

# **Environment Agency**

Review of an Environmental Permit for an Installation subject to Chapter II of the Industrial Emissions Directive under the Environmental Permitting (England & Wales) Regulations 2016

# Decision document recording our decision-making process following review of a permit

The Permit number is: EPR/FP3031HJ

The Operator is: px Limited

The Installation is: Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site,

c/o Tronox Pigment UK Limited

This Variation Notice number is: EPR/FP3031HJ/V003

## What this document is about

Article 21(3) of the Industrial Emissions Directive (IED) requires the Environment Agency to review conditions in permits that it has issued and to ensure that the permit delivers compliance with relevant standards, within four years of the publication of updated decisions on best available techniques (BAT) conclusions.

We have reviewed the permit for this installation against the revised BAT Conclusions for large combustion plant published on 17<sup>th</sup> August 2017. This is our decision document, which explains the reasoning for the consolidated variation notice that we are issuing.

It explains how we have reviewed and considered the techniques used by the Operator in the operation and control of the plant and activities of the installation. This review has been undertaken with reference to the decision made by the European Commission establishing best available techniques (BAT) conclusions ('BAT Conclusions') for large combustion plant as detailed in document reference IEDC-7-1. It is our record of our decision-making process and shows how we have taken into account all relevant factors in reaching our position. It also provides a justification for the inclusion of any specific conditions in the permit that are in addition to those included in our generic permit template.

As well as considering the review of the operating techniques used by the Operator for the operation of the plant and activities of the installation, the

consolidated variation notice takes into account and brings together in a single document all previous variations that relate to the original permit issued. It also modernises the entire permit to reflect the conditions contained in our current generic permit template.

The introduction of new template conditions makes the Permit consistent with our current general approach and philosophy and with other permits issued to installations in this sector. Although the wording of some conditions has changed, while others have been removed because of the new regulatory approach, it does not reduce the level of environmental protection achieved by the Permit in any way. In this document we therefore address only our determination of substantive issues relating to the new BAT Conclusions.

Throughout this document we will use a number of expressions. These are as referred to in the glossary and have the same meaning as described in "Schedule 6 Interpretation" of the Permit.

We try to explain our decision as accurately, comprehensively and plainly as possible. We would welcome any feedback as to how we might improve our decision documents in future. A lot of technical terms and acronyms are inevitable in a document of this nature: we provide a glossary of acronyms near the front of the document, for ease of reference.

### How this document is structured

Glossary of	of t	erms
-------------	------	------

- 1 Our decision
- 2 How we reached our decision
- 2.1 Requesting information to demonstrate compliance with BAT Conclusions for Large Combustion Plant
- 2.2 Review of our own information in respect to the capability of the installation to meet revised standards included in the BAT Conclusions document
- The legal framework
- 4 Key Issues
- 4.1 Emissions to air and the emission limits applied to the plant
- 4.2 The energy efficiency levels associated with the Best Available Techniques Conclusions
- 5 Decision checklist regarding relevant BAT Conclusions
- Review and assessment of derogation requests made by the operator in relation to BAT Conclusions which include an associated emission level (AEL) value
- 7 Emissions to Water
- 8 Additional IED Chapter II requirements
- 9 Review and assessment of changes that are not part of the BAT Conclusions derived permit review

# Glossary of acronyms used in this document

(Please note that this glossary is standard for our decision documents and therefore not all these acronyms are necessarily used in this document.)

APC Air Pollution Control

BAT Best Available Technique(s)

BAT-AEEL BAT Associated Energy Efficiency Level

**BAT-AEL BAT Associated Emission Level** 

BATc **BAT** conclusion

**BREF** Best available techniques reference document

**CCGT** Combined Cycle Gas Turbine CEM Continuous emissions monitor CHP Combined heat and power

CV Calorific value

Directly associated activity - Additional activities necessary to be carried out to DAA

allow the principal activity to be carried out

DLN Dry Low NOx burners DLN-E Dry Low NOx effective

European environment information and observation network is a partnership **EIONET** 

network of the European Environment Agency

**ELV** Emission limit value derived under BAT or an emission limit value set out in IED

**EMS Environmental Management System** 

Environmental Permitting (England and Wales) Regulations 2016 (SI 2016 No. **EPR** 

1154)

**EWC** European waste catalogue **FSA** Food Standards Agency IC Improvement Condition

**IED** Industrial Emissions Directive (2010/75/EU)

Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control Directive (2008/1/EC) - now **IPPCD** 

superseded by IED

LCP Large Combustion Plant subject to Chapter III of IED MSUL/MSDL Minimum start up load/minimum shut-down load NOx Oxides of nitrogen (NO plus NO<sub>2</sub> expressed as NO<sub>2</sub>)

NPV Net Present Value

**OCGT** Open Cycle Gas Turbine PHE Public Health England

SAC Special Area of Conservation

SGN Sector guidance note **TGN** Technical guidance note TNP Transitional National Plan TOC **Total Organic Carbon** 

WFD Water Framework Directive (2000/60/EC)

#### 1 Our decision

We have decided to issue the consolidated variation notice to the Operator. This will allow it to continue to operate the Installation, subject to the conditions in the consolidated variation notice.

We consider that, in reaching that decision, we have taken into account all relevant considerations and legal requirements and that the varied permit will ensure that a high level of protection is provided for the environment and human health.

The consolidated variation notice contains many conditions taken from our standard Environmental Permit template including the relevant Annexes. We developed these conditions in consultation with industry, having regard to the legal requirements of the Environmental Permitting Regulations and other relevant legislation. This document does not therefore include an explanation for these standard conditions. Where they are included in the Notice, we have considered the techniques identified by the operator for the operation of their installation, and have accepted that the details are sufficient and satisfactory to make those standard conditions appropriate. This document does, however, provide an explanation of our use of "tailor-made" or installation-specific conditions, or where our Permit template provides two or more options.

#### 2 How we reached our decision

# 2.1 Requesting information to demonstrate compliance with BAT Conclusions for Large Combustion Plant

We issued a Notice under Regulation 61(1) of the Environmental Permitting (England and Wales) Regulations 2016 (a Regulation 61 Notice) on 1<sup>st</sup> May 2018 requiring the Operator to provide information to demonstrate how the operation of their installation currently meets, or will subsequently meet, the revised standards described in the large combustion plant BAT Conclusions document. The Notice also required that where the revised standards are not currently met, the operator should provide information that:

- Describes the techniques that will be implemented before 17<sup>th</sup> August 2021, which will then ensure that operations meet the revised standard, or
- Justifies why standards will not be met by 17<sup>th</sup> August 2021, and confirmation of the date when the operation of those processes will cease within the installation or an explanation of why the revised BAT standard is not applicable to those processes, or
- Justifies why an alternative technique will achieve the same level of environmental protection equivalent to the revised standard described in the BAT Conclusions.

Where the Operator proposed that they were not intending to meet a BAT standard that also included a BAT Associated Emission Level (BAT AEL) described in the BAT Conclusions Document, the Regulation 61 Notice requested that the Operator make a formal request for derogation from compliance with that AEL (as provisioned by Article 15(4) of IED). In this circumstance, the Notice identified that any such request for derogation must be supported and justified by sufficient technical and commercial information that would enable us to determine acceptability of the derogation request.

The Regulation 61 Notice response from the Operator was received on 9/10/2018.

We considered it was in the correct form and contained sufficient information for us to begin our determination of the permit review but not that it necessarily contained all the information we would need to complete that review: see below.

- BAT 10, 12, 41 and 42 We asked the operator to confirm whether the upgrade of burners to the second unit and the replacement of the both GT's with Dry low-NOx burners(DLN) due for installation during 2019 had been completed.
- BAT 40 we asked the operator to confirm the actual figure for net fuel utilisation.
- BAT 42 & 44 We asked the operator to define Dry Low NOx (DLN)
  effectiveness point in relation to the indicative BAT-AEL that they will
  meet for NOx and CO within the ranges set out in the BAT
  Conclusions.

Suitable further information was provided by the Operator on 24/03/2020 and 05/05/2020. The responses are included in the decision checklist regarding the BAT Conclusions in section 5 of this document.

# 2.2 Review of our own information in respect to the capability of the installation to meet revised standards included in the BAT Conclusions document

Based on our records and previous regulatory activities with the facility we have no reason to consider that the operator will not be able to comply with the conditions that we include in the permit.

In relation to BAT Conclusion 10, 12, 41, 42 and 44 . we agree with the operator in respect to their current stated capability as recorded in their Regulation 61 Notice response that improvements are required. The operator has confirmed that these will be completed by 17 August 2021. This is

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD

discussed in more detail in the key issues section and/or in the decision checklist regarding relevant BAT Conclusions.

# 3 The legal framework

The consolidated variation notice will be issued under Regulation 20 of the EPR. The Environmental Permitting regime is a legal vehicle which delivers most of the relevant legal requirements for activities falling within its scope. In particular, the regulated facility is:

- an installation as described by the IED;
- subject to aspects of other relevant legislation which also have to be addressed.

We consider that the consolidated variation notice will ensure that the operation of the Installation complies with all relevant legal requirements and that a high level of protection will be delivered for the environment and human health.

We explain how we have addressed specific statutory requirements more fully in the rest of this document.

# 4 The key issues

The key issues arising during this permit review are:

- Emissions to air and the emission limits applied to the plant.
- The energy efficiency levels associated with the Best Available Techniques (BAT-AEELs)

We therefore describe how we determined these issues in most detail in the relevant sections of this document.

## 4.1 Emissions to air and the emission limits applied to the plant

A number of general principles were applied during the permit review. These included:

- The upper value of the BAT AELs ranges specified were used unless use of the tighter limit was justified.
- The principle of no backsliding where if existing limits in the permit were already tighter than those specified in the BREF, the existing permit limits were retained.
- Where a limit was specified in both IED Annex V and the BAT Conclusions for a particular reference period, the tighter limit was applied and in the majority of cases this was from the BAT Conclusions.
- Where AELs are indicative in the BAT Conclusions, these were applied unless adequate justification was provided by the operator to demonstrate that an alternative limit was more appropriate.
- For gas turbines where the IED specified that limits applied over 70% load and the BAT Conclusions specified that AELs applied when dry low NOx is effective (DLN-E), we have used DLN-E as a default across all monitoring requirements for NOx and CO.

