

Basic education and employment

Catherine Grant

Institute of Development Studies

18.11.2016

Question

What are the different employment outcomes and cost effectiveness differences between public vs. private basic education (primary and lower secondary) in low and middle income countries and what accounts for any difference (disaggregated by gender as appropriate)?

Do either private or public education systems focus more greatly on providing students with foundation skills (literacy and numeracy skills) and does this have an impact on employment outcomes?

What is the relative value for money of basic child education (primary and lower secondary) vs. programmes focusing on providing foundation skills e.g. to out of school youth, if the main benefit measure is higher skilled/waged employment

Table of contents

1. Overview
2. Key findings
3. Methodology
4. Evidence
5. Evidence Summary Table

The K4D helpdesk service provides brief summaries of current research, evidence, and lessons learned. Helpdesk reports are not rigorous or systematic reviews; they are intended to provide an introduction to the most important evidence related to a research question. They draw on a rapid desk-based review of published literature and consultation with subject specialists.

Helpdesk reports are commissioned by the UK Department for International Development and other Government departments, but the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of DFID, the UK Government, K4D or any other contributing organisation. For further information, please contact helpdesk@k4d.info.

1. Overview

This review provides a summary of existing research on:

- What are the different employment outcomes and cost effectiveness differences between public vs. private basic education (primary and lower secondary) in low and middle income countries and what accounts for any difference (disaggregated by gender as appropriate)?
- Do either private or public education systems focus more greatly on providing students with foundation skills (literacy and numeracy skills) and does this have an impact on employment outcomes?
- What is the relative value for money of basic child education (primary and lower secondary) vs. programmes focusing on providing foundation skills e.g. to out of school youth, if the main benefit measure is higher skilled/waged employment?

This report is not a systematic review, but aims to capture a substantial portion of the literature offering evidence on this topic, including the most important and useful papers to guide policy-making. It provides an annotated bibliography of the literature, followed by an evidence summary table assessing the literature according to DFID's 'strength of evidence' guidelines¹.

Definitions

- Basic education is defined as primary plus lower secondary education.
- The Global Monitoring report defines 'foundation skills' as the literacy and numeracy skills necessary for getting work that can pay enough to meet daily needs. These skills are a prerequisite for continuing in education and training, and for acquiring transferable, technical and vocational skills that improve the chance of achieving employment.

This is based on the definitions used in DFID's position paper².

Another useful definition of foundation skills is: The ability to read, write and use numbers, to handle information, express ideas and opinions, make decisions and solve problems, as family members, workers, citizens and lifelong learners³.

2. Key findings

What are the different employment outcomes and cost effectiveness differences between public vs. private basic education (primary and lower secondary) in low and middle income countries and what accounts for any difference (disaggregated by gender as appropriate)?

¹ DFID (2014) Assessing the Strength of Evidence. How To Note. Department for International Development. London: UK. https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/291982/HTN-strength-evidence-march2014.pdf

² DFID (2013) Education position paper: Improving learning, expanding opportunities. Department for International Development. London: UK https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/225715/Education_Position_Paper_July_2013.pdf

³ Adult Literacy and Numeracy in Scotland (2001) Scottish Government, UK <http://www.gov.scot/Resource/Doc/158952/0043191.pdf>

Employment Outcomes

- South Asia and especially Sub-Saharan Africa face the largest youth employment challenge in terms of size and share of the youth population. These are also the regions where vulnerable employment shares (self-employment and unpaid work) are highest, particularly in the low-income countries. Vulnerable employment and working poverty are highest among youth with no or little education and in rural areas (Pieters 2013).
- Research has identified a gap in the literature resulting from the limited types of research design used to study the role and impact of private education providers. In particular, there is a striking paucity of longitudinal research that can indicate trends over time – either in individual academic achievement or system-wide effects (Day et al 2014).
- The effects of private schooling on equity are currently limited to snapshot or cross-sectional designs. This leaves unanswered questions about the long-term impact of private schooling on employment, social mobility, or, given the gender differential, women's economic participation (Day et al 2014).
- Few in-depth analyses or ethnographic studies have looked at the effects of private schooling on household poverty over time (Day et al 2014).
- Comparative work is thin, leaving little room for meaningful comparison across and within contexts (Day et al 2014).
- The evidence on education largely does not specifically connect primary education with employment. Instead it usually highlights whether secondary and tertiary education have effects on youth employment (Browne 2016)
- There is long-standing evidence that the effects of schooling on productivity (and hence incomes and poverty reduction) is much more marked when there is a dynamic, supportive environment surrounding schools (Palmer 2005).
- The young person with the lowest level of education is the least likely to be unemployed. But also the most likely to be in vulnerable, precarious self-employment. Poorly educated youth are more likely to work in agriculture and higher educational attainment is evident in industry and services, where productivity levels are generally also higher. In general, earnings tend to rise in accordance with workers' levels of educational attainment and those with higher qualifications and/or more work experience can expect to earn more (Browne 2016).

Cost effectiveness

- There is moderate strength evidence that the cost of education delivery is lower in private schools than in state schools often due to the lower salaries of private school teachers (Day et al 2014).
- Most of the evidence does not rigorously analyse the cost-effectiveness of private schools. However there is some limited evidence indicating a relationship between lower costs of education delivery and cost-effectiveness in certain contexts (Day et al 2014).
- Moderate strength evidence indicates that private schools tend to be more expensive than state schools, both in terms of school fees and hidden costs such as uniforms and books. However there is some variation in certain contexts, for example according to private school registration status (Day et al 2014).

- Private schools are more cost-effective than government schools and are financially sustainable. Private schools, the evidence shows, have lower cost of education delivery than government schools; in combination with their higher quality levels this would suggest greater cost effectiveness. Using the proxy measure of length of operation of private schools, private schools are very clearly financially sustainable. Even stronger circumstantial evidence comes from the vast number of private schools: so many educational entrepreneurs would not be entering these markets if they did not believe the schools to be financially sustainable (Tooley et al 2014)

What accounts for the difference?

- There are unanswered questions about the long-term impact of private schooling on employment, social mobility, or, given the gender differential, women's economic participation (Day et al 2014).
- 'Private schools may mitigate gender differences ... if private schools fulfil differentiated demand (e.g., provide local schools so that girls do not have to travel far or provide separate toilets for girls and boys), availability of private schools will increase girls' access to schooling and learning and thus reduce the gender gap in literacy' (Pal and Kingdon, 2010, p. 4) (Tooley et al 2014).
- Middle-income countries in the Southern Mediterranean and Sub-Saharan Africa have the world's highest youth unemployment rates. Youth unemployment rates tend to rise with education and are higher in urban areas. Women fare much worse than men in these regions, both in terms of unemployment and vulnerable employment (Pieters 2013).
- The school-to-work transition of young people has to be analysed taking into account of parallel key early life transitions, including cohabitation, marriage and childbearing.

Do either private or public education systems focus more greatly on providing students with foundation skills (literacy and numeracy skills) and does this have an impact on employment outcomes?

Evidence from Day et al's literature review:

- Some evidence indicates variation in the relative performance of private school pupils in different subject areas. Kingdon (2008) concludes that private unaided schools are 27 percent more effective than private aided schools in their mathematics teaching in Uttar Pradesh. Using data from Andhra Pradesh, Singh and Sarkar (2012) similarly find a private school advantage in mathematics (though attainment was still lower than expected). Notably, however, in Kingdon's analysis (2008), all three school types studied (government, private aided and private unaided) were equally effective in imparting reading skills.
- By contrast, emerging work by Muralidharan and Sundararaman (2013) reports that children in private schools in Andhra Pradesh are performing better in English and Hindi, and no worse in mathematics and Telugu. This is in spite of the fact that 40 percent less instruction time is dedicated to these subjects in private than in government schools (Muralidharan and Sundararaman (2013)).

- Dixon et al.'s (2013) multi-level regression analysis in the Kibera slums of Nairobi finds a positive relationship between attendance in private schools and test scores in mathematics and Kiswahili, but not English.
- One explanation given by the authors (which is also relevant in other multilingual contexts) is that English language skills, unlike mathematics, tend to be additionally learned outside the school environment, in the wider community. This leads to the broader question of the extent to which pupil attainment advantage relates to what is learned inside the school and outside the school, and where the latter is concerned socioeconomic background is likely to be key.

What is the relative value for money of basic child education (primary and lower secondary) vs. programmes focusing on providing foundation skills e.g. to out of school youth, if the main benefit measure is higher skilled/waged employment?

