

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2018 - March 2019 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2018/2019 + Brokers fee	£ 4,200.61	<p>NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure.</p> <p>If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.</p>		<p>The Applicants sought to persuade us that there were reasons to believe from the limited documentation which was available that there were good reasons to believe that no policy had been taken out or that it had not been 'validly' taken out. The basis for that claim seemed to be that documents relating to different years of account had the same policy number. The true basis of the Applicants' challenge appeared to be that there was in fact no policy and that the documents had been fabricated, although Mr Silva disavowed such a claim when it was put to him directly.</p> <p>In our view the documents which were available including the policy schedule and a demand for the payment of a policy excess suggest to us that there was indeed a policy in place which had paid out on a claim.</p> <p>In the absence of any clear evidence that the premium was not reasonable it is our view using in particular our professional expertise and experience that the annual premiums seem to be reasonably well aligned and to accord with premiums for comparable properties. It is well known that Building Insurance premiums are quite volatile and that</p>

				<p>explains the apparently significant deviations from the mean across the six years.</p> <p>We note, for the record, that copy of the insurance policy at p.198 of the bundle describes the premises as a 'purpose built block of 18 flats'. That is inaccurate, the premises comprise three purpose built low rise blocks. Although we recognise that that misdescription could have had an impact on the premium payable, there was no evidence before us that that was the case.</p>
Common parts electricity	£ 560.39	<p>ALTERATION</p> <p>Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.</p>		<p>Each block is separately metered, there is therefore no reason why these costs should not be apportioned specifically between the blocks. That seems to us to be fair. It is not clear whether that is what has been done.</p> <p>There is also no reason why those meters should not have been read at any point during the period, iif only by the managing agent so that an accurate reading could be reported to the supplier. However, because the majority of the readings are estimates, the true state of the account takes a considerable period to be resolved.</p> <p>We were also informed that the Applicants/their RTM Company had had to pay the sum of £600.00 in order to clear the account with Pozitive Energy. That sum was a late payment charge imposed as a result of the Respondent's failure to make any payments on the account since</p>

				June 2023. In our view that is a sum which ought properly to be refunded either to the Applicants or their RTM Company in order to reconcile their service charge accounts.
Common parts cleaning	£ 1,512.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Common parts Window cleaning	£ 1,404.00	UNREASONABLE The previous contractor provided services for much less. Double charged with two service providers.		These costs were not reasonably incurred. There was no need for monthly visits. Bi-monthly visits at £192.00 per visit is the amount of visits and the cost which would have been reasonably incurred. These costs should also be apportioned equally between the units.
Rubbish removal	£ 792.00	NOT PAYABLE Not necessary, and no further information provided.		Not disputed
Clear Plastic from sewage	£ 330.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work.		Not disputed
Door replacement etc as per section 20 notices	£ 10,033.07	NOT PAYABLE Leaseholders have not received a section 20 notice		There is no evidence that any section 20 notice was served or that the works were in fact done. Not payable.
Gutter Replacement	£ 108.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Emergency lighting testing	£ 433.65	NOT DISPUTING		
Remedial works to smoke detectors	£ 178.20	NOT DISPUTING		
Lights replacement	£ 120.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Aerial works	£ 954.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work.		Not disputed

Light repairs	£ 204.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Drainage cleaning	£ 731.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work. Alternative quotes obtained		The Applicants' alternative quote of £336.00 is the amount which it was reasonable for the Respondent to have incurred.
Smoke detector fault repair	£ 166.80	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work.		Not disputed
Accountant	£ 660.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work.		<p>The Applicants claim that the accountancy charge of £660.00 is sufficient to cover the whole of the reasonable charges given the limited scope of the work undertaken, i.e. the further charge of £144.00 which has been included in the Estate Service Charge account was not reasonably incurred</p> <p>We do not agree. A total charge of £804.00 for the certification of these service charge accounts does not strike us as being unreasonable. It is a cost incurred for the benefit of the lessees and is recoverable under the lease although the lease does not specifically require the end of year accounts to be certified by an accountant.</p>
Management fee March 2018/2019	£ 4,968.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		<p>Using our professional expertise, we are of the view that the appropriate management fee for these blocks, given the level of service provided, is £225.00 per unit, i.e. £4,050.00. Please see also our comments below in relation to the additional management charge made in respect of the estate.</p>

