BIS | **Department for Business Innovation & Skills**

The Union Modernisation Fund – Round Two:
Final evaluation report

MARK STUART, MIGUEL MARTINEZ LUCIO, JENNIFER TOMLINSON AND ROBERT PERRETT

JULY 2010

Union Modernisation Fund – Round Two: Final evaluation report

BY
MARK STUART, MIGUEL MARTINEZ LUCIO, JENNIFER TOMLINSON AND
ROBERT PERRETT

CERIC

Centre for Employment Relations Innovation & Change

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS
Leeds University Business School

About EMAR

Employment Market Analysis and Research (EMAR) is a multi-disciplinary team of economists, social researchers and statisticians based in the Employment Relations Directorate of the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills.
Our role is to provide the evidence base for good policy making in employment relations, labour market and equality and discrimination at work. We do this through:

- Conducting periodic benchmark surveys

- Commissioning external research reports

- Conducting in-house research and analysis

- Assessing the regulatory impact of new employment laws

- Monitoring and evaluating the impact of government policies

Further details of EMAR's work, including PDF versions of all our publications, please see our web pages at:
http://www.bis.gov.uk/policies/employment-matters/research

Published in July 2010 by the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills.

URN 10/1084   © Crown Copyright 2010

Hard copies of this report can be ordered at: www.bis.gov.uk/publications
Alternatively, call the BIS Publications Orderline on 0845 015 0010 (+44 845 015 0010) and quote the URN, or email them at: publications@bis.gsi.gov.uk. Electronic copies are available to download at:
http://bis.ecgroup.net/Publications/EmploymentMatters/EmploymentRelationsResearchSeries.aspx

Enquiries should be addressed to emar@bis.gsi.gov.uk or posted to:

> Employment Market Analysis and Research
> Department for Business, Innovation and Skills
> 3rd Floor, Abbey 2
> 1 Victoria Street
> London SW1H 0ET
> UNITED KINGDOM

About the authors

Mark Stuart is Professor of Human Resource Management and Employment Relations and Director of the Centre for Employment Relations Innovation and Change (CERIC) at the University of Leeds. Miguel Martinez Lucio is Professor of International Human Resource Management and Comparative Industrial Relations at Manchester Business School, University of Manchester. Dr Jennifer Tomlinson is Senior Lecturer in Employment Relations at Leeds University Business School, University of Leeds.

Contents

Glossary of abbreviations and acronyms

ATL	Association of Teachers and Lecturers
BECTU	broadcasting, Entertainment, Cinematograph and Theatre Union
BFAWU	Bakers, Food and Allied Workers Union
BIS	Department for Business, Innovation & Skills
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CSP	Chartered Society of Physiotherapy
CWU	Communication Workers Union
FDA	Association of First Division Civil Servants
GFTU	General Federation of Trade Unions
GMB	General Municipal Boilermakers Union
ICE	Information and Consultation of Employee Regulations
ICT	Information communications technology
MU	Musicians Union
NASUWT	National Union of Schoolmasters, Union of Women Teachers
NUT	National Union of Teachers
ONC	Ordinary National Certificate
OTT	Overseas Trained Teachers
PCS	Public and Commercial Services Union
TGWU	Transport and General Workers Union
TUC	Trades Union Congress
UMF	Union Modernisation Fund
UCATT	Union of Construction, Allied Trades and Technicians
USDAW	Union of Shop Distributive and Allied Workers
YBO	Youth Branch Officer

Executive summary

This report presents an evaluation of projects funded under the second round of the Union Modernisation Fund. The evaluation of UMF2 projects is on the whole supportive. Judged against their aims and objectives, completed projects were successful. Unions are also starting to translate the outputs of projects into longer-term outcomes. Two areas where this is particularly evident is around the transformational nature of equality and diversity projects and the importation of management models into unions, both of which have promoted deeper cultural change and new debates on professionalism. Given the limited resources provided by the UMF, the results in many respects have been impressive. Where the evaluation has been more critical is around the wider issue of demonstration. This has been emphasised, not explicitly in terms of dissemination per se, but in terms of the need for lessons learnt from the UMF to become part of a wider conversation of modernisation across the union movement. The issue is one of sustaining the legacy of the UMF.

Overview and approach to the evaluation

- The UMF was designed to support innovative projects to help speed unions' adaptation to changing labour market conditions. The Fund aimed to support projects that either explored the potential for, or contributed to, *transformational change* within unions, and through such innovative activity provide a *demonstration effect* to the wider union movement.

- The rationale for the UMF was set against the changing world of work and the limited capacity that unions had to take the financial risks associated with innovation. The UMF was therefore introduced to support unions in adopting a forward-looking agenda of change that would allow unions to more fully realise their potential to improve the world of work for all concerned.

- The evaluation aimed to undertake a summary assessment of the overall success of projects funded under the UMF Second Round (UMF2). In total, 31 projects were funded under UMF2, representing a commitment of c.£3 million.

- The evaluation data were derived from two main sources. The first included an analysis of the extensive documentary sources produced by projects, including periodic and final reports. The second involved qualitative interviews with project managers of 26 projects.

Union modernisation in action

- Twenty five unions received funding under UMF2. Fewer smaller unions participated than in the UMF First Round. Just over half of unions had received UMF1 funding. Unions therefore saw value in continuing their modernisation efforts, but an equal number of unions also saw value in UMF activity for the first time. This suggests that unions may be more open to the UMF and any initial scepticism has been overcome.

- The most popular thematic priorities of projects covered: training and development of equality representatives; two-way communications; labour market diversity; and, modern management methods.

- Project activities fell into four general categories. First, there was an extensive programme of scoping and research. This included surveys of members on particular issues, such as views on equality and diversity, consultation workshops and research. Second, was the introduction of new technology. Whilst UMF1 projects had tended to focus on the introduction of new, interactive forms of web resource, UMF2 projects tended to go beyond this and link such resources to wider technological processes, such as integrated membership systems. Third, there was a concerted programme of training and development at various levels. This ranged from short workshops and briefing to more systematic and longitudinal programmes of training. A specific focus of UMF2 was the training of equality representatives, but there were also high profile programmes of continuous professional development for senior union officers. Whilst the training effort was extensive it was impossible for the evaluation to accurately quantify the total number of recipients: a best guess estimate would be somewhere between 2000-2500 recipients. The fourth activity related to wider project and engagement. The evaluation differentiates between 'internal facing' and 'external facing' activity, with internal activity more extensive than external activity.

- No project had failed to deliver any results at all. A detailed list of all project outputs is presented in the accompanying report Annex A. Outputs included updated websites, new electronic membership systems, trained cohorts and a whole raft of toolkits and presentational media. Outputs were not just related to artefacts, however, but the means to promote communication and participation structures within unions – this often meant the production of specific 'action plans' for union transformation.

- In addition to direct project outputs, there were a range of unanticipated results from project activities. This included: improvements in communication, which often had the effect of legitimating change processes and improving understanding within unions of members' needs; a more open attitude to training and improved skill sets, for example around technical and project management skills; wider understanding of union environments and strategies amongst varied external constituencies, such as employer organisations; and the challenging of pre-existing assumptions and modes of working within unions.

The management of modernisation

- It is common for funded projects to face challenges, which can often lead to delays in project deliverables or, worst case scenario, total project failure. There were no examples of UMF2 projects failing, unlike a small minority of UMF1 projects. The challenges experienced by projects could be grouped against 4 key themes.

    o *Management and workload* – many projects reported time constraints in their ability to deliver. Where projects had hired-in dedicated project workers or external agencies time constraints proved less of an issue. Many projects were attuned to the need for appropriate planning mechanisms, even if they admitted they could have done better in this regard.

    o *External engagement and contracting relations* – engaging with employers proved difficult in some cases, as in UMF1. Likewise, challenges were identified with dealing with external contractors (around IT provision) and educational providers.

    o *Internal structural and cultural factors within unions* – internal communications did not appear to be a particular problem for projects. Indeed, this was something of a success story for UMF2. Nonetheless, many potential points of resistance within unions were identified. First, there was an issue of membership or activist engagement, such as getting members or representatives onto training courses. Second, and more pervasive, were deeper levels of resistance within internal union structures. Third, a number of projects took levels of internal resistance to changing traditional ways of working as the actual rationale for projects. The extent of resistance to UMF should not however be overstated. In most cases, internal resistance was anticipated and, where it existed, projects made great efforts to overcome scepticism and 'get people on board'.

    o *Inter-union communication and engagement* - unions were successful in terms of the production of high quality outputs, such as toolkits, but general levels of external dissemination and networking were not as extensive as they could have been, though a number of reasons were identified for this.

- How projects responded to emerging challenges contributed to how they were learning to manage processes of change within unions. Such learning is an important part of the process by which outputs become embedded and sustainable within the every-day working practices of unions. Such learning had been noted for UMF1 (Stuart et al, 2009) and continued for UMF2. Four themes were identified:

    o *New resources, assets and role* – the capacities produced seemed more pronounced for UMF2 projects, compared to those funded under UMF1. Sustainability also appeared to be more 'hard wired' into project design. There was a notable emphasis on training more equality representatives and toolkits seemed to be more sophisticated and extensive. Yet, at the same time, project workers were cognisant of the need for project activity to become embedded within union structures

and that to do this support was needed at different levels of the organisation.

- o *Enhanced communications* – The power of communication and engagement with different constituencies was paying dividends in projects, particularly where consultation was initiated right from the outset of projects. This was about creating a sense of openness and transparency within unions, and ultimately helped to justify and legitimate the modernisation process.

- o *Project management and relational work* – the need to develop project management skills to effectively deliver milestones and targets was recognised in nearly all projects. Projects responded to the challenges of dealing with contractors, notably where there were multiple suppliers, in different ways; be it in terms of learning how to engage at a more technical level or, in one case, learning from the wider problems of projects and engaging a contractor that could undertake a coordination role amongst multiple suppliers. Whilst contracting problems are not easy to resolve, they were an anticipated challenge identified in UMF1 and more could have been done to share potential solutions across UMF2.

- o *Evaluation, networking and mainstreaming and embedding change* – how lessons are learnt and feed into longer-term outcomes relate more widely to levels of reflection on project activity, the degree of wider learning and the cross-fertilisation of knowledge and, ultimately, the mechanisms put in place to assist change and transformation. A degree of internal reflection was taking place, though there was less evidence of this in terms of formal evaluation procedures. Much of this reflection was 'internal facing', with limited networking across unions. More widely, however, projects were starting to look at how to mainstream and embed change, be it in terms of action plans, sets of recommendations, new committees and roles or the extension of project steering groups*.*

- Dissemination activity, as noted, was rather limited in external terms. The fact that many projects tend to undertake such activity post completion partly explains this, as does the overlap between UMF1 and UMF2 and the fact that many unions are not inherently outward facing. Nonetheless, if the UMF is to have a 'demonstration effect' the value of such activity needs to be encouraged further. There appeared to some confusion amongst some unions over the need to disseminate their findings or the wider generalisability of lessons learnt. Yet, equally, there was a large demand for more external engagement and networking activity.

Modernising through equality and diversity

- The equality and diversity agendas have developed as key issues of the UMF. Equality and diversity concerns are becoming central to what unions need to be doing in modernisation terms and are emblematic of the processes of change that need to take place and are taking place. The equality and diversity agendas are managing to create a meaningful difference to unions as they start to think

through new ways of representing members. Whilst there have been challenges in administrative and organisational terms, the portfolio of projects have served to legitimate change and new forms of working. This was evident in the new networks of equality representatives that were being built up, which were ably supported through the TUC acting in a coordinating role. Such coordination was lacking across the wider equality and diversity projects, but the impact of these projects in change terms have been a notable feature of UMF2 projects, whether in terms of how to engage younger members or members from overseas. Representing such workers throws up very real challenges to existing structures and traditions of unions, but equally projects displayed a large degree of openness to the development of such agendas at different levels within unions.

Cultural change in unions

- Embedding change is a major challenge in many organisations. New forms of working in terms of acquiring skills, keeping records in a more interactive manner, being transparent, and developing a new approach to communication mean that traditional ways of working will be undermined or at least challenged. Often there is a sound case for resistance. All too often change is articulated as something that 'must be good' and tradition and established routines castigated for no apparent reason. The case for modernisation needs, therefore, to be justified and legitimated.

- The starting point for many projects was the need for unions to connect with wider constituencies internally and externally. Internally, cultural change has to face up to different sources of resistance. This was anticipated and effectively addressed. It was seen as a key part of cultural change, as raising concerns was welcomed in democratic institutions such as unions.

- Projects were clear that work was still in progress and needed to become mainstreamed into the 'way things are done around here'. For many projects, this was about opening up unions and reducing certain types of hierarchical and bureaucratic controls, such as through the encouragement of new forms of democratic participation. An increasing number of unions were also referencing the need for unions to be run more professionally and for officers to act more professionally. This was supported by the introduction of 'new management' tools and practices into unions.

- This focus on becoming more professional represented a distinct change in narrative from UMF1. Holding officers accountable was part of this, but the need for consistency and quality of practice and competence was more significant. This was nonetheless recognised as a sensitive issue and terminology proved problematic in some cases. Whilst unions accepted that professionalising practice meant introducing certain management practices, such as appraisal, they were also acutely aware of how some schemes had been abused and discredited in everyday practice within private and public employers' organisations. Thus, whilst projects often accepted certain principles behind such schemes and in a couple of cases were open about the need to run the union 'like a business' and recognised the 'union lacks management skills', it was clear

that the purpose of such change was to improve the *union offer.* In other words, the development of more efficient and effective internal structures and processes were seen by unions as contributing in a beneficial way to the delivery of key union objectives.

Conclusions and recommendations

- In simple terms, the conclusion is positive. UMF2 has very much continued where UMF1 left off and the evaluation is broadly similar in that projects were successful on their own terms and had the potential for wider transformational change in the operational effectiveness of unions. There appears to be a noticeable direction of travel, specifically around the promotion of the equality and diversity agendas and the wider processes of cultural change and professionalisation of unions. Many projects noted how change was 'here to stay' and there was 'no going back'.

- Concerns were nonetheless raised about the level of overall project dissemination, in external terms, and the wider demonstration effect of the UMF. Whilst there are recognised caveats for this, this nonetheless raised issues about how the legacy and wide experience of innovation will be built on by unions once UMF has finished. Yet signs are emerging that co-ordination and new forms of working in relation to change are being embedded.

- Six inter-related issues and recommendations were suggested to ensure that the valuable learning taking place is captured over the longer term:

    o 1. *Encourage further networking, working through networks and consultation* – general levels of engagement both internally and externally should be further encouraged. Whilst this type of activity was clearly evident, and there was clear evidence of the benefits of internal communication, there was a large demand for more networking, sharing and, essentially coordination, of what was happening.
    o 2. *Emphasise the wider value and relevance of projects* – many projects were open that they saw little need or value in external engagement. For example, some of the smaller projects suggested their projects were unique to them: yet, many smaller unions faced similar issues, with dispersed members and declining participation.
    o 3. *Create a recognised repository of supporting tools and methods* - in purely practical terms, many projects noted it would have helped to have had more formal guidelines or toolkits on project management, contracting or organising tendering. Constructing a resource, through a weblink, where project managers know they can access information on, for example, recruiting staff, undertaking tendering processes or establishing contracts with (recommended) external suppliers, would be useful.
    o 4. *Leadership buy-in -* many of the major and more successful projects saw leading figures within the union steer and legitimate

processes of change. Leaders should be involved from the outset of projects and formally embedded in some way.

- o 5. *Planning for sustainability* - to ensure that modernisation does not come to an end with projects themselves, projects should be encouraged to 'sign off' with a formal plan for sustaining change and internalising lessons learnt. To the extent that projects may need to demonstrate internally how they have added value, more developed ongoing evaluation of change projects should also be encouraged, notably through some forms of pre- and post-activity assessment.
- o 6. *Facilitate and celebrate ongoing change through strong coordination* - the evaluation found that there was a need to celebrate more widely UMF activity and greater coordination was needed in terms of events, support and networks. The TUC has a [significant] role to play in this wider coordination. Given the extraordinary and exemplary activities of UMF2 it is important that information sharing and thematic networks across forms of change be established more explicitly.

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Overview of the Union Modernisation Fund

The Union Modernisation Fund (UMF) was established under the auspices of the Employment Relations Act 2004, which inserted into the Trade Union and Labour Relations (Consolidation) Act 1992 an authority for the Secretary of Trade to establish a Fund to facilitate the operational modernisation of independent trade unions and their federations. The UMF was set against the changing contextual environment that trade unions in Britain currently face. This not only means a declining membership base, but a more diverse set of representational interests, technological challenges and a more complex political and managerial context (see Stuart et al, 2009). Against this backdrop, the purpose of the UMF has been to support innovative projects to help speed unions' adaptation to changing labour market conditions. It aims to support projects that either explore the potential for, or contribute to, a *transformational* change in the organisational efficiency or effectiveness of a trade union or unions. Through helping unions to explore and test innovative ways of working, and by disseminating the results of projects widely across the union movement, the Fund also aims to provide a *demonstration effect* to the broader trade union movement, enabling unions to realise more fully their potential to improve the world of work for workers and employers alike (see DTI, 2004, 2005a).

The rationale for the UMF was clearly detailed in the Regulatory Impact Assessment published in 2005 by the then Department for Trade and Industry (DTI, 2005b). The backdrop to union modernisation has been the changing world of work, which has seen rapid developments in new ICT technologies, more flexible patterns of work and changing diversity in the labour market, most notably in terms of female participation but also more recently in terms of an increasing presence of black and minority ethnic groups and migrant labour. This raises two big challenges for unions. First, in the face of increased competition, 'the best employers now use a wider range of managerial initiatives to engage their workers' (DTI, 2005b:2). To respond to this, unions need to better understand the changes that are taking place in the world of work so they can 'work with employers to maximise the potential benefits of new ways of working' (DTI, 2005b: 2). Second, and related, whilst unions have been taking the initiative to modernise themselves, the pace of change has been quite slow and unions face a number of obstacles in their ability to change. Competition between a large number of unions means that subscriptions are low, whilst most unions only employ a small number of people and their management systems are relatively unsophisticated. This means that unions 'have a limited capacity to invest for the longer term and to take financial risks associated with innovation (DTI, 2005b: 2). Nonetheless, unionised workplaces are known to be associated with 'more

progressive workplace policies towards training, health and safety and diversity' (DTI, 2005b:2). 'By supporting a forward-looking agenda for unions, the UMF should therefore enable unions to realise more fully their potential to improve the world of work for all concerned' (DTI, 2005b:2).

The first round of projects started in 2006 (with the Round launched in 2005) and focused across 6 thematic priorities. UMF2 was launched in November 2006, with projects started in 2007. The round followed the same basic thematic priorities, merging two of the original priorities and adding a new priority (at the recommendation of the Women and Work Commission) focused on the training and capacity building of equality representatives. Accordingly, the six thematic priorities for UMF2 were:

> 1. *Improving the understanding of modern business practices by full time officers and lay representatives*: to better enable unions to work constructively with employers as partners to improve business performance; there was a particular focus on the need to equip full time officers and lay representatives for their role in the implementation of the Information and Consultation of Employees Regulations.

> 2. *Capacity building to support training and development for equality representatives*.

> 3. *Improving two-way communication between unions and their members*: leading to a potential for greater participation of members in the union.

> 4. *Improving the ability of unions to respond to the increasing diversity of the labour market*: to supply services geared to the needs of a diverse membership.