### The LCP(s) on site consist of:

LCP 221 - 1 x 21.2MWth gas turbine (GT) with a 48.8MWth heat recovery steam generator (HRSG) – total of 70MWth LCP414 - 1 x 21.2MWth gas turbine (GT) with a 48.8MWth heat recovery steam generator (HRSG) total of 70MWth

The plant was put into operation before IED came into force and therefore the existing limits in the permit are from Part 1 of IED Annex V applicable to existing plant.

The ELVs and AELs are based on the following operating regime:

- Unlimited hours of operation
- Existing CCGT with a net total fuel utilisation of ≥ 75 %
- Combustion plant total rated thermal input between 50–600 MWth

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD

The plants operate in three modes: OCGT during start-up, CCGT (GT and HRSG) and auxiliary fired force draft (FD) HRSG only. The site does not operate OCGT for any length of time other than during start-up or in the event of an HRSG trip leaving the GT in open cycle mode. Under the latter mode, the GT is shut down if the HRSG cannot be returned to service within 2 hours. Once the exhaust gas from the GT has been introduced to the HRSG the GT load is increased from 46% required for NOx abatement up to 100% base load within 15 minutes. Therefore, loads between 70% and 100% should only be considered as transient. The start-up of the HRSG is completed independently of the GT as per the design of the CHP.

The following tables outline the limits that have been incorporated into the permit for LCP221 and LCP414, where these were derived from and the reference periods at which they apply. The emission limits refer to concentrations, expressed as mass of emitted substance per volume of fluegas under the following standard conditions: dry gas at a temperature of 273,15 K, pressure of 101,3 kPa and 15%, volume reference oxygen concentration if flue gases.

In the case of HRSG auxiliary firing, this shall be regarded as part of the supplementary firing combustion system, noting that the auxiliary firing performance is technically constrained by the supplementary firing design parameters. For auxiliary firing, the oxygen reference condition for reporting and the boiler ELV reference shall therefore also be increased to 15% O<sub>2</sub> (for short periods when the gas turbine is unavailable). The boiler ELV is taken to be the same numerical value as that applied at 3% O<sub>2</sub>. However, in these situations, the Operator shall provide a credible recovery plan for the gas turbine to the Competent Authority and agree a course of action. When a credible recovery plan cannot be agreed, or is not appropriate, then the auxiliary firing then needs to comply with the original boiler ELV at 3% O<sub>2</sub> (for convenience this ELV can be divided by 3 if reporting continues at 15% O<sub>2</sub>)

The emission limits and monitoring requirements have been incorporated into Schedule 3 of the permit.

The plant is in the Transitional National Plan, TNP. By the end of the TNP on 30 June 2020, as a minimum plant must meet the limits set out in Annex V of the Industrial Emission Directive subject to BAT assessment and the principle of no backsliding. From the implementation date of the BAT Conclusion in 2021 the relevant AELs will also apply.

### LCP 221 and LCP414 : Operating in CHP mode post 2021

In their Regulation 61 response, the Operator requested that DLN-E point be set once all works to improve the operation of the CHP units has been completed. We have included an improvement condition (IC04) requiring the Operator to define effective dry low NO<sub>X</sub> point.

	NOx limits (mg/Nm³)											
Averaging	Existing (TNP)	sting (TNP) IED (Annex V BREF (Table 24 Ex		Expected permit limits	Basis	Limits apply	Monitoring <sup>1</sup>					
Annual	None	None	55 (>75% net fuel utilisation)	55	BREF	E-DLN						
Monthly	None	75 <sup>2</sup>	None	75	IED	E-DLN	CEMS					
Daily	125	82.5	80	80	BREF	E-DLN	CEIVIS					
95 <sup>th</sup> %ile of hr means	None	150	None	150	IED	E-DLN						

Note 1 monitoring is currently every 6 months. CEMS are to be reinstated and will be in use from 17/08/2021 Note 2 Limit of 75 mgm $^3$  for CCGT > 55%  $\eta$ ,

	Indicative CO limits (mg/Nm³)											
Averaging	Existing Until 30/6/20	IED (Annex V Part 1) – Existing	BREF (Table 24 BAT-C )	Expected permit limits	Basis	Limits apply	Monitoring <sup>1</sup>					
Annual	None	None	30 ( 50 low load plant)	100	Requested by operator	E-DLN						
Monthly	None	100	None	100	IED	E-DLN	CEMS					
Daily	100	110	None	110	IED	E-DLN	CEIVIS					
95 <sup>th</sup> %ile of hr means	None	200	None	200	IED	E-DLN						

Note 1 monitoring is currently every 6 months. CEMS are to be reinstated and will be in use from 17/08/2021

The operator has requested to retain the current permit limit of 100mgm³ on the basis that the reference plant in BAT 44 are much larger CCGTs and are not considered to be representative of the achievable performance of a small (56 MWth input) CHP plant with a significant heat bias. They assert that the BAT category <100 MWth input is a more reasonable comparator of achievable performance CO limit of 100 mg/m³ as set in Annex V of IED. They also state that in order to achieve lower NOx emissions the temperature of combustion needs to be reduced and a lower air to fuel ratio used to prevent the formation of thermal NOx. The reduced oxygen and temperature lead to incomplete combustion and therefore the formation of CO.

The Turbine Exhaust Gases (TEG) in CHP mode are fed forward to the HRSG where the burners use the 12-15% Oxygen content to combust the burner fuel. Using the TEG gives lower thermal NOx (as less fresh air is used) but due to less availability of oxygen can lead to higher CO formation. This is a finely tuned balance and as we push towards lower NOx limits it adversely affects CO emissions, meeting the annual indicative BREF CO limit of 30 mg/Nm3 at all loads would be adversely affect NOx and the mandatory limits could no longer be met. We consider the technical justification provided by the operator is adequate and we have set the annual emission limits for CO at 100 mg/m³ in the revised and consolidated permit

# LCP 221 and LCP414: HRSG operating as a standalone unit with its burners providing 'auxiliary' firing

			NO	x limits (mg/	Nm³)		
Averaging	Existing Until 30/6/20	IED (Annex V Part 1) - Existing	BREF (Table 25 BAT- c) (1,2,3)	Expected permit limits	Basis	Limits apply	Monitoring
Annual	None	None	100	None	NA	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	
Monthly	150	100	None	NA	NA	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	<100MWth every 6months/
Daily	None	110	110	110	BREF	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	PEMS
95 <sup>th</sup> %ile of hr means	None	200	None	NA	NA	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	

#### Footnote

- (1) Optimising the functioning of an existing technique to reduce NO<sub>X</sub> emissions further may lead to levels of CO emissions at the higher end of the indicative range for CO emissions given after this table.
- (2) These BAT-AELs do not apply to plants operated < 1 500 h/yr.
- (3) For plants operated < 500 h/yr, these levels are indicative.

BAT Footnote (3) In the case of plants with a rated thermal input of < 100 MW operated < 1 500 h/yr, the minimum monitoring frequency may be at least once every six months.

NA – for periodic monitoring only the daily limits applies

	Indicative CO limits (mg/Nm³)											
Averaging	Existing Until 30/6/20	IED (Annex V Part 1) – Existing	BREF (Table 25 BAT- C ) <sup>)</sup>	Expected permit limits	Basis	Limits apply	Monitoring					
Annual	None	None	40 <sup>1</sup>	None	NA	MSUL/MSDL to baseload						
Monthly	100	100	None	None	IED	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	<100MWth every 6					
Daily	None	110	40	100	BREF	MSUL/MSDL to baseload	months/PEMS					
95 <sup>th</sup> %ile of hr means	None	200	None	None	NA	MSUL/MSDL to baseload						

Note <sup>1</sup> As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be: <5–40 mg/Nm3 for existing boilers operated ≥ 1 500 h/yr NA – for periodic monitoring only the daily limit applies

As already discussed above we accept that for this type of plant higher emissions of CO are expected, particularly when the HRSGs is operating on supplementary firing. Operation in this mode is not likely to be ≥ 1 500 h/yr. We have set the ELV in line BREF and the JEP "Electricity Supply Industry IED Compliance Protocol for Utility Boilers and Gas Turbines" dated December 2015.

#### LCP 221 and LCP414: OCGT mode of operation

The operator is currently limited to operating the GT in open mode during start-up only (applicable to release points A1 and A3 GT bypass stacks). However, there are occasions when the GT needs to operate open cycle outside of start-up. These operations are limited in Tables S3.1, S3.1a and 3.1b to less than 500 hours per annum. There are no ELVs associated with emission points A1 and A3. However, 6 monthly reporting of NOx, SO<sub>2</sub> and CO concentration values are required.

Joint Environmental Programme (JEP) produced a document 'BAT Assessment for Existing Gas and Liquid Fuel Fired OCGTs, CCGTs and Dual-fuel GTs with a Thermal Input Rating of 50MWth or Greater Operating <500 Hours Per Year' dated October 2018. The content of this document has been agreed in principle by the Environment Agency and we have therefore taken the document into account during our determination of this variation.

In all cases, the minimum BAT requirements are considered to be: i) the continued compliance with any permit requirements already in place to protect air quality and ii) the demonstration of an appropriate maintenance regime to maintain plant emissions performance.

# 4.2 The energy efficiency levels associated with the Best Available Techniques Conclusions

An energy efficiency level associated with the best available techniques (BAT-AEEL) refers to the ratio between the combustion unit's net energy output(s) and the combustion unit's fuel/feedstock energy input at actual unit design. The net energy output(s) is determined at the combustion unit boundaries, including auxiliary systems (e.g. flue-gas treatment systems), and for the unit operated at full load.

