**Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board 06 September 2018**

**Minutes**

Turing Rooms 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

| **Attendees** |  |
| --- | --- |
| Kathryn Turner (KT) | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Mike Molloy (MM) |
| Graham Bowers (GB)  | Judith Jones (JJ) |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | John Viggers (JV) |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Kevin Shaw (KS) |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Andy Taplin (AT) |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Joe Penrose (JP) |
| Heather Neate (HN) | Michael Sowerby (MS) |
| Rob Malcomson (RM) (phone) Invited - item DEA/F/1 | Alastair Chisholm (AC) (phone) |
| Justin Kenny (JK) (phone) Invited - item DEA/F/2 | John Fotheringham (JF) (phone) |
| Claire Wainwright (CW) (phone) |  |

Apologies:

Mark Sutcliffe, Chris Mullan, Mark Richardson, Edgar Whitley, Louise Bennett

**New Actions**

**AP01** - Secretariat to amend ToR to reflect Review Board discussions.

**AP02** - Secretariat to invite attendance from the Ministry for Housing, Communities and Local Government.

**AP03** - Homes England to amend DPIA and business case to reflect Review Board suggested changes.

**AP04** - Secretariat to circulate amended Homes England documents to board members.

**AP05** - Secretariat to refer Companies House and Homes England (subject to board agreement) proposals to the Minister for approval.

**AP06** - BHCC to revise business case and DPIA ahead of full formal submission

**Introductions**

KT welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflict of Interest raised**
* GB re Homes England pilot;
* MM re Companies House pilot; and
* AC is a local Councillor
1. **The role of the Information Commissioner’s Office**

The ICO’s role is to observe but also to advise where appropriate. Data Protection Act 2018 and General Data Protection Regulations should not stand in the way of good, compliant data sharing. The ICO’s statutory Data Sharing Code of Practice is being updated and the consultation ends on ending 10th September 2018.

1. **Terms of Reference**

DEA powers are not yet operational for devolved administrations. Representatives from Wales and Scotland wish to attend Board meetings to observe matters of UK interest and the Board sanctioned this.

The Board agreed Terms of Reference, subject to clarification of Board’s role:

* to gather evidence from pilots so the Minister can make informed decision; and
* in considering and monitoring actions following a breach.
* **AP01** - Secretariat to amend wording in ToR to make this clearer.
1. **New proposals for review and recommendations to the Minister**

4.1 The Board considered a proposal from Companies House and HMRC to

combat company accounting fraud by sharing account and disqualified director data.The Board considered the business case, data protection impact assessment and data usage agreement, incorporating security arrangements. The Board recommended the pilot is approved.

**APO5** - Secretariat to report recommendation to Minister.

4.2 The Board considered a proposal from Homes England and HMRC to combat fraud in the English Help to Buy Equity Loan scheme. The Board considered the business case, data protection impact assessment (DPIA) and data usage agreement, incorporating security arrangements. The Board recommended the pilot is approved, subject to amendments:

* **AP03** - Homes England to make amendments to business case.
* **AP04** - Secretariat to recirculate Homes England amended business case.
* **AP05** - Subject to agreement from Board Members, secretariat to report approval to Minister.
1. **New proposals for initial view**

 The Board considered a model proposal from Brighton and Hove City Council (BHCC) or local authorities to reduce council tax debt by matching debt data with HMRC income and earnings data. The Board considered the business case and DPIA, incorporating security arrangements and made recommendations to strengthen the business case.

* **AP02** - Secretariat to invite representative from MHCLG to join the Board and offer expert opinion in line with ToR.
* **AP06** - BHCC to revise business case and DPIA ahead of full formal submission
1. **Ongoing information sharing pilots and forward look**

The Board expects to consider one fraud pilot at the next meeting. Members undertook to confirm the length of their appointment by email.

1. **Risk Register**

The Board undertook to consider the risk register via correspondence.

1. **AOB**

Chair thanked DEA team and ICO commented on good use of ICO DPIA templates.

**Date of next meeting:** Thursday 11th October 2019, 1-3.30pm.

Turing Rooms, 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

**Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board 15th November 2018**

**Minutes**

Turing Rooms 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

| **Attendees** |
| --- |
| Kathryn Turner (KT) | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |
| Steve Coppard (SC) | Heather Neate (HN) |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | John Viggers (JV) |
| Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | Carla Taylor (CT) (phone) |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | Kevin Shaw (KS) |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Chris Mullan (CM) |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Edgar Whitley (EW) |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Louise Bennett (LB) |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Stephen Quick (SQ) |
| Rob Malcomson (RM) | Joe Penrose (JP) |
| Judith Jones (JJ) (phone) | Michael Sowerby (MS) |
| Mike Molloy (MM) (Phone) | Helena Wallace (HW) (phone)  |
| Helen Morris (HM) (phone) | Mark Richardson (phone) |

Apologies:

Claire Wainwright, John Fotheringham, Stuart Stevenson, Alistair Chisholm, Graeme Bowers

 **New Actions**

**AP07** - Secretariat to refer NFI/HMRC proposal to the Minister for approval

**AP08** - DWP and NFI to meet regarding the NFI pilot

**AP09** - DWP and DVLA to review the DWP/DVLA papers following comments from the Review Board

**AP10** - Secretariat to add Companies House and Homes England pilots to the public register

**AP11** - RB members to confirm that they approve the content of the gov.uk Review Board web page

**AP12** - Secretariat to request a link to the Register from the Review Board web page

**AP13** - Secretariat to add risk around the public losing confidence in DEA as a result of a data breach to the risk register.

1. **Introductions**

KT welcomed attendees and introduced SC, who is taking over KT’s role temporarily as she is leaving CO.

1. **Conflict of Interest raised**
* DS, JV, MC & HM declared interests in the NFI/HMRC pilot
* JV declared an interest in the DWP/DVLA
1. **Minutes and Action Points from last Review Board meeting**

The Board approved the ToR, minutes and action points from the last meeting.

1. **New proposal for review and recommendations to the Minister**

The Board considered a proposal from Cabinet Office and HMRC to combat fraud against local authorities through the National Fraud Initiative(NFI). The Board considered the business case, data protection impact assessment and data usage agreement, incorporating security arrangements. The Board recommended the pilot is approved.

* **AP07** - Secretariat to refer NFI/HMRC proposal to the Minister for approval
* **AP08** - DWP and NFI to meet regarding the NFI pilot.
1. **New proposals for initial view**

The Board considered a proposal from DWP and DVLA to combat fraud in Universal Credit by exploring the use of DVLA data. The Board considered the business case and data protection impact assessment, incorporating security arrangements. The Board agreed recommendations to strengthen the business case.

* **AP09** - DWP and DVLA to review the DWP/DVLA papers following comments from the Review Board.
1. **Ongoing information sharing pilots and forward look**

The Board commented on the draft of the current Public Register of Information Sharing Agreements. HN advised that she is a custodian of the register.

https://www.registers.service.gov.uk/registers/information-sharing-agreement-0001].

* **AP10** - Secretariat to add Companies House and Homes England pilot to the public register
1. **Review Board web page**

The Board commented on the proposed content of a web page on gov.uk which details the purpose and composition of the Review Board.

* **AP11** - RB members to confirm that they approve their details being included on the gov.uk Review Board web page.
* **AP12** - Secretariat to request a link to the Register from the Review Board web page.
1. **Risk Register**

Board members reviewed the risk register.

* **AP13** - Secretariat to add risk around the public losing confidence in DEA as a result of a data breach to the risk register.
1. **AOB**

EW asked if ‘error’ was included in the legislation. MC advised that only fraud was, as there was an intent with fraud as opposed to error.

Chair thanked the group.

**Date of next meeting:** Tuesday 11th December 1-3.00pm.

Turing Rooms, 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

**Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**17th January 2019**

Turing Rooms 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

| **Attendees and Apologies** |  |
| --- | --- |
| Alistair Chisholm (AS) (phone) | Kevin Shaw (KS) (phone)  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Louise Bennett (LB) |
| Carla Taylor (CT) (phone) - Invited - item, DEA/F/4 | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |
| Chris Mullan (CM) | Mark Richardson (phone) |
| John Viggers (JV) | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) |
| Darren Shillington (DS) (phone) | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Mike Molloy (MM) |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Peter Tutton (PT) |
| Heather Neate (HN) | Tim Savill (TS) |
| Steve Coppard (SC) | Rob Malcomson (RM) - Invited - item DEA/F/3 |
| Judith Jones (JJ) (phone) | Joe Penrose (JP) |

Apologies:

Stephen Quick, Claire Wainwright, Peter Wallwork, Stuart Stevenson, John Fotheringham, Helen Morris.

**Outstanding Actions**

**AP10** - Secretariat to add NFI and Homes England pilots to the public register.

**New Actions**

**AP14** - DWP/DVLA to amend proposal documents re DEA / F/ 4 and return to secretariat

**AP15** - Secretariat to circulate amended DWP/DVLA proposal for agreement by RB members

**AP16** - Subject to agreement, Secretariat to refer DWP/DVLA proposal to the Minister for approval

**AP17** - Secretariat to refer CH/HMRC variation request to the Minister for approval.

**AP18** - RM to submit NFI/HMRC variation request to the secretariat

**AP19** - Secretariat to circulate NFI/HMRC variation request to RB members for agreement via correspondence

**AP20** - Subject to agreement, secretariat to refer NFI/HMRC variation request to the Minister for approval.

**AP21** - Secretariat to issue paper on major / minor variations with minutes and include an item on February board agenda for further discussion around variations to ongoing pilots.

**AP22** - Secretariat to include future proofing for variations at the risk analysis stage.

**AP23** - Secretariat to refer delay in the delivery of Homes England pilot to the Minister for consideration.

**AP24** - Secretariat to include an agenda item at the February Board meeting on ‘what good looks like’.

**AP25** - Secretariat to send invites to RB members for 2019/20 meetings.

**AP26** - Secretariat to continue to standardise documents for all participating councils.

**AP27** - Secretariat to brief Minister in advance of Feb submission.

**AP28** - Secretariat to liaise with all parties, including ICO and Board members to bring the council tax debt pilots to the February RB meeting.

 **AP29** - Secretariat to develop a communications plan for public authorities to mitigate loss of public confidence in the event of a data breach.

**AP30** - Secretariat to add EU risk to the register.

**AP31** - Secretariat to seek advice from ICO, lawyers, Freedom of Information team and Public Service Delivery secretariat and bring a paper to the February Board meeting.

**AP32** - ICO to confirm ICO guidance to secretariat.

**AP33** - Secretariat to work up a high level version of September minutes for RB to discuss at February meeting.

1. **Introductions**

Mark Cheeseman welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflict of Interest**
* JV declared an interest in the DWP/DVLA pilot.
* AC declared that he is a local councillor.
1. **Minutes and Action Points from last Review Board meeting**

The Board approved minutes and action points from the last meeting, with AP10 to remain open as the Register entry is awaiting HMRC approval.