> 5. *Developing the professional competence of union officers; and applying modern management methods to the running of unions as efficient, outward-looking and flexible organisations*.

> 6. *Assessing the challenges and opportunities of union restructuring and union mergers*.

In total, 31 projects were funded under UMF2. The largest grant offer was for £200, 000, the maximum available under the Fund, which was awarded to three unions (at the time of the award). The smallest award was for £11, 700. Funds were received by 25 unions (counting TGWU and Amicus as two unions), with four organisations receiving two awards (CWU, GFTU, PCS and TUC) and one union (Unison) receiving three awards. The original remit for the UMF was to allocate a 'modest sum' of between £5 to 10 million towards union modernisation. In total, £7.3 million has been paid or committed across the three rounds, c.£3 million of which is accounted for by UMF2. The third and final round of the UMF was launched in 2009, with all projects likely to be completed by the end of 2011/early 2012.

1.2 Aims and objectives of the evaluation

The Centre for Employment Relations Innovation and Change (CERIC) was commissioned to conduct an evaluation of UMF2 in January 2010. The timing of this was deemed appropriate as the majority of projects had either completed or were approaching completion.

The aim of the evaluation was to:

- Undertake a summary evaluation of the overall success of projects funded under the second round of the Union Modernisation Fund. The evaluation to be based on a robust methodology and analysis.

More specific objectives were to:

- Assess the success of projects on their own terms and against the wider aims of the UMF, such as transformational change and demonstration effect;
- Outline the challenges faced by projects and the extent to which these were successfully overcome;
- Analyse the immediate benefits accrued from projects (outputs) and the lessons that were learnt and identify potential indicators of best practice;
- Detail the potential longer-term outcomes of projects, most notably in terms of the extent to which projects have enabled unions to embed longer-term cultural and behavioural change;
- Benchmark, where possible, the outputs, outcomes and overall effectiveness of the UMF2 projects with those funded under the first round.

UMF 2 should be set against a previous evaluation of UMF first round projects (Stuart et al, 2009). The evaluation of UMF1 projects provided evidence that the Fund had started to generate a high degree of potential for transformational change within trade unions. Projects delivered a wide range of outputs, such as new electronic platforms, training programmes for officers and staff, research investigations and the development of new union roles. These outputs were starting to impact on the day-to-day activities of unions. Wider outcomes included improved communication structures and democratic processes, greater understanding of the representational needs of potential members from diverse and ethnic backgrounds, efficiency improvements in union processes and structures and new skills sets for project management. A notable outcome was the development of new union organising roles around equality and diversity, through the formation of networks of equality representatives; something that UMF2 attempted to build on through the specific theme of training equality representatives.

The main contribution of the UMF has been to provide space for unions to engage with and learn about the nature and processes of modernisation. Numerous challenges were identified from the UMF1 evaluation, in terms of the coordination, planning and strategic execution of modernisation, as well as around wider

engagement with external contractors and stakeholders. Such challenges revealed important lessons for unions in terms of the deeper processual and cultural barriers to modernisation. An important dimension to the evaluation of UMF2 was to assess the extent to which the lessons learnt from UMF1 were internalised in any way, in order to mitigate challenges or aid transformation. Such 'internalisation' can be understood in terms of the wider objectives of the UMF, whereby learning can lead to transformational change within individual unions, or where learning can be absorbed at a more general level across the union movement as a whole (often referenced as the 'demonstration effect'). In certain cases, UMF2 projects directly built upon projects funded under the first round. In many cases, however, the connections were not so clear cut, making robust benchmarks between UMF1 and UMF2 difficult.

1.3 Approach to the evaluation

In total 31 projects were funded under UMF2. Those projects concerned with the development of equality representatives were not all covered by the evaluation. These projects had been facilitated to some extent by the TUC and a separate impact assessment had been commissioned. This was undertaken by Professors Nick Bacon and Kim Hoque of Nottingham University Business School and involved a quantitative impact assessment via a survey of equality representatives and a number of qualitative case studies (Bacon and Hoque, 2009). In total eight UMF2 projects fell under the auspices of the TUC evaluation. This left 23 core projects for consideration in the wider UMF2 evaluation. A general evaluation of equality representatives' projects is thus not considered in this report. However, given the important coordination role played by the TUC UMF2 project on equality representatives and the fact that there was a degree of overlap between theme 2 projects on equality representatives and those projects supported under theme 4 on diverse labour markets, the TUC project and a sample of (two) projects on equality representatives were included. The evaluators also considered this appropriate as equality and diversity matters have proved a central and increasing concern across the different rounds of the UMF (See Stuart et al, 2009 and Chapter 4 this report).

Two methods were used in the evaluation. First, a systematic documentary analysis was undertaken of all project records associated with the core 23 projects and the TUC project on equality representatives. This included the periodic reports that projects submitted to BIS, along with occasional interim reports, general communications between projects and BIS and final project reports. For the sample as a whole this involved well in excess of 250 documents. However, their length varied significantly from a simple one page update to a final report of over 300 pages. The documents were read and data extracted and allocated to appropriate evaluation 'themes/ headings'. This process of 'coding' helped to build a picture of aggregate outputs, outcomes, challenges and lessons learnt that are detailed in the body of the evaluation report. The documentary analysis was also used to produce short 'narratives' of each project and a summary table of projects, which are detailed in Annex A.

In addition to the documentary analysis, a telephone 'survey' was also conducted to probe a little deeper and to gain some reflection from project managers on the perceived successes and challenges of projects. This allowed the evaluation to 'fill in any gaps' not covered by UMF documentation. The survey was based on a semi-structured interview template and the purpose was to elicit a qualitative narrative from project managers rather than a quantitative aggregation. Interviews were conducted by telephone over the three week period from the 2nd March 2010 to the 24th March 2010. An email was sent one week prior to the start of the survey from the UMF Programme Manager at BIS, which detailed the purpose and protocol of the survey and encouraged projects to participate. Where agreed, interviews were recorded. Following the interview a transcript was immediately written up against the format of the interview template. This allowed comparison across interviews for data analysis purposes.

The initial target sample was the 23 non-equality representative projects. A 100 per cent response rate was achieved. As noted above, a decision was also made to sample two equality representative projects (by GFTU and PCS, selected due to convenience, as they had other UMF2 projects) to give some insights into these projects and this was complimented by a face-to-face interview with the project manager of the TUC equality reps project. Interviews lasted between half an hour and one and a half hours, depending upon the extent to which interviewees wanted to expand upon their experiences as well as time constraints and other work responsibilities. No opposition to the evaluation was experienced despite often heavy workloads, and respondents talked openly and candidly about their project experiences.

The deeper methodological/ theoretical approach of the evaluation follows that of UMF1. In any evaluation it is important to pay due regard to *context* and also to differentiate between *outputs* and *outcomes* (see Walker et al, 2007). Context is important because it means that similar interventions could produce different outcomes; in basic terms a training course could lead to cultural change in one context, but not in another. Understanding the context of particular trade unions is accordingly necessary for evaluating the overall achievements of the UMF. For the present evaluation this means examining in some detail the specific activities of projects and the outputs produced, before considering the significance of this for wider outcomes and the particular change sought within unions. The distinction between immediate *outputs* and longer term *outcomes* is thus an important one. Outputs are typically specified in the project proposal as deriving over the course of the project from its key activities and interventions – for example, a project handbook. Outputs can then become the means to lead to more substantial outcomes. As Walker et al (2007: 274) explain: 'The *outputs* are produced in one context – the 'context of production' – and are then used in a rather different context – the 'context of use'. The *outcomes* are the wider industrial relations or political consequences stemming from the use of outputs…'

In terms of UMF2 projects, the outputs were relatively easily demonstrable by project completion, allowing in simple terms for an evaluation of project effectiveness on their own terms. Outcomes tend to be more discernable some time after project completion, but it was anticipated that it would be possible to discern the means put in place to achieve 'transformational' change and the processes by which modernisation is justified and legitimated. It was also possible to consider, to some extent, outcomes in terms of the sustainability of innovation and discernable change from UMF1. In this regard, the report aims to consider longer-term outcomes in relation to two emerging factors, which can be seen as the key learning processes that are apparent across UMF1 and UMF2 projects. The first relates to changes that are taking place within unions around new equality and diversity agendas. The second relates to the extent to which UMF projects have facilitated a deeper sense of cultural change and 'professionalisation' within unions.

1.4 Structure of the report

The report is structured into five further chapters:

Chapter two looks at the activities of UMF2 projects. It details the characteristics of projects, what they did, key outputs, the way in which project findings were disseminated and wider unanticipated results.

Chapter three explores the management of modernisation. It considers the challenges that projects faced, the lessons that were learnt and the processes that are unfolding in terms of sustainability.

Chapter four develops the focus on project outcomes through a specific consideration of emerging practice around equality and diversity matters within unions.

Chapter five draws the previous analysis together to examine the extent to which projects were contributing to deeper cultural change within trade unions. It unpacks the way in which projects may be contributing to a wider understanding of professional working and what this means for the management of unions.

Chapter six presents the key conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation.

Chapter 2: Union modernisation in action

This chapter details the main activities and outputs of projects. It outlines the main characteristics of projects and the drivers of modernisation and how this has led to particular types of project practices and deliverables. The chapter also considers the dissemination effort of unions and unanticipated results.

2.1 Project characteristics and drivers

The characteristics of all 31 projects funded under UMF2 are detailed in Table 1. Funding totalling just over £3m was committed to 25 unions. The general spread of unions was less extensive than for UMF1 and the proportion of smaller unions (those with less than 100, 000 members) receiving funding was lower (at around a third of projects). Just over half of projects (16) were by unions that had received funding in the first round. This suggests that a significant proportion of unions saw sufficient value in the UMF to either continue their initial modernisation work or develop new ideas for change. Perhaps of greater note, the success of the first round seems to have encouraged 'first time' UMF activity and also to some extent overcome prior scepticism of the fund. Unison and ATL both had applications for first round funding rejected, but developed successful new proposals for UMF2. Large unions such as PCS, UCATT and NASUWT were all successful first time applicants. UCATT had not submitted first time around, but in hindsight, reflecting on the success of the UMF, noted they should have done. Where large funds were allocated to projects (over £100K) they tended to go to the larger unions, although there were some notable exceptions, for example, the BECTU project, which was considered sufficiently transformational to receive the maximum allowable grant of £200k. Few projects, as in UMF1, were the product of union collaborations; the CSP and Accord/Amicus projects apart. This is often down to different agendas and traditions within unions and the practical obstacles of developing joint bids. Greater collaboration was encouraged for UMF3 with community and voluntary organisations.

The six priority themes were widely covered. Projects tended to cover more than one theme, and to a greater extent than UMF1. The challenges of restructuring and merger (theme 6) and understanding modern business practices (theme 1) were the least covered themes. The latter was a notable change from UMF1, which had numerous projects from small finance unions on partnership working; the Accord and Amicus project was the specific example in UMF2 though several projects referenced theme 1 as part of a wider set of activities. The themes mainly covered equality representatives, two-ways communications, labour market diversity and modern management methods; activities in many cases linked across these themes.

The rationale for projects was articulated in similar terms to UMF1, notably in terms of the new demands of information and communication technology and changing workforce composition and the implications of this in representational terms for more diverse groups. Few concrete definitions of modernisation were articulated, but most projects sought to ground their aims and objectives against a wider strategy of modernisation. Sometimes modernisation was related to union renewal, other times to union structures, organising and activation, and, quite frequently, in terms of equality and diversity. A number of projects were specifically driven by the need to represent more effectively an increasingly peripatetic membership; for example, in terms of dispersed professional or freelance workers (such as Aspect, BECTU, Equity and the Musicians Union). In other cases, projects were driven more explicitly by the need to deepen management expertise and understanding and, to some extent, further professionalise the role of union officers (such as USDAW, GMB and TGWU).

Whilst around half the sample had familiarity with the UMF through first round projects, only a select few sought to build on earlier project work. Two notable exceptions were the Community and USDAW projects, which explicitly built on UMF1 projects; less clearly identifiable but nonetheless relevant were projects by BFAWU, GMB, GTFU and NUT.

Table 1: *Summary of all UMF2 funded projects*

UMF 2 code	Union	Grant offer (banded 000)	Project Theme	Type of union	Size of union (000)
054	The Musicians Union	10-49*	3, 4	Private	20-49
058	Bakers, Food and Allied Workers Union (BFAWU)	10-49*	3, 4, 5	Private	20-49
059	Nautilus UK	10-49	1,2,3,4,5,6	Private	5-19
070	Communication Workers Union (CWU) - Equality	10-49*	2,3,4,5,6	General/ Fed	100-499
071	Aspect	10-49	3, 5	Public	<5
076	Public and Commercial Services Union (PCS) - mentoring	10-49	2,3	Public	100-499
082	Chartered Society of Physiotherapy (6 other unions)	10-49	4,5,6	Private	20-49
101	Community	10-49*	1,2,3,4,5,6	Private	20-49
056	Association of Teachers and Lecturers (ATL)	50-99	1, 3, 4, 5	Public	100-499
066	Equity	50-99*	2, 3, 4, 6	Private	20-49
067	Unison – Virtual branches	50-99	3,4,5	Public	>1 million
072	Communication Workers Union (CWU) – Youth project	50-99*	2,3,4,5,6	General/ Fed	100-499
085	National Union of Teachers	50-99*	2,3,4	Public	100-499
090	National Union of Schoolmasters, Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT)	50-99	1,2,3,4,5	Public	100-499
097	Union of Construction Allied Trades and Technicians (UCATT)	50-99	1,3,4,5	Private	100-499
099	TSSA	50-99*	2,4	Ex Public	20-49
051	General Federation of Trade Unions (GFTU) – Equality Reps	100-149*	2	General/ Federation	N/A
052	General Federation of Trade Unions (GFTU) - Leadership	100-149*	4, 5	General/ Federation	N/A
053	Trades Union Congress (TUC) - Equality	100-149*	2, 4, 5	General/ Federation	N/A
064	Prospect	100-149	2, 4		100-149
073	GMB	100-149*	1,3,4,5	General/ Fed	500-999
083	Accord and Amicus	100-149	1,3,5	Private	20-49 (Accord)
086	Unison – Equality Reps	100-149	1,2,3,4,5,6	Public	>1 million
092	FDA	100-149	3,4,5	Public	5-19
068	Unite – Amicus	>150*	2,4	General/ Fed	>1 million
077	Public and Commercial Services Union (PCS) - Equality	>150	2,4	Public	100-499
078	Union of Shop, Distributive and Allied Workers (USDAW)	>150*	3,4,5	Private	100-499
081	Transport and General Workers Union (TGWU)	>150*	5	General/ fed	>1 million
087	Unison – migrant workers	>150	3,4	Public	>1 million
091	Broadcasting, Entertainment, Cinematograph and Theatre Union (BECTU)	>150	3,4,5	Private	20-49
096	Trades Union Congress – Green workplaces	>150*	1,5	General/ Fed	N/A

*Recipient of UMF 1 grant; shaded – not covered by evaluation

2.2 Project activities and outputs

At the time of the evaluation the vast majority of projects had either completed or were close to completion; though final evaluation reports were often pending. Final project reports are typically delivered a few months after project completion to allow time to pull all the findings together and reflect on lessons learnt. It is rather common for funded projects to require extensions prior to completion, and numerous extensions were granted to UMF2 projects. However, this applied to less than half of projects and extensions were less common than in UMF1 and tended to be relatively short (three months or less).

Given the overlapping priority themes between UMF1 and UMF2 it is unsurprising that the activities undertaken were broadly similar. Accordingly, project activities tended to fall into four categories. First, there was extensive initial scoping activity. This included surveys of members on particular issues, such as views on equality and diversity, consultation workshops and research. Often the initial surveys were associated with an effort to identify the demographics of particular groups within unions (such as activists) or to collect email addresses of representatives. For example, the Association of Teachers and Lecturers (ATL) conducted an exercise to increase email records of their representatives to 50 per cent, followed by a survey of 85 branch officers and 1,098 representatives as part of an equality and diversity audit. Likewise, Equity conducted an online survey of its student members, whilst the CWU conducted a survey of its senior organisers and regional officers' views on the current approach of the union to youth issues and the future of the union. These exercises were pivotal in gauging the pre-project state of affairs, collecting data and views on membership and where staff development was a key component assessing the necessary needs and approach of any training programme. Formal research efforts were typically undertaken when external agencies were hired to manage projects. This was a standard method of, for example, the Campaign Company, which included, in the case of the Musicians Union an initial comparative piece of desk-top research and then quantitative and qualitative research of members. The CSP also commissioned a series of external research reports.

The second activity was the introduction of new technology. A common feature of first round projects was the renewal of union websites from more static to more interactive forms. There were examples of this in UMF2, but it was not so central to project activity. The best example was BECTU, which launched a new interactive website to engage and increase participation of its diverse and fragmented freelance workforce. This proved very successful and included a new online booking system for events. More common, however, was the development of ICT within a wider project remit. For example, both the CWU (YES) and NASUWT introduced new website elements, but this was part of a larger focus on addressing the needs of youth activists and overseas trained teachers respectively.

The Unison Virtual Branches project established 12 new pilot websites to help promote virtual participation in regional and branch matters. A Unison membership survey had revealed that just 12 per cent of members participate in branch meetings, and that time and location are significant factors that affect the level of participation. The project aimed at increasing membership participation in branch activity. The starting point for the project was that the union's current branch meeting structure was not conducive to membership participation. Two virtual pilots had demonstrated that participation could be improved through transforming branch communication structures; with associated cost savings for the union. The project aimed to develop earlier work through the 12 virtual branches; web developments were also being linked more systematically to new integrated memberships systems and the facility for union staff and activists to communicate more frequently via online social networking.

The FDA introduced a new integrated membership system that also incorporated the provision to log and work on personal case work electronically. Whilst this was still bedding down by the end of the project, there was evidence that the new membership system was effective: hits on the website had increased from 200 per month to 200 per day and paper-based membership responses had declined by 40 per cent.

The third dominant activity was training of various forms; which then underpinned activity on a broader front. This ranged from short workshops and briefings to more systematic and longitudinal programmes of training. A core component of UMF2 training was, of course, for the development of the equality representative role. The TUC project alone trained 129 equality representatives on its initial pilots and then a further 116 through two online courses. Those projects that introduced new forms of technology typically had an associated programme of training: in the case of BECTU this involved 800 participants.

More specific forms of training included focused efforts to develop partnership working and the encouragement of women activists. For example, Accord and Amicus followed a training programme with HBOS to improve partnership working. This was facilitated by the Partnership Institute and included training for an equal number of union representatives and managers (196). Pre and post course evaluation suggests that understanding between the two groups increased as a result of the intervention. In terms of encouraging women activists, PCS sought to train 20 mentors and 20 mentees. Whilst the project was able to demonstrate the value of such mentoring relationships, it was not able to recruit its target number (particularly mentees).

The most systematic forms of training related more to continuous professional development and the improvement of 'business' understanding. The Community project sent its National Executive on the same training course that the union's senior management had attended on its UMF1 project. Delivered by external

academics, the course focused on issues of globalisation, strategy, marketing and finance and contributed to a more open and professional approach amongst the union's National Executive. Likewise, the USDAW project built on its UMF1 project to introduce a more systematic approach to competency building amongst senior management, with a 360 degree appraisal programme for managers, and a cascading programme of training for 100 full-time officials. The union's aspiration was for the 'management structure to be the best trained within the union movement'. A concern with management skills was also the focus of the TGWU continuous professional development (CPD) project, which sought to pilot a best practice approach to CPD. Likewise the GMB trained a cohort of some 59 officers and managers, and sought to embed a new management model.

