

IRP

Independent Reconfiguration Panel

***ADVICE ON SHAPING A HEALTHIER FUTURE
PROPOSALS FOR CHANGES TO NHS SERVICES
IN NORTH WEST LONDON***

APPENDICES

Submitted to the Secretary of State for Health

13 SEPTEMBER 2013



Independent Reconfiguration Panel

6th Floor

157 – 197 Buckingham Palace Road

London

SW1W 9SP

Tel: 020 7389 8045/8046

Email: info@irpanel.org.uk

Website: www.irpanel.org.uk

Press Office

Tel: 020 7025 7530

Email: press@irpanel.org.uk

CONTENTS

Report appendices

- 1 Independent Reconfiguration Panel general terms of reference
- 2 Letter of referral to The Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP, the Secretary of State for Health from Cllr Abdullah Gulaid, Chair Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel, 19 March 2013
- 3 Letter to Lord Ribeiro, IRP Chairman, from Secretary of State for Health commissioning IRP review, 23 May 2013
- 4 Letter to Secretary of State for Health from IRP Chairman attaching proposed Terms of Reference, 30 May 2013 and Secretary of State for Health's response, 13 June 2013
- 5 IRP press releases, 18 June 2013 and 9 July 2013
- 6 Letter to editors of local press from Lord Ribeiro, 18 June 2013
- 7 Site visits, meetings and conversations held
- 8 Information made available to the Panel
- 9 Panel membership
- 10 About the Independent Reconfiguration Panel

Appendix One

Independent Reconfiguration Panel general terms of reference

The Independent Reconfiguration Panel is an advisory non-departmental public body. Its terms of reference are:

A1 To provide expert advice on:

- Proposed NHS reconfigurations or significant service change;
- Options for NHS reconfigurations or significant service change;

referred to the Panel by Ministers.

A2 In providing advice, the Panel will consider whether the proposals will provide safe, sustainable and accessible services for the local population, taking account of:

- i. clinical and service quality
- ii. the current or likely impact of patients' choices and the rigour of public involvement and consultation processes
- iii. the views and future referral needs of local GPs who commission services, the wider configuration of the NHS and other services locally, including likely future plans
- iv. other national policies, including guidance on NHS service change
- v. any other issues Ministers direct in relation to service reconfigurations generally or specific reconfigurations in particular

A3 The advice will normally be developed by groups of experts not personally involved in the proposed reconfiguration or service change, the membership of which will be agreed formally with the Panel beforehand.

A4 The advice will be delivered within timescales agreed with the Panel by Ministers with a view to minimising delay and preventing disruption to services at local level.

B1 To offer pre-formal consultation generic advice and support to NHS and other interested bodies on the development of local proposals for reconfiguration or significant service change - including advice and support on methods for public engagement and formal public consultation.

C1 The effectiveness and operation of the Panel will be reviewed annually.

Appendix Two

Letter to Secretary of State for Health from Cllr A Gulaid, Chair Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel, 19 March 2013



Councillor Dr. Abdullah Gulaid
Chair, Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel

Councillor Anita Kapoor
Vice-Chair, Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel

To: **Rt. Hon Jeremy Hunt MP**
Secretary of State for Health
Department of Health
Room 407
Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2NS

Please contact: **Matthew Booth**
Director of Policy and Performance
Ealing Council
Perceval House
14-16 Uxbridge Road
London
W5 2HL
Telephone: 020 8825 8556
Email: boothm@ealing.gov.uk

19 March 2013

Dear Secretary of State,

'Shaping a Healthier Future' – Referral for Review

Following a meeting of the Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel of London Borough of Ealing ("the Panel") on 4 March 2013, we write to refer for your consideration the decision of the North West London Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts ("JCPCT"), reached on 19 February 2013, to make resolutions in connection with the Shaping a Healthier Future programme ("SAHF"). The JCPCT resolved that there should take place major downgrades of a number of hospitals serving Ealing residents: Ealing, Hammersmith, Central Middlesex and Charing Cross. These hospitals will lose accident and emergency services, emergency surgery services, non-elective medicine and surgery services, complex elective medicine and surgery services, a level 3 Intensive Care Unit, in-patient paediatric services, and obstetrics and maternity services.

The impact of the Panel's decision on Ealing's residents is severe. This has not, in the Panel's view, been sufficiently appreciated by the JCPCT. Indeed, whilst currently Ealing residents have the choice of a number of local hospitals to access the full range of healthcare services, this choice has practically been removed *altogether*. Not only does the JCPCT's decision result in the downgrading of the *only* hospital located in the London Borough of Ealing itself (Ealing Hospital), but it also downgrades three other hospitals that are proximate to the Borough and are used extensively by Ealing residents: Hammersmith, Central Middlesex and Charing Cross. The residents of no other borough are affected as severely as those living in Ealing.

The Panel has looked closely at the proposals, including with the benefit of a detailed expert report from a former NHS executive, and is firmly of the view that the proposal is not in the interests of the health service in Ealing. The proposal fails to satisfy the four tests that you have set for reconfiguration proposals to meet in your document *Revision to the Operating Framework for the NHS in England 2010/2011*. The Panel does not



believe that there has been adequate consultation or engagement with the public, clinicians or Ealing Council (“the Council”). The Panel therefore refers the matter to you under Regulation 4 of the Local Authority (Overview and Scrutiny Committees Health Scrutiny) Functions Regulations 2002.

We attach as Appendices to this letter comprehensive supporting evidence to support this request for referral. Titles of the Appendices are listed at the end of this letter for ease of reference.

The Appendices include documents sent by the Council to Anne Rainsberry, Chief Executive of NHS NW London in response to NHS NW London’s purported consultation in connection with SAHF (Appendices 2, 4a and 4b, 5-7 inclusive, and 12a and 12b). These include a paper summarising the issues arising from SAHF from the Council’s perspective, drawing substantially on the independent review of the proposals drafted by Tim Rideout (“the Rideout Report”); the Rideout Report itself; and the views of some key local stakeholders on the proposals, including Ealing Hospital and the Shadow Health and Well-Being Board, and the Panel’s views expressed to NHS NW London during the consultation period.

Appendices 8, 12a, 12b and 13 contain the correspondence between NHS NW London and LBE in relation to Shaping a Healthier Future. Appendixes 1a and 1b comprise the main report to the Panel, and Appendix 14 is the resolution of the Panel to refer the matter to you. Appendix 11 is a document produced by a panel member detailing concerns with the nature of the data employed by SAHF in support of its proposals, produced for this referral subsequent to the Panel’s 4 March meeting. Appendices 1a – 10 inclusive contain documentation formally submitted to the Panel before it made its decision to refer.

We note that Mr Rideout is a recognised specialist in change management, financial strategy and organisational turnaround and a former Chief Executive in the NHS. You will see that the Rideout Report, which followed a systematic review and testing of the business case for the proposals and discussions with key internal and external stakeholders, contains numerous criticisms both of the substance of the proposals and the way that the preferred option was identified, and the consultation which NHS NW London purported to undertake. It is not apparent that the JCPCT properly took into account the points made in the Council’s consultation response through the Rideout Report at all.

We also draw your attention to the fact that there is very significant public opposition to the proposals across Ealing. Some 75% of Ealing residents have expressed opposition to the proposed changes. A greater proportion of respondents to the consultation disagree with concentrating fewer services on fewer sites than agree. Local elected leaders across all main political parties in Ealing, and key strategic partnerships such as the Shadow Ealing Health and Well-Being Board, do not support the proposals. The Panel has noted evidence from campaign groups that 80,000 residents across Ealing and Hammersmith and Fulham have signed petitions against the proposals.

The issues arising from the documentation attached are too numerous to set out fully in this letter, and we trust you will look carefully at all those issues and the proposals generally. We would, however, like to draw your particular attention to the following.



First, contrary to what NHS NW London has claimed, it is clear that your four reconfiguration tests have not been met so far as Ealing's health service is concerned. As the Rideout Report shows, the adverse impact on Ealing's residents is far greater than the impact on the residents of North West London as a whole, or of any other borough. This has not been properly acknowledged or catered for in the JCPCT's decision. Contrary to your stated requirement:

(i) there was **wholly insufficient public and patient engagement** at the stage when the proposals for consultation were being formulated. Public participation was largely confined to three pre-consultation engagement events that were attended by, in total, approximately 360 members of the public (about one in five thousand of the population of NW London). There were no specific attempts to engage with local people, and particularly the most vulnerable groups hit hardest by the proposals that emerged. Nor was there any proper attempt to engage the Council at a senior level on a sufficiently detailed basis. This is in circumstances where the proposals place a higher value on institutions than patients, and on finance than health.

(ii) there is plainly **insufficient GP support for the proposals** (see for example Appendixes 4a and 4b). In fact there is evidence of widespread local clinical opposition to the proposals. The Panel has reviewed a considerable body of evidence suggesting substantial opposition from local clinicians, and it is considered that NHS NW London has failed to secure a mandate in favour of the proposals from member practices of the local Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG), a significant majority of which voted **against** the "preferred option".

(iii) there is **insufficient clarity on the clinical evidence base**. This scale of change has never before been tested in the United Kingdom, and yet no proper consideration has been given to the effect of the proposals to downgrade hospitals on resulting standards of care. Moreover, no clear, let alone credible, plan has been developed which addresses the effect of moving activity out of acute settings into new, untested, care settings which are supposed to absorb it. As the Rideout Report (Appendix 2) makes clear, there is currently insufficient capacity and capability in primary and community services to support the proposed changes. In reality what is proposed is a huge experiment, putting the health of vulnerable individuals in Ealing at risk.

In this regard, we also note that should the decision of the JCPCT be upheld, changes to provision in all affected hospitals will mean that NW London will be served by 5 Type 1 emergency departments: equating to 395,440 per Accident & Emergency unit: 52% more than the national average. The Panel has no confidence that that will be sufficient; and it is Ealing residents who are affected the most.

