

Home Office Response to IAGCI Review Iraq Country of Origin Information (COI) Requests, October 2014 – March 2015

November 2015

Rev	riew Conclusions/ Recommendations	Response	Home Office Comments
	COI Response on Badr Brigades, 23 March 2015		The reviewer appears to be commenting on a different response - 09/14-080, dated 12/9/14, titled, Badr organisation treatment of Ba'athists – on a similar subject.
			Our comments below are therefore in reference to that response.
1.	There is a problem with paragraph numbering. '6' should be where '7' now is, at the top of the third page; '7' should come before: 'An Amnesty International report of 27 June 2014' In fact, I am uncertain that a paragraph number is needed for the 27 June 2014 Amnesty report. It could just be a continuation of paragraph 6. In any event, the paragraphs need renumbering.	Accepted	However see comment to point 6 below
2.	I would replace paragraph 4 with an extract from the Institute for the Study of War's Beyond The Islamic State: Iraq's Sunni Insurgency, October 2014 (see http://www.understandingwar.org/sites/default/files/Sunni%20Insurgency%2 Oin%20Iraq.pdf). Perhaps the following:	Partially accepted	See comment to point 6 below

3.	I would suggest adding the following as a new paragraph, at the end of the Response: 'On 14 October 204 an article in the <i>Independent</i> stated: Iraq is descending into savage sectarian warfare as government-backed Shia militias kill, torture and hold for ransom any Sunni whom they detain. Isis is notorious for its mass killings of Shia, but retaliation by Shia militiamen means that Iraq is returning to the levels of sectarian slaughter last seen in the Sunni-Shia civil war of 2006-07 when tens of thousands were murdered	Partially accepted	See comment to point 6 below
4.	In addition - or alternatively to my suggestion in my previous paragraph - there might be a separate paragraph with extracts from the Amnesty International report cited by the <i>Independent - Absolute Impunity: Militia Rule in Iraq</i> (see https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/8000/mde140152014en.pdf).	Partially accepted	See comment to point 6 below
5.	. I would suggest also a new paragraph with the following extract from UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon's Fourth report of the Secretary-General pursuant to paragraph 6 of resolution 2169 (2014), dated 13 July 2015 (see http://www.uniraq.org/images/SGReports/N1521149%20(2).pdf): "52. UNAMI also continued to receive reports alleging that pro-Government armed groups and militias are perpetrating violations and abuses of human rights. Since the beginning of May, Shi'ite militias have been establishing checkpoints in the area, harassing and assaulting Kurdish drivers and passengers.	Partially accepted	See comment to point 6 below

	It might be worth inserting a new Paragraph 2 with an extract from the Congressional Research Service report <i>Iraq: Politics, Security, and US Policy</i> ,		All the suggested additions are from sources that post-date the response, and some of the material is subsequently covered in our CIG 'reports'.
6.	dated 16 September 2015 (see http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/mideast/RS21968.pdf). This information is essentially the same as that in Paragraph 1, from the 27 February 2015 Congressional Research Service report - which in fact provides slightly more detail.	Partially accepted	We do not propose to make this amendment at the current time – the response was time and case-specific – but the suggested material may be useful in forthcoming CIG on the situation of Sunnis, former Ba'athists and the actions of Shi'ite militia.
	COI Response on Kaka'i religion, 9 March 2015		
7.	Re-phrase opening words of Paragraph 1 thus: 'The World Directory of Minorities, edited by Minority Rights Group International and published in 1997, lists the 'Sarliya-Kakaiya' as a religious minority of Iraq, stating: '	Partially accepted	See comments to point 10 below
8.	Re-phrase the opening words of Paragraph 2 thus: 'Another Minority Rights Group International report, Still Targeted: <i>Continued Persecution of Iraq's Minorities</i> , published in 2010, reported the following, with a very different population estimate:'	Partially accepted	See comments to point 10 below
9.	Paragraph 6 should be transferred to the end of the Response because the paragraphs on either side of it are both about the 'Between the Millstones' report, while the BBC report at Paragraph 6 is unrelated.	Partially accepted	See comments to point 10 below

