

FIRST - TIER TRIBUNAL PROPERTY CHAMBER (RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY)

Case Reference : LON/OOBD/F77/2022/0189

Property: 58 Ashleigh Road, London SW14 8PX

Tenant : Ms Jean Capon

Landlord : R Bloomfield

Type of Application : Determination of a Fair Rent under section

70 of the Rent Act 1977

Tribunal : Mr R Waterhouse MA LLM FRICS

Mr John Francis QPM

HMCTS Code : On Papers

(paper, video, audio)

Date of Decision : 15th February 2023

Date of Statement of Reasons: 15th February 2023

Statement of Reasons

© CROWN COPYRIGHT 2021

Background

The Tribunal gave formal notice of its decision by a Notice dated 15th February 2023 of the determined Fair Rent of £157.00 per week with effect from same date.

By way of application, dated, 20^{th} June 2022 made by the landlord of the property, applied for re registration of a fair rent of £350 per week. Previously the Rent Officer had registered a rent of £123.00 per week on 10^{th} September 2020.

The Rent Officer registered a fair rent of £148.50 per week, effective from 10th September 2022.

In a note dated 28th August 2022 the landlord R Bloomfield objected to the rent registered and the matter was referred to the First –tier Tribunal (Property Chamber) (Residential Property).

Directions were issued by the Tribunal on the 23rd September 2022.

Thereafter, the Directions made provision for the filing with the Tribunal of the parties' respective written submissions and, in particular, for the completion of a reply form giving details of the Property and including any further comments the parties wished the Tribunal to take into account in making its determination.

The tenancy is a statutory (protected) periodic tenancy. The tenancy (not being for a fixed tenancy of 7 years or more) is subject to section 11 of the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985 which sets out the landlords statutory repairing obligations; the tenant is responsible for internal decorations.

The Property

The tribunal inspected the property on 15th February 2023.

The property is a ground floor purpose built flat within an Edwardian terraced building. The property has full central heating, three rooms, with kitchen/dinner, bathroom/shower and a WC. The property is single glazed throughout.

The inspection found a lounge on right of the entrance, with bedroom beyond the passage leading to kitchen dinner with bathroom at the end

Relevant Law

Provisions in respect of the jurisdiction of the Tribunal and the determination of a fair rent are found in Schedule 11, Part 1, paragraph 9(1) to the Rent Act 1977, as amended by paragraph 34 of the Transfer of Tribunal Functions Order 2013, and section 70 of the Rent Act 1977.

Rent Act 1977

Schedule 11, Part 1, paragraph 9 (as amended)

"Outcome of determination of fair rent by appropriate tribunal

9.-(1) The appropriate tribunal shall-

- (a) if it appears to them that the rent registered or confirmed by the rent officer is a fair rent, confirm that rent;
- (b) if it does not appear to them that that rent is a fair rent, determine a fair rent for the dwelling house."

Section 70: Determination of fair rent (as amended)

- "(1) In determining, for the purposes of the Part of this Act, what rent is or would be a fair rent under a regulated tenancy of a dwelling house, regard shall be had to all the circumstances (other than personal circumstances) and in particular to-
 - (a) the age, character, locality and state of repair of the dwelling-house, ...
 - (b) if any furniture is provided for the use under the tenancy, the quantity, quality and condition of the furniture [, and
 - (c) any premium, or sum in the nature of a premium, which has been or may be lawfully required or received on the grant, renewal, continuance or assignment of the tenancy.]
- (2) For the purposes of the determination it shall be assumed that the number of persons seeking to become tenants of similar dwelling-houses in locality on the terms (other than those relating to rent) of the regulated tenancy is not substantially greater than the number of such dwelling-houses in the locality which are available for letting on such terms.

(3) There shall be disregarded-

- (a) any disrepair or other defect attributable to a failure by the tenant under the regulated tenancy or any predecessor in title of his to comply with any terms thereof;
- (b) any improvement carried out, otherwise than in pursuance of the terms of the tenancy, by the tenant under the regulated tenancy or any predecessor in title of his;
- (c), (d) ...[repealed]
- (e) if any furniture is provided for use under the regulated tenancy, any improvement to the furniture by the tenant under the regulated tenancy or any predecessor of his or, as the case may be, any deterioration in the condition of the furniture due to any ill-treatment by the tenant, any person residing or lodging with him, or any sub-tenant of his."