In only a select number of cases was the training provided formally linked to some form of external accreditation. Given the fact that much of the activity was more briefing orientated or focused on a specific issues this is no surprise. However, in a couple of cases, attempts were made to get accreditation; for example, through institutions such as Ruskin College. The PCS mentoring project, based in Wales, aimed to get ONC level 3 accreditation, but this proved problematic. GFTU sought to develop a post-project leadership certificate.

Whilst the training effort was extensive it was impossible for the evaluation to accurately quantify the total number of recipients. Many projects provided clear information about numbers covered, but many did not. The 'best guess' would put the number of recipients at somewhere between 2000-2500. Also, only a minority of projects undertook pre and post-course evaluations of the impact and benefits of training, and often they tended to be qualitative and not that rigorous. Yet, where this did happen (eg. with the Accord and Amicus partnership project; also examples for Community, BECTU and Nautilus) the results were positive and provided a powerful demonstration of the value of UMF investment. Pre-training consultation exercises and identification of training needs also proved useful in terms of how provision was organised. For example, both the USDAW and TGWU projects changed their approach to a more needs based form of provision following an initial consultation, rather than adopt an 'off the shelf' form of training. Both these projects sought to move away from a 'top down' approach, with training dictated by select national officials, to an approach based more on engagement with those on the front line, of what training was actually appropriate for them.

The fourth project activity related to wider project engagement and dissemination. All projects had some form of 'internal facing' dissemination activity, though how widespread this was varied markedly across projects. At the most basic, the project activity itself involved some form of engagement across certain types of groups, be they officers, lay representatives or members. For some unions this was an innovation in itself. More widely, projects kept the general membership informed through publishing articles in union newsletters, for example BFAWU in 'Foodworkers' or UCATT in 'Building Worker', or through events at union

conferences. Fewer projects systematically engaged in an 'external facing' way, either in terms of general dissemination or engagement with other stakeholders. It should be recognised though that external activity tends to happen more frequently as projects approach completion or after projects have completed. A notable exception was the TUC Green Workplaces project. A central objective of the project was the promotion of the green agenda with employers and unions through seven pilots. In addition to the pilot activity, the project disseminated its findings and the benefits of cooperation around green issues through numerous national and international events. Other examples of external demonstration included an event organised by Nautilus via the Unions 21 network, launch events at TUC Congress House by the GMB and CWU and an event by BECTU at the House of Commons. A number of other unions had stated plans for similar high profile activity, such as the TGWU.

2.3 Outputs and unanticipated successes

The outputs produced by projects were naturally related to project activity. A detailed list of all project outputs is presented in Annex A. They included updated websites, new electronic membership systems, trained cohorts and a whole raft of toolkits and presentational media. For example, the CWU (DEBUT) project produced an equality and diversity toolkit that was described as 'groundbreaking', and it was implied by the project worker that this was the most comprehensive toolkit of any union. The ICT projects not only resulted in updated websites and membership systems but in some cases had a direct impact on the means of communication within unions. For example, a key objective of the ATL project was to collect representatives' email addresses, as a way to promote such electronic communication – email addresses held by the union increased from 44 per cent to 69 per cent as a direct result of the project.

In this regard, key outputs of projects were not just related to artefacts such as toolkits and trained cohorts, but the means to promote communication and participation structures within unions. A key objective of the project by Equity was to simplify the process by which nominations for committees could be made; and, as result, the number of committee nominations increased significantly over the course of the project and new committees were established.

Training activity had a direct impact on wider capacity within unions, not just through fostering new knowledge assets, but in terms of new roles and representation. This was clearly evident in the projects committed to the training and development of new equality representative roles. But, in the case of the Unison Migrant Workers project, of the 160 workers that were trained, 70 were recruited to new representative positions. The CWU (YES) project also set targets for the recruitment of branch youth workers. Wider understanding was also promoted through training activity, be it in terms of international union structures in the Nautilus project, financial matters for the Community project or green issues for the TUC.

These deeper deliverables start to foretell the possible longer-term outcomes that may be derived from UMF2 projects. This is explored later in the report. As was noted in the UMF1 evaluation (Stuart et al, 2009), modernisation needs to be understood as a process rather than just in terms of specific project outputs and deliverables. Nonetheless, it is important to note that, in evaluation terms, the majority of projects at the time of writing had completed successfully (some were still to complete): they met the aims, objectives and deliverables that had been set. No project failed to deliver any results at all, though a number openly concluded in their own words that they had only been 'partially successful'. Where this was the case, however, it related to projects not meeting all their objectives, usually with justifiable reasons and with little impact on the overall effectiveness of projects. In a number of cases this explicitly related to a failure to deliver on certain technological aspects, such as UCATT's objective to establish an online communication centre. External factors typically intervened here, be it the failure of external contractors (in a number of cases IT suppliers went bust or were taken over) or uncertain economic conditions that delimited new financial risks.

In addition to direct anticipated outputs, projects also identified a range of unanticipated outputs and successes. Typically, this was articulated in terms of the level of increased openness to training and skills development that had resulted from projects or, more commonly, the enhanced impact of communications. The ATL project manager, for example, noted that there had been a change in attitude towards training by union representatives, 'they appeared to embrace the training, particularly a media skills course'. The TGWU project soon realised that union officers simply do not communicate with each other or seek advice and guidance from each other, as heavy workload often militates against networking. As part of the training being introduced through the project they adopted a software training package that incorporated a social networking facility Moodle. This was embraced by officers, with the result that it has been become a chosen method of communication, and networking has improved significantly as a result.

Improvements in communication and the benefits of this were also identified as unexpected successes of projects by Aspect, FDA, PCS and the MU. In contrast to the TGWU project noted above, Aspect found that the use of social networking sites, such as Facebook, by members was already extensive. They also realised because of this that there was little demand for improved horizontal communications amongst their membership (comprised of professional workers). Instead, members wanted improved vertical communication within the union and direct communication with a union specialist that could offer advice on pertinent issues. For the FDA, the implementation of their new web and membership services had spawned some 20 new online communities, usually linked to a committee or forum around a specific topic. In the case of the MU, the extensive consultation with members that had taken place before implementing changes to branch structures had acted to raise the profile and credibility of what the union was trying to do in modernisation terms.

In addition to facilitating a more open attitude to training per se, a number of projects identified improved skill sets as a notable unanticipated outcome of projects. Both NASUWT and CWU (YES) noted how invaluable it had been to acquire project management skills over the course of their work. The NASUWT project manager claimed that project management skills learnt were being 'internalised' within the union and would be used on future projects, UMF-related or not. The CWU project manager attributed such project management exposure to increased individual confidence in running projects and a desire to develop a formal qualification in project management (eg. PRINCE). The project had also benefited from the acquisition of new technical skills in website management; work that may have previously been outsourced was now 'staying in house'.

Projects also generated wider interest and understanding than was initially anticipated, in terms of relations with employers, members and training providers. The Accord and Amicus partnership project at HBOS had led to an increased management appreciation and support of the union role in partnership. Prior to the project just 22 per cent of managers thought that union representatives understood partnership and the business needs of the organisation, but this had increased to 85 per cent following the project. In the CWU (DEBUT) project a decision not to password protect the online equality and diversity toolkit had meant that members had started using the resource directly themselves. It was claimed this had led to a reduction in the number of disputes on equality and diversity matters. The Diversity Director at Royal Mail was also showing an interest in the toolkit and there was a sense from the union 'that management were less likely to try it on as result of the toolkit and the detailed information it contained'. The TUC Green Workplaces project also reported improved relations with employers, whilst for Nautilus an initial scepticism of their education provider had flourished into an 'open and engaging' relationship that had meant the union had 'increased confidence to develop new learning courses'.

Finally, the projects often acted to challenge pre-existing assumptions, or identified a previously unconfirmed need and were impacting on the wider change agenda within unions. Thus the NASUWT project had found that its previous assumptions of the needs of overseas trained teachers were incorrect, and general levels of support for such teachers was higher than anticipated. The BFAWU project found that levels of English language skills amongst its membership was much higher than previously thought, thereby reducing the need to print union communications in multiple languages; equally it became apparent that IT skills amongst BFAWU members was poor, allowing the union to focus its remedial training.

For GMB, USDAW and UCATT the projects had impacted more broadly on the extent to which union officers were open to and embraced change. For USDAW this was seen in the 'remarkable development of senior managers', for the GMB in the extent to which 'officers had embraced change in re-shaping the union and "breaking the mould"' and for UCATT there was an increased 'willingness to change'. There

were also examples where this translated into new unanticipated ways of working. Aspect had made a commitment to extend the life of the project Steering Group. Whilst the CWU (YES) project had learnt the 'power of the logo' in the way it 'badged' its communications with younger members.

Chapter 3: The management of modernisation

The previous chapter detailed the main activities, outputs and emerging outcomes of UMF2 projects. How outputs become core to union work and contribute to wider transformational change will be shaped by the context of unions and the challenges that processes of modernisation face. Accordingly, this chapter considers the main challenges prevalent for UMF2 projects. How projects responded to such challenges and learnt from them contributes much to the potential for realising longer term outcomes. The chapter therefore considers further the potential for longer-term outcomes and wider issues of sustainability.

3.1 Challenges on the path to modernisation

It is a common part of funded projects to face key challenges along the way. Such challenges can often lead to delays in project deliverables or, worst case scenario, total project failure. There were no examples of the latter for UMF2, as noted. Nonetheless, a myriad of challenges and pitfalls were noted by projects and projects were very open to discussing problems they faced during the evaluation telephone interviews. The UMF1 evaluation identified nine key challenges faced by projects (Stuart et. al., 2009). The challenges faced during UMF2 were similar. In what follows, these are grouped across relevant core themes.

The management of projects and workload – This related to three key themes: first, the time frames for planning work and its strategic implementation; second, general pressures on trade union workloads; third, tensions between 'controlling' projects and 'buying-in' expertise'. These challenges can overlap, as projects seek to establish effective management structures and gain momentum in project activity. The pressures of time were noted by a number of projects, in recognition that 'things took longer than anticipated'. The FDA project quantified this, with work packages often 'taking four times longer' than planned. This was particularly evident where projects had chosen not to 'buy in' external project expertise or recruited dedicated project workers. Projects that did this were less likely to report time constraints. Not surprisingly, where a dedicated resource was not appointed project managers referenced the difficulty of running a project when faced with other workload issues and more pressing priorities. For example, the NASUWT project did not have a project worker and it was noted that given this 'projects have to fight for resources with other 'every day union activities'. That said, even those projects with 'external' managers were faced with the wider challenge of getting people to find the time to

attend training sessions. As the project worker for the Accord and Amicus partnership project noted: 'the logistics of getting all the right people in the right places at the same time and keeping momentum of the project was a real challenge'

The decision not to recruit a dedicated project manager appeared to be less 'political' than for many UMF1 projects. The decision to employ a project manager was subject in a number of UMF1 projects to a 'control dynamic' whereby national officials took day-to-day oversight of projects, rather than bringing someone else in to run projects. For UMF2 projects it came down to simple financial considerations. The appointment of project workers remained, however, a potentially sensitive issue. One project reported that it took over four months to appoint someone, with a knock on effect on project timescales, and even then the union appeared less than satisfied with the appointment. This was because they had 'appointed the wrong project worker...they think like a manager and not an equality representative'. This raises a deeper issues related to the HR practices that operate within unions and in some cases relative uncertainty in recruitment and selection procedures.

Those projects ran by outside agencies such as the Campaign Company appeared to encounter less project management issues, partly because they sought to employ formal project management methods and also because as part of their modus operandi they encouraged the formation of wider project governance structures. More widely, few projects referenced lack of project management skills themselves as a major impediment, but most recognised the importance of planning and monitoring milestones as part of the reporting process to BIS. Reporting itself however could have been more regular and effective, as a number of projects recognised.

External engagement and contracting relations – A key challenge faced by UMF1 projects was a lack of employer buy-in for key initiatives. This was particularly evident in UMF2 in relation to those projects committed to the training and development of equality representatives. The equality representative role lacks statutory support and hence issues of facility time can be a problem. This was also noted by the Accord and Amicus project with HBOS in terms of resistance by some managers to the concept of social partnership with unions; the TUC Green Workplaces project also noted it was a challenge engaging employers. Yet, in neither case did this prove intractable. Indeed, the TUC Green Workplaces project, whilst not achieving its notional number of pilots, generated more support from some employers than expected. Thus, whilst the project did not meet its anticipated number of pilot companies, the number of workplaces involved was far greater than planned, as a couple of companies took the opportunity to pilot the work not in a single workplace but in many. The Nautilus project, faced with the problem of training sailors away from home, elicited the support of employers to get people trained.

External engagement was most extensive in relation to contracting relations between unions and service providers. As for UMF1 projects, contracting for IT services, be it

web design or content management, often proved challenging. This was most acute where unions had to act in a mediating role between two contractors. For two projects, including UCATT, this was made more complicated by the bankruptcy of the external contractor. Also notable, were differences in culture between unions and independent college providers. In one case this was articulated in terms of the approach of the college being 'alien', and taking too much of an academic approach, in another case there seemed some misunderstanding over the requirements for course accreditation. Again, such problems were in the main worked through.

Internal structural and cultural factors within unions – This related to challenges around internal communication and coordination, relations between project workers and union officers and the broader way in which modernisation can challenge traditional unions' systems and ways of operating. The first two concerns did not seem to be that extensive. Internal communications seemed effective in most cases; indeed the extent of it was for some projects seen as an unanticipated success. Only one large union project noted problems with wider 'ownership' and difficulty in engaging senior union officials. More common was for projects to recognise the need to tread 'softly, softly' through the political structures and communication networks within unions.

Nonetheless, the interviews raised many candid observations, more so than for UMF1, on potential points of resistance within unions. This operated at three levels. First, there was an issue of actual membership or activist engagement, such as getting members or representatives onto training courses. For one equality representative there was the wider problem of 'getting the equality rep seen by other TU activists as a genuine role in its own right'. Also, where projects were looking to collect data and information about members and activists this often generated a degree of unease and distrust. As the BFAWU project noted, the reasons behind such an exercise had to be clearly explained. In this case if the union wanted to send targeted communications about breast cancer screening it needed to know the gender of members.

Second, and more pervasive, were deeper levels of resistance within internal union structures. A number of projects made reference to resistance at the level of regions, branches or in terms of specific 'silos'. This was common with reference to projects on equality and diversity, in terms of, for example, the need to give greater representation to young workers. The extent of the problems should not be over-estimated, however, since typically they were anticipated and great effort was concerned with getting people on board. Often it was less about resistance per se, than lack of knowledge or concern about the impact of new ideas and activities on existing heavy workloads. There was also a degree of 'if you keep your head down, it will go away', but a key concern for projects was to demonstrate that 'this is here to stay'. Treading 'softly, softly', also meant recognition that for some unions the term modernisation was synonymous with social partnership.

More significantly, a couple of projects, notably the GMB and Musicians Union, took as their starting point levels of resistance to changing traditional ways of working as the actual rationale for projects. The GMB project (see case on page 33) was designed in response to the traditional organisation of management within the union. Historically this was based around the regions, with rather informal management processes and a distinct lack of professional, formal management protocols. This often inhibited change within the union, and the union had been exposed to a high number of employment tribunals levied against its management. The project sought to address this through the development of a new management protocol and more centralised HR procedures. For the Musicians Union an early attempt at reorganising its branch structures had met with considerable internal resistance and a 'save the branches campaign', but this only highlighted the need for change further, as it was necessary to design a branch configuration that most effectively encouraged membership participation. According to the project manager, the earlier campaign to save branches 'had made people more open to the idea of change'.

A further challenge related to inter-union communication and engagement. The TUC Green Workplaces project put much effort into overcoming some negative perceptions of 'jumping on the environmental bandwagon'. The CSP project involved collaboration between seven small unions all with distinct and longstanding occupational identities. This meant that a certain degree of suspicion existed about the purpose of the project. Significant time was spent getting the message across and there was generally effective working at senior officer level between the unions. The project proved effective in increasing collaboration between the union and, to some extent, overcoming any different views. Turning such collaboration into the more formal sharing of services, notably back office functions, was ultimately held back due to current financial considerations.

The final challenge, picked up later in the chapter, related to the ability of unions to disseminate project outcomes and retain learning as part of organisational memory. Unions were successful in terms of the production of high quality outputs, such as toolkits, but general levels of external dissemination and networking were quite limited. As we explain below there are many recognised reasons for this.

UMF2 projects also took place against the backdrop of a downturn in the economy. Whilst this did not derail any projects, it did contribute to delays and difficulty in engaging employers, for projects such as UCATT and Accord and Amicus. In summary, it should be repeated that, whilst all projects were faced with challenges, they found ways of dealing with them and keeping projects on track.

3.2 Lessons, outcomes and supportive networks

How projects responded to emerging challenges contributed to how they were learning to manage change. Such learning is an important part of the process by which project outputs and deliverables become embedded and sustainable within the every-day working practices of unions. The UMF1 evaluation (Stuart et al, 2009) noted seven areas where organisational learning was starting to take place and potentially contributing to longer term outcomes and transformation. Again, nothing too dissimilar was found for the UMF2 projects.

New resources, assets and roles – as for UMF1, projects were contributing to the upgrading of union capacities and competencies through the development and renewal of websites, new management systems, an array of toolkits and new roles, such as equality representatives and youth workers. If anything, these capacities were more pronounced for UMF2 and, to some extent, sustainability was more 'hard-wired' into project design. There was a notable emphasis on training more equality representatives and toolkits seemed to be more sophisticated and extensive. Yet, at the same time, project workers were cognisant of the need for project activity to become embedded within union structures and that to do this support was needed at different levels of the organisation. This was a central focus of those projects, such as GMB and USDAW that focused on the implementation of wider 'management models'. However, a number of projects stated that, whilst to some extent obvious, they should have spent more time 'getting people on board'. One project worker from a large union noted that it was a 'schoolboy error' not to have got the General Secretary behind the project at an earlier stage to ensure 'ownership': 'the number one thing you should do when project managing – get those in authority onside and make sure they are filled in on exactly what is going on'. Likewise, a smaller union project, noted that more extensive engagement earlier on would have meant that certain technical difficulties could have been addressed sooner: 'I would share information with colleagues and co-workers more widely so as to be able to draw upon their expertise sooner...if we already have this knowledge and expertise it is silly for a non-specialist to have to develop them independently'.

Enhanced communications – an important lesson for projects was thus the power of communication and engagement with wide ranging constituencies within their unions. In terms of outcomes, this was often starting to deliver relatively early for some of the ICT projects, which contributed directly to membership participation. But, it was also about a sense of greater openness and transparency within unions. For the BFAWU project it was reported that whilst the updating of the new membership database was an ongoing process of communication, there was also a sense 'that members are more open to providing information and there is a feeling that information is better used by the union'. The extensive process of consultation, research and surveying within unions was also perceived to have contributed to more open attitudes to change. A number of projects reported that such preparation

was time consuming but worth it; others noted it was so valuable more time should have spent consulting at the outset.

Project management and relational work – the need to develop project management skills to effectively deliver milestones and targets was recognised in nearly all projects. In basic terms, a number of projects reflected that they should have appointed dedicated project workers. At a deeper level, many recognised the value in applying formal project management tools, which they saw as not only important in terms of ongoing monitoring and evaluation, but in terms of wider transparency and accountability given the use of public funds. Many projects were favourably disposed to the reporting protocol required by BIS and the support BIS could offer. BIS officials often encouraged projects to set up steering groups, which they attended. A couple of projects, for example BFAWU and TGWU, claimed that lessons learnt from UMF1 projects had inspired them to take more steps this time around, be it in terms of project management teams or project management methodology.

