

'Feeding young children aged 1 to 5 years'
—
Annex 7

## **Contents**

Annex 7: Overlap between identified systematic reviews or meta-analyses	3
Micronutrients	
Table A7.1 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on iron fortification and iron status	3
Foods, dietary components, and dietary patterns	6
Table A7.2 Overlap between systematic reviews on milk consumption	6
Table A7.3 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on non-nutritive sweeteners	7
Drinks	7
Table A7.4 Overlap between systematic reviews on milk consumption and obesity outcomes	7
Table A7.5 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on sugar-sweetened beverages or fruit juice and obesity outcomes	8
Eating and feeding behaviours	9
Table A7.6 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on interventions to improve vegetable and fruit consumption in young children	•
Table A7.7 Overlap between systematic reviews on caregiver feeding practices or styles	13
Oral health	16
Table A7.8 Overlap between systematic reviews on free sugars intake and dental caries	16
Table A7.9 Overlap between systematic reviews on breastfeeding or bottle feeding beyond 12 months and malocclusion	17

## Annex 7: Overlap between identified systematic reviews or metaanalyses

#### **Micronutrients**

Table A7.1 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on iron fortification and iron status

Primary study (first author, year)	Athe (2013) <sup>1</sup>	Das (2013) <sup>1,2</sup>	Eichler (2012) <sup>1,2</sup>	Hojsak (2018)³	Matsuyama (2017) <sup>1</sup>	Pratt (2015) <sup>3</sup>	Ramakrishnan (2009)a <sup>1</sup>	Overlap
Abizari (2012)		Х						1
Andang'o (2007)	X	X						2
Akkermans (2017)				X				1
Arcanjo (2010)		X						1
Bagni (2009)		X						1
Barbosa (2012)		X						1
Beinner (2005)	X	X						2
Bradley (1993)	X							1
Chen (2005)		X						1
Daly (1996)		X	X		X			3
De Almeida (2003)	Х							1
De Almeida (2005)		X						1
De Oliveira (1996)	Х							1
Faber (2005)		X	X					2
Gibson (2011)			X					1
Gill (1997)		X	X				X	3
Giorgini (2001)	X	X						2
Haschke (1998)		X						1
Huo (2002)		X						1
Jack (2012)						Х		1
Jaivad (1991)							X	1
Lartey (1999)			Χ					1

Primary study (first author, year)	Athe (2013) <sup>1</sup>	Das (2013) <sup>1,2</sup>	Eichler (2012) <sup>1,2</sup>	Hojsak (2018) <sup>3</sup>	Matsuyama (2017) <sup>1</sup>	Pratt (2015) <sup>3</sup>	Ramakrishnan (2009)a¹	Overlap
Le Huong Thi (2006)	Х	Х						2
Liu(1993)			Х					1
Longfils (2008)		X						1
Lundeen (2010)						Х		1
Maldonado Lonzano (2007)			Х					1
Marsh (1995)		Х						1
Moffatt (1994)		Х						1
Moreira-Araujo (2007)	Х							1
Moretti (2006)	Х	X						2
Morley (1999)		X	Х		X		Χ	4
Muthayya (2012)		X						1
Nga (2009)	Х							1
Nogueria (2012)		X						1
Nogueria (2012)		X						1
Osei (2010)	Х							1
Rim (2008)	X	X						2
Rivera (2010)			X		X	X		3
Rosado (2010)						X		1
Sari (2001)	Х	X						2
Sazawal (2010)	X		X		X			3
Schumann (2005)		X	X					2
Shamah Levy (2008)		X						1
Singhal (2000)					X			1
Stevens (1995)		X			X			2
Stevens (1998)			X					1
Szymlek-Gay (2009)		X		X	X	X		4
Van Stuijvenberg (2001)	X							1
Van Stuijvenberg	X							1
Varma (2007)	X							1
Villalpando (2006)			Χ		X	Х		3
Virtanen (2001)		X	Χ		X			3

Primary study (first author, year)	Athe (2013) <sup>1</sup>	Das (2013) <sup>1,2</sup>	Eichler (2012) <sup>1,2</sup>	Hojsak (2018) <sup>3</sup>	Matsuyama (2017) <sup>1</sup>	Pratt (2015) <sup>3</sup>	Ramakrishnan (2009)a <sup>1</sup>	Overlap
Walter (1993)		Х						1
Walter (1993)		X						1
Walter (1998)			X					1
Xuan					X			1
Zimmerman (2010)		X						1
Zimmerman (2006)	X							1
Total	18	33	15	2	10	6	3	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Findings not stratified by baseline status.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> % weighting of meta-analyses from studies in children outside of 12 to 60 month range.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> No meta-analysis.

