

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE

## **Investigation Summaries of Interviews July 2014**

### **1 July 2014**

#### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JAYNE PINKNEY**

Jayne Pinkney was interviewed on 1 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Jacqui Featherstone the Investigation's expert advisor on midwifery, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Jayne was invited to be interviewed because she held, until 2007, the post of a Modern Matron at Furness General Hospital within the Trust. She provided the Investigation with contextual information about how the role of a Modern Matron operated within the Trust, record keeping, the reporting of serious untoward incidents and multidisciplinary team working within the maternity unit.

In addition she provided information about the responsibilities of a community midwife and how the community midwives worked alongside midwifery colleagues at the Trust, particularly at Furness General Hospital.

The Panel also asked Jayne about her responsibilities as a supervisor of midwives and how the team of midwifery supervisors worked with colleagues at the Trust, the LSA and with the NMC to deliver their functions.

#### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ANDREW CALDER**

Andrew Calder was interviewed on 1 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Jacqui Featherstone the Investigation's expert advisor on midwifery, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Andrew Calder provided the Investigation with additional contextual information about the Review of Maternity Services in University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay NHS Trust led by Dame Pauline Fielding. Dame Pauline had been commissioned by the Trust to undertake the Review and her Report was submitted in March 2010. The Report is listed in the Investigation's terms of reference. Professor Andrew Calder, a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist, was one of the clinical expert members of the review team and he was asked about the process of his selection and appointment.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

The Panel asked Andrew Calder about his expert role within the review team and about his recollections of communication between the review team and both senior clinicians and senior managers at the Trust.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH GERALDINE ROBINSON**

Geraldine Robinson was interviewed on 1 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Jacqui Featherstone the Investigation's expert advisor on midwifery, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Geraldine was invited to be interviewed because she was previously the maternity ward manager, and is now the maternity unit manager, at Furness General Hospital within the Trust. She provided the Investigation with information about both roles and the responsibilities that are associated with both roles.

She was asked about her management of the unit, the staffing levels and associated pressures and the management response to resourcing difficulties.

Geraldine was asked about the working relationships in the maternity and neonatal unit and about the working relationships between the clinicians and midwives and between midwives and the Head of Midwifery and the senior managers at the Trust.

In addition the Panel asked Geraldine about the links between the maternity and neonatal team and the team working in the special care baby unit, how incidents and serious untoward incidents were reported and the necessary follow up action undertaken.

## **9 July 2014**

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH DENISE FISH**

Denise Fish was interviewed on 9 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Denise was invited to interview as she held her role as head of midwifery at the Trust until 2007. She explained that she was appointed to her post prior to Furness General Hospital becoming part of the Trust and, when Trust status was awarded her role was extended as she became head of midwifery across all of the sites within the new Trust (including the Royal Lancaster Infirmary and Westmorland General Hospital). She provided the Investigation

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

with information about her main responsibilities and what changes she experienced when her responsibilities were extended by the award of Trust status.

The Panel asked Denise about her working relationships with senior managers, paediatricians and obstetricians.

She was also asked about her management of the midwifery unit, the staffing levels and associated pressures, how incidents and serious untoward incidents were reported and the necessary follow up action undertaken and how learning was embedded amongst the midwifery staff.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ANGELA OXLEY**

Angela Oxley was interviewed on 9 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Angela was invited to interview as she held her roles of midwifery manager, head of midwifery and service manager for gynaecology at the Trust. She was head of midwifery from 2007 until 2011 and her management responsibility extended across all of the Trust sites. She provided the Investigation with information about her main responsibilities and what changes she experienced during her time in the posts listed.

The Panel asked Angela about her working relationships with senior managers, paediatricians and obstetricians.

She was also asked about her management of the midwifery unit, the staffing levels and financial pressures faced by the Trust, the associated pressures of these and how they impacted on her ability to discharge her duties. She was also asked how incidents and serious untoward incidents were reported and the necessary follow up action undertaken and how learning was embedded amongst the midwifery staff.