The table below sets out the BAT-AEELs specified in the LCP BAT Conclusions for the large combustion plant on the site and the energy The Operator stated in the Regulation 61 response that for the CHP (Heat Generation Orientated) the net total fuel utilisation was between 65-95% and . between 78-95% when operating HRSG Only. We asked the operator to provide exact figure and the calculations of derivation. The operator responded on 24/03/2020 with SCHP Model Data from IPSE Pro and stated that the plant is orientated to heat generation. We consider this plant is BAT in relation to the AEELs.

Table 23 BAT-associated energy efficiency levels (BAT-AEELs) for the combustion of natural gas

	BAT AEELs (%)		Plant efficiency (%) 1						
Net electrical efficiency	Net total fuel utilisation	Net mechanical efficiency	Net electrical efficiency	Net total fuel utilisation	Net mechanical efficiency				
	LCP221:ex	sisting CCGT < 6	00 MWth - heat	generation					
46 - 54	65-95	None	NA	89.9	NA				
	LCP414: existing CCGT < 600 MWth								
46 - 54	None	None	NA	90.78	NA				

Note 1 In the case of CHP units, only one of the two BAT-AEELs 'Net electrical efficiency' or 'Net total fuel utilisation' applies, depending on the CHP unit design (i.e. either more oriented towards electricity generation or heat generation).

# 5 Decision checklist regarding relevant BAT Conclusions

BAT Conclusions for large combustion plant, were published by the European Commission on 17<sup>th</sup> August 2017. There are 75 BAT Conclusions. Only the BAT Conclusions relevant to the particular fuel type used on site have been replicated below.

This annex provides a record of decisions made in relation to each relevant BAT Conclusion applicable to the installation. This annex should be read in conjunction with the Consolidated Variation Notice.

The conditions in the permit through which the relevant BAT Conclusions are implemented include but are not limited to the following:

BAT Conclusion	Permit condition(s)	Permit table(s)
requirement topic		
Environmental	1.1.1	S1.2
Management System		
BAT AELs	3.1.1 and 3.5.1	S3.1b
Monitoring	2.3, 3.5 and 3.6	S1.2, S1.5,S3.1b
Energy efficiency	1.2 and 2.3	S3.4
Noise	3.4 and 2.3	S2.1
Other operating	2.3	S1.2
techniques		

The overall status of compliance with the BAT conclusion is indicated in the table as:

NA Not Applicable

**CC** Currently Compliant

FC Compliant in the future (within 4 years of publication of BAT

conclusions)

NC Not Compliant

PC Partially Compliant

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement	Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
General			
1	In order to improve the overall environmental performance, BAT is to implement and adhere to an environmental management system (EMS) that incorporates all of the following features:  i. commitment of the management, including senior management; iii. definition of an environmental policy that includes the continuous improvement of the installation by the management; iii. planning and establishing the necessary procedures, objectives and targets, in conjunction with financial planning and investment; iv. implementation of procedures  (a) Structure and responsibility (b) Training (c) Communication (d) Employee involvement (e) Documentation (f) Efficient process control (g) Maintenance programmes (h) Emergency preparedness and response (i) Safeguarding compliance with environmental legislation v. checking performance and taking corrective action, paying particular attention to: (a) monitoring and measurement (see also the Reference Document on the General Principles of Monitoring) (b) corrective and preventive action (c) maintenance of records (d) independent (where practicable) internal and external auditing in order to determine whether or not the EMS conforms to planned arrangements and has been properly implemented and maintained; vi. review of the EMS and its continuing suitability, adequacy and effectiveness by senior management; viii. consideration for the environmental impacts from the eventual decommissioning of the installation at the stage of designing a new plant, and throughout its operating life;	CC	An EMS certified to the ISO 14001:2015 standard is in place that meets requirements (i) through to (xvi) set out in the BAT Conclusion.

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Con-	clusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	decommissioning of the throughout its operating ix. application of sectors Etc - see BAT Conclusion Applicability. The scop standardised or non-sta	al benchmarking on a regular l	pasis.  ure of the EMS (e.g. elated to the nature, scale		
2	utilisation and/or the ne and/or combustion units according to EN standa modification that could s the net total fuel utilisati unit. If EN standards are	net electrical efficiency and/o t mechanical energy efficiency by carrying out a performance rds, after the commissioning of significantly affect the net elect on and/or the net mechanical e not available, BAT is to use that ensure the provision of date	of the gasification, IGCC e test at full load (1), of the unit and after each trical efficiency and/or energy efficiency of the ISO, national or other	CC	The operator confirmed that no performance test has been conducted as this is not relevant to CHP Unit.  Recent calculations conducted utilising IPSE Pro software submitted on the on 23/03/20 confirmed that the net total fuel utilisation for the CHP are  FD Mode CHP - 89.5% Teg Mode (Tornado no DLE fitted) - 89.9% Teg Mode (SGT 200 DLE) -90.78%  Refer to section 4.2
3	BAT is to monitor key and water including th	process parameters relevar	nt for emissions to air	СС	The operator has confirmed that A2 - Oxygen monitored periodically to BS EN 14789
	Stream	Parameter(s)	Monitoring		A4 - Oxygen monitored periodically to BS EN 14789
	Flue-gas	Flow	Periodic or continuous determination		A2 - Water vapour monitored periodically to BS EN 14790 A4 - Water vapour monitored periodically to BS EN 14790
		Oxygen content, temperature, and pressure	Periodic or continuous measurement		A2 - Stack gas volume flow monitored periodically to BS EN 16941 & TGN M2 A4 - Stack gas volume flow monitored periodically to BS EN 16941
		Water vapour content (3)			& TGN M2 in line with BREF
	Waste water from flue- gas treatment	Flow, pH, and temperature	Continuous measurement		
4		sions to air with at least the fro standards. If EN standards ar		CC	The operator has confirmed that periodic measurement are undertaken as follows:

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD Issued 30/06/2020

EPR/FP3031HJ/V003

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary	Immary of BAT Conclusion requirement  Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement					
r		mational or other interequivalent scientific of Fuel/Process/Type of combustion plant  - When SCR and/or SNCR is used  - Coal and/or lignite including waste coincineration  - Solid biomass and/or peat including waste coincineration  - HFO and/or gasoil-fired boilers and engines  - Gas-oil-fired gas turbines  - Natural-gas-fired boilers, and turbines  - Iron and steel process gases		Standard(s)_(1/2)  Generic EN standards  Generic EN standards	Minimum monitoring frequency_(*)  Continuous_(*)_(*)  Continuous_(*)_(*)	Monito ring associ ated with	NC	A2 - NOx monitored periodically to BS EN 14792 A4 - NOx monitored periodically to BS EN 14792 A2 - CO monitored periodically to BS EN 15058 A4 - CO monitored periodically to BS EN 15058 A2 - SO2 monitored periodically by calculation A4 - SO2 monitored periodically to calculation  From the 17 <sup>th</sup> August 2021 continuous emission monitoring of NOx and CO will be required. See section 4.1 for the setting of limits and monitoring.
		Process fuels from the chemical industry     IGCC plants      Combustion plants on offshore platforms	All sizes	EN 14792	Once every year_(°)	BAT 53		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement						Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	N <sub>2</sub> O	Coal and/or lignite in circulating fluidised bed boilers	All sizes	EN 21258	Once every year (10)	BAT 20 BAT 24		
		Solid biomass and/or peat in circulating fluidised bed boilers						
	СО	Coal and/or lignite including waste co- incineration	All sizes	Generic EN standards	Continuous (6) (8)	BAT 20 BAT 24 BAT 28 BAT 33 BAT 38		
		Solid biomass and/or peat including waste co-incineration				BAT 44 BAT 49 BAT 56 BAT 64		
		HFO- and/or gas- oil-fired boilers and engines				BAT 65 BAT 73		
		<ul> <li>Gas-oil-fired gas turbines</li> </ul>						
		Natural-gas-fired boilers, engines, and turbines						
		<ul> <li>Iron and steel process gases</li> </ul>						
		Process fuels from the chemical industry						
		<ul><li>IGCC plants</li></ul>						
		Combustion plants on offshore platforms	All sizes	EN 15058	Once every year <u>(<sup>9</sup>)</u>	BAT 54		
	SO <sub>2</sub>	Coal and/or lignite incl waste co-incineration	All sizes	Generic EN standards and EN 14791	Continuous_(6)_(11 )_(12)	BAT 21 BAT 25 BAT 29 BAT 34		

