



BEE NETWORK

**City Region Sustainable
Transport Settlement**

GMCA Annual Monitoring Report 23/24

Powered by



Transport for
Greater Manchester

Contents

Foreword	3
Progress to date	5
Background	5
Key Achievements	6
Updates to the Programme Business Case	12
Published Delivery Plan.....	12
Financial Management	12
Benefits Management (Value for Money).....	13
Monitoring and Evaluation Framework.....	14
Programme Governance & Assurance.....	15
Key Challenges, Mitigations and Lessons Learned	17
Risk Management	17
Challenges across the programme	17
Lessons Learned	19

Foreword

Transport is central to Greater Manchester's plans for levelling up our city region and driving our ambition to be a greener, fairer, and more prosperous place.

At the heart of this ambition is the creation of the Bee Network, an integrated transport system which will unify buses, trams, walking and wheeling by 2024, with commuter rail incorporated by 2030.

The Bee Network is already transforming how people travel around Greater Manchester, driving growth and productivity, tackling congestion and supporting our vision for a sustainable, decarbonised city region. It is supporting people here to access jobs, education, vital public services and combat social isolation and car dependency.

Greater Manchester has long advocated for the kind of devolved, long-term capital funding that the City Region Sustainable Transport Settlements (CRSTS) provide, and the allocated £1.07bn – 90% of our initial ask – was a major vote of confidence in our plans for the city region. The fund is already delivering transformative transport infrastructure and we are looking forward to working with Government on future funding through CRSTS2, as part of Greater Manchester's Single Settlement.

CRSTS represents a positive partnership for delivery with Government, working together to drive local priorities that support national objectives; in this case, the levelling up ambition to 'make local public transport connectivity significantly closer to the standards of London, with improved services, simpler fares and integrated ticketing by 2030'.

As this report sets out, our City Region Sustainable Transport Settlement has allowed us to make good progress towards the delivery of the Bee Network delivery over the last two years through directly funding or contributing towards a wide range of transport initiatives, including:

- GM has taken delivery of more than 100 Electric Buses which are now operational through our franchised bus services and supported with the electrification of the first depots, putting us on track for a third of the bus fleet to be zero carbon by 2027.
- The opening of the award-winning Stockport Interchange, one of the biggest single projects outside of London linking seamless transport connectivity with new homes and public realm investment, and forming a key part of Stockport's £1 billion town centre regeneration. With the approval of the Strategic Outline Business Case for Bury Interchange's similarly transformative redevelopment, and the Outline Business Case due for submission this Autumn, CRSTS is facilitating a best-practice transfer of knowledge, skills and experience.
- Work has continued alongside partners from the rail industry to develop proposals for a new rail station at Golborne, with the Outline Business Case currently under review by Government. Alongside this, we are progressing schemes to improve accessibility at a number of rail stations within the city region.

-
- The Strategic Outline Business Case for Metrolink’s Next Generation Vehicles – which are to have tram-train capability – has been approved. The Outline Business Case is progressing with the key aim being a Bury-Heywood-Rochdale-Oldham tram-train ‘Pathfinder’ service. Preparatory work completed on future Metrolink extensions will allow formal business case development towards an application for statutory powers to commence this financial year.
 - Greater Manchester has established 114km of active travel routes since the Bee Active Network was launched in 2018, with CRSTS funding helping us to continue that work and develop a pipeline of schemes into the future.
 - Over £200m has been invested to date in maintaining and renewing the highway and Metrolink network across Greater Manchester, safeguarding the resilience and operational integrity of our key public infrastructure assets.

We are proud of our progress to date and look forward to providing further updates on delivery and the transformational impact of this major investment in the future.

Andy Burnham, Mayor of Greater Manchester

Progress to date

Background

City Region Sustainable Transport Settlement (CRSTS1) [1 Apr 2022 – 31 Mar 2027]

Greater Manchester (GM) submitted its CRSTS Prospectus in September 2021 requesting funding totalling £1.19bn for the financial years 2022-2027 to support the delivery of its transport ambitions and, in particular, the creation of the Bee Network: an integrated transport system for the city region.

Through the Autumn 2021 Spending Review, GM was awarded an indicative allocation of 90% of this funding request and, via a letter from the Secretary of State for Transport in late November 2021, was asked to submit a detailed Programme Case that was also to include provision for the capital elements of GM's Bus Service Improvement Plan (BSIP).

The GM CRSTS Programme Case was submitted at the end of January 2022, including the additional BSIP capital elements in relation to Zero Emission Buses and Integrated Ticketing and Customer Information Measures, with a reduced overall budget of £1.07bn.

At the start of April 2022, the Secretary of State wrote to the GM Mayor to confirm that GM would receive the full amount of the indicative allocation of £1.07bn, which covers the five-year period up to March 2027.

CRSTS 2 [1 Apr 2027 – 31 Mar 2032]

The Government's Network North plan on 4 October 2023 included the announcement of an indicative c£2.5bn CRSTS 2 allocation for Greater Manchester for the period April 2027 to March 2032. When added to GM's £1.07bn settlement for CRSTS1, this indicative allocation contributes to an overall (CRSTS funded) pipeline to the end of the financial year 2031/32 of c£3.5bn. It is envisioned that this funding will form part of Greater Manchester's Single Settlement agreed as part of the Trailblazer Devolution deal at the next Spending Review, which will cover other sectors such as housing and skills alongside transport.

Engagement with DfT officials regarding the indicative CRSTS2 allocation is ongoing. The development of GM's proposals for CRSTS2 will be informed by the 2040 Strategy / Local Transport Plan (LTP) refresh process, which is now underway.