(iv) the proposals are **not consistent with current and prospective patient choice**. Ealing residents are being deprived of practically *all* of their current choice of local hospitals for the full range of services. Not only will they be deprived of the opportunity to access the full range of services at a hospital located in the Borough; other hospitals used extensively by Ealing residents (e.g. Charing Cross, Central Middlesex and Hammersmith) are also being downgraded.

Secondly, there has been a failure properly to consider the effects that the downgrading will have on specific groups within Ealing's population.



The local population in Ealing has a relatively high burden of specific diseases and conditions. It is worse than the England average for obesity in children, physically inactive adults, hospital stays for alcohol related harm, drug use, diabetes, tuberculosis, acute sexually transmitted infections, and early death from heart disease and stroke. Notably high in Ealing is the prevalence of cardiovascular conditions, for which prompt urgent care in emergencies is critical.

Ealing also has a notably diverse community compared to the national average, with certain ethnic groups, for instance, constituting a greater part of the population than elsewhere, and which experience a far higher rate of particular diseases. Those hospitals regularly used by Ealing residents – and, in particular, Ealing Hospital – have developed impressive cultural competence. That will be lost, and there is no adequate plan for its replacement.

In spite of this, there has been no proper consideration of the impacts which the proposals would have on particular groups, and no proper consideration of what should be done to mitigate such impacts. As you will no doubt ascertain, the Equality Impact Assessments carried out are woefully inadequate, failing properly to engage with the specific needs of Ealing residents.

Thirdly, as the Rideout Report explains, there are also a number of general flaws with the underpinning approach adopted by NHS NW London including, importantly, insufficient exploration of alternatives to hospital reconfiguration caused largely by the failure properly to engage, referred to above. There were also fundamental problems with aspects of the methodology used by NHS NW London in further developing the proposals. The sequential nature of the methodology used by NHS NW London to identify the initial “long-list” of eight potential options has not provided the opportunity for all of the options to be tested on a truly comparable basis. It was not appropriate, for example, to use “location” as the primary driver for the development of these options, rather than other factors including the needs of local people and the relative quality of local hospital services.

Fourthly, there are further, compelling, reasons why the proposals should not have been approved at this particular time. No final decisions should be made about hospital reconfiguration until the “Out of Hospital” strategies have been implemented and their performance properly assessed as successful. Further, the decisions have been made by the local Primary Care Trusts on the eve of their abolition. This is highly inappropriate: decisions should not be made until the new Clinical Commissioning Groups are formally established and authorised and are working in partnership with the new Health & Wellbeing Boards. Further still, it is obviously sensible for the potential merger of Ealing Hospitals NHS Trust and North West London Hospitals NHS Trust (including its financial implications) to be addressed prior to deciding upon any reconfiguration.

Fifthly, the consultation conducted by NHS NW London in respect of the proposals was inadequate. The Panel is particularly concerned by the delays in the translation of consultation documents concerning the proposals, which it believes had a negative impact on engagement with the local community in view of the ethnically diverse nature of the Borough’s population, because it unduly shortened the period of time during which proposals could be reviewed and discussed by those groups. It was also inappropriate that the consultation took place over the period of summer and school holidays and the London Olympic and Paralympic Games: one of the busiest summers for Londoners in living memory. In spite of the lack of pre-consultation engagement referred to above, the



consultation document was then structured to support the preferred option rather than providing a sufficiently open consideration of the alternatives.

We trust you will give anxious consideration to whether, in all the circumstances, the decision really is in the interests of the health service in the area of Ealing. As will be apparent from the above, the Panel firmly believes it is not.

Irrespective of the outcome of this referral, we would request that you direct NHS NW London to work closely with the new Health and Wellbeing Board (once formally established), and all relevant stakeholders, in the development of healthcare services and arrangements for Ealing residents.

We look forward to your response, and for any queries please contact Matthew Booth, Director of Policy and Performance using the details above.

Yours sincerely,

Councillor Abdullah Gulaid
(Chair of Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel)

Councillor Anita Kapoor
(Vice-Chair of Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel)

CC Members of the Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel
Councillor Julian Bell, Leader, Ealing Council
Councillor Jasbir Anand, Cabinet Member for Health and Adult Services
Councillor David Millican, Leader, Conservative Group, Ealing Council
Councillor Gary Malcolm, Leader, Liberal Democrat Group, Ealing Council
Martin Smith, Chief Executive, Ealing Council

Jeff Zitron, Chair, NHS NW London
Dr Anne Rainsberry, Chief Executive, NHS NW London
Dr Mohini Parmar, Chair, Ealing Clinical Commissioning Group
Rob Larkman, Accountable Officer, Ealing Clinical Commissioning Group



Appendixes:

- **Appendix 1a:** Scrutiny Cover Report, 4th March Meeting
- **Appendix 1b:** Shaping a Healthier Future Progress Review (paper for 4th March Scrutiny meeting)
- **Appendix 2:** Rideout Report with colour-coded annotations
- **Appendix 3:** Shaping a Healthier Future Ealing Hospital Board consultation response
- **Appendix 4a:** Ealing CCG letter in response to the Shaping a Healthier Future consultation
- **Appendix 4b:** Ealing CCG ballot results in relation to Shaping a Healthier Future
- **Appendix 5:** Shaping a Healthier Future Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel response to consultation
- **Appendix 6:** Summary of Full Council motions in relation to Shaping a Healthier Future
- **Appendix 7:** Summary of key points raised by the Shadow Health and Well-Being Board in relation to Shaping a Healthier Future
- **Appendix 8:** NHS NWL response to Ealing Council's Shaping a Healthier Future consultation submission
- **Appendix 9:** Joint Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee's Final Report on Shaping a Healthier Future
- **Appendix 10:** Recommendations to the Joint Committees of Primary Care Trusts with regard to Shaping a Healthier Future
- **Appendix 11:** Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel member's submission on use of data in Shaping a Healthier Future business case
- **Appendix 12a:** Shaping a Healthier Future consultation response cover letter
- **Appendix 12b:** Shaping a Healthier Future Ealing Council consultation response
- **Appendix 13:** Letter from the Council to Anne Rainsberry, regarding lack of promised response to consultation submission
- **Appendix 14:** Health and Adults Scrutiny Decision Sheet

Appendix Three

Letter to Lord Ribeiro, IRP Chairman, from Secretary of State for Health commissioning IRP review, 23 May 2013

*From the Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP
Secretary of State for Health*



POC1_769662

The Lord Bernard Ribeiro
Chair
Independent Reconfiguration Panel
6th Floor
157-197 Buckingham Palace Road
London
SW1W 9SP

*Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2NS*

*Tel: 020 7210 3000
Mb-sofs@dh.gsi.gov.uk*

23 MAY 2013

Dear Sir,

**“SHAPING A HEALTHIER FUTURE” – NORTH WEST LONDON
RECONFIGURATION OF ACUTE HOSPITALS, REFERRAL
FROM EALING COUNCIL**

I am writing to request the advice of the Independent Reconfiguration Panel (IRP) in relation to the above referral and ask you to undertake a full review.

The advice should be provided by Friday 13 September 2013 and in line with the agreed protocol between the Department of Health and the IRP.

I would be grateful if you could contact James Skelly in Provider Policy here at the Department of Health on 0113 254 6583 if you require any additional information.

I look forward to hearing from you.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Jeremy Hunt'.

JEREMY HUNT

Appendix Four

Letter to Secretary of State for Health from IRP Chairman attaching proposed Terms of Reference, 30 May 2013, and Secretary of State for Health's response, 13 June 2013

IRP

6th Floor
157-197 Buckingham Palace Road
London
SW1W 9SP

The Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP
Secretary of State for Health
Department of Health
Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London SW1A 2NS

30 May 2013

Dear Secretary of State

***Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals for changes to NHS services in north west London
Ealing Council Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel**

Thank you for your letter of 23 May 2013 requesting the IRP's advice about this referral.

You have asked the IRP to undertake a full review and, in light of the documentation received and assessed to date, we would propose a review based on the attached terms of reference.

If you are content with the proposed terms of reference, we look forward to providing you with the IRP's advice by 13 September 2013 as requested.

Yours sincerely



Lord Ribeiro CBE
IRP Chairman

***Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals for changes to NHS services in north west London
Ealing Council Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel**

Terms of Reference for IRP review

With due regard to the Panel's general terms of reference, as agreed between DH and the IRP, the Panel is to advise by 13 September 2013:

- a. Whether it is of the opinion that the *Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals for change will enable safe, sustainable and accessible services for north west London and if not, why not;
- b. On any other observations the Panel may wish to make in relation to the changes; and
- c. On how to proceed in the best interests of local people in light of a and b above and taking into account the issues raised by the Ealing Council Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel in its referral letter of 19 March 2013

From the Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP
Secretary of State for Health



POC1_785366

The Lord Bernard Ribeiro CBE
Chair
Independent Reconfiguration Panel
6th Floor
157 – 197 Buckingham Palace Road
London
SW1W 9SP

Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2NS

Tel: 020 7210 3000
Mb-sofs@dh.gsi.gov.uk

13 JUN 2013

Der Bernie,

**SHAPING A HEALTHIER FUTURE PROPOSALS FOR
CHANGES TO NHS SERVICES IN NORTH WEST LONDON
EALING COUNCIL HEALTH AND ADULT SOCIAL SERVICES
STANDING SCRUTINY PANEL**

Thank you for your letter of 30 May 2013 about the *Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals.

I hereby accept the terms of reference for your review laid down in that letter and I look forward to receiving your advice no later than 13 September 2013.

Yes

JEREMY HUNT

Appendix Five

IRP press releases, 18 June 2013 and 9 July 2013

IRP

www.irpanel.org.uk

**Press release
18 June**

IRP undertaking independent health review

The Independent Reconfiguration Panel (IRP), the independent expert on NHS service change, has started a full review to consider whether the proposed changes to local health services in North West London will enable the provision of safe, sustainable and accessible services for the local population.

The IRP has been asked to carry out the full review of the *Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals by the Secretary of State for health following a referral from the Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel.

Lord Ribeiro, Chairman of the IRP, said: "Our key focus throughout the review will be the patient and quality of care. During the course of the review we will gather evidence locally and listen to all interested parties to ensure that our recommendations are in the best interests of the local population of North West London."