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD Issued 30/06/2020

EPR/FP3031HJ/V003

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement							Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
			Solid biomass and/or peat incl waste co-incineration HFO- and/or gasoil-fired boilers HFO- and/or gasoil-fired engines Gas-oil-fired gas turbines Iron and steel process gases Process fuels from the chemical industry in boilers				BAT 39 BAT 50 BAT 57 BAT 66 BAT 67 BAT 74		
	SO <sub>3</sub>	_	When SCR is used	All sizes	No EN standard available	Once every year	_		
	Gaseous chlorides, expressed as HCI	_	Coal and/or lignite Process fuels from the chemical industry in boilers	All sizes	EN 1911	Once every three months (6) (13) (14)	BAT 21 BAT 57		
		_	Solid biomass and/or peat	All sizes	Generic EN standards	Continuous (15) (1	BAT 25		
		_	Waste co- incineration	All sizes	Generic EN standards	Continuous (6) (16 )	BAT 66 BAT 67		
	HF	_	Coal and/or lignite Process fuels from the chemical industry in boilers	All sizes	No EN standard available	Once every three months (6) (13) (1	BAT 21 BAT 57		
		_	Solid biomass and/or peat	All sizes	No EN standard available	Once every year	BAT 25		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary	of B	AT Conclusion	requirem	ent			Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
		_	Waste co- incineration	All sizes	Generic EN standards	Continuous (6) (16)	BAT 66 BAT 67		
	Dust — Coal and/or lignite — Solid biomass and/or peat — Solid biomass and/or peat — Coal and/or peat — Continuous (6) (17 BAT 22 BAT 26 BAT 30 BAT 35 BAT 39		lignite	All sizes	standards and		BAT 26 BAT 30		
		_	HFO- and/or gas- oil-fired boilers		EN 13284-2		BAT 51 BAT 58 BAT 75		
		-	Iron and steel process gases						
		_	Process fuels from the chemical industry in boilers						
		_	IGCC plants						
		_	HFO- and/or gas- oil-fired engines						
		_	Gas-oil-fired gas turbines						
		_	Waste co- incineration	All sizes	Generic EN standards and EN 13284-2	Continuous	BAT 68 BAT 69		
	Metals and metalloids except	_	Coal and/or lignite	All sizes	EN 14385	Once every year (18)	BAT 22 BAT 26 BAT 30		
	mercury (As, Cd,	-	Solid biomass and/or peat				BAT 30		
	Co, Cr, Cu, Mn, Ni, Pb, Sb, Se, Tl, V, Zn)	_	HFO- and/or gas- oil-fired boilers and engines						
	, =,	_	Waste co- incineration	< 300 MW <sub>th</sub>	EN 14385	Once every six months (13)	BAT 68 BAT 69		
				≥ 300 MW <sub>th</sub>	EN 14385	Once every three months (19) (13)			
		_	IGCC plants	≥ 100 MW <sub>th</sub>	EN 14385	Once every year_(18)	BAT 75		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary	of BAT Conclusion	requirem	ent			Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	Hg	Coal and/or     lignite including     waste co-	< 300 MW <sub>th</sub>	EN 13211	Once every three months (13) (20)	BAT 23		
		incineration	≥ 300 MW <sub>th</sub>	Generic EN standards and EN 14884	Continuous (16) (2			
		Solid biomass and/or peat	All sizes	EN 13211	Once every year (22)	BAT 27		
		Waste co- incineration with solid biomass and/or peat	All sizes	EN 13211	Once every three months_(13)	BAT 70		
		<ul><li>— IGCC plants</li></ul>	≥ 100 MW <sub>th</sub>	EN 13211	Once every year (23)	BAT 75		
	TVOC	<ul> <li>HFO- and/or gas- oil-fired engines</li> </ul>	All sizes	EN 12619	Once every six months_(13)	BAT 33 BAT 59		
		Process fuels from chemical industry in boilers						
		Waste co- incineration with coal, lignite, solid biomass and/or peat	All sizes	Generic EN standards	Continuous	BAT 71		
	Formaldeh yde	Natural-gas in spark-ignited lean-burn gas and dual fuel engines	All sizes	No EN standard available	Once every year	BAT 45		
	CH <sub>4</sub>	Natural-gas-fired engines	All sizes	EN ISO 25139	Once every year_( <sup>24</sup> )	BAT 45		
	PCDD/F	Process fuels from chemical industry in boilers	All sizes	EN 1948-1, EN 1948-2, EN 1948-3	Once every six months_(13)_(25)	BAT 59 BAT 71		
		Waste co- incineration						

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Con	clusion requirement			Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
5	frequency given below are not available, BAT that ensure the provisi	ssions to water from flue and in accordance with is to use ISO, national ion of data of an equival	n EN standards. or other interna ent scientific qu	If EN standards tional standards ality.	NA	No flue gas treatment
	Substance/Parame ter	Standard(s)	Minimum monitoring frequency	Monitoring associated with		
	Total organic carbon (TOC)_(26)	EN 1484	Once every month	BAT 15		
	Chemical oxygen demand (COD)_(26)	No EN standard available				
	Total suspended solids (TSS)	EN 872				
	Fluoride (F <sup>-</sup> )	EN ISO 10304-1				
	Sulphate (SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup> )	EN ISO 10304-1				
	Sulphide, easily released (S <sup>2-</sup> )	No EN standard available				
	Sulphite (SO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> )	EN ISO 10304-3				
	metalloids  Cd Cr EN ISO 1188 EN ISO 1729 Cu Ni Pb Zn  Hg Various EN savailable (e.g.	Various EN standards available (e.g. EN ISO 11885 or EN ISO 17294-2)  Various EN standards available (e.g. EN ISO 12846 or				
	Chloride (Cl <sup>-</sup> )	EN ISO 17852)  Various EN standards available (e.g. EN ISO 10304-1 or EN ISO 15682)	-	_		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BA	AT Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement	
	Total nitrogen EN 12260		_			
6	plants and to re	educe emissions to air of CO nised combustion and to use a	ental performance of combustion and unburnt substances, BAT is an appropriate combination of the	FC	The operator has confirmed the following:  A) no blending or mixing undertaken natural gas only.  B) Combustion system maintained to manufacturer's recommendations.	
	Technique Description		Applicability		C) Advanced control system in place via Eurotherm Network, PLC &	
	a Fuel blending and mixing	Ensure stable combustion conditions and/or reduce the emission of pollutants by mixing different qualities of the same fuel type	Generally applicable		Burner Management System D) OEM designed & supplied burner equipment. One boiler has undergone burner modifications in order to meet the IED regulations with the second unit to be modified during 2019. In addition both GT's will be replaced with DLE units to further improve emissions.	
	b Maintenanc e of the combustion system	Regular planned maintenance according to suppliers' recommendations			E) Natural gas used as the fuel."	
	c Advanced control system	See description in Section 8.1	The applicability to old combustion plants may be constrained by the need to retrofit the combustion system and/or control command system			
	d Good design of the combustion equipment	Good design of furnace, combustion chambers, burners and associated devices	Generally applicable to new combustion plants			
	e Fuel choice	Select or switch totally or partially to another fuel(s) with a better environmental profile (e.g. with low sulphur and/or mercury content) amongst the available fuels, including in start-up situations or when back-up fuels are used	Applicable within the constraints associated with the availability of suitable types of fuel with a better environmental profile as a whole, which may be impacted by the energy policy of the Member State, or by the integrated site's fuel balance in the case of combustion of industrial process fuels.  For existing combustion plants, the type of fuel chosen may be limited			

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement	Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	by the configuration and the design of the plant		
7	In order to reduce emissions of ammonia to air from the use of selective catalytic reduction (SCR) and/or selective non-catalytic reduction (SNCR) for the abatement of NO $_{\rm X}$ emissions, BAT is to optimise the design and/or operation of SCR and/or SNCR (e.g. optimised reagent to NO $_{\rm X}$ ratio, homogeneous reagent distribution and optimum size of the reagent drops). BAT-associated emission levels  The BAT-associated emission level (BAT-AEL) for emissions of NH $_{\rm 3}$ to air from the use of SCR and/or SNCR is < 3–10 mg/Nm $^{\rm 3}$ as a yearly average or average over the sampling period. The lower end of the range can be achieved when using SCR and the upper end of the range can be achieved when using SNCR without wet abatement techniques. In the case of plants combusting biomass and operating at variable loads as well as in the case of engines combusting HFO and/or gas oil, the higher end of the BAT-AEL range is 15 mg/Nm $^{\rm 3}$ .		No SCR/SNCR is fitted. We agree this is not applicable.
8	In order to prevent or reduce emissions to air during normal operating conditions, BAT is to ensure, by appropriate design, operation and maintenance, that the emission abatement systems are used at optimal capacity and availability.	СС	The operator has confirmed that steam injection NOx control abatement system is installed as a part of the current gas turbine system. System includes an engineer locked steam to fuel ratio which is continuously monitored and trimmed dependent upon gas turbine fuel use. System valves are maintained and calibrated on an annual basis.
9	In order to improve the general environmental performance of combustion and/or gasification plants and to reduce emissions to air, BAT is to include the following elements in the quality assurance/quality control programmes for all the fuels used, as part of the environmental management system (see BAT 1):  (i) Initial full characterisation of the fuel used including at least the parameters listed below and in accordance with EN standards. ISO, national or other international standards may be used provided they ensure the provision of data of an equivalent scientific quality;		Natural Gas is burnt We consider that for plants which burn natural gas from the National Grid as a fuel that it is not necessary for the operator to replicate the testing carried out by the National Grid
	(ii) Regular testing of the fuel quality to check that it is consistent with the initial characterisation and according to the plant design specifications. The frequency of testing and the parameters chosen from the table below are based on the variability		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Concl	usion requirement	Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	of the fuel and an assessment of the relevance of pollutant releases (e.g. concentration in fuel, flue-gas treatment employed);  (iii) Subsequent adjustment of the plant settings as and when needed and practicable (e.g. integration of the fuel characterisation and control in the advanced control system (see description in Section 8.1)).  **Description**  Initial characterisation and regular testing of the fuel can be performed by the operator and/or the fuel supplier. If performed by the supplier, the full results are provided to the operator in the form of a product (fuel) supplier specification and/or guarantee.			
	Fuel(s)	Substances/Parameters subject to characterisation		
	Biomass/peat  — LHV — moisture  — Ash — C, Cl, F, N, S, K, Na — Metals and metalloids (As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Pb, Zn)  Coal/lignite  — LHV — Moisture — Volatiles, ash, fixed carbon, C, H, N, O, S — Br, Cl, F — Metals and metalloids (As, Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Hg, Mn, Ni, Pb, Sb, Tl, V, Zn)  HFO — Ash — C, S, N, Ni, V			
	Gas oil	<ul><li>— Ash</li><li>— N, C, S</li></ul>		
	Natural gas	— LHV		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclu	usion requirement	Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement	
		— CH <sub>4</sub> , C <sub>2</sub> H <sub>6</sub> , C <sub>3</sub> , C <sub>4</sub> +, CO <sub>2</sub> , N <sub>2</sub> , Wobbe index			
	Process fuels from the chemical industry_(27)	<ul> <li>Br, C, Cl, F, H, N, O, S</li> <li>Metals and metalloids (As, Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Hg, Mn, Ni, Pb, Sb, Tl, V, Zn)</li> </ul>			
	Iron and steel process gases	<ul> <li>LHV, CH<sub>4</sub> (for COG), C<sub>X</sub>H<sub>Y</sub> (for COG), CO<sub>2</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>, total sulphur, dust, Wobbe index</li> </ul>			
	Waste_(28)	<ul> <li>LHV</li> <li>Moisture</li> <li>Volatiles, ash, Br, C, Cl, F, H, N, O, S</li> <li>Metals and metalloids (As, Cd, Co, Cr, Cu, Hg, Mn, Ni, Pb, Sb, Tl, V, Zn)</li> </ul>			
10	operating conditions (OTN plan as part of the ecommensurate with the rethe following elements:  — appropriate design of the have an impact on emission for reducing the minimula turbines),  — set-up and implemental relevant systems,  — review and recording circumstances and implemental relevants, duration, emissions.	ions to air and/or to water during other than normal NOC), BAT is to set up and implement a management environmental management system (see BAT 1), elevance of potential pollutant releases, that includes e systems considered relevant in causing OTNOC that may sions to air, water and/or soil (e.g. low-load design concepts m start-up and shutdown loads for stable generation in gas attion of a specific preventive maintenance plan for these of emissions caused by OTNOC and associated ementation of corrective actions if necessary, if the overall emissions during OTNOC (e.g. frequency of sisions quantification/estimation) and implementation of	CC	The operator has confirmed the following: GTs and HRSGs are of OEM design planned preventative maintenance is undertaken. Start-up, open cycle operations and HRSG only operating periods are monitored and recorded as part of the environmental permit reporting requirements	
11	<b>Description</b> The monitoring can be can	onitor emissions to air and/or to water during OTNOC.  arried out by direct measurement of emissions or by parameters if this proves to be of equal or better	СС	In their response to the regulation 60 notice they stated that they do not have any specific OTNOC operations with regard to monitoring emissions to air. Monitoring is undertaken in	

