



ReCAP
Research for Community Access Partnership



Putting Rural Transport on the agenda for multi-lateral development – Lessons from Asia

Final report



Peter O'Neill

ReCAP KMN2131A

February 2018

The views in this document are those of the authors and they do not necessarily reflect the views of the Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP), or Cardno Emerging Markets (UK) Ltd for whom the document was prepared

Cover Photo: UNCRD EST Vientiane 2017

<i>Quality assurance and review table</i>			
Version	Author(s)	Reviewer(s)	Date
1.0	Peter O'Neill	C Visser	21 January 2018
		L Sampson Technical Panel	31 January 2018 30 January 2018
1.1	Peter O'Neill	C Visser L Sampson	26 February 2018

ReCAP Database Details: [Project Title]			
Reference No:	KMN2089C	Location	Bangkok
Source of Proposal		Procurement Method	Sole source
Theme	Transport knowledge management, education and dissemination	Sub-Theme	Rural transport advocacy
Lead Implementation Organisation	Peter O'Neill	Partner Organisation	NA
Total Approved Budget	GBP 4'375	Total Used Budget	GBP 4'375
Start Date	21/12/2017	End Date	28/02/2018
Report Due Date	21/01/2018	Date Received	17/01/2018

ReCAP Project Management Unit
 Cardno Emerging Market (UK) Ltd
 Oxford House, Oxford Road
 Thame
 OX9 2AH
 United Kingdom



Abstract

A Rural Transport pre-event was organised between ReCAP, SLoCaT, the UN Economic Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP), the UN Centre for Regional Development (UNCRD) and the Lao PDR government, ahead of the 10th Environmentally Sustainable Transport (EST) Forum for Asia, in March 2017. Following this capacity building pre-event, the EST Forum itself culminated in the adoption of the Vientiane Declaration on Sustainable Rural Transport towards achieving the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Based on the successful example in Asia, this Report explores for ReCAP the option to support a similar process in the African region. The Report examines how ReCAP can influence the appropriate actors and stakeholders in the African region and play a catalysing role, providing research evidence to support the process. The Report provides lessons learnt in elevating the topic of rural transport and rural access to the agenda of the multilateral development discourse in Asia, in particular, the experience of the EST Forum for Asia. The analysis within the Report includes an assessment of the transferability of the lessons to other global regions, in particular Africa. Ultimately the analysis will feed into a roadmap for an Africa regional dialogue on the topic of Rural Transport in Africa.

Keywords

Environmentally, sustainable, transport, UNCRD, EST, Forum, Asia, Africa, multilateral, regional, Vientiane Declaration

Acknowledgements

Mohanty Choudhury ; UNCRD
Cornie Huizenga ; SLoCaT
Rob De Jong ; UNEP
Ibou Diouf ; SSATP

RESEARCH FOR COMMUNITY ACCESS PARTNERSHIP (ReCAP)

Safe and sustainable transport for rural communities

ReCAP is a research programme, funded by UK Aid, with the aim of promoting safe and sustainable transport for rural communities in Africa and Asia. ReCAP comprises the Africa Community Access Partnership (AfCAP) and the Asia Community Access Partnership (AsCAP). These partnerships support knowledge sharing between participating countries in order to enhance the uptake of low cost, proven solutions for rural access that maximise the use of local resources. The ReCAP programme is managed by Cardno Emerging Markets (UK) Ltd.

See www.research4cap.org

Acronyms, Units and Currencies

\$	United States Dollar
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AFCAP	Africa Community Access Partnership
AfDB	African Development Bank
ASANRA	Association of Southern African National Road Agencies
ASCAP	Asia Community Access Partnership
ASTF	African Sustainable Transport Forum
AU	African Union
CAREC	Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation
CIRAD	Agricultural Research for Development
CSIR	Council of Scientific and Industrial Research
EST	Environmentally Sustainable Transport
FAO	Food Administration Organisation
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GMS	Greater Mekong Sub-Region
ICA	Infrastructure Consortium for Africa
ICLEI	Local Governments for Sustainability
IRF	International Road Federation
IRU	International Road Transport Union
ITDP	Institute for Transportation and Development Policy
KAS	Konrad Adenauer Stiftung
MDB	Multi-lateral development banks
NEPAD	New Partnership for African Development
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation.
NPCA	NEPAD Planning and Coordinating Agency
OECD	Organisation for Cooperation and Development
PIARC	World road association
PIDA	Programme for Infrastructure Development in Africa
RECAP	Research for Community Access Partnership
SADC	South African Development Organisation
SATC	South African Transport Conference
SLoCaT	Partnership on Low Carbon Sustainable Transport
SSATP	Africa Transport Policy Programme
SUM4All	Sustainable Mobility for all
UIC	International Union of Railways
UK	United Kingdom (of Great Britain and Northern Ireland)
UKAid	United Kingdom Aid (Department for International Development, UK)
UNCRD	United Nations Centre for Regional Development
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDESA	United Nations Department for Economic and Social Affairs
UNECA	United nations Economic Commission for Africa
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
VPI	Victoria Policy Institute
WHO	World Health Organisation
WBG	World Bank Group

Contents

Acknowledgements	3
Acronyms, Units and Currencies	4
Contents	5
1 Executive summary.....	5
2 Background	7
2.1 History	7
2.2 Context	7
2.3 Outcomes from the EST Forum	8
2.4 Organisation of the Forum	10
2.5 Supporting organisations	10
2.6 Inclusion of rural transport	10
2.7 Funding of the EST	11
3 Research objective and analysis	12
3.1 EST Forum strengths	12
3.2 Transport Related Multilateral forums in Asia	13
3.3 Transport Related Multilateral forums in Africa	14
4 Conclusions	17
4.1 Lessons Learnt and going forward	17
4.2 Recommendations	18
4.3 Next Steps	20

1 Executive summary

This report was commissioned to see how ReCAP can influence the appropriate actors and stakeholders in the African region and play a catalysing role, providing research evidence to support efficient delivery of rural access based on the successful example of the Environmentally Sustainable Transport, EST, Forum in Asia, and exploring the option to support, but not lead, a similar process in the African region. The analysis in this Report will ultimately feed into a roadmap for an Africa regional dialogue on the topic of Rural Transport in Africa.