1. **New proposal for review and recommendations to the Minister**

The Board considered the business case for a DWP/DVLA pilot to combat fraud by sharing DWP Universal Credit with DVLA data (reference DEA/F/4). The Board agreed the pilot should be recommended to the Minister, subject to amendments.

* **AP14** - DWP/DVLA to amend proposal and return to Secretariat.
* **AP15** - Secretariat to circulate amended DWP/DVLA proposal for agreement by RB members.
* **AP16** - Subject to agreement, secretariat to refer DWP/DVLA pilot to the Minister for approval.
1. **Pilot Variations**

5.1 The Board considered and approved a written request to vary pilot DEA/F/1 Companies House / HMRC to onwardly disclose information to the Insolvency Service. **AP17** - Secretariat to refer CH/HMRC variation request to the Minister for approval.

5.2 The Board considered a verbal request to vary pilot DEA/F/3 NFI/HMRC to re-purpose data usage for better fraud detection. **AP18** - RM to submit variation request to secretariat. **AP19** - Secretariat to circulate NFI/HMRC variation request to RB members for agreement via correspondence. **AP20** - Subject to agreement, secretariat to refer NFI/HMRC variation request to the Minister for approval.

5.3 The Board discussed potential criteria for future requests to vary an ongoing pilot and how they should be considered and approved. **AP21** - Secretariat to issue paper on major / minor variations with minutes and include an item on February board agenda for further discussion around variations to ongoing pilots. **AP22** - Secretariat to include future proofing for variations at the risk analysis stage.

1. **Progress report:**

6.1 RM provided an interim update on the DEA/F/2 Homes England/HMRC pilot to combat fraud inthe Help to Buy Equity Loan Scheme.**AP23** - Secretariat to refer delay in the delivery of Homes England pilot to the Minister for consideration. **AP24** - Secretariat to include an agenda item at the February Board meeting on ‘what good looks like’.

1. **Update from devolved administrations**

7.1 No update.

1. **Forward look**

8.1 The Board agreed to meeting dates for 2019/20 as follows:

* 16 May 2019;
* 4 July 2019;
* 12 September 2019;
* 24 October 2019;
* 5 December 2019;
* 15 January 2020; and
* 27 February 2020

**AP25** - Secretariat to send invites to RB members for 2019/20 meetings.

8.2 The Board considered next steps in 29 local authority council tax debt pilots and agreed to engage with the window of opportunity in HMRC work programming - HMRC have resource for a limited period which would mean submission to the February RB meeting. **AP26** - Secretariat to continue to standardise documents with all participating councils. **AP27** - Secretariat to brief Minister in advance of Feb submission. **AP28** - Secretariat to liaise with all parties, including ICO and Board members to bring the pilots to the February RB meeting.

-

1. **Review Board performance**

Secretariat has reported Board performance to the Minister for the quarter ended 31 December 2018 and provided a written update to DCMS for the Data Advisory Board.

1. **Risks**

10.1 The Board reviewed the risk register. **AP29** - Secretariat to develop a communications plan for public authorities to mitigate loss of public confidence in the event of a data breach. **AP30** - Secretariat to add EU risk to the register.

10.2 The Board considered a challenge from a stakeholder to publish both the minutes from RB meetings and all documents that support individual pilots. The Board discussed the need:

* for openness and transparency to demonstrate the processes around developing pilots, and
* to protect the integrity of pilots in combating fraud.

**AP31** - Secretariat to seek advice from ICO, lawyers, Freedom of Information team and Public Service Delivery secretariat and bring a paper to the February Board meeting. **AP32** - ICO to confirm ICO guidance to secretariat. **AP33** - Secretariat to work up a high level version of September minutes for RB to discuss at February meeting.

**AOB**

None raised

**Date of next meeting: 14th February 2019, 1pm to 3pm**

Turing Rooms, 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE

**Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**14th February 2019**

Turing Rooms 10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE (13.00-15.00)

| **Attendees**  |
| --- |
| Debra Heaton (DB) (ICO, phone) | Kevin Shaw (KS)  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Louise Bennett (LB) |
| Peter Bates (PB) (by invitation for item 5) | Stephen Quick (phone) |
| Chris Mullan (CM) | Helen Morris (HM) (phone) |
| John Fotheringham (JF) (phone) | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) |
| Darren Shillington (DS) (phone) | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Tim Savill (TS) |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) (phone) | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) |
| Heather Neate (HN) | Joe Penrose (JP) |

**Apologies:**

Alistair Chisholm , Mark Richardson, Claire Wainwright, Peter Wallwork, Stuart Stevenson, Mark Cheeseman, John Viggers, Judith Jones, Mike Molloy, Peter Tutton

**Outstanding Actions to carry forward**

**AP10** - Secretariat to add NFI and Homes England pilots to the public register.

**AP14** - DWP/DVLA to amend proposal documents re DEA / F/ 4 and return to secretariat

**AP15** - Secretariat to circulate amended DWP/DVLA proposal for agreement by RB members

**AP16** - Subject to agreement, Secretariat to refer DWP/DVLA proposal to the Minister for approval

 **AP29** - Secretariat to develop a communications plan for public authorities to mitigate loss of public confidence in the event of a data breach.

**AP31** - Secretariat to seek advice from ICO, lawyers, Freedom of Information team and Public Service Delivery secretariat and bring a paper to the February Board meeting - deferred to March Board meeting.

**AP33** - Secretariat to work up a high level version of September minutes for RB to discuss at February meeting - deferred to March Board meeting.

**New Actions**

**AP34** - Re **AP14**, Secretariat to provide support to DWP/DVLA re DEA/F/4.

**AP35** - Secretariat to refer proposals DEA/D/1 - DEA/D/29 to the Minister for approval prior to implementation.

**AP36** - Secretariat to amend flowchart to remove reference to benefits data as set out in the data specification; and specify 14 day window for engagement as set out in the Fairness Principles statement in each business case; reissue to pilot LAs.

**AP37** - Secretariat to liaise with KS re some pilot LAs with higher committal action and total debt to minimise adverse impact at evaluation.

**AP38** - Secretariat to take forward with pilot LAs comments from members on control group, success measures on Fairness Principles where practicable, HMRC debt recovery, pilot review periods, case studies, and explanations of vulnerability / financial hardship.

**AP39** - Secretariat to liaise with CO Counter Fraud colleagues to implement the Minister's response to take advantage of the communications opportunity re counter fraud at annual council tax billing.

**AP40** - Secretariat to refer proposed policy and procedure for variations requests to the Minister for approval.

**AP41** - ICO to inform secretariat when consultation opens for RB consideration.

1. **Introductions**

Chair welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflict of Interest**
* MS, CM, TS and AT declared an interest in the LA Council Tax debt pilots.
1. **Minutes and Action Points from last Review Board meeting**

The Board approved minutes and action points from the last meeting.

* AP10 to remain open as the Register entry is awaiting GDS approval.
* AP14-AP16 to remain open as Secretariat have not received the amended DWP / DVLA proposal.
* AP29, AP31 and A33 to remain open and report at March Review Board.
1. **Update from Devolved Administrations.**

Codes were laid before Scottish Parliament in November and conversations are ongoing with interested authorities.

1. **New** **proposal for review and recommendations to the Minister**

The Board considered the business cases for 29 pilots between HMRC and sample Local Authorities (references DEA/D/1 - DEA/D/29) to reduce and manage council tax debt by sharing employment information about debtors, enabling LAs to conduct financial hardship assessments and take recovery action. The Board recommended that the Minister approve the proposals for implementation.

**AP35** - Secretariat to refer proposals to the Minister for approval prior to implementation.

**AP36** - Secretariat to amend flowchart to remove reference to benefits data as set out in the data specification; and specify 14 day window for engagement as set out in the Fairness Principles statement in each business case; and reissue to pilot LAs.

**AP37** - Secretariat to liaise with KS re some pilot LAs with higher committal action and total debt to minimise adverse impact at evaluation.

**AP38** - Secretariat to take forward with pilot LAs comments from members on control group, success measures on Fairness Principles where practicable and explanations of vulnerability.

**AP39** - Secretariat to liaise with Counter Fraud colleagues to implement the Minister's response to take advantage of the communications opportunity re counter fraud at annual council tax billing.

1. **Requests to Vary Ongoing Pilots - Policy and Procedure**

Secretariat presented the proposed policy and procedure for how to approve requests to vary DEA pilots in operation from their original scope. The Board recommended the Minister approve the proposed policy and procedure for implementation.

**AP40 -** Secretariat to refer proposed policy and procedure for variations requests to the Minister for approval.

1. **Transparency.**

Secretariat updated the Review Board that ICO and lawyers had provided advice will deliver a policy paper at the March Review Board - see updated **AP31 and AP33**.

1. **What does good look like.**

The Board agreed to defer this item until the March Review Board.

1. **Communications plan in the event of a breach.**

The Board asked that a bespoke plan was produced for a data breach, rather than an overall communications plan.

1. **AOB**

ICO reported that advised the ICO data sharing code of practice is expected to be out for consultation in March.

**AP41 -** ICOto inform secretariat when consultation opens for RB consideration.

 **Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

 **Date 21st March 2019**

**Time 13:00 to 15:00**

10 Great George Street London SW1P 3AE - Turing rooms 1&2

Dial in details 0800 496 0693

Code: 4458629 - Chairs Pin: 1981

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alistair Chisholm | Y |  |  | Kevin Shaw (KS) |  |  | Y |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  |  | Y | Louise Bennett (LB) |  |  | Y |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  |  | Y | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  |  | Y |
| Iain Burns |  |  | Y | Mark Richardson |  | Y |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | Y |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | Y |  |  |
| Debra Heaton (DH) ICO |  | Y |  | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y |  |  | Mike Molloy |  | Y |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  |  | Y | Peter Tutton | Y |  |  |
| Heather Neate (HN) | Y |  |  | Peter Wallwork | Y |  |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | Y |  | Stephen Quick |  |  | Y |
| Joe Penrose (JP) | Y |  |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | Y |  |  |
| John Viggers |  |  | Y | Stuart Stevenson |  |  | Y |
| Judith Jones |  |  | Y | Tim Savill (TS) | Y |  |  |

Presenting item 5: Rob Malcomson, Duncan Baxter, Karen Fox, Claire Jenkins, Helen Fisher, Georgia Battersby, Will German, Katherine Maguire & Fiona Innes

**Outstanding Actions brought forward**

* APs 14,15 & 16 - DVLA/DWP to amend proposal documents re DEA / F/ 4 and return to secretariat, circulate to RB members and refer to the Minister
* AP29 - Secretariat to develop a communications plan for public authorities to mitigate loss of public confidence in the event of a data breach
* AP31- Secretariat to seek advice from ICO, lawyers, Freedom of Information team and Public Service Delivery secretariat and bring a paper to the February Board meeting.
* AP37 - Secretariat to liaise with KS re some pilot LAs with higher committal action and total debt to minimise adverse impact at evaluation
* AP38 - Secretariat to take forward with pilot LAs comments from members on control group, success measures on Fairness Principles where practicable, HMRC debt recovery, pilot review periods, case studies, and explanations of vulnerability / financial hardship
* AP39 - Secretariat to liaise with CO Counter Fraud colleagues to implement the Minister's response to take advantage of the communications opportunity re counter fraud at annual council tax billing
* AP41 - ICO to inform secretariat when consultation opens for RB consideration.