In addition she was asked about the change programme that she was involved in delivering whilst in post and about the governance arrangements in place to support her, and her staff, deliver the midwifery service at the Trust.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH KAREN WEAKLEY**

Karen Weakley was interviewed on 9 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Walker one of the expert advisors on obstetrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Karen was invited to be interviewed because she previously held the post of a Modern Matron at Furness General Hospital within the Trust. She provided the Investigation with contextual information about how the role of a Modern Matron operated within the Trust, record keeping, the reporting of serious untoward incidents and multidisciplinary team working within the maternity unit.

In addition she provided information about how her role evolved beyond being a clinical one to more of a managerial and office based one as her responsibilities increased. She was also asked about the resourcing of the midwifery unit.

As Karen is now a midwife coordinator at the Trust she was asked to provide some insight into how that role differed from her previous responsibilities.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH PRABAS KUMAR MISRA**

Prabas Kumar Misra was interviewed on 9 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Mr Misra was invited to interview as he is a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist at the Trust. He has been employed at the Trust since 1990. He provided the Investigation with information about how the clinical team operated to support midwifery colleagues and patients.

He was asked by the Panel how the clinical team in the maternity unit was structured, what responsibilities were handled by junior grade clinicians and what responsibilities lay with the consultants including what ward rounds were carried out, and when, and what the on call arrangements were. Mr Misra was also asked about the working relationship between the obstetricians and gynaecologists, the Trust's sonographers and the clinical director. Mr Misra advised the Panel how clinical handover sessions were managed and how any clinical staff resourcing issues were addressed.

The Panel asked Mr Misra how serious untoward incidents and incidents were dealt with and how complaints were handled previously and how the handling of complaints had altered during the period of time the Investigation was reviewing.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH DHIA MAHMOOD**

Dhia Mahmood was interviewed on 9 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics and Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance.

Dhia was invited to interview as he is a consultant paediatrician at Lancashire Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust involved in the transfer of very ill and/or premature babies from the Trust to paediatric intensive care units elsewhere in the region.

Mr Mahmood was asked about how the retrieval team is alerted of the need to arrange the stabilisation and safe transfer of babies to the Lancashire Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust and to other Trusts in the region and how the responsibilities are shared via a weekly rota with colleagues at the East Lancashire Hospitals NHS Trust in Burnley. He also explained that the arrangements for babies who require a transfer overnight are handled by a call centre. He outlined the organisation involved in arranging and managing a transfer and the specialist nursing and clinical skills required by team members.

The Panel asked Mr Mahmood specifically about his own, and his Trust's, knowledge and experience of transfers from Furness General Hospital within the Trust. He was also asked how individual transfers were reviewed and audited and, should any learning issues be identified by what mechanism these were communicated to all of those involved.

## **10 July 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH BEVERLEY COLE**

Beverley Cole of the Care Quality Commission (CQC) was interviewed on 10 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics, Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance, Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Beverley was invited to interview as she was appointed, in 2011, as the Commission's compliance manager for Cumbria. Beverley had previously been an inspector at the CQC and had earlier experience as a regulator. She explained how the compliance team was resourced, how its work was allocated and what resources were allocated specifically to the Trust.

Questions were asked of Beverley about complaints handling and about the work of the Quality Surveillance Group and Gold Command and what involvement the compliance team had with them.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

The Investigation Panel asked Beverley about the level of involvement and communication she had with colleagues at the Trust, NHS England, Monitor, the Local Area Team, the CCG, Healthwatch, the Local Authority and the Deanery and how frequently she, or her team, were in contact regarding issues that arose at the Trust. The Panel asked particularly about the post holder(s) at the Trust the CQC's compliance team liaised with on a regular basis and the type of issues that were raised with the CQC.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH FRASER CANT**

Fraser Cant was interviewed on 10 July 2014 by the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Dr Bill Kirkup, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics, Julian Brookes the expert advisor on governance, Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Fraser was invited to interview because he was appointed in 2009 on a part time basis to the post of Assistant Director of Operations within the family services and core clinical services division at the Trust. He was seconded to the post from Cumbria PCT and carried out his duties during a period of significant reorganisation. The reorganisation involved a restructuring of the division and Fraser was then appointed to a substantive Assistant Director of Operations post within a newly established division at the Trust where he remained until 2013.