Re-baselining

In recognition of national and global inflationary pressures on construction and manufacturing supply chains, in early 2023 Government provided all Mayoral Combined Authorities with the opportunity to re-baseline their CRSTS1 Delivery Plans. In developing our re-baselining proposals we have had to take account of a number of local challenges, for example in terms of addressing the

substantial post-covid financial pressures associated with the safe operation of GM's existing Metrolink network, but we have also looked to maximise opportunities where possible, such as those associated with being the first of the Combined Authorities to successfully launch Bus Franchising.

Greater Manchester's formal CRSTS1 re-baselining response was approved by Government in March 2024 and a copy of the updated Delivery Plan is attached to this Report (see Appendix 1).

Key Achievements

Work to develop and deliver the schemes within GM's CRSTS Programme continues at pace.

To date, circa 90% of our target number of Strategic Outline Business Cases (SOBCs) have been approved and circa £480m of the £1.24bn CRSTS1 and match funding has been released to scheme promoters. Over 50 further business case submissions (comprising Strategic, Outline and Full Business Cases) are expected by the end of March 2025.

A selection of project and programme highlights are included below:

Bus

Greater Manchester is the first Combined Authority outside London to implement **Bus Franchising**. With the completion of Tranches 1 and 2 of Bus Franchising in September 2023 and March 2024 respectively, over 50% of buses in GM are now franchised, with the final tranche (Tranche 3) to be implemented in January 2025.

Funding from the CRSTS programme is supporting the provision of zero emission buses and the installation of supporting charging infrastructure at bus depots. The first **bus depot electrification** was completed in September 2023 at Bolton Bus Depot, followed in March 2024 in Oldham. The electrical charging infrastructure installed at both of these depots now supports the operation of 100 **new electric buses** in these areas.

The new **Stockport Interchange** opened in March 2024. As one of the biggest single projects outside of London, this £140million facility forms part of Stockport's £1 billion town centre regeneration, comprising residential and retail development but with transport investment at its heart. The new interchange itself features 18 bus stands which can support up to 164 departures an hour and has been designed with future Metrolink integration in mind; whilst the wider scheme redefines the town's connectivity with a new 2 acre park and new walking and cycling links to the railway station and the town centre, supported in part by a CRSTS funding contribution.

Our CRSTS proposals include a similarly transformative scheme at **Bury Interchange** as part of the rapid transit integration programme, with Metrolink also featuring redevelopment there. Following approval of a Strategic Outline Business Case in November 2022 the Outline Business Case is due for submission this Autumn, demonstrating how CRSTS funding is facilitating a best-practice transfer of knowledge, skills and experience from one scheme to the next – using a true pipeline approach.

Proposals for bus priority improvements on 7 **Improving Journeys Orbital Corridors** have been developed and submitted for public engagement. The engagement feedback will be analysed and incorporated where possible as the detailed design progresses. A number of early intervention packages have also been developed across these corridors and are now moving into delivery. These include traffic signal improvements to help with bus journey time reliability, and improved pedestrian access to key bus stops.

Following consultation on the Stockport section of the A6 **City Centre Radial**, outline proposals for bus priority improvements on a further 5 key radial routes connecting Manchester City Centre within the M60 Boundary are being developed and a first round of public engagement is due to take place later this year.

In parallel with the above schemes, complementary works are underway through the **Bus Pinch Points and Maintenance Programme** which focuses on delivering localised interventions (such as traffic signal, junction and bus stop improvements) to improve the overall bus network. To date over 70 interventions have been identified, of which 2 schemes have been completed and a further 6 schemes are currently on site/in delivery. An audit of 4,300 bus stops across GM has been undertaken, which will be used to identify where priority **Bus Stop Enhancements** are required. 4 bus stops have been upgraded to date and further works are forecast to commence in Autumn 2024. Alongside this, we are also renewing bus priority **Signing and Lining** across GM and renewing and upgrading the supporting **ITS Platform** to support the operation of an efficient highway and bus network.

As part of our rapid transit integration programme, the expanded Park & Ride at the Tyldesley guided busway stop in Wigan is scheduled to open in 2025 as a first-of-its-kind '**travel hub**' for Greater Manchester – offering better active travel and public transport integration to improve the first and last mile for our customers. Development work also continues to bring forward, with private sector investment, a **new Leigh-Salford-Manchester Guided Busway stop** at Mosley Common in Wigan.

The above infrastructure improvements are supported and complemented by investment in our **Customer and Ticketing offer** which focusses on six core packages:

- Contactless Ticketing including Revenue Protection and Insight and Analytics;
- Mobile Ticketing including Insight and Analytics; and
- Account Based Ticketing including In Person Retail and Insight & Analytics.
- Travel Information Improvements: Interchange and bus stop information improvements, including open data portal
- Travel Information Improvements: Website and Metrolink real time information)
- Customer Contact Centre Improvements

The first phase of **Contactless Ticketing** has been rolled out as part of Bus Franchising, enabling customers to pay a 'Known Fare' using contactless media (i.e. bank card/smart watch/mobile phone) on a Bee Network Franchised bus service. Work on the second phase of delivery is now underway.

The first phase of **Mobile Ticketing** has also been completed, enabling customers to purchase and pay for Bee Network bus, tram and multi modal products in advance of travel. The **Bee Network App** is a personal travel companion, empowering customers to plan journeys in advance, promoting the cheapest tickets for tram and bus journeys (supported with the functionality of retailing tickets), as well as providing live Bus Tracking and live stops and departures. The Bee Network App also includes features such as Google & Apple pay to enable customers to easily purchase and pay for travel, as well as providing a portal for Customer Service Agents to support customers with analytics and account insights.