### Foods, dietary components, and dietary patterns

#### Table A7.2 Overlap between systematic reviews on milk consumption

Primary study (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline are listed.	De Beer (2012)	Dougkas (2019)	Dror and Allen (2014)	Overlap
Carruth and Skinner, 2001		Х	Х	2
Garden, 2011		X		1
He, 2005	Х			1
Huus, 2009		X		1
Moore, 2005			X	1
Moore, 2006		X	X	2
Moore, 2008			X	1
Rangan, 2012		X	X	2
Total	1	5	5	

Table A7.3 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on non-nutritive sweeteners

Primary study (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline	Karalexi (2018)	WHO (2022)	Overlap
Kral, 2008	X	X	2
Newby, 2004	X	X	2
Zheng, 2015		X	1
Total	2	2	

#### **Drinks**

Table A7.4 Overlap between systematic reviews on milk consumption and obesity outcomes

Primary study (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline	Dougkas (2019)	Vanderhout (2020)	Overlap
DeBoer, 2014	X	X	2
Faith, 2006	X		1
Huh, 2010	X	X	2
Newby, 2004	X		1
Hasnain 2014	X		1
Scharf, 2013	X	X	2
Wosje, 2001		X	1
Total	6	4	

Table A7.5 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on sugar-sweetened beverages or fruit juice and obesity outcomes

Primary study (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline	Frantsve- Hawley (2017)	Luger (2017)	Perez- Morales (2013)	Te Morenga (2012)	Overlap
Cantoral (2015)		Х			1
Chaidez (2014)		Х			1
De Boer (2013)	Х	Х			2
De Coen (2014)	Х				1
Dubois (2007)	Х		Х	X	3
Faith (2006)	Х			Х	2
Guerrero (2016)	Х				1
Hasnain (2014)	Х	Х			2
Herbst (2011)			Х	Х	2
Kral (2008)			Х		1
Kuhl (2014)	Х				1
Lim (2009)	Х			Х	2
Millar (2014)	Х		Х		2
Newby (2004)	Х		Х		2
Shefferly (2016)	Х				1
Skinner (1999)	Х				1
Skinner (2001)	Х		Х	Х	3
Sonneville (2015)	X	X			2
Weijs (2011)	Х			Х	2
Welsh (2005)	Х		Х	Х	3
Wheaton (2015)	Х				1
Williams (2008)				Х	1
Zheng (2015)	Х	Х			2
Total	18	6	7	8 <sup>1</sup>	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Five of the 8 studies included in the meta-analysis by Te Morenga et al (2012) are referenced in the main report.

#### **Eating and feeding behaviours**

Table A7.6 Overlap between systematic reviews or meta-analyses on interventions to improve vegetable and fruit consumption in young children

Primary study (first author, year)	Hodder (2020)	Holley (2017)	Nekitsing (2018)	Mura Paroche (2017)	Overlap
Addessi (2005)				X	1
Anzman-Frasca (2012)	X				1
Bayer (2009)					1
Bell (2015)			X		1
Birch (1980)				Х	1
Birch (1987)				X	1
Black (2011) <sup>2</sup>	X				1
Blissett (2016)	X				1
Blossfeld (2007a)				X	1
Blossfeld (2007b)				X	1
Bouhlah (2014)		X	Х	X	3
Branen and Fletcher (1994)					1
Brouwer (2013)			X		1
Brown and Harris, 2012				X	1
Capaldi-Phillips (2014)		Х			1
Caton (2013)	X		Х	Х	3
Caton (2014)				X	1
Chaidez and Kaiser (2011)					1
Cohen (1995) <sup>1</sup>	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Cooke (2011)	X <sub>e</sub>				1
Correia (2014)	X	X	X		3
Cravener (2015)	X <sub>6</sub>		Х		2
Daniels (2014) <sup>1</sup>	X <sub>6</sub>				1

