

Title: Sheffield UTC

Author: Department for Education (DfE)

Approved in May 2012, opened in September 2013

Impact Assessment – Section 9 Academies Act Duty

1. Section 9 of the Academies Act 2010 places a duty upon the Secretary of State to take into account what the impact of establishing the additional school is likely to be on maintained schools, Academies and institutions within the further education sector in the area in which the additional school is (or is proposed to be) situated. Any adverse impact will need to be balanced against the benefits of establishing the new school.

Background

2. Sheffield UTC will be a 600 place 14 – 19, non-faith school specializing in advanced engineering and manufacturing, and creative and digital media. It will open with an intake of 120 Y10 pupils and 120 Y12 for its first year of operation in September 2013. When at full capacity the Y12 and Y13 places will be 180. It will be located in Sheffield city centre on Shoreham Street, a location that offers easy access to the train station, tram stops and Pond Street bus station. It will be at a point midway between Sheffield College and Sheffield Hallam University, forming an education hub within the Cultural Industries Quarter. The UTC will be based in a new building, although it may also include a refurbished Sydney Works building.

3. Sheffield UTC will be managed by the Sheffield UTC Academy Trust. The Trust's three members are Sheffield College, who are leading the project, Sheffield Hallam University and Sheffield Chamber of Commerce and Industry. Other organisations represented on the Board of the UTC include The University of Sheffield, Sheffield City Council and a mixture of engineering companies, local creative and digital media employer representatives and a school.

Catchment Area and its Characteristics

4. Sheffield UTC will be open to applicants in the Sheffield City Region comprising the local authority districts of Sheffield, Rotherham, Barnsley, Doncaster, Derbyshire Dales, North East Derbyshire, Chesterfield, Bolsover and Bassetlaw. The UTC will also be open to applicants from outside Sheffield City Region, who will be treated as if they were resident in the nearest area to them within the Region.

5. There are around 120 state funded mainstream schools in the 20 Mile area around the UTC. That means, on average, 1, 2 or 3 pupils may go to the UTC from a large number of schools. Transport costs are high and it is judged that fewer pupils per school will be motivated to travel to the UTC beyond 10 miles. The proportion of secondary pupils who travel beyond 5 miles to school in the wider area is between 2 and 6% with an average distance travelled of less than 2 miles. It is therefore officials' view that the UTC is likely to have a minimal impact on schools/academies in the wider catchment area.

6. The proportion of secondary pupils who travel beyond 5 miles to school in the Sheffield LA area, where the UTC is located, is 3.6%. We have therefore limited the

detailed impact assessment to the fifteen secondary schools/academies within a three and a half mile radius of the proposed UTC site as these are those that the UTC is likely to have the greatest impact on.

7. There is currently an overall surplus of secondary school places in the LA Districts closest to the UTC and in the local area (within a 10 mile radius of the UTC) as illustrated in the table below. However, seven of the fifteen closest schools to the UTC in the local area have a deficit of places.

School places at district level and in the local area				
Basic need statistics	Sheffield	Rotherham	Derbyshire	Local area
Total school capacity	32,129	20,411	51,129	17,518
% of surplus places	5.5%	6.7%	5.6%	4.4%
% increase in number of secondary places needed by 2013/14 (basic need)	None	None	None	
Secondary pupil population increase between 2011/12 and 2017/18	-0.8%	-4.0%	-10.6%	

8. The average FSM rate in secondary schools in the local area is higher than the national and LA averages (see table below). When looking at Indices of Multiple Deprivation (IMD), the UTC is located in the 10% most deprived LSOAs (small geographical areas) of the country. This increases to the 20% most deprived LSOAs when including neighbouring LSOAs. Both the FSM rate and the IMD deciles point to evidence of an area that has much higher levels of deprivation relative to other areas in the country.