Rail

GM's CRSTS programme include proposals for the first new rail station to be built in Greater Manchester in 25 years, **Golborne Station**. This is one of three "retained" schemes within GM's CRSTS programme, alongside Bury Interchange and Metrolink Next Generation Vehicles and Tram-Train Pathfinder, which means that final approval for these schemes rests with Government. Following public consultation (completed in early 2024), an Outline Business Case was submitted to Government in March 2024 and is currently under review with a report due to be presented to the West Coast North Programme Board in May. The scheme has also made significant design development progress, ahead of an outline planning application being submitted in August 2024.

Separately, proposals are progressing for improvements to **Stockport Station** which has recently been incorporated into the Manchester & Salford Stations partnership between TfGM and Network Rail. The scheme is currently being progressed to the selection of a preferred option, which is due to be completed by the end of March 2025.

CRSTS funding has enabled GM to progress its **Access for All programme**, which seeks to improve accessibility at a number of rail stations across the city region. Outline designs have been completed for the next 4 priority schemes which are at Swinton, Reddish North, Hindley and Bryn Stations. Following completion of a 2-stage open market tender, a contract has been awarded to complete the detailed design for these 4 sites by the end of 2025, which will enable construction works to take place throughout 2026.

In parallel, a further 3 stations have been developed to outline design stage: Flowery Field, Newton for Hyde and Levenshulme Stations. Using CRSTS as match funding, TfGM nominated these stations to the DfT's Access for All Programme for CP7 and has been awarded Flowery Field, Newton for Hyde and Bredbury stations. TfGM will now commence the design and delivery of these schemes and establish a funding route for Levenshulme which was not successful in this funding bid.

In October 2023, Government announced its **Network North** initiative, rescoping HS2, including cancelling HS2 Phases 2a (Birmingham to Crewe) and 2b (Crewe to Manchester). Before the Network North announcement, funding from the CRSTS programme had enabled the development of proposals for enhanced connectivity of the GM HS2 stations at Manchester Piccadilly, Airport and Wigan with particular focus on active travel and public transport access, as part of our HS2 wider connectivity programme of works. CRSTS funding has also supported the production of plans for the relocation and expansion of Metrolink at Piccadilly and the Airport Metrolink Western Leg variant,

facilitating sustainable mode connection of the proposed Manchester Airport High Speed station to Manchester Airport. We successfully worked with DfT and HS2 Limited on amendments to the HS2 proposal as part of the Additional Provision 2 of the hybrid Bill, including provision of powers to construct, operate and maintain the **Airport Metrolink Western Leg Variant** which was missing from the main Bill proposal.

At part of the Network North, Government allocated funds to expand the Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR) programme with an additional £12 billion “to better connect Manchester to Liverpool” as part of the Liverpool-Manchester-Leeds element of the NPR network. Following this announcement, we have worked with DfT and local leaders to agree the strategic route for this connection and are working on a programme for development of the Manchester Piccadilly to Millington/ Rostherne section of this route.

Metrolink

The Metrolink Programme primarily delivers **safety and operationally critical renewals and enhancements** to the existing Metrolink network and tram fleet. Since April 2022, CRSTS funding has enabled the advanced procurement of long-lead materials to deliver a range of track, Overhead Line Equipment (OLE), tram, depot and safety related projects (tram overrun protection, upgrades to off-street pedestrian crossings & improved platform markings).

Alongside this, extensive work has been undertaken to develop the **longer-term Metrolink programme** to continue to deliver safety and operationally critical renewals and enhancements to maintain Metrolink operations for the customer including further track, OLE, power, tram, depot, safety and security and speed control projects.

In parallel with operating the existing Metrolink network, we continue to explore options and develop business cases to expand the reach of our overall rapid transit network (fast and frequent public transport moving large numbers of people – e.g. suburban rail, tram and tram-train, underground metro, and busways) across the city region.

As part of the rapid transit integration programme, development work continues to bring forward a number of **new Metrolink stops**, including private sector investment, to serve major developments:

- **Cop Road** on the Oldham & Rochdale Metrolink line, serving the Beal Valley and Broadbent Moss developments in Oldham (approximately 1,900 homes and 22,000 square metres of employment space). A Strategic Outline Business Case is due for submission in the next year.
- **Elton Reservoir** on the Bury Metrolink line, serving the Elton Reservoir development in Bury (approximately 3,500 homes). A Strategic Outline Business Case is due for submission in the next year.

- **Sandhills** on the Bury and Oldham & Rochdale Metrolink lines, serving the Victoria North development in Manchester (approximately 15,000 homes). A Strategic Outline Business Case was approved in 2023, assisted by funding from Homes England.

As part of the future rapid transit programme, the Strategic Outline Business Case for Metrolink's **Next Generation Vehicles** – which are to have tram-train capability, to allow services to join up the light rail and heavy rail networks – has been approved in 2023. The Outline Business Case is progressing through 2024 and 2025 with the key aim being a **Bury-Heywood-Rochdale-Oldham tram-train 'Pathfinder' service**. Preparatory work completed to date for **new and extended Metrolink lines** will allow formal business case development towards an application for statutory powers to commence this financial year, using a steady and rolling pipeline approach.

Active Travel

As of the end of March 2024, Greater Manchester has delivered over 114km of high quality active travel schemes, as part of our **Bee Active Network**. Development and delivery of these schemes has been funded through a combination of our Transforming Cities Funded 'Mayor's Challenge Fund' (£160m), over £40m of Active Travel England funding and a CRSTS funding contribution of £54m. By 2027 we anticipate having approximately 10% (or around 270 km) of our planned network in place.