- The most successful adolescent remediation programmes are not as effective as the most successful early childhood and elementary school programmes, although adolescent mentoring and the provision of information can be very effective. Building an early base of skills that promote later-life learning and engagement in school and society is often a better strategy than waiting for problems to occur. Prevention is more effective than remediation if at-risk populations are sufficiently well targeted (Kautz et al 2014).
- The most common type of intervention for youth is skills training, or Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) (Browne 2016).
- TVET interventions demonstrate an overall positive effect, with the evidence being stronger for formal employment and monthly earnings than for paid employment and weekly hours worked. In contrast, the overall effect on self-employment earnings was found to be negative (Browne 2016).
- There is a strong message from the TVET literature that it works, but only when it offers comprehensive and complementary training, with links to the labour market. Single-component TVET interventions are not successful (Browne 2016).
- There is evidence of training programmes in developing countries having a positive impact on future employment and earnings (Thompson et al 2016).
- A solid general education is required as a basis for youth development and for future employment opportunities. For the disadvantaged, skills acquisition is more effective when built on a solid foundation of good quality basic education (Adams et al. 2013)
- Skills training has resulted in increased self-awareness, empathy, decision making, goal setting, and communication skills for youth pressure (Olenik and Takyi-Laryea 2013).
- Cognitive skills are linked to increases in incomes and employment chances generally, technical skills training is shown to be more effective when focused on skills closely linked to market demand (Thompson et al 2016).
- Women may benefit from skills training more than men because they are often starting from a greater state of disadvantage in the labour market (Adams 2011).
- Vocational education systems may benefit from reform in developing countries. However, it is essential to remember that TVET does not guarantee a solution to youth unemployment. Skills and employment are intrinsically related to overall growth, development and innovation pathways. Policies that promote access to general

education and business development are likely to support skills training initiatives (Thompson et al 2016).

- At the level of TVET system reform, there is a consensus that involving all stakeholders, most particularly employers, in the design and delivery of training, contributes to better outcomes for all. There have been many attempts to reform funding regimes, including through levy-grant systems, but there is a lack of conclusive evidence on their efficacy. Indeed, it appears that systems may need to be well-functioning before these reforms are effective (Dunbar 2013).
- There is evidence that apprenticeship programmes provide good quality access to training and to new technology, and are a strong route into decent employment (Thompson et al 2016).
- Second-chance education programmes for youth who did not have previous access to basic education are also a worthy investment. Basic literacy and numeracy skills are the foundation to any technical skills required in the world of work, and are best acquired through education up to lower-secondary level. Whenever young people have not completed education to that stage, a gap of “foundation skills” is likely to exist (UNESCO, 2012). Ad-hoc programmes can fill that gap, by offering a mix of literacy and numeracy teaching, combined with technical training courses.
- Children who are in school learn too little each year; many of those who manage to complete primary school, do so without gaining the foundation skills of reading, writing and numeracy, let alone being prepared to face the challenges of the 21st century.

Evidence from OECD countries which may provide some input into the debate on the impact in low and middle income countries (OECD 2014):

- People with a tertiary education in OECD countries are more likely to have a job, and to be working full-time, than those without.
- Unemployment rates are higher among people who do not have an upper secondary education (14% on average across OECD countries) than among those who have a tertiary education (5%).
- People with at least an upper secondary education are more likely to have a job than those without this level of education.
- The employment rate is considerably higher among men (80%) than among women (65%), although the gap is narrowest among tertiary-educated individuals and widest among those without an upper secondary education.
- Students who attend private schools tend to perform significantly better than students who attend public schools; but students, from public or private schools, in a similar socio-economic context tend to do equally well.
- Students who attend private schools tend to perform significantly better than students who attend public schools; but students, from public or private schools, in a similar socio-economic context tend to do equally well.

3. Methodology

The literature searched was included based on the following criteria:

- Low and middle income countries

- Asia, Africa, Latin America
- Peer-reviewed and grey literature
- English language literature
- Primary empirical studies (including modelling and case studies but not theoretical or conceptual studies without empirical analysis) and reviews of empirical studies
- All research regardless of the date published, quality, and method (within the limits above).

Experts were contacted during the course of the research, but none were able provide input within the short timeframe available for this report.

4. Evidence

Day Ashley L, Mcloughlin C, Aslam M, Engel J, Wales J, Rawal S, Batley R, Kingdon G, Nicolai S, Rose P (2014) The role and impact of private schools in developing countries: a rigorous review of the evidence. Final report. Education Rigorous Literature Review. Department for International Development.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/439702/private-schools-full-report.pdf

A multi-pronged search strategy was used which entailed: (i) searching a wide range of citation and journal indexes; (ii) using key search terms; (iii) building on recent policy-oriented reviews; and (iv) verifying an initial master bibliography. A set of inclusion criteria was applied to the bibliography. This resulted in 59 studies included in the rigorous review. All included studies have been assessed as high or medium quality, have been published in the past five years, and focus on DFID priority countries.

Impact on employment

This research identified a gap in the literature resulting from the limited types of research design used to study the role and impact of private education providers. In particular, there is a striking paucity of longitudinal research that can indicate trends over time – either in individual academic achievement or system-wide effects. Consequently, there is currently limited understanding of the long-term effects of donor or government interventions on the quality of private provision. Likewise, studies of the effects of private schooling on equity are currently limited to snapshot or cross-sectional designs. This leaves unanswered questions about the long-term impact of private schooling on employment, social mobility, or, given the gender differential, women’s economic participation. Likewise, few in-depth analyses or ethnographic studies have looked at the effects of private schooling on household poverty over time. In addition, comparative work is thin, leaving little room for meaningful comparison across and within contexts.

Impact on teaching skills such as numeracy and literacy

Some evidence indicates variation in the relative performance of private school pupils in different subject areas. Kingdon (2008) concludes that private unaided schools are 27 percent more effective than private aided schools in their mathematics teaching in Uttar Pradesh. Using data from Andhra Pradesh, Singh and Sarkar (2012) similarly find a private school advantage in mathematics (though attainment was still lower than expected). Notably, however, in Kingdon’s analysis (2008), all three school types studied (government, private aided and private unaided) were equally effective in imparting reading skills. By contrast, emerging work by Muralidharan

and Sundararaman (2013) reports that children in private schools in Andhra Pradesh are performing better in English and Hindi, and no worse in mathematics and Telugu. This is in spite of the fact that 40 percent less instruction time is dedicated to these subjects in private than in government schools (Muralidharan and Sundararaman (2013)). Dixon et al.'s (2013) multi-level regression analysis in the Kibera slums of Nairobi finds a positive relationship between attendance in private schools and test scores in mathematics and Kiswahili, but not English. One explanation given by the authors (which is also relevant in other multilingual contexts) is that English language skills, unlike mathematics, tend to be additionally learned outside the school environment, in the wider community. This leads to the broader question of the extent to which pupil attainment advantage relates to what is learned inside the school and outside the school, and where the latter is concerned socioeconomic background is likely to be key.

Cost effectiveness

There is moderate strength evidence that the cost of education delivery is lower in private schools than in state schools often due to the lower salaries of private school teachers. Most of the evidence does not rigorously analyse the cost-effectiveness of private schools. However there is some limited evidence indicating a relationship between lower costs of education delivery and cost-effectiveness in certain contexts.

Moderate strength evidence indicates that private schools tend to be more expensive than state schools, both in terms of school fees and hidden costs such as uniforms and books. However there is some variation in certain contexts, for example according to private school registration status.

Supply

There is strong evidence that teaching in private schools is better –in terms of more teacher presence and teaching activity, and approaches to teaching that are more likely to lead to improved outcomes – than in state schools. The review found moderate strength evidence that pupils attending private school tend to achieve better learning outcomes than pupils in state schools. There is moderate strength evidence that the cost of education delivery is lower in private schools than in state schools often due to the lower salaries of private school teachers. Most of the evidence does not rigorously analyse the cost-effectiveness of private schools. However there is some limited evidence indicating a relationship between lower costs of education delivery and cost-effectiveness in certain contexts.

Demand

There is moderate strength evidence that perceived quality of education is a priority for users when choosing schools, and private schools are often perceived to be of higher quality than their government school counterparts.

Enabling environment

The evidence base on whether private schools complement government school provision is very small (and therefore weak). However, there is some evidence indicating supply-side synergies between government and private school provision. There is also evidence that private schools are not only filling gaps where supply of government schools is low, but also where government schools are performing poorly – indicating potential blurred boundaries between whether private schools are complementing or competing with government schools.

Who attends private schools?

The evidence is ambiguous about whether private schools geographically reach the poor. While they continue to cluster mainly in urban areas, private schools are increasingly prevalent in rural areas. However, most research cautions against assuming that this means they are increasingly accessible to the poor. Evidence on whether private schools are equally accessed by girls and boys is inconsistent and therefore weak. Although a number of studies indicate that girls are less likely to access private schools than boys, this finding is context specific. Some evidence is ambiguous in relation to the issue, and a minority of studies find that in certain contexts private schools reduce the gender gap that is found in state schools. The evidence on whether the poor are able to pay private school fees is ambiguous; most is neutral, some is negative, but there is no positive evidence. A few studies find that a very small minority of children of lower economic quintiles access private schools. Financial constraints are a key factor limiting or preventing poorer household enrolling their children in private schools. Where children of poorer households do attend private schools, research indicates that welfare sacrifices are made and continued attendance is difficult to sustain. However many studies did not adequately disaggregate data to indicate what household sacrifices are made to meet private school costs.

James Tooley and David Longfield, October 2014, The Role and Impact of Private Schools in Developing Countries: A Response to DFID's "Rigorous Literature Review", E.G. West Centre, Newcastle University

<https://eqwestcentre.files.wordpress.com/2012/07/the-role-and-impact-of-private-schools-in-developing-countries-a-response-to-dfid-s-rigorous-literature-review.pdf>

In several cases in Day's literature review, literature which clearly says one thing is presented as saying the opposite, or is much more nuanced than the Rigorous Review suggests.

