

THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION

Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE

Professor Anne Garden
Lancaster Medical School
Furness College
Lancaster University
Lancaster
LA1 4YG

3rd Floor
Park Hotel
East Cliff
Preston
Lancashire
PR1 3EA

23 April 2014

Dear Professor Garden,

DOCUMENTS AND EVIDENCE REQUIRED BY THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION

You may be aware the Secretary of State for Health announced the terms of reference of the University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay NHS Foundation Trust (UHMBT) Maternity and Neonatal Services Investigation (the Morecambe Bay Investigation) on 12 September 2013. I have enclosed a copy of the terms of reference with this letter for your information.

Dr Bill Kirkup CBE was appointed as Chairman of the independent Investigation and is seeking the co-operation of you and your organisation.

The Investigation is collecting evidence in respect of its terms of reference and the Investigation's Panel of expert advisors are reviewing evidence received from a number of interested organisations. As a result of their work further requests for material are emerging and these include information that you can, hopefully, supply.

The Investigation believes that Lancaster Medical School is the body responsible for overseeing the training and clinical placement of junior doctors throughout the Morecambe Bay and South Cumbria areas since August 2008. I trust you will confirm that this is correct?

Telephone: 01772 536376

Email: correspondence@mbinvestigation.org

Independent investigation into the management, delivery and outcomes of care provided by the Maternity and Neonatal services of University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay Trust from January 2004 – June 2013

If so the Investigation is seeking to obtain the material set out in the attached Annex. Further requests may be made at a later date.

The Investigation's Documents and Evidence Manager (DEM), Paul Roberts, or the Assistant Documents and Evidence Manager (ADEM) [REDACTED] will be your principle points of contact in relation to evidence management.

The Investigation would prefer to receive evidence electronically in one of the following formats:

- Searchable PDF
- Word
- Excel

Should this not be possible, please contact Paul or [REDACTED] to discuss alternative ways in which the evidence can be made available to the Investigation.

Management of evidence by the Investigation

The Investigation recognises that Lancaster Medical School will be concerned to know how material it is being asked to provide to the Investigation will be managed. It will therefore be helpful for you to know that material sought by and supplied to the Morecambe Bay Investigation from interested organisations and the families of those involved will be viewed and accessed by Investigation staff and the Investigation Panel only.

All Investigation staff, including the Panel, will view the material via a secure internet based database to which access will be controlled by the Investigation's Documents and Evidence Management Team and all Investigation personnel, including Panel members, are required to sign and adhere to the terms of a confidentiality undertaking.

Material and/or documents supplied to the Investigation will be collected from, or derived from, official files that are the property of interested organisations and/or individuals and will be considered by the Investigation as "working papers".

Working papers will be either returned to the relevant interested organisation/family at the end of the Investigation or destroyed by the Investigation and a record of all document destruction will be retained.

The Investigation has applied to the Information Commissioner for Data Protection Act Registration and fully understands its responsibilities holding evidence supplied by interested organisations.

Material and/or documents supplied to and considered by the Investigation will not be provided or shown to any interviewee in advance of their attendance, by the Investigation. Interviewee's will be advised in advance of their attendance what specific topics or areas the Panel wish to ask them about and which of the Investigations specific term(s) of reference they are being invited to provide evidence in respect of.

Should any interviewee wish to be reacquainted with any material and/or document(s) prior to attending the Investigation for an interview or to give evidence, they will be advised by the Investigation to liaise with their employer, or former employer, to make any necessary arrangements for them to undertake any such preparation.

I trust that being made aware at this early stage of the protocol the Investigation has adopted regarding document management will assist Lancaster Medical School in providing material as swiftly as possible.

The evidence required for the Investigation from Lancaster Medical School is set out at Annex A, and should be submitted to the Investigation **within 21 working days** of the date of this letter.

I anticipate that your organisation may hold evidence covering some of the period of time the Investigation is looking at. However, should that not be the case, I would be grateful if you could advise the Investigation where that evidence might be obtained.

Once the evidence has been examined, the Chairman will decide whether oral evidence is required. Whilst it is not possible to determine at this stage whether the Investigation will require to interview you, or any of your staff, it may be helpful, even at this early stage, if you would advise your staff accordingly, and if you would also make contact with any staff member who has retired or left your organisation to ensure, if necessary, the Investigation has up to date contact details for those who may be asked to give oral evidence.

If you have any further queries regarding the evidence being requested or would like an informal discussion, please contact:

Paul Roberts:

T: 01772 536401

E: paul.roberts@mbinvestigation.org

T: 01772 536390

E: [\[REDACTED\]@mbinvestigation.org](mailto:[REDACTED]@mbinvestigation.org)

Should this letter be forwarded to or addressed to another officer at the University, will you kindly pass on this request and advise me of the name of the colleague who is now dealing with it.

