

Physical activity for general health benefits in disabled children and disabled young people: evidence review: Appendix 3 – examples of reviews compared

Published 16 February 2022

Contents

| Cardiorespiratory fitness | 2 |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| Muscular outcomes | 3 |
| Disease risk and prevention | 4 |
| Psychological outcomes | 5 |
| Functional skills | 5 |
| Psychosocial, wellbeing and community | 7 |
| Cognitive outcomes | 7 |
| Behavioural outcomes | 9 |

Cardiorespiratory fitness

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-------------------|------|---------------------|---|--|---------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|
| Butler et al. | 2010 | PD (CP) | 3 | Aerobic fitness | High | High | N |
| Armstrong et al. | 2019 | PD (CP) | 9 | Cardiorespiratory fitness | Moderate | Mod | N |
| Johnson et al. | 2009 | Mix | 8 | Aerobic capacity | Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| McPherson et al. | 2014 | Mix | 13 | Aerobic fitness; aerobic endurance; energy expenditure | Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Paravlic et al. | 2015 | SI (VI) | 4 | Rate of perceived exertion; aerobic capacity | Moderate | Mod | N |
| Conrad et al. | 2020 | ID | 3 | Physical fitness | Low to Moderate | Low | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Aerobic fitness; cardiovascular endurance | Low to Moderate | Mod | N |
| Rogers et al. | 2008 | PD (CP) | 13 | Aerobic fitness | Low | Low | N |
| Verschuren et al. | 2008 | PD (CP) | 20 | Aerobic capacity | Low | Low | N |
| Dagenais et al. | 2009 | PD | 4 | Cardiovascular endurance | Low | Low | N |
| Deutsch et al. | 2015 | PD (CP) | 4 | Energy expenditure | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Fang et al. | 2019 | ID (ASD) | 7 | Physical fitness | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Lang et al. | 2010 | ID (ASD) | 13 | Aerobic fitness; energy expenditure | No evidence | No evidence | N |

Muscular outcomes

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|--------------------|------|---------------------|---|---|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Fleeton et al. | 2020 | PD (CP) | 22 | Muscle strength | High | High | N |
| Keawutan et al. | 2014 | PD (CP) | 10 | Motor capacity | High | High | N |
| Zhang et al. | 2020 | ID | 11 | Gross motor skills | High | High | N |
| Clutterbuck et al. | 2019 | PD (CP) | 34 | Gross motor function | Moderate to High | Moderate to High | N |
| Armstrong et al. | 2019 | PD (CP) | 9 | Hamstring strength; gross motor function | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Gillett et al. | 2016 | PD (CP) | 6 | Hypertrophy | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Li et al. | 2013 | ID (DS) | 6 | Muscle strength | Moderate | Moderate to High | Υ |
| Kapsal et al. | 2019 | ID | 109 | Physical health | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Hocking et al. | 2019 | Mix | 11 | Gross motor skills | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| McPherson et al. | 2014 | Mix | 13 | Muscle strength | Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Johnson et al. | 2009 | Mix | 8 | Gross motor function | Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Paravlic et al. | 2015 | SI (VI) | 4 | Unilateral peak torque; explosive strength; grip strength | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Martin et al. | 2010 | PD (CP) | 34 | Muscle strength; gross motor skills; endurance | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Leg power; handgrip strength; muscular endurance | Low to Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Verschuren et al. | 2008 | PD (CP) | 20 | Muscle strength | Low | Low | N |
| Roostaei et al. | 2006 | PD (CP) | 10 | Gross motor skills | Low | Low | N |
| Dagenais et al. | 2009 | PD | 4 | Hand grip; quadriceps strength | Low | Low | N |

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-------------------|------|---------------------|---|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Lang et al. | 2010 | ID (ASD) | 13 | Gross motor skills | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Kamp et al. | 2014 | ID (AD/HD) | 5 | Motor skills; strength | | No evidence | N |
| Vysniauske et al. | 2020 | ID (AD/HD) | 13 | Motor skills | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Lee et al. | 2016 | PD | 7 | Motor skills | No evidence | No evidence | N |

Disease risk and prevention

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-----------------|------|---------------------|---|-------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|
| Paravlic et al. | 2015 | SI (VI) | 4 | Fatty tissue percentage | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Conrad et al. | 2020 | ID | 3 | Body weight; fat mass | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Tricep skinfold | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Maiano et al. | 2014 | ID | 1 | Body weight; fat mass | Low | Low to Moderate | N |

Psychological outcomes

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-----------------------------------|------|---------------------|---|------------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Zang | 2019 | ID (AD/HD) | 14 | Anxiety; depression | Moderate to High | Moderate to High | N |
| Arbour- Nicitopoulos et al. | 2018 | PD | 7 | Psychological well-being | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Self-concept; self-esteem | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| May et al. | 2021 | Mix | 19 | Self-concept | Low | Low | N |
| Sahlin and Lexell | 2015 | Mix | 2 | Self-perceived physical appearance | Low | Low | N |
| Fang et al. | 2019 | ID (ASD) | 7 | Self-perception | No evidence | No evidence | N |

