

Consultation on the draft report:

Lower carbohydrate diets for adults with type 2 diabetes

Comments Form

Organisation	n/a (formally a Senior Statistician in the GSS)
Name of commentator and contact details	Tricia Williams

- Please do not PDF the form.
- Please do not amend the formatting of this form.
- Please do not embed attachments into this form.
- Please list any references in full that you wish the committee to consider.
- Please email this form to: sacndiabetes@phe.gov.uk
- Closing date: 9:30am 30 April 2020

General comments	Comments
	Please insert each new comment in a new row
<i>Example: References</i>	<i>Example: Please check that referencing is consistent across all the chapters.</i>

Please add extra rows as needed

Comments by paragraph	Comments
	Please insert each new comment in a new row
<i>Example: 1.2</i>	<i>Example: Missing reference and statement unclear</i>
5.9	I am extremely disappointed that you chose to omit the extensive analysis available from primary care cases; as a statistician I do not agree with your reasoning for this. In doing so you have weakened the case for supporting low carbohydrate diets and omitted longer-term case studies that help to disprove the extremely weak evidence, mainly supposition, about adverse effects.
5.10	I would hope that as a minimum your conclusions point to the weakness resulting from the restrictive inclusion criteria. The use of n=1 case studies may be inappropriate but the exclusion of the extensive case studies analyses by Unwin, etc. al is indefensible. Selecting the single case study while ignoring published research that included larger populations makes this analyses appear biased. You have taken a much strict line on the positive evidence while including unevidenced or weakly evidenced negative lines.
7.61	There are case study analyses of type 2 diabetic patients whose starting weight was within the normal range for BMI, why is there no reference to these?

Please add extra rows as needed