Assumptions

The framing of several of the assumptions leads to a less favourable view of the role and impact of private schools than would assumptions framed only slightly differently; one in particular seems like a 'straw man' assumption, the wording of which makes it impossible to see private schools in a favourable light.

Evidence missed or duplicated

In several cases, evidence from the selected literature that could have informed the Assumptions is simply missed out; sometimes this evidence would completely turn around the conclusions reached. Evidence is also duplicated – studies using the same datasets are used as distinct pieces of evidence, thus lending greater support to certain conclusions than is warranted. Many of the articles accepted used research methods which should not have allowed for the kinds of generalisations made in the Rigorous Review. These criticisms notwithstanding, this Response uses only the studies selected by the Rigorous Review. With a revised analysis and modification of two of the assumptions, our Response finds that all 12 of the Assumptions are positive in favour of private schools, with the most important 10 out of these 12 moderately or strongly supported in terms of overall strength of evidence (Table 1- see below). Instead of the lukewarm conclusions about private schools, this leads to a much more positive assessment of their current and potential roles in development.

Private schools are more cost-effective than government schools and are financially sustainable. Private schools, the evidence shows, have lower cost of education delivery than government schools; in combination with their higher quality levels this would suggest greater cost effectiveness. Using the proxy measure of length of operation of private schools, private schools are very clearly financially sustainable. Even stronger circumstantial evidence comes from the vast number of private schools: so many educational entrepreneurs would not be entering these markets if they did not believe the schools to be financially sustainable

'Private schools may mitigate gender differences ... if private schools fulfil differentiated demand (e.g., provide local schools so that girls do not have to travel far or provide separate toilets for girls and boys), availability of private schools will increase girls' access to schooling and learning and thus reduce the gender gap in literacy' (Pal and Kingdon, 2010, p. 4).

Table 1 Findings of Rigorous Review and our revised findings

Assumption	According to Rigorous Review		Revised Assessment	
	Overall strength of evidence	Result ²	Overall strength of evidence	Result
1. Better learning outcomes	Moderate	+	Strong	+
2. Better teaching	Strong	+	Strong	+
3. Geographically reach poor	Weak, by definition (neutral findings)	0	Moderate	+
4. Equally accessible to girls	Moderate	-		
4*. Improve education for girls			Moderate	+
5. Cost of education delivery lower	Moderate	+	Moderate	+
6. Financially sustainable	Weak, by definition (small number of countries and studies)	-	Moderate	+
7. Poor(est) are able to pay fees	Weak, by definition (neutral findings)	0	Strong	+
8. Affordable as state schools	Weak, by definition (small number of studies)	-		
8* Nearly as affordable as state schools			Moderate	+
9. Perceived quality underpins choice	Moderate	+	Moderate	+
10. Choice is informed	Moderate	+	Moderate	+
11. Users participate in decisions	Weak, by definition (small number of studies)	+	Weak, by definition (small number of studies)	+
12. Responsive to user demands	Weak, by definition (small number of studies)	+	Weak, by definition (small number of studies)	+

Nag S, Chiat S, Torgerson C, Snowling MJ (2014) Literacy, Foundation Learning and Assessment in Developing Countries: Final Report. Education Rigorous Literature Review. Department for International Development

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/305150/Literacy-foundation-learning-assessment.pdf

Developing countries face distinct challenges in providing access to quality education. Educational provision also varies markedly in terms of teacher training, teaching and learning resources, school attendance, and motivation of parents, teachers and children for schooling. Against this backdrop, we consider the available evidence on foundation learning and literacy in order to identify key components for intervention that are appropriate to specific cultural and linguistic contexts. A fundamental assumption is that in order to increase the educational

attainments of children, it is critical to put in place high-quality teacher education; however this is beyond the scope of the current review.

The review was commissioned to address issues pertaining to foundation learning and literacy. We therefore included evidence on language and literacy learning from early childhood to Grade 8 (approximately 3-13 years), when the ability to read with understanding should be in place. We also decided to include mathematical reasoning and numeracy learning up to Grade 2 (approximately 3-8 years) as an example of a foundation skill critical to the development of numerical and scientific thinking. In conducting the review, we considered within-child factors, including cognitive and language skills, and contextual factors including home language and literacy environment, community practices and quality of opportunity as well as the social stratifiers and economic drivers that influence non-enrolment, poor attendance, and dropout. Finally, we included a rigorous evaluation of interventions.

Rankin, K, Cameron, DB, Ingraham, K, Mishra, A, Burke, J, Picon, M, Miranda, J and Brown, AN (2015.) Youth and transferable skills: an evidence gap map. 3ie Evidence Gap Report 2. New Delhi: International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie).

http://www.3ieimpact.org/media/filer_public/2016/07/05/egm2-youth_and_transferable_skills.pdf

Transferable skills, also referred to as soft skills and life skills, provide youth with the tools and confidence to succeed in terms of employment, health and personal well-being. This report summarises the findings of an evidence gap map on transferable skills programming for youth in low- and middle-income countries, as part of a project funded by the MasterCard Foundation and the MacArthur Foundation. Evidence gap maps created by the International Initiative for Impact Evaluation are visual representations of how much impact evaluation evidence exists for a given sector or policy issue according to the types of programmes evaluated and outcomes measured.

Kautz, T, Heckman, JJ, Diris, R, Ter Weel, B and Borghans, L, 2014. Fostering and measuring skills: improving cognitive and non-cognitive skills to promote lifetime success. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.

<https://www.oecd.org/edu/cei/Fostering-and-Measuring-Skills-Improving-Cognitive-and-Non-Cognitive-Skills-to-Promote-Lifetime-Success.pdf>

This paper reviews a variety of interventions targeted to different stages of the life cycle. We interpret all of the studies we examine within an economic model of skill development. While it is difficult to compare different interventions because they are often multifaceted and target different populations, nonetheless, four conclusions emerge.

First, the evidence base is larger on the long-term effectiveness of interventions that start in early childhood and elementary school compared to their adolescent counter-parts. Many evaluations of early programmes measure a diverse set of outcomes and have follow-ups lasting more than 20 years. Evidence on adolescent interventions is scarcer. Follow-ups for them are typically shorter and fewer outcomes are analysed over shorter horizons. For this reason, we can draw stronger conclusions about the long-run efficacy of early programmes and how they work.

Second, when evaluating skill enhancement programmes it is vital to consider outcomes other than IQ or achievement test scores. Only interventions that start long before kindergarten begins have been shown to have long-term effects on IQ. If IQ were the only measure of success, most intervention programmes would seem futile. Using a diverse set of outcomes presents a more optimistic point of view. Many early programmes improve later-life outcomes, even though they do not improve IQ. These programmes work because they foster non-cognitive skills. Some have annual rates of return that are comparable to those from investments in the stock market. Parental involvement is an important component of successful early interventions just as successful adolescent mentoring is an age-appropriate version of parental involvement.

Third, the available evidence suggests that the most successful adolescent remediation programmes are not as effective as the most successful early childhood and elementary school programmes, although adolescent mentoring and the provision of information can be very effective. Building an early base of skills that promote later-life learning and engagement in school and society is often a better strategy than waiting for problems to occur. Prevention is more effective than remediation if at-risk populations are sufficiently well targeted.

Fourth, adolescent remediation is possible for children who grow up in disadvantaged environments in their early years. The available evidence suggests that the most promising adolescent interventions are those that target non-cognitive skills as well as programmes that offer mentoring, guidance and information. Many adolescent programmes that focus on academic skills or temporarily change a participant's environment are only successful in the short run although the short-term results can often appear to be spectacular.

Workplace-based programmes that teach non-cognitive skills appear to be effective remedial interventions for adolescents. They motivate acquisition of work-relevant skills and provide for disadvantaged youth the discipline and guidance which is often missing in their homes or high schools. Successful interventions at any age emulate the mentoring and attachment that successful families give their children. Skills enable people. They are capacities to function. Greater levels of skill foster social inclusion and promote economic and social mobility. They generate economic productivity and create social well-being. Skills give agency to people to shape their lives, to create new skills and to flourish.

Palmer, R (2005) Beyond the Basics: Post-Basic Education, Training and Poverty Reduction in Ghana, Post-Basic Education and Training Working Paper Series - N°4

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08c5be5274a31e0001172/Palmer_Ghana_PBET_WP4.pdf

There is long-standing evidence that the effects of schooling on productivity (and hence incomes and poverty reduction) is much more marked when there is a dynamic, supportive environment surrounding schools (see King and Palmer, 2005). However, Ghanaian policy focus is very much on the education and training system as the solution to unemployment / under-employment and poverty reduction, rather than on the creation of a supportive decent and productive work environment. But, without a supportive decent and productive work environment, the education and training system cannot have any real impact on the problem of unemployment / under-employment or poverty reduction.

