



Research on use of pay-to-use cash machines

Competition and Markets Authority

Technical Appendix

30.08.2017

Summary

Kantar TNS were commissioned to undertake a general population survey designed to provide the CMA with a better understanding of the reasons why consumers choose to use pay-to-use cash machines instead of free-to-use machines, and the potential impact on their behaviour if a PTU ATM was not available.

Given the need to find a quick and efficient way to interview a low penetration group of respondents, questions were added to a large weekly sample face-to-face omnibus survey with the objective of delivering a minimum of 100 interviews amongst past four week PTU ATM users. There was no requirement to provide data at a detailed regional level, nor to identify users of either of the two competitor brands.

Interviews took place from 14th June through to 9th July 2017 across four face-to-face omnibus surveys. In total, the survey was asked of 8,444 adults aged 16+ from across the UK. A total of 349 different UK sample points were included for this survey.

At the outset, the estimated incidence of PTU ATM usage in the past four weeks was 1.5%. This was a cautious estimate based on known numbers of withdrawals per week in 2015 and a downward trend in usage of PTU ATMs, but with an unknown share of usage by international visitors and those under the age of 16 (neither of which would be represented within the omnibus survey) and by non-unique users (i.e. those UK adults age 16+ who make more than one PTU ATM withdrawal in a four-week period).

When we asked respondents if they had used a pay to use cash machine at any time in the past four weeks, a total of 411 users were identified, giving a higher incidence of 5.5% and thus providing a more robust sample size for analysis than originally anticipated.

The CMA also included a question to identify past three month users in case it was not possible to identify sufficient numbers of past four week users. The broader definition of PTU ATM users delivered a total of 573 interviews with respondents who had used a PTU ATM in the past three months, including those who had used PTU ATMs in the past four weeks.

A copy of the questions included in the survey appears at the end of this report.

Sampling Methodology

The Kantar TNS Omnibuses employ a random location methodology each week. A varying number of sampling points are issued depending upon the length of the questionnaire. The number of Great Britain sampling points issued can be 208, 192, 176, 151 or 143 and corresponding sampling points in Northern Ireland are 7, 5, 5, 4 or 4. The points used are sub-samples of those determined in a sampling system developed by Kantar TNS for its internal use.

Sampling Frame

2001 Census small area statistics and the Postcode Address File (PAF) were used to define sample points. These are areas of similar population sizes formed by the combination of wards with the constraint that each point must be contained within a single Government Office Region [GOR]. In addition, geographic systems were employed to minimise the drive-time required to cover each area as optimally as possible.

600 points were defined south of the Caledonian Canal in Great Britain [GB]. Another 25 were defined in a similar fashion in Northern Ireland. Finally, 5 points were defined north of the Caledonian Canal. These latter differ in size from the other points and each other to meet the need to separately cover the different parts of the Highlands and Islands.

Stratification and Sample Point Selection

415 points were selected south of the Caledonian Canal for use by the Omnibuses after stratification by Government Office Region and Social Grade. They were also checked to ensure they are representative by an urban and rural classification. Those points are divided into two replicates. One set is used in one week. The other set is used in the next week. One of the points north of the Caledonian Canal is also used. 14 of the points in Northern Ireland are selected and divided into two replicates. Those replicates are used in rotation to give a wide spread across the Province over time. Similarly, the statistical accuracy of the GB sampling is maximised by issuing sequential waves of fieldwork systematically across the sampling frame to provide maximum geographical dispersion. This ensures that the sample point selection remains representative for any specific fieldwork wave.

Selection of Clusters within Sampling Points

All the sample points in the sampling frame have been divided into two geographically distinct segments each containing, as far as possible, equal populations. The segments comprise aggregations of complete wards. For the Omnibuses, alternate A and B halves are worked each wave of fieldwork. Each week different wards are selected in each required half and Census Output Areas selected within those wards.