As part of the review the IRP will make a number of visits to North West London to see the NHS facilities and meet patients, clinicians and other staff. IRP members will also hold a series of meetings to hear directly from a range of interested parties, including local authority representatives and interest groups.

The IRP will make recommendations to the Health Secretary by 13 September 2013 in relation to the changes. The final decision on changes to services will be made by the Health Secretary.

The review is now underway and anyone wishing to share their views or provide new evidence as part of this review can contact the IRP in the following ways:

- By email: info@irpanel.org.uk
- In writing: IRP, 6th Floor, 157-197 Buckingham Palace Road, London SW1W 9SP
- By leaving a voice message on: 020 7389 8046

The IRP is not able to respond to individual emails, letters or phone calls, however all information and views will be taken into account by the IRP and contributors will be acknowledged in the final report.

**Press release
9 July 2013**

IRP visits Ealing as part of full review

The Independent Reconfiguration Panel (IRP), the independent expert on NHS service change, is undertaking a full review to consider whether the proposed changes to local health services in North West London will enable the provision of safe, sustainable and accessible services for the local population.

As part of its review the IRP visited Ealing on 8th and 9th July to gather evidence from some of those who may be affected by the proposed changes. The IRP was asked to carry out a full review of the *Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals by the Secretary of State for Health following a referral from the Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel.

Lord Ribeiro, Chairman of the IRP, said: “The Panel is in listening mode and this visit to Ealing was an important part of our evidence gathering process, during which we are seeking to hear from all those who may be affected by the proposed changes, including patients and their families.

“We are visiting a number of areas in North West London as part of our review and taking a wide range of evidence and would like to encourage people to contact the IRP to share their views.”

The IRP will make recommendations to the Health Secretary by 13 September 2013 in relation to the changes. The final decision on changes to services will be made by the Health Secretary.

Anyone wishing to share their views or provide new evidence as part of this review can contact the IRP in the following ways:

- By email: info@irpanel.org.uk
- In writing: IRP, 6th Floor, 157-197 Buckingham Palace Road, London SW1W 9SP
- By leaving a voice message on: 020 7389 8046

The IRP is not able to respond to individual emails, letters or phone calls, however all information and views will be taken into account by the IRP and contributors will be acknowledged in the final report.

Appendix Six

Letter to editors of local press from Lord Ribeiro, 18 June 2013

IRP

www.irpanel.org.uk

Independent Reconfiguration Panel
6th Floor
157 – 197 Buckingham Palace Road
London
SW1W 9SP

18 June 2013

For publication

IRP: Have your say on independent health review

Dear Editor

The IRP, the independent expert on NHS service change, is undertaking a review to consider whether the proposed changes to local health services in north west London will enable the provision of safe, sustainable and accessible services for the local population.

As part of our review we would like to hear from all interested parties in north west London, particularly those who have new evidence to offer or feel that their voice has not been heard, including patients, local residents, local authority representatives, interest groups, clinicians and other staff. Please contact us by email at: info@irpanel.org.uk or by leaving a voice message on: 020 7389 8046.

The Health Secretary, Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP, has asked the IRP to carry out an independent review following a referral from: the Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel.

We will make recommendations to the Health Secretary by 13 September 2013 in relation to the changes. The final decision on changes to services in the area will be made by the Health Secretary.

It is important that our reviews are open and accountable to local communities. We will therefore publish our findings on our website - www.irpanel.org.uk - once they have been considered by the Health Secretary.

Yours sincerely,

Lord Ribeiro CBE
IRP Chairman

Appendix Seven

Site visits, meetings and conversations held

24 June 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Shera Chok, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Martin Houghton, Maureen Larkin

*Site Visit Ealing Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E and Maternity
West Middlesex Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E and Maternity
Heart of Hounslow Centre for Health
Hillingdon Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E and Maternity*

25 June 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin

*Site Visit Northwick Park Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E, STARRS and Maternity
Central Middlesex Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E
Hammersmith Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E and Maternity
White City Health Centre – Currently under construction*

4 July 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Maureen Larkin

Evidence gathering session

Dr Mark Spencer, SaHF Programme Medical Director

Mr Daniel Elkeles, SaHF Programme SRO & CO, Central London, West London, Hounslow & Hammersmith & Fulham CCGs

Mr Rob Larkman, CO, Brent, Ealing, Harrow & Hillingdon CCGs

Ms Thirza Sawtell, SaHF Programme Director

Dr Tim Spicer, SaHF Programme Medical Director & Chair Hammersmith & Fulham CCG

Dr Susan LaBrooy, SaHF Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, The Hillingdon Hospitals NHS FT

Dr Mike Anderson, SaHF Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, Chelsea & Westminster NHS FT

Mr Kevin Atkin, Delivery Support Unit, NHS North West London

Mr Paul Brown, SaHF Programme Finance Manager

Dr David Evans, GP, Ealing CCG

Dr Raj Chandok, GP Vice Chair Ealing CCG

Ms Trish Longdon, Vice Chair JCPCT NW London

Mr Don Neame, SaHF Programme Communications Director

Mr Abbas Mirza, SaHF Programme Engagement Manager

Dr Ethie Kong, Chair Brent CCG & Central Middlesex SRO

Dr Nicola Burbidge, Chair Hounslow CCG & Maternity & Paediatrics Zone SRO

Dr Ian Goodman, Chair, Hillingdon CCG

Dr Genevieve Small, GP, Harrow CCG

Dr Mark Sweeney, Chair, West London CCG
Dr Ruth O'Hare, Chair, Central London CCG
Mr Bill Shields, Chief Financial Officer, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Mr David McVittie, CEO, Ealing Hospital Trust & North West London Hospitals NHS Trust
Dr William Lynn, Deputy CEO and former Medical Director, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Mr Tony Bell, CEO, Chelsea & Westminster Hospital NHS FT
David Radbourne, COO, Chelsea & Westminster Hospital NHS FT
Dame Jacqueline Docherty, CEO, West Middlesex University Hospital NHS Trust
Mr Shane Degaris, CEO, The Hillingdon Hospitals NHS FT

Early evening staff drop-in session - Ealing Hospital

5 July 2013

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Martin Houghton, Maureen Larkin**

Evidence gathering session

Dr Mark Spencer, SaHF Programme Medical Director
Mr Daniel Elkeles, SaHF Programme SRO & CO, Central London, West London, Hounslow & Hammersmith & Fulham CCGs
Ms Thirza Sawtell, SaHF Programme Director
Dr Tim Spicer, SaHF Programme Medical Director & Chair Hammersmith & Fulham CCG
Dr Raj Chandok, GP Vice Chair Ealing CCG
Dr Susan LaBrooy, SaHF Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, The Hillingdon Hospitals NHS FT
Dr Mike Anderson, SaHF Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, Chelsea & Westminster NHS FT
Mr Don Neame, SaHF Programme Communications Director
Mr Abbas Mirza, SaHF Programme Engagement Manager
Dr Nicola Burbidge, Chair Hounslow CCG & Maternity & Paediatrics Zone SRO
Mr Hugh Rogers, Consultant Urologist and Divisional Director for Surgery and Critical Care, West Middlesex University Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Alfa Sa'Adu, Medical Director, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Prof. Nick Cheshire, Medical Director, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Prof. Rory Shaw, Medical Director, North West London Hospitals NHS Trust
Dr Abbas Khakoo, Joint Medical Director, The Hillingdon Hospitals NHS FT
Mr Peter KcKenna, Asst Director of Operations West, London Ambulance Service
Dr Andrew Steedon, GP and Clinical Co-Director of Inner North West London Integrated Care Pilot
Ms Pippa Nightingale, Head of Midwifery, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Mr Charles Bruce, Managing Director, Health Education North West London
Ms Leyla Mustafa, Principal Equality and Sustainability Adviser TFL
Mr Stephen Golden, Head of Equality & Sustainability, TFL
Mr Trevor Begg, Hillingdon Healthwatch & former Chair Hillingdon LINK & PPAG

Site Visit *St Mary's Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E, Trauma Centre and Maternity*

*Charing Cross Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E
Chelsea and Westminster Hospital - Tour of Urgent Care Centre, A & E, and Maternity*

8 July 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Shera Chok, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Natalie Andrews, Maureen Larkin

Tour – Ealing Council area including GP surgery

Evidence gathering session

Mr Gareth Shaw, Campaign Manager Save Our Hospitals Ealing
Mr Colin Standfield, Chair, Ealing Save Our Services
Cllr Bell, Leader, Ealing Council
Cllr Bakhai, Member of Ealing HASSSSP and Liberal Democrat health spokesperson
Cllr Byrne, Member of Ealing HASSSSP
Mr Alan Cook, Co-opted member of Ealing HASSSSP (former LINK)
Cllr Dr Gulaid, Chair of Ealing HASSSSP
Cllr Kapoor, Vice-Chair Ealing HASSSSP
Cllr Stafford, Member of Ealing HASSSSP, Deputy Leader of Conservative Group, Conservative health spokesperson
Cllr Dr Patricia Walker, Cabinet Portfolio for Adults and Public Health
Cllr Jasbir Anand, former Cabinet Portfolio for Adults and Public Health

9 July 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, Jane Hawdon, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Natalie Andrews, Maureen Larkin

Evidence gathering session

Ms Carmel Cahill, formerly Chair Ealing LINK now Chair Ealing Healthwatch
Dr Susan LaBrooy, SaHF Programme Medical Director
Mr Charles Bruce, Managing Director, Health Education North West London
Mr Jeremy Levy, Director of Education, Health Education North West London
Ms Thirza Sawtell, SaHF Programme Director
Ms Lizzie Smith, Director of Workforce Planning, Health Education North West London
Dr Mark Spencer, SaHF Programme Medical Director
Mr Trevor Begg, SaHF Patient and Public Advisory Group, Chair and Hillingdon CCG lay governing body member
Ms Eve Turner, Member of the public, Southall resident, community activist
Ms Malika Hamidou, General Manager, Community Interpreting, Translation and Access Service
Ms Zara Ghods, Forum Development Officer, Greater London Forum for Older People – now Age Concern UK.
Mr Graham Hawkes, formerly Hillingdon LINK now Hillingdon Healthwatch
Dr Mohini Parmar, Chair, Ealing CCG
Mr Daniel Elkeles, Programme SRO and Chief Officer Central London, West London, Hammersmith and Fulham and Hounslow CCGs
Mr Rob Larkman, Chief Officer Brent, Ealing, Harrow and Hillingdon CCGs
Ms Ruth Barnes, Public Health specialist