He outlined his roles and responsibilities managing the divisions during period of considerable change. He was asked by the Panel about resourcing and financial pressures and the impact these had on his ability to fully undertake his duties. He was also asked to describe the management structures of the division during his time at the Trust and what the governance arrangements were. He was asked about the working relationships and communications between obstetricians and gynaecologists and midwifery staff, between obstetricians and paediatricians and between him and senior managers and clinicians at the Trust.

The Panel asked Fraser how the findings of the Reports (referred to in the Investigation's terms of reference) into the delivery of midwifery and neonatal services at the Trust were shared with him and what actions took place to address concerns and/or recommendations made in the Reports. He was also asked about the application process for Foundation Trust status and if this impacted on his role and what involvement he had with partner organisations following the incidents that occurred at the Trust.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

**15 July 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JACQUELINE HOLT**

Jacqueline (Jackie) Holt was interviewed on 15 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Jackie was invited to interview because she was the Trust's Director of Nursing and Modernisation from 2008 until 2013.

The Panel asked Jackie about the priority issues that she faced when she took up the post, how she prioritised them and what support she received from her executive colleagues. She was also asked about the Trust's application for Foundation Trust status and about staffing levels and resourcing issues and how frequently, and by what methods, these matters were communicated to Trust Board colleagues.

Jackie was asked about where responsibility sat within the Trust for clinical risks, governance, safety and quality. She was also asked how the findings and recommendations of the Fielding Report were communicated and implemented.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ROGER WILSON**

Roger Wilson was interviewed on 15 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Roger was invited to interview because he was the Director of Human Resources and Organisational Development at the Trust from 2007 until 2012.

The Panel asked Roger what were the priority issues that he faced when he joined the Trust and how he prioritised and addressed these. He was asked how staffing and resourcing issues were reported to the Board, how operational responsibility for human resource matters was managed and how matters relating to communication between clinicians were discussed and managed. He was also asked about recruitment to the Trust, what work was undertaken to facilitate greater rotation of human resources within the Trust and what interaction he had with senior managers in the midwifery department.

Roger was asked about the culture in each of the hospitals within the Trust and about the engagement project that was designed to help develop a Trust-wide culture.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH KAY GILBEY**

Kay Gilbey was interviewed on 15 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Kay was invited to interview because she held a number of nursing posts at the Trust. She was the Trust's acting Director of Nursing for 18 months until a substantive appointment was made to the post. When the permanent Director of Nursing took up her post, Kay was the Deputy Director of Nursing until her retirement from the Trust in 2010.

The Panel asked Kay what the key issues were that she faced when she was appointed as the Trust's acting Director of Nursing, how she addressed these and what support she received from the rest of the executive team. She was asked how she divided her time across the three hospital sites in the Trust, how she worked effectively with the Head of Midwifery and the Matrons to ensure that she had a comprehensive view of the nursing and midwifery services and how she worked effectively with the Medical Director, obstetricians and paediatricians.

She was asked if the Fielding Report was discussed by the Trust Board and how the recommendations were considered and addressed. In addition she was asked how serious incidents were reported by staff and then to the Board and also how complaints were brought to her attention and handled by the Trust.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JENNIFER BOWNS**

Jennifer Bowns was interviewed on 15 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Jennifer was invited to interview because she was a senior midwife, a midwifery supervisor and a labour ward coordinator at the Trust until 2012.

She was asked about her midwifery experience, her role and responsibilities as a midwife at the Trust. She was asked by the Panel how her supervisory responsibilities were discharged, what training and development was offered and how any learning from incidents was undertaken.