Total expenditure	£ 27,355.72	
-------------------	-------------	--

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2018 - March 2019 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Garden Maintenance	£ 468.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Car Park Management	£ 252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Estate Accountant	£ 144.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		Payable. See above.
Estate Management fee	£ 1,329.60	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		Given the relatively small proportion of the management effort attributable to the estate as opposed to the blocks, we consider, using our professional expertise and having regard to the level of service provided, that an additional management charge of £50.00 per unit p.a. is reasonably payable i.e. £1,200.00 in total.
Total	£ 2,193.60			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2019 - March 2020 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2019/2020 + Brokers fee	£ 4,712.00	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure. If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.		See above
Common parts electricity	£ 625.99	ALTERATION Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.		See above
Common parts cleaning	£ 1,152.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Common parts Window cleaning	£ 648.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Surveyors for insurance purposes	£ 2,040.00	UNREASONABLE for scope of works. Alternative quote provided.		Not disputed
Rubbish removal	£ 120.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Bush Cutting	£ 120.00	NOT PAYABLE Should be included in garden maintenance in Estate Charges		This is an estate service charge cost and should be apportioned between the 24 units responsible for the estate service charge.

Fire Health & Safety equipment service	£ 3,062.48	UNREASONABLE Cost unreasonable considering size of block / repairs required		Not disputed
Fire Health & Safety Risk Assessment	£ 498.01	NOT PAYABLE - Only required a full report every 4 years and a review every 2 years, as per the gov website. Last full review was 2017.		Not disputed
Investigate Door issues	£ 273.60	NOT DISPUTING		
Drainage CCTV and cleaning	£ 1,173.00	UNREASONABLE		The cost reasonably incurred, as per the Applicants' estimate, is £336.00
Accountant	£ 690.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		Payable see above.
Management fee March 2019/2020	£ 5,011.20	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, £225.00 per unit.
Total expenditure	£ 20,126.28			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2019 - March 2020 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Estate Insurance March 2019/2020	£ 764.00	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe insurance taken out was invalid, as it is not usual practice to apply a declared value on the estate, which comprises a car park and some patches of greenery.		See above
Garden Maintenance	£ 180.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Car Park Management	£ 252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Estate Accountant	£ 156.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		Payable see above.
Estate Management fee	£ 1,358.40	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, £50.00 per unit.
Total	£ 2,710.40			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2020 - March 2021 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2020/2021 + Brokers fee	£ 6,084.00	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure. If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.		See above.
Common parts electricity	£ 630.71	ALTERATION Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.		See above.
Common parts cleaning	£ 648.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Common parts Window cleaning	£ 648.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Fire Health & Safety Risk Assessment	£ 522.00	NOT PAYABLE - Only required a full report every 4 years and a review every 2 years, as per the gov website. Last full review was 2017.		Not reasonably incurred. A full report is only required once every four years. The previous full assessment was done in 2017.
Fire Health & Safety service	£ 216.82	NOT DISPUTING		
Re-energisation of landlords main supply	£ 270.00	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the scope of works		Not disputed.

Installation of fireboard to ceiling void of electric cupboard	£ 1,003.30	UNREASONABLE - Given the follow up works required - this did not meet fire standards		Not disputed
Removal of Furniture & tidying	£ 180.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Accountant	£ 720.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		See above.
Management fee March 2020/2021	£ 5,076.00	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, £225.00 per unit.
Total expenditure	£ 15,998.83			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2020 - March 2021 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Estate Insurance March 2020/2021	£ 549.80	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe insurance taken out was invalid, as it is not usual practice to apply a declared value on the estate, which comprises a car park and some patches of greenery.		See above
Garden Maintenance	£ 108.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Car Park Management	£ 252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
6-monthly Drains Service	£ 1,224.00	UNREASONABLE - Unreasonable for scope of works. Alternative quotes found.		Not reasonably incurred. There is no reason for a 6 monthly drain survey in the absence of any apparent problem.
External Fire Health & Safety risk assessment	£ 234.00	NOT PAYABLE - No need for a fire risk assessment in the external parts		Not disputed.
Excavation of collapsed drains	£ 1,530.00	UNREASONABLE - Unreasonable for scope of works.		No works done.
Drains CCTV Investigation	£ 408.00	UNREASONABLE - Unreasonable for scope of works. Alternative quotes found.		As above £336.00 as per the Applicants' estimate.
Estate Accountant	£ 174.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		As above
Estate Management fee	£ 1,416.00	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, £50.00 per unit.