However, despite the level of recognition of robust project management approaches, project reporting was often not as effective as it could have been. In some cases projects simply chose not to use the standard reporting template, with the agreement of BIS officials, but in other cases project reporting was rather thin until the completion of the final report. A number of projects openly admitted this; others noted that whilst BIS provided a framework projects were rightly 'given a long lead' and BIS pulled them in as and when needed. One project suggested a wider 'template' for project management, not just reporting, would have been useful, though an initial workshop, well received by projects, was provided by BIS.

One factor that is worth noting is the relative low level of transference of expertise and knowledge from UMF1 to UMF2 projects. Project management skills and relationships with external contractors were noted as challenges, lessons learnt and outcomes from the first round, yet this did not seen to radically effect how projects fared in the second round. To some extent the experience was repeated: although such problems are often deep-rooted with no easy solutions. This was most notable in terms of potential problems with ICT suppliers, something that was rife for UMF1 and again evident in UMF2. Evidence for UMF1 was that projects had started networking and learning about how to deal with ICT contractors and relations. Yet, this did not seem to have fundamentally shaped practice. A number of projects reported some formal protocol for setting contracts and dealing with tenders would have been useful. One project reported that it was a condition of contract they 'demonstrate best value' when dealing with consultants. But with no experience of how to do this, the process probably took a lot longer than it should have done.

Dealing with contractors proved particularly complicated when there were a number involved. This tended to occur when projects need to buy in both web design and database construction skills. There was evidence from UMF1 that projects found it difficult to manage across these contracting relations and deal with problems that

arose through lack of communication between contractors. There are examples in UMF2 where projects dealt with this in different ways. In one case a project manager noted that it was 'indeed a challenging situation in terms of project management, when coordinating individuals specialising in IT specific knowledge' that she did not hold. The solution was to 'ride the rodeo' and learn very quickly the basics of web-based technology so as to communicate with the companies. In contrast, the FDA specifically aimed to hire a company that could undertake both the web design and database construction, as the project manager did not want to be a 'middle man' passing messages between two companies relating to a topic she was not an expert in.

Evaluation, networking and mainstreaming and embedding change – how lessons are learnt and feed into longer-term outcomes relate more widely to levels of reflection on project activity, the degree of wider learning and the cross-fertilisation of knowledge and, ultimately, the mechanisms put in place to assist change and transformational sustainability. Interviews suggested that a degree of internal reflection was taking place, though there was less evidence of this in terms of formal and ongoing monitoring and evaluation procedures. To a large extent, also, much of this activity was 'internal facing'. Beyond the example of the TUC coordinated network for equality representative projects, there was only limited networking activity between projects. Many projects stated that this was not really necessary given either the focus of their projects or what were perceived as the unique aspects of their union – for example, they were small, or membership was dispersed and/ or occupationally specific. In other cases, it was noted that union officers network on a regular and informal basis anyway, so they continued to just work their regular networks. There were a few clear cases that seem to have emerged as perceived good practice. For example, a number of unions had been in the discussion with the NUT about their UMF1 (Hearth) project, whilst the Unison Migrant Workers project team held discussion with the TGWU UMF1 project. There were various other isolated examples, but this activity was not as extensive as it could have been.

Finally, the majority of projects had started to prompt wider evaluation within unions of how to mainstream and embed change. Again, issues of sustainability were articulated and understood in different ways. At its most basic, was ongoing change as an 'act of faith'. Thus, it was reported that projects had made a difference and would lead to further developments. A more developed viewpoint was that projects in stimulating wider consultation and debate had provided a platform to 'test' new ideas and that in many cases this had led to more openness to change. For example, the GMB project reported how their project had challenged certain assumptions: in this case, perceived resistance to change was found to be not as entrenched as envisaged. Following the work of the project it was noted that 90 per cent of GMB members were now familiar and understood the new 'GMB @ work' model. How projects impact on, facilitate and encourage cultural change within unions is a complicated matter and is considered in more detail in Chapter 5. Nonetheless, at

the other extreme, a number of projects had sought to put in place the means to influence sustainability. For example, the GMB had a clear set of recommendations for future action, whilst ATL and the Musicians Union had agreed to maintain the role of the project Steering Group to focus on implementing a final project action plan. In the BECTU case, a new communications role had been funded by the UMF and had overseen the new project; the role was now permanent.

3.3 Demonstration and support

All projects had undertaken some sort of dissemination activities. In general this tended to be 'internal facing' rather than 'external facing'. Levels of internal dissemination were often extensive and, as noted, had acted to create understanding about projects. This was a new activity in itself for some unions. Wider dissemination was less extensive. A number of projects contributed to BIS/TUC events or held launch events and, for some projects, such as the TUC Green Work Places project, this was extensive. However, this activity or general levels of union networking was not as widespread as it could have been. It is important to enter some caveats at this point. First, many projects had only just or were nearing completion and there was an expectation that further dissemination activity would be forthcoming. Second, the whole process of dissemination and networking across unions requires a cultural shift in itself and many unions are not naturally outward facing. Third, there was to some extent an overlap between UMF1 and UMF2 projects that restricted the scope for knowledge transfer.

The central point here, however, is that the 'demonstration effect' is about more than just presenting findings at workshops of what projects did, it is about sharing experiences and fostering wider learning. There was certainly some evidence that projects were showing increasing wiliness to network and share thinking, informally and formally, as the UMF developed. This was supported through a number of workshops organised by BIS and the TUC. Such events were favourably received and very well attended. BIS organised, for example, a very successful learning event in February 2010, with the support of the TUC, to share learning across UMF1 and UMF2 projects. The event adopted an interactive, participative approach, designed to engage delegates, create ownership of the change agenda and raise the profile of the learning on offer. The TUC noted that this was a very successful event. Nonetheless, across projects there was either a degree of confusion about dissemination or a large demand for more coordinated engagement. For example, some of the smaller projects just saw little point in contributing to external activity as their circumstances were unique: yet this was not the case. Other unions suggested more coordination, perhaps by the TUC, was needed. As one project manager noted: 'the management of change should be more widely celebrated and promoted to a wider audience'.

Chapter 4: Modernising through equality and diversity

This chapter briefly considers the equality and diversity dimension of union modernisation. The changing age, gender and ethnic profile of the modern workplace has created a distinct set of challenges for trade unions. In UMF terms this is characterised by the need for unions to represent more diverse and under-represented groups. As a priority theme this has emerged as central to the process of union modernisation, but it brings with it a distinct set of challenges and emerging lessons for unions. The chapter explores this through a consideration of the drivers and activities of projects, the potential longer term outcomes and the main demands that unions face. The chapter focuses on equality and diversity in a general sense, but reference is made where relevant to projects on equality representatives and a short case study is presented of the TUC equality representative project to illustrate the emerging outcomes of this initiative.

4.1 The drivers and focus of equality and diversity

There were three types of equality and diversity project. The first type focused on equality and diversity training, guidance and advice covering *multiple aspects* of equality and diversity, for example the creation of toolkits and training for equality reps. The second type focused more specifically on *one particular aspect* of equality and diversity, such as younger workers and women workers. For example, several projects, such as CWU YES, focused on attempts to engage and activate young and student members within unions, to secure activation and engagement of future generations of membership. Engagement with younger members, student members and youth members was often positioned as key to transforming dated union structures, challenging traditional union cultures and modernising trade unions. In addition to the focus on young members, PCS focused on mentoring for women reps given their under-representation in union structures and decision-making processes. NASUWT sought to provide more effective access to information for overseas trained teachers (OTTs) on professional aspects of the teacher's role as well as social and cultural issues; and to enhance the effectiveness with which the union responds to the needs of OTTs. This was delivered via a dedicated website and targeted training for union equality officers. The third type took the form of providing resources to facilitate the engagement of diverse groups within unions or collaboration between affiliated unions. One project sought to explore the potential

for collaborative working between a number of small unions which form the Allied Health Professions Federation bringing together diverse interests and priorities.

Projects were designed in relation to a perceived problem in representing diverse membership groups, and therefore sought to improve the representation of under-represented groups such as women and young members. For example, in 2005 a PCS equality and diversity report concluded that women were poorly represented in all union representative/decision making processes, though nationally, women comprise 60 per cent of PCS membership. As a democratic trade union, PCS believed that in order to be truly effective, its organisational structures and decision making processes should reflect membership diversity. Thus a mentoring programme was established to support women reps and to train women to be effective mentors to other, younger female reps.

Both EQUITY and CWU YES sought to modernise and transform union structures and cultures through engagement with, and activation of, younger members. EQUITY's 'getting in on the act' project was designed to 'improve student voice and activate younger members' and CWU's Youth Empowerment Strategy project identified that 12.2 per cent of non-retired members, 27,421 members, were under the age of 30; yet they were largely absent from union structures and decision-making processes. As the CWU project team stated:

> 'The future of the trade union movement clearly relies on unions becoming more relevant to young workers. The CWU YES Project provides an opportunity to engage young members, thus increasing internal democracy.'

Other unions faced the challenge of trying to represent members who are hard to reach due to their spread across a large number of workplaces, or are hard to reach for other reasons. For example, Aspect represents just 4,000 members throughout England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Members' roles are highly specialised, and the work of educational inspectors, advisers and consultants often entails fairly remote and isolated working. The Aspect project tried to overcome these challenges through the development of a modern intranet resource designed to facilitate greater engagement with and involvement of members in union decision-making. The FDA, in contrast, was aware of internal inertia amongst officers on a range of equality and diversity issues, and addressed this, following consultation and research, through new web resources and focused communications on equality and diversity. Unison recognised that whilst it has engaged positively with some aspects of equality its representation of migrant workers was still poor, so it sought to support networks, train migrant workers and ultimately recruited 70 new migrant worker representatives.

4.2 Emerging outcomes, challenges and lessons learnt

The longer term outcomes of projects will depend upon the culture of the union and whether the culture is one that embraces change and is willing to transform dated union structures and decision-making processes, when and where appropriate. Cultural change is clearly a key part of modernisation. For example, in the case of the CWU (YES) project, which was designed to empower and activate young members, the creation of Youth Branch Officers (YBOs) was seen as a crucial development. However, whilst the project increased YBO representation significantly, the project manager noted that in certain regions recruitment and retention was difficult due to 'the culture of certain branches'. The project manager noted that, in some cases, those in senior positions often found 'young workers to be a threat to the way that they did things' and that 'young workers/ officers...just wanted to get involved in the exciting stuff and not do any of the boring [but necessary] stuff'. Such attitudes had in some cases led to complaints by young workers who had 'taken roles as activists/ reps and subsequently resigned their position'. Yet, ensuring that new posts such as YBOs are supported in their work by their union will be essential to maintaining long term transformation. In the CWU (YES) case the project overcame resistance by, first convincing traditional 'silo' attitudes of the benefits of YBOs and, second, garnering strong support from the most 'senior and influential people within the union' and so built a 'strong coalition'.

Changing culture and embedding equality and diversity practices and new positions such as YBOs or equality representatives, necessitates a process in unions that needs recognition of the significance of these new roles and where they sit in union structures. This process takes time. As the project co-ordinator of the TUC equality reps project explained: 'You need time and understanding that if you are trying to bring in something that is new, like equality reps, (and) you need more time than you might think to do it'.

Another perceived challenge was the timing of the projects, which coincided with changes in equality legislation, a general election looming, as well as the recession. One project manager stated: 'There is a fair amount of uncertainty about equalities work and it perhaps was not such a priority when people were losing jobs'.

It is interesting to ask whether the increased focus on equality and diversity in UMF2 is indicative of a slow process of professionalisation within unions on these matters. In the case of equality representatives, whilst the TUC developed a new and valuable three day training course this would not seem sufficient in itself to represent a professionalisation of equality and diversity. However, the TUC was in the process of designing a diploma level qualification for equality reps and perhaps over time, as these roles become more established within unions underpinned by qualifications and training, we may see positive developments here. But, of course, professionalisation cannot just be defined in terms of the qualifications structures of front line representatives, important though this may be. Much comes back to the

cultures and structure of unions and how they are changing to embed such roles and envelop them within broader systems of support and legitimacy, including at the most senior levels. Much will also depend on how pilot projects like PCS mentoring, which faced considerable challenges, get mainstreamed across the union. In the case of the CWU (YES) project it was noted, 'the genie is out of the bottle now and it won't go back in'. Some of the equality representative projects not covered explicitly by the evaluation also focused on recruiting more senior branch officials with equality responsibilities which shows some thought to the wider embedding of the equality agenda: though campaigning for statutory support for equality representatives is also important. The PCS equality project had prompted consideration of a constitutional amendment to make the equality rep role mandatory in branch elections, rather than a role that is just encouraged.

Beyond such organisational concerns, there are also signs of a body of initiatives being used as a way of creating a community of experts and representatives who can sustain such initiatives in the longer term. For example, the Unison migrant workers project engaged with relevant external networks. Likewise, the TUC's coordination of equality reps was significant, and the regional briefings organised as part of this proved influential. They were attended by 185 officers from a range of different unions and were seen as pivotal in promoting equalities work and the role of the equality rep within the union movement to secure greater support for these relatively new roles. Dissemination and networking, then, also has an important part to play in mainstreaming equality and diversity. However, whilst the issue of equality and diversity had seen more engagement across projects when compared to other initiatives, dissemination remained relatively under-developed. The evidence from interviews and documentation, the specific case of the TUC project apart, did not really present serious evidence of unions' cross-referencing with other projects. Union structure remained in great part to be a major obstacle and the failure of any serious co-ordinating strategy on this question remained apparent.

4.3 Discussion

In relation to the question of equality and diversity the UMF is a major driver for sustaining change on such issues and of creating a framework for discussion. Projects have covered a wide diversity of groups and led to initiatives and concrete outputs in terms of website development, training, and others. The equality and diversity agendas are managing to create a meaningful difference to unions as they start to think through new ways of approaching equality and diversity-related issues. Whilst there have been challenges in administrative and organisational terms, the portfolio of projects has served to legitimate change and new forms of working. There is evidence of the move to new forms of equality and diversity strategies helping unions in UMF2 rethink their approach to working as a union, as was clear from the changes in membership datasets and websites. A good example would be that of the GMB, whereby a UMF1 project on diversity, notably training for all its employees, has paved the way for more transformational projects in cultural terms in

rounds two and three; with the UMF2 project, described in the next chapter, focused on a new management model for the union and the UMF3 project focused on vulnerable work and wider issues of inclusion within the union's participation structures. However, the question of systematic dissemination and networking across projects remains a serious challenge.

Case study: TUC 'Training and Evaluating Union Equality Representatives Project'

The TUC project on equality reps was designed to promote the work of equality reps, and recruit and train a network of equality reps. The TUC also played a role in coordinating the seven other equality rep projects funded UMF2. An initial survey exercise was conducted across 11 unions to understand more about the roles, activities and training of equality representatives. This contributed to a design of a new, nationally accredited 3 day training course. Twelve initial pilots trained129 equality representatives. Two training courses were also held for 21 TUC tutors. Following feedback from tutors and trainees the learning materials were further refined, hard copy manuals printed and an online resource developed. Initial expressions of interest for the online training courses were high and a further 116 reps were trained in two cohorts during the course of the project. All materials were shared with the seven other projects and the TUC set-up and co-ordinated a network to share materials and good practice and to disseminate project findings and outputs.

The project and associated activity was widely disseminated through regional briefings and a final conference attended by some 160 delegates. Further, the equality rep network acted as a valuable vehicle for the sharing of information, good practice and learning materials, fostering goodwill, support and collaboration between unions and encouraging momentum with regard to equality matters. Ambitious targets have been set across projects as a whole: Unite – 400 equality reps; Unison – 380 reps and 180 branch equalities officers; PCS – an Equalities Officer in every branch; NUT - one equalities office in each of its 149 associations and divisions; Prospect – 30 equalities reps. to train 30 interested members using TUC materials.

An end of project independent impact assessment concluded that equality reps were starting to have an impact at workplace level. The TUC project manager also noted that the project was changing people's perceptions of equality and behaviour within workplaces. As she explained:

' *I received one anecdote from one of the training courses, there was a white bloke on it from a manufacturing background who was a health and safety rep and he said he had gone on the course just to find out more about it. It really opened his eyes and when he went back to his workplace he realised that there was no focus on equality whatsoever. I thought it was fantastic that the course had reached that sort of person and he was going to try to see the world through an equality lens. That sort of awareness and making people think about equality and the arguments for equality and statistics on inequality is important.*'

Chapter 5: Cultural change in unions

The report has considered in some detail the various activities, outputs and emerging outcomes of projects. There is sound evidence to suggest that many projects have the potential to enhance the organisational effectiveness of unions. The extent to which this is truly 'transformational' will depend on the longer-term way in which projects lead to cultural change and are integrated into organisational routines, practices and narratives. It would be asking too much for what are essentially pilot and demonstration projects to immediately transform the culture of unions. Whether this happens will depend on the way in which projects have challenged established practice, overcome resistance and left unions with a legacy for change in terms of new skills, competencies, practices and organisational vision. These issues are briefly considered in this chapter.

5.1 Challenging tradition and developing an understanding for change

Embedding change is a major challenge in many organisations. New forms of working in terms of acquiring skills, keeping records in a more interactive manner, being transparent, and developing a new approach to communication mean that traditional ways of working will be undermined or at least challenged. Often there is a sound case for resistance. All too often change is articulated as something that 'must be good' and tradition and established routines castigated for no apparent reason. The case for modernisation needs, therefore, to be justified and legitimated. This process of legitimation takes place within the frame of reference of the organisation. In this respect it is important to note that the organisation purpose of unions is totally different to an organisational context whereby modernisation is driven by the profit motive. There is certainly a demand on unions to modernise and to introduce more effective and efficient management processes and practices, but these will need to be carefully constructed within the democratic ideal that unions operate within.

The starting point for many projects was the need for unions to connect with wider constituencies, in equality and diversity terms, to improve membership participation and engagement. Often the need for initiatives to address such concerns had been widely debated for many years and had become part of unions' modernisation plans. Nonetheless, most projects also had a starting point that to be effective projects would have to come up against resistance at various levels. Projects such as the GMB's Modern Management Methods sought to tackle head on the structural way in which the union had operated through strong regional independence (see case study). It was noted that communication structures between the regions and the

centre and between regions themselves were not always as open as they could be. Likewise, the TGWU CPD Project found that officers across the regions often did not communicate with each other as frequently or as effectively as they could.

Anticipated reluctance to change, as noted, was widely anticipated. This was articulated in three ways: Officers who don't want change; officers who may want change, but just don't think things will; and officers who perceived the inertia of change as being too slow and become frustrated. This was referenced in relation to projects aimed at improving young worker representation or the role of equality representatives, and a concern that this would not be seen in terms of the union's core mission. But, in most cases it related to the workload and way of working of officers. Questions were raised as to whether the equality rep role, for example, was just another responsibility to be added to existing duties. In other cases, the use of new technology and, for example, the electronic documenting of case work was seen to interfere with the need for officers to be on the road. In facing potential resistance, projects first openly accepted it as a reality. As the UCATT project manager explained, union officials 'are used to questioning things and being vocal if they disagree with something. People get used to their way of working and can be reluctant to change. But raising concerns was perfectly welcomed in a democratic institution.'

