

**1. Name**

Iain Dell

**2. Organisation**

Comprehensive Training Solutions DA

**3. Type of Organisation**

Commercial

Consultancy to NATO

**6. What subject area of the Foreign Policy Report does your evidence relate to?**

Security and Defence

Civil Protection

**7. What are the comparative advantages/disadvantages of working through the EU in the area you wish to comment on, rather than the UK working independently?**

Main advantage: the EU appears well-funded. Main disadvantage: the EU appears to concentrate on the political rather than the practical element of a situation.

**8. In what areas of global affairs does the EU add value or deliver impact or not on behalf of the UK?**

**No Response**

**9. How effective is the EU at combining its foreign, defence, economic and civil contingency policy instruments to deliver best effect in foreign policy? What, if anything, should it do differently?**

Coming from a NATO background in crisis response yet often in contact with EU counterparts, the EU appears overwhelmingly biased towards the political rather than the practical elements. Given that most EU countries are members of NATO and that NATO retains an effective and practiced civil crisis response system, there appears little point in operating a duplicate system so close in physical location to that of NATO. If the EU were to focus on partnering with NATO on crisis response instead of duplicating existing mechanisms then costs could be reduced and effectiveness increased as each contributed according to its particular skill to create synergy. There seems little point to the UK providing expensive resources to two organisations in areas where they are responsible for the same thing.

**10. How effective are the EU's delivery mechanisms? Would any changes make them more effective, and if so, which ones and why?**

In terms of civil contingencies it is hard to see how the EU is delivering compared with the 'Comprehensive Approach' developed by NATO which engages all necessary actors from the civil and military. Multi-agency and multi-national cooperation requires to be exercised in demanding conditions and subjected to detailed scrutiny.

**11. Would a different division of EU and Member State competence in a particular area produce more effective policies? If so, how and why?**

**No Response**

**12. How might the national interest be served by action being taken in this field at a different level e.g. regional, national, UN, NATO, OECD, G20 – either in addition or as an alternative to action at EU level?**

The UK's long and deep commitment to NATO places it in a good position to influence the development of the Comprehensive Approach to civil contingencies. NATO is making serious efforts to engage IO/NGOs and any civil organisation or government that would have an interest in civil protection as it is recognised that the military element may only do so much and is constrained in many circumstances. Training events are frequent, extensive and highly detailed and they exercise both the people and perhaps more importantly the processes that are necessary to provide protection to communities as well as States. A new scenario has recently been developed which permits exercising of all aspects of a crisis and its resolution mechanisms including detailed economic, political and social levers. These also serve as 'test beds' for differing solutions and may involve governmental participation at a senior level. It is submitted that the UK should investigate potential uses for this scenario which is in current use by an increasing number of countries including Denmark, Norway and all Baltic States to assist in the development of national resilience. Extract from NATO journal to be forwarded in support together with other supporting documentation.

**13. What future challenge/opportunities might we face in this area of policy and what impact might these have on the balance of competence between the UK and the EU?**

**No Response**

**14. Are there any general points you wish to make which are not captured above?**

**No Response**