Apart from this 'work environment', other sectors/areas are crucial determinants of education/training outcomes. Three recent documents show a growing acknowledgement that

what happens outside of school is also a crucial determinant of these education/training outcomes. These are: UNESCO's most recent EFA Global Monitoring Report on educational quality (UNESCO, 2004), the UN Millennium Project Report (UNDP, 2005) and the World Bank's forthcoming policy paper on Education, the Education Sector Strategy Update (World Bank, 2005). Education and skills training alone cannot solve unemployment in Ghana. Both the delivery context and the wider supporting environment are weak. The education and training system in Ghana should not be seen in isolation from the other strategies, such as those for health, governance and decent work. The area of decent work is a crucial cross-cutting issue that needs to be seriously addressed. The current GPRS does not fully cover this issue having no clear informal sector strategy. There are no automatic outcomes to education and training and without a supportive internal and external context, in urban and rural areas, many of the desired developmental outcomes, including poverty reduction, will not occur, or occur unevenly and exacerbate inequality

Pieters, J (2013) Youth Employment in Developing Countries, IZA Research Report No. 58
http://www.iza.org/en/webcontent/publications/reports/report_pdfs/iza_report_58.pdf

South Asia and especially Sub-Saharan Africa face the largest youth employment challenge in terms of size and share of the youth population. These are also the regions where vulnerable employment shares (self-employment and unpaid work) are highest, particularly in the low-income countries. Vulnerable employment and working poverty are highest among youth with no or little education and in rural areas. – Middle-income countries in the Southern Mediterranean and Sub-Saharan Africa have the world's highest youth unemployment rates. Youth unemployment rates tend to rise with education and are higher in urban areas. Women fare much worse than men in these regions, both in terms of unemployment and vulnerable employment.

Cho, Y. and Honorati, M. (2014) Entrepreneurship programs in developing countries: A meta regression analysis. Labour Economics, 28, pp 110–130
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1596/1813-9450-6402>

The authors included 37 impact evaluations using experimental or quasi-experimental designs assessing the effects of interventions that aimed to promote entrepreneurial activities among current or potential entrepreneurs in developing countries over the past 10 years. The authors broadly categorised intervention types as training, financing, counselling or a combination of these, and they gathered information on six outcomes of interest: labour-market activities, labour-market income, financial behaviour, business knowledge and practice, business performance, and attitudes. The findings show that entrepreneurship programmes have a positive impact on business practices and labour-market activity, and no impact on the other outcomes.

Women appear to benefit most from financing support. They do not significantly benefit from entrepreneurship programmes, other than some improvements in empowerment-related outcomes. Private-sector delivery is strongly linked to programme success. Programmes delivered by the private sector and non-governmental organisations are more likely to be successful than those delivered by banks or microfinance institutions.

Tripney J, Hombrados J, Newman M, Hovish K, Brown C, Steinka-Fry K, Wilkey E. (2013) Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Interventions to Improve the Employability and Employment of Young People in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: A Systematic Review. Campbell Systematic Reviews 2013:9 DOI: 10.4073/csr.2013.9
<http://campbellcollaboration.org/lib/project/227/>

TVET interventions demonstrate an overall positive effect, with the evidence being stronger for formal employment and monthly earnings than for paid employment and weekly hours worked.

The authors included 26 studies assessing the effectiveness of 20 different TVET interventions in Latin America and the Caribbean (14 interventions), Europe, East Asia, South Asia and sub-Saharan Africa, between 2000 and 2011. The interventions are mostly provided by government, but also NGOs and private sector, which the authors do not differentiate in the results.

TVET interventions demonstrate an overall positive effect on paid employment, formal employment, monthly earnings, and weekly hours worked. In contrast, the overall effect on self-employment earnings was found to be negative. When the results are drilled down, the mean effects for paid employment, self-employment earnings, and working hours are negligible, and statistically insignificant. In contrast, the mean effects for formal employment and monthly earnings are larger (though still relatively small) and statistically significant. The overall mean effect of TVET on number of weekly hours worked was positive but non-significant. Average treatment effects for female trainees were positive, while those for male trainees were negative, suggesting that, at least in terms of increasing the number of hours worked, TVET works better for young women than young men. Overall, the existing evidence shows that TVET interventions have some promise, with the strength of the evidence being stronger for formal employment and monthly earnings than for the other outcomes measured.

The authors conclude that several limitations of the studies and the review mean that drawing strong inferences is not recommended. In the absence of evidence in support of one particular intervention, they suggest that opting for the cheapest and/or most culturally acceptable models may be the best approach.

Kluve J, Puerto S, Robalino D, Romero J M, Rother F, Stöterau J, Weidenkaff F, Witte M. (2016) Interventions to improve the labour market outcomes of youth: a systematic review of training, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services, and subsidized employment interventions. Geneva: International Labour Organization
http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/WCMS_327595/lang-en/index.htm

The overall results showed that ALMPs have a positive effect on youth labour market outcomes, particularly employment and earnings. Effects on business performance outcomes were limited. In LMICs skills training and entrepreneurship interventions produce the greatest impacts.

This systematic review analyses 113 impact evaluations published between 1990 and 2014 on labour market outcomes of youth. The interventions studied were active labour market programmes (ALMPs) that include at least one of: training and skills development, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services and/or subsidised employment. Outcomes measured were employment, earnings, or business performance. The evidence from LMICs was

mostly from interventions implemented by NGOs and donor organisations. There was no systematic evidence about the role of public, private or civil entities.

The overall results showed that ALMPs have a positive effect on youth labour market outcomes, particularly employment and earnings. Effects on business performance outcomes were limited. In LMICs skills training and entrepreneurship interventions produce the greatest impacts, especially for income gains, and combined multiple services and programme components lead to better outcomes. A comparison of short- vs. long-term estimates indicates that outcomes are greater when measured at least a year after exposure to the intervention. The systematic review captured information about the type of skills delivered to young people and found no particular connection between soft skills and better labour market outcomes. The review did not find differential effects by gender or age. A focus on low-income, disadvantaged, or low educated youth triggers higher employment and earnings gains for youth across all income levels.

The evidence calls for careful design of youth employment interventions. The “how” seems to be more important than the “what” and targeting disadvantaged youth as well as providing incentives for participation, appropriate profiling mechanisms and schemes to motivate service providers to perform effectively appear to act as key factors of success.

Browne, E, (2016) *What works in youth employment programmes?* HEART Helpdesk Report

Education

- The evidence on education largely does not specifically connect primary education with employment. Instead it usually highlights whether secondary and tertiary education have effects on youth employment.
- Education is still seen as a key route out of poverty via the increased likelihood of a well-paying job. The report finds clear evidence that education offers the greatest chance to escape the informal sector (although it offers less chance to escape an informal job in the formal sector). All countries show increasing shares in formal employment as the level of education increases.
- In general, earnings tend to rise in accordance with workers' levels of educational attainment and those with higher qualifications and/or more work experience can expect to earn more. Returns to education differ widely between workers in paid employment, for whom an additional year of schooling generally results in a higher income, and those in own-account work, for whom significant returns are far less certain.
- Across all countries, the proportion of youth with less than primary or only primary education is greater for youth in vulnerable employment, while those in non-vulnerable employment are more likely to have a secondary or tertiary level.
- Poorly educated youth are more likely to work in agriculture and higher educational attainment is evident in industry and services, where productivity levels are generally also higher
- Relatively high unemployment rates for better educated youth reveal that youth are underprepared for the careers that are in demand in the labour market, and also that these youth are prepared to wait for the opportunity of a quality job (in the formal sector). See the accompanying paper on youth preferences for further detail.

- Some young graduates are waiting for a “good” job. The evidence shows high (and unrealistic) expectations on the part of youth to attain work in the public sector. The less educated, however, are more likely to create their own job in self-employment or to accept lower wages.
- The young person with the lowest level of education is the least likely to be unemployed. But also the most likely to be in vulnerable, precarious self-employment. This supports a view of own-account work as an option of last resort, which is less driven by economic opportunities.
- There are relatively high levels of qualifications mismatch. Young professionals working in low-income countries are typically undereducated for their jobs, having completed, on average, only secondary education. However, more young professionals in urban areas are “better matched” to their jobs than in rural areas.

TVET

- However, the most common type of intervention for youth is skills training, or Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET).
- TVET interventions demonstrate an overall positive effect, with the evidence being stronger for formal employment and monthly earnings than for paid employment and weekly hours worked. In contrast, the overall effect on self-employment earnings was found to be negative.
- There is a strong message from the TVET literature that it works, but only when it offers comprehensive and complementary training, with links to the labour market. Single-component TVET interventions are not successful.

Sparreboom T. & Staneva, A. (2014) Is education the solution to decent work for youth in developing economies? : Identifying qualifications mismatch from 28 school-to-work transition surveys. International Labour Office. Geneva: ILO.

http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/work-for-youth/publications/thematic-reports/WCMS_326260/lang--en/index.htm

Increasing the level of education of the emerging workforce in developing economies will not in itself ensure an easy absorption of the higher skilled labour into non-vulnerable jobs. Yet it is clear that continuing to push forth undereducated, under-skilled youth into the labour market is a no-win situation, both for the young person who remains destined for a hand-to-mouth existence based on vulnerable employment and for the economy which gains little in terms of boosting its labour productivity potential. In general, earnings tend to rise in accordance with workers’ levels of educational attainment and those with higher qualifications and/or more work experience can expect to earn more. Returns to education differ widely between workers in paid employment, for whom an additional year of schooling generally results in a higher income, and those in own-account work, for whom significant returns are far less certain.

