

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **Investigation Summaries of Interviews November 2014**

**3 November 2014**

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH DAVID HOLDEN**

David Holden was interviewed on 3 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

David was interviewed because, from April until August 2013, he was the Interim Director of Governance at the Trust.

The Panel asked David what the priorities were that he faced when he took up the appointment and about the structure within the Governance Directorate.

He was asked about induction, audit, risks, patient experience information and how he reported this information to the Trust's Quality Committee.

He was asked about the involvement of non-executive directors and about the access he had to the Board to support the development and resourcing of the Governance structure.

The Panel also asked David about clinical involvement in the governance process at the Trust.

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JUDITH KURUTAC**

Judith Kurutac was interviewed on 3 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman and Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Judith was interviewed because she was the Local Supervisory Authority (LSA) Midwife from 1999 until 2013.

The Panel asked Judith what her specific role and responsibilities were. She was asked about communication with midwives, supervisors of midwives, Primary Care Trusts (PCTs) and Trust Chief Executives in respect of audit findings made by the LSA.

The Panel asked Judith particularly about information supplied to the LSA by the Trust and about record keeping at the Trust. Judith was asked how the NW LSA reported to the Nursing and Midwifery Council in respect of concerns about service delivery.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ANGELA WHITAKER**

Angela Whitaker was interviewed on 3 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman and Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics.

Angela was interviewed because, until 2013, she was a neonatal matron at the Trust.

She was asked about the priorities she faced when taking up her post and about resourcing across the Bay. The Panel asked Angela about the relationship between the different clinical groups including neonatal nurses, midwives, paediatricians and obstetricians. The Panel asked Angela about the policy and practice of transferring sick babies out of the Trust, about the role and responsibilities of the neonatal matron, about the access she had to senior managers and the frequency of that access.

Angela was asked about training and development for neonatal nurses, about resourcing difficulties and workloads and also about the culture of the organisation.

In addition Angela was asked about serious untoward incidents and how they were investigated and how the learning from those incidents was disseminated and embedded.

## **4 November 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JENNIFER CLAY**

Jennifer Clay was interviewed on 4 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Julian Brookes expert advisor on governance.

Jennifer was interviewed by the Panel in respect of her post as a public health analyst working with Cumbria Primary Care Trust (PCT).

The Panel asked Jennifer how the public health analytical team collected data (including data from the Trust), analysed it and provided that data to the PCTs Director of Public Health to enable the commissioners to have as full a possible picture of activity across the area.

Jennifer was asked about the complexity of effective data collection, analysis and the challenges of collating information to support commissioning when Trusts were reliant upon individual IT systems to capture data.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ALAN JEFFERSON**

Alan Jefferson was interviewed on 4 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Julian Brookes expert advisor on governance and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Alan was interviewed because he had held the post as the Regional Director for the North West at the Care Quality Commission (CQC) when it was established in 2009. Alan retired from the CQC in 2010.

The Panel asked Alan about his involvement with the Trust and how he became aware of issues of concern at the Trust.

He was asked how he liaised with the Trust, the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA), Monitor and the Parliamentary Health Service Ombudsman (PHSO).

The Panel asked Alan about the registration process for Trusts and about how the regional team at the CQC liaised with national colleagues. The Panel asked Alan about the Fielding Report.

## **6 November 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH IBRAHIM HUSSEIN**

Ibrahim Hussein was interviewed on 6 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Catherine Calderwood the expert advisor on obstetrics, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics and Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor on midwifery.

Ibrahim was interviewed by the Investigation Panel because he was a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist at the Trust from 1987, the Clinical Director for obstetrics, gynaecology and paediatrics from 1998 until 2008, subsequently the Clinical Lead for obstetrics and gynaecology from 2008 to 2010 and from 2010 onwards, the Associate Medical Director for obstetrics, gynaecology and paediatrics.

The Panel asked Ibrahim particularly about his role and responsibility as Clinical Director and what his management responsibilities were in this post.

He was asked how the maternity and neonatals operated to provide effective care and about the working relationships between clinical groups involved in delivering that care. He was asked about serious untoward incidents, in particular how these were reported and investigated, how lessons were learnt from them and about the relationship between him and the Director of Nursing to ensure that action plans were progressed.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

The Panel asked Ibrahim about resourcing issues at the Trust and how he addressed them.

He was also asked about his management responsibilities and how he communicated with and reported to the Executive Board.

Ibrahim was also asked about reports that were undertaken to assess the maternity services being delivered at the Trust and how the findings of the reports were shared and disseminated and acted upon.