The EST Forum started in 2004 and has subsequently been held 10 times in 13 years. With long-term adequate funding, a strong champion organiser in the United Nations Centre for Regional Development, UNCRD, it has consistently grown in size and influence over the 13 years; developing a credibility for quality, consistency and reliability. The donor's satisfaction is shown in the long-term character of funding and the ownership of the Forum by the countries of Asia in contributing substantial sums to host the event. The report draws attention to the evidence from feedback, reviews and subsequent analysis that contribute to the change to more sustainable transport policies in the Asia region. This supports the assumption that the EST Forum series have been successful in bringing knowledge, innovation and substantive matters to the attention of decision makers in the region and thereby influencing change.

The report examines the history of the lead-up to the rural access topic being included in the EST programme and also gives an insight as to how individual and institutional champions provided the motivation and academic evidence for elevating the topic of rural transport and rural access to the agenda of the multilateral development discourse in Asia, in particular, the experience of the EST Forum for Asia.

Producing research, developing knowledge and lessons learnt need a platform to reach the practitioners who will use this information to create better programmes. Attracting the most influential of stakeholders is never easy to accomplish but EST has gained significant success in this regard by managing the essential Ministerial involvement, preventing an overpolitisization of the Forum whilst retaining a high-level status that attracts the decision makers of governments in the region. The evidence produced shows that the EST in Asia was the most appropriate choice for using as a platform, as it is well attended especially by government decision makers and development banks and shaped to create an easy atmosphere for networking and building relationships. It forms an excellent platform to launch policy papers, evidence of research, lessons learnt and case studies of rural access solutions in front of a diverse and interested audience.

Transferring the EST model to the Africa diaspora is not straight forward. There are no ready-made solutions. An attempt was made in 2013 at the meeting of the Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy programme (SSATP) to explore the possibility of an EST Africa Forum, without conclusion. However, the following year an Africa Sustainable Transport Forum, ASTF, funded by the SSATP and organised by the United Nations Environment Programme, UNEP, was held in Nairobi as a one-off event. More efforts have been invested by the UNEP on smaller more focused meetings at lower level since that ASTF meeting. The first and one-off African Development Bank Transport Forum took place in November 2015 at the headquarters of the African Development Bank, AfDB, in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, under the theme 'Sustainable Transport for an Integrated Africa'. There are no plans for a follow-up. The SSATP already have a programme that includes an annual meeting, however since 2013 only a single SSATP meeting has been held and that was in 2017.

The context of the political and institutional challenges within SSATP would need to be understood for further DFID involvement including the management of the Francophone and Anglosaxon aspects of the African governance systems.

Large multilateral meetings led by UN are expensive but have a distinct advantage of international protocols in connecting to governments at high level. UN and development banks usually deliver on the criteria of multilateralism and high level participation both by Ministers and implementing decision makers. The feedback received from the UN agencies and the development banks is that there is a need for an EST type forum in Africa but that there is a reluctance to take the lead and shoulder the cost. A lesson to be learnt from the EST Forum in Asia is that a loyal donor with a long-term vision is a key component for sustainability and delivery success.

Creating a successful and credible forum that delivers a high-level multilateral platform for dissemination and networking requires long-term and committed funding, a strong and capable secretariat of an international neutral organisation and champions of the multilaterals that support the event. There are opportunities for building on the previous work of UNEP, UNCRD and AfDB to create an EST or build on the already held ASTF that was a cooperation of the multilaterals active in this area. SSATP have a strategic objective to have an operational website dedicated to EST and could form a fourth pillar of support. UNCRD have a strong and committed transport secretariat in Nagoya that would be a first choice to investigate as a secretariat, and in support would be a role for UN-Habitat.

This Report recommends that DFID/ReCAP take a pro-active role in finding partners in order to organise an EST Forum in Africa. It is expected that this can be achieved without ReCAP/DFID taking the lead role but supporting and ensuring that steps are taken along the route to a sustainable establishment of an EST Forum for Africa. Following on from the inaugural ASTF in Nairobi there is an opportunity to create an ongoing EST/AST Forum in Africa with institutional partners such as UNCRD taking a lead role with support from UN-Habitat and backing of AfDB and World Bank. Economies of scale and efficiencies could be achieved with cross-regional linkages if a regional exchange platform is set up with the EST Asia Forum. Conversations held with UNCRD indicate that they would be willing to offer their secretariat services but, as their main funder, the Japanese Government is not willing to extend funding to Africa, all costs would need to be found. This EST Forum establishment would further protect the U.K. government investments in rural access for Africa and contribute to SuM4All objectives.

It is recommended that a consultant should be engaged to visit the various African institutions, such as the AfDB, AU/NEPAD, SSATP, UN-Habitat to seek willingness to act as co-organisers of a long-term programme of Forums that would be held annually in the countries across the region alternating between Anglosaxon and Francophone countries. Also consultations should be made with potential funders to secure, for as long-term as possible, funding for an EST. AfDB may be interested in collaborating following on from their first African Development Bank Transport Forum in 2015, as may SSATP. Other funders from development banks and aid agencies may be available. This would also satisfy the multilateral requirements. Initially DFID may need to be prepared to commit to funding the event. Co-opting the High Volume Transport programme may help in this regard. Next steps are to decide on a way forward, that may include one or more options on organisational route. Firstly a more detailed evaluation is needed with wider consultation, secondly, a paper should be produced of this report for presentation to the 2018 SARF/IRF/PIARC Regional Conference for Africa and a regional workshop held for consultation and ownership.