Yours sincerely,

OONAGH McINTOSH
SECRETARY TO THE INVESTIGATION

Enc: MBI terms of reference

Annex A

1. The evidence required by the Investigation covers the period from 1 January 2004 to 30 June 2013, and should include any information that was known and is pertinent to the Investigation by the Lancaster Medical School since its formation in August 2008.
2. All feedback the Medical School received/collected from medical staff (registered with the Lancaster Medical School) who had placements in obstetrics and gynaecology at UHMBT between August 2008 and 30 June 2013.
3. All correspondence between the Lancaster Medical School and the UHMBT with regard to complaints about their junior medical staff on placement in obstetrics and gynaecology during the period covered by the Investigation.
4. All correspondence between the Lancaster Medical School and the UHMBT with regard to complaints about junior medical staff on placement in other Departments of the Trust during the period covered by the Investigation.
5. All information on any measures taken by the Lancaster Medical School in response to any complaint against medical staff on placement at the UHMBT during the period covered by the Investigation.
6. Any other material that Lancaster Medical School considers would assist the Investigation in addressing its terms of reference in full.

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 15 May 2014 17:42
To: [REDACTED] Correspondence MB
Cc: Roberts, Paul; [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Dear Ms McIntosh

I am replying on behalf of Professor Garden – [REDACTED] answered our query yesterday. I attach Professor Garden's response and the following documents:

Reports of the Quality Monitoring Visits to UHMBT:

- April 2009 (University of Liverpool)
- February 2012 (Lancaster Medical School)
- March 2013 (Lancaster Medical School)

Student feedback on their placements in Obstetrics and Gynaecology at UHMBT (2009-10 to 2012-13)

Please contact me if you have any difficulties with any of the documents.

Yours sincerely

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
Project Manager
Lancaster Medical School
Faculty of Health and Medicine
Furness College
Lancaster University
Lancaster LA1 4YG
tel [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Garden, Anne
Sent: 14 May 2014 12:49
To: Correspondence MB
Cc: Roberts, Paul; [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Dear Ms McIntosh

I am leaving the University this afternoon for two days on Medical School business followed by a week's holiday. I have completed my report for the Investigation – but am waiting for a response to my query of 12.5.14 regarding whether you wished inclusion in the documents such direct feedback information that we still have in our possession – most of it being destroyed after the academic year when it was obtained and after it has been acted on. I have passed my response to [REDACTED] – one of the Administrators in the Medical School and she will send out my response when we receive an answer to the query.

I should therefore be grateful I, in my absence, you would send your response to my query to [REDACTED] whose email address is above

If this is not acceptable to you, would you be willing to wait for my response for my return to the University on 27th May – which is beyond the deadline you set

Yours sincerely
Anne Garden

From: Correspondence MB [<mailto:correspondence@mbinvestigation.org>]

Sent: 29 April 2014 09:49

To: Garden, Anne

Cc: Roberts, Paul; [REDACTED]

Subject: RE: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Dear Anne,

Many thanks for your prompt response and for clarifying the role of Lancaster Medical School. I apologise that the Investigation's terms of reference were not enclosed, please find them attached to this email.

When the Investigation is referring to junior doctors or junior medical staff, we intended this to mean medical students.

To help clarify Annex A; the Investigation is looking for:

- Any feedback from medical students about clinicians employed by UHMBT.
- Any information about complaints relating to medical students on placement in obstetrics and gynaecology at UHMBT.
- Any information about complaints relating to medical students on placement at other Departments at UHMBT.
- Any information on measures taken by the medical school in response to any such complaint.

The Investigation apologises for any confusion this may have caused. If you would like to discuss this request in more detail, please do not hesitate to contact Paul Roberts or [REDACTED]

Kind regards

Oonagh McIntosh
Secretary to the Investigation

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: 28 April 2014 17:35

To: Correspondence MB

Cc: [REDACTED] Roberts, Paul; [REDACTED]

Subject: RE: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Dear Ms McIntosh

Thank you for your email and letter regarding the Investigation which I shall reply to fully in due course.

You mention in your letter that terms of Reference for the Investigation will be enclosed but there was no enclosure attached and I should be grateful if you could send me a copy.

I would also appreciate some clarification. In your letter and in Annex A you mention 'junior doctors' or 'junior medical staff'. Lancaster Medical School is responsible for the training of medical students – we have no

responsibility for the training of medical staff. Are your questions aimed at the students for whom we have responsibility or at any reports we may have had from students about medical staff – be they senior or junior?

Yours sincerely
Anne Garden

Prof AS Garden
Head, Lancaster Medical School

From: Correspondence MB [<mailto:correspondence@mbinvestigation.org>]
Sent: 23 April 2014 11:16
To: Garden, Anne
Cc: [REDACTED]; Roberts, Paul
Subject: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Dear Professor Garden,

Please find attached a letter regarding the Morecambe Bay Investigation.

Kind Regards

Oonagh McIntosh
Secretary to the Investigation

This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, any reading, printing, storage, disclosure, copying or any other action taken in respect of this e-mail is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify the sender immediately by using the reply function and then permanently delete what you have received.