The findings also underline the labour market segmentation in developing economies, in particular between workers in non-vulnerable employment (employers and employees) and those in vulnerable employment (own-account workers and contributing family workers). Workers in vulnerable employment are severely disadvantaged by both higher levels of qualifications mismatch and much lower levels of educational attainment. In low income countries, under

qualification resulting from low levels of education is also more prevalent. Returns to education differ widely between workers in paid employment, for whom an additional year of schooling generally results in a higher income, and those in own-account work, for whom significant returns are far less certain. Finally, the findings also point to the increasing importance of educational attainment beyond the primary level.

75 per cent of tertiary graduates were working in non-vulnerable employment. Unfortunately, completion of education at the secondary level alone is not enough to push youth through towards better labour market outcomes in low-income countries. Only four in ten young secondary school graduates were engaged in non-vulnerable employment in the low-income countries (compared to seven in ten (72 per cent) in lower middle-income countries).

Across all countries, the proportion of youth with less than primary or only primary education is greater for youth in vulnerable employment, while those in non-vulnerable employment are more likely to have a secondary or tertiary level of qualification (on average, 83 per cent of youth with tertiary education were in non-vulnerable employment). Poorly educated youth are more likely to work in agriculture and higher educational attainment is evident in industry and services, where productivity levels are generally also higher. Completion of education at the secondary level alone is not enough to push youth towards better labour market outcomes in LICs. Only 40 per cent young secondary school graduates were engaged in non-vulnerable employment in the low-income countries (compared to 72 per cent in lower middle-income countries). The returns to education for youth in own-account work are weaker than for youth in paid employment. This seems consistent with a view of own-account work as an option of last resort, which is less driven by economic opportunities, and also with the relatively high levels of qualifications mismatch in vulnerable employment. Unemployment rates in low-income countries tend to rise by level of education. Relatively high unemployment rates for better educated youth reveal that youth are not preparing themselves for the careers that are in demand in the labour market, and also that these youth are prepared to wait for the opportunity of a quality job (in the formal sector).

Informal employment among youth: evidence from 20 school-to-work transition surveys

Shehu, E. and Nilsson, B. (2014) Geneva: ILO.

http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/work-for-youth/publications/thematic-reports/WCMS_234911/lang--en/index.htm

This report provides empirical evidence to confirm that informal employment, a category considered as “non-standard” in traditional literature, is in fact “standard” among young workers in developing economies. Based on the school-to-work transitions surveys (SWTSs) run in 2012-2013, the report finds that three-quarters of young workers aged 15-29 (at the aggregate level) are currently engaged in informal employment.

Drawing on the ILO’s 2012-13 school-to-work transition surveys, this report finds that three-quarters of young workers aged 15-29 are in informal employment. The report finds clear evidence that investing in education offers the greatest chance to escape the informal sector (although it offers less chance to escape an informal job in the formal sector). All countries show increasing shares in formal employment as the level of education increases. The youth with a tertiary education has at least a 51 per cent chance of finding formal employment (and even higher in the countries with comparatively lower shares of informal employment), compared to 14

per cent for the young person with less than primary level education. Parental education is also a good predictor of formal versus informal employment among youth. The more educated an employed youth's father is, the higher the probability that the person's employment will be formal rather than informal, but only up until the secondary level. The relationship is very similar when the mother's education level is compared to employment status.

Thompson, S, McGrath, S and Joynes, C (2016) Skills Topic Guide, HEART
<http://www.heart-resources.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/Skills-Topic-Guide.pdf?x30250>

There are also two reading packs and one HEART talk:

- http://www.heart-resources.org/reading_pack/skills-provision-private-sector-demand/
- http://www.heart-resources.org/reading_pack/skills-for-development-thinking-about-system-reform-options/
- <http://www.heart-resources.org/mmedia/simon-mcgrath-transforming-skills-development/>

Simon McGrath writes in this topic guide that 'a focus on skills and technical and vocational education and training (TVET) almost slipped off the development agenda after 2000. Excluded from the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and marginalised in the Education for All (EFA) debate, the dominant policy and research view was that specific vocational skills were less important than general education and that public provision of vocational skills was particularly ineffective. This orthodox position had largely been developed by the World Bank in the 1980s and early 1990s (e.g., Psacharopoulos 1981 and 1985; Psacharopoulos and Loxley 1985; Middleton, Ziderman and Adams 1993), drawing strongly on human capital approaches.

Yet, the current decade has seen skills and TVET return to the development agenda. TVET is clearly present in the new language of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); UNESCO convened a world conference on the subject in 2012 and is working on a new revised recommendation - its key standard-setting tool; whilst a range of international reports have emerged on skills from organisations such as McKinsey and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), as well as the *Global Monitoring Report on Youth and Skills*. These global policies can be placed against a backdrop of national commitments in developed and developing contexts to diversify and expand skills provision in terms of its supply and demand. However, the policy of neglect of skills has contributed to a paucity of good international research on the topic and there remains more ideological heat than empirical light in the field.

The topic guide reports evidence that skills training has resulted in increased self-awareness, empathy, decision making, goal setting, and communication skills for youth pressure (Olenik and Takyi-Laryea 2013). It also points to evidence of training programmes in developing countries have been shown to have a positive impact on future employment and earnings.

Whilst cognitive skills are linked to increases in incomes and employment chances generally, technical skills training is shown to be more effective when focused on skills closely linked to market demand. Women may benefit from skills training more than men because they are often starting from a greater state of disadvantage in the labour market (Adams 2011). Nonetheless, a

solid general education is required as a basis for youth development and for future employment opportunities. For the disadvantaged, skills acquisition is more effective when built on a solid foundation of good quality basic education (Adams *et al.* 2013).

Vocational education systems may benefit from reform in developing countries. However, it is essential to remember that TVET does not guarantee a solution to youth unemployment. Skills and employment are intrinsically related to overall growth, development and innovation pathways. Policies that promote access to general education and business development are likely to support skills training initiatives.

At the level of TVET system reform, there is a consensus that involving all stakeholders, most particularly employers, in the design and delivery of training, contributes to better outcomes for all. There have been many attempts to reform funding regimes, including through levy-grant systems, but there is a lack of conclusive evidence on their efficacy. Indeed, it appears that systems may need to be well-functioning before these reforms are effective (Dunbar 2013). Similarly, national qualifications frameworks (whether education-wide or just vocational) have been introduced in a large number of countries in recent years but there is considerable evidence on their complexity and little on their positive impact (Allais 2010). There is evidence that apprenticeship programmes provide good quality access to training and to new technology, and are a strong route into decent employment. However, such programmes typically prove hard to deliver at scale, due to the limited numbers of medium to large firms in developing economies and market failure (World Bank *a.* 2013). Overall, there has been more failure than success with TVET policy reform in developing countries (McGrath *et al.* 2013).¹

Quality of the evidence on skills

The evidence presented on the current status of skills development includes a medium number of high-quality systematic reviews published by the World Bank and OECD, each describing detailed methodologies and drawing on substantial data-sets and case studies, and which can be regarded as highly reliable sources. In some cases, these publications have a lower focus on analysing TVET-related policy in LMICs. Further evidence on new approaches to focussing on TVET is drawn from a proposals report produced for UNESCO ahead of EFA Global Report 2012, a published peer-reviewed research paper, and a country-specific analysis of TVET policy published in 2004, each of which are of high quality. There are a small number of country case studies featured: due to various geographic, social and/or political factors, the countries selected could be regarded as atypical.

Adams A. (2011) The Role of Skills Development in Overcoming Social Disadvantage. Background paper prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012. UNESCO, Paris

<http://www.18ccem.orange.mu/download/The%20Role%20of%20Skills%20Development%20in%20Overcoming%20Social%20Disadvantage%20by%20Avril%20V%20Adams.pdf>

This paper was written as part of the planning phase for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012. Its objective is to highlight current policies that support skills development and to identify gaps that present potential for progress. Theories of skills acquisition have moved on from being exclusively linked to formal education settings. Other sources of skills development

are now considered. This includes skills development through informal at work learning, apprenticeships and enterprise-based training. It also includes government and non-government funded training and education institutes. Past policy interventions and country experiences can provide important lessons on past policies and inform new ways of thinking. The first section of this paper explores definitions and theories about skills development. It considers measuring and monitoring of success. The second section provides an overview of evaluating skills development implementations. The third section reflects on reform trends and challenges in reaching the socially disadvantaged with skills and the policy gaps that need to be filled.

Adams A, Johansson de Silva S and Razmara S. (2013) Improving Skills Development in the Informal Sector Strategies for Sub-Saharan Africa. The World Bank. Washington DC.
<http://elibrary.worldbank.org/doi/pdf/10.1596/978-0-8213-9968-2>

This study examines the role played by education and skills development in achieving sub-Saharan Africa's full potential. It uses household labour force surveys to look at the experience of skills development in Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Rwanda, and Tanzania. The household labour force surveys capture the skills profile of the informal sector and study how different means of skills development - including formal education, technical and vocational education and training, apprenticeships, and learning on the job - shape productivity and earnings in the informal sector as compared with the formal wage sector. It quantitatively assesses how different sources of skills development are related to the sector in which one works and the earnings received in that sector. It highlights economic constraints to skills acquisition. It delivers a comprehensive strategy for improving employment outcomes in the informal sector through skills development with examples of successful interventions taken from international experience and the five countries.