2 Background

2.1 History

Building on work carried out at the time by the Organisation for Cooperation and Development, OECD, on environmentally sustainable transport, EST, Japan's Ministry of the Environment and Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport recognized that the many challenges of creating an EST future in Asia needed a coordinated approach between countries and sectors in developing policies and measures to achieve that objective.

A meeting of Asian governments, jointly organised by the OECD and the Japanese ministries was held in March 2003 in Nagoya, Japan. 'The International Conference on Environmentally Sustainable Transport' set out plans for developing EST in Asia including a role for the UN Centre for Regional Development, UNCRD on how to coordinate the efforts of countries of the region, as stated in the adopted 'Nagoya Statement on Environmentally Sustainable Transport in the Asian Region' ([UNCRD, 2003](#)).

In January 2004, a similar meeting was held in Manila, 'The Manila Policy Dialogue on Environment and Transport in the Asian Region' and it was agreed to develop measures to promote EST including establishing the regional EST Forum, and set down in the adopted Manila Statement. The Ministry of the Environment, Government of Japan, was the principal funder and together with UNCRD established the "Regional EST Forum in Asia" at Nagoya, Japan, in 2005. Since that meeting the EST Forum has been held ten times in various capital cities across the Asia region and has grown from 13 countries with 80 participants in Nagoya to 28 countries and 330 participants at Vientiane, Laos in 2017.

2.2 Context

Asian countries at the time of inauguration of EST were requiring strategies and policies within the transport framework to tackle the socioeconomic and environmental problems resulting from the acceleration in economic development. These problems included public health, environmental degradation, increasing energy costs and resulting productivity impacts from greater vehicle use, congestion, and road crashes.

UNCRD were asked to create a new paradigm in the transport sector in Asia for achieving low carbon and sustainable transport (integrating social equity, economic prosperity, and environmental conservation). UNCRD set up a high level Regional EST Forum in Asia to build a common understanding across Asia on essential elements of EST and to create a political consensus on the need for an integrated approach to deal with multi/cross-sectoral environment, health and transport issues, including climate change, through interagency coordination. EST also subsequently administered regional/national EST training programs; technical assistance for national EST strategies; Asian Mayors' Policy Dialogue on EST and Rio+20 Voluntary Commitments.

The objectives of the EST Forum as agreed in the 2004 meeting in Manila were agreed as follows:-

- i) Facilitate policy dialogues and provide strategies for sharing best practices, policy instruments, tools, and technologies in relation to various aspects of EST among Asian countries.

- ii) In consultation with the subsidiary expert groups, facilitate and provide necessary advisory support for the formulation of national EST strategies and action plans on EST for selected countries.
- iii) Support the implementation of action plans into practice through the participation of international organizations and international development and donor agencies.
- iv) Help establish linkages with other ongoing regional and international activities/initiatives in promoting EST through the common understanding.

As the Forum progressed more formal targets were needed and these were provided in the Bangkok 2020 Declaration from the 2010 Forum. The agreed intention for the participating Asian countries was to accomplish a safe, reliable, affordable, efficient, people focused and environment friendly transport system that enabled economic, social and environmental development whilst integrating developing countries in the world economy and contribute the eradication of poverty.

At the Bali Forum in 2013, themed “The Next Generation Transport System We Want for 21st Century - Looking Beyond Rio+20”, the Forum reviewed the progress and achievements made by countries towards achieving the goals under the Bangkok 2020 Declaration. The Forum also reviewed the EST in the context or harmonising with the Rio+20 outcomes. Coupled with the Forum was the Global Consultation on Sustainable Transport in the post 2015 Development Agenda, held with the participation of government representatives from Africa, Asia, Europe, Latin America and North America. The annual Regional EST Forum in Asia facilitated engaging participants in the discussion on the contribution of sustainable transport to sustainable development and the contribution of transport in the preparation of the development of a Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

In the Latin-America region the UNCRD-LAC office supported the implementation of the Sustainable Transport Forum for Latin America in 2011, at Bogota, Columbia. The event was held in collaboration with the Inter-American Development Bank and the Columbian Ministry of Transport. The Forum had an aim of implementing environmentally sustainable transport in policies and planning in the countries of Latin America. A Bogota Declaration was agreed among the participating countries stating the objectives of Environmentally Sustainable Transport in Latin America 2020. This initiative was a replica of the EST successfully implemented by UNCRD in cooperation with the Ministry of Environment of Japan for Asia. The Forum brought together Ministers of Transport from 12 countries in Latin America. It has not been repeated and the UNCRD–LAC office closed in December 2014 following ODA reductions for South America by the Japanese government.

2.3 Outcomes from the EST Forum for Asia

The Forum provides the opportunities for learning both in terms of good practise but also what others are doing. In this regard it is a powerful networking event with spin off projects and relationships being formed. The Forums have produced associated events such as the Asian Mayors Forum and capacity building workshops. An example of the latest workshop being the Regional Environmentally Sustainable Transport (EST) Policy Dialogue and Training Workshop for South Asia and South-East Asian Cities in October 2017, held in conjunction with the Asian Institute of Technology and the Royal Thai government.