Consequently, when determining a fair rent the Tribunal, in accordance with the Rent Act 1977, section 70, has regard to all the circumstances including the age, location and state of repair of the Property. It also disregards the effect of (a) any relevant Tenant's improvements and (b) the effect of any disrepair or defect attributed to the Tenant of any predecessor in title under the regulated tenancy, on the rental value of the Property.

In Spath Holme Ltd v Chairman of the Greater Manchester etc. Committee (1995) 28 HLR 107 and Curtis v London Rent Assessment Committee [1999] QB 92 the Court of Appeal emphasised:

- (a) that ordinarily a fair rent is the market rent for the property discounted for "scarcity" (i.e. that element, if any, of the market rent, that is attributable to there being a significant shortage of similar properties in the wider locality available for letting on terms- other than as to rent- to that of the regulated tenancy) and
- (b) that for the purposes of determining the market rent, assured tenancy (market rents) are usually appropriate comparables. (The rents may have to be adjusted where necessary to reflect any differences between the comparables and the subject property).

In considering scarcity under section 70 (2), the Tribunal recognises that:

- (a) there are considerable variations in the level of a scarcity in different parts of the country and that there is no general guidance or "rule of thumb" to indicate what adjustments should be made; the Tribunal, therefore, considers the case on its merits;
- (b) terms relating to rents are to be excluded. A lack of demand at a particular rent is not necessarily evidence of scarcity; it may be evidence that the prospective tenants are not prepared to pay that particular rent.

Fair rents are subject to a capping procedure under the Rent Acts (Maximum Fair Rent) Order 1999 which limits increases by a formula based on the proportional increase in the Retail Price Index since last registration.

The only exception to this restriction on a fair rent is provided under paragraph 7 of the Order where a landlord carries out repairs or improvements which increase the rent by 15% or more of the previous registered rent.

Pre hearing Submissions

Landlord

The Application dated 20^{th} June 2022, by the Landlord, noted in covering letter that, since last review "the Electrical Consumer Unit has been replaced and updated". "furthermore, rewiring to several pendant lights was undertaken along with installing smoke and fire detectors and alarms to the ground floor flat." These works cost £3500.00"

The Application noted the landlord has responsibility for "repairs and external decorations" and the tenant has responsibility for "internal decorations"

The landlord's objection letter added no further information.

The landlord completed and submitted the Reply form, undated but received 29th September 2022. The form noted;

The landlord installed the central heating noting the tenant had radiators installed in the flat.

Also noting a new boiler was installed around 2018 or 2017

Additionally, an electrical consumer unit installed, some rewiring, and roof works carried out in 2022.

A further letter dated 7th October 2022 to the Tribunal noting to the background of the works and the installation of the central heating.

Tenant

The tribunal was also in receipt of a letter from the tenant dated 2nd September 2022 to the Rent Officer.

The letter noted the increase was considered too high because;

The level of increase was far higher than it had been over the previous few years.

Additionally, the tenant completed a Reply Form, undated but sign by Jean Capon.

The Form noted;

The property was a ground floor flat, with two living rooms, a kitchen and a bedroom, and a bathroom.

The property has a central heating installed by the tenant, no double glazing, carpets and curtains provided by the tenant and white goods provided by the tenant.

There is a private garden without a secure fence.

The tenancy of the property was taken out in 1978 and works were undertaken to make it habitable.

Works undertaken at start of tenancy were;

"Front Room- plastering in front room after removal of hardboard pinned to exterior walls rewiring of all electrics as unsafe and very old light switches. Hired floor sander to make good floor boards and filler applied as huge gaps in boards.

Hall – Walls crumbling when redecorating so plastering of part of the walls and rewiring.