Mr Bill Lynn, Deputy CEO and former Medical Director, Ealing Hospital Trust
Mr Phillip Young, Lay member and Deputy Chair, Ealing CCG

10 July 2013

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Nicky Hayes, Martin Houghton**

Meeting

Mr Andy Slaughter, MP for Hammersmith

17 July 2013

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin**

Evidence gathering session

Dr Tom Rosenbaum, Consultant Urologist, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust

Mr Raj Gill, Member of the public

Ms Anita Sharda, Academic, member of the public, member Save Our Hospitals Campaign

Mr Stephen Day, Director of Adult Services, Ealing Council

Cllr Lucy Ivimy, Chairman, North West London Joint HOSC

Dr Gurjinder Sandhu, Infectious Diseases Consultant, Ealing Hospital

Mr Janpal Basran, Manager, Southall Community Alliance and Southall resident

Ms Amanda Norrie, Member of the public

Mr Oliver New, Member of the public

Ms Audrey Jones, Member of the public

Ms Bridget Ogden, Member of the public

Mr John Delaney, Member of the public

Ms Laura Saville, Member of the public

Ms Clara Lowy, Acton resident, retired consultant physician

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Richard Jeavons, Martin Houghton,**

Meeting

Mr Andy Slaughter, MP for Hammersmith

Mr Virendra Sharma, MP for Ealing Southall

Ms Seema Malhotra, MP for Feltham and Heston

Ms Karen Buck, MP for Westminster North

(**Mr Barry Gardiner**, MP for Brent North was also represented)

18 July 2013

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Shera Chok, Rosemary Granger, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin**

Evidence gathering session

Ms Vivienne Lukey, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)

Mr Dai Peters, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)

Mr Bruce Marquart, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)

Ms Dede Wilson, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)

Mr Ken Bromfield, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)

Ms Josephine Lundberg, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)
Ms Desiree Cranenburgh, Member Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross)
Cllr Nicholas Botterill, Leader of Hammersmith and Fulham Council
Cllr Marcus Ginn, Hammersmith and Fulham Council Cabinet Member for Social Care and Health
Mr Derek Myers, Chief Executive, Hammersmith and Fulham Council
Ms Eve Acorn, Member of the public
Ms Lynda Collett, Co-Chair, Ealing 135 Mums Group
Ms Rachel Nolan, Co-Chair, Ealing 135 Mums Group
Mr Ray Champion, Member of the public

Early evening staff drop-in session - Charing Cross Hospital

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Richard Jeavons, Martin Houghton

Meeting

Mr Greg Hands, MP for Chelsea and Fulham

19 July 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin

Evidence gathering session

Dr David Slovik, Consultant Care of the Elderly, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Miranda Harvie, Consultant Radiologist, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr John Vogel, Consultant Anaesthetist, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Sanjeev Mehta, Consultant Endocrinology and Diabetes Mellitus, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Colin Michie, Consultant Paediatrician, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Mr Eric Leach, Member of the Public, Vice Chair West Ealing Neighbours, Chair West Ealing Centre Neighbourhood Forum
Ms Maggie Beirne, West London Citizens
Sister Rita Syron, West London Citizens
Mr Jasper Kain, West London Citizens
Mr Anthony Brewer, Member of the Public
Dr Khaled Saraya, Consultant Accident and Emergency, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Ms Catherine Sellu, Matron Emergency Department and Acute Medicine, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Mrs Neila Mahadevan, Consultant Obstetrician, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Seah Seosoon, Consultant Anaesthetist, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Ms Lesley Deacon, Head of Midwifery and Assistant Director of Nursing, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust
Dr Jenny Vaughan, Consultant, Neurologist, Ealing Hospital NHS Trust and Chair of Ealing Hospital NHS Trust Medical Staff Committee
Dr Fionna Moore, Operations Director, London Ambulance Service & Consultant in Emergency Medicine, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Mr Peter McKenna, Interim Deputy Director of Operations, London Ambulance Service

Meeting with users of Michael Flanders Centre, Ealing

1 August 2013

IRP Nicky Hayes, Richard Jeavons

Meeting

Observers at a meeting of Save Our Hospitals (Hammersmith and Charing Cross), Rivercourt Methodist Church, King Street, Hammersmith

12 August 2013

IRP Gina Tiller, Shera Chok, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin

Evidence gathering session

Ms Alwen Williams CBE, Director of Delivery & Development (London), Trust Development Authority

Dr Onkar Sahota, Greater London Assembly Member for Ealing and Hillingdon, Chair GLA Health Committee and local Ealing GP

Dr Anne Rainsberry, London Regional Director, NHS England

Ms Karen Clinton, Head of Primary Care Commissioning, NW London, NHS England

Mr Alex Gordon, Delivery Director, NW London, NHS England

Dr Mark Spencer, Director, Quality and Service Design, NHS England

Ms Judy Breens, Member of the public

Dr A Sandhu, GP, Southall

Mr Arthur Breens, Member of the public

Mr Martin Eady, Member of the public

Dr Adam Jenkins, Chairman, Ealing, Hammersmith and Hounslow LMC and Chairman of London wide LMCs

Dr Eleanor Scott, Secretary, Ealing, Hammersmith and Hounslow LMC and Medical Director London wide LMCs

Ms Elizabeth Ursell, Manager, Ealing Outreach Team, St Mungo's

Ms Sally Groves, Member of the public

Ms Gaynor Lloyd, Member of the public

Cllr Swarn Kang, Ealing Council

19 August 2013

Early evening staff drop-in session – Central Middlesex Hospital

20 August 2013

IRP Lord Ribeiro CBE, Shera Chok, Rosemary Granger, Nicky Hayes, John Parkes, Linn Phipps, Gina Tiller, Richard Jeavons, Maureen Larkin

Evidence gathering session

Dr Mike Anderson, Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, Chelsea & Westminster NHS FT

Mr Daniel Elkeles, Programme SRO & CO, Central London, West London, Hounslow & Hammersmith & Fulham CCGs

Dr Susan LaBrooy, SaHF Programme Medical Director and former Medical Director, The Hillingdon Hospitals NHS FT (and Co-chair U&E Care CIG)

Ms Thirza Sawtell, SaHF Programme Director
Dr Mark Spencer, SaHF Programme Medical Director

2 September 2013

IRP **Lord Ribeiro CBE, Richard Jeavons**

Evidence gathering session

Prof. Dermot Kelleher, Dean, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College, London

Prof. Sir Anthony Newman Taylor, Rector's Envoy for Health, Head of Research and Development, NHLI, Imperial College, London

Mr Nigel Buck, Faculty Operating Officer, Imperial College, London

Mr Mark Davies, Chief Executive, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust

Prof. Nick Cheshire, Medical Director, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust

Appendix Eight

Information made available to the Panel

Supporting papers

Referral letter from Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Standing Scrutiny Panel, 19 March 2013
Supporting documentation for referral, 19 March 2013
Submission to IRP following oral evidence, Ealing Council, July 2013
SaHF database at http://www.healthiernorthwestlondon.nhs.uk/document-downloads
IRP information template, May 2013
<i>Shaping a Healthier Future</i> consultation document
Decision making business case, 14 February 2013 at: http://www.healthiernorthwestlondon.nhs.uk/document-downloads?term=167
Pre-consultation business case at: http://www.healthiernorthwestlondon.nhs.uk/document-downloads?term=127
JCPCT minutes of meeting 25 June 2012 and 6 December 2012
JCPCT minutes of meeting 19 February 2013
SaHF Implementation - Programme Initiation Document, May 2013
SaHF - IRP orientation visit to north west London
SaHF slides from evidence presented 4 July 2013
SaHF slides from evidence presented 5 July 2013
SaHF Supporting documentation for IRP review, 4 and 5 July 2013:
a. Supporting pack 1 index
b. Evaluation criteria
c. Briefing on Ealing Hospital as a local hospital
d. Implementation programme initiation
e. Acute trusts dashboard
f. Review of major trauma centres
g. Whole systems approach
h. Provider letters supporting consultation
i. CCG letters of support for consultation
j. London Ambulance Service report
k. NCAT emergency care report
l. NCAT maternity and paediatrics report
m. CCG letters supporting JCPCT
n. Letters from medical directors
o. Letters from PEC medical directors
p. Letters from providers supporting JCPCT
q. Alternative proposals to create a specialist health and social care hospital at Charing Cross and Alternative proposals for the local hospital at Ealing, NHS North West London, 14 February 2013_
r. NCAT Shaping a Healthier Future report
s. Supporting pack 2 index
t. End of life profiles
u. Public health maps
v. Joint strategic needs assessment executive summary
w. Ealing local hospital briefing
SaHF Tracker Summary, 4 July 2013
SaHF slides from evidence presented 9 July 2013:
a. Workforce presentation and amendment
b. Addressing the needs of Ealing residents
c. Financial analysis
Ealing CCG agenda and minutes of meeting, 12 March 2013

Additional evidence provided by SaHF team

- a. Briefing on engagement, consultation and plans for elderly frail people
- b. High level assessment of the impact on Option A of retaining Ealing as a major hospital
- c. Options development and appraisal
- d. Index of SaHF data
- e. Index of multiple deprivation by local authority, 7 August 2013
- f. Urgent care centres contracts position paper, 7 August 2013
- g. Transforming primary care in north west London, 7 August 2013
- h. Ealing CCG SaHF decision-making process, 7 August 2013
- i. Provision of emergency and urgent care in Ealing
- j. Programme risk management framework and Programme risk register
- k. Primary care estates review methodology