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Sui	mmary of BA	Γ Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement	
	star me: yea	rt-up and shutc asurement car ar, and using tl	han the direct measurement of down (SU/SD) may be assessed rried out for a typical SU/SD properesults of this measurement to U/SD throughout the year.	based on a detailed emission ocedure at least once every		accordance with permits i.e. periodic emission monitoring undertaken.  However, preventative maintenance and responding to accidents and emergencies are adequately described in their EMS.  Emissions to water are visually checked on a routine basis and this would also cover OTNOC.	
12	IGC the	CC units opera techniques giv	ase the energy efficiency of cou ted ≥1500 h/yr, BAT is to use a ven below.		FC	The operator confirmed that improvements are required. combustion optimisation has been optimised in one HRSG following the implementation of burners designed to meet	
		Technique	Description	Applicability		IED regulations. The second HRSG is to undergo the same	
	a.	Combustion optimisation	See description in Section 8.2. Optimising the combustion minimises the content of unburnt substances in the flue-gases and in solid combustion residues			modification in 2019. In addition it is anticipated that the sit will be installing 2 DLE GTs during 2019.  (B) Optimisation of the working medium conditions - Not applicable	
	b.	Optimisation of the working medium conditions	Operate at the highest possible pressure and temperature of the working medium gas or steam, within the constraints associated with, for example, the control of NO <sub>X</sub> emissions or the characteristics of energy demanded			<ul> <li>(C) Optimisation of the steam cycle - Plant is CHP therefore Steam cycle is optimised to supply steam at required process conditions.</li> <li>(D) Minimisation of energy consumption - All feedwater is preheated</li> <li>(E) Preheating of combustion air - Not applicable</li> <li>(F) Fuel preheating - Not applicable</li> </ul>	
	C.	Optimisation of the steam cycle	Operate with lower turbine exhaust pressure by utilisation of the lowest possible temperature of the condenser cooling water, within the design conditions			<ul> <li>(G) Advanced control system - Control system in place via Eurotherm Network, PLC &amp; Burner Management System H) Feed-water preheating using recovered heat - not applicable.</li> <li>i) Heat recovery by cogeneration (CHP) - steam used at the Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site.</li> <li>j) CHP readiness - not applicable.</li> <li>k) Flue gas condenser - currently no demand for low grade heat.</li> </ul>	
	d.	Minimisation of energy consumption	Minimising the internal energy consumption (e.g. greater efficiency of the feed-water pump)				

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	mmary of BA	Γ Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	e.	Preheating of combustion air	Reuse of part of the heat recovered from the combustion flue-gas to preheat the air used in combustion	Generally applicable within the constraints related to the need to control NO <sub>X</sub> emissions		I) Heat accumulation - currently no demand for low grade heat.     m) Wet stack - not applicable.     Cooling toward discharge, not applicable.
	f.	Fuel preheating	Preheating of fuel using recovered heat	Generally applicable within the constraints associated with the boiler design and the need to control NO <sub>x</sub> emissions		<ul> <li>n) Cooling tower discharge - not applicable.</li> <li>o) Fuel pre-drying - not applicable.</li> <li>p) Minimisation of heat losses - not applicable.</li> <li>q) Advanced materials - not applicable.</li> </ul>
	g.	Advanced control system	See description in Section 8.2. Computerised control of the main combustion parameters enables the combustion efficiency to be improved	Generally applicable to new units. The applicability to old units may be constrained by the need to retrofit the combustion system and/or control command system		r) Steam turbine upgrades - not applicable. s) Supercritical and ultra-supercritical steam conditions - not applicable.
	h.	Feed-water preheating using recovered heat	Preheat water coming out of the steam condenser with recovered heat, before reusing it in the boiler	Only applicable to steam circuits and not to hot boilers. Applicability to existing units may be limited due to constraints associated with the plant configuration and the amount of recoverable heat		
	i.	Heat recovery by cogeneration (CHP)	Recovery of heat (mainly from the steam system) for producing hot water/steam to be used in industrial processes/activities or in a public network for district heating. Additional heat recovery is possible from:  — flue-gas — grate cooling	Applicable within the constraints associated with the local heat and power demand. The applicability may be limited in the case of gas compressors with an unpredictable operational heat profile		
		OUD	circulating fluidised bed			
	J.	CHP readiness	See description in Section 8.2.	Only applicable to new units where there is a realistic potential for the future use of heat in the vicinity of the unit		
	k.	Flue-gas condenser	See description in Section 8.2.	Generally applicable to CHP units provided there is enough		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Sui	mmary of BAT	Γ Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement	
				demand for low-temperature heat			
	I.	Heat accumulation	Heat accumulation storage in CHP mode	Only applicable to CHP plants. The applicability may be limited in the case of low heat load demand			
	n. C	Wet stack	See description in Section 8.2.	Generally applicable to new and existing units fitted with wet FGD			
		Cooling tower discharge	The release of emissions to air through a cooling tower and not via a dedicated stack	Only applicable to units fitted with wet FGD where reheating of the flue-gas is necessary before release, and where the unit cooling system is a cooling tower			
	0.	Fuel pre- drying	The reduction of fuel moisture content before combustion to improve combustion conditions	Applicable to the combustion of biomass and/or peat within the constraints associated with spontaneous combustion risks (e.g. the moisture content of peat is kept above 40 % throughout the delivery chain). The retrofit of existing plants may be restricted by the extra calorific value that can be obtained from the drying operation and by the limited retrofit possibilities offered by some boiler designs or plant configurations			
	p.	Minimisation of heat losses	Minimising residual heat losses, e.g. those that occur via the slag or those that can be reduced by insulating radiating sources	Only applicable to solid-fuel- fired combustion units and to gasification/IGCC units			
	q.	Advanced materials	Use of advanced materials proven to be capable of withstanding high operating temperatures and pressures and thus to achieve	Only applicable to new plants			

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	mmary of BA	T Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
			increased steam/combustion process efficiencies			
	r.	Steam turbine upgrades	This includes techniques such as increasing the temperature and pressure of medium-pressure steam, addition of a low-pressure turbine, and modifications to the geometry of the turbine rotor blades	The applicability may be restricted by demand, steam conditions and/or limited plant lifetime		
	S.	Supercritical and ultra- supercritical steam conditions	above 220,6 bar and temperatures above 374 °C in the case of supercritical conditions, and above 250 – 300 bar and temperatures above 580 – 600 °C in the case of ultra-supercritical conditions	Only applicable to new units of ≥ 600 MW <sub>th</sub> operated > 4 000 h/yr. Not applicable when the purpose of the unit is to produce low steam temperatures and/or pressures in process industries. Not applicable to gas turbines and engines generating steam in CHP mode. For units combusting biomass, the applicability may be constrained by high-temperature corrosion in the case of certain biomasses		
13			e water usage and the volume of its to use one or both of the techn		CC	The operator confirmed that a closed cooling system is used that minimises water usage. Waste water discharged from the cooling
	Te	chnique	Description	Applicability		system contains water treatment chemicals which is not suitable for
	recycling rune rune rune rune rune rune rune rune		esidual aqueous streams, including n-off water, from the plant are used for other purposes. The degree recycling is limited by the quality quirements of the recipient water eam and the water balance of the ant	Not applicable to waste water from cooling systems when water treatment chemicals and/or high concentrations of salts from seawater are present		reuse.
	b	,	y, hot bottom ash falls from the nace onto a mechanical conveyor	Only applicable to plants combusting solid fuels.		

