

Action for Empowerment and Accountability Research Programme: Understanding Social and Political Action

Mozambique: Country and Intervention Scoping Report

Katia Taela and Alex Shankland (IDS) and Nicholas Awortwi (PASGR)

Contact:
Action for Empowerment and Accountability
Institute of Development Studies
University of Sussex
Brighton, BN1 9RE
Email: J.Edwards@ids.ac.uk

This country scoping report was prepared as part of the A4EA Programme Inception, April-November 2016.
(The views expressed do not necessarily reflect those of our funder).

Action for Empowerment and Accountability Research Programme: Understanding Social and Political Action

Mozambique: Country and Intervention Scoping Report

1: Introduction

This scoping study was conducted as part of the inception phase for the DFID-funded Action for Empowerment and Accountability Research Programme (A4EA). It aimed at analysing and describing the context, actors and interventions and strategies related to social and political action for empowerment and accountability in Mozambique to help the identification of locally relevant research themes and projects as well as potential partners and stakeholders for the next phase of the programme in the country.

The report presents the conclusions of the literature review, interviews and scoping visits undertaken by Katia Taela and Alex Shankland of the Institute of Development Studies (IDS) and Nicholas Awortwi of the Partnership for African Social and Governance Research (PASGR) in September 2016. It draws on a separate document produced by Nicholas Awortwi; on reflections from a two-day international seminar on participation and social accountability co-convened by CEP, the DFID-funded Citizen Engagement Programme, N'weti Health Communication and IDS; and on discussions with DFID Maputo and leading Mozambican researchers and civil society activists in early October 2016.

2: Context

2.1: National political context

Formally, Mozambique is a democratic republic with a multi-party system. In reality, there is the dominance of a single political party (Frelimo - *Frente de Libertação de Moçambique*, Mozambican Liberation Front), the ascendancy of the party over state institutions and of the executive over the judiciary and the legislative, weak democratic institutions, politicisation of electoral and state bodies, weak opposition parties¹ and lack of social accountability. While Frelimo continues to enjoy considerable influence as a political and economic force, the events associated with the selection of Frelimo's presidential candidate for the 2014 elections revealed internal fissures within the party, challenging assumptions of cohesion and homogenous loyalty to the president. Fairbairn (2011) and Buur et al. (2011) had already identified factions within Frelimo pointing out their differentiated policy orientations.

In October 2014, Mozambique held its fifth presidential elections amidst a political climate characterised by increased distrust and deterioration of dialogue between Frelimo (in power for the past 40 years) and Renamo which led to localised military action that is increasingly looking like a civil war. On 15 January 2015, Filipe Jacinto Nyusi was sworn in as Mozambique's new President amid controversy surrounding the election results and doubts about Nyusi's autonomy, in relation to the outgoing president (Armando Emílio Guebuza). Renamo who won the elections for provincial assemblies in some provinces, refused to accept the results of the 2014 elections, alleging irregularities and fraud. In protest, it boycotted the inaugural seating of the National Assembly

¹ Although previous pre- and post-election periods have also shown the increasing mobilisation capacity of the opposition party (Renamo - *Resistência Nacional de Moçambique*, Mozambican National Resistance) and its ability to attract large crowds to its gatherings, particularly in the Central and Northern regions of the country.

where Frelimo retained the majority - 144 of the 250 seats; none of Renamo's 89 members of parliament took part in the swearing in ceremony.

At the time, it was uncertain how the election of the new President and the appointment of a new government and parliament would affect state-society relations, and many feared that the space for civil society, already reduced during President Guebuza's two previous mandates, would shrink further. Initially, Nyusi seemed open to dialogue with civil society organisations when he met with them a couple of months after being sworn in. However, many feel that he is not willing to, or cannot, listen and see him as Guebuza's puppet. Relatedly, control and repression of civil society voices have increased during his mandate, including the use of police and military forces to dissuade people from taking part in street protests.

Also, although civil society organisations (CSOs), particularly religious ones (the Protestant-dominated Mozambican Christian Council and the Catholic Church), played a critical role in the peace process which culminated in the peace agreement in 1992 and reconciliation, they and other political parties have been excluded from ongoing peace negotiations between Frelimo and Renamo. Civil society organisations have voiced the need for peace, including through marches and are demanding their inclusion in the negotiations.

In 2015 the existence of a 'secret loan' contracted by the previous government was revealed, followed in 2016 by the uncovering of two further substantial loans which had not been disclosed to the Mozambican Parliament and the International Monetary Fund (IMF). This has forced first the IMF and the World Bank and then Britain, Canada, the European Union, France and the African Development Bank to suspend aid to Mozambique. The IMF and CSOs (through the Budget Monitoring Forum) have demanded that the government allow an independent international audit of the companies involved in the secret loans scandal. The audit is currently taking place.

2.2: Local contexts: urbanisation and political decentralisation²

The 2013 elections saw a major political shift at the municipal level, with the opposition party MDM (*Movimento Democrático de Moçambique*, Mozambique Democratic Movement) winning control of Nampula, consolidating its hold on Beira and Quelimane and mounting a strong challenge to the dominant Frelimo in Maputo. The risks of being perceived to favour the opposition have grown after Renamo's controversial proposals for "autonomous" provincial governments in the regions where it won the largest share of the votes in 2014, as championing decentralisation is increasingly perceived as an opposition agenda.

The policy context has also changed significantly since 2012, with the creation of a raft of new municipalities shifting the overall balance towards smaller, poorer and more rural settlements with a more entrenched tradition of top-down governance. This raises further challenges for the government's gradualist approach to decentralisation. This approach has been criticised by some of the municipal governments, who are frustrated that personnel and resources for services such as health and education that are due to be devolved to the municipal level have not been transferred. At the start of President Nyusi's mandate in early 2015 there was a government reorganisation that led to a merger of the ministry responsible for municipal development policy with the civil service ministry, bringing tensions over the transfer of central government personnel to municipal governments inside the department.