Table 1 - Timetable of meetings

Date	Meeting	Outcome (Forum statements and Ministerial Declarations)
Mar. 2003	International Conference on Environmentally Sustainable Transport in the Asian Region (Nagoya, Japan)	Nagoya Statement on Environmentally Sustainable Transport in the Asian Region
Jan. 2004	Manila Policy Dialogue on Environment and Transport in the Asian Region (Manila, the Philippines)	“Manila Statement” to develop measures to promote EST including establishing the regional EST Forum
Aug. 2005	First Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Nagoya, Japan)	Adopted <i>Aichi Statement</i>
Dec. 2006	Second Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Yogyakarta, Indonesia)	
Apr. 2007	Asian Mayors' Policy Dialogue for the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Transport (EST) in Cities (Kyoto, Japan)	Adopted <i>Kyoto Declaration</i>
Mar. 2008	Third Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Singapore)	
Nov. 2008	Special Event of Asian Mayors for the Signing of the Kyoto Declaration for the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Transport (Bangkok, Thailand)	
Feb. 2009	Fourth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Seoul, Republic of Korea)	Adopted <i>Seoul Statement</i>
Mar. 2010	Special Event of Asian Mayors for the Signing of the Kyoto Declaration for the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Transport (Seoul, Republic of Korea)	
Aug. 2010	Fifth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Bangkok, Thailand)	Adopted <i>Bangkok Declaration for 2020</i>
Dec. 2011	Sixth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (New Delhi, India)	
Apr. 2013	Seventh Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Bali, Indonesia)	Adopted <i>Bali Declaration</i>
Nov. 2014	Eighth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Colombo, Sri Lanka)	Adopted Colombo Declaration Adopted Addendum to Kyoto Declaration in special session by Asian Mayors
Nov. 2015	Ninth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Kathmandu, Nepal)	
Mar. 2017	Tenth Meeting of the Regional EST Forum in Asia (Vientiane, Lao PDR)	Adopted Vientiane Declaration Adopted Addendum to Kyoto Declaration at the International Mayors Forum

2.4 Organisation of the Forum

EST Forums are broadly based around the standard UN meeting format. Main sessions facilitate political protocols, plenary sessions are where the Forum business is conducted and side events where topic areas are discussed in greater detail. Most plenary sessions have presentations of high quality background papers prepared by participating organisations and experts. There is usually great emphasis on information sharing, including panel discussions, workshops and special events. The 2017 Forum recorded 14 background papers, 23 country reports and 15 city reports.

The main organiser is the UNCRD Environment Section, based in Nagoya. They operate under the auspices of the United Nations Department for Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) in New York. Their funding is entirely originated from the Ministry of the Environment of Japan, who contribute around US\$450,000 to the UNCRD Environment Section annually, of which US\$250,000 is expended on the costs associated with holding the EST Forum annually (or thereabouts). In recent years this investment has been supported in organisation and most recently funding by the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, UNESCAP (US\$30,000) and the Partnership for Sustainable Low Carbon Transport, SLoCaT, (US\$30,000), courtesy of a donation from the Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung (KAS). In total, the Forum costs around US\$300,000 to hold with the host governments (except Nepal) providing at their expense the local amenities and services including catering. Evening events and field trips are usually sponsored by host ministries. The majority of the cost is attributed to flights and daily subsistence allowance for government officials from developing countries and experts.

2.5 Supporting organisations

Organisations that have supported the Forum with inputs (additional to organisers) include the Asian Development Bank (ADB), Adenauer Foundation, United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID), EMBARQ (The World Resources Institute's Centre for Sustainable Transport), Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), ICLEI - Local Governments for Sustainability, International Road Transport Union (IRU), Institute for Transportation and Development Policy (ITDP), International Union of Railways (UIC), Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP), SAFER-Vehicle and Traffic Safety Centre, University of Gothenburg, United Nations Human Settlements Program (UN-Habitat), United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), Victoria Transport Policy Institute (VTPI), World Health Organization (WHO), the World Bank (WB).

2.6 Inclusion of rural transport

Following the production of two new papers, one for the UNESCAP Ministerial Meeting on Transport 'Rural connectivity to wider networks' and the other proposing a 'Community of Practice of Rural Roads in Asia', UNESCAP, as joint funders and organisers of the EST Forum, proposed that a session be included on rural transport at the ninth EST Forum in Kathmandu Nepal, November 2015. EST had delivered country and delegate numbers growth consistently and developed a credible reputation amongst transport practitioners. From post meeting feedback forms the EST Forum was perceived by many as the premiere 'transport for development' meeting in the Asia region with a reputation for neutral and unbiased knowledge advocacy.

Although the Forum was focused on climate adaptation and disaster resilience for transport in urban settings (following the earthquake in Nepal), UNESCAP argued that rural transport should not be ignored when discussing sustainability in transport for three main reasons. Firstly, rural poverty is a major impediment to realizing sustainable development goals; secondly, rural areas produce the food products for consumption in growing urban areas; and thirdly, climate change will create significant impacts for rural transport as well as urban transport. It was also seen as an opportunity to disseminate the outputs of the UK funded ReCAP research programme on achieving better practise on gaining and improving rural access.

The EST organising committee accepted this recommendation and piloted the inaugural inclusion of a session within the EST on rural transport, 'Sustainable Rural Transport for Resilient Rural Community, Food Security & Poverty Eradication'. The success of the pilot session on rural transport in generating interest and enthusiasm amongst delegates in Kathmandu was noted and it was decided by the major contributors and organisers, UNCRD, UNESCAP and SLoCaT, and agreed by Japan's Ministry of the Environment, that rural transport should be a regular and ongoing component of the Forum. Consequently, UNESCAP initiated a Ministerial declaration committee to draft a declaration on the subject of rural transport for the Tenth Regional EST Forum in Asia to be held in Vientiane, Lao PDR, on March 14-16, 2017.

The second paper outlining the case for a Community of Practice for Rural Transport in Asia was presented to the ADB as consistent funding would be needed into the future, but ADB were unable to commit at that time.

Participants at the Forum included senior government officials of 28 Asian countries from Transport, Health and Environment Ministries, representatives from international organizations, bilateral and multilateral agencies, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), research organizations, and sustainable transport experts. At this Forum the Vientiane Declaration for sustainable rural transport toward achieving the 2030 Agenda was adopted. In addition a further session of the International Mayors Forum was facilitated and the Addendum to the Kyoto Declaration was adopted reinforcing the commitment of the Kyoto Declaration 2007, and highlighting the importance of environmentally sustainable transport in Asia.