Judge's decision on London Borough of Ealing application for permission to apply for judicial review, 8 August 2013

SaHF slides from presentation, 20 August 2013 plus additional information and DMBC maps

Extract from PCBC regarding emergency surgeons across major hospital sites in north west London

Community Interpreting Translation and Access Service, final report 17 December 2012

Documentation provided by Ealing Hospital staff:

- a. Ealing deprivation links to respiratory disease
- b. British Thoracic Society, NIV (Adult) Analysis, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 23.12.11
- c. British Thoracic Society, Paediatric Pneumonia Institution v National Analysis, 07.09.12
- d. British Thoracic Society, NIV(Adult) Analysis, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 01.06.12
- e. British Thoracic Society, Adult Community Acquired Pneumonia Analysis, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 05.07.13
- f. British Thoracic Society, Adult Community Acquired Pneumonia Audit Tool Analysis, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 07.09.12
- g. British Thoracic Society, Paediatric Asthma, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 07.09.12
- h. British Thoracic Society, NIV (Adult) Analysis, Ealing Hospital v All Institutions, 17.06.13
- i. Ealing Council / NHS Ealing: Joint Strategic Needs Assessment 2012-13, Executive Summary
- j. Ealing Council: State of Ealing Health and Wellbeing, November 2011
- k. Presentation by T Rosenbaum *What population do we serve? Reflections from a hospital under threat*
- l. Documents provided by O New North West London's NHS Under the Knife, What the consultation doesn't tell you and Comments on transport assessment of proposed Southall gasworks development
- m. Presentation by Dr J Vogel and attachments Ealing ITU WW Data and Severe sepsis in the UK and case-volume association
- n. Documents provided by Dr M Harvie, consultant radiologist, Ealing Hospital: Lung Biopsy Audit and Radiology Audit
- o. Documents provided by Dr S Mehta, consultant diabetologist, Ealing Hospital: Inpatient mortality summary Ealing Hospital; Diabetes community health profile; Ealing CCG diabetic footcare profile; Ealing PCT diabetic footcare profile; A diabetologist's perspective
- p. Presentation by Dr C Machie, paediatrician Ealing Hospital *Mapping urban micronutrient deficiencies*
- q. Presentation by Dr K Saraya, Consultant in Emergency Medicine and Medical Director, Ealing Hospital, *ED activity*
- r. Documents provided by Ms L Deacon, Head of Midwifery and Assistant Director of Nursing, Ealing Hospital: Flower logo; Unit photographs; Maternity report May 2013; Maternity report March 2013; 12-13 Maternity dashboard; Feedback for IRP; Ward patient feedback; Maternity response 12-13
- s. Presentation by Mrs N Mahadevan, consultant obstetrician Ealing Hospital *Maternity care in Ealing*
- t. Presentation and documents provided by Dr GS Sandhu, Consultant in Infectious Diseases
- u. Presentation and documents provided by Dr J Vaughan: GP impact1 and 2; Letter to Jeremy Hunt from Ealing MSC, Mark Spencer interview rebuttal, SaHF risk profile
- v. Ealing Hospital MSC online scripted responses
- w. Choose Ealing Hospital newsletter, July 2013
- x. Ealing CCG Ballot on options, October 2012 and Ealing CCG Statement on SaHF at: <http://www.ealingccg.nhs.uk/news/statement-from-ealing-clinical-commissioning-group-on-shaping-a-healthier-future.aspx>
- y. Ealing Hospital Unite branch response to IRP
- z. Paper on the Somali community
- aa. Presentation by Dr D Slovik, Dept. Medicine for Older People, 19 July 2013

West Middlesex University Hospital NHS Trust - a first class hospital for our community: presentation to IRP

Heart of Hounslow Centre for Health - floorplan (hard copy)

Hillingdon Hospital - floorplans for proposed Emergency Care Centre reconfiguration

Presentation to IRP by Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust

Chelsea and Westminster NHS Foundation Trust - presentation pack for IRP visit, 5 July 2013 (hard copy) and trust News, August 2012

Submission from Ealing, Hammersmith and Hounslow LMC

Presentation by NHS England London Region, 12 August 2013

Submission from Dr A Sandhu, Belmont Medical Centre, 12 August 2013

Documents provided by Prof. D Kelleher, Dean Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London:

a. Letter to IRP, 21 August 2013

b. Imperial College Academic Health Science Centre response to consultation, 5 October 2012

Submissions from members of parliament:

a. Submission to Shaping a Healthier Future consultation by Mr G Hands, MP for Chelsea and Fulham

b. Ms A Bray, MP for Ealing Central and Acton

c. Letter from local MPs: Mr A Slaughter, Ms K Buck, Mr V Sharma, Mr S Pound, Mr G Thomas, 16 August 2013

d. Mr A Slaughter, MP for Hammersmith, 6 September 2013

Submission from Ms A Drinkell, community matron

Correspondence provided by Ms D Wilson, Save our Hospitals campaign, and attaching:

a. Clinical Commissioning Groups: protecting our NHS together

b. Select committee meeting notes, 17 September 2012

c. Fulham Broadway meeting

d. LBHF meeting

e. Consultation timescale

f. Charing Cross consultation letter

g. Hospital consultation letter

h. 25 Sept request to LBHF for help

i. LBHF consultation response, 11 September 2012

j. JCPCT meeting notes, December 2012

k. Transparency letter, 20 February 2013

l. Letter from Andy Slaughter MP to Anne Rainsbury, 20 December 2012

m. Letter and attachments from Mr M Davies, Chief Executive Officer, Imperial Healthcare NHS Trust to Mr J Zitron, Chairman NHS North West London

n. Correspondence with Cllr M Ginn, London Borough of Hammersmith and Fulham, February 2013

o. Article by Dr T Sissons, February 2013

p. Consultation flaws and concerns

q. Articles in local media and open letter from Mr K Bromfield and response from Ms L Ivimy, JHOSC Chair

Documents provided by Hillingdon LINK:

a. SaHF report to JCPCT, December 2012

b. Formal response to consultation

Submissions from members of local authorities:

a. Cllr M Butt, Leader of Brent Council on behalf of Brent Council

b. Cllr J Carlebach, London Borough of Hammersmith and Fulham

c. Cllr N Bakhai, Ealing Liberal Democrats

d. Mr A Cook, co-opted member of Ealing Health and Adult Social Services Panel

e. Cllr G Stafford, Deputy Leader Conservative opposition group, London Borough of Ealing

f. Brent Liberal Democrats submission to IRP and Brent Council response to SaHF consultation

g. Ealing Council Conservative group submission to IRP

h. Cllr L Ivimy, Chairman, Joint HOSC to IRP

i. Cllr S Kang, Ealing Council

j. Cllr D D'Souza, City of Westminster Council

Documents provided by Mr D Chauhan-Keys, Chief Officer, Age UK Brent:

a. Submission to IRP

b. Queen's Park area residents assoc
c. correspondence from Sarah Teather MP
d. Brent Health Partnerships Overview and Scrutiny
e. Comments on better care, closer to home; response to consultation
Submission to IRP from Southall Black Sisters
Submission from Mrs J Breens
Submission from Mr A Brewer
Presentation from Mr M Eady and TfL journey times for Northwick Park and West Middlesex
Submission from Mr A Breens
Submission from Mr C Standfield, Chair Ealing Hospital SOS
Documents provided by Ms E Ursell, Manager St Mungo's, Ealing Street and Community Outreach Team: Ealing Outreach 2012-13 Annual Report, case study L, case study M, StreetMed
Submission from Mr E Leach
Submission from Save our Hospitals - Hammersmith Charing X Central Middlesex and Ealing
Documents provided by Save our Hospitals - Charing Cross and Hammersmith
a. Hammersmith and Fulham Core Strategy: Local Development Framework, October 2011
b. BBC News item: London consultants to work more weekends and evenings
Submission from Ms E Acorn
Submission from Ms A Jones
Submission from Community Interpreting, Translation and Access Services re SAHF
Submission from Ms A Sharda, former NHS employee and member Save our Hospitals Campaign
Submission from Mr J Basran, Southall Community Alliance LBE Theme Lead Officer
Submission from Mr G Shaw, Campaign Manager, Save our Hospitals Ealing
Submission from Ms S Groves
Submission from Ms G Lloyd
Submission from Kensington and Chelsea residents in support of Save our Hospitals

Members of the public who contacted the IRP (emails, letters and phone calls)

1	Ms C Cookson	40	Mr R Champion
2	Mr ? Tippens	41	Mr R Mohindroo
3	Mr P Simmons	42	Ms S Qu
4	Mr H Termezy	43	Ms J Greenberg
5	Ms T Hicks	44	Mr R Ali
6	Mrs C Elliott	45	Mr E Schonfield
7	Ms A Billimoria	46	Ms A Levi
8	Mr P Williams	47	Mr A Mock
9	Mrs P Moss	48	Mr H Coope
10	Ms T Popotska	49	Ms A Sharda
11	Ms M Theobold	50	Anon
12	Mrs ? Toll	51	Anon
13	Mr P Fordham	52	Ms E Maxwell
14	Mr C Stoker	53	Mr G Mathur
15	Mrs D Kingston	54	Ms M Drew
16	Mrs M Stoker	55	Ms P Houlihan
17	Ms A Larter	56	Ms S Robinson
18	Mrs ? Sadler	57	Mr F Prideaux
19	Mr & Mrs B Trenerry	58	Ms A Morrisey
20	Ms J Elson	59	Ms A Kamacasarvey
21	Mr P Butcher	60	Ms J Heberden
22	Ms T Featherstone	61	Ms S Hayward
23	Mrs R Grady	62	Mr D Simpson
24	Ms D Donnelly	63	Ms L Brockett
25	Ms K Lang	64	Ms A Woods
26	Mr S Lynton	65	Ms P Arundel
27	Mr C Balzer	66	Mr J Howard
28	Mr S Cuttica	67	Ms T Gray
29	Mr R Arneson	68	Ms M Raynes
30	Mr G Hodgkin	69	Mr N Hindley
31	Ms Y Malik	70	Mr & Mrs C Handley
32	Ms H Kuttner	71	Anon
33	Mr J Ball	72	Ms C Adcock
34	Mr A Parmar	73	Mr O Shawo
35	Ms C Bonan	74	Mr Z Maserhenas
36	Ms K Platt	75	Ms I Ali
37	Dr A Sethi	76	Mr T Klepacz
38	Ms B Ogden	77	Mr S Beards
39	Ms L Raisey	78	Ms M Devine