Then, groups of OAs containing a minimum of 200 addresses are sampled in those areas from the PAF (a maximum of 250 addresses are issued per assignment).

Interviewing

The addresses, selected as above, are issued to achieve an adult sample of 10, 11, 12, 14 or 16 interviews in provincial areas, and 10, 10, 11, 14 or 15 in London, depending upon the questionnaire length. Assignments are conducted over two days of fieldwork and are carried out weekday 2pm-8pm and at the weekend. Quotas are set by gender/housewife. Within female, presence of children and working status is set and within men, working status is set, to ensure a balanced sample of adults within effective contacted addresses. All interviewers must leave 3 doors between each successful interview.

Weighting and Demographic Analysis

In addition to fieldwork back-checks on the quality of interviewing, further checks are made to ensure that respondent details, including postcode, are complete and that answers to the survey and demographic questions are present. Any incomplete interviews are removed before the data is processed for weighting and analysis.

The results of the four surveys were combined and weighted to represent the adult population. An interlocked 72-cell matrix was employed with Gender, Age (16-24, 25-34, 35-54, 55+), Social Grade (ABC1, C2, DE) and grouped Government Region controls.

The total number of interviews used for final analysis was 8,444. Once the data was weighted on the above criteria, the effective sample size was calculated as 7,742.

In addition to the CMA's questions, demographic analysis was included covering:

- Gender
- Age
- Social grade
- Working status
- Presence of children
- Country
- Population density
- Ethnicity

Where questions allowed for respondents to give an answer not already listed, the verbatim responses were reviewed following fieldwork and the following small number of edits were made to the final results:

Q7 – Two more answer codes were added to summarise answers given by a total of 18 respondents:

- Amusement arcade/pier/promenade
- Fast food/restaurant/takeaway

A further eight answers were re-coded from "Other" into existing pre-codes.

Q12 – Three new answer codes were added, covering a total of 14 responses:

- Pay for games/rides
- Pay for fuel
- Make a donation

A further 41 answers were re-coded from "Other" into existing pre-codes.

Q13 – Two new codes were added, covering a total of 14 responses:

- The recipient could only be paid in cash
- Chip and in machine/card reader was not working

A further 16 responses were re-coded from “Other reason” into existing pre-codes.

Q19 – Three new codes were added, covering a total of 26 responses:

- £5 notes were available
- FTU machine was out of order/empty
- It was the closest/handiest one

A further 16 responses were re-coded from “Other reason” into existing pre-codes.

Q20 – One new code was added, covering a total of 11 responses:

- Borrowed money from someone

A further 14 responses were re-coded from “Something else” into existing pre-codes.

Questionnaire

INTERVIEWER READ OUT

The following questions I ask you are about using pay-to-use ATMs, also known as pay-to-use cash machines, to make a cash withdrawal. These are cash machines where users are charged a fee by the machine for using it.

Please note that if you use a credit card to withdraw cash from a cash machine, the credit card provider may charge a fee, regardless of whether the cash machine itself is free-to-use or pay-to-use. Our questions are NOT about that. We're interested in cash withdrawals for which the cash machine makes a charge, whether the card used is a debit card or credit card.

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.X At any time in the last 3 months, have you used a pay-to-use cash machine in the UK, where you were charged a fee by the machine for using it to make a cash withdrawal?

- 1 Yes
2 No

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.1 Have you used a pay-to-use cash machine at any time in the last 4 weeks?
We are ONLY interested in pay-to-use cash machines.

- 1 Yes
2 No

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.2A On how many occasions in total have you used a pay-to-use cash machine to withdraw cash over the last 4 weeks? A rough idea is fine if you can't remember exactly. Every withdrawal counts as 1.

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.2B And again thinking back over the last 4 weeks, on how many occasions do you think you have used any type of cash machine to withdraw cash? These can be free-to-use or pay-to-use cash machines.

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.3A On how many occasions in total have you used a pay-to-use cash machine to withdraw cash over the last 3 months? A rough idea is fine if you can't remember exactly.
Every withdrawal counts as 1.

