



John Hayes MP
Minister of State
Department of Energy & Climate Change
3-8 Whitehall Place
LONDON, SW1A 2HH

26 SEP 2012

20th September 2012

John,

RE: 'HEALTH CANADA' STUDY ON WIND TURBINE NOISE.

The above study has been brought to my attention, as have the enclosed peer reviewed comments relating to it – a copy of which I enclose.

I would therefore be most grateful if you could consider this document and the findings contained within it and let me have your comments at the earliest opportunity.


I look forward to hearing from you.


With best wishes,


Yours ever,

CHRIS HEATON-HARRIS MP
MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT FOR DAVENTRY

House of Commons
LONDON, SW1A 0AA



Scan Sheet eCase DECC CU - New Case	 System User 36625/13
--	--

1. eCase Case Ref.	
2. Case type (please circle)	INV <u>MC</u> PO TO TFR
3. Case Title	Health Canada Wind Noise Study
4. Department/Directorate (Team)	LBR
5. Subject	Wind Farm Noise Issues
6. Date Post Opened and Scanned (Date Received)	2619
7. Urgency (please circle)	HIGH
8. Handling Instructions	
9. Addressee minister (if applicable)	Barker Davey <u>Hayes</u> Verma
10. Responding minister (if applicable)	Barker Davey <u>Hayes</u> Verma
11. Allocated to (Drafter)	LM
12. 15 day deadline	

Open Letter

Peer Review

Health Canada Wind Turbine Noise and Health Study

Submitted by

Carmen Krogh, BScPharm

Brett Horner BA CMA

September 7, 2012



Table of Contents

1	Disclaimer	5
2	Executive Summary: Michaud et al. (2012)	6
3	Conclusion	8
4	Recommendations	9
5	Some terms used	10
6	References used	13
7	Introduction	14
8	Need for precaution	16
9	The Study peer review	18
9.1	Peer review: defined	18
9.2	The Study review process	19
9.2.1	Peer review comments	20
10	Issues previously identified	21
10.1	Ethics	23
10.1.1	Peer review comments	25
11	Health Canada: government's job	26
11.1	Health Canada's mission and vision	26
11.2	Health Canada's core values	26
11.3	Health Canada's objectives	26
12	Michaud et al. (2012)	28
12.1	At conferences	28
12.1.1	InterNoise 2012	28
12.1.2	Future conferences uncertain	29
12.1.3	Additional disclosure at InterNoise 2012	29
12.2	Length of paper	29
12.3	Abstract	30
12.4	Section 1	30
12.5	Section 2	30
12.6	References cited	31
12.7	Paucity of references	31
12.7.1	Citations - Dr. Leventhall	31
12.8	Plausible causes omitted	32
12.9	Costs InterNoise 2012	33
12.9.1	Peer review comments	33
13	Detailed analysis of Michaud et al. (2012)	34
13.1	Definition of Health	34
13.1.1	Peer review comments	37
13.2	Disturbance of activities: quality of life	37
13.2.1	Peer review comments	40
13.3	Health includes mental well-being	41
13.3.1	Stigma of mental health	42
13.3.2	Health Canada's role: mental health	42
13.3.3	Wind turbines and mental health	43
13.3.4	Peer review comments	44
13.4	Stress can represent serious harm	44
13.4.1	Health Canada's role: mental health and stress	45