Olenik C. and Takyi-Laryea A. (2013) State of the field report: Examining the evidence in youth education in crisis and conflict. USAID youth research, evaluation, and learning project. USAID, Washington DC.
http://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1865/USAID%20state%20of%20the%20field%20youth%20education%20in%20conflict%20final%202_11.pdf

This paper summarises evidence on youth education in crisis- and conflict-affected settings. It focuses on research and evaluation of workforce development programming for youth. It is focused on developing countries. A framework for guiding the interpretation of the impact that workforce development has on youth outcomes is presented. Trends in the field that increase positive youth employment outcomes are analysed. Evidence of what works in achieving positive outcomes are provided, as well as evidence gaps.

Dunbar M. (2013) Engaging the private sector in skills development. HEART
http://www.heart-resources.org/doc_lib/engaging-the-private-sector-in-skills-development/

This report aims to provide an understanding of the role of the private sector in skills development, both as employers and as skills providers. The objective was to find potential opportunities to support private sector integration in all aspects of skills development, particularly in low-income contexts. In addition, the research explored the twin issues of access to finance for

skills development stakeholders; and financial support from the private sector for skills development programmes. The volume of recent work focused on skills is considerable.

It is clear that a radical shift in skills development is both needed and is beginning to take place. To succeed, this shift must:

- Respond to demand for training opportunities with greater private sector involvement
- Improve co-ordination efforts between stakeholders
- Make effective use of new technology and the media

Private sector interventions generally need facilitation either by a government, donor or NGO. Employers are more likely to engage in skills development at any level, if the benefits of doing so are apparent, the business environment is favourable and there is minimal bureaucracy attached. Their engagement is being proactive.

Lewin, Keith M., and Ricardo Sabates. 2012. 'Who gets what? Is improved access to basic education pro-poor in Sub-Saharan Africa?' International Journal of Educational Development, vol. 32, no. 4 (July): 517–528

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0738059312000326>

This paper explores changing patterns of access to basic education in six Sub-Saharan Africa countries using data from Demographic and Health Surveys at two points in time. In general the analysis confirms that participation of children in schooling has increased over the last decade. However, access to education remains strongly associated with household wealth. In most countries the differences associated with urban and rural residence and sex are smaller than those associated with household wealth. Over time the wealth gradient related to access has deteriorated more often than it has improved in the countries in the sample. Disturbingly, the proportion of over age children has also risen rather than fallen more often than not, and the poorer the household the more likely children are to be over age. Increased numbers of over age children are indicative of internal inefficiencies, and make it unlikely that goals to universalise access and completion will be achieved. Education for All should be pro-poor and where it is not, it is failing.

5. Evidence Summary Table

Reference (with url)	Region / Country / City	Method	Quality (H,M,L) Peer reviewed journal?	Summary	Impact on primary outcomes (productivity, employment, salaries)	Other reported outcomes
<p>Day Ashley L, Mcloughlin C, Aslam M, Engel J, Wales J, Rawal S, Batley R, Kingdon G, Nicolai S, Rose P (2014) The role and impact of private schools in developing countries: a rigorous review of the evidence. Final report. Education Rigorous Literature Review. Department for International Development.</p> <p>https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/439702/private-schools-full-report.pdf</p> <p>https://www.gov.uk/go</p>	DFID Priority countries	Rigorous literature review	H	This paper discusses the strength of recent evidence on the role and impact of private schools on education for school-aged children with a particular focus on the delivery of education for the poor, including but not restricted to low-fee schools.	In particular, there is a striking paucity of longitudinal research that can indicate trends over time – either in individual academic achievement or system-wide effects. Consequently, there is currently limited understanding of the long-term effects of donor or government interventions on the quality of private provision. Likewise, studies of the effects of private schooling on equity are currently limited to snapshot or cross-sectional designs. This leaves unanswered questions about the long-term impact of private schooling on employment, social mobility, or, given the gender differential, women’s economic participation.	<p>Gaps in the literature include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Types of research designs are limited with a paucity of longitudinal research, in-depth ethnographic research, and comparative work. •Few studies offer a political economy analysis of private schooling.

government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/442673/private-schools-evidence-brief1.pdf						
<p>James Tooley and David Longfield, October 2014, The Role and Impact of Private Schools in Developing Countries: A Response to DFID's "Rigorous Literature Review", E.G. West Centre, Newcastle University</p> <p>https://egwestcentre.files.wordpress.com/2012/07/the-role-and-impact-of-private-schools-in-developing-countries-a-response-to-dfid-s-rigorous-literature-review.pdf</p>	<p>DFID priority countries</p>	<p>Critique</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>Reading of evidence. In several cases, literature which clearly says one thing is presented as saying the opposite, or is much more nuanced than the Rigorous Review suggests. 2. Assumptions. The framing of several of the assumptions leads to a less favourable view of the role and impact of private schools than would assumptions framed only slightly differently; one in particular seems like a 'straw man' assumption, the wording of which makes it impossible to see private schools in a favourable light. 3. Evidence missed or duplicated. In several cases, evidence from the selected literature that could have informed the Assumptions is simply missed out; sometimes this evidence would completely turn around the conclusions reached. Evidence is also duplicated – studies using the same</p>	<p>Summary: Private schools are more cost-effective than government schools and are financially sustainable Private schools, the evidence shows, have lower cost of education delivery than government schools; in combination with their higher quality levels this would suggest greater cost effectiveness. Using the proxy measure of length of operation of private schools, private schools are very clearly financially sustainable. Even stronger circumstantial evidence comes from the vast number of private schools: so many educational entrepreneurs would not be entering these markets if they did not believe the schools to be financially sustainable</p>	<p>See table in the main report.</p>

				<p>datasets are used as distinct pieces of evidence, thus lending greater support to certain conclusions than is warranted. Many of the articles accepted used research methods which should not have allowed for the kinds of generalisations made in the Rigorous Review. These criticisms notwithstanding, this Response uses only the studies selected by the Rigorous Review. With a revised analysis and modification of two of the assumptions, our Response finds that all 12 of the Assumptions are positive in favour of private schools, with the most important 10 out of these 12 moderately or strongly supported in terms of overall strength of evidence (Table 1). Instead of the lukewarm conclusions about private schools, this leads to a much more positive assessment of their current and potential roles in development.</p>		
Nag S, Chiat S, Torgerson C, Snowling MJ (2014)	Focus on developing	Literature review from 1990	H	Developing countries face distinct challenges in providing access to quality education.	Morocco: A 2007 estimate showed that 8 per cent of children aged 5-14 were engaged in some sort of employment (CIA World	In 2006, it was estimated that 21 per cent of children

<p>Literacy, Foundation Learning and Assessment in Developing Countries: Final Report. Education Rigorous Literature Review.</p> <p>Department for International Development</p> <p>https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/305150/Literacy-foundation-learning-assessment.pdf</p>	<p>countries</p>	<p>to January 2013.</p> <p>All papers were appraised</p> <p>included only those rated as of high and moderate quality</p>		<p>Educational provision also varies markedly in terms of teacher training, teaching and learning resources, school attendance, and motivation of parents, teachers and children for schooling. Against this backdrop, we consider the available evidence on foundation learning and literacy in order to identify key components for intervention that are appropriate to specific cultural and linguistic contexts. A fundamental assumption is that in order to increase the educational attainments of children, it is critical to put in place high-quality teacher education; however this is beyond the scope of the current review.</p> <p>The review was commissioned to address issues pertaining to foundation learning and literacy. We therefore included evidence on language and literacy learning from early childhood to Grade 8 (approximately 3-13 years), when the ability to read with understanding should be in place. We also decided to include mathematical reasoning and numeracy learning up to Grade 2</p>	<p>Factbook). UNESCO statistics show, however, that 96 per cent of children are enrolled in primary school, with a primary to secondary transition rate of 83 per cent.</p>	<p>aged 5-14 were involved in child labour (CIA World Factbook). This high rate of employment does affect enrolment in schooling: in 2011, UNESCO estimated that the regional average of children enrolled in primary school in Tanzania was only 77 per cent.</p>
---	------------------	---	--	---	---	--