The donor community and Mozambican civil society are increasingly turning their attention towards the municipalities. Thanks to a growing number of programmes supported by European donors and

² This section cites the context analysis section from the 'IDS Mid-Term Review of the DFID-funded DIÁLOGO Democratic Governance Support Programme', 2016.

multilateral agencies, and to the work of civil society actors such as the Civil Society Support Mechanism (now the MASC Foundation, which has decided to allocate 30 per cent of its future support to work on urban governance) and the Centre for Public Integrity (CIP), a very low base of local CSO capacity to engage on municipal governance issues, identified in 2012, has begun to grow significantly. This opens up a much broader range of potential collaborations, but also increases the risk of unhelpful competition.

Broader socioeconomic and demographic changes are increasing the volatility of urban Mozambique. These changes include the acceleration of rural-urban migration (particularly in the “growth-pole” cities of Mozambique’s extractive economy, such as Tete and Nampula) and the rapidly-growing number of under-employed young men and women with higher levels of education, greater access to communications technologies and more critical attitudes to authority than previous cohorts. Increased flows of foreign direct investment and the emergence of a small but growing urban middle class have intensified pressure on urban land and changed the geography of many of Mozambique’s principal cities. New industrial districts and ‘expansion zones’ for middle-class housing have emerged alongside and sometimes displaced marginalised peri-urban neighbourhoods. As a result, tensions over inequality (which has risen steeply in the country as a whole in recent years) have become particularly sharp in urban areas. This, along with the current steep economic downturn, which combines a contraction in key employment-generating sectors such as construction with a rapid rise in prices linked to the devaluation of Mozambique’s currency, may create conditions similar to those that saw widespread urban unrest over food and fuel price increases in 2008 and 2010.

2.3: Economic context

Gender, income and wealth inequalities; poor coverage of the formal education system and resulting high illiteracy rates; and lack of access to public institutions and services constitute important barriers to the exercise of the civil, political, social and economic rights recognised by the Mozambican constitution (OSISA 2009:6). The country’s economic growth (7 per cent GDP growth rates in the last 10 years) has not been translated into safer livelihoods and improved quality of life for the majority of the population. Despite a reduction in absolute poverty rates (from 69.4 per cent in 1996/7 to 54.7 per cent in 2002/03), shown in national poverty assessments, the majority of the Mozambican population continues to live below the poverty line. Poverty rates have not reduced between 2003 and 2007/08 (MPD 2010). Besides, there are significant regional and gender differences: poverty rates are higher in the central regions of the country (59.7 per cent) and rural areas (56.9 per cent), and it has a female face, with female-headed households figuring amongst the poorest (CMI 2008). While many of the conditions above outlined are the effect of a history of colonial exploitation, civil war and natural disasters, they are also a reflection of inadequate policy choices. For instance, even though subsistence agriculture is the main source of livelihoods for the majority of the Mozambican population, the focus of macroeconomic policies in the agricultural sector on the rapid expansion of agricultural land area has marginalised smallholder subsistence agriculture.

Castel-Branco (2010) argues that the lack of translation of economic growth on the reduction of poverty rates is related to the extractive character of the economic development model adopted by Mozambique, based on large-scale foreign investments focused on the extraction of natural resources (land, forestry, minerals and energy). Mozambique’s “mining boom” and the recent discovery (in 2010 and 2012) of large deposits of exploitable gas in the Rovuma Basin, off the coast of Cabo Delgado province, is expected to increase foreign direct investments over the next years exponentially. The impacts of these investments on Mozambicans’ livelihoods are yet to be seen and many fear that these discoveries may only benefit political elites, increase social inequalities and exacerbate social and political cleavages as the centralisation of party-state control over the economy and political-business alliances are strengthened (Wittmeyer 2012; Chichava 2013; ILPC

2013). Many see the reduction of space for civil society as related to the interest of political elites to derive personal gains from the economic deals with companies operating in the extractive industries sector, an area which has been increasingly scrutinised by CSOs. While a growing number of organisations has been actively engaged in advocating for economic policies more responsive to the needs of the Mozambican population, the majority is ill-equipped to perform this role.

2.4: *Basic rights and freedoms*

The political, economic and social changes Mozambique has been experiencing have had considerable implications for civil, political and economic rights. The rights granted by the Mozambican Constitution (1990 and 2004) which offer the foundation for the exercise of citizenship, including multi-party democracy, gender equality, and freedom of association, expression and press have been threatened by attempts to reduce the space for civil society and restrict people's civil liberties and political rights. The gap between a relatively progressive legal and policy framework, the practice of public institutions and people's living conditions is also widening.

Cultural arguments are often deployed to legitimise the infringement of civil liberties and associational rights³ while political rhetoric is used for intimidation and vilification of increasingly assertive and vocal civil society actors in attempts to silence voices that challenge the status quo. The list of people murdered for exposing or challenging the interests of political elites is growing – it includes journalist Carlos Cardoso, economist and banker Antonio Siba-Siba Macuacua, the Director of Investigation, Audits and Intelligence of the Mozambican Customs Service, Orlando José, and constitutional lawyer Giles Sistac. The number of people assaulted, threatened and imprisoned is also increasing. In May 2016, José Jaime Macuane, political analyst, professor at Eduardo Mondlane University, and 'Pontos de Vista' (Points of view) commentator on the independent STV channel was kidnapped, shot and seriously injured. Marches organised by civil society organisations have been accompanied by heavily armed *Força de Intervenção Rápida*, anti-riot police.

There is a vibrant and independent media, vibrant but increasingly under pressure. While the number and importance of community radio stations⁴ including local-language programming have grown in recent years, particularly in rural areas, many independent radio stations have also been closed. Community radio stations are mainly funded through donor projects to disseminate messages around programmatic themes. They often disseminate ready-made messages covering various themes from sanitation to gender-based violence but there are also partnerships in which the radio stations have more autonomy in content-design (Junior and Amadeu 2014).