De Bock (2011)	X				1
De Coen (2012)	X				1
De Droog (2014) <sup>3</sup>	X				1
De Droog (2017) <sup>3</sup>	X				1
De Wild (2013)	X	Χ	Х	X	4
De Wild (2015a)	X	Х	Х		3
De Wild (2015b)	X	Х			2
De Wild (2017) <sup>3</sup>	X				1
Duncanson (2013) <sup>2</sup>	X				1
Edelson (2016)				Х	1
Farrow (2019)	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Fildes (2014)	X <sub>6</sub>		Х		2
Fildes (2015) <sup>1</sup>	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Fisher (2012)	X	X	X		3
Gregory (2010)				X	1
Gripshover (2013)		Χ	Х		2
Haire-Joshu (2008) <sup>2,3</sup>	X				1
Harnack (2012)	X	Χ	X		3
Harper and Sanders (1975)				X	1
Hausner (2012)	X	X	X	X	4
Heath (2014)	X			X	2
Hetherington (2015) <sup>1</sup>	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Holley (2015)		X <sup>4</sup>	Х		2
Houston-Price (2009)				X	1
Horne (2011)		Χ	Х		2
Johnson (1991)				X	1
Keller (2012) <sup>1</sup>	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Kim (2018)	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Kling (2016)	X				1
Lee (2015)	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Lumeng and Hillman (2007)				X	1
Lundy (1998)				Х	1

Martinez-Andrade (2014) <sup>2,5</sup>	X		Х		2
Namenek Brouwer (2013) <sup>5</sup>	Х				1
Natale (2014) <sup>4</sup>	X				1
Nekitsing (2019)	X <sup>6</sup>				1
Nicklas (2017) <sup>4</sup>	X				1
O'Connell (2012)	X <sup>6</sup>				2
Owen (2018)	X <sub>6</sub>				1
Remington (2012)	X <sub>6</sub>	X	X		3
Roe (2013)	X	X	X		3
Roset-Salla (2016) <sup>2</sup>	X				1
Savage (2012)	X		Х		2
Sherwood (2015) <sup>2</sup>	X				1
Sirikulchaya-nonta (2010)			Х		1
Skouteris (2015) <sup>2</sup>	X				1
Smith (2017)	X				1
Spill (2010)	X		X		2
Spill (2011a)	X		X		2
Spill (2011b)	X	X	X		3
Staiano (2016)	X <sub>6</sub>	X			2
Tabak (2012) <sup>2</sup>	X		X		2
Vereecken (2009)	X		X		2
Wardle (2003)	X <sub>6</sub>				4
Williams (2014)	X		X		2
Witt and Dunn (2012)	X	X	X		3
Wyse (2012) <sup>2</sup>	X	X			2
Zeinstra (2018)	X <sup>6</sup>				1
Total	58	18	30	19	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Participants aged <1 year but included in the meta-analysis by Hodder et al (2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Excluded from consideration because the intervention targeted parental or child nutrition knowledge (without a dietary or feeding style component) or food provision.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Excluded from consideration because the study did not directly link changes in feeding practices or styles to changes in children's eating behaviours or body weight.

- <sup>4</sup> Excluded from consideration because the intervention did not involve a dietary or feeding component.
- <sup>5</sup> Excluded from consideration because the intervention involved weight management.
- <sup>6</sup> Included in meta-analysis by Hodder et al (2020).

