

Appendix C – Process materials

The full set of process materials is available from Hopkins Van Mil on request. Below we share a sample of the process plans used for online workshops.

Excerpt from workshop 1 – scoping and question review – 6-9pm Thursday 11th/ Monday 15th May

Aim & objectives of the dialogue:

The overall aim of the project is to engage a diverse group of the public to inform what further policy is necessary for digital identity services and provision to be trustworthy. Findings from the dialogue will:

- Inform the rules that providers of digital identities must follow in order to become certified against the UK digital identity and attributes trust framework.
- Inform the functions, oversight structure and interaction with the public of the governing body for digital identities (the Office for Digital Identities and Attributes - OfDIA) e.g. complaints structure, advisory functions, support for the public, anti-fraud functions.
- Inform planning for public communications initiatives.
- Test a new engagement strategy combining a public dialogue and sandbox-style testing with industry.

Initial research questions

These will be reviewed by participants in workshop 1 – scoping and questions review - and may change as a result. For now the overarching question is: *What is the government's role in setting system oversight?* The key questions are:

1. What rules should be put on providers regarding user control of data, transparency, privacy and inclusion?
 - What are the red lines of what providers should not be allowed to do with users' data?
 - What does the public expect from the use of biometric technologies in digital identities?
2. What does a digital identity governing body need to have in order to build public trust?
3. What risks does the public see in digital identities?
4. What should the general public know about digital identities?

The dialogue is being held **online using Zoom**. It comprises:

- Workshops with two groups of 48 people (England/ Scotland, Wales & Northern Ireland) from 9th May to 7th June

Team – LF x 1, Facilitators x 8 (including LF), Tech support x 1 for each location.

- This scoping workshop is the second event in the dialogue
- Scotland, Wales & Northern Ireland is held on Thursday 11th May
- England is on Monday 15th May

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
5:15-5:45	Set-up	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Test link, and camera. • Transfer host/co-host function to relevant team members and ensure it is allocated to the right team member(s) for sharing screens. • Change screen name to NAME HVM – Facilitator/ Tech Support • Test screen share function for films/ presentations • Check small groups, facilitator allocation 	HVM team	PP Slides	Project team set up and ready
5:45-6:00	Participant Check-in	<p>Participants who want to test their learning from the tech-try outs are encouraged to join the zoom session early to check-in and check their video/ mic is working.</p> <p>Open www.menti.com on smart phones/ tab on their computer. Explain about QR code/ link (which will be put in the chat)</p> <p>Participants encouraged to get a pen and paper and have their participant pack with them. Once settled they can mute/ turn video off/ get drinks and snacks before we start promptly at 6pm.</p> <p>Warm chat as people settle in.</p> <p>TS to run a register as people join and change your screen name to first name only.</p>	All	Menti.com List of participants	Participants set up and ready
6:00-6:10	Introduction to this	Warm welcome to our second session together, and our first workshop. This will feel different from our webinar. We'll be	HVM	PP Purpose & Agenda	People are clear:

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> How/ why we'll capture what is said this evening – we are interested in what you say not who says what, your name will not be linked back to anything we write about in the report Mention the final report and its purpose 			
6:10-6:20 (10 mins)	Menti questions set 1	<p>Participants asked to get menti.com on their phones/ another tab on their device.</p> <p>Share the code, the QR code and the link in the chat – as 3 easy ways to get into menti.</p> <p>Reminder no right or wrong here, the questions I'm asking now are about beginning to think about our dialogue topic. LF to share screen with 'hide results'</p> <p>QM1: Share one quick thing about yourself</p> <p>Just a few words with something you feel you can share with us about you, and/ or what you are interested in. Remember we'll be sharing our screen in a minute so make the sentence appropriate.</p> <p>QM2: What comes to your mind now when you think about what you heard at the webinar?</p> <p>LF to share results when more than 12 are in.</p>	LF	Menti.com Tech support to put menti link/ code in the Chat	<p>Getting back in to the space by remembering the webinar</p> <p>Getting to know each other and who we have in the room.</p> <p>Knowledge of digital identities</p>
6:20-6:25 (5 mins)	Short day in the life slides	LF to introduce a short set of 'day in the life' slides – one person's day of proving their identity, showing a variety of situations/ proofs needed.	LF/ TS	In slide deck	A prompt for the next discussion
6:25	TS to move everyone to their pre-allocated small groups – 7 participants per group, based on a mix of demographics, 1 facilitator for each group, tech support available to all groups for immediate Zoom challenges. Facilitation team stay in touch				

