

ANNEX B: Draft Management Response to the independent evaluation

Response to Evaluation Report (overarching narrative)

DFID welcomes the findings of this external evaluation of Trade Mark Southern Africa (TMSA). This evaluation provided an Interim Report in August 2013 which informed DFID's Annual Review in October 2013. A Project Completion Report will be carried out following completion of the closure of the programme.

The evaluation report meets DFID's evaluation standards. It has been subject to external quality assurance, endorsement by DFID's Evaluation Department, and oversight of a Reference Group which comprised two independent experts from the World Bank and the University of Kent and two DFID evaluation advisers. The evaluation is comprehensive in its coverage and was developed through extensive literature and field-based reviews with findings and conclusions supported by a strong evidence base.

Like the ICAI review, the evaluation noted that the programme had set objectives which were too ambitious, with insufficient attention given to tracking impact and results. The evaluation highlighted a number of areas where TMSA had made an important contribution to regional integration, including the critical role the programme had played in moving the Tripartite Free Trade Agreement negotiations forward.

In response to the findings of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact, the Secretary of State for DFID took the decision in early December 2013 to commence the closure of TMSA with immediate effect. This means that a number of the recommendations will not be implemented. However, the evaluation will help to inform future and ongoing DFID programmes of support for trade and regional integration.

Annex A: Evaluation Report Title: Trade Mark Southern Africa (TMSA) Mid-Term Evaluation Report

Recommendations	Accepted or Rejected	If “Accepted”, Action plan for Implementation or if “Rejected”, Reason for Rejection
1. Technical Support on Tripartite Free Trade Area (TFTA)		
Consideration should be given to establishing a team/pool of international and regional experts that can be made available to provide assistance to the RECs and member countries, on a request basis, during the negotiations and after the conclusion of the initial agreement. DFID should engage with the RECs to discuss the need for such assistance prior to the programme end date.	Accepted	The Trade Advocacy Fund (TAF), supported by DFID, is already providing technical assistance to support the East African Community’s efforts in this area. We have invited the Secretary-General of COMESA to apply for TAF funding if COMESA needs further technical assistance to support this work in future.
TMSA should undertake additional work around understanding the implications of the TFTA within vulnerable countries or sectors, and exploring means to make the FTA work better for specific communities.	Accepted	DFID (rather than TMSA) will disseminate the TMSA commissioned analysis of the Tripartite Free Trade Agreement.
2. Trade facilitation		
TMSA should continue to provide technical support to those involved at the Chirundu border post to monitor progress and facilitate further reforms, as needed. TMSA should review work programmes for the development of OSBPs at the Nakonde-Tunduma and Kasumbaslesa border posts and focus efforts on high impact elements that can realistically be completed within the remaining timeframe of the Programme.	Reject	The closure of TMSA means that work in this area will end by March 2014.
TMSA and the RECs should adopt a programme of engagement to solicit support from national governments for the implementation of a regional	Partially Accepted	With the closure of TMSA it will be for the RECs to consider whether they adopt a programme of engagement to solicit national governments’ support for implementation. DFID will explore how to best support this

transit management system, incorporating current innovations. TMSA should also engage with the RECs to develop a hand-over plan and medium term work programme/ budget for the NTB reporting, monitoring and elimination mechanism.		area in future.
TMSA should suspend work on those aspects of the wider trade facilitation programme where work has not begun or where little/ no progress is evident. (See Section 6.2.5.1)	Accepted	The decision to close TMSA means that all aspects of the trade facilitation programme will be stopped by March 2014.
3. Infrastructure		
TMSA and DFID should engage with the RECs and other donors to develop a sustainable work programme for the PPIU, which can be implemented as soon as TMSA funding ends.	Partially Accepted	A sustainable work programme for the PPIU, led by the RECs, is very important for the PPIU's sustainability. DFID will be pleased to consider any request from the RECs for assistance in this respect.
4. Monitoring and Evaluation		
TMSA should investigate the use of more advanced statistical techniques to generate a more rigorous assessment of border performance, identifying critical breaks in the data and linking these to border improvements or problems. This can be supported by the evaluation team in the design of the impact evaluation.	Partially Accepted	TMSA will close in March 2014 and this recommendation will not be implemented. However, DFID will ensure that M&E, including the impact on the poor, is given greater priority in any future support for regional trade and integration in Southern Africa and in other regions and countries.
It is recommended that TMSA be tasked to undertake further ex-post assessments/case-studies (to the extent that time and resource constraints will allow) of how TMSA has contributed to specific cross-cutting issues (for example, with regard to small scale traders) and should be required to give more attention to collecting information on these issues in remaining activities. Any activity in this area will be complemented by that of the	Partially Accepted	As above.

evaluation team as part of the forthcoming impact evaluation.		
5. Economic Competitiveness		
It is recommended that TMSA should conclude the ongoing value chain studies but do not commence any new work in under the industrial development area.	Accepted	No further work in this area is planned.