**New Actions**

* AP42 - Re: AP14, 15 and 16 - Secretariat to contact DVLA, on behalf of the Review Board, asking for assurances on pilot delivery
* AP43 - Secretariat to follow up with authorities on the three pilots submitted for an initial view
* AP44 - CH / CO /HMRC to submit revised business case, DPIA and ISA.
* AP45 - HE to work with secretariat to outline reasons for the Minister re delays in reporting
* AP46 - All members to review transparency paper together with the ToR for next meeting
* AP47 - Secretariat to issue the data breach communications plan via e-mail
* AP48 - ICO to discuss concerns around the it’s role on the bard with the secretariat
1. **Introductions**

SC welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflict of Interest**
* GB, MM, MS & AC declared an interest in the fraud pilots.
1. **Minutes and Action Points from last Review Board meeting**

RB approved minutes and action points from the last meeting.

* AP14-AP16 to remain open as Secretariat have not received the amended DWP / DVLA proposal. **AP42 - Secretariat** to contact DWP/DVLA on Ap 14, 15 & 16.
1. **Update from Devolved Administrations.**

No updates were provided

1. **New business cases for initial review.**

The Board considered the initial business cases and DPIAs for 3 fraud pilots between:-

* Destin Solutions and HMRC to combat fraud related to business rates avoidance.
* Cabinet Office and HMRC to combat fraud relating to the Internal Fraud Hub
* Student Loans Company and HMRC to combat fraud in childcare grants**.**

RB gave recommendations on how each proposal may be strengthened.

**AP43** - Secretariat to follow up recommendations with authorities on each pilot.

1. **What does good look like?**

RB considered:-

* Companies House final outcomes report: RB agreed for piloting activity to be extended for a further six months to review policy and governance arrangements, subject to submitting revised business case, DPIA and ISA, as appropriate

**AP44** - CH / CO /HMRC to submit revised business case, DPIA and ISA, as appropriate.

* Homes England interim report. RB noted that this was the second extension, and underlined the need from public authorities to ensure original timelines were being met. The RB asked that HE work with the secretariat so that Ministerial progress report from HE due in April reflects the reasons behind these delays.

**AP45** - HE to work with secretariat to draft a note for HE to issue to the Minister advising reasons behind the delay.

1. **Transparency.**

Due to time pressures and challenges on the principles to the policy, RB agreed to review the paper and consider it together with the ToR for the next meeting. **AP46** - All members to review transparency paper together with the ToR for next meeting

1. **Communications plan in the event of a data breach.**

Due to time pressures, RB agreed to review the paper via correspondence.

**AP47** - Secretariat to issue the data breach communications plan via e-mail

1. **Update from ICO.**

ICO provided an update on ICO data sharing code of practice. ICO also raised some concerns about the role on the Board as observers.

**AP48** - ICO to discuss concerns around the role on Board with secretariat

1. **AOB.**

Members noted that the Minister has approved all recommendations to date.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**Date 16 May 2019**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) |  |  | Y | Kevin Shaw (KS) |  |  | Y |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y |  |  | Louise Bennett (LB) | Y |  |  |
| Chris Mullan (CM) | Y |  |  | Mark Cheeseman (MC) (co-chair) | Y |  |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  |  | Y | Mark Richardson (MR) |  | Y |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |  |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) |  | Y |  |
| Debra Heaton (DH) ICO |  |  | Y | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y |  |  | Mike Molloy (MM) | Y |  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  |  | Y | Peter Tutton (PT) | Y |  |  |
| Heather Neate (HN) | Y |  |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y |  |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | Y |  | Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y |  |  |
| Joe Penrose (JP) | Y |  |  | Steve Coppard (SC) (co-chair) | Y |  |  |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y |  |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  |  | Y |
| Judith Jones (JJ) |  |  | Y | Tim Savill (TS) | Y |  |  |
| Viv Adams (VA) |  | Y |  | Claire Wainwright (CW) |  |  | Y |

| KM (SLC) | Y |
| --- | --- |
| RM (CO) | Y |
| GB (HE) | Y |

**1. Welcome and Introductions**

Secretariat welcomed everyone to the meeting

**2. Conflicts of Interest**

Members declared interests in:

* item 5 - Student Loan Company / HMRC (ref: DEA/F/7) to combat fraud in childcare costs
* item 6 -Initial evaluation - fraud pilot CO / LA / HMRC (ref DEA/F/3)

**3. Minutes and Action Points from last Review Board meeting**

RB approved minutes and action points from the last meeting.

**APs 14-16:** Actions regarding DEA/F/4 remain open.

**AP45:** Secretariat to work with HE to draft a note for the Minister advising on pilot delays.

**4. Transparency**

The Review Board discussed a transparency paper and the obligations of the Review Board to publish

* minutes from meetings; and
* supporting documents to information sharing pilots.

**Decision:** Review Board agreed to publish reasonable, high level minutes, which will contain pilot outcomes. The decision to publish will be taken in full at the following meeting.

**Decision:** The Review Board agreed that the corporate memory of pilot learnings will rest with the Cabinet Office.

**Decision:** The Review Board agreed not to publish any supporting documents to the pilots (business cases, DPIAs or ISAs).

**AP49:** Secretariat to design central repository of business cases and evaluation reports.

**AP50:** Secretariat to circulate minutes from previous meetings for discussion and approval at the July meeting.

**AP51:** Secretariat to explore where minutes will be published and the process of approval for this.

**AP52:** Secretariat to amend ToR accordingly and to add that the Board will hold the CO to account.

**5. New business case for approval**

SLC presented pilot proposal (DEA/F/7) for data sharing between the Student Loans Company and HMRC to combat fraud in childcare grants. The Review Board considered the business case, data protection impact assessments and information sharing agreement in line with the Code of Practice.

**Decision:** The Review Board accepted the pilot proposal for submission to the Minister, subject to amendments.

**AP53**: SLC to amend proposal paperwork re: DEA/F/7 and return to the Secretariat.

**AP54**: Secretariat to circulate amended DEA/F/7 proposal for agreement by RB members via correspondence.

**AP55:** Subject to agreement, Secretariat to refer DEA/F/7 to the Minister for approval.

**6. New Business case for initial evaluation**

DS presented the interim report (DEA/F/3) for the NFI / HMRC pilot for combating fraud in Local Authorities.

**Decision**: The Review Board approved the progression of the pilot to stage two subject to amendments to pilot paperwork and if applicable, necessary HMRC approvals from Data Guardian, policy and other areas; and assurances around issued guidance.

In addition, NFI and DWP will discuss whether/which HB referrals should be released and will come back to the Board on 4 July 2019 to advise.

**AP56**: NFI to meet with DWP to discuss the organisational overlap with housing benefit investigations, and to report progress to the Review Board in July.

**AP57**: NFI to consider business case to clarify whether purpose has changed with progression to pilot phase two, and submit variation to the secretariat.

**AP58**: NFI to amend issued guidance in line with Review Board feedback.

**7. Update from Devolved Administrations.**

Secretariat updated with a summary of a meeting with CW of the Scottish Government earlier in the week.

**8. Update from information Commissioner’s Office**

ICO updated on progress with the ICO Data Sharing Code of Practice.

ICO requested that two amendments are made to the ToR to clarify ICO involvement on the board:

**Decision**: The Review Board agreed that an amendment should be made to clarify that ICO involvement on the board does not equal regulatory approval.

**Decision**: The Review Board rejected the proposed amendment that the ICO ‘may’ attend meetings instead of ‘will’, in line with the Code of Practice.

**AP59**: Secretariat to amend ToR accordingly.

**9. Report on Companies House / HMRC fraud pilot (ref: DEA/F/1)**

CO updated on the Companies House / HMRC pilot extension and requested that Review Board members review a request to vary the pilot via correspondence.

**Decision**: The Review Board agreed to accept continuation and amendments, subject to circulation of paperwork.

**AP60**: Secretariat to issue CH papers for RB members to approve continuation of pilot and amendments by correspondence.

**10. Homes England / HMRC fraud pilot**

HE provided a verbal update on final metrics for the Homes England pilot (DEA/F/2) to combat fraud in the Help to Buy Scheme. Review Board discussed whether the pilot has met its aims in line with the Code of Practice.

**AP61**: Secretariat to circulate final evaluation papers for DEA/F/2 by correspondence.

**AP62**: Secretariat to include item on July agenda for Homes England to attend, to review the pilot and consider if the pilot has met its objectives.

**11. AOB**

There was no other business.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**Date 4 July 2019**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) |  |  | X | Kevin Shaw (KS) |  | X |  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  |  | X | Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  |  |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  |  | X | Mark Cheeseman (MC) | X |  |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  |  | X | Mark Richardson (MR) |  |  | X |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | X |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) |  | X |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO |  | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | X |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  |  | Mike Molloy (MM) | X |  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  | X |  | Peter Tutton (PT) |  |  | X |
| Heather Neate (HN) | X |  |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) |  |  | X |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  |  | X | Stephen Quick (SQ) | X |  |  |
| Joe Penrose (JP) | X |  |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |  |
| John Viggers |  |  | X | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  |  | X |
| Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |  | Neeta Parekh (Shadow)  | X |  |  |

| GB and WG, Homes England  |
| --- |

**Outstanding actions brought forward**

* AP41 - ICO to inform secretariat when consultation opens for RB consideration.
* AP44 - CH to submit a revised DPIA for consideration.
* AP49 - Secretariat to design central repository of business cases and evaluation reports.
* AP51 - Secretariat to explore where minutes will be published and the process of approval for this.

**New Actions**

* AP63 - Homes England to provide more details to Secretariat on pilot DEA/F/2 in regard to i) how false positives have been determined using CRA checks; and ii) the evidence that was required to be submitted as part of compliance exercises.
* AP64 - Secretariat to draft a report to the Minister re: Homes England pilot DEA/F/2 and circulate to Board Members for discussion at the next meeting.
* AP65 - re NFI / HMRC / LA pilot ref: DEA/F/3, NFI to share information on HB investigations with DWP and to continue to report into the Review Board on discussions with DWP.
* AP66 - Secretariat to amend ToR to reflect chairmanship in instances where established chairs are absent and seek approval from Board Members by correspondence.
* AP67 - Secretariat to published updated ToRs on gov.uk site.
* AP68 - HMRC to approve the minutes from previous meetings for publication and notify Secretariat.
* AP69 - Secretariat to i) check rating of RAG status; and ii) add new risks related to pilot management and achieving objectives.
* AP70 Secretariat to schedule  the NAO report on ‘Challenges in using data across government’ and CO / DCMS ‘Thought Paper on Tackling fraud in Government with data analytics - Starting the conversation’ for  discussion at the next meeting.