Total	£ 5,895.80	
-------	------------	--

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2021 - March 2022 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2021/2022 + Brokers fee	£ 3,468.34	<p>NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure.</p> <p>If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.</p>		As above.
Common parts electricity	£ 501.64	<p>ALTERATION Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.</p>		As above.
Common parts cleaning & carpet cleaning	£ 2,568.00	UNREASONABLE Compared to the other years in dispute.		Not disputed.
Common parts Window cleaning	£ 1,404.00	UNREASONABLE Compared to the other years in dispute.		As above.
Fire Health & Safety testing, services & repairs	£ 869.24	NOT DISPUTING		
Anglian Water	£ 212.74	<p>NOT PAYABLE Attributed to Flat 21. Should be recovered from Tenants of Flat 21</p>		Not payable. There is no communal water supply. It is believed this charge relates specifically to the

				tenants of Flat 21.
Fire Door Inspections	£ 873.52	UNREASONABLE - Cost Excessive for works provided. Alternate quotes available.		The charge reasonably incurred is £302.30.
EICR Report & Remedial Works	£ 1,893.29	UNREASONABLE - Cost Excessive for works provided.		Not disputed
Meter Cupboard Works	£ 3,600.00	NOT PAYABLE - Works completed in Block A.		Works wrongly attributed to Applicants' block, the works were done in Block A. Not payable.
Call out with scaffold tower to replace roof tiles	£ 1,500.00	UNREASONABLE - Not enough information provided. Not known if relevant to Block C		Not disputed.
Replacement of lights	£ 342.00	UNREASONABLE - Not enough information provided. Not known if relevant to Block C or howm any lights replaced.		Not disputed.
Fire Health & Safety Remedial Works	£ 1,182.00	Scope of work is unreasonably excessive, in addition to the charges themselves. Some of the invoices are reasonable, some are not - detailed list to be provided.		Not disputed.
Fire Health & Safety Risk Assessment	£ 522.00	NOT DISPUTED (once every 4 years)		Not disputed.
Accountant	£ 750.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		As above.
Management fee March 2021/2022	£ 5,119.20	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, £225.00 per unit.
Total expenditure	£ 24,805.97			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2021 - March 2022 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Estate Insurance March 2020/2021	£ 578.29	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe insurance taken out was invalid, as it is not usual practice to apply a declared value on the estate, which comprises a car park and some patches of greenery.		As above.
Garden Maintenance	£ 828.00	UNREASONABLE Compared to the other years in dispute.		The charge reasonably incurred is £360.00 twice annually.
Monthly Bin Cleaning	£ 523.20	UNREASONABLE Compared to the other years in dispute. 1 Bin cleaning a year only is reasonable		This seems to us to be a charge reasonably incurred and reasonable in amount.
Car Park Management	£ 252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Surveyor to prepare pre planned maintenance schedule	£ 1,320.00	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of work. Alternate quote available		Not reasonably incurred. Not payable.
Removal of waste & bushes and treating of area	£ 594.00	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of work. Alternate quote available		Not reasonably incurred. Not payable.
Drains Service	£ 1,023.00	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of work. Alternate quote available		£336 based on the Applicants' alternative quote for the works.
Manhole cover & frame replacement	£ 870.00	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of work.		Not disputed
External Lighting call out & repair to fuse	£ 456.00	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of work.		Not disputed