Looking ahead to 2024-25, GM has already achieved full business case approval for £29m of CRSTS-funded active travel schemes which are currently in varying stages of delivery, including:

- Completion of the third and final phase of the **Bee Network Crossings Programme**, which will have delivered new and upgraded crossings at 9 sites across Bolton, Rochdale, Salford, Stockport, Tameside and Trafford by Summer 2024.
- Completion this Summer of a series of strategic cycling & walking improvements along the **A56 corridor in Trafford**, and the installation of a new pedestrian and cycle bridge over the Ashton Canal in Ancoats as part of **Manchester's Northern and Eastern Gateway scheme**.
- The roll-out of a GM-wide programme of **Safety Camera** digitisation and upgrades (led by TfGM) which is currently being delivered by our appointed delivery partner, Jenoptik. This will improve safety on the network for all users, particularly those most vulnerable.
- Works are due to start on site this Summer on schemes in **Bolton town centre**, which will improve the quality of infrastructure for walking, wheeling and cycling including a series of protected signalised junctions, new cycle parking spaces, footway reconstruction and lengths of new segregated two-way cycle lanes, and in **Bury**, including a new pedestrian and cycle bridge over the River Irwell.
- **Manchester's active neighbourhood scheme** in Levenshulme has benefitted from extensive on-street trials and is now progressing through a phased delivery, while **Tameside's Active Neighbourhood Phase 2** scheme is forecast to commence works on site this Summer.

Streets for All

The Streets for All programme comprises 24 schemes which have been identified by the 10 GM local authorities to improve the environment for pedestrians, cyclists and public transport users in key locations, including town centres and strategic transport corridors. To date £11 million has been released through the approval of Strategic Outline Business Cases (SOBCs) to develop schemes to the point of delivery, including producing outline designs, undertaking public engagement and consultation, and completing detailed transport modelling to support the case for each scheme. Four SOBCs remain to be submitted during 2024 and approvals are expected by Autumn. One scheme is currently on-site, with a further two schemes due to start works this Summer.

Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure (EVCI)

GM has secured a LEVI funding allocation of £16.2m which, alongside CRSTS funding, will help to deliver low power on-street electric vehicle charging infrastructure across GM. The EVCI programme will focus on areas which are often less likely to be served by the commercial market, such as rural areas and locations where residents don't have access to off-street parking or access to charging within five minutes' walk. Part of the CRSTS funding will also enable the installation of EVCI on a number of TfGM-managed Travel Hub sites. Proposals are currently in development, with installation expected to start in 2026.

Strategic Highways Maintenance

Through the CRSTS programme £45m in total is being invested equally across the ten GM Local Authorities (LA's) over 5 years from April 2022, following the submission of successful business cases to carry out various treatment interventions to their deteriorating carriageways on the Key Route Network (KRN) and/or maintenance to their structures.

The programme objective is to arrest the rate of deterioration on the KRN and maintain a safe, reliable and resilient network and to prevent the build-up of reactive repairs. New running surfaces extend the life of the carriageway and road users will benefit from smooth uninterrupted and safe journeys.

97 maintenance schemes have been completed to date, totalling 57.3km of carriageway surfacing / treatment and key maintenance works to 3 bridges.

In addition, £175m has been allocated over the 5 year period giving all 10 GM Local Authorities (LA's) a share of £35m per year to support their capital highway maintenance. Each LA is progressing through their respective maintenance programmes, improving and providing resilience across all aspects of their highway networks, including carriageways, footways, cycleways, bridges, street lighting and drainage.

Updates to the Programme Business Case

Published Delivery Plan

As noted above, in early 2023 Government provided all Mayoral Combined Authorities with the opportunity to re-baseline their CRSTS1 Delivery Plans, with Greater Manchester's formal CRSTS1 re-baselining response approved by Government in March 2024.

The latest Delivery Plan, which has been updated to reflect the approved re-baselined position, is included as an attachment to this Report (Appendix 1).

The key changes to the Delivery Plan are:

- Securing resilience across the bus franchising infrastructure, including bus depots and associated EV charging infrastructure; Customer Information Systems; (AVA/ CCTV) installed on the bus fleet and at stops and interchanges; IS and ticketing systems and equipment costs.
- Additional critical renewals to the Metrolink network required to maintain safe operations.
- Development of a replacement tram management system.
- Some reallocations of funding within individual local authority programmes, to maximise delivery of scheme outputs.
- In addition to the above, as a result of 4 October Govt. announcement cancelling HS2 phases 2a and 2b, the CRSTS funded HS2 / NPR scope (including preparatory works / utility diversions) is yet to be re-confirmed.

Financial Management

Greater Manchester's formal CRSTS1 re-baselining response was approved by Government in March 2024, which increased the expenditure forecast (including local match contributions) to March 2027 from £1.31bn to £1.48bn. With funding totalling £1.24bn (£1.07 bn CRSTS grant and £170m local / match funding), therefore overprogramming is £257.1m (ie, 24% of the CRSTS grant), an increase of £191m compared with the original over programming allocation of £66.0m, as shown in the table below.

Programme	Approved Delivery plan (June 22 GMCA)			Current forecast (rebaseline) August 23			Variance	
	Local	CRSTS	Total	Local	CRSTS	Total	CRSTS	%
	£m	£m	£m	£m	£m	£m	£m	
Bus	80.0	359.1	439.1	84.0	487.5	571.5	(128.4)	
Rail	-	44.0	44.0	-	58.4	58.4	(14.4)	
Rapid Transit Integration	15.4	48.0	63.4	15.4	48.0	63.4	-	
Future Rapid Transit	34.0	67.0	101.0	30.0	67.0	97.0	-	
HS2 Programme	-	85.0	85.0	-	85.0	85.0	-	
Metrolink Renewals (incl. TMS replacement)	40.6	21.4	62.0	40.6	79.3	119.9	(57.9)	
Active Travel	-	53.6	53.6	-	53.6	53.6	-	
Streets for All	-	134.7	134.7	-	125.2	125.2	9.5	
Highways Maintenance	-	220.0	220.0	-	220.0	220.0	-	
Minor works / Road Safety	-	103.5	103.5	-	103.5	103.5	-	
Original overprogramming	-	(66.0)	(66.0)	-	-	-	(66.0)	
Sub total	170.0	1,070.3	1,240.3	170.0	1,327.4	1,497.4	(257.1)	
2024/25 revenue support (cap / rev switch)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Total	170.0	1,070.3	1,240.3	170.0	1,327.4	1,497.4		
Current overprogramming / funding shortfall							(257.1)	(24%)