Given this backdrop, it is no surprise that many projects spoke of the need to 'tread softly, softly'. It was recognised that one of the main barriers to change would be the difficulty of linking organisational development to a real sense of ownership and involvement from officers. Yet in many projects the use of surveys, pilots and focus groups proved essential in preparing the ground for change. This was achieved through various research and communication techniques thus making such features part of the strategic activity of the union. This included: surveys of members and officers; focus groups of members; links with research and consultancies; links with teaching institutions; and, early communication efforts such as meetings and circulars. These were notable in many projects and at first appear to be simply devices for establishing the focus and trajectory of their development. Yet this early phase of the projects became one of the substantial learning outcomes and activities linked to change. It was part of the 'opening up' of unions. Essentially, such activity helped create a cluster of individuals within and beyond the organisation who prepared the ground for the project.

One of the striking features of projects was the extent to which resistance was either overcome or did not prove to be as significant as initially envisioned. Many of the projects concluded in their final reports or in their interviews that their activities had created a climate of increased openness or understanding to the need for change. And this was seen to provide a firm platform for further developments. The TGWU CPD project was faced with the merger to form UNITE midway through its activities and this naturally increased some of the risks facing the project. The need to navigate political uncertainty, raise the visibility of the project and get new (often

sceptical) constituencies on board inevitably delayed the course of activities, but the project still completed and raised many challenging questions for how the union organises its management.

5.2 Professionalisation and new organisational vision

Projects were also very clear on completion that this was work still in progress. It was common for projects to report that their work needed to become mainstreamed into the 'way things are done around here'. For many projects, this was about opening up unions and reducing certain types of hierarchical and bureaucratic controls, such as through the encouragement of new forms of democratic participation. This was evident for, example, with the arts and media unions and virtual forms of participation. But an increasing number of unions were also referencing the need for unions to be run more professionally and for officers to act more professionally. This was supported by the introduction of 'new management' tools and practices into unions.

This focus on becoming more professional represented a distinct change in narrative from UMF1. It was clearly evident in projects such as those by Community, GMB, TGWU, Nautilus, UCATT and USDAW, and others, all of which in some way sought to train their officers to work in a more formalised and professional sense, often accompanied by extensive programme of CPD and supporting management models and practices. The focus of training, whilst extensive, was often not dictated in a hierarchical manner. Both the TGWU and USDAW, for example, conducted training needs analyses of sorts and concluded that training needed to be directed to the needs of individuals rather than delivered 'off the shelf'. For USDAW this meant support through developmental reviews, whilst the TGWU focused on more 'expansive learning' through work.

Supporting management practices included new job descriptions, performance appraisal schemes, competency reviews and mentoring of various kinds. Holding officers accountable was part of this, but the need for consistency and quality of practice and competence was more significant. The TGWU project found that officers did not communicate with each other and did not have written job descriptions: which resulted in no mechanism for measuring an officer's ability. The project thus introduced job descriptions for seven different grades of officer. USDAW introduced an explicit performance appraisal scheme. Terminology proved problematic in some cases. Whilst unions accepted that professionalising practice meant introducing certain management practices, they were also acutely aware of how some schemes had been abused and discredited in everyday practice within private and public employers' organisations. The GMB were concerned with the term appraisal, CWU with mentoring and TGWU with learning/ change ambassador. Thus, whilst projects often accepted certain principles behind such schemes and in a couple of cases were open about the need to run the union 'like a business' and recognised the 'union lacks management skills', it was clear that the purpose of such

change was to improve the *union offer*. The development of more efficient and effective internal structures and processes was seen to contribute to key union goals. For the GMB and USDAW this was articulated in terms of a shift from servicing to organising. More generally, it was about the ability of the union to represent existing and potential members via the development of more outward-facing, inclusive organisation.

Case Study: GMB : Developing Modern Management Methods in the GMB

The project was set against a recent history of turbulent change within the union. The union had sought to respond to financial difficulties, membership challenge and changing leadership. A future strategy had been set out in a modernisation document to Congress in 2005 entitled 'A Framework for the Future of the GMB', which laid out clear objectives and targets for the union. This was monitored annually at Congress through an ongoing programme GMB@work. However, the implementation of this strategy required a degree of coordination and coherence within the management of the union that had not historically been given priority. The strength of the union had been built on strong regional independence, which meant that communication structures between the regions and the centre and between regions themselves was not always as open as it could be. Moreover, the wider changes taking place within the union, such as cut backs in staff employed had led to a perceived culture of distrust and increased employee relations problems such as grievances. The project sought to address this through embedding modern management methods throughout the union, via a programme of management training. The training programme, delivered by The Campaign Company, included 7 days' training to the 14 member Senior Management Team and 2 days' facilitated team training to 11 teams across the union. The team training was delivered to 59 participants, from the union's 9 regions, the Head Office and the National Administration Unit. The training programmes included modules such as leadership, teamworking, performance management and communications. A survey was also administrated to regional officers and senior organisers to gauge their views on the union's future. It was noted that there was some minor, indirect resistance to the idea of the project, mainly in terms of 'seen it all before, keep your head down and it will go away'. The project was seen as high risk by the union, as it represented a radical attempt to 'break the mould'; yet it was seen as fundamentally necessary. It was made clear that new management approaches 'were here to stay' and there was 'no going back to the old ways of doing things'. Overall, it was noted that the work of the project had 'created a higher propensity for individuals to accept and embrace change', and this was penetrating through the structures of the union and had resulted in specific cultural and behavioural changes.

Chapter 6: Conclusions

The report has presented an evaluation of round two projects of the Union Modernisation Fund. In simple terms, the conclusion is positive. UMF2 has very much continued where UMF1 left off and the evaluation is broadly similar in that projects were successful on their own terms and had the potential for wider transformational change in the operational effectiveness of unions. Yet, there appears to be a noticeable direction of travel. Whilst many projects contained an element of improving electronic communications and web applications, this did not have a singular focus as in UMF1. Rather, applications were embedded within much broader project remits. More significant, there was an increased emphasis on equality and diversity concerns *writ large* and projects were more focused on the processes by which modernisation becomes embedded. Concerns were nonetheless raised about the level of overall project dissemination, in external terms, and the wider demonstration effect of the UMF. Whilst there are recognised caveats for this, this nonetheless raises issues about how the legacy and wide experience of innovation will be built on by unions once UMF has finished. Yet signs are emerging that co-ordination and new forms of working in relation to change are being embedded.

Trade unions are complex organisations with well-established democratic processes. They have complex leadership structures. Modernisation has been a part of what unions have been doing for some time in terms of communications and management. However, the way UMF has evolved as a series of priorities and learning processes has meant that new agendas and new ways of thinking and acting are being developed around communities of trade union professionals and representatives. Any discussion of change and new forms of working needs to be alert to this particular legacy of participation and engagement that has evolved as a direct result of the UMF.

6.1 The process of modernisation: engaging a diverse workforce through new approaches

The UMF has established itself as a point of reference within the debate on union modernisation. Modernisation certainly predated the UMF, but together the three UMF rounds have provided over 70 specific and identifiable projects across the union movement. The Fund has not been the preserve of a few select unions and incorporates small and specialised unions as much as the large union behemoths. The UMF has provided a space for unions to experiment with ideas and practice, to take risks and to develop new, innovative ways of working, which would not have progressed without the availability of funding. Across the projects as a whole an extensive programme of transformational change has taken place, which must be

seen as significant given the small level of financial investment involved and the extensive challenges faced by many unions in modernising.

At one level, the UMF is becoming part of the vocabulary of the union movement, notably in relation to the equality and diversity agenda. As projects have started to become referenced, and as UMF has become a more common feature of union activity, then it has become noticeable how through a gradual processes of osmosis UMF is facilitating internal learning and change.

UMF2, then, evidently builds on the projects and practice supported under UMF1. The report has detailed the various activities that have taken place and the outputs that have resulted. As noted previously, the UMF cannot be understood or formally measured simply in terms of the outputs that are produced – whether in terms of toolkits, educational DVDs, enhanced websites, or trained capacity. This is because modernisation is a process and longer-term outcomes need to be examined against the wider cultural changes that take place and the basis for sustaining change that exists within unions. The increased emphasis on communication audits and structures within UMF2 was important in this regard. A range of activity was evident in the preparation of and evaluation of projects – the start up and finishing/reflection stage. This was often not as analytical as it could have been. Nonetheless, the extensive use of surveys, the broad use of external experts and the development of internal dialogue around project based committees and across departments, in itself created a culture of dialogue and reflection. It also led to a greater use of external expertise links. Many projects noted the impact of new relations with institutions/individuals based on a dialogue of renewal. This was an unintended and positive outcome of modernisation.

The discussion on modernisation has focused not just on internal union matters, but the environment of learning and development as it exists within a community. Mapping and scoping a new migrant and aging workforce, and a new set of potential leaders in gender terms has brought with it a need to understand not solely forms of research and communication but the way education and learning can be built into an ongoing scoping of social and union needs. In the GMB, for example, the need to comprehend and represent a new workforce required new forms of organisation in terms of training, dialogue structures and long term planning.

More widely, the report has drawn out the centrality of two core themes: representing equality and diversity and the embedding of cultural change. To some extent these themes are intertwined. The need to develop sensitivity to the question of equality and diversity through clearer databases that register difference in the structure of membership (beyond the 'male, pale and stale' union membership stereotype), the use of training to sensitise the organisation to equality and diversity related issues, the development of specialised units and migrant-based initiatives and representatives, and the development of equality representatives as new modes of representation have all brought about a need to reform the structures of unions. In

comparative terms this represents some of the most innovative developments within the European trade union community (cf Walker et al, 2007). In essence, cultural change within unions is a precondition for a more effective response to the diverse nature of the workforce. In turn, the changing nature of the workforce impacts on the work of unions and opens it to social and cultural influences. Hence, these two themes are clearly linked. The evaluation saw this link being developed consciously with a view of shifting from a male dominated culture (which in all fairness has been changing in recent years anyway) and through the UMF legitimating and underpinning real projects of social change and new forms of interactive leadership.

The UMF has thus contributed to the development of a series of practices, texts and roles in relation to the diverse workforce, which are clearly illustrative of emerging best practise. There are training programmes on equality and diversity, the development of new forms of dialogue and systems of representation and new ways of viewing the workforce. Website developments remain a common feature. In terms of cultural change, there is a greater attention paid to preparing union officers and representatives to the changing labour market, character of employers and forms of dialogue. In some cases this has meant a fundamental (re)assessment of how a union goes about representing and giving voice to young members or migrant workers. Also, where membership is dispersed, how can participation be increased?

Meeting the challenges of equality and diversity, as noted, often meant reworking the branch and committee structures of unions. Projects had started to reflect on how this challenged traditional ways of working and, in some cases, a firm case was made that change was 'here to stay'. For some unions the UMF has enabled a project for change to be advanced incrementally and with some thought. For example, BFAWU, GMB and USDAW all noted how UMF2 projects built on round one projects and would have not taken place without the initial investment. For Community, UMF1 and UMF2 projects had led to training for, initially, senior officers and, subsequently, its executive members. This training had led to new attitudes and understanding within the union and paved the way for a UMF3 project that looks more fundamentally at what it means to be a 'community union'. This is a very good example of where a relatively small project and financial investment can fundamentally change the approach of a union. This shows that the UMF can form a *stream and narrative* for the way modernisation is understood: it provides a thread around which initiatives can evolve and needs become realised. However, overall, the relationship between UMF1 and UMF2 projects needs to be more solidly built on if these narratives and reflections are to impact on a more permanent basis within trade unions.

More broadly, projects were starting to tackle deeper issues of cultural change within unions through an attempt to professionalise unions and import modern management methods. The development of management systems was a feature of UMF1 but in UMF2 it appeared to be more prevalent. At a general level, there was a view amongst projects that constituencies within unions were becoming more open

to new ideas and initiatives and were starting to embrace change. In this regard, the UMF can be seen to have been successful in terms of providing space for change agents within unions, and around them as well through key networkers and educationalist/researchers. This was not necessarily a straightforward process. Not only did project workers meet inevitable resistance, but in some cases they were isolated from the wider body politic of unions. Support from senior officers and the wider leadership of unions is essential for the implementation of change projects. In the case of the CWU it was noted how senior support was leveraged and a broad coalition was behind the project. Likewise, for USDAW and the GMB, major projects of change had top level support. The question of leadership in terms of focus and capacity was an integral theme in terms of how to advance cultural change and modernisation. There was emerging evidence of how this could improve the operational effectiveness of unions, but it was too early to evaluate in a purely bottom line sense.

6.2 The challenging process of modernisation

All projects faced challenges, but none appeared so significant that projects were unable to complete. The challenges noted were largely predictable and were noted in the evaluation of UMF1 projects (Stuart et al, 2009). In terms of specific activities, there was a concern that training was in some cases isolated from wider investments in change – ie. even when UMF projects appeared successful it was not clear how training for change would be followed up. This was notable for those projects based on pilot activity. There was also some instances where aspirations to build highly interactive online forms of engagement still faced limitations in terms of their effective implementation.

More significant was, firstly, project management and wider stakeholder engagement and contracting. Projects on reflection noted the value of robust project methodologies, but most experienced problems around time management and project monitoring of some kind. Likewise, problems dealing with external contractors, notably ICT, were pervasive. This in itself was no surprise. Yet, such issues were raised throughout UMF1 projects and more could have been done by way of templates and guidelines to assist UMF2 projects through problems that were identifiable *a priori*. There is a role here that could be taken up by the TUC. In UMF2 the TUC played a key coordinating role with regard to the development of a network of equality representatives, and there is early evidence that this coordination role has been further embedded across UMF3 projects. It is highly recommended that the TUC continues to acts as a link and point of reference for any ongoing agenda of modernisation.

Second, was the wider issue of internal union resistance; in terms of officers and representatives not 'buying into' the change agenda. There were cases of projects that were highly sophisticated requiring new forms of branch working and new approaches to dealing with individual cases. These tend to break the *modus*

operandi of the union: or at least challenge it. Most unions appear to have taken this into account. How this can be overcome and become part of an ongoing culture of modernisation has been discussed throughout the report. Only time will tell how effective projects will be in the longer-term.

6.3 Networking, demonstration and the legacy of the UMF: key recommendations for the future of modernisation

One of the aspirations of the UMF is to provide a demonstration effect to the wider union movement. The report has argued that more work is needed in this area. To-date most effort has been *internal facing*. This is positive, as unions need to disseminate projects internally and engage members and officers in order to advance and legitimate the modernisation process. But, more *external facing* activity is needed. This needs to be understood as going beyond simple dissemination of project findings; which to some extent had started to ramp up across UMF2 as projects completed. It was notable, that very little networking existed between UMF1 and UMF2 projects. Some cases existed, either in relation to projects within unions or through discussion with selected cases, such as the NUT. Overall much of the learning that took place during the first round was not captured for the second round. BIS did organise a number of workshops, at project outset in terms of managing projects and towards the end of projects in terms of sharing lessons from UMF1. But there was a need for networking, knowledge transfer and learning *in situ* and on an ongoing basis.

The UMF1 Final Evaluation Report (Stuart et al, 2009: 76) pointed to a series of recommendations related to the need to embed change: developing cluster groups and networks around themes; developing milestones and maps for projects; creating greater synergies between officers and project work/ers; emphasising project training; building supportive frameworks around BIS and the TUC; building teamwork, transparency and cultural change; clearer internal dissemination plans; mainstreaming UMF outputs. These have steadily begun to resonate within the UMF at various levels, although in different ways. They have also been incorporated into a joint BIS/TUC UMF guide on emerging learning:

http://www.bis.gov.uk/assets/biscore/employment-matters/docs/10-611-union-modernisation-fund-guide.pdf

Six further inter-related issues and recommendations need to be considered to assist the ongoing legacy of the UMF.

    1. *Encourage further networking, working through networks and consultation*– General levels of engagement both internally and externally should be further encouraged. Whilst this type of activity was clearly evident, there was clear evidence of the benefits of internal communication, whilst there was a large demand for more networking, sharing and, essentially coordination, of what

was happening. Internally, early communication and consultation with as wide a range of constituents as possible helps to ground projects and bring people 'on board' and provide a platform for debate for modernisation. Externally, whilst many project managers noted that they knew each other already through wider informal union circuits, this is different to focused activity on the UMF and modernisation more generally. In other words, networks need to be more widely nurtured and sustained around modernisation.

2. *Emphasise the wider value and relevance of projects* – Many projects were open that they saw little need or value in external engagement. For example, some of the smaller projects suggested their projects were unique to them: yet, many smaller unions faced similar issues, with dispersed members and declining participation. Such projects need further encouragement to share their lessons across the wider union movement, as a notable feature of union structures in Britain is the large number of unions that exist, many of which are small. More generally, a number of project managers noted that a few projects and unions tended to be celebrated and more favoured than others. There are many reasons why this may be the case, but dissemination and demonstration should aim to encourage an inclusive and collegiate approach.

3. *Create a recognised repository of supporting tools and methods:* In purely practical terms, many projects noted it would have helped to have had more formal guidelines or toolkits on project management, contracting or organising tendering. This is not to suggest that such tools did not exist. There were guidelines for various aspects of project management and all projects had the option to attend an initial workshop on project management. But this is not the point. Project managers reported that more guidance would have helped during the course of the project. Thus, constructing a resource, through a weblink, where project managers know they can access information on, more example, recruiting staff, undertaking tendering processes or establishing contracts with (recommended) external suppliers, would be useful

4. *Leadership buy-in*: Many of the major and more successful projects saw leading figures within the union steer and legitimate processes of change. The importance of leadership in whatever form is key so that projects can be seen as central to a new union vision that is representative and reflective of new workforce demands, but also in creating a more proactive debate about change in terms of the form, purpose and participative structures of unions. Linking UMF into the leadership projects of the trade unions is vital given the extraordinary levels of innovation inside UMF. Leaders should be involved from the outset of projects and formally embedded in some way.

5. *Planning for sustainability*: To ensure that modernisation does not come to an end with projects themselves, projects should be encouraged to 'sign off' with a formal plan for sustaining change and internalising lessons learnt. For

example, the GMB and MU developed specific sets of recommendations which were subject to approval within union structures, whilst other unions sought to extend the life of project steering groups or formally embed recently acquired project management skills in order to valorise such knowledge. To the extent that projects may need to demonstrate internally how they have added value, more developed ongoing evaluation of change projects should also be encouraged, notably through some forms of pre- and post-activity assessment.

6. *Facilitate and celebrate ongoing change through strong coordination*: The evaluation found that there was a need to celebrate more widely UMF activity and greater coordination was needed in terms of events, support and networks. BIS acted as major point of reference for the unions involved, but the absence of major interactive third party was at times a problem. The TUC has a significant role to play in this wider coordination. TUC officials have recognised that it could take greater responsibility for the dissemination agenda, including embedding UMF learning in its training and communications activities. It was also notable that few projects seemed to be referencing the TUCs Union Professionals network (funded under UMF1). The problem with innovative environments and processes is the danger of loss and disappearance – of not archiving correctly and not facilitating attempts at referencing back to projects. Given the extraordinary and exemplary activities of UMF2 it is important that information sharing and thematic networks across forms of change be established more explicitly. The TUC clearly has an important role to play in ensuring the ongoing legacy and learning of project innovation is captured, shared and built upon beyond the finite lifetime of the UMF.