**1. Introductions**

 The Chairs welcomed attendees

**2. Conflicts of Interest**

 MS, MM and TS declared an interest in item 4

 MS, and MM declared an interest in item 5

 MS, MM, DS and MC declared an interest in item 6

**3. Minutes and actions from last Review Board meeting**

 The Board approved the minutes and action points from the last meeting.

**4. LA / HMRC Council Tax Debt Pilot refs DEA/D/1-29 - Verbal progress**

**update**

The Review Board heard a progress update on the council tax debt pilots where 29 local authorities shared personal data with HMRC earlier this year for the purposes of reducing and managing council tax debt.

**5.** **Evaluation - Homes England ref DEA/F/2 - has pilot met its objectives?**

The Review Board heard an evaluation of final metrics from Homes England on the pilot to combat fraud in the Help to Buy Equity Loan schemes and discussed lessons learned.

**AP63** - Homes England to provide more details to Secretariat on pilot DEA/F/2 in regard to i) how false positives have been determined using CRA checks; and ii) the evidence that was required to be submitted as part of compliance exercises.

**AP64** - Secretariat to draft a report to the Minister re: Homes England pilot DEA/F/2 and circulate to Board Members for discussion at the next meeting.

**6. NFI / HMRC ref DEA/F/3 - verbal update on progress with HB matches**

The Review Board heard an update on discussions with DWP re: the organisational overlap with HB investigations. APs 56-58 are closed.

**AP65** - re NFI / HMRC / LA pilot ref: DEA/F/3, NFI to share information on HB investigations with DWP and to continue to report into the Review Board on discussions with DWP.

**7. Revised Terms of Reference**

The Review Board agreed amendments to the Terms of Reference.

**AP66** - Secretariat to amend ToR to reflect chairmanship in instances where established chairs are absent and seek approval from Board Members by correspondence.

**AP67** - Secretariat to published updated ToRs on gov.uk site.

**8. Transparency - publication of minutes**

The Review Board agreed the minutes of previous meetings for publication on gov.uk, subject to HMRC approval.

**AP68** - HMRC to approve the minutes from previous meetings for publication and notify Secretariat.

**9. Update from devolved administrations**

There was no update from the devolved administrations

**10. Update from Information Commission Office**

ICOadvised the data sharing code is not yet out for consultation.

**11. Risk Register**

 The Review Board considered the updated risk register, queried the RAG status of item at line 14 and asked for new risks to be added related pilot management and the capacity of organisations to achieve their objectives

**AP69** - Secretariat to i) check rating of RAG status at line 14; and ii) add new risks related to pilot management and achieving objectives.

**12. AOB**

The Review Board asked that the NAO report on ‘Challenges in using data across government’ and the CO / DCMS ‘Thought Paper on Tackling fraud in Government with data analytics - Starting the conversation’ are discussed at the next meeting.

**AP70**: Secretariat to schedule  the NAO report on ‘Challenges in using data across government’ and CO / DCMS ‘Thought Paper on Tackling fraud in Government with data analytics - Starting the conversation’ for  discussion at the next meeting.

Board Members were asked to consider the relationship between the Board and pilot SROs in advance of the next meeting.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**Date: 24 October 2019**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) |  |  | X | Kevin Shaw (KS) |  |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | X |  |  | Louise Bennett (LB) |  |  | X |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  |  | X | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  |  | X |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  |  | X | Mark Richardson (MR) |  | X |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | X |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | X |  |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO |  | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | X |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) |  |  | X | Mike Molloy (MM) |  |  | X |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  |  | X | Peter Tutton (PT) | X |  |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | X |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) |  |  | X |
| Joe Penrose (JP) | X |  |  | Stephen Quick (SQ) |  |  | X |
| John Viggers |  | X |  | Steve Coppard (SC) (Chair) | X |  |  |
| Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  |  | X |
|  |  |  |  | Farhathul Sanu (FS) | X |  |  |
| **Additional Speakers** |
| KF HMRC | X |  |  | NF Insolvency Service | X |  |  |
| CJ Companies House |  | X |  |  LR Companies House |  | X |  |
| MB HMRC |  | X |  | PE HMRC |  | X |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward**

● AP49 - Secretariat to design central repository of business cases and

evaluation reports.

● AP65 - re NFI / HMRC / LA pilot ref: DEA/F/3, NFI to share information on HB investigations with DWP and to continue to report into theReview Board on discussions with DWP.

● AP70 Secretariat to schedule the NAO report on ‘Challenges in using

data across government’ and CO / DCMS ‘Thought Paper on Tackling

fraud in Government with data analytics - Starting the conversation’ for

discussion at the next meeting.

**New Actions:**

* AP71 Secretariat to upload minutes quarterly onto the DEA RB page on gov.uk.
* AP72 Cabinet Office to amend Internal Fraud Proposal [DEA/F/6] and provide to secretariat.
* AP73 Secretariat to circulate amended Internal Fraud Proposal [DEA/F/6] to RB members for approval.
* AP74 Subject to RB agreement, secretariat to send note to minister recommending that Internal Fraud proposal [DEA/F/6] is approved for implementation.
* AP75 Secretariat to send note to the minister recommending that CH/HMRC pilot [DEA/F/1] has i) met its objectives; and ii) moves to BAU.
* AP76 Secretariat to re-draft note to the Minister re: Homes England pilot [DEA/F/2] and circulate to RB members for comment via correspondence.
* AP77 Subject to RB approval, secretariat to send note to the Minister re: Homes England [DEA/F/2].
* AP78 Secretariat to work with SLC and ensure consideration of debt collection and fairness is included in the December report for pilot DEA/F/7.
* AP79 Secretariat to include information from the Council Tax Pilot Update [DEA/D/1 - DEA/D/29] in the quarterly report to the Minister.
* AP80 Secretariat to review templates, issued guidance and risk assessment.

**1. Welcome and introductions**

The Chairs welcomed attendees.

**2. Conflicts of interest**

 MS – items, 4, 5, 6, 7 & 8

AT, TS & PT – item 8

**3. Minutes and actions from last Review Board meeting**

The Review Board approved the minutes and action points from the last meeting.

**AP71** Secretariat to upload minutes quarterly onto the DEA RB page on gov.uk.

**4. New business case submitted for review: Internal Fraud DEA/F/6**

The Review Board heard a proposal for a new business case to combat fraud in Civil Service recruitment between Cabinet Office and HMRC.The Review Board recommended that, subject to amendments, the Minister approve the proposals for implementation.

**AP72** Cabinet Office to amend Internal Fraud Proposal [DEA/F/6] and provide to secretariat.

**AP73** Secretariat to circulate amended Internal Fraud Proposal [DEA/F/6] to RB members for approval.

**AP74** Subject to RB agreement, secretariat to send note to minister recommending that Internal Fraud proposal [DEA/F/6] is approved for implementation.

**5. CH/ HMRC DEA/F/1 - report and request for conversion to Business as Usual**

The Review Board heard an update from the Companies House/HMRC Pilot and a request to convert to Business as Usual.The Review Board, subject to requested clarifications will recommend that the Minister approves the pilot for Business as Usual.

**AP75** Secretariat to send note to the minister recommending that CH/HMRC pilot [DEA/F/1] has i) met its objectives; and ii) moves to BAU.

**6. Draft Note to Minister on Homes England pilot DEA/F/2**

The Review Board was provided with an update on the proposed note to the Minister regarding Homes England pilot DEA/F/2.  The Review Board asked that the note is re-worked in line with feedback and re-circulated for further comment via correspondence.

**AP76** Secretariat to re-draft note to the Minister re: Homes England pilot [DEA/F/2] and circulate to RB members for comment via correspondence.

**AP77** Subject to RB approval, secretariat to send note to the Minister re: Homes England [DEA/F/2].

**7. SLC/HMRC Variation/Interim Report - DEA/F/7**

The Review Board heard an update on SLC/HMRC variation and interim report.

The Review Board acknowledged the update.

**AP78** Secretariat to work with SLC and ensure consideration of debt collection and fairness is included in the December report for pilot DEA/F/7.

**8. LA/HMRC  Council Tax Pilot - DEA/D/1 to 29 - Update**

The Review Board heard an update on the council tax pilots [DEA/D/1 - DEA/D/29] including a report of a low impact data breach:

* Employment data (name and address of employer) relating to 18 data subjects was made available to other local authorities outside of agreed project scope.
* No information was made public.
* Access to information was removed on the same day as the disclosure was noticed.
* Affected Local Authorities and HMRC have followed their breach procedures
* HMRC have marked the breach as ‘low impact’
* The Review Board agreed to note the update in the next quarterly report to the Minister. The Review Board also asked that the secretariat assess the DEA process to mitigate against the risk of recurrence.

**AP79** Secretariat to include information from the Council Tax Pilot Update [DEA/D/1 - DEA/D/29] in the quarterly report to the Minister.

**AP80** Secretariat to review templates, issued guidance and risk assessment.

**9. FOI and Transparency**

The Review Board heard the update on FOI and Transparency.  The Review Board acknowledged the update.

**10. NAO Report and Fraud Thought Paper**

This item will be included in the next meeting.

**11. AOB**

The Review Board heard an update on recruitment for secretariat.

The Review Board heard a request to be informed of any further FOIs.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**05 December 2019**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alison Dewar |  |  | X | Louise Bennett (LB) |  |  | X |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | X |  |  | Mark Brewin (MB) |  |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  |  | X | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  |  | X |
| Chris Mullan (CM) | X |  |  | Mark Richardson (MR) |  |  | X |
| Christine Hutchinson |  |  | X | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | X |  |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | X |  |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | X |  | Mike Molloy (MM) | X |  |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO |  | X |  | Peter Tutton (PT) |  |  | X |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  |  | X | Stephen Quick (SQ) |  |  | X |
| Heather Neate (HN) | X |  |  | Roisin Kelly |  |  | X |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | X |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  | X |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  |  | X |
| Joe Penrose (JP) | X |  |  | Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |  |
| John Jeewoonarain |  |  | X | Tracy Holland |  | X |  |
| John Viggers | X |  |  | Kevin Shaw (KS) |  |  | X |

Presenting items:

| KM (SLC) |  | X |  | RT (DWP) |  | X |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| GT (CO) | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

* AP71 - Secretariat to upload minutes onto DEA RB page on gov.uk
* AP74 - Secretariat to send note to the minister recommending proposal DEA/F/7 for approval
* AP76 - Secretariat to rework Homes England note and circulate to RB
* AP77 - Subject to RB agreement, secretariat to send Homes England note to the Minister
* AP79 - Secretariat to include update on council tax pilots in quarterly update and minutes for RB consideration
* AP80 - Secretariat to review templates, issued guidance and risk assessment in light of data breach

**New Actions:**

* **AP81 -** Secretariat to provide feedback to ESFA to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.
* **AP82 -** Secretariat to provide feedback to HMRC to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.
* **AP83** - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements.
* **AP84** - Secretariat to work with DWP to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2.
* **AP85 -** Secretariat to work up horizon scanning document to inform DEA engagement

**1. Introductions**

SC welcomed attendees

**2. Conflicts of interest**

JV declared an interest in item 7

MM and CM declared an interest in item 5

PT declared an interest in item 4

**3. Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the October Board meeting for publication.

**4. New proposal for initial review - ESFA/HMRC to combat fraud relating to apprenticeship learning**

The Board considered the proposal from ESFA for a pilot with HMRC relating to apprenticeship learning.