While there is documented evidence on the importance of the internet, social media and mobile phones for social mobilisation and service delivery, there is less information about their use for cyber/digital activism. Mare (2014) discusses the use of social media in the 10 September 2010 food riots, specifically the mobilising power of the Short Message Service (SMS) used to mobilise people to the streets, Facebook to circulate information about the riots as they happened, while YouTube was mainly used by journalists and activists to disseminate images of police repression. Whether the use of SMS for mobilisation purposes was preceded by debates in social networks remains unclear, although the IESE & IDS (2014) claims that this has been the case. There is, however, evidence of post-protests debates.

³ Particularly women and sexual minorities' rights, based on claims that these are Western cultural exports with no resonance in local culture.

⁴ Some of the radio stations are managed by the state, but a growing number is coordinated by FORCOM, the National Forum of Community Radios, established in 2004. They have been established by UNESCO, the Institute of Social Communication, NGOs, as well as Catholic and Protestant churches (Alves 2005). Some community radio stations were established under governance and accountability programmes.

Access to Facebook continues to be limited but has increased in the last couple of years with an agreement between Facebook and Mcel, the state-owned Mozambican mobile company, for the provision of a free Facebook platform for its users. Facebook and Twitter accounts as well as blogs of academic, journalists and political commentators are attracting growing attention in the capital city and generating public debate about a variety of contentious issues. When the university lecturer José Jaime Macuane denounced, on his Facebook page, the illegality⁵ of the gift (a Mercedes Benz S350) the President of the Republic had received from the Confederation of Economic Associations (CTA), besides making the headlines of various newspapers the issue was also discussed in non-virtual spaces throughout the country. Three days later the President returned the gift to CTA. The growing importance of the use of social media is also reflected in the fact that government institutions and Frelimo have also created accounts on social networks such as Twitter, Facebook, Instagram and WhatsApp, and that pro-regime journalists and academics are increasingly using social media to disseminate their views.

3: Definitions of key terms

Mozambique's official language is Portuguese, but 80 per cent of the population also speak other languages, and in most rural areas local languages are the primary means of communication. Some interviewees mentioned the lack of widely-understood translations of key concepts such as 'empowerment' and 'accountability', as well as notions of 'rights' that are not inextricably linked with 'responsibilities'. The influence of aid donors and international NGOs has ensured that formal civil society organisations and government bodies make extensive use of the English terms 'empowerment' and 'accountability' and/or their transliterated equivalents 'empoderamento' and 'responsabilização'. However, the meanings attributed to these terms vary widely.

For example, the dominant use of 'empoderamento' by policymakers linked to the ruling party, Frelimo, is in relation to economic empowerment (particularly via small business development). Among many civil society interviewees, by contrast, 'empoderamento' was primarily linked to the issue of rights awareness and access to information, as well as to concepts of (urban) modernity and escape from the constraints of traditional norms. One interviewee referred specifically to empowerment as the development of capacities to engage in political dialogue and demand accountability from government. The term 'empoderamento' is also used to describe civil society capacity development processes supported by INGOs and donor programmes, in areas ranging from financial management skills to policy influence.

The commonest use of accountability language among civil society actors is 'responsabilização social', which refers specifically to social accountability initiatives such as community scorecards and social audits (also referred to as 'monitoria social' or 'social monitoring'). However, the term 'responsabilização' ('holding someone responsible') is associated with notions of blame and sanction, and for that reason is sometimes avoided by accountability practitioners seeking a less confrontational approach. As an alternative, the term 'prestação de contas' ('giving an account' or 'presenting accounts') is often used in relation to government service delivery. Within the government, this use is primarily in the context of upwards accountability within highly hierarchical political and administrative systems. Notions of mutual accountability (whether between government and donors or different branches of government) are normally described in terms of 'coordination' or 'alignment'.

The well-established practice of visits by senior officials to different localities known as 'Open Presidencies' have the appearance of an accountability institution, but in practice they are highly choreographed with extremely limited opportunities for unscripted questioning. The practice

⁵ According to the Public Probity Law.

contains echoes of the visits made by revered independence leader Samora Machel that were understood to reflect his concern with listening to the people, but no longer have the emphasis that he placed on listening to popular concerns (including his interest in hearing the jokes that were made about him by local people).

Political action in the terms used by the A4EA programme proposal – i.e. “collective action undertaken by groups (or a network of groups) for change in public policies and governance arrangements” – is rarely described in these terms in Mozambique. This may be due to the risk of confusion with party-political action, as well as the use of the term ‘política’ to refer both to the practice of politics and to public policy.

In relation to political action the most commonly-used term is ‘mobilisation’, but this is understood as something practised above all by the ruling party and government agencies (following a long history of party-directed collective action dating back to the independence struggle and Socialist period). Similarly, ‘social action’ is understood to refer to the top-down promotion of social welfare by the government or religious mobilisation, not to bottom-up social mobilisation.

The key term used in relation to social action is ‘o povo’, or ‘the people’, which has clear echoes of Socialist-period Frelimo rhetoric but is increasingly used by activists, in particular to convey the notion of shared experience of unjust suffering. The notion of ‘civic action’ is limited to the promotion (usually by political authorities) of ‘civilised’ citizen behaviour in relation to public infrastructure, etc. (such as the organisation of community road-sweeping and waste-picking groups). Civil society-led mobilisation, whether in relation to marches organised on social media or to preparation of collective advocacy documents, is generally referred to as ‘organised action’.