In summary, the evaluation of UMF2 projects is supportive. Judged against their aims and objectives, completed projects were successful. Of greater note, is the extent to which unions are starting to translate the outputs of projects into longer-term outcomes. Two areas where this is particularly evident is around the transformational nature of equality and diversity projects and the importation of management models into unions, both of which have promoted deeper cultural change and new debates on professionalism. Given the limited resources provided by the UMF, the results in many respects have been impressive. Where the evaluation has been more critical is around the wider issue of demonstration. This has been emphasised, not explicitly in terms of dissemination per se, but in terms of the need for lessons learnt from the UMF to become part of a wider conversation of modernisation across the union movement. The issue here is one of sustaining the legacy of the UMF.

For this to happen there needs to be **vertical** and **horizontal** communication between and within the different waves of the UMF. The role of the TUC and BIS is built into the wave of UMF3 projects in a new and proactive manner that allows for

greater co-ordination: what is more the role of key individuals and networkers within projects is being used to further reinforce this. Yet UMF3 is more focused on a particular theme: vulnerable workers. There needs to be, therefore, a retrospective mapping backwards into the previous projects, through an ongoing dissemination process that links with specific core themes of modernisation. Modernisation as cultural change needs to build on the success and innovation of many projects by thematically showing how modernisation is institutionally and socially beneficial. The UMF is a series of steps which brings this patchwork of change together around a debate which unions will need to build on in the future. The trade union movement, through the UMF, now has a new series of potential networks and practices that are extensive and innovative – and related to change, equality and diversity and participation – and this needs to be taken forward as a shared experience and not left in isolation which is always a possibility in any type of organisation.

Technical Annex A

A.1 Methods

In total 31 projects were funded under the second round of the Union Modernisation Fund. Those projects concerned with the development of equality representatives were not all covered by the evaluation. These projects had been facilitated to some extent by the TUC and a separate impact assessment had been conducted. This meant that the UMF2 evaluation focused on the remaining 23 projects. However, the TUC Equality Reps project was also included in our core sample to give some insights into the equality projects.

Two methods were used in the evaluation. First, a systematic documentary analysis was undertaken of all project records associated with the core 24 projects. This included the periodic reports that projects submitted to BIS, along with occasional interim reports, general communications between projects and BIS and final project reports. For the sample as a whole this involved well in excess of 250 documents. However, their length varied significantly from a simple one page update to a final report of over 300 pages. The documents were read and data extracted and allocated to appropriate evaluation 'themes'. This process of 'coding' helped to build a picture of aggregate outputs, outcomes, challenges and lessons learnt that are detailed in the body of the evaluation report. The documentary analysis was also used to produce short 'narratives' of each project and a summary table of projects, which are detailed below.

In addition to the documentary analysis, a telephone 'survey' was also conducted to probe a little deeper and to gain some reflection from project managers on the successes and challenges of projects. The survey was based on a semi-structured interview template and the purpose was to elicit a qualitative narrative from project managers rather than a quantitative aggregation. Interviews were conducted by telephone over the three week period from the 2nd March 2010 to the 24th March 2010. An email was sent one week prior to the start of the survey from the UMF Project Manager at BIS, which detailed the purpose and protocol of the survey and encouraged projects to participate. This proved useful as some project managers commented that they had been 'expecting the call' and were happy to participate. Some interviews were digitally recorded though some interviewees were less comfortable with their comments being tape recorded, which was respected. A headset was used and notes were written up immediately after interview to encourage accurate recall. The initial target sample was the 23 non-equality representative projects. A 100 per cent response rate was achieved. It was also decided to sample two equality representative projects to give some insights into these projects and this was complimented by a face-to-face interview with the project manager of the TUC Equality Representatives project.

On the whole all respondents, despite other commitments, were happy to take part in the evaluation and spoke openly about their experiences of their project. All were very open about their (positive) experiences of BIS. Furthermore, respondents were remarkably open about the difficulties they experienced throughout their projects and did not try to hide difficulties or over emphasise successes. Interviewees were permitted to 'ramble' and express what they believed to be important to their projects as well as simply answer the questions put to them. Interviews lasted between half an hour and one and a half hours, depending upon the extent to which interviewees wanted to expand upon their experiences as well as time constraints and other work responsibilities. No opposition to the evaluation was experienced despite often heavy workloads, and only one union expressed a lack of desire to participate. As noted above, two additional interviews were undertaken, with GFTU and PCS.

A 2: Telephone instrument for UMF 2 survey

Name of project
Name of contact
Date of interview

- Can you identify your top three successes in terms of:
  a) direct project outputs and,
  b) secondary or unanticipated process learning that emerged?
- What were the main challenges you faced delivering the project, and how did you deal with them?
- Were there any objectives that you didn't meet, and why?
- Given the initial resistance to change experienced in many organisations how have you dealt with this problem, if such has occurred, in your union?
- How helpful did you find the project management methodology required by UMF to deliver the project?
- How have you publicised the project a) within the union, and b) to a broader external audience?
- Did you network with other UMF projects? If so, with who and what did you get out of it?
- Following project completion, how have you managed/do you plan to build on specific project outcomes and use them as a platform for further change?
- How successfully are you managing to embed and mainstream activities in your broader union structures and processes?
- What, in anything, would you have done differently?
- What is your assessment of the extent of long-term cultural and behavioural change likely to be introduced in your union as a result of the UMF project?
- What are your modernisation plans for the future? Has modernisation become more accepted within the union? Does it have leadership support?
- What further advice and guidance would you like from external sources to help you drive your modernisation strategy and continue to respond to the challenges and opportunities thrown up by a rapidly changing economy and the process of economic globalisation (e.g. TUC and Government)?

A 3: CASE STUDY NARRATIVES FOR UMF 2 (EVALUATION) PROJECTS

052: General Federation of Trade Unions (GFTU)

Trade Union leadership and development

The GFTU had two round 2 projects which had equality as their remit. There is a growing awareness of the need to address new issues and develop new forms of representation. The GFTU covers a range of sectors with high a high concentration of BME and female workers. There have been a range of UMF projects in the past around affiliates dealing with such issues especially the BFAWU. The project was primarily a research project, though it had three clear elements. First, was to undertake detailed research into leadership and the accumulation of statistics. Second, the project sought to identify and train leaders within the organisation and offer training. Finally, the project sought to research issues around BME workers and women and identify whether they were gaining fair access to leadership and management positions. The training was provided by Ruskin College. Initially, the union found working with this external supplier a little 'alien' and consider the training as too 'academic'. But the final results were seen as 'most beneficial and participants had a better overall understanding'. The project produced a pamphlet highlighting its research findings and 2500 copies were distributed. The project was seen to have acted as a platform for change that had led to longer-term outcomes. The union had developed a partnership with the 'Institute of Leadership and Management' and the 'Northern College' to offer a certificate in leadership for affiliate union reps – this is a formal certificate to level 3 and ran over 6 consecutive taught weekends: the GFTU is also looking into developing a 15 consecutive weekend course with diploma status. For the project organizer, the project would 'eventually have long term effects on the culture and behaviour of the organisation…. it would ultimately teach people how they deal with others and how they do and will deal with employers and what the long term ramifications of this would be.'

053: TUC

Training and evaluating union equality representatives

The project's aims were to provide comprehensive training for equality representatives and to promote the work of equality representatives within the trade union movement and workplaces across Britain. Related to this, the project also aimed to provide training for TUC Education tutors to deliver these new materials. To promote the project, the TUC organised regional seminars and created an equality group for sharing and disseminating good practice. The project was set against recognition that equality and diversity are pressing issues for employers today, with new equality legislation and with growing numbers of women and BME employees. Unions want to support employers in ensuring that their workplaces adopt best practice. However, if equality representatives are to be effective they need to receive appropriate training before taking-up their roles. The project was focused on providing

46

such training to ensure that equality representatives have the knowledge and skills they need to undertake their work. An initial benchmarking survey was conducted across 11 unions to establish current practice and training of equality representatives. Following this, focus groups were held with equality reps, training officers and TUC tutors to determine the content of a new training programme. A three day equality training programme was then developed and piloted in 2008. 129 equality reps were trained through the pilots, and, after some revisions following feedback, the final training programme was introduced in 2009 and then converted to an online programme. To promote the project, 8 regional seminars took place to raise awareness of equality representatives, the new Equality Bill and the new training programme. An equality project group was also set-up to disseminate the project outputs and provide a forum for best practice. Finally, the project was extended, via an alternative funding source, and an impact assessment of equality representatives was conducted. The project was seen as highly successful and the training programmes were well attended, with 129 trained through the pilots and 116 through two online courses. The 8 regional seminars attracted 207 officers from 28 unions. The project was also showcased at the 2009 TUC Conference, with a workshop attracting 160 delegates. The results from the survey, focus group and regional seminars were highly valuable in scoping the range of issues faced by equality reps and regional variation in equality issues. Evidence was emerging of high levels of support for the equality representative role, evidenced by high numbers of subscribers and at times oversubscription to workshops, seminars, courses and a high response rate to the initial survey. The network equality groups established and facilitated by the TUC through the project was seen as very valuable for knowledge sharing across unions and campaigning for statutory rights for equality representatives.

054: Musicians' Union: Managing Change

Transforming our traditional structures

The project was concerned with how the union's structures needed to change as part of the modernisation process. The MU had experienced an increasing level of membership, but participation across the union was in decline. The traditional union structure was based in branches but this did not relate to the way that the majority of the union's self employed (that account for 80-90 per cent of membership) members' work. In response (in 2005) the union abolished its 72 branches and sought to organise across 6 regions and various sectional structures. This had not resulted in increased levels of participation, however, and the union was concerned about a 'democratic deficit' and the fact that its diversity of membership was not represented (eg. fewer people were putting their names forward for election on to committees). The project explored how this could be addressed through an extensive programme of research and consultation, led by the external organisation The Campaign Company. The project involved four elements: comparative research (ie desk top); activist consultation; wider membership research; final reporting and action planning. The union brought forward some of its initial deadlines in order to allow more time for consultation with members. The

research resulted in a survey of 364 members and a wide ranging set of insights that led to 8 recommendations, which were accepted by the Executive Committee. The main finding was that 'members have little interest in democratic structures, but in accessing the union's services where and when they want them'. The 8 recommendations were: more flexible system for raising motions; use technology to encourage more personalised communication; diversity networks; regional roles; strengthen sections; review EC composition; review conference to make it more interactive and inclusive; disseminate report. The project was managed in a formal manner with clear lines of reporting with the Campaign Company. It was considered a success and an Implementation Group was established to take forward the recommendations.

056: Association of Teachers and Lecturers (ATL)

Developing effective and representative lay structures

The project focused on transforming the way that branch secretaries conduct their business. Historically, branch secretary activities were focused at the local authority level. However, as a result of government policy, increased decentralisation and wider changes in the school and college system (for example more independents), it is the workplace that is increasingly the focus of industrial relations activity. The role of lay workplace reps has become more important and it is necessary for them to receive more support from branch secretaries. Branch secretaries also need to engage more with employers rather than local authorities. Given this, the project sought to provide a training programme to branch secretaries. Alongside this, the union had invested heavily in a new modernisation strategy that included investment in a new IT branch system, call My Branch Database. Branch secretaries also needed to be trained to make full and effective use of this. The database also allows for more systematic analysis of activists in terms of diversity information, but there was no data in the system. In practical terms, the project sought to develop 4 training modules and to conduct a number of equality and diversity surveys to gather demographic information (of branch secretaries and reps) and to undertake a telephone exercise to collect such information along with representatives' email addresses. Information on emails addresses increased to 69 per cent from 44 per cent. The target for diversity information was 60 per cent but achieved 20 per cent, whilst 40 per cent of reps undertook training against a target of 50 per cent. The training was nonetheless favourably received and was claimed to have created 'a thirst for learning'.

058: BAKERS, FOOD AND ALLIED WORKERS UNION (BFAWU)

Modernising Our Organisation

The project followed on from a UMF Round 1 project designed to improve communication with members following the design of a new database management system. Building on this, the Round 2 project was specifically concerned with two key areas: first, training lay reps to use the system; and,

second, engaging them to use it and so improve communication with members, to allow for better targeted campaigns. Greater detailed information on members would allow for the union to work more clearly alongside its membership. In practical terms the project was based on training representatives to use the system and to start putting in relevant information, such as on diversity, into the database. The project was managed by the Campaign Company. The purpose of this met with some initial questioning and a degree of mistrust but was overcome through a process of engagement. It was noted that 'practical examples were given as to why information was required'. For example if you want to target members on the benefits of screening for breast cancer, you need to know the gender of members. The project was considered a success. The project was seen to have had a direct impact upon the culture of the union and had directly created improvements. It had allowed members to more easily provide information, officials to more easily gain access to member information, and for members and officials to be more open about why they are collecting such information. There had also been an increased used of communication via email. Two further outcomes was that the training revealed the extent to which some representatives had very poor IT skills and remedial training could be provided for this; also, it became clear that English proficiency skills amongst the membership was of sufficient standard to allow the production of union literature just in English.

059: Nautilus

Lay and Full Time Officers Training Course

Faced with a changing global context and the emergence of new coordinated employers and organizations, NAUTILUS developed a project aimed at increasing awareness and know-how in relation to international union working. Dealing with employers internationally and working across borders was seen to require a new mindset and set of capabilities in terms of officers and representatives. It also required understanding of the structures of Nautilus, as an international union. A training programme was designed in conjunction with Ruskin College, to equip all their officials and a group of lay reps with the skills necessary to represent members in the global market place. In total, 75 officers and representatives were trained. The training resulted in the structures within the new union being developed and allowed reps to understand the benefits of an international union and it was claimed that officers and representatives 'now better understand the union and its structure'. New executive committee members have been elected and they have held their first ever conference which entailed speakers from the training course. Employer resistance to attending the courses was not an issue; indeed employers were engaged through the project. The union also developed a clearer understanding of project development and management and of working with providers of training on a longer-term and strategic basis, such as Ruskin College. Questions of costing, project management and planning were seen as having been improved due to the project – particularly costing and measurement of resources. The project is a key step in globalizing the union in terms of culture and perspectives.

066: Equity

Get in on the act: increasing participation among Equity members

Equity is a long standing union that represents members in media and the performing arts. The union was concerned that in recent years membership participation had declined. The union has specialist committees and a Council which is comprised of many long-standing members; comprising a highly committed but dwindling group of people. There was a concern about succession issues, knowledge transfer to new activists and the wider membership and the need to identify new agendas to activate members. The project therefore sought to spearhead transformational change that would impact on internal operations and also reach across and activate membership. It comprised four strands: the production of an audio-visual resource to communicate to and engage members in union activities; to reform election methods; to improve student voice and activate younger members within the union; and, to develop a keener focus on equality issues, through the creation of a network of equality representatives. In practical terms the project involved, focus groups with key stakeholders to determine content for a union DVD, an online survey to gauge students' perceptions of the union, revisions to the nomination processes within the union structures, and two equality workshops. The project resulted in 50,000 DVDs (endorsed by the comedian Jo Brand, who provided 12 'punch lines'), increased participation by union members in the union's structures, and increase in the number of union committees and in nomination for positions and the recruitment of 49 equality representatives (from a base of zero). It was suggested that the long-term outcomes were also visible in the way that the 'student survey had started to change day-to-day practice'.

070: Communication Workers Union (CWU)

Deconstructing Equality Barriers through Union Training (DEBUT) Project

This project was used as a platform to further modernise CWU equality based education and training materials. CWU recognise that the culture within the trade union movement regularly sees equality representatives 'pushed' to the peripherals of the Branch and while not deliberate, it is often apparent that Branches mistakenly value industrial relations far higher than the responsibilities associated with equal opportunities. The project aimed to make the role of equality reps more central and visible in terms of work. The project sought to do this through the production of a state of the art equalities toolkit. As part of the project a review of existing training for equality reps was conducted and a new, enhanced programme of training was designed. The main output was a 94 page toolkit for CWU equality reps, available also in an on-line version, and a training DVD entitled 'Everyone is different, everyone is equal', designed for wide circulation within the union to promote equality and diversity and highlight the important work done by equality reps within the union. The toolkit was designed to be "future proof", through on-going updates in response to the changes in policy and legislation. Post project interviews

found that the toolkit was highly valued by equality representatives. There were also unexpected outcomes. First, members' themselves were using the toolkit and the awareness this created in terms of equality rights at work had led to fewer disputes over equality and diversity issues. Second, there was some interest in the toolkit from management at Royal Mail. The union noted that in their view the toolkit was 'groundbreaking', had contributed to increased engagement with management and within the union, 'it was changing attitudes towards issues around diversity, it was opening debates on topics that unions in the past have found difficult to confront'.

071: Aspect

The Next Generation: Modernising Communications for Trade Unionists in the 21st Century

Aspect is a relatively small union representing 4,000 members throughout England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Members' roles are highly specialised and they tend to be geographically dispersed. Members tend to be senior professionals and often have limits to the time available to meet with and communicate to union officials. The union's modernisation strategy noted that the union 'seeks to be the 'voice' of educational improvement and children's services professionals, and is committed to delivering high quality union representation to its members as well as proactively providing a range of resources and services which will assist with their day-to-day work'. The project sought to promote this the development of the union's internet and intranet capabilities. The aim was that this facility would allow Aspect to engage more strongly with its membership base and key officers, and provide the organisation with greater capacity to make informed decisions. Prior to the design of the new system a wide-ranging consultation exercise took place with key stakeholders, including members of the union's executive council, senior full time officers, industrial and regional officers and finally professional associates (who deliver the union's programme of continuing professional development training). Full roll out of the intranet to membership and selected guests took place in Spring 2009, and an induction programme for core users/personnel responsible undertaken. It was then launched in late 2009. The project provided some important insights into how the union's membership wanted communication to develop. First, it became clear that social networking, through resources such as Facebook, was already being used: the new intranet has offered a way to capitalise on this through 'specialist zones'. Second, the union realised 'there was little demand for horizontal communication between professionals and what they really wanted was vertical communication and communication directly with a specialist within the union that could advise them'.

072: Communication Workers Union (CWU)

Youth Empowerment Strategy

The CWU has some 27,421 members under the age of 30. However, the union's resource allocation for dedicated youth work had been low and

engagement with youth workers was in urgent need of attention. The CWU YES Project aimed to provide a dedicated resource focussed on identifying, developing and supporting young representatives. Central to the project was a scoping exercise of all regional branches in terms of their youth empowerment activities, the design of a toolkit and the design of a bespoke website, which was developed over time and involved consultation through focus groups with key stakeholders. The focus groups aimed to better understand the educational needs to develop new modules and curriculum on youth empowerment and training of new Youth Branch Officers (YBOs). While some success has been reported in terms of recruiting new YBOs there was some indication that retaining the YBOs tended to vary and success depended upon the structure and culture of regional branches. There was also some evidence of resistance from older branch workers in some of the regions. In total, the project set itself a target of recruiting a youth worker in 90 per cent of its 157 branches. The project achieved a level of between 60 and 70 per cent. The project had planned to introduce a mentoring system, but there was some scepticism of the value of this. Nonetheless, the project sought to take the issue of succession planning (as young workers get past 30) seriously and there was evidence the project was having an impact. The new youth website (www.cwuyouth.org) was widely accessed and more generally across the union the project had changed 'how young people are viewed within the union'.