Deprivation statistics of local area			
	Local area	LA	National
Average FSM rate (2011)	19.5%	16.0%	14.6%
	LSOA deciles		Neighbouring LSOAs deciles
Indices of multiple deprivation (IMD) (most deprived is bottom 10%)	10%-20%		20%-30%

Local Authority View

9. The local authorities in Sheffield, Rotherham, Barnsley, Doncaster, Derbyshire and Nottinghamshire were invited to provide their views on the UTC proposal.

10. Sheffield City Council's view is that it is fully committed to the success of the UTC and in January 2012 demonstrated its commitment by agreeing to purchase and transfer the land on which the new UTC will be built. Local authority representatives will endeavour, as members of the UTC governing body, to make the UTC a successful 14-19 institution that benefits learners and businesses in the city.

11. The Council expects that, due to the wide catchment area, the impact on any individual school at 14 and 16 is likely to be the notional loss of a maximum of five students. The Council is also expecting the secondary intake for Sheffield city to rise

as a result of the demographic uplift with the result that there will be a need for more secondary school places by the end of the decade. The Council feels that the UTC could go some way towards alleviating the pressure on secondary school places that will result. Those learners opting for the UTC curriculum as an appropriate choice at 14 could release accommodation in existing schools and academies so reducing the pressure caused by the rising number of secondary age students in the city.

12. The Council also supports the UTC's corporate priorities that include building a strong and competitive economy and preparing young people for higher skilled, high value jobs. The UTC's specialisms have been identified in Sheffield's Economic Master-plan and by the Local Enterprise Partnership as key growth sectors that are essential to the future economic prosperity of Sheffield and its city-region. The UTC will support economic growth and the creation of more high quality jobs by increasing the supply of skills in these sectors.

13. Rotherham Metropolitan Borough Council's (MBC) view is that it is broadly in agreement with the proposal which responds to the need to open up the education and training market and responds to labour market information and aims to address the skills gap.

14. Doncaster MBC's view is that the location of the UTC would be unlikely to draw pupils from the Doncaster area and that it did not therefore have any qualified objection to the proposal.

15. Derbyshire County Council forwarded the outline details of the UTC proposal to [REDACTED] Eckington School (an 11-18 Specialist Engineering School) and Dronfield Henry Fanshaw School (an 11-18 Specialist Technology School). Both [REDACTED] support the Council's view that the UTC proposal is unlikely to have a significant impact on their own provision and potentially offers an opportunity for a collaborative approach that would benefit all partners.

16. Nottinghamshire County Council confirmed it has no specific views in relation to the proposed Sheffield UTC.

17. Barnsley MBC did not provide a response.

Representations

18. No direct representations have been received by the Department but a public consultation has been carried out by the Sheffield UTC Academy Trust. The consultation ran from 27 January to 9 March 2012. A consultation brochure and questionnaire were widely disseminated across the Sheffield City Region and made available through a specially created website. In addition, views were sought through a series of focus groups with young people, parents and employers, and via a number of stands at major public venues including leisure centres and Meadowhall shopping centre. The full range of stakeholders were consulted including: political leaders; local authorities; other representative and member organisations; schools; colleges; universities; parents; young people; employers; interest groups and influencers and opinion formers relevant to young people and their parents. The general public, businesses and residents close to the proposed site were also consulted.

19. The consultation has shown overwhelming support for the idea of a UTC in Sheffield. Of the 202 responses to the consultation questionnaire, 171 (85%) were in

favour of the UTC, 23 (11%) didn't know and only 6 (3%) were against. Of the 6 against, reasons given included the need for a more central location to the city region, 14-19 year olds were too young to be specialising and the working day was too long.

20. With nearly 100 young people or their parents expressing interest in attending the UTC through the questionnaire, as well as 29 employers interested in participating (beside those engaged through other means), the consultation has demonstrated both the need for the UTC and the strong support that exists for it.

