Developing an evidence base for improving appraisal guidance

Technical Summary: FD2019

Joint Defra / EA Flood and Coastal Erosion Risk Management R&D programme

Background to R&D project

This study, through consultation and reviewing and analysing existing guidance and appraisals, explores the potential for improvements to the existing flood and coastal erosion risk management project appraisal and guidance (including the FCDPAG series, Catchment Flood Management Plan (CFMP) and Shoreline Management Plan (SMP) guidance and the FCDPAG3 spreadsheets).

The aim of the study as set out in the project specification is to:

Explore the potential for improvements to the existing project appraisal guidance (Defra 1999-2001) to reflect the findings of the Foresight Study (OST 2004) and the direction of travel identified in the Government's first response to the Making Space for Water (MSfW) consultation (Defra 2005)

The objective of the project is to:

• Develop evidence that will allow Defra and the operating authorities to improve appraisal guidance and process, and thus assist practitioners in making better decisions

Results of R&D project

The problems, causes and solutions have been organised to reflect the area of the appraisal process that they are related to. As well as issues connected to the guidance, wider issues, such as time, resources, skills and knowledge gaps and limitations on data are also included. The evidence shows that the existing guidance, although fulfilling a need in the past, is limited in scope, has not kept abreast of changes and which users do not find it particularly user friendly





R&D Outputs and their Use

The outputs of this study are a 184 page Technical Report - this includes a two page executive summary – and an 18 page summary report, which forms the Project Record.

The Technical Report is supported by five task reports Annexes 1-5 (FD2019PR2-6), which provide the evidence collected under each individual task:

- Task A1: review of existing published guidance including the priority score arrangements and documents used within the Operating Authorities;
- Task A2: gathering of structured feedback on the existing guidance using questionnaires and workshops;
- Task B1: review of Project Appraisal Reports;
- Task B2: review of appraisal processes used in other fields; and
- Task C2: discussion on the use of scenarios, including examples of their application and the benefits and pitfalls of using them.

Each task report includes its own appendices which contain the raw evidence. The reports will inform further deliberations of Defra, the Agency and their advisory group and should not, in themselves, be taken as indicators of any specific change in current policy.

This R&D Technical Summary relates to R&D Project FD2019 and the following R&D outputs: **R&D Technical Report FD2019/TR1 – Developing an evidence base for improving appraisal guidance.** Published Feb 2007. **R&D Project Record FD2019/PR1 – Developing an evidence base for improving appraisal guidance.** Published Feb 2007. **R&D Annexes FD2019/PR2-6 – Developing an evidence base for improving appraisal guidance.** Published Feb 2007.

Publication Internal Status: Released Internally External Status: Released to Public Domain

Project Manager: Karl Hardy, Defra Flood Management Division: Tel 01823 348401 Research Contractor: Risk & Policy Analysts Ltd and Royal Haskoning Ltd

The above outputs may be downloaded from the Defra/EA Joint R&D FCERM Programme website (<u>www.defra.gov.uk/environ/fcd/research</u>). Copies are also available via the Environment Agency's science publications catalogue (<u>http://publications.environment-agency.gov.uk/epages/eapublications.storefront</u>) on a print-on-demand basis.

PB 12527/ 7+8 TS

Tel: 020 7238 6000

Further copies are available from: Defra Flood Management, Ergon House, Horseferry Road, London SW1P 2AL

Environment Agency

Info-fm@defra.gsi.gov.uk www.defra.gov.uk/environ/fcd/research