Following the re-baselining being approved, there has been a further £25.1m contribution identified and reported through GMCA relating to receipt of funding received from GM's Bee Network Tranche 1 Bus Franchise Operator to part fund the cost of the first 100 zero emission buses (ZEBs), which are now operational in the Tranche 1 area. Homes England funding of £0.15m has also been received to further develop the potential Metrolink stop at Sandhills for the Victoria North development, bringing the total CRSTS funding including the GM local contribution to c.£1.52bn.

As of March 2024, £477.2m of CRSTS funding has been approved for release to scheme promoters by the GMCA/ Bee Network Committee (BNC) to support scheme development and delivery, with further drawdowns to be requested as and when required to deliver the programme.

There is an on-going delivery confidence exercise that will inform any potential underspend against the CRSTS1 funding. However, any potential underspend will likely result in the current overprogramming associated with the programme being negated.

Benefits Management (Value for Money)

As per the GMCA Assurance Framework, Benefits Management is a three part process whereby the benefits of a scheme are tracked through the scheme lifecycle:

- i) Appraisal of impacts through the scheme development process to full approval to ensure scheme design is aligned to the stated objectives and represent value for money;
- ii) Benefits Realisation to ensure that the inputs provided are converted into the intended outputs, with benefits at the heart of any change control process alongside time and budget constraints, and with schemes looking to 'advertise' their future benefits via behavioural change Activation activity; and
- iii) Monitoring and evaluation post-opening, which is covered in the next section, to assess the extent to which the delivered outputs actually translate to expected outcomes and impacts.

As at the date of this report, over 50 CRSTS funded projects have at least an SOBC in place and hence will have, as a minimum, an outline appraisal showing how the scheme is likely to perform in terms of value for money (vfm), and drafts of the Benefits Realisation and Monitoring and

Evaluation plans in place. Draft final value for money statements are provided at OBC for conditional approval of the preferred option, and then finalised at FBC. Where schemes have been assessed as lower complexity, they have the option to submit a combined OBC/FBC (subject to approval) in which case the final appraisal is presented at this stage.

The table below shows the number of schemes (grouped by mode) that have been appraised to date and the split across the value for money categories based upon the assessment of the outline appraisals for the SOBC submissions. The majority of schemes are classed as offering medium and high value for money, with certain active travel and highway maintenance schemes offering very high vfm. 4 schemes have poor vfm based on their outline appraisals to date and therefore for these schemes, noting that they are each supported by a strong strategic case, approval to pass to OBC has been accompanied by a plan to continue to review and improve the vfm through further scheme development activity.

VfM Category	Active Travel	Bus	Highway / Maintenance	Metrolink / Rail	Total
Very High	1	0	1	0	2
High	3	3	7	0	13
Medium	7	1	0	2	10
Low	3	3	0	1	7
Poor	3	1	0	0	4
Total	17	8	8	3	36

The table below presents the same information but with split of vfm classes within each mode weighted by the PVC as an indicator of spend.

VfM Category	Active Travel	Bus	Highway / Maintenance	Metrolink / Rail	Total
Very High	11%	0%	51%	0%	8%
High	14%	38%	49%	0%	21%
Medium	42%	3%	0%	95%	43%
Low	15%	42%	0%	5%	19%
Poor	18%	18%	0%	0%	9%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

The early emphasis in Greater Manchester's work on CRSTS monitoring and evaluation (M&E) has been to secure high quality and proportionate scheme-level activity to provide evidence on the effectiveness of interventions. This evidence will allow for accountability at the scheme level and also to provide the basis for informing future investment decisions.

The scheme level evaluation approach has been led by evaluation officers at TfGM, providing a critical friend review service as well as developing both an M&E plan template and a reporting template. Ongoing support that can be called upon includes:

-
- Guidance on objective setting, emphasising the need for consistency with national and GM CRSTS objectives;
 - Guidance on producing a clearly set out logic map;
 - Confirming which of our core set of research questions are applicable, alongside any bespoke questions derived from scheme objectives;
 - Advising on the appropriate data collection activities and resources needed to answer each of the research questions.

Our scheme-level evaluation supports the DfT national evaluation requirements for quarterly monitoring of outputs and outcomes and the Department's wider evaluation activity.

As the M&E work progresses, there has been a growing emphasis on programme level needs, to inform future GM programmes and strengthen the basis for future decision-making, e.g. in the realms of improved modelling and appraisal capabilities.

As well as being ready to input into the DfT's regular monitoring of outputs and outcomes, TfGM/GM is able and willing to fully support other national evaluation activities, particularly once a national evaluator is appointed in the summer. We welcome the opportunities that will arise for future conversations on M&E activity and creation of enhanced national capacity on M&E and are also keen to facilitate in-depth conversations that include other MCAs' M&E specialists.

Programme Governance & Assurance

All CRSTS-funded schemes are required to go through a defined assurance process in line with GM's local Single Pot Assurance Framework. The assurance requirements to be applied to each scheme are determined by the scheme's risk and complexity, which is measured by an industry-standard project complexity tool. In addition, the Department for Transport (DfT) has identified a number of schemes as "retained schemes" which must go through DfT's required assurance processes in addition to the local assurance framework. Current 'retained' schemes include Bury Interchange; Metrolink Next Generation Vehicles and Tram-Train Pathfinder; and Golborne Station.

