



Department  
for Environment  
Food & Rural Affairs

T: 03459 33 55 77 or  
08459 33 55 77  
helpline@defra.gsi.gov.uk  
[www.gov.uk/defra](http://www.gov.uk/defra)

[REDACTED]

**Our ref:** RFI 6805  
**Date:** 09/2014

Dear [REDACTED],

**REQUEST FOR INFORMATION: MARINE CONSERVATION ZONE (MCZ) ECONOMIC  
IMPACT ASSESSMENT**

Thank you for your request for information about the MCZ Economic Impact Assessment process, which we received on 06/08/2018. As you know, we have handled your request under the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 (EIRs).

The EIRs apply to requests for environmental information, which is a broad category of information defined in regulation 2 of the EIRs. Public authorities are required to handle requests for environmental information under the EIRs. They give similar access rights to the Freedom of Information Act 2000 (FOIA).

Within your request, you asked:

“A number of management scenarios are given for each rMCZ in the Impact Assessment. Who (which bodies) created these management scenarios, and how were they decided?”

The management scenarios used in the impact assessments for each particular rMCZ are dependent on the conservation objectives of features proposed for designation in rMCZs. The conservation objectives are based on advice from the Statutory Nature Conservation Bodies (SNCBs) which are Natural England (NE) and the Joint Nature Conservation Committee (JNCC). More information is given in Box 1, p. 6 of the final impact assessment<sup>1</sup>. The management scenarios used in the impact assessment are based on a SNCB paper on the sensitivity of particular features to particular gear types<sup>2</sup> supplemented by site specific knowledge, local stakeholder input and expert judgement from SNCBs,

---

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukia/2013/190/pdfs/ukia\\_20130190\\_en.pdf](http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukia/2013/190/pdfs/ukia_20130190_en.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/Images/MCZ-fish-impacts\\_tcm6-26384.pdf](http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/Images/MCZ-fish-impacts_tcm6-26384.pdf)



Regional Project and Defra economists. Stakeholders were given the opportunity to comment on these scenarios and responses were considered in the impact assessment.

Management measures for MCZs will be set by the regulatory authorities after designation and be determined by what is required to meet a site's conservation objectives. Since these measures are not known in advance, the IAs contain illustrative examples of likely management scenarios and cannot prejudge regulator decisions. There are likely to be a range of management measures across and within MCZs, delivering differing levels of protection depending upon the sensitivity of the features to the activities taking place in that area and on the conservation objectives of those features.

In response to the second part of your request asking:

“What was the methodology used to make the assumption about the likelihood of the lowest and highest cost scenarios occurring to derive the best estimate?”

A full explanation of the approach used to assessing the impacts on commercial fisheries is given by a paper on the Natural England website<sup>3</sup> (Annex H7), although the displacement assumption was added for the tranche 1 consultation IA. Where the likelihood between the lowest and highest cost scenario was not known or considered equal the best estimate was halfway between the low and high cost estimate. Where the high cost scenario was considered less likely (based on SNCB advice and Defra and Regional Project economist expert judgement) the best estimate was 25% of the range between the low and high cost scenarios.

The assumption that 75% of fishing Gross Value Added (GVA) can be displaced to other locations is based on the low overlap of MCZs with core fishing grounds, suggesting that it is reasonable to assume that most catch can still be sourced from existing fishing grounds. Discussion of the displacement assumption is given in the impact assessment in Table 4, p.23 and paragraph 6.13, p.29.

In keeping with the spirit and effect of the EIRs, and in keeping with the government's Transparency Agenda, all information is assumed to be releasable to the public unless exempt. Therefore, the information released to you will now be published on [www.gov.uk](http://www.gov.uk) together with any related information that will provide a key to its wider context. Please note that this will not include your personal data.

I attach Annex A, which explains the copyright that applies to the information being released to you.

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://publications.naturalengland.org.uk/publication/1940011>

I also attach Annex B giving contact details should you be unhappy with the service you have received.

If you have any queries about this letter, please contact me.

Yours

The Defra FOI and EIRs Team

E: [informationrequests@defra.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:informationrequests@defra.gsi.gov.uk)

## Annex A

### Copyright

The information supplied to you continues to be protected by copyright. You are free to use it for your own purposes, including for private study and non-commercial research, and for any other purpose authorised by an exception in current copyright law. Documents (except photographs or logos) can be also used in the UK without requiring permission for the purposes of news reporting. Any other re-use, for example commercial publication, would require the permission of the copyright holder.

Most documents produced by Defra will be protected by Crown Copyright. Most Crown copyright information can be re-used under the [Open Government Licence](#). For information about the OGL and about re-using Crown Copyright information please see [The National Archives website](#).

Copyright in other documents may rest with a third party. For information about obtaining permission from a third party see the [Intellectual Property Office's website](#).

---

## Annex B

### Complaints

If you are unhappy with the service you have received in relation to your request you may make a complaint or appeal against our decision under section 17(7) of the FOIA or under regulation 18 of the EIRs, as applicable, within 40 working days of the date of this letter. Please write to Mike Kaye, Head of Information Standards, Area 4D, Nobel House, 17 Smith Square, London, SW1P 3JR (email: [requestforinfo@defra.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:requestforinfo@defra.gsi.gov.uk)) and he will arrange for an internal review of your case. Details of Defra's complaints procedure are on our [website](#).

If you are not content with the outcome of the internal review, section 50 of the FOIA and regulation 18 of the EIRs gives you the right to apply directly to the Information Commissioner for a decision. Please note that generally the Information Commissioner cannot make a decision unless you have first exhausted Defra's own complaints procedure. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office  
Wycliffe House  
Water Lane  
Wilmslow  
Cheshire  
SK9 5AF