



AfCAP
Africa Community Access Partnership



Impacts and Implications of Gender Mainstreaming in Rural Transport in Tanzania

Dissemination of Findings - Workshop Report



HelpAge International
AfCAP Project Reference Number. TAN2044H

June 2017



*Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania:
Dissemination of Findings Workshop Report*

The views in this document are those of the authors and they do not necessarily reflect the views of the Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP), or Cardno Emerging Markets (UK) Ltd for whom the document was prepared.

Cover Photo: Participants listening to presentation from HelpAge International Africa Regional Head of Programmes during the dissemination workshop in Dar es Salaam
(Photo: Agnes Mwangoka)

<i>Quality assurance and review table</i>			
Version	Author(s)	Reviewer(s)	Date
1	Agnes Mwangoka, Godfrey Mulongo & Amleset Tewodros		
2	Godfrey Mulongo and Amleset Tewodros	Paul Starkey	22 July 2017
3	Godfrey Mulongo and Amleset Tewodros	Paul Starkey	27 July 2017
		Nkululeko Leta	25 Aug 2017

AfCAP Database Details: Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania			
Reference No:	TAN2044H	Location	Tanzania
Source of Proposal	PMU: Open call	Procurement Method	Open Procurement Method
Theme	Cross-cutting issues	Sub-Theme	Gender equality, equity and social inclusion
Lead Implementation Organisation	HelpAge International	Partner Organisation	N/A
Total Approved Budget	£49,822.40	Total Used Budget	£44,840.12
Start Date	1 st August 2016	End Date	31 st July 2017
Report Due Date	23 rd June 2017	Date Received	22 nd July 2017

ReCAP Project Management Unit
Cardno Emerging Market (UK) Ltd
Oxford House, Oxford Road
Thame
OX9 2AH
United Kingdom



Abstract

HelpAge International conducted a research dissemination workshop with gender and transport sector stakeholders to share the findings of the study conducted to assess whether gender mainstreaming in rural transport has had a transformative effect on women facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion in Tanzania. Intersectional vulnerabilities due to age, gender and disabilities, are increasingly becoming relevant to discourse on gender inequality recognising women's access to their rights and entitlements is further affected by their age and physical ability.

The findings suggest that Gender mainstreaming in rural road works seems to lack significant beneficial impact on women facing intersecting inequalities. Transformations associated with women's involvement in the road construction leaves a lot to be desired. Policy implementation gaps, financial and social barriers and lack of empowerment were cited as some of the constraining factors.

This report relates to the dissemination workshop held 9 May 2017 in Dar es Salaam. The participants endorsed the research findings and stressed the need to ensure equal opportunities and participation to all through the finalisation and implementation of the National Transport Policy of 2011. It further called for the Government to ensure that all performance agreement of contractors incorporate gender mainstreaming ensuring conditions at construction sites are favorable to both men and women and those with disabilities.

Key words

Gender mainstreaming, disability, mobility, transformative, intersecting inequalities, community access

AFRICA COMMUNITY ACCESS PARTNERSHIP (AfCAP)

Safe and sustainable transport for rural communities

AfCAP is a research programme, funded by UK Aid, with the aim of promoting safe and sustainable transport for rural communities in Africa. The AfCAP partnership supports knowledge sharing between participating countries in order to enhance the uptake of low cost, proven solutions for rural access that maximise the use of local resources. The programme follows on from the AFCAP1 programme that ran from 2008 to 2014. AfCAP is brought together with the Asia Community Access Partnership (AsCAP) under the Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP), managed by Cardno Emerging Markets (UK) Ltd.

See www.research4cap.org

Acknowledgements

HelpAge International wishes to acknowledge the support of the President's Office - Regional Administration and Local Government, the Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly and Children, as well as the Ministry of Works, Transport, and Communication for their active engagement during the study and positive contribution during the dissemination meeting. We also wish to thank the regional Administrative and Executive officers of Iringa and Kibaha Districts. Special thanks goes to TANROADS, AfCAP secretariat, the World Bank, EU, AfDB and DFID. We would like to acknowledge the active participation of various state and non-state actors with interest in gender and disability issues. The meeting would not have been dynamic without the active participation of the researchers and the women and men who gave their time to the study by sharing their life stories and experiences during the dissemination meeting which enriched the findings of the study. Those who have not been mentioned but had great contributions towards the realisation of this study are also acknowledged.

Acronyms, Units and Currencies

AFCAP	Africa Community Access Partnership
AfDB	African Development Bank
CBOs	Community Based Organisations
DED	District Executive Director
DFID	Department for International Development
EU	European Union
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ICT	Information Communications Technology
IMT	Intermediate Means of Transport
KII	Key Informant Interview
Km	Kilometre
LGTP	Local Government Transport Programme
M-PESA	Mobile phone-based money transfer, financing, and micro-financing service
MSC	Most Significant Changes
PO-RALG	President's Office - Regional Administration and Local Government
PWD	Persons with Disabilities
RTI	Road Travel Injury
RTTP	Rural Travel and Transport Programme
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SMS	Short Message Service
STDs	Sexually Transmitted Diseases
TANROADS	Tanzania National Roads Authority
TASAF	Tanzania Social Action Fund
UK	United Kingdom (of Great Britain and Northern Ireland)
UKAid	United Kingdom Aid (Department for International Development, UK)
URT	United Republic of Tanzania
VTTTP	Village Travel and Transport Programme