2.7 Funding of the EST

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Government of Japan, is the principal funder of UNCRD. The Ministry of the Environment provides the funds for the UNCRD Environment's section that includes the work on environmentally sustainable transport.

Other contributors to the Forum include ADB and WHO that have funded relevant ministry officials to attend, as have UNESCAP. The Konrad Adenauer Institute recently became a donor. The Government of Japan funding is perceived by the UNCRD programme manager as secure but the other contributors tend to 'dip in and out' depending on budget holders preferences.

On the broader level of funding ADB is active in promoting sustainable transport and is part of the multilateral development banks (MDBs) pledge in June 2012 to provide \$175 billion over 10 years to help fund sustainable transportation systems. Access to the various clean energy funds has been modest with ADB now attempting to include some blends in their development loans.

3 Research objective and analysis

3.1 EST Forum strengths

Being in existence for 13 years has given UNCRD a wealth of reports and feedback from the Forum on the progress towards achieving a region with EST and consequently, the role of the EST Forum; regional/national EST training programs; technical assistance for national EST strategies; Asian Mayors' Policy Dialogue on EST and Rio+20 Voluntary Commitments in that achievement. The EST has a history of reports from cities and countries that reference and build on transport information and guidance from previous EST Forums, indicating that government policies are changing in response to information presented at EST Forums. This is further assisted as countries are required to report on targets for progress towards goals defined in EST Forum documents such as the Bangkok 2020 Declaration.

A Review carried out by the Victoria Policy Institute, VPI, indicates that the EST Forums have had the following impacts:

- They have introduced many decision-makers to sustainable transport concepts and strategies.
- They have helped make national transport and environmental policies more sustainable and have influenced changes by areas of government, for example to improve land use development policies.
- EST forums influenced policy changes by development banks and other international organizations that now support more sustainable transport investments and planning.

The review also cites other achievements of the Forums: taking on the leadership role and assisting countries and cities establish sustainable transport planning goals, performance targets, standards and evaluation programmes; responding to changing demands and emerging needs they have helped create an information network including international organizations, government agencies and experts that produces and shares publications and analysis tools.

The 2016 EST Participants' Survey for this ten-year review set out the feedback concerning their experience and suggestions for improvement. Most respondents indicated that the EST Forums have helped their countries implement more sustainable transport policies, and provided specific examples, such as improving public officials' knowledge, development of new policies, programs and technologies, and implementation of new non-motorized and BRT projects. The EST Forums inspired the National Environmentally Sustainable Transport Strategy for the Philippines (NESTSP), and the Philippines National Climate Change Action Plan (NCCAP). Respondents indicated that the EST Forums provide very useful information, with something for everybody, peer-to-peer sharing, and support for policy reforms. Almost all respondents support the organization of smaller, regional/national forums (the importance of involving local officials is mentioned many times in response to various questions), possibly as biannual events that alternate with the international EST Forum in Asia. A suggestion for improvement was to have countries identify one contact person who is responsible for monitoring and reporting on their country's progress toward targets.

Undoubtedly the major factor in the continuing success of this EST Forum in Asia is the credibility and consistency of the event and the enthusiasm by countries of the region to be involved. This is shown, for example, by the queue of countries requesting to host the event. In November 2018 the event will be held in Mongolia.

The UNCRD Environment Section in Nagoya provide consistency with a well organised team, a slick forward planning process and a can-do attitude ably led by their team leader. Champions in UNESCAP and SloCaT (now both semi-retired) have assisted and helped this management team to deliver a well organised event, year after year, with mostly high quality content. Eminent professionals in the field facilitate sessions. The event planning commences nine months in advance and background papers are produced for all sessions from experts in their field on a particular topic.

The Forum itself is an achievement as it is delivered through UN systems that can be cumbersome and overly bureaucratic. This slows the processes and limits opportunities for flexibility and innovation.

3.2 Transport related multilateral forums in Asia

Transport has a wide range of conferences and forums in Asia, very few of which can be defined as multilateral and most are sub-regional. For instance, there are transport forums for Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Program and Greater Mekong Subregion, GMS. Both are ADB funded but they are small and project focused. The two relevant forums that head the field for developing countries participation and for multilaterism are the EST Forum and the ADB's Transport Forum followed by the Clean Air Asia Forum providing a more topic focused event.

ADB transport Forum

The first ADB transport Forum was held on the 9-12 September 2008 and was initiated by DFID's global Transport Knowledge Partnership, gTKP, programme in cooperation with ADB's transport anchor at the time. It was inaugurated to launch the sustainable transport work of ADB and to highlight the research of DFID, the outputs of the South East Asia Community Access Programme, SEACAP, and to raise awareness of the opportunity to be involved with the DFID funded gTKP knowledge portal. Since that time it has become arguably the largest gathering of transport officials and stakeholders in Asia and the Pacific mainly due to a larger coverage than EST by reaching out to the Pacific and Central Asia. It is aimed at decision makers to discuss and share project updates, policies and issues, best practices and new innovations in the area of sustainable transport. The Forum is arranged around topic sessions similar to the EST and now has a capacity building day that precedes the main event. In its current operation, it is not intended to attract transport Ministers and is not well attended by ADB staff. This is mainly due to it not being promoted as an internal capacity building/knowledge sharing opportunity as it is perceived by ADB staff as an external event to market ADB projects and impress donors. External participants' feedback appears to be not available.

Better Air Quality Conference (BAQ)

Clean Air Asia is an international NGO with offices in China and India and around 8 country programmes in Asia. The programmes are concerned with reducing pollution from motor vehicles, electricity production and industry. The biennial Better Air Quality Conference (BAQ) is a well-attended regional air quality conference with a specific focus on abating pollution.