## **11 November 2014**

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH CHRISTINE BEASLEY**

Christine Beasley was interviewed on 11 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Christine was interviewed because she held the role of Chief Nursing Officer (CNO) from 2004 until 2012.

Christine was asked by the Panel how she first became aware of events at the Trust and how such information was communicated to her. She was asked about the working relationship with Regional Nurse Directors and about the communication channels between regional colleagues and the Department of Health.

She was asked about the role of the Local Supervisory Authority (LSA) and the relationship between the LSA, Strategic Health Authorities (SHAs) and Trusts. She was also asked about nurse training and models of care.

The Panel asked Christine about recruitment of midwives in rural and geographically dispersed areas and about the development of maternity and neonatal networks.

Christine was asked about how arms length bodies work effectively together to enact change. She was also asked about the Foundation Trust application process and how quality issues and concerns, brought to her attention as CNO, were addressed in the Department of Health.

She was also asked about how the SHA liaised with the Department of Health about incidents at the Trust.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH MARIAN DRAZEK**

Marian Drazek was interviewed on 11 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Marian was interviewed by the Investigation Panel because she was the Local Supervisory Authority (LSA)'s Maternity Officer. She held the post from 1996 until 2010.

The Panel asked Marian about her role and responsibility and about how the work of the LSA was resourced and managed.

They asked about the numbers of midwives and midwifery supervisors that the LSA in the North West region was responsible for and about the communication between the LSA and both individual midwives and Trusts. The Panel asked Marian about the supervision of midwives at the Trust, about the annual audit process and the interaction between the LSA and senior nursing managers at the former North West Strategic Health Authority.

## **12 November 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH SAEED GHANIM**

Saeed Ghanim was interviewed on 12 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Catherine Calderwood the expert advisor on obstetrics, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Saeed was interviewed by the Investigation Panel because he was a consultant paediatrician at the Trust from 2005 until 2014.

The Panel asked Saeed to outline his role and responsibilities at the Trust and how he managed his time to ensure that he covered all of the responsibilities of his post.

The Panel asked Saeed about contact and communication between clinical specialists within the Unit and about communications with Trust management, in particular regarding any concerns and/or learning from incidents. They asked Saeed about incident reporting and the clinical management and clinical governance structures in place to respond to the findings of any incident that occurred.

Saeed was asked about the strategic review of paediatric services at the Trust that was carried out by Andrew Mitchell and about how guidelines and protocols were prepared, cleared and shared within the Trust.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH SARAH SEAHOLME**

Sarah Seaholme was interviewed on 12 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Catherine Calderwood the expert advisor on obstetrics, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Sarah was interviewed because until May 2010 she was the Investigations Manager for the Care Quality Commission (CQC).

Sarah was asked about her role and responsibilities as the Investigation Manager, the referrals process and how cases progressed to the initial consideration stage.

The Panel asked her about the governance systems that were in place at the CQC in respect of her role.

In addition the Panel asked Sarah about the volume of cases that were considered by the Investigations Team and what the process was if a case was re-referred at a later stage.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH PATRICK WARD**

Patrick Ward was interviewed on 12 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Catherine Calderwood the expert advisor on obstetrics, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Patrick was interviewed because he was formerly a consultant paediatrician at the Trust. He held a post there from 2000 until 2013 and from 2005 had responsibility as the neonatal lead.

The Panel asked Patrick about his role and responsibilities as a consultant paediatrician at the Trust and about how the paediatric unit was resourced and managed. He was also asked about the role of visiting specialists and how the rota for clinics was managed and what interaction there was between paediatricians from Royal Lancaster Infirmary and from elsewhere.

He was also asked about how the team of paediatricians worked with other clinical groups across the Trust – notably obstetricians and midwives – to deliver an effective service.

The Panel asked Patrick about his involvement with management at the Trust and about how, as a consultant paediatrician, he worked with the Clinical Lead and Medical Director to ensure that there was an effective flow of information, learning and communications.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

**24 November 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH MIRANDA CARTER AND VICTORIA WOODHATCH**

Miranda Carter and Victoria Woodhatch were interviewed on 24 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Miranda was interviewed because she is Monitor's Director of Provider Appraisal and had led the team that considered the Trust's application for Foundation Trust (FT) status and Victoria Woodhatch was interviewed because she held a role in the assessment function that reported to Miranda Carter.

The Panel asked about the FT application process Monitor managed. The Panel asked specifically about the Trust's application, how it was initially considered and how it was subsequently reactivated, considered and subsequently approved by Monitor.