Bedroom- Removal of hardboard and plastering of 2 walls rewiring. No internal door this was purchased from the Jack the stripper in Twickenham and hung by tenant."

Dining room – removal of dangerous fire place removed and wall plastered Wall replastered as crumbling.

Kitchen – No kitchen apart from a burned plastic / type sink unit and tin bath, no bath door and no running hot water. All installed and paid by the tenant.

Bathroom – No bathroom as such just an empty room with half the ceiling missing. No window just a plastic sheet in room leading off which at the time housed a plastic

seated cracked lavatory. New ceiling old fire place removed; window put in bathroom suite installed by tenant.

All rooms redecorated and at a later stage central heating installed by tenant. Additional radiator installed in 2010.

After Mr Bloomfield finished rewiring, I needed to repaint 6 ceilings as they looked patchy.

In terms of disrepair; "guttering needs cleaning, pipework outside the rear of property and over back door needs replacing. Garden fence needs replacing as has fallen down."

A further letter from the tenant to the tribunal dated 29th September 2022 which explained and gave details of the electrical work carried out.

The Hearing

No hearing was requested by the parties nor one felt proportionate, so the matter was addressed on papers.

Reasons for Decision

The tribunal has also inspected. The rent to be determined must reflect the condition found on the date of the hearing disregarding all tenants' improvements.

The tribunal finds on balance that the central heating system that is boiler and radiators were installed by the tenant in 1990 with the tenant adding a later radiator in 2010. The tribunal also finds on balance that the landlord replaced the boiler in 2018 or 2017 with a new boiler at the landlord's expense.

The process for determining a fair rent is the application of Rent Act 1977 section 70 on the subject property and then comparison with the maximum rent permitted under the Maximum Fair Rent Order 1999. This means that comparison with other properties the subject of Fair Rent is not material.

Initially the Tribunal determined what rent the Landlord could reasonably be expected to obtain for the Property in the open market if it were let today in the condition that is considered usual for such an open market letting.

Considering evidence submitted and the Tribunal acting in its capacity as an expert tribunal and using its general knowledge of market levels in the area, concluded that such a likely market rent, if a market rent is adopted would be £ 1900 per month.

However, the Property is not in the condition considered usual for a modern letting at a market rent. Therefore, it is necessary to adjust the above hypothetical rent, a deduction of 20% is made.

In addition, the Tribunal determined that there should be a further deduction of 10% to reflect the fact the terms and conditions and goods supplied under the tenancy would differ from those of a contemporary assured shorthold tenancy, from which the rental comparables are derived.

Thereafter the Tribunal considered the question of scarcity in section 70 (2) of the Rent Act 1977. A figure of 20% was adopted.

Market derived rental level - £1900.00 per month

Less 20% condition

Less 10% for terms and supplied goods inc white goods

Less 20% for scarcity.

The rent after this final adjustment was £950.00 per month which is equivalent to £219.23 per week.

Rent Acts (Maximum Fair Rent) Order 1999

The rent to be registered is limited by the Rent Acts (Maximum Fair Rent Order) 1999. The rent calculated in accordance with the Order is £ 157.00 per week. This figure is lower than the figure calculated by reference to the market rent with adjustments, of £219.23 per week.

Accordingly, the sum of £157.00 per week will be registered as the fair rent with effect from 15^{th} February 2023, being the date of the Tribunal's decision.

Valuer Chair: Richard Waterhouse FRICS

Decision Date: 15th February 2023

Extended reasons: 15th February 2023

Appeal to the Upper Tribunal

A person wishing to appeal this decision to the Upper Tribunal (Property Chamber) on a point of law must seek permission to do so by making a written application to the First-tier Tribunal at the Regional Office which has been dealing with the case which application must:

a. be received by the said office within 28 days after the Tribunal sends to the person making the application written reasons for the decision.

b. identify the decision of the Tribunal to which it relates, state the grounds of appeal, and state the result the party making the application is seeking.

If the application is not received within the 28 –day time limit, it must include a request for an extension of time and the reason for it not complying with the 28- day time limit; the Tribunal will then decide whether to extend time or not to allow the application for permission to appeal to proceed.