073: GMB

Developing Modern Management Methods in the GMB

The project was set against a recent history of turbulent change within the union. The union had sought to respond to financial difficulties, membership challenge and changing leadership. A future strategy had been set out in a modernisation document to Congress in 2005 entitled 'A Framework for the Future of the GMB', which laid out clear objectives and targets for the union. This was monitored annually at Congress through an ongoing programme GMB@work. However, the implementation of this strategy required a degree of coordination and coherence within the management of the union that had not historically been given priority. The strength of the union had been built on strong regional independence, which meant that communication structures between the regions and the centre and between regions themselves was not always as open as it could be. Moreover, the wider changes taking place within the union, such as cut backs in staff employed had led to a perceived culture of distrust and increased employee relations problems such as grievances. The project sought to address this through embedding modern management methods throughout the union, via a programme of management training. The training programme, delivered by The Campaign Company, included 7 days' training to the 14 member Senior Management Team and 2 days' facilitated team training to 11 teams across the union. The team training was delivered to 59 participants, from the union's 9 regions, the Head Office and the National Administration Unit. The training programmes included modules such as leadership, teamworking, performance management and communications. A survey was also administrated to

regional officers and senior organisers to gauge their views on the union's future. It was noted that there was some minor, indirect resistance to the idea of the project, mainly in terms of 'seen it all before, keep your head down and it will go away'. But it was made clear that new management approaches 'were here to stay'. Overall, it was noted that the work of the project had 'created a higher propensity for individuals to accept and embrace change'.

076: Public and Commercial Services Union (PCS)

Mentoring for women reps

In 2005 a PCS report 'Count Me In' found that women were poorly represented at all senior union representative/decision making levels, despite making up 60 per cent of the national membership. The projected aimed to tackle this under-representation of women through a pilot project in Wales – where 75 per cent of membership is female. The project aimed to create a mentoring training programme, with 20 mentors (senior female representatives) and 20 female (preferably young) representatives as mentees. For the mentors a programme of 5 days' training (one day per month) was provided and for mentees ten days (again once a month). The aim was to accredit the training at ONC level 3. However, the project faced a number of challenges. First the training could not achieve the desired accreditation because additional written assessment was not asked of the mentors and mentees. The mentors and mentees were asked to fulfil the additional assessment requirements at a later date to gain the full qualification, which delayed many completing the programme. In addition, it appears that the project struggled to attract and train the proposed numbers of mentors and mentees. In total, 15 mentors were trained, but only 8 mentees (despite 15 initial applications). One possible reason was the lengthy time commitment. This made it difficult for the project to match mentors and mentees. Nonetheless, the project had some positive outcomes. First, there was evidence that the mentees were networking with each other. Second, those mentees trained were showing 'an increase in confidence in dealing with management and going about their day-to-day duties representing members'. Communication between mentors and mentees was also seen as good. The union is currently looking at ways to develop the project more widely.

078: Union of Shop, Distributive and Allied Workers (USDAW)

Developing competent and confident managers

This project sought to build on the work of a UMF1 project. The union had introduced a modernisation strategy based around a Balanced Score Card. This had led the union to develop and pilot new processes and systems for managing its affairs. Senior managers were trained to implement the new system, but other training needs had also become apparent: there was a perceived need to move from 'competence in the 'what' of operating new systems and processes to confidence in the 'how' of achieving results through people. In other words, there was a need to develop new skills and

behaviours to drive the new system. The project involved a wide- ranging consultation exercise, training and the production of guides and toolkits. Specifically, this included a training needs analysis of the central management team, which included a bespoke management development toolkit, 360 reporting exercise and external coaching during a management development review – this covered 45 people. The project also developed three training modules (Leadership and strategic planning, managing poor performance and managing resources). This was then rolled out to lower level managers, called area organisers, and a toolkit called 'managing your patch' was produced. One hundred area organisers participated in training of the toolkit. The union claims to have gained wider benefits from the project than just the immediate deliverables. First the union has started work on a compulsory training programme for all new senior managers. Second, staff surveys show that the union's index of management performance has improved from a score of 0.61 to a score of 0.86 (between, 2007-09), compared to a Work Foundation (who provided much of the project's management training) benchmark of 0.59. The union concluded that 'as a result of the UMF2 project we have a robust management development process that has involved all senior managers and will serve us well in the future. In addition, we have an effective model for Area Organisers to utilise in managing their area of allocation which is rapidly becoming established as a standard operation procedure'. This is contributing to longer-term planning of union strategy.

081: Transport and General Workers Union (UNITE)

Modernising management and training

The project aimed to develop a CPD programme for union officers. This was based on a realisation that officers have found it extremely challenging coming to terms with their new roles and responsibilities. There was a perceived gap between what the union was asking of its officers and their skills base, and this was holding back the union's modernisation agenda. It was also the case that officers did not communicate with each other and share information effectively. The project was designed to bring in external resources to design and pilot a management training programme. The project was organised around three phases: design/preparation, piloting and evaluation/embedding. The consultation, planning and design stage was extensive. One finding was the fact that the job of the officers was not written down. It was not therefore considered the 'property of the union'. Because of this there was no mechanism for measuring an officer's ability. The project developed 7 different grades of officer from an initial inductee to a senior regional officer. It was concluded that a standardised training programme would not be worthwhile. Whilst many officers saw training as important, few got learning opportunities. The project conducted a systematic review of different approaches to learning and concluded that an expansive form of learning was required. Following design, the project sought to mentor and coach 30 officers through a pilot CPD programme. As part of this training they also used Moodle, a software package that incorporated a social networking/ blog area. The project was approved prior to the merger process that formed Unite. A considerable amount of time was thus spent getting buy in from the

wider union and its structures at various levels and the project was expanded as a result of the merger. It was also the case that some officials were concerned with the term modernisation, as it was seen as too close to social partnership. Time was needed to keep the project on track. The project seemed to be highly participative. Key principles were developed for how CPD should be introduced, the value of the 'offer' and the support needed from the union, particularly at a senior level. The programme was committed to developing a number of ambassadors to embed and sustain the programme, but there was concern over the name, though not the principle of this. One of the unanticipated successes of the project was the significant improvements in communication that had resulted through the use of Moodle.

082: Chartered Society of Physiotherapy (CSP)

Feasibility Study of Collaborative Working

Seven participating unions of the Allied Health Professions Federation signed up to a joint modernisation strategy. The unions involved included The College of Occupational Therapists (COT), The British Dietetic Association (BDA), The British & Irish Orthoptic Society (BIOS), The Royal College of Speech and Language Therapists (RCSLT), The Society of Chiropodists & Podiatrists (SCP), The Society of Radiographers (SoR) and the Chartered Society of Physiotherapy (CPS) (the project lead). The project aimed to improve collaborative working in order to enhance the breadth and quality of the services provided for each organisation's membership. Blue Sparks Consultancy was commissioned to carry out a feasibility study to identify opportunities for collaborative working and cost reduction which could transform the way the unions deliver shared membership services. One opportunity considered was to free up resources through merging back-office functions to release more resources for 'up front' campaigning. The project involved a collaborative workshop and the production of a series of reports on how to improve collaborative working. It was established early in the project that buy-in from all participating unions was essential if the project was to have positive outcomes. All seven Chairs of the unions attended the initial workshop and demonstrated commitment throughout the project to collaborative working in the future. The project was considered to be successful. It was successful to the extent that the focus on collaborative working had fostered deeper understanding between the unions, facilitating greater interaction and the sharing of experiences and learning. There was also evidence of increased levels of transparency and trust between the organisations, having shared confidential data and previously unspoken perspectives. It was claimed that the unions 'had started to communicate with each other more and were less suspicious of the intentions of each other'. Nonetheless, the potential for the merger of back office functions did not receive strong report and was put on hold. Whilst there were a variety of different perspectives of what this may mean for traditional occupational identities, the main reason was financial. To move towards such sharing of services, would have required for some unions new upfront expenditure in terms of relocation. Given the current uncertain economic conditions, it was not considered advisable to take on new financial risks. The Project Board

agreed to focus on stability and supporting members given the unstable economic climate and agreed to review the proposal in one year's time.

083: Accord (and Unite)

Developing union reps within a partnership framework at HBOS

The project focused on the development of partnership relations with HBOS. Accord and Unite have been working in partnership with the company on its business plans for ensuring it maintains and improves its productivity and competitiveness in the global financial services market. Both unions were looking to train and upskill their representatives in business understanding and the methods of partnership working. The project sought to provide research, consultancy, training and support to the two unions to create and embed a good practice framework in partnership working in the finance sector. The project was managed by the Partnership Institute. Accord's modernisation strategy states that they wish to make the right training available to lay representatives so that they can equip them to fully understand and participate in the process going forward. A key part of the project involved the training of national and local officials and lay representatives alongside the training of managers to better understand the roles each play in the employment relationship. The training was designed to ensure the relationship maintains and improves its current collaborative stance and structures following a series of focus groups with key stakeholders. The project faced some challenges due to the uncertainty of the industry and redundancies that were taking place. There was also some management resistance from those that 'were fundamentally opposed to the concept of partnership with unions'. Nonetheless, the project completed well within time and overall reported high levels of buy-in from both managers and reps at a time of considerable economic turbulence. There were 192 recipients of partnership training with equal numbers of union reps (96) and managers (96). A pre and post-project evaluation found that 62 per cent of representatives felt their role was appreciated by management following the project compared to 42 per cent before hand; whilst 85 per cent of management reported that union representatives understood partnership and the needs of the business following the project compared to just 22 per cent beforehand. The final report concludes that there is 'strong and unequivocal support for the partnership training programme to continue and compelling evidence already of the benefits that partnership brings to both the business and its employees'.

087: UNISON

Migrant Workers Participation Project

Unison was concerned that it was not representing its migrant membership to a proportionate extent. The union was seen as good in terms of gender and race, but the number of migrant workers in the labour market had increased and Unison had very few active migrant members or migrant representatives. The project focused on a range of practices and ideas that would allow for a

more structured link to migrant communities and its mainstreaming within the union as a whole. There were challenges in terms of branch workload, convincing branches of the merits of engaging migrants and of some problematic attitudes amongst some members and representatives. The project aimed, therefore, to respond to the increasing diversity of the labour market (including those originating from within the EU) and improve Unison's ability to supply services geared to the needs of a diverse membership. The project sought to enhance networking, introduce training for new representatives from migrant worker backgrounds and build more supportive links. It total the project claimed to have engaged with 600 migrant workers through various events and networks and trained 70 new representatives from migrant workers backgrounds. Research was also commissioned from a London research centre. The training of the new activists helped to increase more informal types of activism, so that as a result of the work of the project more migrants felt comfortable recruiting other migrants or giving informal help and advice: a number of services that are directly aimed at migrants as a result of the project included an immigration advice helpline and ESOL training. Further, in at least one branch an agreement was reached with an employer regarding citizenship training for migrant workers. The level of dissemination through open meetings and publicity meetings allowed the project to resonate within the union and in local areas. This was supported by the union leadership. The project concluded that, 'the Migrant Workers Participation Project has successfully identified a substantial group of migrant workers with the capacity and enthusiasm to become more active in the union. Indeed many of these showed a conception of self-organization that is sometimes lacking among British workers. The challenge for UNISON is to develop this enthusiasm; the danger is that it is lost to the union.'

090: National Union of Schoolmaster, Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT)

Support for Overseas Trained Teaching in London and the South East

The teaching profession has seen a large increase in staff employed from overseas. This has brought a range of challenges given the extra needs that such teaching communities have across a range of topics and issues. The union is therefore confronted with a workforce that has experienced major challenges at and beyond the workplace. The project sought to provide more effective access to information for overseas trained teachers (OTTs) on professional aspects of the teaching role and also to enhance the effectiveness with which the union responds to the needs of OTTs. The project activities included the development of a dedicated web site specifically to address OTT issues and a training programme. There were a range of cultural outcomes and unanticipated results. The first unanticipated outcome was the development of more refined project management skills amongst the project team. The second was the fact that the project proved that the union's old set of assumptions about OTTs to be incorrect: as a direct result of an initial piece of research and feedback following the web site and training programmes these had been, more less, proved to be inaccurate and new ways of engaging OTTs had been developed as a direct result. The project

concluded that the union was 'certainly not opposed to developments in this area, in fact they are very positive but in the past simply have not had the knowledge as to how to go about getting involved, identifying and representing the needs of OTTs – hence a knowledge gap rather than opposition'.

091: Broadcasting, Entertainment, Cinematograph and Theatre Union (BECTU)

The Networked Union

The project ran over two years with the aim of radically changing the way that BECTU communicates with its members. The union represents members in a sector where web technologies are often at the cutting edge, and the union needed to match this. Also, its membership is subject to high levels of turnover and includes a very large proportion of free-lance workers, often working on very short-term contracts. Such members were unable to connect to the union through its traditional, rather hierarchical processes and structures and approach to holding meetings. To increase member participation, the union needs to capitalise on the full benefits and functionality of web-based technologies. This would allow members to update their own records on-line (saving head office resources), whilst also allowing them to develop their own social networking options to advertise employment opportunities. The project did through this through the introduction of a new interactive website and the appointment of a communications officer to oversee how the union communicates with its members through web technology. This implied a degree of cost saving through other aspects of the union's business. The introduction of the website was followed by an extensive, rolling programme of training and briefing to regional officers, representatives and members. In total 800 people were involved in the training (more than the 794 planned) and the benefits of the new web site were starting to be realised. For example, the website was used to invite bookings for the 2009 Freelancers' Fair: 400 bookings were received. Early assessments of web usage and awareness were positive, evidenced by the fact that membership web logins had increased from 11 per cent in April 2009 to 25 per cent in December 2009. A further benefit was that the ongoing maintenance of the website had been internalised within the union. The project was widely disseminated and was launched via an event at the Houses of Parliament.

092: FDA

Integrated Membership System and Website

The need to communicate more effectively with members and the need to have clear and effective membership databases has been of concern to the FDA for some time. It had already developed a range of communication systems and a website but it steadily felt that as a union it needed to be more effective in the way it tackled questions of communication. The context of civil service work has been changing with there being greater mobility and

uncertainty within a range of government departments. Membership is less stable and clearly located in terms of government structures. The project therefore aimed to develop an integrated membership system and website to transform the union's communications and membership services. The aim was for the system to: communicate more effectively to a diverse audience; better engage members in democratic processes; facilitate two-way communications; improve internal efficiency; and provide on-line tools for lay reps. The FDA was aware of internal inertia amongst officers and put in place a series of report lines and milestones so that the project would develop effectively. Initial research on the proposed systems was able to clarify what was needed and required in terms of new forms of virtual communication and organization – and managed to strengthen the legitimacy of the project within the union. The question of diversity and equality was also addressed so that focused communications and a broad range of issues were taken on board and addressed. In developing a more interactive and effective website for members, and a more thorough membership system, the FDA has managed to be more interactive with its members and these new supportive technologies appear to be becoming mainstreamed and integrated within the union. Use of the website has increased significantly, with the union reporting 'more hits on one day than previously in one month'. More widely, and unanticipated, was the increased level and focus of communication. Some 20 online communities had been set up through the website, usually linked to a committee or forum around a specific topic. A further stream to the project was, however, considered to have been less received. As part of the new membership database an online 'personal case system' had been introduced. Union staff initially indicated that they were in favour of the system, but once it was in operation there was some opposition to the need to input into the system, as for some it was seen to detract from 'real union duties'. It was suggested though that whilst the system faced initial resistance 'it would become the norm in due course and would be better accepted by representatives as they got used to it'.

096: Trades Union Congress (TUC)

Green work Places

The project was designed to foster union activity around green issues at the workplace level, with the TUC acting in a coordinating and disseminating role. The aim was to contribute to a transformation in the TUC's capacity to meet unprecedented demand from union members and employers for new skillsets to work together to develop energy and resource efficient, sustainable workplaces. The project set a target to work with affiliate unions and employers across 10-15 pace-setter projects in workplaces in key sectors. Collectively, these activities were to contribute to a transformation in the TUC's ability to meet unprecedented and rapidly growing demand from union members and employers for new skillsets to work together to develop environmentally efficient, sustainable workplaces. The project worked with a number of pilot workplaces, although in the end just 7 pilots took place. There seemed to be a lot of employer interest in the agenda, although there was difficulty in implementing some projects due to the pressures of workplace re-

organisation and in some cases difficulty getting management and union on board. Whilst the project did not meet its target, a number of the pilots covered a wider range of plants than originally anticipated. Final project outputs included: 4 environmental committees established; 97 environmental representatives recruited perceived improvement in employment relations; distribution of 6000 booklets. Demonstration was a key objective of the project and its findings were widely distributed to highlight potential best practice. The project noted that 'as a result of the Green Workplaces campaign unions had succeeded in expanding their consultation agenda, it had improved trust relations with management, improved industrial relations and encouraged more members to become active in a topic they felt passionately about'.

097: Union of Construction Allied Trades and Technicians (UCATT)

Managing Change

The union has during the past few years acknowledged the need to improve its internal organizational systems. New types of decentralized construction networks and changing labour markets mean that the organization has to be more strategic and focused in its approach – drawing on an array of management techniques and practices that can allow for more effective operations. Developing new communication techniques and ways of thinking through the challenges of new forms of employer and employment (e.g. through SWOT analysis) have therefore been a central feature of this union's modernization agenda. There was also a concern to increase the level of professionalism within the unions by addressing four key areas: structural change; networking; communications; and success planning. The project brought together a range of training agendas in terms of 'personal effectiveness; problem solving techniques; internal and external decision-making structures; basic accounting procedures; managing information; individual and team-working; information & consultation arrangements; employment law; networking; working in partnership with employers; promoting awareness and understanding of the construction sector business environment.' A range of toolkits were developed and 150 individuals trained. Senior officials were also signposted to the TUC professionals' programme. The project had planned to develop an online communications centre but were let down by the IT contractor and did not complete this part of the project. Nonetheless, more active communication with the membership was achieved through website improvements, increased use of newsletters (*"Hard Hat"* and *"In Site"*) and USB "memory sticks" which contained pre-loaded materials (promotional materials, employment law checklists and advice, PDFs of promotional literature etc), and were distributed to full time officers, lay representatives and members. It was claimed that the project was impacting within the structures and culture of the union: 'the project represented a total cultural shift, once things had been learnt it is more difficult to unlearn them and they become custom and practice'.

067: UNISON

Virtual Branches

The project was set against a challenge of increasing membership participation in branch activities. In some cases branches covered very large and dispersed geographical areas that made it difficult for people to attend. The project was aimed at responding to changing employment patterns and raising the level of active two-way communication between the union and its membership. The aim was to pilot a virtual branch network to better target members, empower them to participate in branch affairs and overcome traditional barriers to participation. The specific objective was to set up 12 virtual branches as 12 interactive web sites. The project succeeded in establishing all 12 virtual branches. An internal evaluation of the project was yet to be completed, but the early signs were that the project was successful. Accessing the branch through virtual media was proving to be more effective and there was evidence of greater 'attendance'. Monitoring hit rates showed that a large number of members were accessing the information on the virtual branches. There was also evidence of cost savings and some positive achievements in terms of recruitment. The project had faced a challenge in terms of working with the supplier of the software which had been taken over during the contract and which had delayed on some of the software development. The union claimed that already some branches 'had really embraced the virtual branch and it had started to affect the way in which they behaved on an everyday basis and how they were looking at organising campaigns'. The union were planning to produce a document for wide distribution on how to set up virtual branches, the benefits of them and how to overcome the challenges faced in establishing them and dealing with contractors.