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
via WhatsApp group. Participants supported throughout by the facilitator, also reminded to DM facilitator if anything they wish to ask outside of the group discussion.					
6:25-7:15 (50 mins)	Thinking about verifying your identity	Facilitator to welcome everyone to the group. Note about recording. RECORDER ON We asked you before the workshop to find and bring something that you use to verify your identity. Go round the Zoom again, ask participants to share what they have brought and to quickly show it on screen if they feel comfortable doing so, but not so anyone can see details.	Fs/ Small groups	Facilitator Jamboards for visible note taking/ participants can check & amend what's noted as we go along.	Grounding in personal experience of identities.
6:25-6:35 (10 mins)		Let's go round the Zoom, I'll ask you to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Say hello to the group and where you are zooming in from 2. Share briefly the thing you use to verify your identity and any points about why it is helpful 3. Facilitator to start to model the length of the response. 			
6:35-6:55 (15 mins)	A week in the life of your identity	Discussion: We're going to explore this more now. Think about a typical weekday and all the times you have to prove something (e.g. your age, who you are, that you have registered for a service, that you live at your address) about yourself in order to do something. Let's create a list of why you need to do this. Facilitator to use prompts as necessary: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have you thought about all the times when you need to prove who you are – on and offline? • Reflections on how you prove who you are, including biometric data e.g. fingerprints, facial recognition 		List the things people have brought on the Jamboard Note main reasons for using it. Create a list on the Jamboard (images as	Clarity on the ways in which we do need to prove our identity in various

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
6:55-7:15 (20 mins)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reflections on using more than one form of id – a collection of proofs of who you are e.g. opening a bank account needs several proofs of address Are the times you need to prove something about yourself similar to Evie? Or different? <p>Thinking about attributes, when you reflect on all these ways in which you need to prove something –</p> <p>Q1. To what extent are some attributes more important than others in different situations, and why?</p> <p>Facilitator to pick a couple of examples to explore which will explore different situations/ attributes needed e.g. buying alcohol in a supermarket, dating, to access council services e.g. library/ leisure centre, to proving your right to work in the UK. Group to discuss the question.</p> <p>TS to announce to all groups 3 minutes remaining in small groups at 7:17. Close groups with one minute count down at 7:19. RECORDER OFF</p>		<p>a prompt)</p> <p>Show 'what is an attribute' on the Jamboard</p> <p>Note down key points made about importance/ Whys.</p> <p>TS broadcast</p>	<p>everyday situations.</p> <p>Considering that in some cases you need a bank statement and a utility bill to prove your address.</p> <p>Beginning to think of the understanding of equivalence between in person and digital (picked up again in workshop).</p>

Excerpt from workshop 5 – the rules, governance, trust and summing up – 10am-4pm Saturday 3rd June (Scotland, Wales & Northern Ireland group)¹

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
9:15-9:45	Set-up	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Test link, and camera. • Transfer host/co-host function to relevant team members and ensure it is allocated to the right team member(s) for sharing screens. • Change screen name to NAME HVM – Facilitator/ Tech Support • Test screen share function for films/ presentations • Check small groups, facilitator allocation 	HVM team	PP Slides	Project team set up and ready
9:45-10:00	Participant Check-in	<p>Participants who want to test their learning from the tech-try outs are encouraged to join the zoom session early to check-in and check their video/ mic is working.</p> <p>Open www.menti.com on smart phones/ tab on their computer. Explain about QR code/ link (which will be put in the chat)</p> <p>Participants encouraged to get a pen and paper and have their participant pack with them. Once settled they can mute/ turn video off/ get drinks and snacks before we start promptly at 6pm.</p> <p>Warm chat as people settle in.</p>	All	<p>Menti.com</p> <p>List of participants</p>	Participants set up and ready

¹ The same workshop 5 process was followed for the England group but split across two x 3-hour evening sessions on Tuesday 6th and Wednesday 7th June.

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> How/ why we'll capture what is said this evening – we are interested in what you say not who says what, your name will not be linked back to anything we write about in the report Mentions the report this feeds into 			
10:10-10:20 (10 mins)	Menti questions set 1	<p>Participants asked to get menti.com on their phones/ another tab on their device.</p> <p>Share the code, the QR code and the link in the chat – as 3 easy ways to get into menti.</p> <p>Reminder no right or wrong here, the questions I'm asking now are about beginning to think about our dialogue topic.</p> <p>LF to share screen with 'hide results'</p> <p>QM1: Share one hope you have for digital identity services</p> <p>QM2: Share one concern you have for digital identity services</p> <p>Complete this sentence: QM3: Trusted digital identity services will be...</p> <p>In each case LF to share results when more than 12 are in</p>	LF	Menti.com Tech support to put menti link/ code in the Chat	Getting back in to the space by remembering the webinar Thinking about hopes and concerns as a route to trust.
10:20-10:45 (20 mins) 10:20-10:35 (15	Summary of what we've done so far	<p>Presentation 1: LF to present a summary of all we've done so far:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What's been covered in each workshop <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Who has spoken to the group on what Stimulus shared in relation to DSIT plans/ the trust framework Lived experience films we've seen The activities on Recollective 	LF	Questions in the chat shared by participants as we go through these	A full review of what we've discussed/ shared/ worked on over the last 3 weeks.