Table of Contents

Abstract	3
Key words	3
Acknowledgements	4
Acronyms, Units and Currencies	4
Table of Contents	5
1 Executive Summary	6
2 Background and Introduction	7
3 Introduction	8
4 Welcome remarks	8
5 Workshop opening	8
5.1 Work of HelpAge International	8
5.2 Research Objectives	9
6 Presentation of Key Findings on Impacts and implications of the gender mainstreaming in Rural Transport.	9
6.1 Research Rationale	9
6.2 Research questions	9
6.3 Significance of the study	10
6.4 Methodology and Approach	10
6.5 Key Findings	10
7 Plenary discussion, Recommendations and Way forward	11
7.1 Identified major gaps\challenge	11
7.2 Recommendations and way forward	12
8 Closing Remarks	13
9 References	13
10 Annexes	14
Annex A: List of Participants	14
Annex B: HelpAge Background Information	15
Annex C: Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania	17

1 Executive Summary

The main purpose of this dissemination meeting was to provide evidence-based information to policy makers to ensure that informed decisions and actions are taken to address constraints to the mainstreaming of gender in rural transport policies. The findings of the research on the impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania were shared at a one-day workshop held in Dar es Salaam on the 9th of May 2017, brought together 32 participants (see list of participants on Annex A) representing senior government officials from the central government with responsibility to transport, health, gender and disability. Other participants were drawn from civil society and community based organisations working with older men and women and people with disability, media and human rights groups. Representatives of the Kilolo and Kibaha districts men and women who took part in the research were also in attendance.

In 2016, HelpAge International conducted a study to identify and promote mobility-focused interventions to enable rural older women experiencing intersection vulnerability benefit from the impacts of gender mainstreaming to provide an extended evidence base on how rural older people's access to transport impacts on their health and livelihood rights; and to ensure that the findings reach key policy makers and practitioners locally, nationally and internationally.

The research findings highlighted that despite the limited progress, women with multi-dimensional vulnerabilities in Tanzania shoulder a large burden as a result of gender inequality. In 2003, Tanzania adopted a National Transport Policy to mainstream gender in rural transport. The Policy recognised that 75% of women's time is consumed by walking long distances to and from farmland, negatively affecting their productivity. The policy also acknowledged that women are over-represented amongst the poor and face greater difficulties in escaping from poverty. The Local Government Transport Programme (LGTP) was implemented between 2007 and 2012 with a commitment to ensure women's voices are heard and that they participate fully in decision-making. An adopted participative approach to the identification, monitoring and implementation of local transport infrastructure improvements were said to potentially promote gender equality and the empowerment of women. This called for a need to assess whether gender mainstreaming in rural transport has had a transformative effect on women facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion. It also enables the analysis and review of existing policies and provide recommendations to improve policy decisions.

The findings from the study suggest that the extent to which the policy has resulted in transformative benefits, in particular for women experiencing intersectional vulnerabilities, is not encouraging. The dissemination workshop report summarises some of the key areas of discussion, in gaps in policy and application and recommendations for policy and operational changes. Key recommendations included the need to have an integrated approach to gender mainstreaming, expedite the finalisation of the draft National Transport Policy of 2011, ensure accountability and follow up on the established policies, strategies and procedures in rural transport sector, increase awareness and capacity building among gender desk officers in rural areas and the collection and dissemination of disaggregated data.

2 Background and Introduction

One of the recommendations made by the 1995 Beijing Declaration was the need to focus on women's practical needs by reducing the burden placed on them by poverty and their multiple roles in society. For the majority of rural women who play vital roles in the survival of their households, access to farm areas and a market is a key lifeline. Women and their children head load vast quantities of goods in Africa: across most sub-Saharan African societies load carrying for domestic purposes is regarded as a low status activity and assigned to females (Porter, Hampshire et al. 2013). Studies conducted by HelpAge International in Kibaha (2012) and Kilolo (2015) established that older women experience disproportionate disadvantages due to load carrying with negative consequences to their health (Porter, Tewodros et al. 2013). Widespread use of motorcycles and mobile phones is improving mobility and communication, however, its ownership, access and use varied substantially between older men and women.

Gender issues associated with the mobility and transport in rural populations are well known but are rarely prioritised in transport planning and investment. When gender issues are discussed, they tend to focus on women of reproductive and productive age and fail to recognise that women experience gender discrimination at all stages of their lives. Gender mainstreaming should have a transformative impact on women of all ages including those facing intersecting inequalities due to age, gender, disability and widowhood who face multiple barriers to realising their rights, and consequently experience disproportionately higher rates of poverty. The 2003, National Transport Policy of Tanzania mainstreamed gender in rural transport recognising women's active role in rural life, as 75% of their time is often consumed by walking long distances to and from farm and other production centres. Due to poor rural transport infrastructure, their farm production and ability to access the market is often constrained. The policy also recognised the potential role of non-motorised means of transport in improving rural infrastructure. As a result, the VTTP was introduced in seven districts across Tanzania (with a first phase 2007-12, under the Prime Minister's Office Regional Administration and Local Government, (PM-RALG) subsequently President's Office Regional Administration and Local Government, (PO-RALG). This enabled valuable micro-level assessments, but comprehensive analysis of the wider social and economic impact of this intervention is not available.