In recent years there has been an increase in the tendency of civil society representatives to describe themselves as ‘activistas’ (‘activists’), a term that is associated with social movement building. CSOs are increasingly likely to refer to themselves as associated with social movements, a trend that some observers have linked to increasingly frequent exchanges between Brazilian and Mozambican civil society groups and to the high level of contact with transnational social movement organisations, such as the World March of Women and Via Campesina, both of which have strong links with Mozambique.

4: Existing forms of social and political action

As noted above, most opportunities for citizen-government dialogue are highly controlled and choreographed. IDS research carried out in five of Mozambique’s most important cities in 2015 showed that even where civil society and independent media were relatively active, by far the most commonly-used strategy for seeking to address locally important issues was to submit a formal request to the party-appointed neighbourhood secretaries, and to wait for an eventual response from further up the chain of command.⁶

Numerous efforts to establish citizen and service user complaint mechanisms have failed to obtain widespread social legitimacy. In general, individual citizens who complain directly to public officials are seen as arrogant, since demanding one’s rights tends to be seen as a marker of social, political and economic status, not of speaking on behalf of others. The ‘complaints and suggestion boxes’ that local government offices are required to install are rarely used, although there is a need for further research on the reasons for this, which may vary from low levels of literacy to fear of reprisals. Instead of these formal mechanisms, the public voicing of complaints usually takes place

⁶ See IDS (2015) Diálogo MTR Report.

among citizens in different informal spaces, including markets and public transport. In recent years, citizens – in particular youth, but also women – have become notably more outspoken in these spaces, despite the risk of being reported by the extensive network of secret police agents and informers.

In recent years political campaigns have also seen a higher degree of explicit demands for accountability, particularly in relation to electoral promises, made by citizens during canvassing. There is also anecdotal evidence of an increase in spontaneously-organised citizen vigilance initiatives such as staying outside the polling stations from the beginning to end of vote count to avoid electoral fraud, in addition to those promoted by political parties and donor-funded initiatives such as the Election Observatory, which express growing citizen mistrust in electoral administration bodies. On the eve of the 2013 presidential elections a new clandestine newspaper called 'Cidadão Atento', Vigilant Citizen was launched and shared through the blog 'Moçambique para Todos', Mozambique for All. The cover had an iconic image of a protester in march with a poster asking "who keeps voting for these guys?".

In addition to an increased focus on empowerment and accountability within key sectors such as health and education, the economic and political trends described in Section 2 have led to an increasing civil society focus on some key areas: budget transparency and monitoring (FMO), especially since the revelation of the 'secret loans'; decentralisation and local governance; extractives, megaprojects (including transparency of contracts); land rights and land-grabbing and; economic empowerment, in particular of women and girls. In the remainder of this section, we review the different forms of social and political action along a spectrum from the most formal and institutionalised to the less visible and more 'unruly' forms.

4.1: *Formal policy advocacy and institutionalised dialogue*

- The Development Observatories are a space created by the government but result from civil society demand. These forums meet twice a year and the agenda is set by the government, usually without the participation of CSOs. The selection of the civil society representatives is carried out by CSOs in coordination with the government. The Development Observatories focused on monitoring the implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), but the last strategy expired in 2014. Ineffectiveness of the Development Observatories as well as their co-option by the government has been documented, leading to a decline in credibility and they are now on the way out.
- CSOs are increasingly investing in building and working through CSO's networks and platforms, both sectorally based, as in the health and education sectors (PLASOC – *Plataforma da Sociedade Civil de Chimoio*, Chimoio Civil Society Platform and MEPT- *Movimento de Educação para Todos*, Movement for Education for All respectively) – and geographically based, at the provincial or district levels. CSO platforms and thematic networks are an essential mechanism for dialogue with the government, since the latter has a preference for interacting with groups rather than individual CSOs. For many years, the government has used the division and lack of consensus among CSOs to delegitimise the claims made by individual CSOs arguing that they represent minority voices. While in the past the reasons for establishing networks and platforms were associated with attempts to improve their legitimacy and coordination, currently joint action and protection against individual backlash have been emphasised. Affiliation to platforms and networks has also been adopted by CSOs addressing socio-culturally sensitive issues (such as sexual minorities' rights) as a strategy to mobilise support from within civil society. CSOs platforms and networks are also perceived as an effective way of capitalising on the strengths of different CSOs and of providing space and visibility for smaller CBOs in policy making processes.
- Very few CSOs engage in policy influencing. For the majority of those who do, policy influencing has emerged organically from their service delivery interventions and a

combination of exposure to domestic policy-making spaces, participation in regional and international meetings and trainings, and monitoring the implementation of conventions and declarations approved at those levels, through the production and submission of shadow reports to United Nations bodies and regional intergovernmental bodies. Although many have included lobby and advocacy work in their strategic and organisational development plans, and many have delivered advocacy training to others, policy influencing is still a relatively new area for most them. These CSOs are in the process of clarifying their views and approaches to policy influencing and of identifying adequate indicators to monitor their work in this area.

- Evidence-based influencing and use of civil society research by government. Some NGOs have a strong research component which includes investigative journalism (CIP), formative research (N'weti) and academic research (IESE – *Instituto de Estudos Sociais e Económicos*, Institute of Social and Economic Studies and WLSA – Women and Law in Southern Africa). Although not systematically, other CSOs also commission studies to support their work. It is noteworthy that CSOs have increased technical expertise in some areas, particularly when compared to some government institutions, granting them significant legitimacy in policy making processes. This is manifested in invitations received by CSOs to present their research findings at government events as well as to provide training to government institutions in various areas. While in-country research capacity is increasing there are few independent research-oriented CSOs and the majority of those who stimulate policy debate are based in Maputo. Moreover, the institutional links between academia and CSOs are nearly non-existent, in spite of individual university researchers being often hired to conduct research on, with and for CSOs, on a consultancy basis.
- Reporting of policy influencing, lobby and advocacy activities in CSO's annual reports and other documents is poor affecting the scope for learning and creation of institutional and collective memory (Taela 2014). Thus, organisations are looking for ways of better systematising and communicating their work including through production of case studies describing their experiences and results and dissemination through newsletters, websites and public events and experimenting with "reporting for learning". Some organisations such as N'weti, WLSA and CIP have invested significantly in this area and play a key role in the development of communication products targeting decision makers. Some governance and accountability programmes such as Diálogo, MASC and AGIR have provided practical training to its partners on how to use social media (Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and WhatsApp) in advocacy work.