101: Community

Community Trade Unionism and the NEC: Contributing to the Union's Modernisation

The project, in simple terms, involved the delivery of a one week course to NEC members. It built on the UMF first round project, which trained full-time officers and senior staff. The aim was to bridge the gap in knowledge and understanding between union full-time staff and NEC members and also to lay the basis for future induction training of NEC members. The course was held in late 2007 and included 18 participants. Senior union officers also attended as participants and speakers. Speakers were invited from the Work Foundation, LSE and Henley Management College, covering the changing nature of the union environment and labour market, marketing and management and union finances. A final evaluation considered future concerns for the union, and covered: new constituencies, such as care, smes and young people, for organising; the offer of professional support (eg around pensions) as benefits; prioritising job quality issues in collective bargaining; intervene in the community through its education and professional services. General evaluation comments just after the course were positive: 'It is vital to

61

do this as it takes time to know all the issues. It will help to heal the gap between the NEC and the FTOs.' A further evaluation was conducted five months on, which drew out wider issues of sustainability: 'as not the end, but the start of a sharing of Community's vision between us'. There was a view that more was needed for NEC members (after they are elected) in terms of financial management, legal knowledge and presentational skills. The project was seen as important in training the union's Executive to act in a more professional and united way, rather than looking to make decisions on the basis of, for example, regional interests. Following the course, the Executive were more able to challenge and make decisions around, for example, financial matters. It was also claimed that they were acting in a more professional way when dealing with employers and were more understanding of business need. Likewise, a greater appreciation of the needs of the union had led to a structural change from 8 to 4 regions. Following from the first round project, this project was seen to prepare the union for a more detailed examination of its key activities as a community union, something that is currently the focus of a UMF 3 project.

A 4: SUMMARY TABLE OF UMF 2 (EVALUATION) PROJECTS

Code	Applicant Union	Project title and objectives	Project activities/outputs	Dissemination
052	GFTU	*Trade Union Leadership and Development* – 24 month project. The aim of the project was to develop existing and future leaders of the Federation and its affiliates to transform the culture and structures of unions, to include, develop and empower women and BME leaders. This was to be achieved through research, training and dissemination	Key activities included: - Programme of qualitative and quantitative research; - Training programme, in conjunction with Ruskin College. - Dissemination of research **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** Key needs and views about the union and its work were gathered from the research which helped inform the main training approach. The training and the training of trainers led to new forms of networks and engagement around these groups. More activists than the target number were trained. Responses to the questionnaire was not as high as were expected (out of 826, 218 responded). New relations also with Ruskin college and a more systematic approach to the subject of new leadership were developed; though working with the college raised some initial cultural issues. The project has now an ongoing element through annual courses and a new certificate course. 2500 pamphlets were distributed.	I++, E++

| 053 | TUC | *Training and evaluating Equality Representatives*: 12 month project focused on survey current practice, course design and training of equality representatives. | Successfully completed. Key activities included:
- Scoping survey of characteristics, practice and training of equality representatives in 11 unions;
- Training course designed and 129 equality representatives training;
- Wide ranging dissemination events – attended by 207 representatives from 28 unions, showcase conference attended by 160 delegates;
- Project network group established for individual unions.
-
Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice
Project successful in raising awareness of the need for more training for the equality representative role, demonstrating positive impact and establishing a case for a campaign for statutory rights. Project network group effective in cross-fertilisation of knowledge and learning across unions. However, project seen as too short and completed before many of the individual UMF projects. | I++, E++, N++ |
| 054 | Musicians' Union | *Transforming our traditional structures*: 15 month project research and consultation project designed to improve | Completed successfully, with key elements:
- Comparative desk-top research
- Activist consultation, involving 6 discussion groups (from different | I+ |

		levels of participation within union structures.	membership constituencies) and 20 stakeholder interviews - Membership survey – 364 responses - Reporting and action plan - **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project led to 8 key recommendations to improve membership participations throughout the union's activities and structures. An Implementation Group has been tasked with delivering on the recommendations. The key lessons learnt related to the effective project management approach of the project and the benefit of using an external contractor.		
056	Association of Teachers and Lecturers (ATL)	*Developing effective and representative lay structures*: 2 year project designed to equip lay reps to undertake a broader branch role via an improved communications infrastructure and training and development programme.	Project completed, with one month extension. Key elements included: - Exercise to collect email addresses of reps, target to increase by 50 per cent achieved; - Survey of branches (85 officer responses – 39 per cent) and Representatives (1098 responses – 19.5 per cent) as part of equality and diversity audit; - 4 training modules drafted and delivered (membership system, organising skills, communications, action planning); - 2 learning CDs produced.	I+	

			Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice Awaiting final report. The project had increased branch secretaries awareness of IT packages and identified increased training needs. The learning CDS, training modules and ongoing meetings will contribute to sustainability of the project. Lessons learnt when shifting the development of e-learning packages in-house, when external contractor went bust.	
58	BFAWU	*Modernising our Organisation* – 12 month project that aimed to implement outcomes from their two successful Round One by improving two-way communication between unions and their members, by developing a training programme for members to use the new membership system and use a professional approach to use of the new membership system.	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - 14 training events with 119 participants; - 18, 700 records have been updated, which represents 47 per cent of all records; of these 29 per cent indicate ethnic origin and 68 per cent gender. 3000 new membership records have been added. - Dissemination through union journal, 'Foodworker'. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** There were relevant developments in materials, website related data and training for members so they could use the new systems in terms of membership and communication.	I++, N+

			The use of flexible training and cascading systems of support were useful in helping develop the use of the new systems. The use of the Internet and email has become more common. Assumptions about the number of training sessions required were over estimated. However this allowed the union to gain further insight into its structures and activist base.	
59	Nautilus	*Lay and Full Time Officials Training Course*: 16 month project that project sought to fund a training programme, in conjunction with Ruskin College, to equip all their officials and over 100 lay reps with the skills necessary to represent members in the global market place.	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - The training of 75 officers and representatives. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project managed to refocus some of the longer term planning and views of the union's work in relation to the question of globalization. It has created a longer term view of training and links with training providers on strategic issues. It has also led to changes in internal representation and links with representatives that emerged from the course. The project is a key step in globalizing the culture of the union, and represents a step change in terms of a new international dimension to the union.	I +, E +
066	Equity	*Get In On The Act – increasing participation among Equity members* – 24	Project successfully completed. Key activities included:	I++, E+

		month project that sought to increase participation of members in the union and activism.	- Audio visual resources created and 50, 000 DVDs for distribution through union magazine; - Online survey of student members (417 responses out of 4000) to provide qualitative and quantitative data; - Increased emphasis on participation in elections and committees, through simplified procedures; - Training for 49 new equality (from 0) representatives - Student day (48 participants) **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** Project successful increased communication, participation and expertise in the union. 27 members new to committee were elected through course of project and number of nominations highest ever. Three new committees established. Wide dissemination of DVD through social networking sites. Man challenges was time to manage project, as no project worker appointed.	
070	CWU – Debut	CWU *Deconstructing Equality Barriers through Union Training* (DEBUT) – 24 month	Project successfully completed. Key activities included:	I ++, E ++, L

		project that sought to modernise the union's equality-based education and training materials via an interactive toolkit on equality legislation and best practice guide.	- Initial consultation with 70 equality reps and survey; - 94 page Toolkit for CWU equality reps; - DVD "Everyone is different, everyone is Equal; - Review of existing training for equality reps and creation of new training provision to enhance role; - Post-project evaluation; - Wide ranging dissemination **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The toolkit was considered 'groundbreaking' and there was evidence that it was being used by members and management as well as equality reps. Dissemination was extensive, with a seminar a equality reps, a CWU conference meeting and an external launch (all attended by between 80-100 delegates). There was some initial delays over the appointment of a project worker, but did not derail a successful project.	
071	Aspect	*The Next Generation - Modernising Communications for Trade Unionists in the 21st Century* – 12 month project that sought to equip lay representatives to	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Wide ranging consultation with key stakeholders; - Roll of new intranet facility; - Induction programme for core users.	I+, L

		undertake a broader branch role via an improved communications infrastructure and a training and development programme.	**Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The new facility has become embedded into organisational daily working practices. The project revealed that social networking was widespread and that members wanted improved communications on a direct basis with union experts.	
072	CWU – Yes	*CWU – Youth Empowerment Strategy* – 24 month project that sought to transform the union's approach to recruiting and empowering young workers, via development of a dedicated resource for supporting young representatives and mainstreaming of youth activity.	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Regional youth mapping questionnaire - Design of a bespoke website resource to support engagement with the youth empowerment strategy - Toolkit - Short Course prospectus to promote outputs - Recruitment of youth officers for all 153 branches; achieved for 97. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project was considered successful in terms of increasing engagement with and the participation of youth activists in branches. The number of youth workers in branches was just 50 before the project and increased to 97. An unexpected level of churn was identified. The	I++, E++, N+

			new website for young members was widely accessed. Some resistance at branch level was noted and an aspiration to introduce a mentoring system was not met – mainly due to lack of credibility of such schemes in employer organisations.	
073	GMB	*Developing modern management methods* - 12 month project aimed at programme of training for Senior Management Team and wider management structures in union, with policies to embed key management practices.	Completed successfully, with 6 month approved extension: - 7 days' training for 14 members of SMT; - 2 days facilitated team development for 11 wider teams (including 9 regions, for 59 staff) - Survey of senior organisers' and regional officers' views on state and future of union - Identification of SMART team objectives and action plan **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project strengthened the working of the SMT and its communication processes with the wider management structures of the union. There was recognition of the need for line management roles and capabilities with the union, and that this required openness and consistency in practice. However, achieving consistency through the roll out of the action	I+, E +

			plans is still a 'work in progress' around key issues such as performance management and disciplinary processes.	
076	PCS	*Mentoring for women reps* - The project aimed to revitalise the recruitment, training, development and support of local equality representatives. This was to focus on the training of a network of 20 mentors and 20 mentees	The project has yet to complete: Key activities included: - Mentors training programme of 5 days training (a day per month), with 15 mentors trained; - Mentees training programme of 10 days training (a day per month), with 8 mentees trained; - Accreditation process for training. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The aim was to achieve a training programme with a nationally recognised qualification that could be rolled out to all regions of the PCS union. The project met challenge sin recruiting both mentors and particularly mentees. The length of the mentee training was considered problematic. The accreditation process also met with problems at college level. Nonetheless, the principle of mentoring is considered worthwhile and the union is looking to roll out further.	I+
078	USDAW	*Developing competent and confident managers* – 20 month project to develop the	4 months' extension approved. The project activities included:	I ++, E +

		skills and behaviours of senior managers and introduce a training and development programme for next tier management to ensure the embedding of modernisation plans.	- Initial consultation exercise with 25 managers to develop role profiles - Wide ranging development programme for senior management, with training needs assessment, 360 degree profile exercise and coaching (for 45 managers); - Development of training modules; - Training needs analysis and briefing for Area Organisers; - Production of various guides and tookits for 'managing your patch'. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project was considered a success and acted to embed the processes designed under UMF 1 project. The project has developed the core skills of managers and, assisted by the Work Foundation, provided a platform for ongoing development and review. A key lesson learnt was not to attempt to produce an 'off the shelf' training programme for area organisers, but rather to focus on understanding their competency needs and then implementing other developmental routes.	
081	Transport and General Workers	*Modernising management and training* – year project that is part of a wider change	Completed with approved 4 month delay. Key activities included: - Extensive planning and consultation	I+

	Union	programme which seeks to reform management / Officer training and delivery structures, and constitutes a platform for change to work practices and union systems and culture.	exercise - Survey and training needs analysis - Development of expansive learning approach - CPD pilot for 30 officers - Website for CPD developed - Formal launch planned for Autumn 10 **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project developed a CPD programme for officers and a more developed understanding of the role of officers and how they learn. Key lessons learnt related to project management, overcoming the challenge of merger and how to professionalise the role of officers.	
082	CSP (and six other unions)	*Feasibility Study of Collaborative Working* – 19 month project designed around a feasibility study to explore opportunities for collaborative working. The aim was to identify the scope for sharing facilities and support services and thereby reduce infrastructure costs and improve the quality of services.	The project completed. Key activities included: - Workshop on potential for collaborative working involving all Chairs of the seven organisations involved in the study; - Production of four related reports into collaborative working: Potential Options for Collaboration'; 'A Summary Report'; 'A Business Cases Report' and 'Payback Paper' **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project helped to produce a shortlist of	I+, E+

			ways in which to work collaboratively and research in the form of a 'feasibility study' give the changing economic climate in 2009. The possibility of merger 'back office' functions across the unions was not approved, due to the increased levels of financial risk this would entail. The CSP propose to come back to this at a later date.	
083	Accord/Unite	*Developing union reps within a partnership framework at HBOS* – 16 month project that sought to develop capacity to support and train reps in understanding modern business practices as part of the existing partnership agreement with HBOS	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Ten, three hour focus groups with a total of 68 participants – 50 union reps and 18 managers. - Partnership training with 196 reps and managers (equal participation) partnership training - Post evaluation response from 110 participants **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** Project was overseen by the Partnership Institute. Key challenges related to the organisation of training, initial resistance from some mangers to the notion of partnership working with unions and industry uncertainty as a result of the recession. Nonetheless, the project delivered positive outcomes in terms of changes attitudes and understanding from	I +

			both management and union representatives, as evidenced by the pre and post training evaluation. A piloted and evaluated partnership training programme is now in place and a wide roll out programme has begun with training being delivered by union reps, supported by the business through senior management and the learning and development team.	
87	UNISON	*Migrant Workers Participation Project* – 24 month project that aimed to respond to the increasing diversity of the labour market. The aim was to involve migrant workers at all levels of the union, and reduce economic and social exclusion.	Key project activities include: - Networking events that engaged around 600 migrant workers; - Training of 160 migrant workers, of which 70 were recruited to representative positions; - Research commissioned from Working Lives Institute. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** There was internal resistance and a problem of over-worked branches in some cases. There was a need to profile the project and market it. However new migrant worker activists were recruited and this helped to increase more informal types of activism, so that more migrants felt comfortable recruiting other migrants or giving informal help and advice: a number of services that are directly aimed at migrants also resulted, including an	I ++, E ++, N +, L

			immigration advice helpline and ESOL training. In at least one branch an agreement has been reached with the employer regarding citizenship training for migrant workers.	
90	NASUWT	*Support for overseas trained teachers in London and the South East* – 24 month project that aimed to provide more effective access to information for overseas trained teachers (OTTs) on professional aspects of the teachers' role as well as social and cultural issues; and to enhance the effectiveness with which the union.	Project not yet completed, extension approved. Key activities included: - Development of specific website for OTT issues; - Training programme. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** As well as training officers it has developed relevant resources online for OTTs and raised the profile of this issue within the union. These were disseminated to OTT's via the marketing and press offices of the union which helped frame a dissemination strategy. Greater focus in terms of the role of the Internet and services has emerged but also a greater rethink in terms of assumptions about overseas workers and the approach of the union.	I+, N+
091	BECTU	*The Networked Union* – 2 year project aimed at making best use of available web-enabled tools to support modernisation strategy of transforming how the union relates to its members, non-	The project completed successfully. Key outputs included: - launch of new interactive website (including new booking system for events) - appointment of new role of communications officer	I++, E++, N++

			varied training programme for 800 recipients (branch officials, representatives and members - end of project member survey with 439 responses (majority felt project had met objectives in full or in part) **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project strengthened the union's ability to engage with its increasingly peripatetic workforce. The new website seems to be widely used and there is much awareness of it. The key lesson learnt related to overreaching ambition of what is possible within timeframe – some aspects of website remain to be developed.	
092	FDA	*Integrated Membership System and Website* – 20 month project that sought to develop an integrated membership system and website to transform the union's communications and membership services.	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Development of new memberships, which received commendation from TUC; - New electronic personal case work system introduced - Membership engagement seminar **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** Membership survey found that the new site is	I++, E+

			viewed favourably. Two-thirds of members surveyed found site useful, and hit rate is running at 200 per day compared to previous 200 hits per month. 900 members have updated their records on-line and paper-based responses have declined by 40 per cent. Personal case work system met with some staff resistance, although at least 100 cases logged by end of project.	
096	TUC	*Green Work Places* This 24 month project sought to develop new skill-sets for affiliates and employers to enable them to work together to promote energy and resource efficient, sustainable workplaces. This was to be achieved through 10-15 pacesetting projects, the result of which would be widely disseminated.	The project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Wide variety of activity within 7 workplaces and scoping activity in a number of others; - 4 environmental committees established and 97 environmental representatives recruited; - production of workbook on green workplaces; - development of website; - Extensive dissemination and media activities, including dissemination of 6000 booklets; including Ministerial launch **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The final report was to be completed. However, the project was delivering insights	I++, E++, N++, L

			into the potential of green issues for trade union engagement with employers. The TUC coordination was effective.	
97	UCATT	*Managing Change* – 24 month project that sought to respond to a series of internal and external challenges and implement a broad-based change programme. This was to be delivered via: an on-line communications centre; a membership survey to inform the modernisation process; and a training programme for lay reps and officers.	Project completed. Key activities included: - extensive training to 150 people union officers and representatives; - Increased communications effort to membership. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** Developments of the union website and new forms of information systems. Training on issues such as personal effectiveness; problem solving techniques; internal and external decision-making structures; basic accounting procedures; managing information; and others'. A new approach to thinking through strategy and innovation. However, was not able to implement a new on-line communications centre due to problems with contractor.	I ++, E+
67	UNISON	*Virtual Branches* – 24 month project that aimed to respond to changing employment patterns and pilot a virtual branch network to better target members, empower them to participate in branch affairs, and overcome	Project successfully completed. Key activities included: - Establishment of 12 virtual branches, via interactive web sites. **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** At the time of evaluation, the data from a	I++, E+

		traditional barriers to participation.	second survey aimed at understanding the extent of change and improvement within these branches compared to the previous period of traditional branch engagement, was not ready. However, accessing the branch through virtual media was proving to be more effective and there was evidence of greater 'attendance'.	
101	Community	*Community Trade Unionism and the NEC: Contributing to the union's modernisation*: 6 month project to improve understanding between full-time officers and the NEC via an education programme covering strategy, culture, marketing and financial skills.	The project was successfully completed. Key outputs:5 day training course for 16 participants - Immediate and 5 month evaluation **Benefits accrued, lessons learnt and good practice** The project built successfully on a UMF 1 project. The training course was well received and identified key training issues for the future and also wider strategic issues for the union. For NEC members it was recognised that an induction programme was needed on election that gave insights into union finances and employment law and the opportunity to develop presentational skills.	I+

Code: I = Internal dissemination; E = External dissemination; N = Networking with other unions/ projects/ stakeholders; L = Major launch event.
Measure: + = minor (such as through project activity); ++ = Extensive (beyond specific project activities, including articles in union journals, external publications and presentations at multiple workshops).

References

Bacon, N. And Hoque, K. (2009) TUC Union Equality Representatives Survey 2009: Final Report. Nottingham University Business School

Department of Trade and Industry (2004) *Union Modernisation Fund: Consultation on the draft rules and procedures.* London: DTI

Department of Trade and Industry (2005a) *Union Modernisation Fund: Governmental response to public consultation on the draft rules and procedures.* London: DTI

Department of Trade and Industry (2005b) *Establishment of a Union Modernisation Fund (UMF): Regulatory Impact Assessment*, Employment Relations Directorate. London: DTI

Stuart, M., Martinez Lucio, M. And Charlwood, A. (2009) The Union Modernisation Fund – Round One: Final Evaluation Report, BIS *Employment Relations Research Series, No. 104*. Dept for Business, Innovation and Skills: London, URN 09/1346. Walker, S., Martinez Lucio, M. and Trevorrow, P. (2007) 'Tracing trade union innovation: a framework for evaluating trade union learning projects in a time of complexity', *Transfer*, 13(2): 267-90.