**AP81 -** Secretariat to provide feedback to ESFA to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.

**5. New proposal for initial review - HMRC/CH/INSS to combat fraud relating to mini umbrella companies**

The Board considered the proposal from HMRC for a pilot with Companies House and the Insolvency Service relating to mini umbrella companies.

**AP82 -** Secretariat to provide feedback to HMRC to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.

**6. Pilot reporting outcomes back to the board - SLC/HMRC to combat fraud related to childcare grants**

The Board considered the final pilot outcomes as presented by KM.

**AP83** - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements.

**7. Pilot reporting outcomes back to the board - DWP/DVLA to combat fraud related to Universal Credit**

The Board considered the final pilot outcomes as presented by RT.

**AP84** - Secretariat to work with DWP and DVLA to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2.

**8. Report on the first year of DEA operations and next steps**

HN presented to the Board on the first year of DEA and proposed next steps

**9. NAO and Fraud Thought Paper**

The RB considered the recent NAO report into cross-government use of data, and heard an update from GT on the Counter Fraud Data Analytics Thought Paper.

**AP85 -** Secretariat to work up horizon scanning document to inform DEA engagement

**10. Update from devolved administrations**

The RB heard an update from the devolved administrations.

**11. Risk Register**

The RB heard an update on the risk register

**12. AOB**

There was no other business raised

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board Minutes**

**16th January 2020**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |  | In Person | Phone | Apologies |
| Alison Dewar |  |  | X | Mark Brewin (MB) |  |  | X |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | X |  |  | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | X |  |  | Mark Richardson (MR) |  | X |  |
| Chris Mullan (CM) | X |  |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | X |  |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  |  | X | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | X |  |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO |  | X |  | Mike Molloy (MM) | X |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  |  | Peter Tutton (PT) |  |  | `X |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  |  | X | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  |  | X | Rich Wental |  |  |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  |  | X | Roisin Kelly |  |  | X |
| Joe Penrose (JP) |  |  | X | Stephen Quick (SQ) | X |  |  |
| John Viggers | X |  |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |  |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) |  | X |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  |  | X |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  |  | Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |  |
| Tracy Holland |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |

Presenting items:

| AW (ESFA) |  | X |  | KH (HMRC) |  | X |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

* AP76 - Secretariat to rework Homes England note and circulate to RB
* AP77 - Subject to RB agreement, secretariat to send Homes England note to the Minister
* AP79 - Secretariat to include update on council tax pilots in quarterly update and minutes for RB consideration
* AP80 - Secretariat to review templates, issued guidance and risk assessment in light of data breach
* AP81 - Secretariat to provide feedback to ESFA to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.
* AP82 - Secretariat to provide feedback to HMRC to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.
* AP83 - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements.
* AP84 - Secretariat to work with DWP to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2.
* AP85 - Secretariat to work up horizon scanning document to inform DEA engagement

**New Actions:**

* AP86 - Secretariat to work with ESFA to revise paperwork for DEA/F/8
* AP 87 - Secretariat to work with HMRC to revise the paperwork for DEA/D/30

**1. Introductions**

SC welcomed attendees

**2. Conflicts of interest**

CM declared an interest in item 4

MS (Sec), AT, TS, CM, MM, KS, AC and PW declared an interest in item 5

**3. Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the October Board meeting for publication.

**4. New proposal for formal review - ESFA/HMRC to combat fraud relating to apprenticeship learning**

The Board considered the proposal from ESFA for a pilot with HMRC relating to apprenticeship learning.

RB agreed to recommend approval to the Minister with amendments before submission.

**AP86 - Sec to revise documentation and gain approval from RB, then submit to the Minster**

**5. New proposal for initial review -**

The Board considered the proposal from CO for a pilot with HMRC and central government departments and 20 Local Authorities on analysis on vulnerable debtors.

RB made comments to strengthen the pilot and gain better insight from the study.

**AP87 - Sec to strengthen the pilot**

**6. Update from devolved administrations**

There were no available reps to provide an update.

**7. AOB**

There was no other business raised.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 26th March 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 15:00**

| **Attending**  |
| --- |
|  | Phone | Apologies |  | Phone | Apologies |
| Alison Dewar |  | X | Mark Brewin (MB) | X |  |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) |  | X | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  | X | Mike Molloy (MM) |  | X |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  | X | Mark Richardson (MR) | X |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | X | Mark Sutcliffe (MS) | X |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MSo) | X |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  | Peter Tutton (PT) | X |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | X |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | X | Rich Wentel (RW)(Chair) |  | X |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  | X | Roisin Kelly (RK) (NI) |  | X |
| John Viggers (JV) | X |  | Stephen Quick (SQ) |  | X |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | X |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  | X |
| Mandeep Bhogal (MBh) | X |  | Tim Savill (TS) |  | X |

Presenting items;

| Ruth Fawley (RF) | X |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

AP71 Secretariat to upload minutes onto DEA RB page on gov.uk

AP82 DEA/F/9 HMRC/INSS - Secretariat to provide feedback to HMRC to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission.

AP83 DEA/F/7SLC/HMRC - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements

AP84 DEA/F/4 DWP/DVLA - Secretariat to work with DWP/DVLA to consider the proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2.

AP85 Secretariat horizon scanning inform DEA engagement

**New Actions:**

AP88 DEA/D/30 - Secretariat to work with authorities to revise paperwork and provide signed copies to the RB ahead of submission to the Minister

AP89 DEA/D/30 - Secretariat to follow-up StepChange’s offer to share a report on overlapping debt

1. **Introductions**

MS welcomed attendees.

The Board decided there were enough attendees and out of committee input on substantive matters to consider the day’s attendance as quorate.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

MSo, AC, AT, CM, KS, MM, TS and PW declared an interest in item 4.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the last Board meeting for publication.

1. **New proposal for formal review - Vulnerable and Overlapping debtors**

The Board considered the proposal from CO/HMRC for a pilot with central government departments and a selection of local authorities for analysis of vulnerable and overlapping debtors.

RB agreed to recommend approval to the Minister with amendments and signed paperwork before submission.

Consideration was given to impacts from Covid-19 pandemic to resourcing the pilot and importance of the pilot's relevance to the current emergency.

The Board recognised resource uncertainties arising from staff redeployment to support pandemic countermeasures, and the impact this may have on the pilot going forwards.

**AP88 - Secretariat to work with authorities to revise paperwork and provide signed copies to the RB ahead of submission to the Minister**

**AP89 DEA/D/30 - Secretariat to follow-up StepChange’s offer to share a report on vulnerable debtors.**

1. **Update from devolved administrations**

Paper update provided from the Scottish Government rep

1. **AOB**

Discussion recognising the risks from COVID 19 pandemic countermeasure resource diversion and potential Ministerial delays.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 23rd April 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 15:00**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | Phone | Apologies |  | Phone | Apologies |
| Alison Dewar | X |  | Mark Brewin (MB) | X |  |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | X |  | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  | X | Mike Molloy (MM) |  | X |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  | X | Mark Richardson (MR) | X |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | X |  | Mark Sutcliffe (MS-CO) | X |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MSo-CO) | X |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  | Peter Tutton (PT) |  | X |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  | X | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |
| Helen Morris (HM) |  | X | Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | X |  |
| Iain Burns (IB) |  | X | Roisin Kelly (RK) |  | X |
| John Viggers (JV) | X |  | Stephen Quick (SQ) |  | X |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) |  | X | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  | Stuart Stevenson (SS) |  | X |
| Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | X |  | Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |

Guests:

| Lisa Bright (LB) | X |  | Malcolm Davies (MD) | X |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| James Wragg (JW) | X |  |  |  |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

AP71 - Secretariat to upload minutes onto DEA RB page on gov.uk. (cleared)

AP82 - Secretariat to provide feedback to HMRC to strengthen the business case ahead of full submission. (cleared)

AP83 - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements (cleared)

AP84 - Secretariat to work with DWP/DVLA to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2 (ongoing)

AP85 - Secretariat horizon scanning to inform DEA engagement (ongoing).

AP88 - Secretariat to work with authorities to revise paperwork and provide signed copies to the RB ahead of submission to the Minister.

AP89 - Secretariat to follow-up StepChange’s offer to share a report on vulnerable debtors.

**New Actions:**

**AP90** - Secretariat to progress this variations with HMRC and local authorities

1. **Introductions**

MS welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

DS declared an interest in item 4.

MSo, AC, TS and PW declared an interest in item 5.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the last Board meeting for progressing to publication.

1. **Evaluation - fraud pilot NFI/HMRC ref DEA/F/3**

The Board reviewed and agreed the final evaluation report requesting a new business case be presented to the board to support continuation of pilot work between NFI and HMRC relating to the use of improved NFI analytics in combating fraud faced by HMRC/LAs.

1. **Variation - Debt Council Tax pilot HMRC/LA’s DEA/D/1-29**

The Board reviewed the proposal from CO for a variation in the pilot between HMRC and LA’s.

The RB approved the variation in the pilot in principle, leaving minor details in the paperwork to be agreed between HMRC and CO.

AP90 - Secretariat to progress this variation with HMRC and local authorities.

1. **Update from devolved administrations**

No updates were provided.

1. **AOB**

In anticipation of Covid 19 related fraud and debt within new financial support provision causing new demand on the Fraud and Debt DEA data sharing powers, the RB agreed that:

* The frequency of the board may increase to every 2-3 weeks
* There may be tighter deadlines for the review of papers, etc.

The Board recognised the importance of supporting this work as needed.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 28th May 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 14:00**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | Phone | Apologies |  | Phone | Apologies |
|  |  |  | Mark Brewin (MB) | X |  |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | X |  | Mark Cheeseman (MC) |  | X |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | X |  | Mike Molloy (MM) | X |  |
| Chris Mullan (CM) |  | X | Mark Richardson (MR) | X |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) |  | X | Mark Sutcliffe (MS-CO) |  | X |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MSo-CO) | X |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) |  | X | Peter Tutton (PT) |  | X |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  | X | Michelle Boniface (MB-CO) | X |  |
| Heather Flanagan (HF) | X |  | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |
| John Viggers (JV) | X |  | Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | X |  |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) |  | X | Stephen Quick (SQ) | X |  |
| Leo Ehrnrooth (LE) | X |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |
| Lisa Bright (LB-CO) | X |  | Tim Savill (TS) |  | X |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  | Michael Parfitt (MP) | X |  |
| Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | X |  | Victoria James (VJ) | X |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

**AP83** - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements (ongoing)

**AP84** - Secretariat to work with DWP/DVLA to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2 (ongoing)

**AP85** - Secretariat horizon scanning to inform DEA engagement (ongoing).

**AP88** - Secretariat to work with authorities to revise paperwork from the Vulnerable and Overlapping Debtors pilot and provide signed copies to the RB ahead of submission to the Minister.