Following Strategic Outline Business Case (SOBC) approval, the role of the GMCA going forward is to ensure that the business case principles on which these initial scheme approvals were predicated, including their value for money status, are maintained throughout the scheme development process. This is necessary to help the GMCA discharge its functions as the Accountable Body for the Greater Manchester Local Enterprise Partnership (GM LEP), namely:

- To have responsibility for ensuring value for money is achieved;
- To identify prioritised lists of investments within prevailing available budgets;
- To have ultimate responsibility for individual scheme and programme approvals, make decisions in relation to investment and release of funding, and provide scrutiny of business cases where appropriate;
- To monitor progress of scheme delivery and spend; and

-
- To actively manage the devolved budget and programme to respond to changed circumstances (such as schedule range, scheme alteration, realisation of risks).

The Bee Network Committee has been established to provide this governance on behalf of the Combined Authority and is supported by an Infrastructure Pipeline Boards, individual Programme Boards and Steering Groups.

Separate assurance processes have been developed to ensure the appropriate design quality is achieved and these design checks are undertaken at key project stages in parallel with the business case assurance processes outlined above.

Key Challenges, Mitigations and Lessons Learned

Risk Management

An Enterprise Risk Management (ERM) framework has been established and is continuously implemented and monitored across TfGM's infrastructure pipeline delivery which includes all CRSTS-funded schemes. The framework ensures that the appropriate level of risk governance, risk process (identification, treatment and monitoring), hierarchy, and management tools are applied to each scheme.

The ERM consists of three levels of risk hierarchy (scheme-specific level, programme level and infrastructure pipeline level). Each level has dedicated risk champions to ensure continuous implementation and monitoring of the process as well as delegated authorities for critical decision making on risk escalation matters. A single source of truth is maintained through utilising TfGM's chosen risk management information system, and this also contributes to transfer of knowledge and lessons learned across schemes. Most importantly, these provide visibility of aggregate risk impacts across the framework and ensures that no level of the framework's risk hierarchy is isolated.

The framework utilises ISO 31000 risk management standards and adopts both qualitative and quantitative risk assessment and modelling approaches according to projects' lifecycles. The risk management requirements to be applied to each scheme are determined by the scheme's risk and complexity, which is measured by an industry standard project complexity tool. Risk management training is continuously provided through formal and informal means to the delivery teams, and this continues to enhance the risk management culture across the pipeline.

A number of key strategic risks and challenges spanning scheme, programme and pipeline levels are outlined in the following section of this report.

Challenges across the programme

All major infrastructure programmes of the scale and nature of GM's CRSTS programme face a wide range of challenges which need to be carefully tracked and managed. This section provides an overview of some of the key strategic challenges currently being seen across the programme and the steps that are being taken to address these:

- **Inflation.** Although inflation has reduced from the levels seen between 2021 and 2023, significant financial challenges for construction and manufacturing supply chains remain. While the approved re-baselining proposals go some way to mitigating this challenge, we continue to closely monitor the impact of inflation across the programme.

-
- **Resource Availability.** As the programme builds momentum, the availability of required resources and capability/skills continues to be a critical risk. Challenges include ensuring delivery partners are sufficiently resourced to be able to undertake the development and delivery of schemes, and that there is sufficient access to specialist technical support areas (such as highway modelling, appraisal or traffic signals design). There are also additional resource pressures on those local authority partners who are supporting GM-wide programmes (such as Bus Infrastructure) in parallel with developing and delivering their own schemes. Access to capability and capacity funding to address these resourcing needs has proved essential to date in enabling early scheme development work.
 - **Pressure on Industry and Contracting Partners.** Some project teams have experienced difficulties in attracting & securing sufficient suppliers with the requisite capability and capacity to deliver their programmes within a competitive environment (locally, regionally and nationally). This has been exacerbated by a shortage of specific skills and experience in certain sectors, for example rail and active travel, which has resulted in scheme delays in terms of progressing design development or securing necessary technical approvals. More generally, a significant amount of work is planned in GM over the next three years with TfGM and LAs accessing similar contracting frameworks. This may require a review of delivery timescales as competing works are identified to mitigate impact the pressure.
 - **Managing Customer Disruption during Construction.** Over the next 3 years significant infrastructure improvements are planned across GM. If construction works are not properly managed and coordinated this will result in significant disruption and customer impacts across the transport network, particularly given external factors such as unplanned utility works or emergency highway maintenance repairs. Scheme mapping and delivery integration are vital to managing this key risk.
 - **Delivering a Fully Integrated Network.** The CRSTS programme includes proposals to improve transport infrastructure across all modes, from Bus to Metrolink, Rail to Active Travel. Within the context of a constrained highway network this can give rise to potential conflict : for example, delivering ambitious bus priority requires re-allocation of road space to buses, but in many cases this can have a potential impact on private car journeys and/or require creative and cost effective solutions to meet active travel needs. Equally, delivery of ambitious active travel projects can require a re-imagining of the way road-space and streets are used, especially through proposals such as active neighbourhoods and school streets, and some of these conversations and debates have played out on the national stage, including a recent review on the effectiveness of low traffic neighbourhoods and the introduction of the Plan for Drivers. Robust design management, comprehensive stakeholder engagement and strong political support and decision making are needed to ensure that the expected benefits are delivered in the required timescales, and that the expectations of a fully integrated and reliable transport network are met.