10.	I would suggest a final paragraph with the following extract from <i>Report on the Protection of Civilians in the Armed Conflict in Iraq: 11 December 2014 to 30 April 2015</i> , published jointly by UNAMI and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), and issued in June 2015 (see http://www.uniraq.org/index.php?option=com_k2&view=item&task=download&id=1396_5fcd404d37485e029a9429a71d783df5&Itemid=650⟨=en):	Partially accepted	This source post dates the response. We do not propose to make this amendment at the current time – it was time-limited for a specific case – but the suggested material may be useful in forthcoming CIG on the situation of minorities.
	COI Response on the Al-Fardous newspaper, 27 October 2014		
11.	I would insert the following, prior to the final sentence: 'The media list on the www.al-bab.com website notes that 'after this initial burst of activity [in mid-2003] many of them [the publications listed] closed as the security situation deteriorated'.	Partially accepted	Thank you for the suggested source. We do not propose to make this amendment at the current time — it was time-limited for a specific case.
12.	COI Response on LGBTI persons, 15 January 2015		
13.	Paragraphs 4, 5, 6, 7, 9 and 10: The State Department's latest report, for 2014, should be cited - although the information is much the same.	Partially accepted	Thank you. We do not propose to make this amendment at the current time – it was time-limited for a specific case – but the material may be useful in future CIG on LGBT persons.
	COI Response on the treatment of Yazidis, 24 February 2015		

14.	I would re-phrase Paragraph 2 slightly, as follows: '(their divine being, Malak Taus, also being known as Shaytan - the name for Satan, or the devil, in the Islamic holy book, the Qu'ran)'.	Partially accepted	See comments to point 16 below
15.	At Paragraph 3 I would re-phrase very slightly, as follows: 'with a smaller community in the Shaikhan region, north east of Mosul, where their most holy shrine, the tomb of Shaikh Adi at Lalish, is located'.	Partially accepted	See comments to point 16 below
16.	I would suggest inserting a new paragraph 12 (in the section on the treatment of Yazidis in ISIL controlled areas) with the following extract from <i>Report on the Protection of Civilians in the Armed Conflict in Iraq: 11 December 2014 to 30 April 2015</i> , published jointly by UNAMI and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), and issued in June 2015 (see http://www.uniraq.org/index.php?option=com_k2&view=item&task=download&id=1396_5fcd404d37485e029a9429a71d783df5&Itemid=650⟨=en :	Partially accepted	Thank you. The source post dates the response date. We do not propose to make this amendment at the current time — it was time-limited for a specific case — but the material may be useful in future CIG on minorities.
17.	COI Response on Desertion, 11 May 2015		
18.	I would suggest the insertion of a new paragraph 3 with an extract from a Washington Post article entitled 'Iraqi soldier tells of desertion as militants attacked refinery: "Our officers sold us out", dated 11 July 2014 (see https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/middle_east/iraqi-soldier-tells-of-desertion-as-militants-attacked-refinery-our-officers-sold-us-out/2014/07/10/e634c0a0-02be-11e4-8fd0-3a663dfa68ac_story.html). The article is essentially an interview with a soldier, Ammar, who was one of hundreds who deserted in the face of an IS attack against the Baiji Refinery. The article states:	Partially accepted	See comment to point 19 below

19.	Although it's about desertion, rather than penalties for desertion, it might also be worth adding, as a new Paragraph 4, the following extract from a <i>Reuters</i> reported entitled 'Some Iraqis ditch fight against Islamic State for life in Europe', dated 21 September 2015 (see http://www.reuters.com/article/2015/09/21/us-europe-migrants-iraq-military-insight-idUSKCN0RK0EB20150921#uFQ6s3TufirsUHzI.97):	Partially Accepted	Thank you. While not directly relevant to the penalty for desertion or whether this is applied in practice, the source has some useful figures. As above, we do not propose to make this amendment at the current time – it was time-limited for a specific case – however both source recommendations will be useful for future CIG products.
-----	--	--------------------	---