				(approximately 3-8 years) as an example of a foundation skill critical to the development of numerical and scientific thinking. In conducting the review, we considered within-child factors, including cognitive and language skills, and contextual factors including home language and literacy environment, community practices and quality of opportunity as well as the social stratifiers and economic drivers that influence non-enrolment, poor attendance, and dropout. Finally, we included a rigorous evaluation of interventions.		
OECD (2012), Public and Private Schools: How Management and Funding Relate to their Socio-economic Profile, OECD Publishing. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264175006-en http://www.oecd.org/pisa/50110750.pdf	OECD countries		M	In recent years, an increasing number of education systems in OECD and partner countries have welcomed the involvement of private entities, including parents, non-governmental organisations and enterprises, in funding and managing schools. Part of the interest in broadening the responsibility for schools beyond the government is to provide greater choice for parents and students and to spur creativity and innovation within schools, themselves. This report examines how	Advocates also argue that the existence of private schools creates a useful competition that can improve the productive efficiency of public schools, as well, and benefit the entire system. The families, non-profit organisations or enterprises that fund private schools are more likely to demand better student outcomes and hold the school accountable. Parents of children in public schools – and staff in these schools – may then begin comparing the quality of education available in other schools and start demanding higher standards too. Advocates also point out that more funding from families and private institutions would ease governments' obligation to invest in	More advantaged parents tend to send their children to privately managed schools than disadvantaged parents do

				private involvement in managing and funding schools is related to socio-economic stratification between publicly and privately managed schools.	education.	
<p>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). 2014, Education at a Glance</p> <p>http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/education-at-a-glance-2014_eag_highlights-2014-en.jsessionid=56do7bpotoobc.x-oecd-live-03</p>	OECD countries, but looks a useful paper so have included	Statistics	H	<p><i>Education at a Glance 2014: Highlights</i> summarises the OECD's flagship compendium of education statistics, <i>Education at a Glance</i>. It provides easily accessible data on key topics in education today, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education levels and student numbers: How far have adults studied, and how does early childhood education affect student performance later on? • Higher education and work: How many young people graduate from tertiary education, and how easily do they enter the world of work? • Economic and social benefits of education: How does education affect people's job prospects, and what is its impact on incomes? • Paying for education: What share of public spending goes on education, and what is the 	<p>People with a tertiary education in OECD countries are more likely to have a job, and to be working full-time, than those without.</p> <p>Unemployment rates are higher among people who do not have an upper secondary education (14% on average across OECD countries) than among those who have a tertiary education (5%).</p> <p>People with at least an upper secondary education are more likely to have a job than those without this level of education.</p> <p>The employment rate is considerably higher among men (80%) than among women (65%), although the gap is narrowest among tertiary-educated individuals and widest among those without an upper secondary education.</p> <p>Students who attend private schools tend to perform significantly better than students who attend public schools; but students, from public or private schools, in a similar socio-economic context tend to do equally well.</p>	

				<p>role of private spending?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The school environment: How many hours do teachers work, and how does class size vary? 	<p>Students who attend private schools tend to perform significantly better than students who attend public schools; but students, from public or private schools, in a similar socio-economic context tend to do equally well.</p>	
<p>Rankin, K, Cameron, DB, Ingraham, K, Mishra, A, Burke, J, Picon, M, Miranda, J and Brown, AN (2015.) Youth and transferable skills: an evidence gap map.</p> <p>3ie Evidence Gap Report 2. New Delhi: International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie).</p> <p>http://www.3ieimpact.org/media/filer_public/2016/07/05/egm2-youth_and_transferable_skills.pdf</p>	<p>Low- and middle-income countries</p>	<p>Evidence gap map/Literature review</p>	<p>H</p>	<p>Transferable skills, also referred to as soft skills and life skills, provide youth with the tools and confidence to succeed in terms of employment, health and personal well-being. This report summarises the findings of an evidence gap map on transferable skills programming for youth in low- and middle-income countries, as part of a project funded by the MasterCard Foundation and the MacArthur Foundation. Evidence gap maps created by the International Initiative for Impact Evaluation are visual representations of how much impact evaluation evidence exists for a given sector or policy issue according to the types of programmes evaluated and outcomes measured.</p>		

<p>Kautz, T, Heckman, JJ, Diris, R, Ter Weel, B and Borghans, L, 2014. Fostering and measuring skills: improving cognitive and non-cognitive skills to promote lifetime success.</p> <p>The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.</p> <p>https://www.oecd.org/edu/cei/Fostering-and-Measuring-Skills-Improving-Cognitive-and-Non-Cognitive-Skills-to-Promote-Lifetime-Success.pdf</p>	OECD	Literature review	M	<p>This paper reviews a variety of interventions targeted to different stages of the life cycle. They interpret all of the studies they examine within an economic model of skill development.</p>	<p>Workplace-based programmes that teach non-cognitive skills appear to be effective remedial interventions for adolescents. They motivate acquisition of work-relevant skills and provide for disadvantaged youth the discipline and guidance which is often missing in their homes or high schools. Successful interventions at any age emulate the mentoring and attachment that successful families give their children. Skills enable people. They are capacities to function. Greater levels of skill foster social inclusion and promote economic and social mobility. They generate economic productivity and create social well-being. Skills give agency to people to shape their lives, to create new skills and to flourish.</p>	
<p>Palmer, R (2005) Beyond the Basics: Post-Basic Education, Training and Poverty Reduction in Ghana, Post-Basic Education and Training Working Paper Series - N^o4</p> <p>https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/me</p>	Ghana	Not clearly stated	L	<p>This paper is one of a series of six country papers – from Ghana, South Africa, Tanzania, Rwanda, Kenya and India. Together they form part of a Department for International Development (DFID) funded project that is exploring the possible contribution that post basic education and training (formal</p>	<p>In terms of the impact that both formal and informal skills development have on poverty reduction in Ghana, there remains a lack of research evidence that examines the links between formal and informal skills development and poverty reduction. At present the underlying assumption of the Ghanaian skills development agenda is that providing skills to the poor will make them employable and hence reduce poverty. But this has not been proven. Further, there</p>	

dia/57a08c5be5274a31e0001172/Palmer_Ghana_PBET_WP4.pdf				<p>and informal skills development, secondary and tertiary education) can make to poverty reduction in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia</p>	<p>remain serious 'challenges' in the delivery and transformative contexts of informal skills training in particular.</p>	
<p>Pieters, J (2013) Youth Employment in Developing Countries, IZA Research Report No. 58</p> <p>http://www.iza.org/en/webcontent/publications/reports/report_pdfs/iza_report_58.pdf</p>	<p>Developing countries</p>	<p>Literature review</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>The aim of this paper is to identify the key challenges in relation to youth employment in developing countries and provide recommendations on how EU development cooperation could support the youth employment agenda. It starts with a general discussion of the main reasons why youth employment challenges matter for development and a comprehensive description of common trends and key differences in youth employment outcomes across developing regions (Section 2). The determinants of youth employment outcomes and main challenges by region are discussed in Section 3. Section 4 discusses relevant policy measures and lessons from existing policies and programs. After a brief mapping of the international policy framework on youth employment in Section 5, the paper ends with conclusions and</p>	<p>South Asia and especially Sub-Saharan Africa face the largest youth employment challenge in terms of size and share of the youth population. These are also the regions where vulnerable employment shares (self-employment and unpaid work) are highest, particularly in the low-income countries. Vulnerable employment and working poverty are highest among youth with no or little education and in rural areas. – Middle-income countries in the Southern Mediterranean and Sub-Saharan Africa have the world's highest youth unemployment rates. Youth unemployment rates tend to rise with education and are higher in urban areas. Women fare much worse than men in these regions, both in terms of unemployment and vulnerable employment.</p> <p>The school-to-work transition of young people has to be analysed taking into account of parallel key early life transitions, including cohabitation, marriage and childbearing.</p>	

				recommendations in Section 6.		
<p>Shehu, E. and Nilsson, B. (2014) Informal employment among youth: evidence from 20 school-to-work transition surveys, Geneva: ILO.</p> <p>http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/work-for-youth/publications/the-matic-reports/WCMS_234911/lang--en/index.htm</p>						
<p>Sparreboom T. and Staneva, A. (2014). Is education the solution to decent work for youth in developing economies? : Identifying qualifications mismatch from 28 school-to-work transition surveys.</p>	Global	Synthesis	H	<p>This report provides up-to-date evidence on the link between labour market outcomes and educational attainment for the population of youth in low- and middle-income countries. Based on the school-to-work transitions surveys (SWTSs) run in 2012-2013, the report summarises the education profile of youth, identifies</p>	<p>In general, earnings rise in accordance with workers' levels of educational attainment and those with higher qualifications and/or more work experience can expect to earn more.</p>	

<p>International Labour Office. Geneva: ILO.</p> <p>http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/work-for-youth/publications/thematic-reports/WCMS_326260/lang-en/index.htm</p>				<p>patterns of qualifications mismatch measured in over- and undereducation and examines rates of return to education.</p>		
<p>Brown, E (2016) What works in youth employment programmes?, HEART Helpdesk Report</p>	<p>Low and middle income countries</p>	<p>Rapid literature review</p>		<p>The purpose of the review was to provide a summary of existing research on interventions for youth employment. This report is linked to two other reports, one on youth preferences in employment and one on youth employment and migration</p>	<p>This section of this report on education is particularly relevant to this query.</p>	
<p>The role of youth skills development in the transition to work: A global review. Adams, A. V. (2007). World Bank.</p> <p>http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/251031/day8Role%20of%20skillsApril%208Ses2.pdf</p>	<p>Global</p>	<p>Review</p>	<p>L</p>	<p>Employment outcomes; TVET; earnings</p>	<p>TVET works when strongly linked to labour market demand and at advanced/post-secondary levels.</p>	

<p>Thompson, S, McGrath, S and Joynes, C (2016) Skills Topic Guide, HEART</p> <p>http://www.heart-resources.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/Skills-Topic-Guide.pdf?x30250</p>						
<p>Adams A. (2011) The Role of Skills Development in Overcoming Social Disadvantage. Background paper prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012. UNESCO, Paris</p> <p>http://www.18ccem.orange.mu/download/The%20Role%20of%20Skills%20Development%20in%20Overcoming%20Social%20Disadvantage%20by%</p>	Global	Background paper for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012	M	<p>This paper was written as part of the planning phase for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012. Its objective is to highlight current policies that support skills development and to identify gaps that present potential for progress. Theories of skills acquisition have moved on from being exclusively linked to formal education settings. Other sources of skills development are now considered. This includes skills development through informal at work learning, apprenticeships and</p>	<p>The third section reflects on reform trends and challenges in reaching the socially disadvantaged with skills and the policy gaps that need to be filled.</p>	