Other meetings

There are numerous other regional forums divided into categories such as topic/mode, or research, trade fairs and large NGO conferences. Examples of main meetings with a topic or mode are the ITS Asia-Pacific Forum that seeks to facilitate Intelligent Transport Systems (ITS) cooperation and coordination between countries/areas in the Asia-Pacific region. The Singapore International Transport Congress and Exhibition (SITCE) promotes and exhibits public transport

innovation. It is organised by Singapore's Land Transport Authority, LTA and the Union Internationale des Transports Publics, UITP.

Some Forums are related to research as in the International Conference of Eastern Asia Society for Transportation Research. Some large NGO conferences are intermittent and topic focused such as International Road Federation regional conferences.

3.3 Transport Related Multilateral forums in Africa

Exploratory meeting for developing an EST Forum for Africa

At the SSATP meeting In April 2013 in Nairobi, Kenya, a side meeting was held organized by Africa Transport Policy Program (SSATP) in partnership with UN Habitat and the World Bank Africa Sustainable Development Department to discuss the establishment of the Environmentally Sustainable Transport (EST) Forum for Africa following the results of a stakeholder consultation process on that subject. An EST Forum was seen at the time to be a useful and necessary platform for high-level discussions on sustainable transport, environment, human health and human settlements. It was seen as Africa's response to the successful EST Forum in Asia.

The Africa Sustainable Transport Forum (ASTF)

The Africa Sustainable Transport Forum (ASTF) held its 1st Ministerial and Experts Conference on 28 to 30 October 2014 at the UN Headquarters in Nairobi, Kenya. The event was hosted by the Kenyan Government and organised by UNEP, supported by UN-Habitat with financial support from the SSATP programme based in the World Bank. The Ministerial Session of the Forum was officially opened by the UN Secretary General Mr. Ban Ki-moon and the President of Kenya. It brought together representatives of 43 African countries, with 21 Ministers of environment and transport in attendance. The Forum agenda focused on the challenges of delivering sustainable transport in Africa, and discussed solutions in the context of green growth and emissions reductions. The resulting action framework that was presented to Ministers was grouped into four priority areas: road safety; vehicles and emissions; accessibility and sustainable infrastructure; and, enabling conditions. The framework also had recommendations for the future of the ASTF. Led by UNEP it focused on emissions and urban mobility.

There are ideas to have another ASTF like event in the future. Governments just adopted a UN Resolution on Air Quality referring to the ASTF in Africa. Although no subsequent ASTF has been organised, the report of the meeting indicated that there is much interest with decision makers in Africa on their transport future. The ASTF has not been repeated and there is currently a vacuum for a Forum that is focused on the opportunities for Africa to move towards a more sustainable transport system. The ASTF was a major undertaking (with a major price tag), bringing together experts and Ministers from the continent. Its primary purpose was to bring sustainable transport to the political agenda in Africa.

African Clean Mobility week

UNEP have followed up on the ASTF with several specific programs and implementing a wide set of activities in Africa, including sustainable transport projects in 28 African countries, together with a regional and sub-regional programme. Topics include clean fuels and vehicles, electric mobility, clean busses, walking and cycling, clean ports, motorcycles. Also, in March 2018, they will be organizing an African Clean Mobility week in Nairobi focusing mainly on city issues.

However, in the near future UNEP's preference would be to have less general and more focused meetings to promote sustainable transport in Africa, for example, the clean mobility week. UNEP's

strategy is to develop more country and city initiatives and programs, promoting sustainable mobility roadmaps for African cities and countries.

The African Development Bank Transport Forum

The first African Development Bank Transport Forum took place in November 2015 at the headquarters of the African Development Bank, in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, under the theme 'Sustainable Transport for an Integrated Africa'. The meeting had a wide range of topics that focused on investigating sustainable solutions to the continent's transport and integration challenges. The Forum also aimed to share best practices and experiences, promote research and development, and stimulate professional networking with the 260 participants. It brought together a range of government representatives, experts, development partners, international organizations, the private sector, academia, NGOs and other selected stakeholders. It has not been repeated, and there are no known plans to do so.

The former Sub-Saharan, now Africa Transport Policy programme, SSATP, is a partnership of 40 African countries, 8 Regional Economic Communities, 2 African institutions (UN Economic Commission for Africa, UNECA, and African Union's New Partnership for Africa's Development, AU/NEPAD) and has financing partners of which the main one, by far, is the European Commission. It has an objective of holding an annual meeting but a challenging political environment, personnel changes in the Secretariat, loose meeting management and a failure to hold a meeting in three years has damaged its reputation. Its annual meeting held in 2017 in Marrakech themed 'African Transport Policies aligning with the sustainable development goals' was the first meeting since 2013. SSATP lost its connection at country level provided by World Bank staff, following a strategic decision from the World Bank Board to disconnect SSATP activities from World Bank projects. It has also suffered from capacity restraints at the secretariat. It further lost connection as it alternates between an English-speaking and a French-speaking focus. The annual budget of around US\$1.8 is mostly spent on World Bank staff costs and the annual meeting. The Annual Meeting has in the past had both a practitioners' element and Ministerial section. For many years it has fulfilled the global development community's criteria of pan Sub-Saharan Africa focus, multilateral funding, high level participation, donor and multilateral bank and NGO and government participation, virtually alone. Its main achievement is to highlight the importance of policies for good planning and it has been acknowledged for the work done on road funds.

The SSATP have a stated strategy objective to launch a web-based Environmentally Sustainable Transport Forum for Africa (EST-Africa). It is intended that the Forum will serve as a regional cooperation mechanism that would engage the participants from countries of Africa into a policy dialogue about the challenges posed by the need for environmental sustainability in the transport sector, while meeting long-term development goals. It is intended to have a policy-oriented forum to have a permanent on-line presence, seen by practitioners as the place to go for information, guidance, tools, and references to ensure that transport planning is carried out in an environmentally sustainable way, but there is little evidence of any progress on this initiative.