Functional skills

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-----------------------------------|-------|---------------------|---|--|---------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Chen et al. | 2018 | PD (CP) | 15 | Arm function; postural control; ambulation | Moderate to High | High | N |
| Ma et al. | 2020 | ID | 10 | Balance | Moderate to High | Moderate to High | N |
| Armstrong et al. | 2019 | PD (CP) | 9 | Balance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Cooper and Williams | 2017 | PD (CP) | 6 | Balance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Li et al. | 2013 | ID (DS) | 6 | Balance | Moderate | Moderate | Υ |
| Hocking et al. | 2019 | Mix | 11 | Balance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| McPherson et al. | 2014 | Mix | 13 | Functional abilities | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Page et al. | 2017 | Mix | 19 | Balance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Arbour- Nicitopoulos et al. | 2018 | PD | 7 | Physical skills | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Paravlic et al. | 2015 | SI (VI) | 4 | Flexibility; dynamic balance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Dewar et al. | 2015 | PD (CP) | 45 | Postural control | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Martin et al. | 2010 | PD (CP) | 34 | Gait speed; stride length | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Hardee et al. | 2017 | ID (DS) | 11 | Daily life activities | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Maiano et al. | 2019a | ID | 14 | Fundamental movement skills; balance | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Flexibility | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Maiano et al. | 2019b | ID (DS) | 9 | Static balance | Low | Low | Υ |
| Melo et al. | 2020 | SI (HI) | 5 | Balance; gait | Low | Low | Υ |
| Maiano et al. | 2019c | ID | 13 | Static balance; dynamic balance | Low | Low | Υ |
| May et al. | 2021 | Mix | 19 | Balance; jumping skills | Low | Low | N |

Psychosocial, wellbeing and community

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-----------------------------------|------|---------------------|---|---|---------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| Tsoi et al. | 2012 | PD (CP) | 2 | Quality of life | Moderate | High | N |
| Kapsal et al. | 2019 | ID | 109 | Psychosocial health | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Ash et al. | 2017 | Mix | 23 | Sociability | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Arbour- Nicitopoulos et al. | 2018 | PD | 7 | Social skills and relationships | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Personal development; social competence | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| May et al. | 2021 | Mix | 19 | Social competency | Low | Low | N |
| Sahlin and Lexell | 2015 | Mix | 2 | Global self-worth | Low | Low | N |
| Lang et al. | 2010 | ID (ASD) | 13 | Self-stimulation; attention; stereotypy | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Kamp et al. | 2014 | ID (AD/HD) | 5 | Social behaviour | No evidence | No evidence | N |

Cognitive outcomes

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|-----------------|------|---------------------|---|---|---------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|
| Suarez- | 2018 | ID | 16 | Executive functions | High | High | Υ |
| Manzano et al. | | (AD/HD) | | | | | |
| Zhang et al. | 2020 | ID | 11 | Inhibitory control; cognitive flexibility | High | High | N |
| Christiansen et | 2019 | ID | 18 | Executive functions | Moderate | Moderate | Υ |
| al. | | (AD/HD) | | | | | |

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|----------------------------|------|---------------------|---|---|---------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| Grassmann et al. | 2017 | ID (AD/HD) | 3 | Executive functions | Moderate | Moderate | Υ |
| Lambez et al. | 2020 | ID (AD/HD) | 11 | Cognitive functioning | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Varigonda et al. | 2020 | ID | 28 | Attention; working memory | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Fragala- Pinkham et al. | 2020 | ID | 5 | Cognitive skills | Low to Moderate | Low | N |
| Berwid and Halperin | 2012 | ID (AD/HD) | 5 | Neuropsychological functioning | Low | Low | N |
| Saitta et al. | 2019 | ID (AD/HD) | 1 | Concentration | Low | Low | N |
| May et al. | 2021 | Mix | 19 | Attention; learning; oranisation | Low | Low | N |
| Fang et al. | 2019 | ID (ASD) | 7 | Executive function | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Lang et al. | 2010 | ID (ASD) | 13 | Self-stimulation; attention; stereotypy | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Archer and Kostrzewa | 2012 | ID (AD/HD) | 3 | Cognitive functioning | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Gapin et al. | 2011 | ID (AD/HD) | 0 | Cognitive performance | No evidence | No evidence | N |
| Vysniauske et al. | 2020 | ID (AD/HD) | 13 | Executive function | No evidence | No evidence | N |

Behavioural outcomes

| Author | Year | Disability category | Included studies (children only) | Improved outcomes | Evidence level/quality | Outcome confidence | Reviewed by WHO |
|---------------------------|------|---------------------|---|---|---------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Suarez- Manzano et al. | 2018 | ID (AD/HD) | 16 | General behaviour | High | High | Υ |
| Zang | 2019 | ID (AD/HD) | 14 | Aggression | Moderate to High | High | N |
| Ash et al. | 2017 | Mix | 23 | Classroom functioning; academic performance | Moderate | Moderate | N |
| Tint et al. | 2017 | ID | 8 | Maldaptive behaviour; problem behaviour | Low to Moderate | Low to Moderate | N |
| Berwid and Halperin | 2012 | ID (AD/HD) | 5 | Behavioural symptoms | Low | Low | N |
| Gapin et al. | 2011 | ID (AD/HD) | 0 | Behavioural symptoms | No evidence | No evidence | N |