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD Issued 30/06/2020

EPR/FP3031HJ/V003

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	mmary of BAT Conclu	usion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
			is cooled down by ambi r is used in the process.	restrictions that prevent retrofitting to existing combustion plants		
14	red trea <b>De</b> Wa run <b>Ap</b>	uce emissions to wate at them separately, dep scription aste water streams that -off water, cooling wate plicability	er, BAT is to segregate and ing on the pollutar are typically segregater, and waste water for restricted in the cas	ated and treated include surface	NA	No direct discharge of water from the CHP plant to either water or sewer, all waste water and surface water enters the installation waste water system and is treated by Tronox Pigment UK Limited (formerly Cristal Pigment UK Ltd) before being discharged to the River Humber.
15	app	propriate combination of	of the techniques give	gas treatment, BAT is to use an en below, and to use secondary order to avoid dilution.	NA	The operator confirmed that No Flue gas treatment is undertaken.
	Technique Typical pollutants Applicability prevented/abated					
			Primary techniques	5		
	a. Optimised combustion (see BAT 6) and fluegas treatment systems (e.g. SCR/SNCR, see BAT 7)  Generally applicable ammonia (NH <sub>3</sub> )					
	Secondary techniques (29)					
	b.	Adsorption on activated carbon	Organic compounds, mercury (Hg)	Generally applicable		
	c.	c. Aerobic biological treatment Biodegradable organic compounds, ammonium (NH4 +) Generally applicable for the treatment of organic compounds. Aerobic biological treatment of ammonium (NH4 +) may not be applicable in the case of high chloride concentrations (i.e. around 10 g/l)				

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement					Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	d.	Anoxic/anaerobic biological treatment	Mercury (Hg), nitrate (NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> ), nitrite (NO <sub>2</sub> <sup>-</sup> )	Generally applicable		
	e.	Coagulation and flocculation	Suspended solids	Generally applicable	- - - - - - -	
	f.	Crystallisation	Metals and metalloids, sulphate (SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ), fluoride (F <sup>-</sup> )	Generally applicable		
	g.	Filtration (e.g. sand filtration, microfiltration, ultrafiltration)	Suspended solids, metals	Generally applicable		
	h.	Flotation	Suspended solids, free oil	Generally applicable		
	i.	Ion exchange	Metals	Generally applicable		
	j.	Neutralisation	Acids, alkalis	Generally applicable		
	k.	Oxidation	Sulphide (S <sup>2-</sup> ), sulphite (SO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> )	Generally applicable		
	I.	Precipitation	Metals and metalloids, sulphate (SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup> ), fluoride (F <sup>-</sup> )	Generally applicable		
	m	Sedimentation	Suspended solids	Generally applicable		
	n.	Stripping	Ammonia (NH <sub>3</sub> )	Generally applicable		
	The BAT-AELs refer to direct discharges to a receiving water body at the point where the emission leaves the installation.  BAT-AELs for direct discharges to a receiving water body from flue-gas treatment					
	Substance/Parameter			BAT-AELs		
				Daily average		
	l	otal organic carbon (TOC)		0-50 mg/l_( <sup>30</sup> )_( <sup>31</sup> )_( <sup>32</sup> )		
	Chemical oxygen demand (COD)			0–150 mg/l ( <sup>30</sup> ) ( <sup>31</sup> ) ( <sup>32</sup> )		
	l	tal suspended solids (TSS	·	10–30 mg/l		
	Fluoride (F <sup>-</sup> )			0–25 mg/l_( <sup>32</sup> )		
	Su	ılphate (SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup> )	1	$,3-2,0 \text{ g/l} (3^2) (3^3) (3^4) (3^5)$		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement					Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	Sulphide (S <sup>2-</sup> ), eas	sily released	0,1–0,2 mg/l <u>(<sup>32</sup>)</u>	1-0,2 mg/l_( <sup>32</sup> )		
	Sulphite (SO <sub>3</sub> <sup>2-</sup> )		1–20 mg/l <u>(<sup>32</sup>)</u>			
	Metals and metallo	oids As	10–50 μg/l			
		Cd	2–5 μg/l			
		Cr	10–50 μg/l			
		Cu	10–50 μg/l			
		Hg	0,2–3 μg/l			
		Ni	10–50 μg/l			
		Pb	10–20 μg/l			
		Zn	50–200 μg/l			
16	In order to reduce the quantity of waste sent for disposal from the combustion and/or gasification process and abatement techniques, BAT is to organise operations so as to maximise, in order of priority and taking into account lifecycle thinking:  (a waste prevention, e.g. maximise the proportion of residues which arise as ) by-products;  (b waste preparation for reuse, e.g. according to the specific requested ) quality criteria;  (c) waste recycling;  (d) other waste recovery (e.g. energy recovery),  by implementing an appropriate combination of techniques such as:					The operator confirmed that No waste produced as a result of the process - the hierarchy of waste protocol is followed and is documented in SCHP/EMS/05.
	Technique	Description	Applicability		0	
	a Generation of gypsum as a by-product	Quality optimisation of the c based reaction residues ger by the wet FGD so that they used as a substitute for min- gypsum (e.g. as raw materia plasterboard industry). The of limestone used in the wet influences the purity of the op-	the constraints associated with the required gy quality, the health requirements associated and the constraints associated with the requirements associated and the constraints associated with the required gy quality, the health required and the constraints associated with the required gy quality, the health required gy quality, the health required gy quality, the health required gy quality and the constraints associated with the required gy quality.	ociated psum ciated to		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	mmary of BA	Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	construction sector  (e.g. from semi-dry desulphurisation processes, fly ash, bottom ash) as a construction material (e.g. in road building, to replace sand in concrete production, or in the cement industry)  (e.g. from semi-dry desulphurisation the const with the r quality (e properties substance each specific production).		Generally applicable within the constraints associated with the required material quality (e.g. physical properties, content of harmful substances) associated to each specific use, and by the market conditions			
	C.	Energy recovery by using waste in the fuel mix	The residual energy content of carbon-rich ash and sludges generated by the combustion of coal, lignite, heavy fuel oil, peat or biomass can be recovered for example by mixing with the fuel	Generally applicable where plants can accept waste in the fuel mix and are technically able to feed the fuels into the combustion chamber		
	d	Preparation of spent catalyst for reuse	Preparation of catalyst for reuse (e.g. up to four times for SCR catalysts) restores some or all of the original performance, extending the service life of the catalyst to several decades. Preparation of spent catalyst for reuse is integrated in a catalyst management scheme	The applicability may be limited by the mechanical condition of the catalyst and the required performance with respect to controlling NO <sub>X</sub> and NH <sub>3</sub> emissions		
17		order to reduce	e noise emissions, BAT is to use obelow.	one or a combination of the	CC	The operator confirmed that a noise monitoring regime is in place with the following techniques in use to minimise noise
	l 1	Technique	Description	Applicability		Noisy equipment is contained within enclosures.
	a	Operational measures	These include:  — improved inspection and maintenance of equipment  — closing of doors and windows of enclosed areas, if possible  — equipment operated by experienced staff  — avoidance of noisy activities at night, if possible  — provisions for noise control during maintenance activities	Generally applicable		<ul> <li>There is a inspection and maintenance of equipment</li> <li>new or replacement equipment is subject to limits.</li> <li>We agree with the operators stated compliance</li> </ul>

BAT Concn. lumbe	Su	mmary of	BAT Conclu	sion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	b	Low-noise equipment		entially includes sors, pumps and disks	Generally applicable when the equipment is new or replaced		
	C	Noise attenuation	by insert emitter a obstacle	ppagation can be reduced ng obstacles between the nd the receiver. Appropriate s include protection walls, nents and buildings	Generally applicable to new plants. In the case of existing plants, the insertion of obstacles may be restricted by lack of space		
					The applicability may be restricted by lack of space		
	e Appropriate location of equipment and buildings Noise levels can be reduced by increasing the distance between the emitter and the receiver and by using buildings as noise screens						
П	tion of gaseous fuels						I
)	use	an appro	priate combin	ation of the techniques gi	gas combustion, BAT is to ven in BAT 12 and below.	FC	As already Advanced control system in place via Eurotherr Network, PLC & Burner Management System
	16	echniq ue	Descriptio n	Applic	cability		Combustion optimisation - Combustion has been optimise
	a	Combine d cycle	See description in Section 8.2	except when operated < 1 Applicable to existing gas the constraints associated and the space availability. Not applicable to existing operated < 1 500 h/yr.	turbines and engines within with the steam cycle design gas turbines and engines		in one HRSG following the implementation of burners designed to meet IED regulations. The second HRSG is to undergo the same modification in 2019. In addition it is anticipated that the site will be installing 2 DLE GTs during 2019.
				Not applicable to mechani operated in discontinuous variations and frequent sta	mode with extended load		CHP readiness - not applicable.
		T-associa natural ga		Not applicable to boilers  fficiency levels (BAT-Al	EELs) for the combustion		Combined cycle - two gas turbines each with its own supplementary fired heat recovery steam generator.

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD Issued 30/06/2020

EPR/FP3031HJ/V003

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT	Γ Conclι	usion req	uirement				Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	Type of			BAT-AEEI	Ls <u>(136)</u>	<u>(137)</u>			
	combustion unit		ectrical ncy (%)	Net total total (%) (138)	on	energy	echanical efficiency (140)		
		Ne w unit	Existi ng unit			New unit	Existing unit		
	Gas engine	39,5– 44 <u>(<sup>141</sup>)</u>	35– 44 <u>(141)</u>	56–85 <u>(141)</u>		No BAT-A	EEL.		
	Gas-fired boiler	39– 42,5	38–40	78–95		No BAT-A	EEL.		
	Open cycle gas turbine, ≥ 50 MWth	36– 41,5	33–41,5	No BAT-AE	EL	36,5–41	33,5–41		
		Comb	ined cycle	e gas turbii	ne (CC	GT)	•		
	CCGT, 50– 600 MW <sub>th</sub>	53– 58,5	46–54	No BAT-AE	EL	No BAT-A	EEL		
	CCGT, ≥ 600 MW <sub>th</sub>	57– 60,5	50–60	No BAT-AE	EL	No BAT-A	EEL		
	CHP CCGT, 50– 600 MW <sub>th</sub>	53– 58,5	46–54	65–95		No BAT-A	EEL		
	CHP CCGT, ≥ 600 MW <sub>th</sub>	57– 60,5	50–60	65–95		No BAT-A	EEL		
41	In order to prevent or reduce NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers, BAT is to use one or a combination of the techniques given below.			FC	The operator has confirmed that an advanced control system in place via Eurotherm Network, PLC & Burner Management System				
	Technique		Descriptio	n		Applicab	ility		Cystoni
	a Air and/or fuel . staging	8.3. Air stagi	criptions in ing is often -NO <sub>X</sub> burne	associated	Genera	ally applicat	ole		Combustion optimisation - Combustion has been optimised in one HRSG following the implementation of burners designed to meet IED regulations.
	b Flue-gas . recirculation	See des	cription in	Section 8.3					