4.2: *Legal activism and campaigns for changes in legislation*

CSOs have actively lobbied for participation in legislation drafting processes and have successfully proposed and advocated for approval of new legislation. Some examples include: The 1997 Land Law; the 2008 Law on Rights of Workers in Domestic Service; the 2009 Domestic Violence against Women law; the decriminalisation of abortion in 2014; and the 2015 Right to Information Law. They have adopted a number of strategies from more public visibility to generate public support to more "silent campaigning" depending on the cultural and political sensitivity of the topic. CSO platforms and thematic networks have been instrumental in dialogue with the government and parliament as the latter have preference for interacting with groups rather than individual CSOs. Besides campaigning for the revision and/or approval of new legislation, CSOs have been engaged in the production and dissemination of simplified versions of these documents in order to increase citizens' knowledge and utilisation. Another important component of their work has to do with monitoring the implementation of new legislation through, amongst others, the provision of technical advice to

public institutions, monitoring provision of related services as well as the production and submission of shadow reports to international and regional organisations⁷.

⁷ Such as the production of a shadow report on the stage of implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) and its submission to CEDAW Committee.

4.3: *Emerging repertoires of action by established civil society actors*

CSOs have historically been reluctant to engage in and promote activities with an activist edge, but have fewer reservations in relation to public communications and education campaigns. Marches and demonstrations are more visible and tend to be received as a direct “attack” to state institutions, while public communications and campaigns to raise awareness are directed to the general public. The word campaign is very present in the intervention jargon of CSOs, often used indiscriminately and covering a wide spectrum of issues, levels of interventions, and aims. To illustrate, the aims of campaigns range from influencing individuals’ behaviour change in relation to sexual and reproductive health or community tolerance to gender-based violence to the integration of an issue in a policy or strategic planning document. Despite a preference for non-confrontational interaction, the use of advocacy interventions to apply pressure has significantly intensified. This includes the adoption of marches, normally in the context of broader advocacy campaigns (e.g. civil society platforms, Human Rights League, Parlamento Juvenil), a more explicitly critical discourse of denunciation (ADECRU – *Associação Académica para o Desenvolvimento das Comunidades Rurais*, Academic Association for the Development of Rural Communities in relation to Tete, Prosavana) and the use of naming and shaming by some organisations (such as *Centro de Integridade Pública*, Centre for Public Integrity and *Forum Mulher*, Women’s Forum).

- Example: An informal initiative promoted by Forum Mulher, a Mozambican feminist network, the World March of Women, a transnational feminist movement, and *Loucas de Pedra Lilás*, a Brazilian feminist group - to contest and protest against the Ministry of Education’s decision to oblige secondary school girls to wear ankle-length skirts (as a measure to prevent sexual harassment in schools) through public action and confrontation was repressed by the Mozambican police before even starting, Mozambican and Brazilian feminists were detained, and a Spanish feminist who had been living and working in Mozambique for more than four years was deported to Spain ten days after the incident.

4.4: *Unruly and/or unrecognised expressions of social and political action in Mozambique*

There is an “invisible” majority of the Mozambican population that is not represented in any of the mainstream policy spaces (invited and claimed). The “invisible” majority includes self-help groups active at the community level as well as non-institutionalised protestors, such as the returnees from the former German Democratic Republic and the groups involved in recent riots (FDC 2007; ITAD & COWI 2012). Ilal et al. call attention to the importance of considering these forms of civil society arguing that ‘if we focus on meetings in the capital between elements of “recognised” civil society we miss out on traditional forms of neighbourhood associations, spontaneous campaigns, self-help networks, and all the other original ways - some traditional, some modern - through which people organise when they do not feel represented by the political system’ (2014: 7). Below we identify some issues that have been identified in the literature and raised by the interviewees.

- Armed insurgency – not discussed here as it is the focus of an ongoing DFID Joint Analysis of Conflict and Stability (JACS)
- The political-economic dynamics associated with the rising cost of living and attempts to increase fuel/transport costs in 2008, of bread and other basic products in 2010, and again of transport in 2012 have stirred popular protests in Mozambique. A study conducted by IESE & IDS (2014) notes that unemployment, poverty and inequalities in combination with ‘the blocking or non-existence of mechanisms for dialogue between citizens and the government authorities’ contributed to the adoption of violent forms of protest to express discontent. The popular protests brought forth important issues about the relations between professionalised and donor-oriented civil society and citizens and between the state and citizens. The report underlines the inability of CSOs to engage with the food question and how they have distanced themselves from the popular protests.