The Panel asked Jennifer about the relationship between midwives and clinicians at Furness General Hospital and about resourcing difficulties and how these were addressed.



# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH VINCENT BAMIGBOYE**

Vincent Bamigboye was interviewed on 15 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing.

Vincent initially joined the Trust in 1999 as a locum registrar obstetrician and gynaecologist and was appointed to a substantive post as a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist in 2004. He has always been based at Furness General Hospital but ran a specialist clinic at the Royal Lancaster Infirmary until approximately two years ago.

He was asked how the clinical team in obstetrics and gynaecology was organised to ensure that ward rounds, on call duties, emergency caesarean sections, handover meetings and clinics were appropriately resourced, about the working relationship with the clinical lead who is based at Lancaster, paediatricians and midwives at Furness General Hospital and if resourcing issues impacted on how he delivered care to patients.

The Panel asked Vincent how policies and procedures were updated to respond to changes in clinical practice and, should he have any concerns about mortality or morbidity rates how he could raise these with senior managers at the Trust. He was also asked if he was aware of any complaints about the midwifery care delivered at Furness General Hospital and how these were dealt with.

## **16 July 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH EDDIE KANE**

Eddie Kane was interviewed on 16 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Eddie was interviewed as he was Chairman of the Trust from 2008 until 2011.

He was asked what the main issues were facing the Trust when he became Chairman and how he addressed them. He explained to the Panel how the Trust was managed across the three sites, what work the Chief Executive and his executive team were responsible for overseeing and managing and also how he and his non-executive directors used their time and resources.

He was asked what matters would be brought routinely to Trust Board meetings by the executive directors and via sub committees of the Board including what mechanisms were in place to address resourcing issues, complaints, serious untoward incidents and whistleblowing. The Panel asked how the Chairman was assured about the standards of care

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

and services being delivered by the Trust and what mechanisms he and his non-executive directors used to ensure quality standards were maintained and improved.

The Panel asked Eddie about the Trust application for Foundation Trust status and about the meetings he was involved in with Monitor and the Strategic Health Authority (SHA). He was asked what interaction, and meetings, he had with the PCTs and the SHA.

The former Chairman was asked about Gold Command and what he considered would be the benefits of it to the Trust.

The Panel asked about the Fielding Report and how the Report and its recommendations were considered by the Trust Board, communicated to staff and implemented.

Eddie was asked what support was offered to the midwifery and neonatal staff involved in the incidents at the Trust and what lessons could be learnt from them by senior managers.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH KAREN WESTALL**

Karen Westall was interviewed on 16 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Karen was interviewed as she had been a non-executive director at the Trust until 2008. Karen had initially been a non-executive Director at the Royal Lancaster Infirmary and was asked to remain as a non-executive director when the three hospitals merged to form the University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay NHS Trust.

The Panel asked Karen what responsibilities she had as a non-executive director, how she was made aware of issues that were arising at the Trust and how often she visited the three hospital sites.

Karen was asked about the staffing difficulties at the Trust and about complaints and how both of these were communicated to her and fellow non-executive directors. She was asked if she was aware of any concerns regarding the maternity and neonatal services at Furness General Hospital.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JACKIE SMITH**

Jackie Smith was interviewed on 16 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Jackie was interviewed because she is the Chief Executive and Registrar of the Nursing and Midwifery Council (NMC) having been appointed to the post substantively in 2013 having been the Acting Chief Executive and Registrar since early 2012. From 2010, Jackie was the NMC's Director of Fitness to Practice.

The Panel asked Jackie to explain how the NMC supervised midwives to comply with its statutory obligations. The Panel were particularly interested as the practice of supervision is unique to midwives. Jackie explained that detailed reports are submitted from Local Supervisory Authorities (LSAs) to the Midwifery Committee, a statutory committee of the NMC. Jackie explained how the NMC communicated with the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA) that was responsible for delivering the local supervisory function in the region.

Jackie explained that the NMC's responsibilities regarding public protection were set out in 1902 and that these are currently being reviewed by the Kings Fund.