Fire Health & Safety Risk Assessment	£ 234.00	NOT PAYABLE - No need for a fire risk assessment in the external parts		Not reasonably incurred. Previous years' assessments sufficient.
Estate Accountant	£ 204.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		As before.
Estate Management fee March 2021/2022	£ 1,473.60	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above £50.00 per unit.
Total	£ 8,356.09			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2022 - March 2023 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2022/2023 + Brokers fee	£ 6,897.40	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure. If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.		As before.
Common parts electricity	£ 974.94	ALTERATION Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.		As before.
Common parts cleaning & carpet cleaning	£ 1,404.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Common parts Window cleaning	£ 1,386.00	UNREASONABLE The previous contractor provided services for much less. Double charged with two service providers.		As before.
Fire Health & Safety testing, services and repairs	£ 2,553.70	UNREASONABLE Scope of work is unreasonably excessive, in addition to the charges themselves. Some of the invoices are reasonable, some are not - detailed list to be provided.		Not disputed

Anglian Water	£ 340.94	NOT PAYABLE Attributed to Flat 21. Should be recovered from Tenants of Flat 21		Payable by Flat 21. There is no communal water.
Gutter Cleaning	£ 1,320.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable per trip for the two visits made by Gresham Group.		Not disputed.
Surveyors for Insurance purposes	£ 1,020.00	NOT PAYABLE No report provided, no evidence of works carried out, cost wildly disproportionate to the alleged works.		There is no evidence of any report having been prepared. Not payable.
LED lights installation	£ 2,256.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is unreasonable considering the scope of work.		Not disputed
Electric equipment service	£ 180.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Electrical fault finding, light bulbs replaced etc	£ 433.68	UNREASONABLE Cost is wholly unreasonable for the works carried out. Changed 3 bulbs and 1 bulkhead light.		Payable. Reasonably incurred but the costs are excessive. Doing the best we can using our professional expertise, we assess the value of the works at £250.00 plus VAT.
Tanker to remove debris & Gutters	£ 3,822.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is excessive, as materials used are disproportionate to the scope of works.		The proper cost for these works for the reasons given by the Applicants at p. 181 of the bundle is £2,349.00.
Microwave sensors installement	£ 778.80	NOT PAYABLE Not required, and charges also disproportionate to the scope of work.		Not disputed.
Replace LED round bulkhead	£ 546.00	NOT PAYABLE Work not done to correct property. Works related to adjacent property and no description of works.		Not disputed.
Replace overheated power supplies	£ 1,296.00	NOT PAYABLE Works not carried out at the correct property. Scope of work not listed with proper description.		Not disputed.

Emergency light replacement	£ 282.00	NOT PAYABLE No reference to what works were required, nor where this works were carried out.		Not disputed.
Stair nosing secured	£ 192.00	UNREASONABLE Excessive cost considering the works carried out.		Not disputed.
Fuse board fire rated enclosure, etc	£ 5,622.00	NOT PAYABLE Not fit for standard, as wooden enclosure not suitable for fire safety.		Not disputed.
Lock repair	£ 222.00	NOT DISPUTING		Not disputed.
Visual Installation Condition report	£ 896.40	NOT PAYABLE Work not necessary, as should be covered by a EICR report every 5 or 10 years.		Not disputed.
Fuse replacement due to creating short circuit	£ 720.38	NOT PAYABLE Requirement for work not satisfied, photos not provided.		Costs not attributable to this block. In order to be fair they should be apportioned entirely to Arthur Wellesley House.
RCD replacement, upgrade fluorescent lighting, Surge Protective installation e	£ 3,039.36	UNREASONABLE Works either not required, or not relevant to subject building.		Only £1,869.00 of this cost is referable to works done at the Applicants' block. A fair apportionment requires the costs specifically attributable to specific blocks should be apportioned as such.
Wooden door works as per requirement for fire	£ 1,200.00	NOT PAYABLE Duplicate works which were not required initially. Company not competent to carry out such works.		Not disputed.
Roof Drone Survey	£ 300.00	NOT PAYABLE No requirement for works, company also not competent to carry out such works. No evidence provided to support the Respondent's invoice.		Not reasonably incurred. There was no apparent need for this survey and no report has been produced.