-
- **Inclusive Design.** Some elements of active travel design can prove challenging for visually impaired users particularly where they interface with other modes, such as at bus stops. This can lead to difficulty in securing stakeholder support, and the full realisation of intended benefits. TfGM continues to work across GM with a wide range of reference groups, including our own Disability Design Reference Group (DDRG), to ensure such issues are addressed through the design review process, and through supporting the development of pioneering solutions such as our current technology trial which uses an audible warning system to assist visually impaired pedestrians.
 - **Novelty / Lack of National Standards.** There is currently a lack of national standards and requirements for EV buses and associated infrastructure (for example in relation to the type of equipment, how this is monitored and what needs to be considered in emergency scenarios, particularly around fire risk and mitigation). This means that we are not able to be clear with our supply chain on what is required when developing and delivering projects, creating a risk that the specification used will not align with future legislation and retrospective works will be required. This also leads to a lack of definition when consulting with key stakeholders, including fire services and insurers. Clarity on this is essential to ensure a consistent approach and that all requirements are met.
 - **High Speed Rail Timetable Uncertainty.** Following the cancellation of HS2, the timetable for future high speed rail services on the West Coast Mainline is uncertain. In this context, the integration of the new Golborne Station with the wider rail industry remains a key challenge and is likely to result in delays to the scheme until this is resolved. TfGM continues to engage across the rail industry and DfT to ensure Golborne is included in their long term planning assumptions.

Lessons Learned

We have used the key challenges above to identify a number of lessons learned and examples of best practice which are being implemented to drive continuous improvement across the programme. These include:

Pipeline Delivery. Using a range of differing and successive funding streams, including Mayors Challenge Fund via Transforming Cities, Active Travel Funding, Capability Funding and CRSTS, TfGM has been able to develop an active travel infrastructure pipeline which is a blend of schemes approved for delivery and those which have had some development work undertaken. This developed pipeline has enabled GM to rapidly respond to emerging funding opportunities, with a demonstrable ability to deliver to short time-frames.

Adopting a whole pipeline approach has also enabled us to realise benefits over and above transport-related outcomes, for example through the recently-completed **Stockport Interchange Mixed Use** development where our ability to blend multiple funding streams has resulted in the

delivery of significant regeneration and placemaking with transport at its heart. A whole pipeline approach has also allowed transfer of team knowledge, skills and experience from Stockport Interchange to Bury Interchange.

Early Development of Schemes in Advance of Capital Funding. Given the timescales required to develop schemes, including design and undertaking meaningful engagement and public consultation, it is critical to secure approval of the Strategic Outline Business Case (SOBC) in advance of securing capital funding. This means a greater reliance on revenue funding to facilitate timely development and delivery, in partnership with local authorities. Access to revenue funding to enable scheme development through the early years of the CRSTS1 programme has been a key factor in getting schemes to the point where they are ready to deliver, however ongoing access to this support is required in order to maintain a rolling pipeline approach.

Effective and Efficient Processes. Successful delivery of a programme of this scale and complexity relies on having streamlined and proportionate processes embedded at each stage. As an example, the Bus Pinch Points and Maintenance programme is a rolling programme, delivering a high volume of lower cost and lower risk / complexity schemes. Standard governance procedures were deemed disproportionate and time consuming. To mitigate this, streamlined governance arrangements have been implemented that are proportional based on risk, complexity, and value, whilst still providing assurance that money is spent on the right things, and delivering value in line with the SOBC. Examples of this include an annual drawdown of funding to support development and delivery of schemes, and a "one-pager" Full Business Case template for interventions less than £100k with a simplified sign off process. This all enables quicker delivery and the ability to be flexible to respond to operational issues as they arise on the network. Use of embedded templates and processes across the programme also helps us to ensure a consistent approach.

Buildability. Early contractor involvement (ECI) can help to derisk delivery and provide certainty on the costs estimate and construction timescales, by providing the most up-to-date construction knowledge and buildability input to inform the options and development stages of a scheme. As an example, this has proved key in our Bus Depot Charging Infrastructure programme in enabling us to determine how construction works can best be implemented in an operational depot environment.

Reference to delivery of previous schemes and programmes also provides us with important learning points in terms of key areas and risks to consider. For example, reference to previously delivered electric vehicle charging infrastructure programmes has helped to inform the delivery of our current bus depot electrification programme, in particular in relation to electrical supplies and associated requirements.

Industry Engagement. Ongoing engagement is required with suppliers, consultants, operators and contractors to understand what the market looks like today, tomorrow and beyond. In particular, some areas of the CRSTS programme are in a fast-emerging market, with operational, technical and technology advances happening at an accelerated pace. Following ongoing market engagement, procurement strategies have been optimised to incentivise the supply chain via a combination of

scale & longevity (for example, creating pipeline packages of similar renewals developed via ECI) whilst retaining individual procurement opportunities for SMEs / specialist suppliers.

We have also experienced situations, for example through the rail programme, where interfacing schemes have been identified at a late stage of delivery and this has caused some delay. Earlier engagement and better integration by key industry partners to provide a single guiding mind will lead to greater efficiency in the delivery of benefits and mitigate the delays caused by interfacing projects.

Good Network Management. Undertaking preventative maintenance to carriageways in the early stages of deterioration can help to avoid or delay the need to carry out full structural renewal and, in most cases, will return a greater whole life cost benefit.

To understand the condition of the KRN carriageway a SCANNER survey is planned to be carried out in the first quarter of 2024 for the whole length of the carriageway, the results of which will enable us to prioritise preventative highway maintenance works where they are most needed.

To secure the expeditious movement of traffic it is important that LA's engage with their work co-ordination teams early to plan their time on the highway network to minimise the disruption. Works programmes also need to be dynamic to take into account the needs of other works promoters, for example utility companies. The National Highways & Transport Network (NHT) is a service used by all the GM LA's, which are used to measure their performance, compare with their peers, identify areas of improvement and can help to shape policies and procedures. We also use GMRAPs to co-ordinate works, in conjunction with GIS mapping of all schemes.