The Panel asked Jackie when the NMC, in its regulatory capacity, was initially alerted about concerns at the Trust, about the extraordinary review of the Trust that the NMC undertook jointly with the Care Quality Commission (CQC) in 2011 and how it has responded to complaints made to the NMC following events at the Trust. Jackie explained how the NMC initially engaged with other external organisations regarding incidents at the Trust and what the current arrangements are.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH IAN CUMMING**

Ian Cumming was interviewed on 16 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Ian was invited to an interview because he had been: the Chief Executive of the Lancaster Acute Hospitals NHS Trust; Project Director of the merger of the three hospitals to form the University Hospitals Morecambe Bay NHS Trust (the Trust) and then its Chief Executive and then, from 2006 to 2009, Chief Executive of North Lancashire PCT.

He was asked how the Trust Board began to establish effective teams and leaders following the establishment of the Trust.

The Panel asked Ian what the reasons were for the merger of the hospitals, what the characteristics of each hospital was and what, if any, challenges each hospital was facing in respect of recruitment and retention of staff, financial issues, the quality and safety profile and any other clinical governance matters.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Ian was asked how he worked with his executive directors to ensure the delivery of health care services to the community and what involvement he had with the local Primary Care Trusts (PCTs) and the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA).

The Panel asked how complaints were handled and how issues of concern were brought to Ian's attention and what, if any, reviews were established regarding services at the Trust.

The Panel asked Ian about his move to become Chief Executive of North Lancashire PCT and his involvement with the Trust and the working relationship between the North Lancashire PCT and South Cumbria PCT which had responsibility for commissioning services from the Trust for the population covered by both PCTs.

**17 July 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH MIKE BEWICK, NEELA SHABDE AND PETER CLARKE**

Mike Bewick, Neela Shabde and Peter Clarke were interviewed on 17 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Geraldine Walters the expert advisor on nursing and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Mike Bewick had previously been the Director of Primary Care and the Executive Medical Director at South Cumbria Primary Care Trust (PCT), Neela Shabde is a consultant paediatrician involved with the delivery of children's services at both Trusts in Cumbria (University Hospitals of Morecambe Bay NHS Foundation Trust and North Cumbria University Hospitals NHS Trust) and was the Medical Director for Children at the PCT and Peter Clarke was the Incident Director for the Gold Command Process.

All three were interviewed regarding their role and responsibility in the Gold Command process and Mike Bewick and Neela Shabde were asked by the Panel about their individual responsibilities.

In respect of Gold Command, the interviewees were asked what the rationale had been for the introduction of Gold Command, by whom it was both established and led, what the objectives for it were, the time period the process ran for, how this was determined and agreed and the financial costs related to providing support via the Gold Command process to the Trust. The Panel asked what support was given to the Trust during Gold Command and how this was both delivered and received by the Trust.

The Panel asked about the leadership of the Gold Command and the reporting structures and mechanisms and communications processes adopted throughout the duration of the process.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

The Panel wanted to ensure it gained a detailed understanding of the involvement of other agencies in the Gold Command process such as the former North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA) and the Department of Health (DH), how partner health care organisations contributed to the process and how Gold Command liaised with both senior managers and clinicians at the Trust during its life span.

The interviewees were asked what lessons were learnt from the process and how learning from the Gold Command process was assessed, considered and embedded across all of the organisations involved.

Mike Bewick and Neela Shabde were asked, from the perspective of the PCT, about the commissioning of children's services in the region and the region's maternity strategy, when the PCT was made aware by the Trust about the Fielding Report and about the Mitchell Report and its findings.

They were also asked specifically how the events at the Trust were brought to the attention of the PCT and about the reporting of serious untoward events, complaints handling, patient feedback and the relationship between both the commissioners and the Trust and between the commissioners and regulators and senior managers in external organisations. The Panel also asked about resourcing issues and the provision of adequate clinical leadership and cover as well as the recruitment of staff at the Trust. The Panel asked about progress made by the Trust to address the issues raised and highlighted during Gold Command, about the current level of paediatric staffing at the Trust and the present delivery of children's services as well as about the leadership and working relationships now between the nursing and clinical staff at Furness General Hospital.