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD

BAT Concn. Numbe	Su	mmary of BA	T Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	c	Low-NO <sub>X</sub> burners (LNB)				
	d	Advanced control system	See description in Section 8.3. This technique is often used in combination with other techniques or may be used alone for combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr	The applicability to old combustion plants may be constrained by the need to retrofit the combustion system and/or control command system		
	e	Reduction of the combustion air temperature		Generally applicable within the constraints associated with the process needs		
	f.	Selective non– catalytic reduction (SNCR)		Not applicable to combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr with highly variable boiler loads. The applicability may be limited in the case of combustion plants operated between 500 h/yr and 1 500 h/yr with highly variable boiler loads		
	g	Selective catalytic reduction (SCR)		Not applicable to combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr. Not generally applicable to combustion plants of < 100 MW <sub>th</sub> . There may be technical and economic restrictions for retrofitting existing combustion plants operated between 500 h/yr and 1 500 h/yr		
42	In order to prevent or reduce NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in gas turbines, BAT is to use one or a combination of the technique given below.				FC	The operator has stated that improvements are required reference was made to these work being undertaken in 2019. We asked the operator to confirm whether the improvements
	Technique Description Applicability					had been completed or if outstanding the time scale for
	a	control T system control m	ee description in Section 8.3. his technique is often used in ombination with other techniques hay be used alone for combustion lants operated < 500 h/yr	The applicability to old combustion plants may be constrained by the need to retrofit the combustion		completion.  NOTE: Current limit set within the Permit is 125mg/Nm3

Error! Unknown document property name. and Stallingborough Titanium Dioxide Site Permit Review DD

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	ımmary of E	BAT Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	b . c .	NÓ <sub>X</sub> burners (DLN)	Adaptation of the process control and related equipment to maintain good combustion efficiency when the demand in energy varies, e.g. by improving the inlet airflow control capability or by splitting the combustion process into decoupled combustion stages	system and/or control command system  The applicability may be limited due to water availability  The applicability may be limited in the case of turbines where a retrofit package is not available or when water/steam addition systems are installed  The applicability may be limited by the gas turbine design		Low-NOx burners: Combustion optimisation - Combustion has been optimised in one HRSG following the implementation of burners designed to meet IED regulations. The second HRSG is to undergo the same modification in 2019. In response received on 20/5/2020 the operator confirmed that  a. Advanced operational controls c. DLN e. LNB will be installed by the end of 2020  Both LCP units will meet BAT
	f.	Low-NO <sub>x</sub> burners (LNB)  Selective catalytic reduction (SCR)	See description in Section 8.3	Generally applicable to supplementary firing for heat recovery steam generators (HRSGs) in the case of combined-cycle gas turbine (CCGT) combustion plants  Not applicable in the case of combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr.  Not generally applicable to existing combustion plants of < 100 MW <sub>th</sub> .  Retrofitting existing combustion plants may be constrained by the availability of sufficient space.  There may be technical and economic restrictions for		

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Su	mmary of E	BAT Conclusion requirement		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
				retrofitting existing combustion plants operated between 500 h/yr and 1 500 h/yr		
43	na			ns to air from the combustion of a combination of the techniques	NA	Gas engine are not in use
	Т	echnique	Description	Applicability		
	а	Advanced control system	See description in Section 8.3. This technique is often used in combination with other techniques or may be used alone for combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr	The applicability to old combustion plants may be constrained by the need to retrofit the combustion system and/or control command system		
	b	Lean-burn concept	See description in Section 8.3. Generally used in combination with SCR	Only applicable to new gas-fired engines		
	C	Advanced lean-burn concept	See descriptions in Section 8.3	Only applicable to new spark plug ignited engines		
	d	Selective catalytic reduction (SCR)		Retrofitting existing combustion plants may be constrained by the availability of sufficient space.  Not applicable to combustion plants operated < 500 h/yr.  There may be technical and economic restrictions for retrofitting existing combustion plants operated between 500 h/yr and 1 500 h/yr		
44	In order to prevent or reduce CO emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas, BAT is to ensure optimised combustion and/or to use oxidation catalysts.  **Description - See descriptions in Section 8.3.**  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in gas turbines  Type of combustion plant  BAT-AELs (mg/Nm³) (142) (143)				CC	Current limit set within the Permit is 100mg/Nm3, the operator has requested retention of this limit. Refer to section 4.1

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion	n requirement			Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
		Combustion plant total rated thermal input (MWth)	Yearly average (144 ) (145)	Daily average or average over the sampling period		
	Open-cycle g	as turbines (OCG	GTs <u>) (<sup>146</sup>) (<sup>147</sup>)</u>			
	New OCGT	≥ 50	15–35	25–50		
	Existing OCGT (excluding turbines for mechanical drive applications) — All but plants operated < 500 h/yr	≥ 50	15–50	25–55 <u>(<sup>148</sup>)</u>		
	Combined-cycl	e gas turbines (C	CGTs) (146) (149)	,		
	New CCGT	≥ 50	10–30	15–40		
	Existing CCGT with a net total fuel utilisation of < 75 %	≥ 600	10–40	18–50		
	Existing CCGT with a net total fuel utilisation of ≥ 75 %	≥ 600	10–50	18–55 <u>(<sup>150</sup>)</u>		
	Existing CCGT with a net total fuel utilisation of < 75 %	50–600	10–45	35–55		
	Existing CCGT with a net total fuel utilisation of ≥ 75 %	50–600	25–50 <u>(<sup>151</sup>)</u>	35–55 <u>(<sup>152</sup>)</u>		
	Open- and combined-cycle gas turbines					
	Gas turbine put into operation no later than 27 November 2003, or existing gas turbine for emergency use and operated < 500 h/yr		No BAT-AEL	60–140_(153)(154)		
	Existing gas turbine for mechanical drive applications — All but plants operated < 500 h/yr	≥ 50	15–50 <u>(<sup>155</sup>)</u>	25–55_(156)		

As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels for each type of existing combustion plant operated ≥ 1 500 h/yr and for each type of new combustion plant will generally be as follows:  — New OCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5-40 mg/Nm³. For plants with a net electrical efficiency (EE) greater than 39 %, a correction factor may be applied to the higher end of this range, corresponding to [higher end] × EE/39, where EE is the net electrical energy efficiency or net mechanical energy efficiency of the plant determined at ISO baseload conditions.  — Existing OCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : (excluding turbines for mechanical drive applications): < 5-40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of this range will generally be 80 mg/Nm³ in the case of existing plants that cannot be fitted with dry techniques for NO₂ reduction, or 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.  — New CCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5-30 mg/Nm³. For plants with a net electrical efficiency (EE) greater than 55 %, a correction factor may be applied to the higher end of the range, corresponding to [higher end] × EE/55, where EE is the net electrical energy efficiency of the plant determined at ISO baseload conditions.  — Existing CCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5-30 mg/Nm³. The higher end of this range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.  — Existing gas turbines of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> , for mechanical drive applications: < 5-40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of the range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ when plants operate at low load.  In the case of a gas turbine equipped with DLN burners, these indicative levels correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.  BAT-aELs (mg/Mm³)  Yearly average (½) Daily average or average over the sampling period  New plant   Da-60 50-100   30-85   85-110 (½)  Engine (½)   Daily average or average over the sampling period  Engine (½)   Daily average or average over the sampling period   Daily average or average over the sampling period   Daily average or average over   Daily average or average over   Daily average or average over   Daily average	BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT	Conclusi	on requireme	nt		Status NA/ CC / FC / NC	Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
(EE) greater than 39 %, a correction factor may be applied to the higher end of this range, corresponding to higher end y. EE/39, where EE is the net electrical energy efficiency or net mechanical energy efficiency of the plant determined at ISO baseload conditions.  — Existing OCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> (excluding turbines for mechanical drive applications):  <		combustion plant of	perated ?	≥ 1 500 h/yr ar				
< 5–40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of this range will generally be 80 mg/Nm³ in the case of existing plants that cannot be fitted with dry techniques for NO <sub>x</sub> reduction, or 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.       New CGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5–30 mg/Nm³. For plants with a net electrical efficiency (EE) greater than 55 %, a correction factor may be applied to the higher end of the range, corresponding to [higher end] × EE/55, where EE is the net electrical energy efficiency of the plant determined at ISO baseload conditions.       Existing CCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5–30 mg/Nm³. The higher end of this range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.       Existing gas turbines of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> for mechanical drive applications: < 5–40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of the range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ when plants operate at low load.       In the case of a gas turbine equipped with DLN burners, these indicative levels correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.       BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers and engines       Type of combustion plant   Satisting plant (Sb)   Daily average or average over the sampling period   New plant plant (Sb)   Daily average or average over the sampling period   Satisting plant (Sb)   Daily average		(EE) greater than range, correspon efficiency or ne	n 39 %, a d nding to [hi t mechani	correction factor gher end] × EE/	may be applied 39, where EE is	to the higher end of this the net electrical energy		
(EE) greater than 55 %, a correction factor may be applied to the higher end of the range, corresponding to [higher end] × EE/55, where EE is the net electrical energy efficiency of the plant determined at ISO baseload conditions.  — Existing CCGT of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> : < 5–30 mg/Nm³. The higher end of this range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.  — Existing gas turbines of ≥ 50 MW <sub>m</sub> for mechanical drive applications: < 5–40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of the range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ when plants operate at low load.  In the case of a gas turbine equipped with DLN burners, these indicative levels correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers and engines  Type of combustion   SAT-AELs (mg/Nm³)   Yearly average ([s⁻¹])   Daily average or average over the sampling period   New Existing plant ([s⁻³])   Paint ([s⁻³])		< 5-40 mg/Nm <sup>3</sup> . of existing plants	The higher s that can	end of this rang not be fitted wit	e will generally b h dry technique	e 80 mg/Nm <sup>3</sup> in the case		
generally be 50 mg/Nm³ for plants that operate at low load.  — Existing gas turbines of ≥ 50 MW <sub>th</sub> for mechanical drive applications: < 5— 40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of the range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ when plants operate at low load.  In the case of a gas turbine equipped with DLN burners, these indicative levels correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers and engines  Type of combustion  Type of combustion  New Existing plant (157) Daily average over the sampling period  New plant Existing plant (159)  Boiler 10–60 50–100 30–85 85–110  Engine (160) 20–75 20–100 55–85 55–110 (101)  As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be:		(EE) greater than range, correspon	n 55 %, a d nding to [hi	correction factor gher end] × EE/	may be applied 55, where EE is	to the higher end of the the net electrical energy		
40 mg/Nm³. The higher end of the range will generally be 50 mg/Nm³ when plants operate at low load.  In the case of a gas turbine equipped with DLN burners, these indicative levels correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers and engines  Type of combustion plant  Yearly average (¹⁵⁻) Daily average or average over the sampling period  New Existing plant (¹⁵⁵) Daily average over the sampling period  New plant plant (¹⁵⁵) New plant Existing plant (¹⁵⁵)  Boiler 10-60 50-100 30-85 85-110  Engine (¹⁶⁰) 20-75 20-100 55-85 55-110 (¹⁶¹)  As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be:						r end of this range will		
correspond to when the DLN operation is effective.  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for NO <sub>X</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in boilers and engines  Type of Combustion Plant  Yearly average (157)  New Existing Plant		40 mg/Nm <sup>3</sup> . The	higher end					
Type of combustion plant  Yearly average ( $^{157}$ )  Daily average or average over the sampling period  New plant ( $^{158}$ )  Boiler 10–60 50–100 30–85 85–110  Engine ( $^{160}$ ) 20–75 20–100 55–85 55–110 ( $^{161}$ )  As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be:		correspond to when	n the DLN I emissio	l operation is en levels (BAT	effective. -AELs) for NO	${\sf D}_{\sf X}$ emissions to air		
Plant    Vearly average (180)   Daily average or average over the sampling period		Type of			_			
Description   Description   Description   Description		plant   Plant						
Boiler         10–60         50–100         30–85         85–110           Engine (160)         20–75         20–100         55–85         55–110 (161)           As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be:						Existing plant (159)		
As an indication, the yearly average CO emission levels will generally be:						85–110		
		<u> </u>						
— < 5–40 mg/Nm³ for existing boilers operated ≥ 1 500 h/vr.								
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·								
— < 5–15 mg/Nm³ for new boilers,		— < 5–15 ma	ı/Nm³ for ı	new boilers.				