79	Ms K Burnett	118	Ms T Weller
80	Mr G Smith	119	Dr P Lau
81	Ms D Mason	120	Ms P Risk
82	Mr E Larmont	122	Ms A Finlay
83	Ms L Goldsworthy	123	Ms J Khera
84	Mr J Park	124	Ms Z Farel
85	Ms S Kelly	125	Mrs J Bettaccini
86	Mr C Plummer	126	Mrs Y Little
87	Ms S Byrne	127	Mr M Allen
88	Mr P Mackenzie	128	Anon
89	Ms V Tubby	129	Mrs J Biddlecome
90	Ms S Devonshire	130	Miss T Campbell
91	Ms E Howe	131	Mr R Ealoriq
92	Ms L Ayson	132	Mr S Kong
93	Ms P Ince	133	Mr P Southey
94	Ms D Norden	134	Anon
95	Mr C Walters	135	Anon
96	Mr G Francis	136	Mr N Patel
97	Mr H Satar	137	Mrs A Jaggee
98	Ms K Tomlinson	138	Mrs S Patel
99	Mr G Basire	139	Mrs M Patel
100	Mr P Julian	140	Mr M Dhaliwal
101	Mr E Pawley	141	Mr I Burge
102	Mr C Kalpani	142	Mr M Mulchrone
103	Ms H Pye-Smith	143	Ms H Fordham
104	Mrs D O'Donovan	144	Mr K Dadoo
105	Ms G Carroll	145	Ms H Butler
106	Ms K Kelly	146	Ms R Addelhadi
107	Mr D Blackwell	147	Mr F Lazurus
108	Mr L Kaye	148	Mr B Kaywood
109	Mr S Yates	149	Mr G Parrish
110	Ms P Blamey	150	Ms S Mellish
111	Mr G Panesar	151	Ms M Betterton
112	Ms I Esmann	152	Ms C Page
113	Ms D Dickinson	153	Mr H Stenholm
114	Mrs B Farmer	154	Ms H Goodman
115	Mr J Rushton	155	Ms P Maclachlan
116	Ms H Archbold	156	Mr F Mescolini
117	Dr A Davis	157	Ms A Carrington

158	Miss J Keane	197	Anon
159	Mr R Mezo	198	Ms A ?
160	Mr R Janeliunaite-Tambis	199	Mr S Huk
161	Ms K Richardson	200	Anon
162	Ms M Mooney	201	Mr A Breen
163	Dr F Farrell	202	Anon
164	Mr D Xavier	203	Mr R Gill
165	Ms Y Prapasrianan	204	Mr ? Fenner
166	Ms L Afifi	205	Anon
167	Mr L Welch	206	Anon
168	Mr M Damree	207	Anon
169	Ms M Anderson	208	Mr D Holmes
170	Mr M Weller	209	Mr ? Dixon
171	Mr ? Ziaurehmom	201	Mr ? Abdi
172	Mr J Norris	211	Mr ? Kumar
173	Ms C Allen	212	Mrs ? Sheppard
174	Mr C Mann	213	Mr M Peitli
175	Ms R Abbott	214	Mrs K Reid
176	Mr A Senesi	215	Mr ? Pakhar
177	Ms P Arundel	216	Anon
178	Mr D Halford	217	Anon
179	Ms S Noble	218	Mr ? Balsar
180	Mr J Swarc	219	Mr ? Onkar
181	Mrs A Golding	220	Anon
182	Ms M Nicholson	221	Anon
183	Mr R Ross	222	Mrs B Taylor
184	Mr T Mamamaros	223	Ms J Rodby
185	Ms A Midgley	224	Mr ? Aziz
186	Ms H Qizibash	225	Ms R Hunt
187	Ms E Mullin	226	Mr R Bellis
188	Mr P Caulfield	227	Anon
189	Ms V Papantoniou	228	Anon
190	Ms T Knox	229	Ms L Kirkwood-Price
191	Mrs P Jones	230	Ms R Lennon
192	Dr R Nurnberg	231	Ms R Grady
193	Miss ? Wildblood	232	Ms A Butler
194	Mr H Alvarez	233	Mr D Ghaly
195	Ms L Moller	234	Mr P Purton
196	Ms S Scott	235	Ms A Wood

236	Ms A Hood	275	Mr A Butt
237	Ms M Patel	276	Mr M Griffiths
238	Ms J Ardrey	277	Ms H Savery
239	Ms C Connelly	278	Ms G Zielinska
240	Ms N Erdresser	279	Mrs M Lohfink
241	Ms C Ning	280	Mr B Walker
242	Ms A Cole	281	Ms V Jani
243	Mr A Brand	282	Mr R Hering
244	Mr R Buckley	283	Ms N Walsby
245	Mr ? Gurjit	284	Mr A Flatt
246	Mr J Matthews	285	Ms E Kane
247	Mr E Onstad	286	Ms B Keyte
248	Mr R Harrington	287	Ms M Hickey
249	Ms B Wellock	288	Ms P Singh
250	Ms L Sugrue	289	Mr B Hussein
251	Mr K Simons	290	Mr J Mitchell
252	Dr A Goldsworthy	291	Mr & Mrs J Lucas
253	Mr R Garner	292	Mr J Morrisey
254	Mr K Hamilton	293	Mr ? Arayne
255	Mrs J Harris	294	Ms G Lloyd
256	Mr C Motee	295	Anon
257	Mrs C Blackmore	296	Mr P Southey
258	Mr T Willis	297	Mrs ? Sumarasingarithnam
259	Mr D ?	298	Anon
260	Ms R Skinner	299	Mr J Ryan
261	Mr L Bhere	300	Ms D Omar
262	Ms A Clement	301	Ms C Morrissey
263	Ms J Tulusiewicz	302	Ms L Jarrett
264	Me E Tulusiewicz	303	Mr R Topiwalla
265	Mr S Singh	304	Mr C Mason
266	Ms G Burns	305	Ms D Davis
267	Ms D Butler	306	Ms A Bovett
268	Mr P McCough	307	Ms S Nisbet
269	Mr P Gosalia	308	Ms C Calliste
270	Mr S Patel	309	Ms V Fernandes
271	Mr B Gill	310	Mr O Pribyl
272	Ms M Sargeant	311	Mr S Barbe
273	Ms J Read	312	Mr C Powell
274	Dr D Wijesinghe	313	Mr A Ward

314	Mr M ul Hassan	353	Dr K Cabot
315	Dr G Moses	354	Mr G Cadden
316	Ms A Scanlon	355	Ms S Kelsall
317	Mrs V Jones	356	Mr R Totty
318	Ms C Ward	357	Mr M Hammerton
319	Dr S Seah	358	Miss B Powell
320	Ms M Nyuydzewira	359	Mr M Mankoo
321	Mr A Smith	360	Mr A Murray
322	Mr G Young	361	Mr M Sinead
323	Mr S Chadda	362	Mr G Gill
324	Dr A Fragoyannis	363	Mrs C Kenny
325	Ms C Krzyanowska	364	Mr C Russell
326	Ms G Hillier	365	Ms P Codrington
327	Mr M Kehoe	366	Mr A Gregorians
328	Mr S King	367	Ms M Da Cunha
329	Ms M Conroy	368	Dr G Drower
330	Mr T Carroll	369	Mr M Draper
331	Ms M Matysik	370	Mr J Drant
332	Mr A Costello	371	Mr M Levitt
333	Mr T Green	372	Ms D Legroux
334	Mr E Laichena	373	Ms N Golia
335	Mr A Miller	374	Mr S Walsh
336	Mr A Heldt	375	Mr P Patel
337	Anon	376	Ms L Woodward
338	Mr R Critchfield	377	Miss G Burrows
339	Mr ? James	378	Mr S Ishab
340	Mr K Santry	389	Anon
341	Ms V Jones	380	Ms S Cox
342	Ms J Marley	381	Ms K McBride
343	Mr R Knoll	382	Ms J Laurie
344	Mr T Jones	383	Mr D Mistry
345	Ms M Gerada	384	Ms E Haas
346	Ms E Green	385	Mr C Lakin
347	Anon	386	Ms J Francis
348	Ms S Whitehead	387	Prof. J Davison
349	Mrs J Veasey	388	Dr C Reddy
350	Mr T Robinson	389	Ms E Ursell
351	Mr A Goel	390	Ms D Golt
352	Mrs A Ware	391	Ms O Barradas

392	Mr D Turner	431	Mrs ? Sanwaranassan
393	Mr J Ryan	432	Mrs ? O'Donnell
394	Ms S Campbell	433	Mrs ? Ophelie
395	Ms D Benjamin	434	Ms S Sampson
396	Mr ? Kalisana	435	Mr ? Muhammed
397	Ms T Dorcey	436	Ms J Sax
398	Dr S Banu	437	Ms J Myer
399	Ms J Chivers	438	Mr A Singh
400	Mrs S Sidhu	439	Ms C White
401	Mr N Sidhu	440	Ms J Ryan
402	Mr J Lodge	441	Mr H Leahy
403	Ms F Gristwood	442	Ms C Coppard
404	Ms J Gaffney	443	Anon
405	Ms J Lundberg	444	Mr J Williams
406	Mr P Chandler	445	Mr R Gupta
407	Mr S Duckworth	446	Mr I Richardson
408	Mr ? Singh	447	Mr S Rodney
409	Anon	448	Mr M Blackmore
410	Anon	449	Ms M Toale
411	Mr M Dubily	450	Mr M Al-Batti
412	Mrs ? Snard	451	Ms M Lavelle
413	Anon	452	Dr D Innes
414	Anon	453	Ms S Stewart
415	Ms S Steer	454	Mr P Sekhon
416	Anon	455	Ms D Domb
417	Mr M Ahmad	456	Ms J Walsh
418	Anon	457	Mr B Harris
419	Mrs F Martin	458	Dr L Wallach
420	Anon	459	Ms A Brown
421	Mr P Prendaker	460	Ms C Oakshott
422	Ms J Lang	461	Mr P Conlan
423	Mr Z Indmail	462	Ms C Baxter
424	Mr W White	463	Mr D Nash
425	Mrs ? Coker	464	Ms J Fitzpatrick
426	Anon	465	Mr N Gupta
427	Ms P Root	466	Mrs J Breens
428	Mr A McFarlane	467	Ms S Nathan
429	Anon	468	Mr R Sharma
430	Ms T Hughes	469	Mr M O'Sullivan