20Avril%20V%20Adams.pdf				<p>enterprise-based training. It also includes government and non-government funded training and education institutes. Past policy interventions and country experiences can provide important lessons on past policies and inform new ways of thinking. The first section of this paper explores definitions and theories about skills development. It considers measuring and monitoring of success. The second section provides an overview of evaluating skills development implementations.</p>		
<p>Adams A, Johansson de Silva S and Razmara S. (2013) Improving Skills Development in the Informal Sector Strategies for Sub-Saharan Africa. The World Bank. Washington DC.</p> <p>http://elibrary.worldbank.org/doi/pdf/10.1596/978-0-8213-9968-2</p>	<p>Sub-Saharan Africa</p>	<p>Survey</p>	<p>M/H</p>	<p>This study examines the role played by education and skills development in achieving sub-Saharan Africa's full potential. It highlights economic constraints to skills acquisition. It delivers a comprehensive strategy for improving employment outcomes in the informal sector through skills development with examples of successful interventions taken from international experience and the five countries.</p>	<p>It looks at the skills profile of the informal sector and study how different means of skills development - including formal education, technical and vocational education and training, apprenticeships, and learning on the job - shape productivity and earnings in the informal sector as compared with the formal wage sector. It quantitatively assesses how different sources of skills development are related to the sector in which one works and the earnings received in that sector.</p>	

<p>Olenik C. and Takyi-Laryea A. (2013) State of the field report: Examining the evidence in youth education in crisis and conflict. USAID youth research, evaluation, and learning project. USAID, Washington DC.</p> <p>http://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1865/USAID%20state%20of%20the%20field%20youth%20education%20in%20conflict%20final%202011.pdf</p>	<p>Developing countries</p>	<p>Literature review of 33 studies that were published between 2001 and 2012</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>This paper summarises evidence on youth education in crisis- and conflict-affected settings. It focuses on research and evaluation of workforce development programming for youth. It is focused on developing countries. A framework for guiding the interpretation of the impact that workforce development has on youth outcomes is presented.</p>	<p>Trends in the field that increase positive youth employment outcomes are analysed. Evidence of what works in achieving positive outcomes are provided, as well as evidence gaps.</p>	
<p>Dunbar M. (2013) Engaging the private sector in skills development. HEART</p> <p>http://www.heart-resources.org/doc_lib</p>	<p>Low income contexts</p>	<p>Literature review</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>The objective of this report was to find potential opportunities to support private sector integration in all aspects of skills development. In addition, the research explored the twin issues of access to finance for</p>	<p>This report aims to provide an understanding of the role of the private sector in skills development, both as employers and as skills providers.</p>	

/engaging-the-private-sector-in-skills-development/				<p>skills development stakeholders; and financial support from the private sector for skills development programmes.</p>		
<p>Lewin, Keith M., and Ricardo Sabates. 2012. 'Who gets what? Is improved access to basic education pro-poor in Sub-Saharan Africa?' International Journal of Educational Development, vol. 32, no. 4 (July): 517–528</p> <p>http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0738059312000326</p>	<p>Sub-Saharan Africa</p>	<p>Data from Demographic and Health Surveys at two points in time in six countries</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>This paper explores changing patterns of access to basic education in six Sub-Saharan Africa countries. In general the analysis confirms that participation of children in schooling has increased over the last decade.</p>	<p>Children who enrol above the normal age of entry will miss learning experiences at a time when they are most receptive to learning basic skills and establishing secure foundations for subsequent cognitive development. Access to education remains strongly associated with household wealth. In most countries the differences associated with urban and rural residence and sex are smaller than those associated with household wealth. Over time the wealth gradient related to access has deteriorated more often than it has improved in the countries in the sample. Disturbingly, the proportion of over age children has also risen rather than fallen more often than not, and the poorer the household the more likely children are to be over age. Increased numbers of over age children are indicative of internal inefficiencies, and make it unlikely that goals to universalise access and completion will be achieved. Education for All should be pro-poor and where it is not, it is failing.</p>	

<p>Cho, Y. and Honorati, M. (2014) Entrepreneurship programs in developing countries: A meta regression analysis. Labour Economics, 28, pp 110–130 http://dx.doi.org/10.1596/1813-9450-6402</p>	<p>Developing countries</p>	<p>Based on 37 impact evaluations assessing the effects of interventions</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>The authors that aimed to promote entrepreneurial activities among current or potential entrepreneurs in developing countries over the past 10 years. The authors broadly categorised intervention types as training, financing, counselling or a combination of these, and they gathered information on six outcomes of interest: labour-market activities, labour-market income, financial behaviour, business knowledge and practice, business performance, and attitudes. The findings show that entrepreneurship programmes have a positive impact on business practices and labour-market activity, and no impact on the other outcomes.</p>	<p>Women appear to benefit most from financing support. They do not significantly benefit from entrepreneurship programmes, other than some improvements in empowerment-related outcomes. Private-sector delivery is strongly linked to programme success. Programmes delivered by the private sector and non-governmental organisations are more likely to be successful than those delivered by banks or microfinance institutions.</p>	
<p>Tripney J, Hombrados J, Newman M, Hovish K, Brown C, Steinkamp Fry K, Wilkey E. (2013) Technical and Vocational Education</p>	<p>Low and middle income countries</p>	<p>Based on 26 studies assessing the effectiveness of 20 different</p>	<p>M</p>	<p>The authors included 26 studies assessing the effectiveness of 20 different TVET interventions in Latin America and the Caribbean (14 interventions), Europe, East Asia, South Asia and sub-</p>	<p>TVET interventions demonstrate an overall positive effect, with the evidence being stronger for formal employment and monthly earnings than for paid employment and weekly hours worked.</p>	

<p>and Training (TVET) Interventions to Improve the Employability and Employment of Young People in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: A Systematic Review. Campbell Systematic Reviews 2013:9 DOI: 10.4073/csr.2013.9</p> <p>http://campbellcollaboration.org/lib/project/227/</p>		TVET interventions		Saharan Africa, between 2000 and 2011. The interventions are mostly provided by government, but also NGOs and private sector, which the authors do not differentiate in the results.		
<p>Kluge J, Puerto S, Robalino D, Romero J M, Rother F, Stöterau J, Weidenkaff F, Witte M. (2016) Interventions to improve the labour market outcomes of youth: a systematic review of training, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services, and subsidized employment interventions. Geneva: International</p>	Low and middle income countries	Systematic review	H	This systematic review analyses 113 impact evaluations published between 1990 and 2014 on labour market outcomes of youth. The interventions studied were active labour market programmes (ALMPs) that include at least one of: training and skills development, entrepreneurship promotion, employment services and/or subsidised employment. Outcomes measured were employment, earnings, or business performance. The evidence from LMICs was mostly from interventions	The overall results showed that ALMPs have a positive effect on youth labour market outcomes, particularly employment and earnings. Effects on business performance outcomes were limited. In LMICs skills training and entrepreneurship interventions produce the greatest impacts, especially for income gains, and combined multiple services and programme components lead to better outcomes. The review did not find differential effects by gender or age. A focus on low-income, disadvantaged, or low educated youth triggers higher employment and earnings gains for youth across all income levels.	

<p>Labour Organization</p> <p>http://www.ilo.org/employment/areas/youth-employment/WCMS_327595/lang-en/index.htm</p>				<p>implemented by NGOs and donor organisations. There was no systematic evidence about the role of public, private or civil entities.</p>		
---	--	--	--	---	--	--

Acknowledgements

We thank the following experts who voluntarily provided suggestions for relevant literature or other advice to the author to support the preparation of this report. The content of the report is the sole responsibility of the author and does not necessarily reflect the opinions of any of the experts consulted.

- Professor Stephens, University of Brighton, D.Stephens@brighton.ac.uk
- Dr Anita Staneva, University of Sydney, anita.staneva@sydney.edu.au
- Muriel Dunbar, muriel.dunbar@camb-ed.com
- Professor David Blackaby
- Dr Nigel O'Leary

Suggested citation

Grant, C. (2016). *Basic Education and employment*. K4D Helpdesk Report. Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies.

About this report

This report is based on five days of desk-based research. The K4D research helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of a selection of recent relevant literature and international expert thinking in response to specific questions relating to international development. For any enquiries, contact helpdesk@k4d.info.

K4D services are provided by a consortium of leading organisations working in international development, led by the Institute of Development Studies (IDS), with Education Development Trust, Itad, University of Leeds Nuffield Centre for International Health and Development, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine (LSTM), University of Birmingham International Development Department (IDD) and the University of Manchester Humanitarian and Conflict Response Institute (HCRI).

This report was prepared for the UK Government's Department for International Development (DFID) and its partners in support of pro-poor programmes. It is licensed for non-commercial purposes only. K4D cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this report. Any views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of DFID, K4D or any other contributing organisation. © DFID - Crown copyright 2016.