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.3B And again thinking back over the last 3 months, how many occasions do you think you have used any type of cash machine to withdraw cash? These can be free-to-use or pay-to-use cash machines.

INTERVIEWER READ OUT

The next questions I am going to ask you are about pay-to-use cash machines only. Please think about the last\most recent cash withdrawal you made where you were charged a fee by the machine for using it.

Q.4 Where were you when you made this cash withdrawal using a pay-to-use cash machine? I would like you to tell me if you can in as much detail as possible here. For example: The one outside the exit to Elephant and Castle Tube station, or on Dickson Road Blackpool, or near the Kebab Shop on Brick Lane. Any detail you can think of would be really helpful.

Additional Code: DK\CR

SHOW SCREEN

Q.5 And would you say this particular cash machine was in an area you know well ?
Remember we are only talking about the most recent pay-to-use cash machine you used.
Know the area....

- 1 Very well
- 2 Fairly well
- 3 Not well

Additional Code: DK\CR

SHOW SCREEN

Q.6 Which ONE of the following best describes the pay-to-use cash machine you used?

- 1 A "hole in the wall" machine
- 2 A free-standing machine inside somewhere
- 3 A free-standing machine outside

Q.7A What type of premises was the hole-in-the-wall machine set into?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 A. Shop
- 2 B. Shopping centre\mall
- 3 C. Bank\building society
- 4 D. Post Office
- 5 E. Bureau de Change (e.g.: Travelex, Thomas Cook)
- 6 F. Motorway service station
- 7 G. Petrol station
- 8 H. Public transport site (bus\coach\railway\tram\underground)
- 9 I. Airport
- 10 J. Hospital
- 11 K. Hotel
- 12 L. Pub
- 13 M. Night club
- 14 N. Sports venue\stadium
- 15 O. Betting shop
- 16 P. Bingo hall
- 17 Q. Casino
- 18 R. Gentlemen's club (i.e.: lap-dancing\strip club)
- 19 S. Race course
- 20 T. Event\festival site
- 21 U. Holiday park
- 22 V. Theme park
- 23 W. Military base
- 24 X. A place with no public access (e.g.: within a secure office block, conference centre etc.)
- 25 Other

Q.7B Inside what type of premises?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 A. Shop
- 2 B. Shopping centre\mall
- 3 C. Bank\building society
- 4 D. Post Office
- 5 E. Bureau de Change (e.g.: Travelex, Thomas Cook)
- 6 F. Motorway service station
- 7 G. Petrol station
- 8 H. Public transport site (bus\coach\railway\tram\underground)
- 9 I. Airport
- 10 J. Hospital
- 11 K. Hotel
- 12 L. Pub
- 13 M. Night club
- 14 N. Sports venue\stadium
- 15 O. Betting shop
- 16 P. Bingo hall
- 17 Q. Casino
- 18 R. Gentlemen's club (i.e.: lap-dancing\strip club)
- 19 S. Race course
- 20 T. Event\festival site
- 21 U. Holiday park
- 22 V. Theme park
- 23 W. Military base
- 24 X. A place with no public access (e.g.: within a secure office block, conference centre etc.)
- 25 Other

Q.7C Outside what type of premises?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 A. Shop
- 2 B. Shopping centre\mall
- 3 C. Bank\building society
- 4 D. Post Office
- 5 E. Bureau de Change (e.g.: Travelex, Thomas Cook)
- 6 F. Motorway service station
- 7 G. Petrol station
- 8 H. Public transport site (bus\coach\railway\tram\underground)
- 9 I. Airport
- 10 J. Hospital
- 11 K. Hotel
- 12 L. Pub
- 13 M. Night club
- 14 N. Sports venue\stadium
- 15 O. Betting shop
- 16 P. Bingo hall
- 17 Q. Casino
- 18 R. Gentlemen's club (i.e.: lap-dancing\strip club)
- 19 S. Race course
- 20 T. Event\festival site
- 21 U. Holiday park
- 22 V. Theme park
- 23 W. Military base
- 24 X. A place with no public access (e.g.: within a secure office block, conference centre etc.)
- 25 Other

SHOW SCREEN

Q.8 Still thinking about the last\most recent cash withdrawal you made where you were charged a fee by the machine for using it. Was it the first time you had used this particular pay-to-use cash machine, or not?