**AP89** - Secretariat to follow-up StepChange’s offer to share a report on vulnerable debtors.

**AP90** - Secretariat to progress the variation on the Council Tax pilot with HMRC and local authorities (ongoing).

**New Actions:**

**AP91 -** MB to share the Internal fraud pilot report with HMRC internal audit teams.

**AP92** - MB-CO and VJ to update board with next steps on the Internal fraud pilot

1. **Introductions**

MS welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

MB-CO declared an interest in item 4.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the last Board meeting for progressing to publication.

1. **Internal Fraud report DEA/F/6**

The Board considered the final pilot outcomes as presented by MB-CO and VT. The Board agreed that the pilot had met its objectives

**AP91 -** MB to share the pilot with HMRC internal audit teams.

**AP92** - MB-CO and VJ to update board with next steps

1. **Update from devolved administrations**

No updates were provided.

1. **Forward Look**

MS outlined two Covid-19 related pilots, one fraud and one debt.

1. **AOB**

There was no other business.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 2nd July 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 14:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
|  | Phone | Apologies |  | Phone | Apologies |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) |  | X | Mark Brewin (MB) | X |  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) |  | X | Mike Molloy (MM) | X |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | X |  | Michael Sowerby (MS) | X |  |
| Debra Heaton (DB) ICO | X |  | Peter Tutton (PT) |  | X |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | X |  | Michelle Boniface (MB-CO) | X |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) |  | X | Peter Wallwork (PW) | X |  |
| Heather Flanagan (HF) | X |  | Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) |  | X |
| Iain Burns (IB) | X |  | Stephen Quick (SQ) | X |  |
| John Viggers (JV) | X |  | Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X |  |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | X |  | Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |
| Leo Ehrnrooth (LE) | X |  | Guests |  |  |
| Lisa Bright (LB-CO) | X |  | Dominic Walker | X |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | X |  | Emma Rogers | X |  |
| Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | X |  | Victoria James | X |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

**AP83** - Secretariat to work with SLC to consider proposed improvements (ongoing)

**AP84** - Secretariat to work with DWP/DVLA to consider proposed progression of the pilot to stage 2 (ongoing)

**AP85** - Secretariat horizon scanning to inform DEA engagement (ongoing).

**AP89** - Secretariat to follow-up StepChange’s offer to share a report on vulnerable debtors (ongoing).

**AP90** - Secretariat to progress the variation on the Council Tax pilot with HMRC and local authorities (ongoing).

**AP92** - MB-CO and VJ to update board with next steps on the Internal fraud pilot

**New Actions:**

**AP93 -** Sec to work with BEIS/MOJ and DFE to amend the business case and refer the pilot back to the Review Board.

**AP94** - Sec to include a review of the minutes at a future Review Board

1. **Introductions**

MS welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

MB-CO declared an interest in item 4.

LB declared an interest in Item 4.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

RB approved the completed actions and agreed to the minutes from the last Board meeting for progressing to publication.

1. **New business case submitted for review: Contingent Labour DEA/F/11**

MB-CO and VJ presented a pilot proposal (DEA/F/11) for data sharing between the BEIS/MOJ/DFE to analyse and combat fraud in contingent labour. The Review Board considered the proposal.

**Decision:** The Review Board asked for the business case to be clarified and strengthened up around areas of :-

* Contract types
* Payment types
* Sample definition
* Ability to identify false positives

**AP93 -** Sec to work with BEIS/MOJ and DFE to amend the business case and refer the pilot back to the Review Board.

1. **Forward Look**

ER and LE presented a forward look at a pilot with Innovate UK, Cabinet Office and HMRC to combat fraud in grants applications and awards. This pilot is currently being assessed by HMRC and the Secretariat will be requesting an ad-hoc review board to hear the formal proposal.

MS gave a forward look on pilots being scoped and developed:-

* Operational version of the Vulnerable and Overlapping Debtors Pilot - Currently being scoped;
* Council Tax 2 - Follow on pilot with Local Authorities and HMRC, now including DWP, pilot will increase identification of vulnerable debtors with DWP data and also increase matching - Formal data request made to HMRC;
* Pilot using DVLA data for use with debt and fraud with DWP/HMRC/LA’s - Formal data request made to DVLA;
* Pilot with Insolvency Agency and HMRC to combat fraud - on hold due to Covid-19, to be re-started.
1. **AOB**

LB asked for a review of the minutes.

**AP94** - Sec to include a review of the minutes at a future Review Board

LB - provided an update on data and reports around Covid-19:-

* Data and reports are available from ONS, LB can provide a contact within ONS.
* Open Data Foundation are providing socio-economic data from open data sources and the Royal Society of Arts produced a report on attitudes to data sharing (including medical data).

EW - Noted that the DEA Mid point review is due to be issued by DCMS in early July.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 19th August 2020**

**Time 13:30 to 14:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Heather Flanagan (HF) | N |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | N | Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | Y | Michael Sowerby (MSo-CO) | Y |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | N | Michelle Boniface (MB-CO) | Y |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | **Observers**  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y | Debra Heaton (DB) (ICO) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y |  |  |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | N | **Guests** |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y | Evan Williams (EW) | Y |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y | Ralph Palmer (RP) | Y |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | Phillip Nye (PN) | Y |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | N | Victoria James (VJ) | Y |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Hannah Grout (HG) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | N | Graeme Thomson (GT) | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Y |  |  |

1. **Introductions**

MS welcomed attendees. MS noted that as this was an ad-hoc review board and as such would concentrate on the proposed pilots.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

MB-CO, LB and GB declared an interest in item 3.

1. **New business case submitted for review: Contingent Labour DEA/F/11**

MB-CO presented an updated pilot proposal and paperwork following previous comments at the July meeting.

The proposal is to analyse and combat fraud in contingent labour.

The Board considered the proposal and the updated level of detail on contract types, payment systems and false positives.

The Board queried the scalability of the pilot and around the wider use of Public Sector Resourcing, the contracting framework across government for potential future work.

The Review Board suggested a minor change to the business case.

**Decision:**

The Board agreed the pilot should be recommended to the Minister, subject to amendments

**AP95** - Secretariat to circulate amended Contingent Labour proposal for agreement by the Board.

**AP96** - Subject to agreement, secretariat to refer the Contingent Labour pilot to the Minister for approval.

1. **Informal business case submitted for review: Covid-19 Bus Operator Grants DEA/F/12**

HG-CO presented an informal submission to obtain feedback ahead of formally submitting the pilot.

The Board commented on the use of the Cabinet Office’s Fraud and error - Data Pilots & Analytics team to analyse the data and to ensure that the DEA is being used appropriately.

**Decision:** The Board asked for the pilot paperwork to be updated.

**AP97** - HG to work with DfT to make the suggested improvements on the pilot paperwork.

1. **AOB**

RW will ask for feedback from the Review Board on the flexible approach to meetings to ensure that it is working for members, to inform potential process improvements.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 16th September 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 14:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | **Yes/No** | **Secretariat** | **Yes/No** |
| Rich Wentel (RW)(Chair) | N | Heather Flanagan (HF) | N |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | Y | Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | Y | Michael Sowerby (MSo-CO) | Y |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y | Michelle Boniface (MB-CO) | Y |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | N |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | **Observers**  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | N | Debra Heaton (DB) (ICO) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | N | Roisin Kelly (RK) (NI) | Y |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | N |  |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y | **Guests** |  |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y | Gail Cousins (GC) | Y |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | Katharine Knowles (KK) (ESFA) | Y |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | N | Keith Hunter (KH) (ESFA) | Y |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Craig Martin (CM) (CO) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y | Simon Harris (SH) (HMRC)  | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | N | Charlotte Aspinall (CA) (CO) | Y |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

**AP 96** - Subject to agreement, Secretariat to refer the Contingent Labour pilot to the Minister for approval. Note: Submission made on 18/8/20. AP Closed.

**New Actions:**

**AP 98 -** Secretariat to refer the Apprenticeship Levy DEA F/13 pilot to the Minister for approval. Note: Submission made on 18/9, AP Closed.

1. **Introductions**

MSo-CO welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

MB and MM (both HMRC) declared an Interest in item 4.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

The Review Board approved all completed actions and approved the minutes from the last two board meetings.

1. **New formal business case submitted for review: Apprenticeship Levy DEA/F/13**

KK and KH-ESFA presented a pilot proposal for data sharing between ESFA and HMRC to combat Apprenticeship Levy fraud.

The Review Board sought clarification around the use of the DEA as the legal gateway, ESFA confirmed the DEA was the only legal gateway available and other options had been explored.

The Review Board sought clarification on the impact of those identified as victims of identity fraud. ESFA clarified that follow up action would be taken to notify those whose eligibility to funding has been affected.

**Decision:** The Review Board accepted the pilot proposal for submission to the Minister.

**AP 98 -** Secretariat to refer the Apprenticeship Levy DEA F/13 pilot to the Minister for approval. Note: Submission made on 18/9, AP Closed

1. **Review of Contents of Review Board Minutes**

The Review Board held a general discussion following the AP raised by LB at the July meeting around the content of the minutes.

**Decision:** The Review Board agreed to maintain the standard of detail in the minutes in line with the minutes from the two most recent Review Board meetings.

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look on Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

CM-CO presented a forward look at a two stage pilot into fraud in the Bounce Back Loan Scheme.

Phase 1 of the pilot will be reviewed by correspondence during the w/c 21st September.

Phase 2 of the pilot will be submitted to the Review Board in October.

The Review Board discussed the proposal and were supportive of Phase 1 of and will review via correspondence.

1. **AOB**

No other business raised.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 8th October 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 14:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wentel (RW)(Chair) | N | Mandeep Bhogal (MB-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | Y | Michael Sowerby (MSo-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | N |  |  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | N |  |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | **Observers**  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | N | Debra Heaton (DB) (ICO) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y | Roisin Kelly (RK) (NI) | Y |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | N |  |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y |  |  |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y |  |  |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | **Guests** |  |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | N | Susan Baker (SB) | Y |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Kevin Reid (KR) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y |  |  |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Y |  |  |

**Outstanding actions brought forward:**

None

**New Actions:**

**AP100 -** Secretariat to refer the NFI/HMRC pilot (DEA/F16) to the Minister for approval.

1. **Introductions**

MSo-CO welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of interest**

DS, MB and MM declared an Interest in item 4.