- Faith-based organisations play a key role (including in peace-making at national, local and domestic levels) (Jacobs and Van De Kamp 2014). At the local level, religious and spiritual leaders are more influential than politicians or NGOs. The last population census (INE 2007) indicates that 28 per cent of the population in Mozambique is Catholic, 18 per cent is Zion⁸, 11 per cent is Protestant, Pentecostal or Evangelical, 18 per cent is Muslim and 18 per cent reported not having a religion. There is, however, a significant proportion of the Mozambican population that follows animists' beliefs and practices, but this category has not been included in the census. The influence of Evangelic, Apostolic and Pentecostal churches has grown significantly in the last 15 years. An area of research that has been neglected is the role of churches in mobilising church goers for political action, from campaigning for political parties to encouraging them to vote. Relatedly, whilst several faith-based organisations have been involved in social development (HIV prevention, care work and education and literacy) little is known about their engagement in social accountability.
- The overlap between traditional, civil and political society as well as forms of social and political action in rural areas have been neglected. However, the literature review and interviewees highlighted the need for better understanding of them. This has been motivated amongst others by findings from studies which claim that phenomena such as witchcraft accusations (Kleibl and Munck 2016), lynching (Serra 2008) or opposition to public health campaigns (Serra 2008) constitute forms of political language and practice. Drawing on their research in rural Zambézia, Kleibl and Munck suggest that witchcraft accusations are 'a form of community-owned problem-articulation and -solving strategy' (2016: 7) particularly by individual and collective actors that are not part of any church or government group. According to Kleibl and Munck, this constitutes part of 'their own responses to their precarious economic situation and livelihood/survival issues ranging from witchcraft and magic to violent protest and (apparently widely accepted) crime' (ibid). Jacobs and Van De Kamp on the other hand point out that 'fears of witchcraft and evil spirits constitute a major concern in people's daily lives in contemporary Mozambique' (2014: 200) arguing that 'people often join the AICs [African Independent Churches] and Pentecostal churches to seek solutions to conflicts and afflictions provoked by witchcraft and various evil spirits' (ibid).
- Music and theatre as forms of political commentary – disguised and direct. This is particularly important in a context of increased repression and dominance of an authoritarian discourse. Examples include the work of the Mozambican rapper Azagaya who sings about social and political issues in Mozambique often 'crossing the red light', by talking about controversial issues and confronting the government. Other examples include the contrast between how the performance of the government is celebrated by the national dance company and satirised by the theatre company Ngungu.

⁸ Zionism is the third largest African Independent Church (AICs); these were originally formed as secessions from mission churches or were founded by Africans for Africans (Jacobs and Van De Kamp 2014).

5: External actors

Mozambique's aid dependency has shaped both policy influencing processes as well as the mushrooming of empowerment and accountability initiatives. Donors have influenced government-civil society relations as well as civil society interventions. However, many believe that donors' influence is likely to reduce as aid dependency declines and their interests become more commercial, as evidenced in policy shifts 'from aid to trade'. Relevant issues pertaining to donors' role include:

- Links between aid dependency and empowerment and accountability work are of particular relevance in the current context of tension between donors and the Mozambican government over 'secret loans'.
- Financing and shifts towards strategic and basket funding for key CSOs, although most resources are still projectised and linked to service delivery activities. However, the lack of coordination of donor support to CSOs policy influencing work prevents an accurate assessment of what has been done and the gaps; CSOs themselves are unable to present an overall picture of the support they have received in this area.
- Commissioning research and supporting independent research institutes such as IESE, WLSA and OMR - *Observatório do Meio Rural*, Rural Observatory. For instance, research is part of the actions identified by the European Union Road Map on Engaging with Civil Society, such as a study on the conceptualisation of civil society in Mozambique to be commissioned by Ireland, as well as support to the production and dissemination of relevant analysis by research centres, think tanks and universities (under the responsibility of Austria, Germany, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, Ireland, Switzerland, and UK (Topsøe-Jensen et al. 2015: 5).
- Facilitating civil society access to some policy spaces, such as strategic planning processes, joint annual reviews and development observatories.
- Donors increasingly open in expressions of support for CSO activities, adding political statements to material support, which has included hosting CSO events in their embassies.
- INGOs who have acted as intermediaries between donors and Mozambican organisations and have been involved in capacity-building, alliance-building and development of platforms, through programmes such as AGIR – *Acções para uma Governação Inclusiva e Responsável*, Actions for Responsive and Inclusive Governance.

Key donors active in the field of empowerment and accountability include: DFID, SDC, Sida, Irish Aid, USAID and DANIDA. Examples of key donor-funded empowerment and accountability programmes:

- AGIR is a programme funded by Sweden, Denmark and the Netherlands aimed at strengthening the capacity of local CSOs to influence in development processes and demand accountability and respect for human rights of power-holders. AGIR is implemented by 58 local CSOs through partnerships with four international intermediate NGOs (Diakonia, Ibis, Oxfam Novib, and We Effect). AGIR has entered into its second phase which will cover the period 2015-2020⁹.
- Citizen Engagement Programme, *Cidadania e Participação* (CEP), is a five-year (2012-2017) social accountability programme funded by DFID, Irish Aid and Danida, implemented in four provinces. The purpose of this programme is to increase citizen influence on the quality of health and education service delivery. The programme supports citizens to monitor the quality of health and education service delivery in four provinces (Gaza, Nampula, Manica and Zambézia) as well as to advocate for the improvement of the quality of those services at the district, provincial and national levels.

⁹ The first phase was from 2010 to 2014.

- Civil Society Support Mechanism *Mecanismo de Apoio a Sociedade Civil* (MASC) is a five-year programme (2007-2012 later extended to 2015) managed by COWI and funded by DFID and Irish AID aimed at strengthening CSOs' engagement in governance monitoring and advocacy. The programme provides funds and technical support for monitoring and advocacy activities as well as to improve organisational capacity, including internal governance.
- Democratic Governance Support Programme *Diálogo Local para Boa Governação* (known as DIÁLOGO) is a five-year programme (2012-2017) that aims at improving governance and accountability for Mozambican citizens in targeted urban municipalities (in Beira, Maputo, Nampula, Quelimane, and Tete) and sectors. The programme fosters dialogue, consultation and consensus-building through provision of funds to municipalities, CSOs and non-state media; it has a strong component of support to civic engagement and media strengthening. The programme is financed by DFID and managed by Development Alternatives, Inc (DAI) in partnership with COWI.
- LIGADA is a six-year (2015-2021) DFID-funded urban girls and young women's economic empowerment programme, through improving recruitment and retention in secure, well-paid jobs and provision of better access to markets. LIGADA is one of the few programmes that links economic empowerment and accountability, with a focus on improvements in policy, programmes and interventions with regards to gender. The programme consortium is managed by Oxford Policy Management (OPM).