Impact on other schools/academies

21. We have considered the impact the UTC will have on all secondary schools within a three and a half mile radius of the proposed UTC site. The table below shows that opening the UTC is likely to have a minimal impact on nine schools/academies, a moderate impact on five and a high impact on one academy.

22. The impact of the UTC on the six schools/academies rated as high or moderate in the table below is based on the fact that they have low attainment, low Ofsted ratings and high levels of surplus places putting them at a high risk of losing pupils to an attractive new provider, particularly the academy with a high impact rating which was significantly undersubscribed for entry in 2010/11.

Schools within the local area						
School name	Ofsted judgement	School capacity	Proportion of surplus places	% 5A*-C incl Eng & Maths 2011	Distance from UTC site (miles)	Impact Rating
All Saints' Catholic High School	Outstanding	1,244	-11%	50%	0.53	Minimal
King Edward VII School	Good	1,649	-4%	54%	1.38	Minimal
Sheffield Springs Academy	Satisfactory	1,350	23%	32%	1.86	High
Sheffield Park Academy	Satisfactory	1,350	20%	34%	1.9	Moderate
Fir Vale School	Outstanding	710	-7%	40%	1.95	Minimal
Notre Dame High School	Outstanding	1,328	-6%	83%	2.3	Minimal
Newfield Secondary School	Satisfactory	1,050	14%	35%	2.31	Moderate
Tapton School	Outstanding	1,535	-10%	69%	2.41	Minimal
Parkwood Academy	#N/A	900	23%	30%	2.43	Moderate
Forge Valley Community School	#N/A	1,350	#N/A	#N/A	2.66	Minimal
High Storrs School	Good	1,577	-4%	68%	2.92	Minimal
Hinde House 3-16 School	Satisfactory	1,215	-1%	34%	3.2	Minimal
Firth Park Community Arts College	Good	1,365	7%	25%	3.25	Minimal
The City School	Satisfactory	1,345	18%	42%	3.28	Moderate
Chaucer Business and Enterprise College	Satisfactory	900	5%	25%	3.37	Moderate

Schools/academies where the impact is high or moderate

(a) Sheffield Springs Academy

23. Sheffield Springs Academy is 1.86 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has capacity for 1350 pupils. There was a surplus capacity in this school of 23% in 2010/11. The school was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted in its last inspection in September 2010. Although rated satisfactory, Ofsted found that the school no longer required significant improvement, achievement was satisfactory and rising and the quality of teaching had improved and was satisfactory. However, the inspection found that further improvements were required to accelerate the pace of learning to raise attainment further, develop students' skills so that they are confident to take greater responsibility for their learning and reflect on their learning and to strengthen the strategic leadership of the sixth form. There was a follow up monitoring visit in February 2012 which found that the academy had made inadequate progress in making these improvements and the effectiveness of the academy in improving pupils' behaviour was inadequate.

24. The school had a low attainment rate in 2011, with 32% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths, below the Sheffield LA average of 49% and well below the national average of 58%. There was no improvement in the attainment rate compared to 2010 (although results have improved from 23% in 2009). Ofsted found little evidence that overall, standards of teaching had improved since the last inspection. The follow up visit also identified ongoing problems with the quality of leadership and management of the school.

25. The academy's Ofsted rating and low attainment rate which did not improve between 2010 and 2011 probably mean it is not a popular choice with parents and may indicate why it is significantly undersubscribed for entry in 2010/11. The opening of a UTC less than two miles from the academy could be a more attractive proposition to parents and this may exacerbate the high surplus. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as high.

(b) Sheffield Park Academy

26. Sheffield Park Academy is 1.9 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has capacity for 1350 pupils. There was surplus capacity in this school of 20% in 2010/11. The school was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted in its last inspection.

27. The school had a low attainment rate in 2011, with 34% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths, below the Sheffield LA average of 49% and well below the national average of 58%. However, there has been a modest improvement in the attainment rate over the three years 2009 to 2011.