13.4.2	Environmental noise and stress.....	45
13.4.3	Wind turbine noise and stress	46
13.4.4	Peer review comments	47
13.5	Omission: wind turbine noise can harm humans	47
13.5.1	Peer review comments	48
13.6	Omission: Health professionals have concerns.....	48
13.6.1	Peer review comments	50
13.7	Omission: Canadians adversely affected	50
13.7.1	Peer review comments	51
13.8	Omission: other studies.....	51
13.8.1	Peer review comments	52
13.9	Omission: review of the literature.....	53
13.9.1	Peer review comments	53
13.9.2	Knopper and Ollson (2011)	54
13.10	Citation: other reviews.....	56
13.10.1	Peer review comments	57
13.11	Studies subject to criticism	57
13.11.1	Studies provide value	58
13.11.2	Peer review comments	58
13.12	Human Health versus Health Policy	58
13.12.1	Health policy and wind turbines	60
13.12.2	Peer review comments	61
13.13	Well-accepted science for noise.....	62
13.13.1	Well known science for noise	62
13.14	Health Canada manuscripts reflect policy	62
13.14.1	Peer review comments	64
13.15	Health Canada's "justification" for 45dBA	64
13.16	Understated: environmental noise	67
13.17	Understated: health effects of noise	68
13.17.1	Peer review comments	69
13.18	Noise Annoyance	69
13.18.1	Definition	69
13.18.2	Effects	69
13.18.3	Symptoms	70
13.18.4	Evaluating	70
13.18.5	Peer review comments	70
13.18.6	Prevalence in Canada.....	71
13.18.7	Distribution of annoyance in Canada.....	71
13.18.8	Canadians most annoyed by traffic.....	73
13.18.9	Objective: prevention and reduction.....	75
13.18.10	Understated: wind turbine noise annoyance	75
13.18.11	Peer review comment.....	77
13.18.12	Wind turbine noise: more annoying.....	78
13.18.13	Peer review comments	79
13.18.14	Increasing annoyance in Canadian communities	79
13.18.15	Peer review comments	81
13.18.16	Increased annoyance in Canadian communities: case study.....	82
13.18.16.1	Annoyance: Krogh et al. (2012) excerpt.....	82
13.19	Wind turbine annoyance and attitude	84
13.19.1	Peer review comments	85

13.19.2	Turbines welcomed: adverse effects.....	86
13.19.2.1	Attitudes: Krogh et al. (2012) excerpt	87
13.19.3	Peer review comments	88
13.19.4	Wind turbines: social economic Impacts	88
13.19.4.1	Social economic impacts: Krogh et al. (2012) excerpt.....	90
13.19.5	Peer review comments	91
13.19.6	Wind turbines: visual impacts.....	92
13.19.7	Peer reviewed comments	94
14	WHO Noise Guidelines	96
14.1	Defining sleep disturbance.....	96
14.2	Sleep disturbance: below 40dBA.....	96
14.2.1	Peer review comments	99
14.3	Wind turbine sleep disturbance: below 40dBA	99
14.3.1	Peer review comments	100
14.4	Averaged "A"-weighted metric	100
14.4.1	Peer review comments	101
14.5	Modern wind turbines	101
14.5.1	Peer review comments	102
14.5.2	Understated: amplitude modulation.....	102
14.5.3	Peer review comments: amplitude modulation.....	105
14.6	Effects: audible low frequency noise	105
14.6.1	Peer review comments	107
14.7	Omission: potential effects inaudible noise	108
14.7.1	Peer review comments	110
14.8	Wind turbine tonal noise	111
14.8.1	Peer review comments	111
14.9	Wind turbine noise: challenges measuring and modeling	111
14.9.1	Peer review comments	112
14.10	Electrical pollution.....	112
14.10.1	Peer review comments	113
15	Appendices.....	114
15.1	Appendix A: Biographies	114
15.2	Appendix B: Open Letter Health Canada Wind Turbine Noise and Health Study.....	115
15.3	Appendix C: Summary of some peer reviewed and conference articles	140
15.4	Appendix D: Escaping wind turbine noise. Ontario, Canada.....	161
15.5	Appendix E: Falmouth Board of Health hearing results.....	162
15.6	Appendix F: Canadian Wind Energy Association fact sheet.....	163
15.7	Appendix G: Letter of inquiry Keith et al (2008).....	166
15.8	Appendix H: Health Canada proposed 45 dBA.....	178
15.9	Appendix I: Audit: National Health and Medical Research Council.....	179
16	References.....	240