BAT Concn. Numbe r	Summary of BAT Conclusion requirement					Assessment of the installation capability and any alternative techniques proposed by the operator to demonstrate compliance with the BAT Conclusion requirement
	<ul> <li>30–100 mg/Nm³ for existing engines.</li> </ul>	gines operated ≥	1 500 h/yr	and for new		
45	In order to reduce non-methane volatile organic compounds (NMVOC) and methane (CH <sub>4</sub> ) emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in sparkignited lean-burn gas engines, BAT is to ensure optimised combustion and/or to use oxidation catalysts.  **Description**  See descriptions in Section 8.3. Oxidation catalysts are not effective at reducing the emissions of saturated hydrocarbons containing less than four carbon atoms.  BAT-associated emission levels (BAT-AELs) for formaldehyde and CH <sub>4</sub> emissions to air from the combustion of natural gas in a spark-ignited				NA	No spark-ignited lean-burn gas engines,
	Combustion plant total rated	n gas engine BAT-AE	Ls (mg/Nm	1 <sup>3</sup> )		
	thermal input (MW <sub>th</sub> )	Formaldehyde	(	CH <sub>4</sub>		
	Average over the sampling period					
		New or existing plant	New plant	Existing plant		
	≥ 50	5–15 <u>(<sup>162</sup>)</u>	215– 500 <u>(163)</u>	215– 560 <u>(162)</u> <u>(163)</u>		

## 6. Review and assessment of derogation requests made by the operator in relation to BAT Conclusions which include an associated emission level (AEL) value

The IED enables a competent authority to allow derogations from BAT AELs stated in BAT Conclusions under specific circumstances as detailed under Article 15(4):

By way of derogation from paragraph 3, and without prejudice to Article 18, the competent authority may, in specific cases, set less strict emission limit values. Such a derogation may apply only where an assessment shows that the achievement of emission levels associated with the best available techniques as described in BAT conclusions would lead to disproportionately higher costs compared to the environmental benefits due to:

- (a) the geographical location or the local environmental conditions of the installation concerned; or
- (b) the technical characteristics of the installation concerned.

As part of their Regulation 61 Note response, the operator has not requested a derogation from compliance with any AEL values.

## 7. Emissions to Water

There is no direct discharge of water from the CHP plant to either water or sewer, all waste water and surface water enters the installation waste water system and is treated by Tronox Pigment UK Limited before discharge to the River Humber.

There are no BAT AELs specified in the BAT Conclusions for this type of plant. There are also no additional treatment options identified as BAT for the installation. We have therefore not carried out any additional assessment of the emissions to water as part of this review.

## 8. Additional IED Chapter II requirements

There are no additional IED Chapter II requirements

## 9. Review and assessment of changes that are not part of the BAT Conclusions derived permit review

This document should be read in conjunction with the application, supporting information and notice.

Aspect considered	Decision
Receipt of application	
Confidential information	A claim for commercial or industrial confidentiality has not been made.
Identifying confidential information	We have not identified information provided as part of the application that we consider to be confidential.
The site	
Biodiversity, heritage, landscape and nature conservation	The application is within the relevant distance criteria of a site of heritage, landscape or nature conservation, and/or protected species or habitat.
	A full assessment of the application and its potential to affect the site(s)/species/habitat has not been carried out as part of the permit review process. We consider that the review will not affect the features of the site(s)/species/habitat as the conditions will provide at least the same level of protection as those in the previous permit and in some cases will provide a higher level of protection to those in the previous permit.
	We have not consulted Natural England on the application. The decision was taken in accordance with our guidance.
Operating techniques	
General operating techniques	We have reviewed the techniques used by the operator where they are relevant to the BAT Conclusions and compared these with the relevant guidance notes.
	The permit conditions ensure compliance with the relevant BREF, BAT Conclusions. The ELVs deliver compliance with the BAT-AELs.

Aspect considered	Decision
Permit conditions	
Updating permit conditions during consolidation	We have updated permit conditions to those in the current generic permit template as part of permit consolidation. The conditions will provide at least the same level of protection as those in the previous permit and in some cases will provide a higher level of protection to those in the previous permit.
Changes to the permit conditions due to an Environment Agency initiated variation	We have varied the permit as stated in the variation notice.
Improvement programme	Based on the information on the application, we consider that we need to impose an improvement programme.
	We have imposed an improvement programme to ensure that:
	IC04 Following the completion of the works to both LCP's to improve NOX emissions as outlined in regulation 61 response of the 23/04/2020 the operator submit a report in writing to the Environment Agency for approval to define an output load or operational parameters for when the dry low NOx operation is effective in line with BAT42.
	We have also removed the completed improvement conditions from the permit.
Emission limits	We have decided that emission limits should be set for the parameters listed in the permit.
	These are described in the relevant BAT Conclusions in Sections 4.1and 5 of this document.
	It is considered that the ELVs/equivalent parameters or technical measures described above will ensure that significant pollution of the environment is prevented and a high level of protection for the environment is secured.
Monitoring	We have decided that monitoring should be carried out for the parameters listed in the permit, using the methods detailed and to the frequencies specified.
	These are described in the relevant BAT Conclusions in Sections 4.1 and 5 of this document.
	Table S3.4 Process monitoring requirements was amended to include the requirement to monitor energy efficiency after overhauls on site in line with BAT2.

Aspect considered	Decision
	Based on the information in the application we are satisfied that the operator's techniques, personnel and equipment have either MCERTS certification or MCERTS accreditation as appropriate.
Reporting	We have specified reporting in the permit for the following parameters:  • Nitrogen dioxide
	<ul><li>Carbon monoxide</li><li>Sulphur dioxide</li></ul>
	These are described in the relevant BAT Conclusions in Sections 5 of this document.
Operator competence	
Management system	There is no known reason to consider that the operator will not have the management system to enable it to comply with the permit conditions.
Growth Duty	
Section 108 Deregulation Act 2015 - Growth duty	We have considered our duty to have regard to the desirability of promoting economic growth set out in section 108(1) of the Deregulation Act 2015 and the guidance issued under section 110 of that Act in deciding whether to grant this permit.
	Paragraph 1.3 of the guidance says:  "The primary role of regulators, in delivering regulation, is to achieve the regulatory outcomes for which they are responsible. For a number of regulators, these regulatory outcomes include an explicit reference to development or growth. The growth duty establishes economic growth as a factor that all specified regulators should have regard to, alongside the delivery of the protections set out in the relevant legislation."
	We have addressed the legislative requirements and environmental standards to be set for this operation in the body of the decision document above. The guidance is clear at paragraph 1.5 that the growth duty does not legitimise non-compliance and its purpose is not to achieve or pursue economic growth at the expense of necessary protections.
	We consider the requirements and standards we have set in this permit are reasonable and necessary to avoid a risk of an unacceptable level of pollution. This also promotes growth amongst legitimate operators because the standards applied to the operator are consistent across businesses in this sector and have been set to achieve the required legislative standards.