As part of their general highway asset management planning all GM LA's have developed long term maintenance programmes, but with the ability to be flexible to accommodate changing circumstances. Adopting this approach has enabled some LA's to accelerate their planned package of works early in the programme to take this into account.

Appendix 1 – GM CRSTS 1 Delivery Plan

CRSTS Re-baselined Scheme List October 2023
Bus Programme
Quality Bus Transit
Future Quality Bus Transit (QBT) Corridor: Bury-Rochdale (including Rochdale: Heywood Streets for All)
Future Quality Bus Transit (QBT) Corridor: Ashton-Stockport
Future Quality Bus Transit (QBT) Corridor: Wigan-Leigh
Initial phased delivery of Wigan-Bolton Corridor
Initial phased delivery of Rochdale-Oldham-Ashton Corridor
City Centre Bus Connectivity
City Centre Bus Strategy Phase 1
Initial phased delivery of Salford Crescent-Media City UK Corridor
Sale West to Altrincham Network Improvements
City Centre Radials: A662 Ashton New Road
City Centre Radials: A664 Rochdale Road
City Centre Radials: A62 Oldham Road
City Centre Radials: A6 Stockport Road
City Centre Radials: B117 Wilmslow Road
Bus Pinch points and Maintenance
Bus Pinchpoint Fund (Rolling Programme)
Bus priority signing and lining (Rolling Programme)
Bus Stop Enhancement Programme (Rolling Programme)
Intelligent Transport Systems (ITS) Enhancements (Rolling Programme)
Integrated Measures
Integrated Ticketing and Information
Electric Bus Package
Electric Vehicles (EV) Buses
Bus Franchise Depots
Depot Charging Infrastructure
Rail Programme
Access for All Package
Deliver a number of the remaining Access for All (AfA) stations
Deliver Daisy Hill and Irlam Access for All (AfA) stations
Develop and deliver Swinton Access for All (AfA) scheme
Develop further Access for All (AfA) schemes (Development only)
Station Improvement Package
Station improvement regeneration and development
Tameside: Hattersley Station Improved Access

CRSTS Re-baselined Scheme List
October 2023
Development of new stations (Development only)
Stockport Station (Development only)
New Stations Package
Golborne Station
Rapid Transit Integration Programme
Interchanges Package
Bury Interchange
Travel Hubs Package
Tyldesley Travel Hub / Park & Ride (P&R)
Programme of Travel Hubs / Park & Ride (P&R) at Stations and Stops
New Stops & Stop Improvements Package
Develop Potential New Guided Busway Stop - Mosley Common (Development only)
Development of Potential New Metrolink Stops: Sandhills (Development only)
Development of Potential New Metrolink Stops: Elton Reservoir (Development only)
Development of Potential New Metrolink Stops: Cop Road (Development only)
Metrolink Stop Improvements
Future Rapid Transit Programme
New Lines & Extensions Package
Development of long term rapid transit options (Development only)
Powers for 1 scheme and development for 2 schemes (Development only)
Metrolink Next Generation Vehicles & Tram-Train Package
Next Generation Vehicles
Pathfinder – Infrastructure
Stockholm Road Bridge
Greek Street Bridge
HS2 Programme
Design and Development work on Metrolink and High Speed Stations (Development only)
Metrolink Renewals Programme
Deferred and further renewals 2025+
Prioritised renewals 2022-2025
Active Travel Programme
Approved but unfunded schemes in MCF programme
Streets for All Programme
Town Centre Scheme Package
Bolton: Farnworth Street for All (S4A) Town Centre Scheme
Bolton: Town Centre Package including Topp Way / Higher Bridge Street
Bury Town Centre Scheme (over and above interchange works)
Bury: Radcliffe Town Centre Development
Bury: Ramsbottom Town Centre Development
Manchester: Ancoats Streets for All
Manchester: Transforming Deansgate (Streets for All)
Oldham: Town Centre - Accessible Oldham Phase 2

CRSTS Re-baselined Scheme List
October 2023
Rochdale: Littleborough Streets for All
Rochdale: Middleton Streets for All Phase 1
Stockport Interchange
Stockport: Town Centre West
Stockport: Greek Street Bridge Streets for All
Corridor Schemes Package
wayBolton: De Havilland Way
Oldham Mumps Corridor Improvements
Oldham: Beal Valley & Broadbent Moss - Greenway Corridor
Salford: Peel Green Active Travel Scheme
Salford: Quays Northern Access (Broadway/S Langworthy Road)
Stockport: A6 / Manchester Road / School Lane
Stockport: Woodley to Bredbury Parkway Improvement Scheme (formerly, Bredbury Economic Corridor Improvement (BECI) Package)
Stockport: Hempshaw Lane
Tameside: A560 Stockport Road
Trafford: Carrington Sustainable Transport Measures
Wigan: A577 Complementary Works (Development only)
Wigan: A580 Lane Head Improvements
Electric Vehicle Charging Package
Electric Vehicle Charging infrastructure (EVCI) Match funding
Highway Maintenance Programme
Core Highway Maintenance Package
Consolidated Highway Maintenance (Needs, Incentive & Potholes)
Strategic Maintenance Package
Bolton - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Bury - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Manchester - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Oldham - Manchester Street Viaduct
Rochdale - Queens Park Bridge Refurbishment & Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Salford - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Stockport: Queens Road Bridge Refurbishment & Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway (formerly, Greek Street Bridge Refurbishment)
Tameside - Hattersley Viaduct Refurbishment and Widening
Trafford - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway and Structures
Wigan - Key Route Network (KRN) Carriageway
Minor Works & Road Safety / Development
Integrated Transport Block (ITB) - Minor Works
Integrated Transport Block (ITB) - Public Transport
Transforming Cities Fund 2 (TCF2) Development (Development only)