AU/NEPAD meetings

The Africa Union Heads of State and Government assembly is the governing body for the African Union Commission (AUC). It coordinates with various initiatives including infrastructure in Africa, Programme for Infrastructure Development in Africa (PIDA), New partnership for Africa's Development, NEPAD, Planning and Coordinating Agency (NPCA) and the African Development Bank (AfDB), the G20 Infrastructure Action Plan, Infrastructure Consortium for Africa (ICA), EU-Africa Infrastructure Trust Fund and Africa Infrastructure Country Diagnostic that all highlight the importance of regional infrastructure for Africa's growth.

NEPAD has held two Rural Development Forums, with the support of OECD, CIRAD, FAO, GIZ, AfDB, of which the second one was held in September 2016 in Cameroon. Although with more of an economic focus rather than transport, the meeting created a platform for peer learning from raising awareness, lesson learning and aligning policies.

Transport sub-sector conferences

At a less multilateral level, transport sub-sector conferences and exhibitions take place such as the February 2017, i-transport and the Africa Chapter of the International Public Transport Association, UATP “Go Green – Go Smart” Conference and Exhibition. It is aimed at collective synergies on implementing and managing integrated and sustainable transport systems by aligning transport, land-use and economic planning to assist the Public Transport and Intelligent Transport opportunities.

The Africa Transport Technology Transfer (T2) Conference is held every 2 years sharing best practices and new technologies of all modes of transport. It is organized by The Association of Southern African National Roads Agencies (ASANRA) in association with transport ministries and agencies of the member states of the Southern African Development Community, (SADC).

PIARC and IRF hold occasional regional meetings on the road sector, but not at multilateral level.

Research papers are presented at the annual Southern African Transport Conference (SATC) and CSIR has a biennial meeting sharing the CSIR’s scientific, engineering and technology innovations and interventions to peers and collaborators.

4 Conclusions

4.1 Lessons Learnt and going forward

Transferring the success of the EST in Asia to Africa is not straight forward as previous efforts have shown. The ASTF arranged by UNEP with SSATP-funding and some UN-Habitat support has not been repeated and the relationship has weakened. The ASTF Secretariat is now housed at UNEP and has been working to secure wide uptake of the Action Framework across Africa and catalyse activities to achieve more sustainable transport on the ground. A presence at sub-regional or topic-led meetings and small capacity building projects has been achieved. The UNEP secretariat has a focused and defined area of intervention that does not include rural transport.

Large multilateral meetings led by UN are expensive but have a distinct advantage of protocol in connecting to governments at high level. UN and development banks usually deliver on the criteria of multilateralism and high level participation both by Ministers and implementing decision makers. The feedback received from the UN agencies and the development banks is that there is a need for an EST type Forum in Africa, but that there is a reluctance to take the lead and shoulder the cost.

Key Success factors are discussed in paragraph 4.2 below, but it was driven by a single member State (Japan) with the resources to fund an organisation (UNCRD) to develop the Forum that made it happen. It was led and funded by the Japanese Environment Ministry, with support from the Transport Ministry, from a desire to have transport as policy priority to tackle the environmental and address transport issues arising from rapid economic growth in Asia. A loyal donor with a long-term vision is a key component for sustainability and delivery success.

There is no obvious existing institutional forum available in Africa matching the criteria of success, as exhibited by the EST Forum in Asia, for the objectives of DFID/ReCAP. For a regional multilateral platform attended by decision makers to be established it leaves two avenues of further exploration. One is to set up an EST Forum and the other is to compromise and become part of an existing meeting structure such as an AU/NEPAD event or taking on greater risk in getting closer to SSATP.

Secretariat duties are of major importance. A strong champion within a UN organisation appears to be a winning formula, and UNCRD have shown distinct competence in this regard. Unfortunately they do not have the capacity to take on this extra work, although they certainly have the experience, procedures and processes to achieve an EST Forum for Africa. They have however given some positive signals that if resources were made available and an ex-UN organiser was made available in Africa it could work. Another route could be to second an ex-UN-official to the AU/NEPAD to work on rural transport and take the lead in organising the annual meeting.

To achieve an ongoing high quality forum, whether it is on environmentally sustainable, or rural, transport, it may be necessary to provide all the funds needed for the first two or three years, whilst actively seeking organising and funding partners. SSATP and AfDB may be prepared to offer some financial support for an Environmentally Sustainable Transport forum, as may some donors such as Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation, NORAD.

Alternatively, a more cautious approach may be to find a partner in AU/NEPAD to hold an regular meeting with less ambition, such as an annual Regional Sustainable Rural Access Forum. Again this may need the seconded expert and seed funding.

4.2 Recommendations

Scenario 1. - DFID/ReCAP takes a pro-active role in finding partners in order to organise an EST Forum in Africa. This will protect its investments in rural access and contribute to SuM4All objectives. In addition the DFID funded High volume Transport HVT project may wish to be joint sponsors of the event.

Following on from the inaugural ASTF in Nairobi there is an opportunity to create an ongoing EST/AST Forum in Africa with institutional partners such as UNCRD and UN-Habitat. Economies of scale and efficiencies could be achieved with cross-regional linkages if a regional exchange platform is set up with the EST Asia Forum.

UNCRD have indicated willingness to provide a secretariat if funding becomes available.

AfDB may be interested in collaborating following on from their first African Development Bank Transport Forum in 2015, as may SSATP. Other funders from development banks and aid agencies may be available. This would also satisfy the multilateral requirements. It should be recognized that initially funding may not be forthcoming and DFID/ReCAP may have to solely finance the US\$250,000 price tag of a forum.

Scenario 2. - DFID/ReCAP take a supportive role in funding and championing a rural transport component of an existing Forum or a separate 'Sustainable Rural Transport (SRT) forum.