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
mins) 10:35-10:45 (10 mins)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Answers to the questions that we've uploaded to Recollective Reassurance that this is a process, and can be difficult, you may change your mind, you may want to explore something in depth – that's fine, we can do that today. <p>Questions on what we've done together/ shared/ discussed fielded by HVM/ DSIT.</p> <p>This is our last question session. Now we need to shift our thinking from asking questions to saying what we want. Think about this as your trust framework and your dialogue. What do you want to focus on to propose clear recommendations for DSIT on how the trust framework and oversight of the system should work.</p>		review points.	
10:45 TS to move everyone to their pre-allocated small groups – 7 participants per group, same groups as in previous workshop					
10:45-11:15 (30 mins)	A focus on the trust framework and the 'Rules'	<p>In the UK digital identity & attributes trust framework you have seen summaries of key sections about the 'rules' for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identity service providers Attribute service providers Identity and attribute service providers Orchestration service providers Scheme owners all identity, attribute and orchestration service providers <p>We're going to work through our summaries (which you'll have already seen on the online community space now). We'll start this now and continue after the break.</p> <p>RECORDER ON</p>		Facilitators have beta version trust framework in full open to share as necessary Infographic/ visual suite summarising sections	Making sure the elements already in the trust framework are being reviewed not re-invented

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
		<p>Q1: What stands out for you as important?</p> <p>Q2: What stands out for you as reassuring?</p> <p>Q3: What is missing which might give further reassurance?</p> <p>Discussion – focused on what you want to see in relation to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Making sure there is consistency across providers e.g. I can use the same app when buying alcohol in all the supermarkets (full framework 15.1 making your products and services interoperable with others/ 15.15 working with relying partners) 2. What happens when things go wrong – responding to complaints (full framework 15.3 responding to complaints) 3. Reassurance – standards/ principles/ values (full framework 15.6 service and quality management) 4. Inclusion (full framework 13.3 make sure your products and services are inclusive) <p>Participants can explore the topics they want to discuss in depth – you can be guided by them in this discussion using the framework as a guide.</p> <p>TS to announce to all groups 3 minutes remaining in small groups at 11:12. Close groups with one minute count down at 11:14.</p> <p>RECORDER OFF</p>		<p>12-16 of the trust framework</p> <p>Fs to share Jamboard with each of the visuals.</p> <p>Screen divided into 3 Important Reassuring Missing</p> <p>TS broadcast</p>	

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
11:15-11:30 (15 mins)	Break – LF to remind people to stay in Zoom just to turn off their cameras/ mics and put the camera back on when they return promptly at 11:40.				
11:30	TS to move everyone to their pre-allocated small groups – same 7 participants per group				
11:30-12:00 (30 mins)	Continued focus on the trust framework and the rules.	<p>RECORDER ON</p> <p>Q1: What stands out for you as important?</p> <p>Q2: What stands out for you as reassuring?</p> <p>Q3: What is missing which might give further reassurance?</p> <p>Discussion – focused on:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Management of data (full framework 15.7 information management, 15.8 information security) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Who owns/ controls the data • How do I expect my data to be cared for/ managed 2. Risk management (full framework 15.9 risk management) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Privacy (full framework 15.13 privacy and data protection) • Fraud (full framework 15.10) • Theft (full framework 15.8 information security) 3. Questions of cost/ monetisation – what do you think? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Who should pay? • Solutions for people who can't pay • Who benefits/ losses <p>Participants can explore the topics they want to discuss in depth – you can be guided by them in this discussion using the framework</p>		<p>Visuals on the 'rules' within the trust framework</p> <p>Screen divided into 3</p> <p>Important Reassuring Missing</p>	Making sure the elements already in the trust framework are being reviewed not re-invented

Time	Agenda	Process	Who?	Process Tools	Expected Outcomes
		as a guide.			
12:00-12:40 (40 mins)	Lived experience review	Review case studies including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Day in the life (from 1st workshop) • Lived experience films • Journal activities. 		Lived experience reminders on Jamboard	Using the examples proposed by participants to understand views on key topics and themes
12:00-12:20 (20 mins)		As a result of this review, thinking through these specific cases: Q4: What are your concerns for digital identity services <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Including those things which are red-lines e.g. what di service providers should never be allowed to do Q5: What are your aspirations for digital identity services <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Including those things which will really give assurances 		– drawn from what participant s shared in workshop 1/ our own materials	
12:20-12:40 (20 mins)		In both cases considering: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusion • Data protection including against theft/ fraud • Re-usability • Being able to use the identity in a range of contexts • Reassurances needed. 		Concerns/ aspirations same column on one Jamboard	
		We'll continue/ conclude our deliberations after lunch.			
		TS to announce to all groups 3 minutes remaining in small groups at 12:37. Close groups with one minute count down at 12:39.			
		RECORDER OFF			