1. **Minutes and actions from last meeting**

The Review Board approved all completed actions and approved the minutes from the last two board meetings.

Note - Phase 2 of the Bounce back Loan is still under development.

1. **New formal business case submitted for review:** National Fraud initiative (NFI) and HMRC to combat fraud in Local Authorities **- DEA/F/16**

SB presented a pilot proposal for data sharing between Cabinet Office’s National Fraud initiative (NFI) and HMRC to combat fraud in Local Authorities.

The Review Board sought clarification on identification of false positives. SB reassured the board that the investigation process would identify these.

**Decision:** The Review Board accepted the pilot proposal for submission to the Minister.

**AP 100 -** Secretariat to commence process to refer the NFI/HMRC DEA/F/16 pilot to the Minister for approval - 12/10/20.

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look on Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

MSo-CO presented a forward look at a number of pilots that are being developed and will be presented to the review board in the coming months.

1. **AOB**

MSo-CO reminded the board that the consultation on the Scottish DEA powers is open till the 6th November, link here:-

<https://consult.gov.scot/digital-directorate/public-authorities-sharing-data-2/>

PW asked for an update on the analysis from the Council Tax debt pilot. MSo-CO noted that data was starting to come in and a high level update would be presented at the 12 November meeting.

 **Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board**

**Minutes**

 **Date 12th November 2020**

**Time 13:00 to 15:00**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | X | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | X  |  |  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y |  |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | **Observers**  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y | Debra Heaton (DB) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y |  |  |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | Y |  |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y |  |  |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y |  |  |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y |  |  |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | X |  |  |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y |  |  |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y |  |  |
| Tim Savill (TS) | X |  |  |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

None

**New Actions:**

**AP 101 -** Secretariat to discuss further dissemination of Year Two DEA report with Chairs (Review: 10/12/20202).

**AP 102** - MS-CO to arrange the production of the Council Tax Pilot report for the Review Board to consider success and next steps of the pilot (Review: 10/12/20).

1. **Introductions**

MS-CO welcomed attendees and introduced the new DEA Review Board Secretariat member, AMU-CO.

1. **Conflicts of Interest**

None

1. **Minutes and Actions From Last Meeting**

Review Board approved all completed actions and minutes from the last Review Board meeting (08/09/20).

1. **Report on Year Two of DEA Operations**

MS-CO presented a report on the Year Two of DEA Operations.

**Decision:** Review Board accepted the report and recommended that report should be disseminated as widely as possible to stakeholders to demonstrate achievements of DEA pilots.

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to discuss further dissemination of Year Two DEA report with Chairs (Review: 10/12/20).

1. **Council Tax Pilot - High-Level Evaluation**

MS-CO presented a high-level evaluation of the LA/HMRC Council Tax Pilot.

**AP 102** - MS-CO to arrange the production of the Council Tax Pilot report for the Review Board to consider success and next steps of the pilot (Review: 10/12/20).

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look on Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

MS-CO presented a forward look at a number of pilots that are being developed and will be presented to the Review Board in the coming months.

1. **AOB**

DH noted that the ICO planned review of the DEA powers will commence in early 2021.

 **Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing ad hoc Review Board Minutes**

 **Date 3rd December 2020**

**Time 16:00 to 17:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board Members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | N | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | N |  |  |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | N |  |  |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |  |  |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | **Observers**  |  |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | N | Debra Heaton (DB) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y | Helen Morris (HM) | Y |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | N |  |  |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y |  |  |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y |  |  |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y |  |  |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | N | **Guests** |  |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Craig Martin (CM) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y | Laurence Pawley (BEIS) (LP) | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | N | Sarah Jones (BEIS) (SJ) | Y |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

**AP 101** - Secretariat to discuss further dissemination of Year Two DEA report with Chairs

**AP 102** - MS-CO to arrange the production of an analysis report as to Council Tax Pilot for Review Board to consider success and next steps of the pilot..

**New Actions:**

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to commence process to refer the BEIS/CO/HMRC to Combat Fraud Relating to BBL via Turnover Analysis DEA Pilot (DEA/F/15) to the Minister for approval upon the Review Board receiving an updated DPIA - 11/12/20.

1. **Introductions**

MS-CO welcomed attendees and advised that invitations for the 2021 DEA Review Board meetings have been sent out.

1. **Conflicts of Interest**

MB, MM and LB declared an Interest in Item 3.

1. **Business Case Formal Proposal - BEIS/CO/HMRC to Combat Fraud Relating to BBL via Turnover Analysis (DEA/F/15)**

CM presented an overview of the BEIS/CO/HMRC to Combat Fraud Relating to BBL via Turnover Analysis DEA Pilot (DEA/F/15)

MS-CO thanked all involved (e.g., BEIS and HMRC) for progressing this pilot proposal at pace.

Review Board noted that BEIS was still finalising the DPIA, BEIS have confirmed that this should be completed within a week and that the ICO had been working with BEIS to clarify some points of the DPIA.

It was confirmed with the Review Board that the data being sent to BEIS post-CO analysis shall comprise aggregated high-level data.

**Decision:** The Review Board accepted the pilot proposal for submission to the Minister upon the Review Board receiving an updated DPIA.

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to commence process to refer the BEIS/CO/HMRC to Combat Fraud Relating to BBL via Turnover Analysis DEA Pilot (DEA/F/15) to the Minister for approval upon the Review Board receiving updated DPIA - 11/12/20.

1. **AOB**

MS-CO noted that the DEA Review Board scheduled for the 10th of December 2020 may not be held.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

 **Date 21st January 2021**

**Time 13:00 to 14:30**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board Members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | N | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | Y |   |   |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y | **Observers** |   |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y |   |   |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y |   |   |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y | Debra Heaton (DB) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y |   |   |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | X |   |   |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y | Helen Morris (HM) | Y |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y |   |   |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | x | **Guests** |   |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | Y | Ruth Fawley - HMRC (RF) | Y |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Gail Cousins - CO (GC) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | x | Kevin Reid - CO (KR) | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | x | Rebecca Law- HMRC (RL) | Y |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

AP101, AP102 and AP103 have been brought forward and are ongoing.

1. **Introductions**

MS-CO welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of Interest**

No conflicts of interest were declared.

1. **Minutes and Actions from Last Meeting**

The Review Board were informed that AP101, AP102 and AP103 have been brought forward and are ongoing. The Review Board approved the minutes from the last two Review Board meetings (12/11/2020 and 3/12/2020).

1. **Verbal Update on ESFA 1 Pilot (DEA/F/8)**

GC presented a verbal update on the initial outcomes of the ESFA 1 Pilot (DEA/F/8). There were no questions from the Review Board.

1. **Verbal Update on ESFA 2 Pilot (DEA/F/13)**

GC presented a verbal update on the initial outcomes of the ESFA 2 Pilot (DEA/F/13). Discussion was given as to how successful DEA pilots are moved into Business As Usual (BAU) and how BAU benefits can be measured over time. It was clarified that for a DEA pilot to become BAU, DEA Review Board approval and Ministerial Approval is to be obtained. For the ESFA pilot to become BAU, a resourcing agreement would need to be produced with HMRC and ESFA would need to fund any provisions implemented (prior to Ministerial Approval being sought).

1. **Verbal Update on the Contingent Labour Pilot (DEA/F/11)**

KR presented a verbal update on the initial outcomes of the Contingent Labour Pilot (DEA/F/11). KR clarified that the contractors considered were both contracted directly and through an agency and the sample criteria for the matching was IT contractors.

1. **Update on the Overlapping & Vulnerable Debtors Pilot (DEA/D/30)**

MS-CO, RL and RF presented a verbal update on the initial outcomes of the Overlapping & Vulnerable Debtors Pilot (DEA/D/30). Clarification was given as to how vulnerability was defined in this pilot (those identified by HMRC as vulnerable and possessing an ongoing debt at the time of the sample’s formation). The Review Board suggested that Local Authorities could engage with this pilot as they face similar issues and this would break down information silos. The Review Board also discussed that consideration should be given to how vulnerability is flagged, the best practice in reaching this designation and how debt recovery practice changes whereupon an individual is flagged as vulnerable.

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look On Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

MS-CO presented a forward look at a number of pilots that are being developed. It was noted that the large number of pilots in scope suggests that reluctance to use the DEA powers has reduced. MB noted that, within the potential pilots detailed, many include HMRC and so consideration needs to be given to HMRC’s capacity. MS-CO confirmed that regular discussions with HMRC are taking place.

1. **AOB**

AMU-CO provided an update on the status of the two Bounce-Back Loan DEA pilots - (DEA/F/14) and (DEA/F/15). It was noted that BEIS is currently addressing concerns relating to BBL Lender Privacy Notices.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

**Date: 25th February 2021**

**Time: 13:00 - 14:00**

**Via tele-conference**

**Chairs: Graeme Thomson, Lisa Bright and Naomi Hunter**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | N | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | N | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | Y |   |   |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y | **Observers** |   |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y | Debra Heaton (DB) | Y |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y |  |   |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y |   |   |
| John Viggers (JV) | N |   |   |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | Y |   |   |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y |   |   |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y |   |   |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | **Guests** |   |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | Y |   |   |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | N | Jenny Lawson (JL) (Cornwall LA) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | N | Rob Cutts (RC) (Rotherham LA) | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Y |   |   |
| Lisa Bright (LB-CO) (acting Chair) | Y | Craig Martin (CM) (CO) | Y |
| Naomi Hunter (NH-CO) (acting Chair) | Y | Daniel Hart (DH) (BEIS) | Y |
| Graeme Thomson (GT-CO) (acting Chair) | Y | Sarah Widness (SW) (CO) | Y |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

**AP102 -** MS-CO to arrange the production of an analysis report as to Council Tax Pilot (DEA/D/1-29) for the DEA Review Board.

**New Actions:**

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to ask pilot bodies to update the documentation for DEA/D/31-64, as per DEA Review Board decision.

**AP 104** - Once AP 103 is completed, Secretariat will refer DEA/D/31-64 pilot to the Minister for approval.

**AP 105** - DH and ICO to review the updated paperwork for DEA/F/14 & 15.

**AP 106** - Once AP 105 is completed, Secretariat will issue the reviewed paperwork for DEA/F/14 & 15 to the Review Board for reference.

1. **Welcome and Introductions**

AMU-CO welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of Interest**

AT, TS, MB, MM, AC, KS and PT declared an Interest in Item 4.

1. **Minutes and Actions From Last Meeting**

The Review Board approved minutes and from the last DEA Review Board meetings

1. **New Business Case for Formal Review - Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support - Council Tax 2 (DEA/D/31-64)**

JL presented a pilot proposal on behalf of 33 Local Authorities for a data sharing pilot with DWP and HMRC to manage and reduce Council Tax debt. This is a second iteration of this pilot, building on the lessons learnt from the 1st version of the pilot (DEA/D/1-29).

The DEA Review Board provided comments around the DPIA and DUA which are to be incorporated into the revised paperwork.