Responding to the ReCAP research call, HelpAge conducted this study with an **overall aim** of assessing whether gender mainstreaming in rural transport has had a transformative effect on women facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion. Specifically, the research was designed to respond to the following questions:

- a) Did gender mainstreaming in rural transport programmes in Tanzania result in transformative changes for women?
- b) Are women facing intersecting inequalities benefiting from the gender mainstreaming programmes?
- c) What are the transformative changes women with multi-dimensional inequalities, specifically older women, women with disabilities, and widows, would like to see through gender mainstreaming programmes?
- d) What are some of the constraints and factors facilitating transformative changes for women facing multiple levels of exclusion in rural transport programmes such as VTTP and the LGTP?
- e) What disparities (if any) do women with intersecting inequalities have in access, use and benefit from the mobile phone/information communications technology (ICT) that is bridging the rural transport and communication gap?

The field research was conducted in Kibaha and Kilolo districts which were the sites for two earlier (complementary) research projects led by HelpAge International: *Learning with older people about their transport and mobility problems in rural Tanzania: focus on improving access to health services and livelihoods* (conducted in 2012 in Kibaha, 2015 in Kilolo). Kibaha District is located 40 kilometres (km) west of Dar es Salaam, along the Dar es Salaam-Morogoro highway. Kilolo district is located at the north-eastern end of Iringa Region, about 37 km from the regional headquarters in Iringa Town. Additional field research involved interviews with national-level key informants in Dar es Salaam. The research was conducted using methodologies that promote participation and inclusion. Focus Group Discussions (FGD) took place with groups of men and women within the communities while Key Informant Interviews (KII) were held with district government authority representatives in particular those in charge of infrastructure development.

3 Introduction

The workshop held in Dar es Salaam, on the 9th of May 2017, was opened by a representative from the President's Office - Regional and Local Governments (PO-RALG). In his introductory remarks, the representative of the PO-RALG commended the effort by HelpAge International and other stakeholders who participated in the successful completion of study. He mentioned that the PO-RALG will look into details of findings and recommendations of the study, find a way forward, and where possible ensure the government finds solutions to the concerns raised by the findings of the study.

4 Welcome remarks

HelpAge International Africa Region Head of Programmes, Ms. Amleset Tewodros welcomed the participants and extended her appreciation for attending the workshop. She emphasised the importance of research studies, evidence-based information for policy makers that will ensure informed decisions and action are taken in addressing various issues of concerns. She further urged all the participants to share widely the information disseminated during the workshop with their respective contacts. She acknowledged the support extended by the UK Aid funded Africa Community Access Partnership.

5 Workshop opening

Ms. Amleset made a presentation to the participants that covered the following areas:

5.1 Work of HelpAge International

HelpAge International is a global network with a vision of a world in which all older people can lead dignified, active, healthy and secure lives. HelpAge International works to ensure older people have:

- Access to secure income to meet their basic needs
- Enjoy the best possible health and quality of life
- Feel safe and secure, and free from discrimination
- Have their voices heard

HelpAge was globally established in 1983 and has been operating in Tanzania since 1992. HelpAge works with Community Based Organisations (CBOs) and Government in both mainland Tanzania and Zanzibar with a focus on research to build knowledge and evidence to influence inclusive policies and practices.

As part of one of the pillars of its theory of change “evidence and knowledge” HelpAge International has been committed to strengthen its research work by collaborating with a range of stakeholders which includes the ReCAP and AfCAP funded by UK Aid. In her presentation she emphasised the relevance of the research in strengthening HelpAge’s advocacy work in promoting equity in access to health care, livelihood and inclusion of older men and women in development initiatives. See details in the power point presentation attached as Annex B.

5.2 Research Objectives

- To identify and promote mobility-focused interventions to enable rural older people and those in their care to achieve better health and well-being;
- To provide an extended evidence-base on how rural older people’s access to transport impacts on their health and livelihoods rights;
- To ensure the findings reach key policy makers and practitioners locally, nationally and internationally.

6 Presentation of Key Findings on Impacts and implications of the gender mainstreaming in Rural Transport.

Mr. Godfrey Mulongo who was the lead national researcher, provided key highlights on the research focusing on the purpose of the study; key questions the research answered; the significance of the study; methodologies and approaches; research activities; research sites; findings and recommendations

6.1 Research Rationale

It was acknowledged that gender dimensions of rural transport are well known but rarely prioritised in transport planning and investment. Policies exist but gender mainstreaming in rural transport planning and implementation is often nothing more than ‘ticking the gender box’. The Government of Tanzania has taken a number of policy initiatives by adopting the following policies:

- ✓ Mainstreaming of gender in the National Transport Policy of 2003
- ✓ The Local Government Transport Programme between 1994 -2004
- ✓ National Construction Policy in 2002
- ✓ National Roads Agency Strategic Plans 2000–2013 and 2014–2018
- ✓ Local Government Transport Programme (2008-Ongoing)

However, transformative gender impacts of these interventions are not yet known. Hence, the purpose of the study was to assess whether gender mainstreaming in rural transport has had a transformative effect on women facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion.

6.2 Research questions

The research attempted to answer the following questions which shaped the design and methodologies applied in the study:

- Are the targeted women benefiting from the gender mainstreaming programmes?
- What transformative changes do these women like to see through gender mainstreaming programmes?
- What are some of the constraints and factors facilitating transformative changes for these women in programmes such as VTTP and LGTP.

- What disparities (if any) do these women have in access, use and benefit from the mobile phone/ICT technology that is bridging the rural transport and communication gap?