28. The low attainment, low Ofsted rating and high level of surplus places in the school is likely to put the school at risk of losing pupils if parents regard the opening of a new UTC less than 2 miles away from the school as a more attractive option. However, this is mitigated by an improving attainment rate at the school and the impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

(c) Newfield Secondary School

29. Newfield Secondary School is 2.31 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has a capacity of 1050 pupils. There was surplus capacity in this school of 14% in 2010/11. The school was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted in its last inspection.

30. The school had a below average attainment rate in 2011, with 35% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths compared to the Sheffield LA average of 49% and the national average of 58%. There was a dip in the attainment rate compared to 2010.

31. The low and falling attainment rate in the school suggests that pupils are not engaged in the academic curriculum. This combined with the low Ofsted rating and significant surplus capacity has the potential to put the school at risk of losing pupils to the UTC although the longer travelling distance, beyond the average distance travelled in Sheffield (1.5 miles), may be a mitigating factor. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

(d) Parkwood Academy

32. Parkwood Academy is 2.43 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has a capacity of 900 pupils. There was a surplus capacity in this school of 23% in 2010/11. The school opened on 1 September 2009 has not yet been inspected by Ofsted.

36. The school had a low attainment rate in 2011, with 30% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths, below the Sheffield LA average of 49% and well below the national average of 58%. However, there was a small improvement in the attainment rate compared to 2010.

33. Parkwood Academy has only been open for two and a half years and has not yet had an Ofsted inspection. The school was significantly undersubscribed for entry in 2010/11 and has a low, but improving, attainment rate. There is therefore a risk of the school losing pupils to the UTC but the school is located beyond the average distance travelled in Sheffield (1.5 miles) and this may deter some pupils from travelling to the UTC. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

(e) The City School

34. The City School is 3.28 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has a capacity of 1345 pupils. There was a surplus capacity in this school of 18% in 2010/11. The school was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted in its last inspection.

35. The school had a below average attainment rate in 2011, with 42% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths compared to the Sheffield LA average of 49% and the national average of 58%. However, there has been a significant improvement in the attainment rate over the three years 2009 to 2011.

36. The below average attainment rate, low Ofsted rating and significant level of surplus places in the school could put the school at risk of losing pupils if parents regard the opening of a new UTC as a more attractive option. However, the attainment rate at the school is not too far off the Sheffield LA average and is improving. The travelling distance to the UTC is over 3 miles, more than twice the average distance travelled in Sheffield (1.5 miles), may deter some parents and pupils from applying for a UTC place. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

(f) Chaucer Business and Enterprise College

37. Chaucer Business and Enterprise College is 3.37 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has a capacity of 900 pupils. There was a surplus capacity in this school of 5% in 2010/11. The school was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted in its last inspection.

38. The school had a low attainment rate in 2011, with 25% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths, below the Sheffield LA average of 49% and well below the national average of 58%. There was a dip in the attainment rate compared to 2010.

39. The low and falling attainment rate in the school suggests that pupils are not engaged in the academic curriculum. This combined with the low Ofsted rating and surplus capacity has the potential to put the school at risk of losing pupils to the UTC although the longer travelling distance to the UTC of over twice the average distance travelled in Sheffield (1.5 miles) is likely to be a mitigating factor. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

Schools/academies where the impact is minimal

40. Nine of the schools/academies considered have all been assessed as being minimally affected by the opening of the UTC. All but three currently have more pupils on their roll than their capacity, thus highlighting the need for high quality secondary school places in the Sheffield city area. All are unlikely to lose a significant number of pupils to the UTC. All but one of these schools either has an attainment rate above the Sheffield LA average of 49% or was rated good or outstanding by Ofsted.