#### Table A7.7 Overlap between systematic reviews on caregiver feeding practices or styles

Primary study (first author, year)	Bergmeier (2015)	Blondin (2016)	Campbell (2007)	Hurley (2011)	Mikkelsen (2014)	Osei- Assibey (2012)	Mura Paroche (2017)	Peters (2012)	Russell (2016)	Skouteris (2011)	Ward (2015)	Overlap
Addessi (2005)							Х					1
Bayer (2009)					X							1
Birch (1980)					X		Х					2
Birch (1987)							X					1
Blossfeld (2007a)							Х					1
Blossfeld (2007b)							Х					1
Bouhlah (2014)							Х					1
Branen and Fletcher (1994)											Х	1
Brouwer (2013)					Х							1
Brown and Harris, 2012							Х					1
Caton (2013)							Х					1
Caton (2014)							Х					1
Chaidez and Kaiser (2011)									Х			1
De Bock (2011)					X							1
De Wild (2013)							Х					1
Dennison (2004)			Х							X		2
Edelson (2016)							Х					1
Faith (2006)				Х					X			2
Farrow and Blissett (2008)				Х								1
Fisher (2003)						Х						1
Fitzgibbon (2005, 2006) <sup>1</sup>			Х					Х		Х		3
Galloway (2006)				Х								1
Gregory (2010)							Х					1
Haire-Joshu (2008) <sup>1,2</sup>								Х		Х		2
Harnack (2012)					X						Х	2

	Bergmeier (2015)	Blondin (2016)	Campbell (2007)	Hurley (2011)	Mikkelsen (2014)	Osei- Assibey (2012)	Mura Paroche (2017)	Peters (2012)	Russell (2016)	Skouteris (2011)	Ward (2015)	Overlap
Harper and Sanders (1975)							X					1
Harvey-Berino and Rouke (2003) <sup>2</sup>			Х					X		X		3
Hausner (2012)							X					1
Heath (2014)							Х					1
Hendy (1999)											Х	1
Hendy (2000)											Х	1
Hendy (2002)					X							1
Horodynski and Stommel (2005) <sup>2</sup>			Х					Х		Х		3
Houston-Price (2009)							Х					1
Ireton and Guthrie (1972)											Х	1
Johnson (1991)							Х					1
Kupers (2014)		X										1
Lim (2011)									Х			1
Looney (2011)						Х						1
Lumeng (2012)	Χ											1
Lumeng and Hillman (2007)							X					1
Lundy (1998)							Х					1
McGarvey (2004) <sup>1</sup>			Х					Х		X		3
O'Connell (2012)					X							1
Ramsey (2013)					X							1
Rolls (2000)						Х						1
Sacher (2008) <sup>3</sup>								Х				1
Spill (2010)						Х						1
Sud (2010)						Х						1
Thompson (2013)									Х			1
Total	1	1	7	3	8	5	19	8	5	7	5	
Wardle (2003)			X					X		X		3

Primary study (first author, year)	Bergmeier (2015)		•	Mikkelsen	Assibey	Darocho			 Ward (2015)	Overlap
Wijtzes (2013)								Χ		1
Worobey (2004) <sup>2</sup>		Х					X			2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Excluded from consideration because the intervention targeted parental or child nutrition knowledge (without a dietary or feeding style component) or food provision.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Excluded from consideration because the study did not directly link changes in feeding practices or styles to changes in children's eating behaviours or body weight.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Excluded from consideration because details of the intervention were not reported.

#### Oral health

#### Table A7.8 Overlap between systematic reviews on free sugars intake and dental caries

Primary study (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline	Baghlaf (2018)	Hooley (2012)	Moores (2022)	Moynihan and Kelly (2014)	Overlap
Battellino (1997)				X	1
Devenish (2020)			X		1
Fontana (2011)		X			1
Gao (2010)	X	X			2
Karjalainen (2001)				X	1
Karjalainen (2015)			X		1
Mackeown (2000)				X	1
Meurman (2010)		X			1
Ohsuka (2009)		X			1
Rodrigues (1999)				X	1
Total	1	4	2	4	

# Table A7.9 Overlap between systematic reviews on breastfeeding or bottle feeding beyond 12 months and malocclusion

Primary studies (first author, year) that includes children aged 12 to 60 months at baseline	Hermont (2015)	Thomaz (2018)	Overlap
Caramez da Silva (2012)	X	X	2
Lescalo de Ferrer (2006)		X	1
Moimaz (2014)	X	X <sup>1</sup>	2
Warren and Bishara (2002)	X	X	2
Total	3	4	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Included in the systematic review but not meta-analysis by Thomaz et al (2018).