

## Recommendation Status Report: Collision between a passenger train and a fallen tree at Broughty Ferry

This report is based on information provided to the RAIB by the relevant safety authority or public body.

The status of the recommendation(s), as reported to us, are described by the following categories:

### Key to Recommendation Status

<b>Open</b> (replaces Progressing and Implementation On-going)	Actions to address the recommendation are ongoing.
<b>Closed</b> (replaces Implemented, Implemented by alternative means, and Non-implementation)	ORR consider the recommendation to have been taken into consideration by an end implementer and evidence provided to show action taken or justification for no action taken.
<b>Insufficient response:</b>	The end implementer has not provided sufficient evidence that the recommendation has been taken into consideration, or if it has, the action proposed does not address the recommendation, or there is insufficient evidence to support no action being taken.
<b>Superseded:</b>	The recommendation has been superseded either by a newer recommendation or actions have subsequently been taken by the end implementer that have superseded the recommendation.
<b>Awaiting response:</b>	Awaiting initial report from the relevant safety authority or public body on the status of the recommendation.

RAIB concern over the way that an organisation has responded to a recommendation are indicated by one of the following:

**Red** – RAIB has concerns that no actions have been taken in response to a recommendation.

**Blue** – RAIB has concerns that the actions taken, or proposed, are inappropriate or insufficient to address the risk identified during the investigation.

**White** – RAIB notes substantive actions have been reported, but the RAIB still has concerns.

# Recommendation Status Report



<b>Report Title</b>	Collision between a passenger train and a fallen tree at Broughty Ferry
<b>Report Number</b>	13/2024
<b>Date of Incident</b>	27/12/2023

Rec No.	Status	RAIB Concern	Recommendation	RAIB Summary of current status
13/2024/01	Open	None	<p>The intent of this recommendation is to use emerging technology to identify trees which have been subject to altered exposure and are potentially at risk of falling onto the railway.</p> <p>Network Rail, as part of its development of aerial surveying technology, should consider how current and emerging technology of this nature could assist in the detection of trees subject to altered exposure, including those trees on third-party land, which could present a risk to the railway (paragraph 131a).</p>	<p>ORR has reported that Network Rail has reported that it has completed actions taken in response to this recommendation. ORR proposes to take no further action unless they become aware that the information provided becomes inaccurate.</p>
13/2024/02	Open	None	<p>The intent of this recommendation is for Dundee City Council to improve its management of the trees which are its responsibility, and which are at risk of falling onto the railway.</p> <p>Dundee City Council should review its management of the trees for which it is responsible to ensure that it is effectively controlling the risk of trees falling onto the railway. This review should consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. compliance with legal requirements and available good practice related to tree management</li> <li>ii. how trees within falling distance of the railway are identified</li> <li>iii. how factors that could increase the risk of healthy trees falling onto the railway such as tree species, growing requirements (including soil condition and effects of windthrow) are understood and accounted for</li> <li>iv. how a risk-based approach to tree inspections is to be established</li> <li>v. how accurate records of tree inspections are to be maintained.</li> </ul> <p>Dundee City Council should develop a timebound programme to make any</p>	

# Recommendation Status Report



			appropriate changes identified to their policies, procedures and systems (paragraph 131b).	
13/2024/03	Closed - I	White	<p>The intent of this recommendation is to provide additional information to the rail industry group which is currently evaluating the additional risk to train occupants associated with the continued operation of high speed trains, which entered service before modern crashworthiness standards were introduced in July 1994.</p> <p>The Rail Safety and Standards Board Carmont Recommendations Steering Group should review its response to recommendation 19 made within RAIB report 02/2022, following its investigation into the derailment of a passenger train at Carmont, Aberdeenshire on 12 August 2020 to ensure that the circumstances of this accident have been addressed (paragraph 132).</p>	<p>ORR has reported that the RSSB steering group has reported that it has completed actions taken in response to this recommendation. ORR proposes to take no further action unless they become aware that the information provided becomes inaccurate.</p>