GOODBYE TO PROJECTS?
THE INSTITUTIONAL IMPACTS OF A LIVELIHOOD APPROACH ON DEVELOPMENT INTERVENTIONS

RESEARCH PROJECT No. R7908

DEPARTMENT FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

WORKING PAPER SERIES

PAPER No 1

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON LIVELIHOOD APPROACHES AND DEVELOPMENT INTERVENTIONS.

ANNA TONER AND DAVID HOWLETT

OCTOBER 2001
BACKGROUND TO PROJECT AND WORKING PAPER SERIES

This paper is one in a series of working papers prepared under a research project on *Goodbye to Projects? The Institutional Impacts of a Livelihood Approach on Projects and Project Cycle Management.*

This is a collaborative project between the Bradford Centre for International Centre for Development\(^1\) (BCID) with the Economic and Policy Research Centre (EPRC), Uganda; Khanya – managing rural change, South Africa; and, the Institute for Development Management (IDM), Tanzania. The project is supported by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) under their Economic and Social Research Programme (ESCOR).

Approaches to projects and development have undergone considerable change in the last decade with significant policy shifts on governance, gender, poverty eradication, and environmental issues. Most recently this has led to the adoption and promotion of the sustainable livelihood (SL) approach. The adoption of the SL approach presents challenges to development interventions including: the future of projects and programmes, and sector wide approaches (SWAPs) and direct budgetary support.

This project intends to undertake an innovative review of these issues. Central to this will be to question how a livelihood approach is actually being used in a range of development interventions. This will be used to identify and clarify the challenges to the design, appraisal and implementation of development interventions and changes required from the adoption of a livelihoods approach.

The research is to be conducted in two phases. The first phase consists of general and country reviews on SL and development interventions. The second phase of the research is detailed case studies on development interventions in Uganda, Tanzania and South Africa. These case studies will compare and contrast the implementation of sector wide approaches, programmes and projects developed following an SL approach against those designed using a “classical” approach.

This paper ‘*Annotated bibliography on livelihood approaches and development interventions*’ is the first in the series of the project working papers. This is the output of a literature review on sustainable livelihood approaches, projects, programmes and sector wide approaches.

This research is funded by the Department for International Development of the United Kingdom. However, the findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are entirely those of the author(s) and should not be attributed to the Department for International Development, which does not guarantee their accuracy and can accept no responsibility for any consequences of their use.

---

\(^1\) Formerly Development and Project Planning Centre (DPPC)
THE AUTHORS

Anna Toner is a research assistant at the Bradford Centre for International Centre for Development University of Bradford.

David Howlett is a lecturer in Natural Resource and Environmental Management, Bradford Centre for International Centre for Development University of Bradford.

PROJECT WORKING PAPERS TO DATE

1. Annotated bibliography on livelihood approaches and development interventions.

For more details on the project, this paper, and others in the series, please contact the UK or African co-ordinators:

David Howlett, Project coordinator, BCID, University of Bradford, Bradford, West Yorkshire, BD1 7DP, UK Tel: +44 (0)1274 235286; Fax: +44 (0) 1274 235280; email: d.howlett@brad.ac.uk; www.brad.ac.uk/acad/bcid

Ian Goldman, Khanya – managing rural change, 17 James Scott Street, Brandwag, Bloemfontein 9301, Free State, South Africa. Tel +27 (0)51 430 8314; Fax: 27 (0)51 430 8322; email: goldman@khanya-mrc.co.za; www.khanya-mrc.co.za

Fred Muhumuza, EPRC, Makerere University Campus, 51 Pool Road, PO Box 7841, Kampala, Uganda. Tel: +256 (0)41 541023; Fax: +256 (0)41 541022; email: muhuma@hotmail.com

Faustin Kamuzora, IDM, P.O. Box 397, Morogoro, Tanzania. Tel: +255 (0)23 604380; Fax: +255 (0)23 4382; email: frkamuzora@yahoo.co.uk

For more details on the project and copies of recent publications please consult the project’s web site:

• http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/dppc/goodbye.html
1. OVERVIEW

1.1 Context

The basis for this bibliography is our central research focus: that taking a sustainable livelihoods approach will have implications for the shape and substance of a range of development interventions. To this end it was felt to be necessary to take a broad overview of existing literature relating to the sustainable livelihoods approach. In addition, this review has widened the net to incorporate work on some of the more contested areas of the approach, for instance, the typology of capital assets and the nature and implications of participatory approaches.