470	Ms P Lord	509	Mr J Routledge
471	Mrs F Martin	510	Ms K Morrison-Briscoe
472	Mr J Choudary	511	Ms K Vaz
473	Mr A Mahmood	512	Mr S Abraham
474	Mr K Chopra	513	Mr M Targosz
475	Mr & Mrs B Hutnell	514	Ms E Davies
476	Mr A Odhar	515	Ms C Nesbitt
477	Mr R Baker	516	Mr & Mrs R Adam
478	Mr J Hooda	517	Mrs F Abraham
479	Ms L Ayson	518	Mr D Foitzik
480	Mr B Thapa	519	Mr O Faith Chuma
481	Mr L Pannu	520	Ms C Fear
482	Mr M O'Sullivan	521	Mr R Khan
483	Mr R Sharma	522	Mr B Stead
484	Mr I Ahsan	523	Mr J Wong
485	Mr R Weathersbee	524	Ms S Lewis
486	Mr A Drinan	525	Ms C Gibson
487	Mr G Avanesian	526	Ms A Kaszewski
488	Mrs L Ohanian	527	Ms E Cwirko-Godycka
489	Mr R Salmons	528	Mr X Yar
490	Mr H Ward	529	Mr D Easton
491	Mr A Razak	530	Ms C Cheung
492	Mr G Fiegehen	531	Ms J Bennett
493	Mrs K Barnes	532	Ms T Khandpur
494	Ms M Bent	533	Mr A Sharma
495	Mr ? Deepa	534	Ms G Lesh
496	Ms M Campbell-Pedersen	535	Mr J Everett
497	Mr R Illingworth	536	Mrs A Germany
498	Mr M Giochon	537	Mrs M Wiltshire
499	Mr D Nissen	538	Miss V Cole
500	Ms C Slattery	539	Mr K Sterrow
501	Mr R Sharp	540	Ms T Jude
502	Ms D Alexander	541	Mr R Harrington
503	Ms P Fenton	542	Ms F Wilkinson
504	Mr V Damis	543	Mr J Baines
505	Mr A Salamo	544	Mr J Wallace
506	Mr M Southon	545	Mr A Morrison
507	Ms M Cotter	546	Ms M Timmins
508	Ms K Cox	547	Mr A Harrop

548	Mr S Reeve	587	Ms B O'Shea
549	Ms T Ilona	588	Ms F Mumtaz
550	Mr D Morgan	589	Ms H Rice
551	Ms P Edwards	590	Ms M Clay
552	Ms J Nicholas	591	Mr J Smyth
553	Ms A Liehocka-Majmom	592	Mr R Chilton
554	Mrs J Loxley	593	Mrs P Humphrys
555	Mr D ?	594	Ms S Lee
556	Mr E Harries	595	Ms H Sacks
557	Ms S Farnfield	596	Ms C Bonifas
558	Ms L Ive	597	Ms D Collon
559	Prof A Lepschy	598	Mr A Cartnell
560	Mr J Bell	599	Ms G Hurren
561	Ms B Cunningham	600	Ms S Lamb
562	Mr R Willetts	601	Mr K Wymer
563	Ms L Arnold	602	Mr K Saradjan
564	Dr B Royappa	603	Mr D Cunningham
565	Ms M Swarren	604	Ms S Hewson
566	Mr & Mrs M Dunning	605	Ms E Rafiw
567	Mr J Savery	606	Ms C Phillips
568	Mr R Sharma	607	Ms J Seglow
569	Ms A Sharpe	608	Mr Y Bush
570	Ms N Simons	609	Ms J Rosoman
571	Ms T Dragadze	610	Ms M Adomon
572	Ms L Olsson	611	Ms A Houlli
573	Ms M Taruvinga	612	Ms N Gupta
574	Mr D Easton	613	Ms E Bell
575	Mr S Conner	614	Ms C Dawnay
576	Mr T Parker	615	Ms M Rasmussen
577	Mr & Mrs J Coates	616	Ms M Barbour
578	Ms S Irvine	617	Ms P Morrison
579	Mr D Brown	618	Mr R Newman
580	Ms H Wickes	619	Mr C Cosstick
581	Mr E Leach	620	Mr R Nisbet
582	Ms I Brown	621	Ms B Melba
583	Mr D Bedi	622	Ms ? Nikkila
584	Mr D Speake	623	Ms S Cullen
585	Ms A Jarvis	624	Ms C Tice
586	Mrs R Bradshaw	625	Mr P Pelliccioni

626	Ms P Austin	665	Ms F Palmer
627	Ms J Cannon	666	Ms J Sacks
628	Mr ? Hanford	667	Ms G Hicks
629	Anon	668	Ms V Cerdeno
630	Anon	669	Dr R Meacher
631	Dr ? Patak	670	Mr & Mrs L Wilkinson
632	Mrs S Lerner	671	Ms L Wilson
633	Ms A Ringsell	672	Ms E Wilmington
634	Ms E Mullen	673	Dr U Navidi
635	Mr M Jowett	674	Mr B Parsons
636	Ms J Dickinson	675	Mr T Brunwin
637	Mr J Booker	676	Ms P Majorcas
638	Ms J Gibson	678	Mr & Mrs R Elliott
639	Mr N Nolan	679	Ms C Ware
640	Mrs J Brotherton	670	Ms C Williams
641	Ms A Waelbroeck	671	Mr & Mrs R Mackinnon
642	Mrs P Sandhu	672	Ms H Charlemagne
643	Mr R Coomber	673	Mr H Joudi
644	Anon	674	Mr P Caulfield
645	Anon	675	Ms E Harris
646	Ms P Easton	676	Ms C Jones
647	Mrs J Collins	677	East Acton residents
648	Ms J Porter	678	Mr J Kelly
649	Mr W English	679	Mr J Grant
650	Mr D Barber	680	Ms A Chadwell
651	Ms C McCarthy	681	Ms B Roberts-Miller
652	Ms J Ball	682	Ms S Burke
653	Ms D Ok	683	Mr L Ritchie
644	Ms H Wise	684	Ms P Sebti
655	Ms D Wilson	685	Ms S Bates
656	Mr & Mrs J Scott	686	Ms C Richardson Andrews
657	Ms A Deery	687	Mr I Russell
658	Mr A Laurent-Marke	688	Ms E Keller
659	Ms M McManus	689	Mr N Ahmed
660	Ms F Pasteur	690	Ms C McDermott
661	Mrs J Bretherton	691	Mr T Mulrenan
662	Dr E Seago	692	Ms K O'Donnell
663	Mr T Yasin	693	Ms E Goldstein
664	Ms G Read	694	Mr B Easter

695	Ms F Spence	734	Ms S Taylor
696	Mr R Fox	735	Ms J Tippen
697	Ms A Errigo	736	Mr J Krish
698	Ms A Muharemi	737	Ms D Wale
699	Dr D Muharemi	738	Mr J Flynn
700	Ms P Arundel	739	Mr P Brady
701	Mr S Greenberg	740	Ms H Usherwood
702	Ms T Reynolds	741	Mr B Ryan
703	Mr P Hughes Smith	742	Mr A Ibrahim
704	Mr B Assiter	743	Ms A Copp
705	Ms C Hyde	744	Ms N Wilson
706	Mr M John	745	Mr B Wilson
707	Dr P Elliott	746	Mr I Smith
708	Mr J McNeill	747	Mrs A Chambers
709	Mr T Chana	748	Ms D Cranenburgh
710	Ms C Dawnay	749	Anon
711	Mr K Mallinson	750	Anon
712	Ms S Bridgman	751	Mr J McNeill
713	Mr R Kaur	752	Anon
714	Mr & Mrs R John	753	Anon
715	Mr J Green	754	Ms U Cawshaw
716	Mr J Dowell	755	Anon
717	Ms M McNeill	756	Ms H Sarowy
718	Mr S Nayee	757	Anon
719	Ms R Rocaburba	758	Anon
720	Ms D Field	759	Anon
721	Ms E Kennedy	760	Mr ? Diab
722	Ms J Barnett-King	761	Anon
723	Mr N Gupta	762	Anon
724	Mr & Mrs J Moss	763	Anon
725	Mr R Nowotarski	764	Anon
726	Mr & Mrs C Murfet	765	Mr A Donegan
727	Mr A Raza	766	Ms S Kirkwood
728	Mr K De Castro	767	Ms J Beacall
729	Mr C Keeble	768	Mr R Krzyzewski
730	Ms L Spinks	769	Mr G Monks
731	Ms L Phillips	770	Ms J Wiley
732	Ms J Brewster	771	Ms L Hatherall
733	Mr Y Tarzhumanov	772	Ms S Sehgal