This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, any reading, printing, storage, disclosure, copying or any other action taken in respect of this e-mail is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify the sender immediately by using the reply function and then permanently delete what you have received.



Dear Ms McIntosh

Re: The Morecambe Bay Investigation

Thank you for your letter of 23.4.14 regarding the Morecambe Bay Investigation being chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE

Background

Lancaster Medical School (LMS) was formed in September 2006 under a Consortium consisting of the University of Liverpool, Lancaster University, the University of Cumbria and the University of Central Lancashire. While the day-to-day running of the School was devolved to Lancaster University, the overall responsibility for the programme and its quality assurance was, and is, the responsibility of the University of Liverpool. Medical students from LMS started to undertake clinical placements in obstetrics and gynaecology at the University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay (UHMB) in the autumn of 2008.

Prior to the setting up of LMS, medical students from the University of Liverpool had been attending clinical placements in years 4 and 5 (which would have included obstetrics and gynaecology) at UHMB from 2003. These students were entirely under the auspices of the University of Liverpool and had no relationship with Lancaster University. Liverpool continued to place some students in UHMB in this way up until summer of 2011.

Students have placements in Obstetrics and Gynaecology in years 3 and 4 of the 5 year undergraduate programme.

Students attending LMS currently receive a University of Liverpool degree but since the process of independence started, the General Medical Council has allowed students currently studying in their 1st and 2nd year at Lancaster to be registered for a Lancaster degree.

Monitoring Processes

i) Monitoring visits

Lancaster Medical School began the process of becoming a Medical School independent of the University of Liverpool in 2011 and while Liverpool remains responsible for the programme (the graduating students receive a Liverpool degree), LMS has begun to take

Lancaster Medical School
Furness College,
Lancaster University,
Lancaster, LA1 4YG, UK
T: +44 (0)1524 594 547
E: medicine@lancaster.ac.uk

on responsibility for the quality monitoring of the clinical placements. The University of Liverpool carried out a Quality Monitoring visit in April 2009 and the report was copied to Lancaster University.

Since 2012, LMS has carried out annual Quality Monitoring visits to the Trust, (accompanied in 2013 and 2014 by the Quality Assurance Manager of Health Education North West). At these visits, the monitoring team meet separately with those responsible for leading the clinical teaching at the Trust; the clinical teachers; and students on placement, as well as visiting the facilities provided by the Trust for education.

To inform the quality monitoring visit process, student feedback from the placements is reviewed and acted upon.

ii) *LMS Committee structure*

Information and feedback from the placement areas are considered at the monthly Medical School Learning and Teaching Committee which is attended by both University and NHS staff. Any issues would also be raised at the regular Curriculum Co-ordinating Group meetings held at UHMB.

iii) *Student feedback*

As well as informal feedback from the students (we are a very small medical school and the students are all known by the School staff, so much information is passed on an informal basis; the formal feedback from placement evaluation; meeting the students formally on the Quality Monitoring visits) twice yearly formal meetings are held with the class representatives and members of the Medical School staff. These were initially called 'Student Parliaments' under the Liverpool system but are now called 'Staff:Student Liaison Committees' under the Lancaster structure. While we keep the notes/minutes from the formal meetings, the placement feedback provided by the students is not routinely kept once it has been acted on but the information the students provide is used as the basis for the Quality Monitoring visits.

Information requested/provided.

1. Included with this letter are copies of the notes of the Quality Monitoring visits carried out by LMS in February 2012 and March 2013, and summaries of student feedback on Obstetrics and Gynaecology placements at UHMB for the academic years 2009-10 to 2012-13. I have also included the copy of the Quality Monitoring visit carried out by the University of Liverpool in April 2009.
2. Minutes of the Learning and Teaching Committee can be provided if required but as the majority of the information in them relates to matters of curriculum development and day-to-day running of the programme, they are not included with this report. They have been checked and there are no reports in them that indicate any problems with the Obstetrics and Gynaecology placements at UHMB.

3. Minutes of the Student Parliament/Staff:Student Liaison Committee can also be provided if required but they are day-to-day concerns of the students regarding the running of the programme. They too have been checked and contain no reports of concerns with Obstetrics and Gynaecology teaching at UHMB.
4. We have had no letters from students containing complaints about Obstetrics and Gynaecology teaching at the Trust in the period covered by the Investigation and under the jurisdiction of LMS.
5. We have had no letters from students containing complaints about other Departments in the Trust in the period covered by the Investigation and under the jurisdiction of LMS.
6. Throughout the period covered by the Investigation and under the jurisdiction of LMS, the feedback from students regarding teaching in Obstetrics and Gynaecology at the Trust and in Furness General Hospital in particular has been extremely good – with several members of staff picked out for particular praise.

I hope this information, and that contained in the attachments to this letter, is what you require. Please do not hesitate to get back to me if further information is necessary

Yours sincerely

Prof AS Garden

Head, Lancaster Medical School