Extractor replacement	£ 249.59	UNREASONABLE Material cost is reasonable, labour cost is unreasonable.		This cost relates exclusively to Charles Weston House. A fair apportionment requires that the lessees of the units in that block bear this cost.
Accountant	£ 780.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		As above.
Management fee March 2022/2023	£ 5,162.40	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, however, it is reasonable to include an increase for inflation for this year to £250.00 per unit.
Total expenditure	£ 43,875.59			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2022 - March 2023 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Estate Insurance March 2021/2022 + BF	£ 1,094.15	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe insurance taken out was invalid, as it is not usual practice to apply a declared value on the estate, which comprises a car park and some patches of greenery.		As above.
Garden Maintenance	£ 1,572.00	UNREASONABLE Cost excessive considering work required.		The charge reasonably incurred is £360.00 twice annually
Monthly Bin Cleaning	£ 366.24	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Charged in 2021 already, following visits not required. One visit is reasonable.		As above. Payable.
Car Park Management	£ 252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Drains Service	£ 804.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is excessive, as materials used are disproportionate to the scope of works.		Based on the Applicants' information, the reasonable charge is £336.00 p.a.
Waste Removal	£ 552.00	UNREASONABLE No certificate provided for responsible waste removal, excessive for works.		This work was undertaken by a London based company Aquevo. That was unreasonable
Downpipes cleaning and repair	£ 3,420.00	UNREASONABLE Excessive cost considering works carried out.		
Moss and Vegetation removal	£ 3,540.00	UNREASONABLE Excessive cost considering works carried out.		The charge made by the RTM company's contractor for the same work was £1,980.00 that is the

				amount reasonably incurred.
Damaged fence replacement and removal	£ 1,290.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Estate Accountant	£ 240.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		As above
Estate Management fee March 2022/2023	£ 1,531.20	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		This charge is reasonable making allowance for inflation.
Total	£ 14,661.59			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2023 - March 2024 - All Blocks Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Insurance March 2023/2024 + Brokers fee	£7,994.70	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe incorrect insurance was taken out, which does not correlate with the policy documentation provided as per disclosure. If the insurance policy is valid, an alternative quote has also been obtained to highlight the unreasonable cost.		As above
Common parts electricity	£2,245.74	ALTERATION Calculation of the electricity has been averaged from all flats, spread across 3 blocks. All invoices have been based upon estimated readings, hence correct figures have not been provided. Calculation to follow.		As above
Common parts cleaning & carpet cleaning	£1,712.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Common parts Window cleaning	£1,848.00	UNREASONABLE Compared to the other years in dispute. Double charging		As above
Fire Health & Safety testing, services & repairs	£2,536.20	UNREASONABLE Excessive cost considering works carried out.		On the Applicants' evidence, no full test was carried out in this year, it is therefore unclear to what this charge relates. Not payable.
BNO - Mains Power , isolator etc - Charles Weston	£2,301.17	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C		BNO is not a qualified electrical provider. It was not therefore reasonable to retain it to carry out

				these works. Not reasonably incurred. Not payable. Also these costs should be apportioned according to the block to which they relate and these costs do not relate to the Applicants' block.
BNO - Mains Power , isolator etc - Arther Wellesley	£3,423.04	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C		BNO is not a qualified electrical provider. It was not therefore reasonable to retain it to carry out these works. Not reasonably incurred. Not payable. Also these costs should be apportioned according to the block to which they relate and these costs do not relate to the Applicants' block.
BNO - Mains Power , isolator etc - Alice Inward House	£2,908.24	NOT PAYABLE - BNO not qualified to carry out these works and not required.		BNO is not a qualified electrical provider. It was not therefore reasonable to retain it to carry out these works. Not reasonably incurred. Not payable.
BNO - Mains Power , isolator etc - Lucas Room	£948.23	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C		BNO is not a qualified electrical provider. It was not therefore reasonable to retain it to carry out these works. Not reasonably incurred. Not payable. Also these costs should be apportioned by 24 as they are estate costs.
Electric Cupboard works	£600.00	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C. No photos or evidence.		Not disputed.
Insurance claim excess	£250.00	NOT PAYABLE No information of what this relates to. No claim funds reached service charge account. Excess paid to company who are not the insurance company.		No sufficient evidence to demonstrate that this sum is payable. Not Payable.