**Decision:** The DEA Review Board accepted, subject to amendments, the pilot proposal for submission to the Minister.

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to ask pilot bodies to update the documentation as per Review Board decision

**AP 104** - Once AP 103 is completed, Secretariat to refer DEA/D/31-64 pilot to the Minister for approval.

1. **Verbal Update on the Bounce Back Loans pilots (DEA/F/14 & 15)**

DH (BEIS) provided a verbal update on the Bounce Back Loan pilots (DEA/F/14 & 15). DEA Review Board recommended that the planned review of the revised paperwork with the ICO is to be completed before BEIS re-starts the pilot.

MS-CO noted that the DEA Review Board would be issued with the revised paperwork.

**AP 105** - DH (BEIS) and ICO to review the updated paperwork.

**AP 106** - Once AP 105 is completed, Secretariat to issue the reviewed paperwork to the DEA Review Board for reference.

1. **Verbal Update on National Fraud Initiative and Widening Use of Local Accountability & Audit Powers**

MS-CO asked Review Board members to consider completing the consultation.

1. **AOB**

No AOB was raised.

​​

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

**Date: 25th April 2021**

**Time: 13:00 - 15:30**

**Via tele-conference**

**Chairs: Rich Wental and Steve Coppard**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | Y | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | N |   |   |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | Y | **Observers** |   |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | N | Julia Cook (JC-ICO) | Y |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | Helen Morris (HM) | Y |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y |   |   |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y | **Guests** |   |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | N | Lex Jones - Registry Trust (LJ-RT) | Y |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y | Louise Jones (LJ-BLA) | Y |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y | Graeme Ruse (GR-BLA) | Y |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | Will Gardner (WG-DWP) | Y |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | Y | Julia Cooke (JC-ICO) | Y |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y | Fiona Innes (FI-SLC) | Y |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | N | Graeme Thomson (GT) | Y |
| Tim Savill (TS) | N |   |   |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

**AP102 -** MS-CO to arrange the production of an analysis report as to the Council Tax Pilot (DEA/D/1-29) for the DEA Review Board.

**AP 103 -** Secretariat to ask pilot bodies to update the documentation for DEA/D/31-66, as per DEA Review Board decision.

**AP 104** - Once AP 103 is completed, Secretariat will refer DEA/D/31-66 pilot to the Minister for approval.

**AP 105** - DH( BEIS) and ICO to review the updated paperwork for DEA/F/14 & 15.

**AP 106** - Once AP 105 is completed, Secretariat will issue the reviewed paperwork for DEA/F/14 & 15 to the Review Board for reference.

**New Actions:**

**AP 107** - LJ-RT to consider the Review Board’s comments and work with DEA Secretariat to identify next steps.

**AP 108 -** Secretariat to work with the pilot bodies to update paperwork for DEA/F/19 based on Review Board comments, to gain signed-off documentation from pilot parties, and then produce Ministerial Submission.

1. **Welcome and Introductions**

AMU-CO welcomed attendees.

1. **Conflicts of Interest**

JV declared an interest in Item 4.

AT, MB, MM and PT declared an Interest in Item 5.

JV declared an interest in Item 6.

1. **Minutes and Actions From Last Meeting**

The Review Board approved minutes and noted the action points from the last DEA Review Board meeting.

1. **New Business Case for Informal Review - Registry Trust Debt and Fraud Pilot**

LJ-RT presented an informal pilot proposal to manage & reduce debt and combat fraud in the public sector.

The DEA Review Board was supportive of the pilot concept and provided comments to strengthen the proposal, as pertained to the beneficiaries of the pilot (e.g. public authorities, the public), addressing false positives and clarifying sandbox provisions.

**AP 107** - LJ-RT to consider the Review Board’s comments and work with DEA Secretariat to identify next steps.

1. **New Business Cases for Formal Review - Additional bodies to the Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support Pilot (DEA/D/31-64)**

LJ-BLA presented a formal proposal for Blackpool Council and Fylde Council to join the Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support Pilot (DEA/D/31-64).

The Review Board commented on the need to strengthen the DPIA Privacy Notice and to clarify the Data Controller/Processor Relationship.

**Decision:** Review Board accepted, subject to amendments, the pilots for submission to the Minister (AP103 & AP104 apply).

1. **New Business Cases for Formal Review - DWP/SLC**

WG-DWP presented a formal pilot for DWP to share Universal Credit data with the Student Loan Company to identify potential fraud (DEA/F/19).

The DEA Review Board gave comments around the DPIA.

**Decision:** Review Board accepted, subject to amendments and documents being signed off, the pilot for submission to the Minister.

**AP 108 -** Secretariat to work with the pilot bodies to update paperwork for DEA/F/19 based on Review Board comments, to gain signed-off documentation from pilot parties, and then produce Ministerial Submission.

1. **Verbal Update on the Bounce Back Loan Pilots (DEA/F/14 & 15) and Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support Pilot (DEA/D/31-66)**

AMU-CO provided a verbal update on the Bounce Back Loan (DEA/F/14 & 15) and Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support (DEA/D/31-66) pilots.

**Decision:** Review Board noted the updates.

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look On Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

AMU-CO presented a forward look at Review Board activity in the upcoming months and a number of pilots that are being developed.

**Decision:** Review Board noted the updates.

1. **AOB**

No AOB was raised.

**Digital Economy Act 2017 - Debt and Fraud Information Sharing Review Board - Minutes**

**Date: 24th June 2021**

**Time: 13:30 - 15:30**

**Via tele-conference**

**Chairs: Rich Wental and Steve Coppard**

| **Attending** |
| --- |
| **Review Board members** | Yes/No | **Secretariat** | Yes/No |
| Rich Wental (RW)(Chair) | Y | Art Mitchells-Urwin (AMU-CO) | Y |
| Steve Coppard (SC)(Chair) | Y | Michael Sowerby (MS-CO) | Y |
| Alistair Chisholm (AC) | Y | Jabeen Kamran (JK-CO) | Y |
| Andy Taplin (AT) | X |   |   |
| Darren Shillington (DS) | Y | **Observers** |   |
| Edgar Whitley (EW) | Y | Debra Heaton (DH) | Y |
| Graeme Bowers (GB) | Y | Zac O’Neil (ZO) | Y |
| John Viggers (JV) | Y |   |   |
| Kevin Shaw (KS) | X | **Guests** |   |
| Louise Bennett (LB) | Y | Matthew James (MJ) - Leeds Council | Y |
| Mark Brewin (MB) | Y | Paul England (PE) - HMRC | Y |
| Mike Molloy (MM) | Y | Michael Forster (MF) - HMRC | Y |
| Peter Tutton (PT) | X |   |   |
| Peter Wallwork (PW) | Y |   |   |
| Stephen Quick (SQ) | Y |   |   |
| Tim Savill (TS) | Y |   |   |
| Graeme Thomson (GT) | Y |   |   |

**Outstanding Actions Brought Forward:**

**AP102 -** MS-CO to arrange the production of an analysis report as to the Council Tax Pilot (DEA/D/1-29) for the DEA Review Board. Review Board has been informed that the report has been produced and is undergoing internal approval by the 29 pilot LAs and HMRC.

**New Actions:**

**AP 109 -** Secretariat to work with MJ to develop DEA/F/20 proposal for formal submission at a subsequent DEA Review Board meeting.

**AP 110 -** Secretariat to work with PE to develop DEA/F/21 paperwork to address Review Board comments, to the Secretariat's satisfaction, prior to the pilot’s Ministerial Submission.

1. **Welcome and Introductions**

AMU-CO welcomed attendees and introduced JK-CO as a new member of the DEA Team and Secretariat.

1. **Minutes and Actions From Last Meeting**

The Review Board approved minutes and noted the action points from the last DEA Review Board meeting.

1. **Conflict of Interest**

AC and TS (as Local Authority representatives) in relation to Agenda Point 4. MB and MM (as HMRC representatives) in relation to Agenda Point 5.

1. **New Business Case for Informal Review - 10 Local Authorities and HMRC Fraud Pilot as to Social Care Funding (DEA/F/20)**

MJ presented an informal pilot proposal for data sharing between 10 Local Authorities and HMRC to combat fraud in Local Authorities’ Social Care Funding.

In guidance, the Review Board recommended that when the pilot is formally submitted for consideration, greater clarity within the paperwork should be given to the data encryption provisions to be instituted, what consultations have been held with HMRC towards the data held and available, whether the data that the Local Authorities would send to HMRC within the pilot comprises patient data and the proportionality and necessity of the proposed data processing.

**Decision:** The Review Board encouraged the pilot proposal to address the suggestions made and for the pilot to be formally submitted to the Review Board at a subsequent Review Board meeting.

**AP 109 -** Secretariat to work with MJ to develop the pilot for formal submission at a subsequent DEA Review Board meeting.

1. **New Business Cases for Formal Review - HMRC and Welsh Government Fraud Pilot as to Economic Resilience Fund and Creative Resilience Fund (DEA/F/21)**

PE presented an informal pilot proposal for data sharing between HMRC and Welsh Government as to fraud in the Economic Resilience Fund and Creative Resilience Fund.

The Review Board noted that

- the NFI has also looked at a similar area but there is no direct overlap with this pilot proposal.

- the paperwork should clarify the eligibility criteria for the funds and whether other HMRC data (e.g., turnover data) will be considered within this pilot. Furthermore, it should be clarified what data will be shared back to the Welsh Government.

PE noted that, from the comments provided by the Review Board, the paperwork for this pilot shall be updated and clarified to the satisfaction of the Secretariat before the pilot is progressed for Ministerial Submission.

**Decision:** Review Board accepted, subject to amendments, the pilot for submission to the Minister.

**AP 110 -** Secretariat to work with PE to develop paperwork to address Review Board comments, to the Secretariat's satisfaction, prior to the pilot’s Ministerial Submission.

1. **Three Year Review of DEA Powers**

MS-CO provided a verbal update on the Secretariat's progression as to the DEA Three Year Review and noted the requirement for involvement of the Review Board members in upcoming months.

**Decision:** Review Board noted the update.

1. **Verbal Update on the Bounce Back Loan Pilots (DEA/F/14 & 15) and Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support Pilot (DEA/D/31-73)**

AMU-CO provided a verbal update on the Bounce Back Loan (DEA/F/14 & 15) pilots, the planned variation to DEA/F/14 which is to be presented to the Review Board in a subsequent meeting and the Debt Recovery and Vulnerable Support (DEA/D/31-73) pilots.

**Decision:** Review Board noted the updates.

1. **Horizon Scanning - Forward Look On Pipeline of Proposed Activity**

AMU-CO presented a forward look at Review Board activity in the upcoming months and a number of pilots that are being developed.

**Decision:** Review Board noted the updates.

1. **AOB**

AMU-CO noted that the DEA Secretariat had been approved to purchase MS Teams licenses. Consequently, subsequent Review Boards will likely be held via MS Teams.