## **22 July 2014**

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH RUTH HUSSEY**

Ruth Hussey was interviewed on 22 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Ruth was interviewed because of her work within the North West Region. She was the Regional Director of Public Health from 2006 until 2011 and was accountable to both the Chief Executive of the Strategic Health Authority (SHA) and also to the Department of Health.

The Panel asked Ruth to explain how her role was established and how it evolved. They were also interested to learn how Ruth's responsibilities changed during her time at the SHA

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

and how it was affected by organisational change, competing priorities and the resources that were available.

Ruth was asked how the SHA operated and how clinical governance, performance issues and quality issues such as SUI reports and reports such as the Fielding Report were considered by the SHA.

Ruth was also asked about the SHA's knowledge of, and involvement with, the Trust's application for Foundation Trust status and how she became aware of the application. In addition she was asked about the SHA's relationship with other organisations and who had responsibility within the SHA for contact with the Care Quality Commission.

The Panel also asked Ruth about the SHA assurance process and relationship between the SHA and the local PCTs.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH MIKE FARRAR**

Mike Farrar was interviewed on 22 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Mike was interviewed because he was the Chief Executive of the North West Strategic Health Authority (SHA) from 2007 to 2011. He was asked how the SHA was managed, where responsibility lay within the organisation for decision making and about the governance arrangements.

The Panel asked Mike about the issues of concern he faced as Chief Executive of the SHA and how he and his colleagues sought to determine and improve the quality outcomes of health care in the region. He was asked specifically about the SHA's role in responding to incidents at the Trust, about the SHA's understanding of how the Fielding Report was commissioned, what the purpose of the Report was and how the SHA expected that the findings and recommendations would be acted upon.

Mike was asked about how the SHA worked effectively with the PCTs and how it communicated with all Trusts in the region – including Foundation Trusts – to ensure it was aware of issues of concern. He was asked when the SHA first became aware of the incidents at the Trust and about the interaction and lines of communication between senior managers at the Trust and senior managers at the SHA. In addition he was asked about the Trust's application for Foundation Trust status and what the SHA's role was in that process.

He was asked about the relationship between the SHA and Monitor and the SHA and the CQC and about the SHA assurance process.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH MOIRA ANGEL**

Moira Angel was interviewed on 22 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

Moira was interviewed by the Investigation as she had held a number of nursing and quality posts in the region and in the Primary Care Trust (PCT) in Cumbria including a board level cluster nurse role addressing clinical quality issues.

The Panel asked Moira about the role of the serious incident group whose meetings she attended and, through the safety and quality team that she led the PCT was aware what patient experiences were being collected and reported. She was also asked about the governance arrangements and how she dealt with concerns regarding the quality of care that were brought to her attention.

She was asked about the Fielding Report and when the PCT first was made aware of the contents of the Report and more generally about the relationship between the PCT and the Trust. Moira was asked who she communicated with directly at the Trust regarding issues such as staffing levels, how issues were raised and addressed and what her role was in working effectively with the Trust to ensure it could deliver appropriate health care.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH CYNTHIA BOWER**

Cynthia Bower was interviewed on 22 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

The Panel interviewed Cynthia because she was the Chief Executive of the Care Quality Commission (CQC) when it was established until July 2012 as the first formal regulator of the Health Service.

Cynthia provided the Investigation Panel with contextual information regarding how the CQC was established from the merger of three existing organisations that were abolished, how it was organised and resourced, what its reporting and accountability structures were and how they operated in practice. She was asked how the critical relationships the Commission had to form with partner organisations such as Monitor, the North West Strategic Health Authority and the Department of Health were developed. She was also asked how the CQC developed its relationship and began to work with the Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Cynthia was asked about the challenges and key priorities she faced when she was appointed as the CQC's first Chief Executive and how she and her fellow senior managers responded to those issues.