6.3 Significance of the study

The study builds evidence to promote inclusive approaches to gender mainstreaming in rural transport. It will serve as an important advocacy toolkit e.g. for country's infrastructure project managers, engineers and procurement officials as mainstreaming advocates to increase the social and gender dimensions of transport operations. The research findings and recommendations will also be an advocacy tool to influence relevant policies. It will further ensure Tanzania's contribution to the SDGs 'Leave No One Behind' agenda and the country's Vision 2025 of becoming a middle-income country.

6.4 Methodology and Approach

The research applied qualitative methods as outlined below:

A number of policy documents were reviewed to assess the extent to which they have integrated commitments to gender mainstreaming. The details of these policy documents are available in the full study report.

Most Significant Changes (MSC) methodology was adopted through storytelling exercises, life journeys/histories or testimonials in a format of participatory photo story.

A total of 297 individuals participated in the study; including 30 key informant interviews, 32 focus group discussions, 5 interviews with national level actors and 3 interviews with development partners were held.

Participants in each group were carefully selected to include women and men facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion (otherwise referred to as 'special' group in this report) such as older people, people with disabilities, orphans, and widows/widowers, single women-headed households. To enrich the data, 'ordinary' community members were also sampled to participate in the study through these FGDs. The researchers worked closely with the village elders to identify participants that fit this criterion.

The KIs and FGDs followed a check-list approach (for which examples are available in the training report, October 2016). For this approach, the aim is to cover a series of key questions, but not necessarily in a fixed order, and with the flexibility to follow new lines of enquiry, should issues emerge that appeared strongly relevant to the investigation.

6.5 Key Findings

Some of the highlights of the findings were presented as follows:

- i. The evidence generated on transformations associated with women's involvement in the road construction is diverse but overall is not encouraging. Individuals interviewed indicated varying opinions from admitting that more needs to be done to achieve truly transformative changes for women while others reflected biases towards women's inability in technical areas that often consider the road sector a male dominated field. The prevailing perception to gender as a separate process also significantly affected the level of achievement.
- ii. It seems unlikely that gender mainstreaming in road works has had any significant beneficial impact on women facing intersecting inequalities, with the exception of those involved in the TASAF programme

- iii. Proposed transformative changes for women facing multidimensional inequalities:
 - Transport to the site for the physically disabled
 - Offered lighter work closer to home
 - Rescheduling of women's contributions so they can leave site early to attend to chores
 - For contractors to be educated on the importance of including women, supported by formal guidelines and a budget to enable its application
- iv. Constraining factors facing transformative changes
 - Male constraints on women's mobility associated with suspicions around their potential promiscuity.
 - Male prejudices around the abilities of women
 - A lack of budget that adequately covers mainstreaming requirements
 - A lack of women professionals in the roads sector, especially (but not only) trained engineers
 - Regulations to support women facing multiple levels of exclusion are not enough. Without adequate monitoring these regulations will not be implemented effectively.
- v. Facilitating factors for transformative changes
 - Champions in positions of power are crucial.
 - Ensuring the voices of women facing multiple levels of exclusion are captured at the beginning of road projects
 - Education and sensitisation of contractors, community leaders and district level staff
 - Careful monitoring to ensure regulations are implemented
 - Attention to development of a facilitating work environment: crèche facilities, gender-friendly latrines.

7 Plenary discussion, Recommendations and Way forward

After the presentation on the major findings of the study, a plenary discussion was opened to all the participants. During the discussion, participants highlighted a number of key issues including existing gaps and challenges, recommendation and way forward.

7.1 Identified major gaps\challenges

One of the major gaps identified by the participants was the delay in finalising the 2003 draft National Transport Policy in which gender mainstreaming issues have been addressed. Other identified gaps included the following:

- Limitations at work places to provide friendly and favorable working environment for both men and women and people with specific needs
- Limited number of qualified women engineers (constructors) in the country resulting in asymmetrical representation in a number of structures including engineers' bodies
- Limited knowledge of gender mainstreaming in the community
- Lack of functioning road agency to ensure gender mainstreaming at all stages.
- Poor implementation of the established transport policies and strategies
- Communication gaps between policy makers and policy implementers. There is huge gap between the two aforementioned groups that have direct impact on the implementation of the transport projects, policies and strategies. Local communities at where the projects are implemented are rarely involved in the planning processes.
- Poor documentation of data on implemented projects including the lack of disaggregation of data.

- Limited number of knowledgeable gender desk officers in rural areas to address gender related issues

7.2 Recommendations and way forward

After a thorough discussion on the gaps and challenges, participants proposed the following as a way forward:

- The need to expedite finalisation of the revised draft National Transport Policy of 2011
- Government and relevant ministries/bodies need to ensure that all performance agreement of the construction contractors incorporates gender mainstreaming and are followed up closely during implementation.
- There remains a need to ensure sustainability of the ongoing and upcoming transport projects and this includes having sustainable implementation strategies and work plans in place. In addition, effective local community participation (with equal representation of all genders) from early stages of planning to implementation of projects will play a great role in ensuring that the projects are sustainable.
- Ensure conditions at work place/construction sites are favorable to both men and women and those with specific needs. This will ensure equal opportunities and participation of both men and women.
- There is a need to develop awareness strategy to educate and sensitise society about gender mainstreaming and to encourage women's participation in the construction/engineering sector.
- According to a representative from PO-RALG, an agency responsible for addressing rural road challenges will be established. The agency is called Tanzania Rural-Urban Road Agency (TARURA). The representative urged participants to send their inputs before it starts being operational in July 2017.
- Ensure accountability and follow up on the established policies, strategies and procedures
- Ensure the voices of women facing multiple vulnerabilities are discussed at the beginning of road projects.
- Ensure clear data disaggregation. Unpack gender information on the reports. Clear recording and documentation will help in evaluation of the impacts and measuring outcomes of various transport projects.
- There is a need to introduce an integrated approach to gender mainstreaming, to prioritise a gender mainstreaming agenda across ministries and sectors so that even the cost implications can be reflected in the sector's budget accordingly.
- To share the study findings widely including to the decision makers and/influencers such as the Parliamentary Committee for Infrastructure so that it can inform their decisions and actions on gender mainstreaming.
- To ensure Transport/Construction companies learn best practices from other organisations implementing projects in the same area on how to effectively engage the local community in the implementation of their activities. For example, TASAF already applies a strategy on public works of which TANROADS may learn from.
- Encourage the local community to establish transport/construction labour groups for easy contracting out process as well as creating a joint voice to echo their rights, including gender mainstreaming.
- To create a liaison forum/structure to build up linkages between the local community and the government at the local level.
- Develop the capacity of gender desk officers in rural areas to ensure they deliver services that benefit men and women equitably.

8 Closing Remarks

In her closing remarks, HelpAge's Regional Head of Programmes emphasised the need to encourage women and girls to be equally active in accessing opportunities; in promoting inclusion for both men and women of all diversities in the execution of policies; and urged stakeholders to ensure gender mainstreaming remains in the center of discussion.

She expressed gratitude to the participants for their active participation during the discussion and urged them to share the findings of the study within their offices and challenge decision makers to expand their gender perspective to include women of all ages.

With these remarks the workshop was closed.

9 References

- Mulongo G, 2017. Presentation on Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania. Presented at HelpAge dissemination workshop held 9 May 2017 in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.
- Tewodros A, 2017. Presentation on HelpAge International Background Information. Presented at HelpAge dissemination workshop held 9 May 2017 in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

10 Annexes








Annex A: List of Participants

No.	NAME	ORGANISATION
1.	Jacob Manguye	The President's Office Regional Administration & Local Government
2.	Giuseppe Valerio	Doctors with Africa-CUAMM
3.	George C. Kaduma	Kilolo District Council
4.	Itika Paul	Tanzania Social Action Fund (TASAF)
5.	Twaha Kibaluga	Social Welfare department
6.	Moria Sloan	HelpAge International – Regional
7.	Gilbert Mwoga	The President's Office Regional Administration & Local Government
8.	Gwamaka Israel	Kibaha District Council
9.	Njonanje Samwel	East Africa Television
10.	Rashid Idrissa	East Africa Television
11.	Jimmy Langwili	Daily News
12.	Deogratius Temba	Tanzania Gender Networking Program (TGNP)
13.	Faustine Barayata	The President's Office Regional Administration & Local Government
14.	Arnold Masaki	The Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)
15.	Nuhu A. Mwasumilwe	Regional Administrative Secretary (RAS)- Iringa
16.	Victoria Lihiru	Action on Disability and Development - International
17.	TUMPE M. Lukongo	Tanzania Social Action Fund (TASAF)
18.	Esther Kaminda	Ministry of Health Community Development, the Elderly & Gender
19.	Filemon E. Namwinga	Kilolo District Council
20.	Scholastica Gibore	Kilolo District Council
21.	Frida Mgidange	Kilolo District Council
22.	Marcella F. Mangosongo	Kibaha District Council
23.	Margareth Malunda	Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Children and Elderly
24.	George Kaduma	Kilolo District Council
25.	Aldo Luhanga	RAS's Office –Iringa
26.	Godfrey Mulongo	Gender Mainstreaming Researcher
27.	Josephine Mwantusye	Gender Mainstreaming Researcher
28.	Agnes Mwangoka	Gender Mainstreaming Research – Rapporteur
29.	Amleset Tewodros	HelpAge International
30.	Janeth Mesomapyia	Journalist - The Citizen
31.	Mpoki Bukuku	Journalist – The Guardian
32.	Ellen Manyangu	Journalist – East Africa FM Radio