There may be an opportunity with AU/NEPAD that ReCAP utilise the NEPAD structure to assist them to organise a High level Regional Rural Transport Forum. In this way a cost effective and focused Forum could be held that delivers on the criteria. This scenario may have a higher level of risk attached as AU/NEPAD are broad based and previously have not shown a significant interest in this idea. Perhaps a broader transport portfolio may bring about more traction but the process is untried and may or may not happen.

Scenario 3 - DFID/ReCAP engage with SSATP for their upcoming preparation of the 4th development plan of the SSATP which is essentially work objectives and workplan document. These preparations are ongoing and a meeting will be convened in May 2018 to gain consensus and agree the 4th development plan. DFID/ReCAP may wish to consider that they could arrange a rural transport meeting with SSATP as there is a rural transport and mobility element of the SSATP current plan in Pillar 2 'transport management'. It would probably attract a lower level audience and could be regional, but may be difficult to attain multilateral attendance. Another route might be to lobby and secure a session in the annual meeting on rural transport. This would probably attain a higher level of participation but annual meetings may not happen and may be managed by the under-resourced SSATP secretariat.

Key Success factors

From the analysis carried out for this report it would indicate that the continuing success and prominence of the EST Forum is based on six key success factors

1. A strong funded neutral and competent secretariat with a 'champion type' leader
2. A long-term donor loyalty with committed funding (theme priority e.g. environment, poverty)

3. UN protocols connect to governments at high level for Ministerial/Senior civil servant attendance and support
4. Champions from UN organisations, multilateral development banks and major development organisations are supportive and pro-active
5. Formatted to be a useful networking opportunity
6. Consistent high quality conduit of relevant knowledge

Table 2 - Scenarios advantages/risk assessment against KSF

Scenario - Advantages	KSF	Risk assessment
<i>Scenario 1</i> Strong secretariat available Cost efficient Successful format High Level attendance Networking opportunity	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The secretariat is not as capable and committed as the Asian EST secretariat
	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The funding is short-term or other donors do not commit
	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A new event and not seen as a high level event
	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • World Bank see it as a competitor to SSATP or AfDB see it as a competitor to their transport forum or UNEP see it as not in line with their Mobility meetings
	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends upon attendance
	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends on the quality of staff arranging it and content relevance to transport issues
<i>Scenario 2</i> Existing networks and initiatives NEPAD well respected	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Secretariat performance is outside the field of influence (an implant would be needed)
	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding would fall upon DFID entirely
	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not seen as a high level event and AU/NEPAD priority
	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not seen as in-line with UN or multilaterals/development bank policy as not convincing in attracting wider audiences and multilateral partners
	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends upon attendance
	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends on the quality of staff arranging it and content relevance to development issues as rural transport is not a priority issue
<i>Scenario 3</i> Already exists and well known Existing structure and secretariat Familiar meeting scenario	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The SSATP has capacity issues within the secretariat.
	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A low cost add-on to an existing programme, although large overheads with fungible funding
	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can be highly overpoliticized and unmanageable
	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There may be a dilution of the message as SSATP is a multi-topic event and rural transport is not a priority
	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This depends on the relevant people to rural transport attending a general event
	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depends on the quality of staff arranging it and content relevance to transport issues

4.3 Next steps

- A dialogue with DFID to discuss the Report
- A next step plan agreed

It is recommended that further work is carried out to reinforce the findings of the Report and reach out to a wider audience in consultation to find the level of support. It is also recommended that the project management of the DFID High Volume Roads project be involved in those consultations.

Further work on the Report could be undertaken to produce a paper on the results of the investigations and to deliver this paper at the 2018 SARF/IRF/PIARC Regional Conference for Africa and the 11th EST Forum for Asia in Mongolia in November 2108.

For the scenarios:-

Scenario 1

A consultant is appointed to canvass support within the various African multilaterals and also to engage with potential financial supporters through visits to the various African institutions, such as the AfDB, AU/NEPAD, SSATP, UN-Habitat. The objective should be to firm-up on co-organisers of a long-term programme of Forums held annually in the countries across the region alternating with Anglo and Francophile countries. Also consultations should be made with potential funders to secure, for as long-term as possible, funding for an EST.

Also included

- Coordination with EST planning
- Consultation with main organisations
- Consultation with the HVT project management
- Regional Workshop to harvest ideas and support

Scenario 2

A consultant is appointed to examine the opportunity with AU/NEPAD that ReCAP utilise the NEPAD structure to assist them to organise a High level Sustainable Rural Transport Forum. In this way a cost effective and focused Forum could be held that delivers on the criteria. This scenario may have a higher level of risk attached as AU/NEPAD are broad based and have not shown a significant interest in this idea previously. There may be greater reaction to a broader transport portfolio and coordination with the DFID High Volume Transport HVT project may bring about more traction but the process is untried and may or may not happen.

Scenario 3

A consultant is appointed to coordinate with SSATP in their upcoming preparation of the 4th development plan of the SSATP for influencing their work objectives and workplan document. The consultant would be involved with the preparations for a meeting that will be convened in May 2018 to gain consensus and agree the 4th development plan.

References

All declarations, statements and reviews appertaining to the EST Forum for Asia are on the UNCRD website: <http://www.uncrd.or.jp/index.php?menu=384> [Accessed on: 02-01-2018]

ASTF action framework is available from the meeting outcome document

Website:

https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/16816/ASTF_OutcomedocumentFinal.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y [Accessed on: 04-02-2018]

Victoria Policy Institute (2017). Insight to Implementation of the Bangkok 2020 Declaration - Policy Trends and Developments, Challenges and Opportunities. In: 10th Regional EST Forum in Asia, 14-16 March 2017, Vientiane. Available at:

http://www.uncrd.or.jp/content/documents/5042Lao%20EST%20Forum%20-Background%20presentations_Plenary%20Session%209.pdf [Access on: 26-02-2018].