41. The exception is Hinde House 3-16 School which has below average attainment with only 34% of pupils achieving 5 GCSEs at A*-C including English and Maths and was rated as satisfactory by Ofsted. However, the school is 3.2 miles from the proposed UTC site, which is around twice the average distance travelled in Sheffield (1.5 miles), and has more pupils on its roll than its capacity. Officials are therefore of the view that while the school may lose a small number of pupils to the UTC it should still be able to fill most of its places. The impact for Hinde House 3-16 School has therefore been assessed as minimal.

Impact on Primary Schools, Special Schools and Alternative Providers

42. The Sheffield UTC will be a school admitting pupils in the 14 to 19 age range offering a curriculum focussing on technical studies alongside core academic subjects. Students will study for national qualifications in the UTC specialisms of advanced engineering and creative and digital media.

43. This is substantially different from the provision offered by Alternative providers and special schools and we therefore expect the potential impact on these providers to be minimal. We also expect Primary Schools to be relatively unaffected because there is no overlap in age group between a primary school (5-11 year olds) and a UTC (14-19 year olds).

Impact on FE Institutions

44. There are five colleges within a ten mile radius of the proposed UTC site. The table below shows that opening the UTC is likely to have a minimal impact on four colleges and a moderate impact on one sixth form college.

Colleges within the local area					
College name	Ofsted	Number of learners aged 16-18	Proportion of learners aged 16-18	Average Point Score per student	Impact Rating
The Sheffield College	Satisfactory	7,267	53%	617.0	Minimal
Rotherham College of Arts and Technology	Satisfactory	2,605	42%	580.8	Minimal
Chesterfield College	Good	4,340	70%	663.1	Minimal
Longley Park Sixth Form College	Satisfactory	1,284	100%	643.7	Moderate
Thomas Rotherham College	Satisfactory	1,540	100%	854.5	Minimal

Colleges where the impact is moderate

Longley Park Sixth Form College

45. Longley Park Sixth Form College is 4.1 miles from the proposed UTC site. It has 1284 learners aged 16-18. It is rated as satisfactory by Ofsted and has below average attainment with an average point score per student at level 3 of 643.7 in 2010 compared to the Sheffield LA average of 708.1 and the national average of 726.5.

46. The below average attainment rate and low Ofsted rating leaves the College at risk of losing some potential learners if students regard the opening of a new UTC as a more attractive option. However, the College is 4.1 miles away from the UTC and is a medium sized provider so even if it did lose some pupils to the new UTC we do not expect this to affect the long-term viability of the college. The impact of the opening of the UTC has therefore been assessed as moderate.

Colleges where the impact is minimal

47. Four of the colleges considered have all been assessed as being minimally affected by the opening of the UTC. Two of these colleges perform below the LA and national averages and are rated as satisfactory by Ofsted but have a lower proportion of 16-18 year old learners which would lessen the impact of the loss of a few potential students to the UTC. One college has below average performance but is rated as good by Ofsted and another, the Thomas Rotherham College, has a satisfactory Ofsted rating but achieved an average points score per student at level 3 in 2010, above the LA and national averages.

48. It is considered unlikely that all four colleges with a minimal rating will lose potential learners to the UTC or may lose some but will still be able to fill most or all of their places. It is also considered unlikely that the opening of the UTC will significantly impact on the long term financial viability of the colleges or on a specific specialism of the colleges.

Conclusion

49. The impact on the majority of secondary schools/academies and FE institutions should be minimal as we do not expect them to lose a significant number of students

to the new UTC and even if they did lose students to the UTC, they should still be able to fill most or all of their places and any impact will be spread across a large number of schools. While some schools/academies and colleges may experience a moderate impact we do not expect them to lose sufficient numbers of students to affect their long-term viability. The one school with a high impact rating was significantly undersubscribed for entry in 2010/11 and the UTC may exacerbate the high surplus in this school in the short term.

50. It is hard to predict whether or not concentrations of students will move from any particular providers to the UTC and for the majority of schools/academies and colleges any impact of the UTC is likely to be mitigated by the positive impact that the Sheffield UTC will have on parental choice and driving up standards in the Sheffield City Region.