Annex B: HelpAge Background Information

<p style="text-align: center;">HelpAge International Background Information</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Our Theory of Change</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Ageing in Tanzania – facts & figures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tanzania's population of older people is 2.5 million (2012 population census) – 5.6% of the total population • 80% of Tanzanian older people live in rural areas • 40% of all orphans are cared for by older people • Only 4% older Tanzanians have secure income • HHs of OP - 22.4% more likely to be poor and food insecure • 5.4% of 50+ live with HIV (15.3% of all people living with HIV) • Free health care policy exist, but not fully enforced • 60% of deaths among people 60+ are due to NCDs. • Killing of older people due to witchcraft accusations rampant 	<p style="text-align: center;">HelpAge International</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> □ A global network with a vision of a world in which all older people can lead dignified, active, healthy and secure lives. □ We work to ensure older people have: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> □ Access to secure income to meet their basic needs □ Enjoy the best possible health and quality of life □ Feel safe and secure, free from discrimination □ Have their voices heard □ Globally established in 1983, in Tanzania operating since 1992 □ Works with CBOs and Government in both mainland and Zanzibar and with research to build knowledge and evidence to influence includes policies and practices
<p style="text-align: center;">Africa Community Access Partnership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AfCAP is a six-year research pr (2014-2020), funded by UK Aid, to promote safe and sustainable transport for rural communities in Africa. • AfCAP supports knowledge sharing between participating countries to enhance the uptake of low cost, proven solutions for rural access that maximise the use of local resources. AfCAP is brought together with the Asia Community Access Partnership (ASCAP) under the Research for Community Access Partnership (ReCAP), managed by <i>Cardno Emerging Markets (UK) Ltd.</i> 	<p style="text-align: center;">Past AfCAP Research Projects</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learning with Older People about their Transport and Mobility Problems in Rural Tanzania (2013 - Kibaha) • Learning with Older People about their Transport and Mobility Problems in Rural Tanzania (2015) - Kilolo
<p style="text-align: center;">Research Objectives</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ To identify and promote mobility focused interventions to enable rural older people and those in their care to achieve better health and well-being ■ To provide an extended evidence base on how rural older people's access to transport impacts on their health and livelihoods rights ■ To ensure the findings reach key policy makers and practitioners locally, nationally and internationally 	<p style="text-align: center;">Findings</p> <p>Current Access to Health Services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Substantially constrained by poor transport services (cost and availability) • Time taken to reach health facility ranged from up to 15 min in Kibadaga for 13% OP, to over 4 hours for 20% OP in Mhanga • Walking the main mode of travel with 71% in Kidabaga, 49% in Mwatasi and 84% in Mhanga with only one person having used ambulance • Some use of bodaboda also noted 10% and 22% respectively in Kidabaga and Mwatasi with only one in Mhanga • Travel a major barrier most OP cited for access to health (31%) – followed by user fee, and cost of travel

**Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania:
Dissemination of Findings Workshop Report**







<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Livelihood implications</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transport, livelihood & health are interconnected • Income sources are limited for OP • For 81% of OP Farming is main occupation • Kidabaga has the highest rate of farming – proximity to market only works for crops but not for perishable crops as transport is not always available 	<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Domestic Load Carrying</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Water, firewood and farm produce are the most common domestic loads • Only 1% OP have piped water, 14% from community standpipes • 28% OP said water comes from >30 minutes; 10-30 minutes for 47% while 25% can access in less than 10 minutes walk • OP depend on children and grandchildren <i>"I can't go to fetch water, my grandchildren do. When they are not here, I have to wait till they get back"</i> 75 year old woman • Even when distance is fair 20 litres containers heavy for OP
<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Pain due to load carrying</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Majority OP reported pain of the waist or back due to load carrying • 29% women and 18% Men waist/back pain • 14% women and 7% men reported headache • 9% both men and women reported neck ache • Women tend to carry on their head while men on their shoulder • <i>'I can feel it for 2 or 3 days and then I get better after resting'</i> – 80 year old man 	<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Transport beyond village</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pedestrian travel dominates journey inside and outside village – no money needed but very tiring • Pedestrian travel involves load carrying due to poor transport • Cycling a rare activity ownership and usage is extremely low in these 3 villages • Bicycle taxis – not at all • Motorcycles – only one male respondent reported owning • In Mhanga (remotest) 99% never used motor cycle • In Kidabaga often available while in Mwatasi no formal bodobodas but private motor cycle owners loan their machines
<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Transport beyond village (cont'd)</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Buses are commonly used in Kidabaga mainly to travel to Iringa (14% never used) • In Mwatasi 85% and Mhanga 86% never used • Cost, accidents and time of travel are cited as barriers to use of bus 	<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Relevance to Rural Transport Policy</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transport a major hurdle for many OP • Transport, health, livelihoods and well-being are interconnected • Long distance to water points may contribute to water borne diseases and other health hazards • Poverty due to low agric production and poor access to markets results in poor nutrition
<p style="text-align: right;"></p> <h3>Relevance to transport policy (cont'd)</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Importance of recognising the diversity of rural transport users • Transport interventions need to reduce domestic transport burden • Inter village and regional transport services enhanced by the emergence of motorcycles 	