- 1 Yes – first use
- 2 No – not first use

SHOW SCREEN

Q.9 When did you decide to visit this particular cash machine? Did you decide ...?

- 1 Before you set out on the trip that included the visit to the cash machine OR
- 2 While you were already out on the trip that included the visit to the cash machine

SHOW SCREEN

Q.10 What time of day did you make the withdrawal? A rough idea is fine if you can't remember when exactly.

- 1 Midnight-5.59am
- 2 6.00am-8.59am
- 3 9.00am-11.59am
- 4 Midday-2.59pm
- 5 3.00pm-5.59pm
- 6 6.00pm-8.59pm
- 7 9.00pm-11.59pm

Q.11A And what fee did the machine charge for using it? Again, if you can't remember please give me your best estimate.

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 Up to £1.00
- 2 £1.01-£1.49
- 3 £1.50-£1.55
- 4 £1.60-£1.65
- 5 £1.70-£1.75
- 6 £1.80-£1.85
- 7 £1.90-£1.95-£1.99
- 8 £2.00
- 9 £2.01-£5.00
- 10 £5.01-£10.00
- 11 More than £10

Q.Y You said it was <?> to use this pay-to-use cash machine, can I check that is correct?

- 1 Yes
- 2 No

Q.11B What fee did the machine charge for using it?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 Up to £1.00
- 2 £1.01-£1.49
- 3 £1.50\£1.55
- 4 £1.60\£1.65
- 5 £1.70\£1.75
- 6 £1.80\£1.85
- 7 £1.90\£1.95\£1.99
- 8 £2.00
- 9 £2.01-£5.00
- 10 £5.01-£10.00
- 11 More than £10

Q.12 What was your main reason for withdrawing the cash? What was it you were paying for?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 Pay a bill
- 2 Pay a fare (e.g. public transport, taxi)
- 3 Pay a fine\penalty charge
- 4 Pay for a bet
- 5 Pay for the lottery
- 6 Pay for entry to a venue (e.g. cinema, night club)
- 7 Pay for food and\or drink (e.g. at a pub, takeaway, street market)
- 8 Pay for parking
- 9 Pay for shopping
- 10 Pay someone back what I owed them\had borrowed from them
- 11 Pay someone for their work for me (e.g. milkman, window cleaner, house cleaner, gardener, plumber)
- 12 Pay to child(re)\grandchild(ren)\nephew\niece etc. as pocket money
- 13 Pay to a collection at work\with friends\family
- 14 To pay for something else
- 15 Other reason
- 16 No reason - just like to have some cash on me

Additional Code: DK\CR

MULTI CHOICE

Q.13 You said that you withdrew cash to pay for something. Why did you use cash to pay rather than another method of payment?

This could have been instead of using a card, mobile payment or a bank transfer

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 I prefer to use cash
- 2 The recipient would only accept cash
- 3 Cannot do chip and pin\contactless with my card
- 4 Safer\more secure to withdraw cash from the machine than risk having my card skimmed
- 5 Didn't want to put a small amount on my card
- 6 Had to spend a minimum amount to use a card (and didn't need\want to spend that much)
- 7 No reason - just like to have some cash on me
- 8 Other reason

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.14 Still thinking about the last\most recent cash withdrawal you made where you were charged a fee by the machine for using it. Before you used the pay-to-use cash machine, did you know (or ask around for) the location of the nearest free-to-use cash machine?