The Panel asked Cynthia about the Trust's application for Foundation Trust status and about the Inspections of the Trust that the CQC carried out and how the warning notice process operated. In addition she was asked about Gold Command and how the CQC was involved in, and contributed to, that process.

## **24 July 2014**

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH HOLLY PARKINSON**

Holly Parkinson was interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor on midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor on obstetrics.

The Panel interviewed Holly because she was a midwife at the Trust having completed her nurse training and early years of work experience there. She was asked about her role and responsibility as a midwife who had worked across the maternity and labour wards as well as in the community and how work was allocated to her when she began a shift.

Holly was asked about midwifery supervision and training, about the working relationships between midwifery staff and clinicians at the Trust and about communications within the maternity and neonatal unit including how she was made aware of issues and information by senior managers.

Holly was asked how she could raise any concern she had and what the escalation route was when concerns were raised. In addition she was asked about team working within the unit and how handovers were managed to ensure the required level of care was delivered to patients.

### **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH SARAH VAUSE AND KAREN CONNOLLY**

Sarah Vause and Karen Connolly were interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor on midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor on obstetrics.



# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

Sarah Vause is a consultant obstetrician and Karen Connolly is the Director of Midwifery at the Central Manchester University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust. Sarah and Helen were two of the four authors of the *Report of the Diagnostic Review undertaken at University Hospitals Morecambe Bay NHS Foundation Trust*. The Report was commissioned by Monitor and is included in the Investigation's terms of reference.

The Panel asked the authors how the need for the Report was identified, how it was subsequently commissioned and what their remit was.

The Authors were asked what material they reviewed prior to undertaking the Diagnostic Review to help provide context for their work and how they structured their work – including who they interviewed at the Trust, how the views that emerged from the interviews were collated and how they were then developed into recommendations.

Sarah and Karen were asked about resourcing issues and about communication between staff and senior managers at the Trust.

The Panel asked the authors who their Report was submitted to and whether they were involved in any subsequent discussions with the Trust regarding their findings and recommendations and how these were being addressed by the Trust.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH STELLA McDOWELL**

Stella McDowell was interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor in midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics.

Stella was interviewed because she is a lead midwife in the antenatal clinic at Furness General Hospital and is also a supervisor of midwives. She was asked about the training and development of midwives, how learning was shared and about the guidance arrangements for the supervision of midwives. She was also asked about record keeping as a midwifery supervisor and how the record keeping system has evolved and developed.

The Panel asked Stella about incident reporting within the unit and about multi-disciplinary meetings within the unit to discuss complex cases and also to share learning.

Stella was also asked about the Fielding Report.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH ANN WEST**

Ann West was interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor in midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics.

Ann was interviewed because she was appointed to the post of modern matron in paediatrics and the special care baby unit (SCBU) at Furness General Hospital in 2005. She held the post until 2009 and in that period the role evolved and increased from two days per week to three days per week. Ann reported to the paediatric nurse manager as in the SCBU she was delivering, and overseeing the delivery of, paediatric care and was responsible for managing the paediatric unit through busy and less busy periods.

She was asked about the training and development she received and what involvement she had with maternity colleagues elsewhere in the Trust and whether there were opportunities to develop skills anywhere other than at Furness General Hospital.

The Panel asked Ann about her involvement with incident reporting at the Trust and about the working relationships between midwifery, nursing and clinical staff.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH OWEN GALT**

Owen Galt was interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor in midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics.

Owen was recruited in 2007 by the Trust as a generic paediatrician for both acute services and the community. He became the clinical lead in May 2010 and was appointed as Clinical Director for Women and Children's Services in April 2012.