Annex C: Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania




<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; align-items: center;"> <div style="text-align: center;">  <p>AfCAP Africa Community Access Partnership</p> </div> <div style="text-align: center;">  <p>UKaid Foreign & Commonwealth Office</p> </div> </div> <h3 style="text-align: center;">Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania</h3> <p style="text-align: center;">Dr. Godfrey Mulongo mulongoe@gmail.com 0786 899 339</p> <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>	<h3 style="text-align: center;">Background</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The gender dimensions of rural transport are well known but rarely prioritised in transport planning and investment • Policies exist but actual gender mainstreaming in rural transport planning and implementation is often more than 'ticking the gender box' • Tanzania adopted the following with aim of mainstreaming gender and making women's voices heard: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ National Transport Policy to mainstream gender in rural transport in 2003 ✓ The Local Government Transport Programme was implemented btw 1994 -2004 ✓ The National Construction Policy of 2002 ✓ National Roads Agency Strategic Plans 2000–2013 and 2014–2018 ✓ Local Government Transport Programme (2008-Ongoing) • Transformative gender impacts of these interventions are not known <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>
<h3 style="text-align: center;">The Study</h3> <p>Purpose of the study was to assess whether gender mainstreaming in rural transport has had a transformative effect on women facing multiple forms of discrimination and exclusion.</p> <p>Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are these women benefiting from the gender mainstreaming programmes? • What transformative changes do these women like to see through gender mainstreaming programmes? • What are some of the constraints and factors facilitating transformative changes for these women in programmes such as VTTP and LGTP. • What disparities (if any) women do these women have in access, use and benefitting from the mobile phone/ICT technology that is bridging the rural transport and communication gap? <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>	<h3 style="text-align: center;">Significance</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study builds evidence to promote inclusive approaches to gender mainstreaming in rural transport • An important advocacy toolkit e.g: for country infrastructure project managers, engineers and procurement officials as mainstreaming advocates to increase the social and gender dimensions of transport operations. • The research findings and recommendations as an advocacy toolkit to influence relevant policies • It will further ensure Tanzania's contribution to the leave no one behind agenda and the country's vision 2025 of becoming a middle income country is realised <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>
<h3 style="text-align: center;">Approaches and Methodologies</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study was conducted between Oct – Dec. 2016 • Study covered Kilolo and Kibaha Districts <p style="text-align: center;"><u>Inclusion criteria of research sites</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completed project (road/bridge) with sufficient length • On-going construction projects with sufficient length • Projects currently under probation with sufficient length <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>	<h3 style="text-align: center;">Kilolo District</h3>  <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Idete: Around Idete, Itonya, Kivalamo and Mhanga 2. Kilolo Town Center: Kilolo Town, Kitowo/Mwatasi and Moonza – Kimala (served the ongoing projects around) 3. Ilula Township: Served ongoing and projects on probation around the area. <div style="text-align: right;">  </div>

<p style="text-align: center;">Kibaha District</p> <p>1. Soga township: Around Soga, Boko Mmemela, Msufini and Kongowe 2. Mlandizi Town Center: Around Kilangalanga, Madimba and Makazi mapya and Ngeta (served ongoing projects) 3. Kwala township: Around the area including Msua bridge, Mperambuli and Dutumi (served ongoing and projects on probation)</p> <p style="text-align: right;">HelpAge International</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Research Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key informant interviews • Focus group interviews • Photo-stories – adapting the most significant change <p style="text-align: right;">HelpAge International</p>
<p>Cont...</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Total of 297 individuals participated</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 32 focus group discussions 30 key informant interviews 5 interviews with national level actors 3 interviews with devpt. partners 	<p style="text-align: center;">Respondents</p> <p>The KII interviews will be conducted with:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Senior ministry officials: PO-RALG, Directorate of Gender, Ministry of Community Development, Gender Women, the Elderly and Children, and the Tanzania Gender Networking Programme. 2. Development partners: World-bank, the African Development Bank (AfDB) and DFID 3. At the district level: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – the District Engineers – Contractors, – District Community Development Officers, – Ward Executive Officers (WEO), – women opinion leaders in these communities – Village Chairpersons/Executive Officers – with homogenous groups of women and men: older people, people with disabilities, orphans, widows/widowers, single women heading households <p style="text-align: right;">HelpAge International</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">1 2</p> <p style="text-align: center;">3 4</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Findings</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><u>Structure</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Perspectives from the participants 2. Summary of the findings 3. Conclusions 4. Recommendations <p style="text-align: right;">HelpAge International</p>

**Impacts and implications of gender mainstreaming in rural transport in Tanzania:
Dissemination of Findings Workshop Report**

<p style="text-align: center;">Perspectives</p> <p>Ordinary Men:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Men at Makazi Mapya recounted volunteering for road construction a decade ago with and men and women being involved equally. However, women's participation was limited to cooking: <i>"Issue with women is that they may spend about two days attending traditional dances; difficult for them to commit fully to road construction activities"</i> <i>"Nobody knows what contract and what standards are required or agreed upon. Normally as villagers we are supposed to know the standards of the road agreed so we are close to the project and can monitor somehow the progress and the quality of the road. With lack of involvement, the villagers are there to stand and watch the workers do their thing"</i> <p style="text-align: right;"></p>	<p>Perspectives cont.....</p> <p>2: Ordinary Women: Mixed perspectives:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>"When the construction of this road (Makazi Mapya) began, women were involved/included.I myself dug from Msongola"</i> <i>"we just saw it excavated"</i> <i>"our benefitting was during the meeting phase. These supervisors do not involve women. There are jobs of uprooting tree stumps and digging trenches but we are told us women are not capable and they take male youth".</i> <i>"We are weak which is recorded in religious books we are from men and cannot equal them in any way"</i> <p style="text-align: right;"></p>
<p>Perspectives cont.....</p> <p>3: Special group (both F&M):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>"except the roads which are maintained locally by the community through TASAF, we the marginalized groups are not involved at all in road projects...we only get to know about them when the authorities come to officially open. We wonder why they call us to the opening ceremonies and why in our community yet they don't involve us from the beginning"</i> <i>"Leaders view it (HIV-AIDS) as a humiliation, hence [they] prefer the physically fit in their place"</i> <p style="text-align: right;"></p>	<p>Perspectives cont.....</p> <p>4: local community/Ward leaders:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>"...Nobody was involved. The bulldozer just comes and excavates and that is all... Decisions are made at the City Council. You find that you don't even know what the contractor looks like."</i> <i>"we should have a committee responsible with road construction issues within the village; it should include both and it should also be involved with employment and supervising all the project activities without bias"</i> <i>"meetings may be composed of 80% women but 70% of responses come from men, because of the cultural practices in our society that empower men to contribute more than women"</i> <i>"awareness and sensitization must first begin with us the leaders, when we make decisions we must also be considerate of people with disability among us. We need to be sensitized to involve people with disability in decision making"</i> <p style="text-align: right;"></p>
<p>Perspectives cont.....</p> <p>5. District office: <i>"whenever we visit the sites we mostly find the men as the main labour force due to the nature of the works - which require strength. Kibaha, being a coastal district, women are not considered active due to the stereotype that coastal women prefer light house-hold chores"</i></p> <p>6: Contractor (female): <i>"I find women more trustworthy on construction jobs better than men. For instance, the women I worked with on the Msua Bridge-Kwala-Dutumi, they were exceptional!"</i></p> <p>7. Road technician (female): <i>"To be honest, this job is hard. It requires a lot of determination. However, the main reason I excel in this job is because I am single and don't have children. ...I am flexible 24/7."</i></p> <p>8. Contractor (male): <i>"...As contractors, we are always time bound; we need to deliver on time and work has to be done! We cannot therefore be too benevolent waiting for an incapable widow to finish a job in three days just because she is a widow"</i></p> <p style="text-align: right;"></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Benefits of Road Construction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved evacuation of farm produce, arrival of new services including visits from health staff based in Mlandizi town, construction of a school and more income for <i>boda-boda</i> (men at Makazi Mapya) Facilitated arrival of minibuses resulting in reduced transport fares (i.e. TSH 1,500 from TSH 2,500 on boda), - Kwala now has buses to Dar es Salaam. Improved income - a widow at Soga reported that her has increased from TSH 5-6,000 per day to TSH 10-20,000, which has enabled her to invest in two saving groups <p style="text-align: right;"></p>