Miranda was asked about communications between Monitor and the Care Quality Commission (CQC) both Regional and National offices, the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA), and the Parliamentary Health Services Ombudsman (PHSO). The Panel asked Miranda about the internal processes at Monitor and how it communicated with the Department of Health to effectively manage the Foundation Trust application process.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH VEENA SHARAN**

Veena Sharan was interviewed on 24 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Veena was interviewed because she was a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist at Furness General Hospital from 2002 until 2010.

The Panel asked Veena about quality issues and how they were managed. In addition the Panel asked who had responsibility for disseminating information regarding the quality of care. The Panel also asked Veena about the reporting of serious untoward incidents.

They were interested to know how issues of concern were raised and guidance and learning was communicated across the Trust.

Veena was asked about recruitment and resourcing in the obstetrics and gynaecology department and how this impacted on the care delivered in the maternity unit. The Panel asked Veena about external reports that were commissioned by the Trust, in particular the Fielding Report.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH RUSSELL DUNKELD**

Russell Dunkeld was interviewed on 24 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Russell was a nurse at the Trust from 1987 until 2009 and was asked by the Panel about his role and responsibilities during his time there.

The Panel asked Russell about incidents that arose and how he raised concerns about those incidents and how, subsequently, those concerns were addressed by Trust management.

## **28 November 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH GEOFF JOLLIFFE**

Geoff Jolliffe was interviewed on 28 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Geoff was interviewed because he was previously the Medical Advisor to Cumbria Primary Care Trust (PCT) when it was formed in 2006.

The Panel asked Geoff about his role and responsibilities in particular how he liaised between primary and secondary care providers, with managers and clinicians at the Trust and the Clinical Commissioning Group and, previously, within the PCT.

Geoff was asked about working with the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA) regarding the strategic plans for commissioning in Cumbria and the provision of maternity services.

The Panel asked about Gold Command and how issues of concern regarding maternity and neonatal services at the Trust were brought to his attention. He was asked how the PCT Board were alerted to concerns about quality and in particular the reporting of serious untoward incidents (SUIs).

Geoff was also asked how quality measures are now built into the commissioning and contracting process with providers.



# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH DAVID BENNETT**

David Bennett was interviewed on 28 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

David was interviewed because he is currently the Chief Executive of Monitor having taken up the post, initially on an interim basis, in 2010.

The Panel asked David about the governance and management of Monitor and in particular what involvement the Chief Executive had with Foundation Trust (FT) application's. He was asked about the FT application from the University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay NHS Trust and about why, and how, the application was suspended and then reintroduced and reconsidered.

The Panel asked David about the consideration of quality issues in respect of FT applications, including quality governance.

David was asked about the PwC Governance Review and the Central Manchester Report both of which are included in the Investigation's terms of reference.

The Panel also asked what changes to the approval system Monitor had introduced in light of the Mid Staffs Report and about its working relationship with colleagues at the Care Quality Commission (CQC) in assessing the suitability of Trust's to achieve Foundation Trust status. David was also asked how Monitor obtained assurance from local commissioners and how they contributed their views on the suitability of a Trust in their locality to be awarded FT status.

The Panel also asked about effective communications between Monitor and all other partner organisations involved in the supervision, support and regulation of Trusts.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH UNA O'BRIEN**

Una O'Brien was interviewed on 28 November 2014 by Bill Kirkup, the Investigation Chairman, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Una was interviewed because she is currently the Permanent Secretary at the Department of Health having taken up that post in 2010. Previously, within the Department of Health, she had been the Director of Policy and Strategy and then from 2007 a Director General when she was accountable for the sponsorship of the Care Quality Commission (CQC).

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Una was asked about her role and responsibility as Permanent Secretary and the role of the Department as the sponsor of some of the partner organisations that were involved with the Trust.

The Panel asked about the responsibilities the Department of Health had in respect of quality and about the relationship between the Permanent Secretary and the Chief Executive of the National Health Service. The Panel were interested to learn how issues of concern in the health system were brought to the attention of senior managers in the Department.

The Panel asked specifically about correspondence received from the public and how the Department of Health dealt with such matters.

Una was asked when she first became aware of events at the Trust and what action the Department took to address those concerns.

She was also asked about whistleblowing and what action was taken when issues were brought to the concern of senior managers in the Department of Health.

The Panel asked about the role of Strategic Health Authorities (SHA), the involvement between Monitor and the Department of Health in respect of the Trust's Foundation Trust (FT) application and about the creation of the CQC, the transition arrangements when it was established and Una was also asked about the Capability Review of CQC that she lead and which was published in January 2012.

Una was asked about the impact of structural reorganisation on the healthcare system.