He was asked what the key issues were when he took up his post and what he did, with senior colleagues, to address these. Owen was also asked about paediatric resourcing at the Trust, how the consultants worked with the middle grade doctors to deliver paediatric care and if recruitment difficulties impacted on the effectiveness of the paediatric unit. In particular he was asked if resourcing difficulties, throughout the unit, had an impact on the standards of care delivered in the SCBU and what the working relationships were like between paediatric staff and nursing staff and between paediatricians and obstetricians.

The Panel asked how Owen liaised with his senior managers to address concerns when they arose or when incidents were reported and in particular if cross bay working improved

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

working relationships and enabled the paediatric team to share learning with nursing and midwifery staff. The Panel also asked about the theatre provision at the Trust and about the resourcing of the theatres when they were required.

Owen was asked about governance arrangements and how these were communicated, discussed and reviewed as appropriate and what processes were put in place for him reporting up the management chain to ensure that all issues of concern were communicated appropriately.

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH JOAN MOORBY**

Joan Moorby was interviewed on 24 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics, Jacqui Featherstone the expert advisor in midwifery and Jimmy Walker the expert advisor in obstetrics.

Joan was interviewed by the Investigation Panel because she was a midwife at Furness General Hospital within the Trust.

The Panel asked Joan about the distribution of midwifery resources across the maternity and neonatal units at the hospital, about the current staffing of the unit and when a number of incidents that the Investigation is reviewing occurred in the midwifery and neonatal unit at the Trust. She was also asked about her relationship with the midwifery supervisors and if this has altered during her time at the Trust.

Joan was asked about training and development and about audits and record keeping.

The Panel asked Joan about communication between midwifery staff and clinicians in the unit and how effectively the team worked to deliver care to patients in the maternity and neonatal units. She was asked how information was communicated to her and her fellow midwives and about multi-disciplinary meetings. She was asked about the escalation routes available to the midwives should they require a second and/or a clinical opinion during their care of a patient.

The Panel also asked about the Fielding Report and when she was made aware of the findings and recommendations included in the Report.

# **THE MORECAMBE BAY INVESTIGATION**

**Chaired by Dr Bill Kirkup CBE**

**28 July 2014**

## **SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEW WITH DAVID NICHOLSON**

David Nicholson was interviewed on 28 July 2014 by Dr Bill Kirkup, the Chairman of the Morecambe Bay Investigation, Stewart Forsyth the expert advisor in paediatrics and Jonathan Montgomery the expert advisor on ethics.

The Panel interviewed David Nicholson as he was appointed to be the Chief Executive of the NHS from August 2006 and became the Chief Executive of NHS England when it was created on 1 April 2013. He retired from the post in March 2014.

David was asked about the establishment, organisation and management of Strategic Health Authorities (SHAs) and about the SHA assurance programme designed to help develop a standardised service across England that he oversaw. The SHA role of reviewing serious untoward incidents (SUIs) was discussed with the Panel, as the review of SUIs by the North West SHA was considered during the SHA assurance meeting between David Nicholson and Mike Farrar the Chief Executive of the North West SHA. He was also asked by the Panel about the ability of all SHAs to cope with significant problems and if any arose, how was he briefed about them. The Panel asked David where responsibility for the delivery of quality health care lay and what type of issues of poor quality care were brought to his attention to enable him to engage effectively with Health Ministers.

The former Chief Executive of NHS England was asked about the process Trusts had to engage with to apply for, and secure, Foundation Trust status and what information regarding individual applications was brought to his attention. He was asked what role his staff and advisors had in considering applications, how the views of the relevant SHA were fed into the process and how recommendations were subsequently made to Ministers. He was asked if he was aware of the reasons that the Trust's initial application for Foundation Trust status was paused and what action was taken to address the concerns that caused the delay.

The Panel asked when events at the Trust were brought to his attention and how aware he was about the Gold Command process.

He was asked about the NHS complaints process and about the relationship between the NHS and the PHSO and if the changes made to the health and social care system during his tenure impacted upon the ability of NHS managers to deal with issues that were brought to the attention of regulatory authorities. He was also asked about the configuration of health services in Cumbria.