<p>Benefits cont...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>"I would say that there is an improvement in social services. Especially in the health sector; for instance, those living with HIV used to get their ARV supplies at Mlandizi, but after seeing that there is an improved road, albeit (only) little improvement, that service has been brought closer here at the local health centre"- (AIDS patient, Kwala)</i> • <i>"men benefit more, especially when it comes to employment in physically involving labour, but women only benefit by selling soft drinks or food to the road workers" (Woman politician, Kilangalanga Madimla).</i> 	<p>Benefits cont...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved income from selling timber, cooked foods and other goods to passing travellers, improved access to farm produce markets: <p><i>"On my part, I will talk about the Mwabingeta road which was constructed last year. Now we use TSH 2000 for the bus and TSH 3000 for motorcycle. So now it is better! Before, we would pay about TSH 50,000 to transport our agricultural goods, but now we pay only TSH 30,000 because the road is good." (Business woman, Luganga)</i></p> 
<p>Benefits cont...</p>  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women can save time on travel therefore able to engage in multiple sources of income or devote the time for their families • <i>"as a student, we use the road to school. The road is vastly improved and wide enough. We no longer compete with motorcycles for space on the road. This makes us feel safe."</i> • <i>I used to crawl because the tricycle could not pass through this bad road. ...the problem was compounded during the wet season! Now I am very mobile</i> 	<p>Benefits cont...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Livestock and donkey carts are restricted on some new roads and there is more rapid spread of STDs • <i>"There are some husbands who do not like the idea of their wives travelling out. ...My husband does not let me travel even for purchasing of personal items. ...We have no rights; our husbands decide for us. We are threatened with termination of our marriages should we choose to ignore their restrictions. We choose marriage over travel."</i> 
<p>Conclusions</p>  <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Transformations associated with women's involvement in the road construction: <u>the evidence is diverse but overall is not encouraging</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>'we are improving but we have not reached where we want to be'.</i>- PO-RALG • <i>'I don't think they are involved because they may lack technical know-how'</i> - PO-RALG • <i>some people still consider gender mainstreaming as a separate process</i> - Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Children and Elderly 	<p>Conclusions cont...</p>  <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. It seems unlikely that gender mainstreaming in road works has had any significant beneficial impact on women facing intersecting inequalities, with the exception of those involved in the TASAF programme 3. Proposed transformative changes for women facing multidimensional inequalities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. transport to the site for the physically disabled b. offered lighter work closer to home, c. rescheduling of women's contributions so they can leave site early to attend to chores d. for contractors to be educated on the importance of including these women, supported by formal guidelines and a budget to enable its application

<p>Conclusions </p> <p>4. Constraining factors facing transformative changes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Male constraints on women’s mobility associated with suspicions around their potential promiscuity. b. Male prejudices around the abilities of women c. Cost – lack of budgets that adequately covers mainstreaming requirements. d. Lack of women professionals in the roads sector, especially (but not only) trained engineers. e. Regulations to support women facing multiple levels of exclusion are not enough – without adequate monitoring these regulations will not be implemented effectively. 	<p>Conclusions </p> <p>5. Facilitating factors for transformative changes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Champions in positions of power are crucial . b. Ensuring the voices of women facing multiple levels of exclusion are captured at the beginning of road projects c. Education and sensitisation of contractors, community leaders and district level staff d. Careful monitoring to ensure regulations are implemented - <i>having a policy is one thing, implementation is another and monitoring the implementation is a different issue altogether</i> – World Bank official e. Attention to development of a facilitating work environment: crèche facilities, gender-friendly latrines.
<p>Conclusions </p> <p>6. Phones are playing an important role for a majority of women with intersecting inequalities - in organising transport and in substituting phone communication for journeys.</p>	