773	Mr S Osborne	812	Ms J Simpson
774	Mr S Chana	813	Ms S Alam
775	Mr W Wong	814	Mr & Mrs M Hoban
776	Mr A Strangeways	815	Mr & Mrs R Bishnani
777	Ms E Bridge	816	Mr S Barnes
778	Ms S White	817	Ms C Thomas
779	Mr A Roden	818	Ms N Weydahl
780	Ms P Reith	819	Mr M Woodward
781	Mr I Alexander	820	Ms P Handley
782	Mr P Taylor	821	Ms M Safar
783	Mr & Mrs R Williams	822	Ms A Kiem
784	Ms B Hanford	823	Mr U Isse
785	Mr K Davidson	824	Miss B Trigg
786	Ms J Evans	825	Ms H Palmer
787	Mr J Needs	826	Mr A Khatchik
788	Ms B Flock	827	Ms K Pezeshkian
789	Mr O Needs	828	Mr R Frost
790	Mr T Perkins	829	Mr S Earl
791	Cllr A Chapman	830	Mr & Mrs H Harvey
792	Ms G Monaghan	831	Ms Z Wilhans
793	Mr R Sharma	832	Ms L Leung
794	Mr C Fazi	833	Ms E Tabernacle
795	Mr & Mrs A Cholmondeley-Clarke	834	Ms K May
796	Mr A Acorn	835	Ms P McMeekan
797	Mr D Edwards	836	Mr F Cains
798	Mr R Chandler	837	Mr M Foster
799	Mr T Acorn	838	Mr P Biggins
800	Mr P Young	839	Ms S Greenyer
801	Mr P Hulme Cross	840	Mr M Franco
802	Mr J Laport	841	Mr J Franco
803	Mr P Frederick	842	Ms A Heyworth
804	Ms K Morrison	843	Dr R Mather
805	Ms B Foster	844	Mr N Bergstein
806	Ms T Kesselstatt	845	Ms S Herschel
807	Mr C Davies	846	Miss A Harrison
808	Ms V Moreno	847	Ms C Oakshott
809	Mr A Lopera	848	Anon
810	Ms J Arady	849	Anon
811	Mr P Brady	850	Anon

851	Mrs R Abdi	890	Mr I Page
852	Anon	891	Mr B Athukorale
853	Anon	892	Ms V Lukey
854	Mr S Kane	893	Ms O Heywood
855	Ms M Fountain	894	Mr M Pavett
856	Anon	895	Ms R Stone
857	Anon	896	Mr W Morton
858	Ms J Doran	897	Ms O Brown
859	Mr J Coles	898	Mr S Harris
860	Mr C Napier	899	Ms J Clapp
861	Mr C McLeod	900	Anon
862	Mr L Daimond	901	Anon
863	Mr J Birring	902	Anon
864	Mr H Pringle	903	Ms E ?
865	Ms L Flynn	904	Anon
866	Ms P Adam-Mcgrail	905	Anon
867	Mr S Quraishy	906	Anon
868	Ms M Codrington	907	Mrs S Gosling
869	Ms J Lane	908	Mrs W ?
870	Mr D Threlfall	909	Mr G Barnham
871	Ms C Kulkarni	910	Ms J Brown
872	Mr K Bronfield	911	Ms G Peters
873	Ms G Forbes	912	Ms E Luciano
874	Mr L Winter	913	Mrs D Harrigan
875	Mr J Lundberg	914	Mr W Harris
876	Mr K Bywaters	915	Ms N Harris
877	Mr W Anderson	916	Ms S Harris
878	Ms M Smallman	917	Mr J Simpson
879	Mr J Gill	918	Ms S Braich
880	Ms J Airey	919	Mr J Gibson
881	Mr A Goble	920	Mr D Wright
882	Ms M Kaladeen	921	Ms K Peacock
883	Ms M Sufar	922	Ms A Davies
884	Ms K Home	923	Ms J Brendon
885	Mr N Benson	924	Ms R Aspinall
886	Mr C Parren	925	Ms K Hearn
887	Mr & Mrs ? Woodridge	926	Mr J Thomas
888	Ms J Corr	927	Ms A Owen
889	Mr R Mcmillen	928	Ms V Japps

929	Ms C Stowell	968	Ms R Spiller
930	Mr M Lachowicz	969	Dr J Butcher
931	Ms V Jovic	970	Ms A O'Neill
932	Dr R Huq	971	Mr O Maatu
933	Ms S Carter	972	Ms C Salmon
934	Mr D Coles	973	Ms R Savery
935	Ms J Verweken	974	Ms H Karimi
936	Ms S Monaghan	975	Mr D Alexander
937	Ms A Davies	976	Mr J Jadar
938	Mrs T Cabrall	977	Ms D Sterling
939	Mr E Blavo	978	Mr A Prozbakht
940	Mr A Nicol	979	Mr J Miles
941	Ms A Exner	980	Mr D O'Connor
942	Mr P Gehin	981	Ms N Knight
943	Mr D Hunt	982	Mr J Ambrosino
944	Ms M Babary	983	Ms M Starkey
945	Ms Y Horsfield	984	Mr S Whitehead
946	Ms R Matter	985	Ms B Conduct
947	Ms E Worth	986	Mrs D Maidment
948	Ms P Cates	987	Mr & Mrs A Ritchie
949	The Haston family	988	Ms N Feiner
950	Mr T Weeks	989	Ms L Desborough
951	Mr H Shoukry	990	Mr W Desborough
952	Ms H James	991	Mr I Cranna
953	Mr J Calvert	992	Mr P De Silva
954	Mr J White	993	Ms L Harris
955	Mr P Holloway	994	Ms A Scanlon
956	Mr M Horsfield	995	Ms J Crooks
957	Mr J Howorth	996	Mr R Prior
958	Mr N Marantos	997	Mr ? Georgiou
959	Ms C Lavedan	998	Mr P Canavan
960	Mr G McMahan	999	Mr J Alman
961	Mr A Burnett	1000	Ms P King
962	Ms C Lachowicz	1001	Mr M Cook
963	Ms S Lesser	1002	Mr A Georgiou
964	Ms A Goodwillie	1003	Mr A Brens
965	Ms A Jordan	1004	Ms S Sheahan
966	Mr S Accapurto	1005	Ms S Fisher
967	Mr I Willis	1006	Ms R Quigley

1007	Ms S Orlando	1045	Ms L Weale
1008	Mr & Mrs M Wood	1046	Mr T Gilmartin
1009	Mr R Bernas	1047	Mr B Smith
1010	Dr B Harper	1048	Mr A Parmar
1011	Mr M Glossop	1049	Mr L Muhammed
1012	Ms J Mackintosh	1050	Ms L Marsh
1013	Ms C Broadbent	1051	Mr I Hopkin
1014	Mr D Filson	1052	Mr J Greenberg
1015	Mr R Godwin	1053	Mrs U Hodgkins
1016	Ms M Wright	1054	Mr B Dobbs
1017	Ms D Willis-Bailey	1055	Ms P Houlihan
1018	Ms L Taylor	1056	Mr L Harvey
1019	Ms S Burke	1057	Ms L Lestrage
1020	Ms H Bateman	1058	Mr V Musa
1021	Mr J Hugosson	1059	Ms R Mauri
1022	Mr J Howard	1060	Ms R Hunt
1023	Ms O Chalmers	1061	Mrs H Mckenzie
1024	Mr S Mehta	1062	Mr A Julyan
1025	Mr C Gabrysch	1063	Ms S Steer
1026	Ms S Buck	1064	Ms S Fernandez
1027	Ms P Thomas	1065	Str C Head
1028	Ms E Doyle	1066	Mr V Vasso
1029	Ms J Melrose	1067	Mr A Erzini
1030	Ms L O'Donnell	1068	Ms T Stuart
1031	Mr F Banks	1069	Ms L Otto
1032	Mr H Francis	1070	Ms V Bales
1033	Mr B Croft	1071	Ms D Ellis
1034	Mr P Chutter	1072	Ms F Van Look
1035	Ms P Allison		
1036	Ms R Denniston	A total of 4,168 postcards were received in response to a campaign organised by Ealing Council	
1037	Ms K Fanthorpe		
1038	Ms M Ljungholm		
1039	Ms T Dubois		
1040	Mr G Karali		
1041	Ms Charman-Blower		
1042	Mrs A Pelosi		
1043	Mr M Tremaine		
1044	Ms B Amodu		

Appendix Nine

Panel membership

* Sub-group members that took a lead in this review

Chair:

*Bernard Ribeiro
Former consultant surgeon, Basildon Hospital
Past president of the Royal College of Surgeons

Membership:

Cath Broderick (lay member)	Independent consultant on involvement and engagement
Fiona Campbell (lay member)	Independent consultant specialising in health and social policy
*Shera Chok (clinical member)	General Practitioner Director of Primary Care, Barts Health NHS Trust
Nick Coleman (clinical member)	Consultant in Intensive Care Medicine and Associate Medical Director, University Hospitals of N. Staffordshire
Shane Duffy (clinical member)	Consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist Chelsea and Westminster Hospital NHS Foundation Trust
Glenn Douglas (managerial member)	Chief Executive Maidstone and Tunbridge Wells NHS Trust
*Rosemary Granger (managerial member)	Leadership coach and independent consultant Former NHS director
Tessa Green (lay member)	Former chair of acute specialist trust Trustee of Institute of Cancer Research
*Jane Hawdon (clinical member)	Consultant Neonatologist and Clinical Academic Group Director Children's Health, Barts Health NHS Trust
*Nicky Hayes (clinical member)	Consultant Nurse for Older People King's College Hospital NHS Trust
Brenda Howard (managerial member)	Independent consultant Former NHS director
*John Parkes (managerial member)	Chief Executive, Greater East Midlands Commissioning Support Organisation
Linda Pepper (lay member)	Independent consultant on involvement and engagement
*Linn Phipps (lay member)	Independent consultant on patient and public engagement, health scrutiny and health inequalities
Hugh Ross (managerial member)	Independent consultant Former NHS chief executive
*Gina Tiller (lay member)	Former chair NHS North of Tyne

Appendix Ten

About the Independent Reconfiguration Panel

The Independent Reconfiguration Panel (IRP) offers advice to the Secretary of State for Health on contested proposals for NHS reconfigurations and service changes in England. It also offers informal support and generic advice to the NHS, local authorities and other interested bodies in the consideration of issues around NHS service reconfiguration.

The Panel consists of a Chairman, Lord Ribeiro, and members providing an equal balance of clinical, managerial and patient and citizen representation.

Further information about the Panel and its work can be found on the IRP Website:

www.irpanel.org.uk