Key Cutting	£93.96	NOT DISPUTING		Not disputed.
Gutter repair, Hopper unblocking etc	£2,940.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is excessive, as materials used are disproportionate to the scope of works. Company no longer exist.		The Applicants' evidence was that this cost did not relation to their block. This is a block specific cost which should in fairness should be apportioned as such.
Canop Repair	£1,140.00	UNREASONABLE Cost is excessive for scope of works. No proof of works.		The Applicants' evidence was that this cost did not relation to their block. This is a block specific cost which should in fairness should be apportioned as such.
Carpet Cleaning & Paint Plus fill	£2,784.00	NOT PAYABLE - No Invoice provided		
Charles Weston - Electrical Sweep , repair and Visual installation	£913.20	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C		The Applicants' evidence was that this cost did not relation to their block. This is a block specific cost which should in fairness should be apportioned as such.
Arther Wellesley House - Electrical Sweep , repair and Visual installation	£1,216.56	NOT PAYABLE - Not relevant to Block C		The Applicants' evidence was that this cost did not relation to their block. This is a block specific cost which should in fairness should be apportioned as such.
Alice Inward House - Electrical Sweep , repair and Visual installation	£1,156.80	UNREASONABLE - Cost excessive for scope of works. Not required.		Not disputed
UPVC Cleaning, Silicone joints etc	£2,640.00	NOT PAYABLE - After RTM handover date.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.
Soffit , Facia board etc works	£2,160.00	NOT PAYABLE - After RTM handover date.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.

Downpipes cleaning and repair	£2,184.00	NOT PAYABLE - No proof of works with invoice.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.
Rear Gutters Cleaning	£1,392.00	50% NOT PAYABLE - After RTM handover date. 50% - Unreasonable - Cost excessive.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.
Communal Area paint touch up	£1,950.00	NOT PAYABLE - After RTM handover date.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.
Roof works	£3,960.00	NOT PAYABLE - After RTM handover date.		Works done after the RTM handover and were not therefore the Respondent's responsibility, Not payable.
Accountant	£810.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the estate accountancy.		As above
Management fee March 2023/2024	£5,292.00	UNREASONABLE Does not reflect the level of service received.		See above, however, it is reasonable to include an increase for inflation for this year to £250.00 per unit.
Total	£57,399.84			

Case Reference: CAM/34UD/LSC/2024/0012

Premises: 19-24 Flats 19-24 Palace Gate, Irthlingborough, Wellingborough NN9 5FD

March 2023 - March 2024 - Estate Service Charges

Item	Cost	Tenant's Comments	Respondent's Comments	Leave Blank (for the Tribunal)
Estate Insurance March 2023/2024 + BF	£1,261.47	NOT PAYABLE / UNREASONABLE Reason to believe insurance taken out was invalid, as it is not usual practice to apply a declared value on the estate, which comprises a car park and some patches of greenery.		As before.
Garden Maintenance	£1,416.00	UNREASONABLE Cost excessive considering work required & cost in previous years		£1,080.00 is the amount reasonably incurred for the reasons explained by the Applicants at p. 179 of the bundle.
Car Park Management	£252.00	NOT DISPUTING		
Drains Service	£7,266.00	UNREASONABLE Cost excessive considering work required. Alternate quotes available		These costs were not reasonably incurred. There appears to have been substantial duplication of effort. For the reasons given by the Applicants at pp. 179-181 of the bundle the sum reasonably incurred is £2,349.00.
Removal of Moss, Vegetations etc from Passway	£1,980.00	UNREASONABLE Cost excessive considering work required. Alternate quotes available		Not reasonably incurred, this work should have been included within the Garden Maintenance charge.
Grit Spreading	£216.00	NOT PAYABLE - No evidence of works		The Applicants' evidence is that this work was not done. Not payable.
Estate Accountant	£270.00	UNREASONABLE Unreasonable cost for works carried out for accountancy, in conjunction with the block accountancy.		As above.
Estate Management fee March	£1,617.60	UNREASONABLE		This charge is reasonable making

2023/2024		Does not reflect the level of service received.		allowance for inflation.
Total	£14,279.07			