DFID is one of the most important players in this field, and is working on the design of new initiatives in Mozambique. During the scoping discussions, DFID Maputo advisors emphasised the potential value of A4EA research in guiding the development of new initiatives. UN agencies, such as UNFPA, UNDP and UN women have also supported empowerment and accountability initiatives with a strong focus on the former. These have a focus on women's participation and leadership in decision-making, economic empowerment for the poorest and most excluded, including women farmers, improving the policy framework on gender-based violence and use of existing services, fostering women's leadership in peace, security and humanitarian response, promotion of institutional accountability to gender equality commitments through support to and engagement with national planning and budgeting processes.

The presence of rising powers such as Brazil, China and South Africa who provide investment, loans and technical assistance under the framework of South-South cooperation and triangular cooperation without the conditionalities imposed by OECD-DAC donors are also thought to be contributing to shifting relationships with traditional donors (Chichava 2012). It is not clear what the position of emerging donors on support to civil society is. Two issues are certain a) CSOs from rising powers, particularly Brazil have played an important role in South-South cooperation as part of initiatives supported by their home governments, and by multilateral and bilateral international development agencies (Taela 2011); b) the engagements of these donors with Mozambique and other countries, particularly in the extractive sector, has sparked protests and transnational solidarity movements (such as the World March of Women and Via Campesina) some of which focus on building the social mobilisation (with a strong component of political training) and policy influencing capacity of Mozambican CSOs. For instance, collaboration between members of Via Campesina, Brazil's Landless Rural Workers Movement (MST) and Mozambican National Farmers Union (UNAC) has increased considerably in the last years and has centred on opposition to land grabbing for agribusiness and the highly controversial Prosavana programme (Shankland and Gonçalves 2016). A distinctive element of these collaborations is their focus on building social movements (e.g. women, farmer and trade unions).

6: Emerging research themes

In this section we summarise research related recommendations from interviews and studies conducted in the Mozambican context.

Recommendations from recent studies

- Facilitate the establishment of partnerships between CSOs and research institutions and universities, with the aim of increasing the analytical and practical capacity of both parties (action research) (Topsøe-Jensen et al. 2015, commissioned by the European Union).
- Support to CSOs should follow established best practices and the recommendations on harmonisation and alignment expressed in various studies (Topsøe-Jensen et al. 2015, commissioned by the European Union).

While interviewees pointed out the need for improving the capacity of research-based NGOs, it also became clear that more partnerships should be forged between CSOs and research institutions. Nevertheless, the interviewees think that the focus of these collaborations must be on learning and co-construction from programmatic experiences rather than having these organisations conducting research themselves or attempting to build their research capacity as this could distract them. Below we identify the four broad thematic areas of interest.

6.1: Social and political action on governance and transparency

In the current context, transparency and anti-corruption issues have become a key focus of social and political action. This is linked to growing popular anger at economic inequality and the contrast between the ostentatious consumption patterns of the elite and the increasingly difficult living conditions of the majority, whose purchasing power is rapidly being eroded by unemployment and inflation.

6.2: Strengthening CSO's representativeness and accountability

There is an ongoing debate on the legitimacy of CSOs focused on: a) the extent to which an organisation needs to have a constituency in order to engage in lobby and advocacy; b) whether legitimacy to intervene in policy making processes should be exclusively drawn from CSOs' social basis and if the causes they defend can be the very source of their legitimacy. This is significant given that the majority of CSOs do not have a constituency and lack mechanisms to meaningfully involve targeted groups in decision-making, even though their theories of change attach greater significance to social mobilisation. Public opinion has been mobilised through collaboration with organisations working in social communication and media (including community radio stations) who disseminate information, convene radio and television debates on policy issues and invite CSO representatives, conduct investigative journalism and write/publish relevant pieces. However, little is known about how these forms of mobilisation are perceived by the public.

6.3: Citizens' perceptions of key actors for social and political action

There is a growing need for better understanding of citizens' perceptions of CSOs and social and political action actors and their initiatives more generally. The series of studies carried out by IDS and partners since 2009, IESE's 'municipal barometer' initiative to track citizen perceptions of corruption, service quality and government responsiveness at the local level, building on previous studies in smaller towns, and the recent IESE-IDS collaboration on the design of the Diálogo Mid-Term Review survey instrument provide a good starting point for investigating citizens' perceptions of key actors for social and political action.

6.4: Cultures of contestation

Allied to the need for exploring the potential of unrecognised forms of social and political action in fostering empowerment and accountability is the use of culture and artistic forms of expression by citizens to communicate discontent. While some artists (in)directly engage in contestation, little is known about citizens' views on them, the level of political permissiveness and repression of particular forms of expression or their link with CSOs repertoires and the potential of these forms in supporting citizen mobilisation. An area of interest is what conceptualisations of accountability are articulated through music, theatre, comedy, satire, cartoons and dance.

7: Research methods and modalities

7.1: Possible research approach

There is a clear demand for primary research that is not exclusively operational in nature. Some of the interviewees underlined the need for asking broader research questions that are not necessarily tied to programme implementation but capture some of the underlying issues shaping voice, empowerment and accountability dynamics as well as broader changes under way in Mozambican politics and society. This demand can be catalysed by providing opportunities for collaborative learning on research strategies and methodologies. However, there is also a clear case for a research strategy that contributes to DFID's new initiatives, whether in terms of intervention design or of monitoring and impact assessment.

7.2: Potential partners

For each of the four key areas highlighted above, we propose a specific modality and set of partners. For the research on **social and political action on governance and transparency**, we recommend an action-reflection process led by key organisations in the field such as the Centre for Public Integrity (CIP).