- 1 Yes
- 2 No

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.15 And before you used the pay-to-use cash machine, did you know (or ask around for) the location of the nearest pay-to-use cash machine that CHARGED A LOWER FEE FOR USING IT?

- 1 Yes
- 2 No

Additional Code: More than 2 hours

Additional Code: No minutes\not willing to walk any further

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.16 Thinking about the pay-to-use cash machine you actually used, how much further would you have been prepared to walk if it had meant you could use a free-to-use cash machine? Please give me your answer in the number of minutes.

Additional Code: More than 2 hours
Additional Code: No minutes\nnot willing to walk any further
Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.17 And again thinking about the pay-to-use cash machine you actually used, how much further would you have been prepared to walk if it had meant you could use a pay-to-use cash machine that charged 20p less for using it?

Additional Code: DK\CR

MULTI CHOICE

Q.19 Why did you use the pay-to-use cash machine, rather than a free-to-use cash machine?

DO NOT PROMPT

- 1 Didn't know where to find a free-to-use cash machine
- 2 In a hurry
- 3 Couldn't be bothered to go any further
- 4 Location of the free-to-use cash machine was less safe
- 5 Prefer to make cash withdrawals inside somewhere
- 6 Cheaper to use the pay-to-use cash machine than pay for travel to a FTU cash machine
- 7 Difficult\impossible to get to a FTU cash machine because of my health\mobility reasons, caring responsibilities etc.
- 8 Difficult\impossible to get to a FTU cash machine because of distance, geography, transport issues etc.
- 9 Could not leave the venue in which the cash machine was located
- 10 Difficult to leave the venue in which the cash machine was located
- 11 Other reason

Additional Code: DK

SHOW SCREEN

Q.20A Earlier, you told me you decided to visit the pay-to-use cash machine before you set out on the trip that included the visit to the cash machine. If you had known before you set out that the pay-to-use cash machine you used (and any other cash machines at the same site) had not been working, what would you have done instead?

READ OUT VERBATIM

- 1 Not withdrawn cash and not made your purchase
- 2 Not withdrawn cash and made your purchase using a different payment method
- 3 Used another cash machine near to the one I wanted to use
- 4 Used another cash machine somewhere else completely
- 5 Withdrawn cash over the counter at the bank\building society\post office
- 6 Something else

Additional Code: DK

SHOW SCREEN

Q.20B Earlier, you told me you decided to visit the pay-to-use cash machine while you were already out on the trip that included the visit to the cash machine. If you had found that the pay-to-use cash machine you used (and any other cash machines at the same site) was not working, what would you have done instead?

READ OUT VERBATIM

- 1 Not withdrawn cash and not made your purchase
- 2 Not withdrawn cash and made your purchase using a different payment method
- 3 Used another cash machine near to the one I wanted to use
- 4 Used another cash machine somewhere else completely
- 5 Withdrawn cash over the counter at the bank\building society\post office
- 6 Something else

Additional Code: DK

SHOW SCREEN

Q.20C Please imagine you had found that the pay-to-use cash machine you used (and any other cash machines at the same site) were not working. What would you have done instead?

READ OUT VERBATIM

- 1 Not withdrawn cash and not made your purchase
- 2 Not withdrawn cash and made your purchase using a different payment method
- 3 Used another cash machine near to the one I wanted to use
- 4 Used another cash machine somewhere else completely
- 5 Withdrawn cash over the counter at the bank\building society\post office
- 6 Something else

Additional Code: DK\CR

SHOW SCREEN

Q.21 If you have a particular cash machine in mind, is it a <?> machine?

- 1 Free-to-use
- 2 Pay-to-use
- 3 Do not have a particular cashpoint in mind

Additional Code: More than 2 hours

Additional Code: Not possible to get to it on foot

Additional Code: DK\CR

Q.22 How far is it from the pay-to-use cash machine you actually used? Please give me your answer in the number of minutes it would take to get there on foot.

End of questionnaire