For the research on **strengthening CSOs' representativeness and accountability**, we propose an action learning set approach carried out in partnership with key civil society groups. Some of the most interesting groups to work with are NGOs linked to the feminist and peasant movements, such as Fórum Mulher and UNAC. It would also be very interesting to work with trade unions, especially those representing informal sector and domestic workers.

For the research on **citizens' perceptions of key actors for social and political action** the ideal scenario would be a partnership with IESE to complement the proposed Municipal Barometer study with qualitative and participatory components. This could also be designed to support a theory of change based approach to impact assessment for DFID Mozambique's new accountability initiatives, using the approach already piloted in the Diálogo baseline and MTR surveys.

For the research on **cultures of contestation**, an ethnographic approach should be used to explore other voices and forms of expression not usually captured by civil society consultation exercises or public opinion surveys. The independent anthropology research organisation Kaleidoscópio is already conducting ethnographic research on musical expressions of political discontent, and would be an ideal partner for work in this field.

We also propose that the programme's work in Mozambique should include support for the formation of a community of practice in research on social and political action for empowerment and accountability, connecting up core research partners with one another to explore areas of thematic and methodological complementarity and with other interested academic and civil society actors.

7.3: Research Uptake

The scoping study revealed the need for a flexible research uptake approach that takes into account not only the research theme and questions but also key moments in the organisational and programmatic cycle of local partners as well as of the organisations we intend to influence. Thus, it will be critical to take advantage of key planning and review moments as well as identify public events and communication strategies planned by the organisations we will be working with to disseminate information about the research projects. This way we will be taking full advantage of synergies between the organisations' work and the research programme's objectives. Moreover, the research projects should include a specific component to support the organisations' communication work and use of social media, as a way of ensuring continuous dissemination of research results and research uptake beyond the life of the research project. This will also allow the programme to better connect with and learn from ongoing experiments in the promotion of research uptake in Mozambique. More details on this are provided in a separate research uptake and network mapping report produced by the Mozambique team.

References

- Alves, A. (2005) 'As Rádios Comunitárias em Moçambique: Estudos de Caso', Dissertação de Mestrado em Estudos Africanos, Universidade do Porto.
- Chichava, S. (2012) 'Impacto e Significado do Investimento Chinês em Moçambique (2000-2010)', in S. Chichava and C. Alden (eds), *A Mamba e o Dragão: Relações Moçambique-China em Perspectiva*, Maputo: IESE.
- Chichava, S. (2013) 'Xai-Xai Rice Farm and Mozambican Internal Political Dynamics: A Complex Relation', LSE Ideas, Africa Programme, *Occasional Paper 2*, London: London School of Economics.
- CMI (2008) 'Gender Policies and Feminisation of Poverty in Mozambique', Bergen: Chr. Michelsen Institute.
- European Union (2015)
- FDC (2007) 'Mozambican Civil Society from Within: Evaluation, Challenges, Opportunities and Action', Civil Society Index, Maputo: Fundação para o Desenvolvimento da Comunidade.
- IDS (2015) 'Diálogo: Democratic Governance Support Programme Mid-Term Review Report', Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.
- IESE and IDS (2014) 'Hunger Revolts and Citizen Strikes: Popular Protests in Mozambique, 2008-2012', Food Riots and Food Rights Project Report, www.foodriots.org.
- Ilal, A., Kleibl, T. and Munck, R. (2014), 'Interrogating Civil Society: A View from Mozambique', *DSA/ Working Paper 002*, Dublin: Development Studies Association of Ireland.
- ILPC (2013), 'Political Economy Analysis of the Petroleum Sector in Mozambique', Norway: International Law and Policy Institute, www.ilpi.com.
- INE (2007) 'III Recenseamento Geral da População e Habitação: Resultados Definitivos', Maputo: Instituto Nacional de Estatística.
- ITAD and COWI (2012), 'Joint Evaluation of Support to Civil Society Engagement in Policy Dialogue', Mozambique Country Report, Evaluation Department: Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark.

- Jacobs, C. and Van De Kamp, L. (2014) 'Christianity's Role in Dispute Resolution in Mozambique', *Social Sciences and Missions*, 27: 192–218.
- Junior, R. and Amadeu, V. (2014) 'A Autonomia das Rádios Comunitárias em Relação à Produção de Programas Educativos', Escola de Comunicação e Artes, Universidade Eduardo Mondlane.
- Kleibl T. and Munck, R. (2016) 'Civil Society in Mozambique: NGOs, Religion, Politics and Witchcraft', *Third World Quarterly*, 38.1: 203-2018.
- Mare, A. (2014) 'Social Media: The New Protest Drums in Southern Africa?', in B. Pătruț and M. Pătruț (eds), *Social Media in Politics*, New York: Springer.
- Serra, C. (2008) *Linchamentos em Moçambique: Uma Desordem que Apela à Ordem*, Maputo: Imprensa Universitária.
- Shankland, A. and Gonçalves, E. (2016) 'Imagining Agricultural Development in South-South Cooperation: The Contestation and Transformation of ProSAVANA', *World Development*, 81: 35-46.
- Taela, K. (2011) 'Gender Equality at Home and Abroad: Brazil Technical Cooperation with Mozambique in the Field of HIV and AIDS', unpublished MA dissertation, Brighton: University of Sussex.
- Taela, K. (2014) 'Policy Influencing, Lobbying and Advocacy: Mozambique Country Study', The Hague: Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands.
- Topsøe-Jensen, B., Pisco, A., Salimo, P. and Lameiras, J. (2015) 'Mapping Study of Civil Society Organisations in Mozambique', Maputo: European Commission, https://eeas.europa.eu/sites/eeas/files/20151020_mappingstudy_onlineversion.pdf.
- Wittmeyer, H. (2012), 'Mozambique's 'Land-Grab': Exploring Approaches to Elite Policymaking and Neoliberal Reform', Honours Thesis, Minnesota: College of St Benedict-St John's University.