Literature relating to other current debates over the form of development interventions, such as the sector-wide approach and rights based approaches, are also included.

This bibliography is intended to be a working document and will be added to during the course of our project. If you have suggestions for inclusion in our bibliography or if you would like to be added to our mailing network then please email: a.l.toner@bradford.ac.uk

Annotations in the bibliography are directed specifically at our research. This summary is intended to draw out some of the main themes and tensions of the sustainable livelihoods approach, and will help us to identify key areas for investigation in case studies from Tanzania, Uganda and South Africa.

1.2 Sustainable Livelihoods Approach (SLA)

One of the first questions to be addressed by our research is: what is the sustainable livelihoods approach? Certainly no consensus emerges from the literature. It appears that the SLA can be interpreted in three broadly different ways: as a set of principles; as an analytical framework, or as a overall developmental objective (Farrington, 2001).

As a starting point much of the literature uses Chambers’ (1992) definition of a sustainable livelihood relating to the assets that are used by the poor to withstand shocks and stresses. (Ashley & Carney 1999; Carney 1998). The need to understand the livelihood strategies and vulnerability of the poor is generally agreed across the literature, although, Moser’s (1996) assumption that the poor behave as ‘strategic managers’ is questioned. (Beall, 2001) The thrust being that people are the key to their own development, hence interventions with the aim of supporting the development of sustainable livelihoods will need to be people-centred.

Represented as a methodological framework the SLA is found to be a useful tool for analysis. Details of the DFID framework (see DFID SL guidance sheets for details) are much discussed in the literature. (Carney 1998; Ashley and Carney 1999; Goldman, 2000; Hobley 2000) This framework uses the concept of capital assets as a central feature and considers how these are affected by the ‘vulnerability context’ in which they are derived, and by ‘policies, institutions and processes’, to constitute ‘livelihoods strategies’ which lead to various ‘livelihoods outcomes’.
However, CARE uses a methodological framework in which the concept of ‘household livelihood security’ is the central feature. (Frankenberger et al. 2000). Oxfam uses the concept of sustainable livelihoods but Neefjes (2000) explains that a framework is only employed at a strategic level and has been found less useful at the field level. He also stresses that such a framework should only be employed as a tool, and does not constitute an approach in itself.

Much discussion also takes place in the literature on the principles that underlie a sustainable livelihoods approach: that interventions should be participatory, holistic, and dynamic; and that they should build macro-micro links, be sustainable, and people-centred. (Carney 1998; Ashley & Carney 1999; DFID/FAO 2000; Carney with Drinkwater et al. 1999) It should be emphasised that SL principles are not set in stone and their evolution is a continuous process. Most recently it has been suggested that such principles might be split into two categories: normative and operational. (Carney- forthcoming review of thinking on SL)

Applied using the framework and as a set of principles the SLA has been found to be useful at all levels without attempting to cover ‘everything’ in a single intervention. Case studies have shown SLA principles and frameworks to be good analytical tools for identifying entry points and sequences for development interventions. (Farrington (2001). They can be an excellent way to reveal locally specific detail, but not for generating universal solutions, although it is felt desirable for the principles to be applied generally. (Ashley & Carney 1999; Ashley 2000)

The SLA can also be viewed as an overall development objective to enhance the sustainability of livelihoods. A broad commitment to the development of sustainable livelihoods can be found across a range of donor agencies: GTZ (Albert, 2000), AusAID (2000), UNDP (Wanmali, 1999b), EU (2000), Oxfam (Neefjes 2000), CARE (Frankenberger et al. and the World Bank (2000). Although with the recent change of administration in the US, USAID is not to engage specifically with sustainability as it’s meaning is said to be too unclear. (USAID 2001)

1.3 Problems and challenges for SLA framework:

There is a great deal of discussion concerning the DFID framework and how it should be employed in practice. However, there is some concern that the methodological frameworks should not become over codified and institutionalised, and specifically that the DFID framework is insufficiently dynamic.

In addition the following direct criticisms of the framework are made:

- People are invisible
- Differing / unclear asset analysis
- Needs more recognition of socio-economic, historical and cultural factors
- Insufficiently flexible
- Overall concept is ethnocentric and not easily translated
- Not sufficiently directed at alleviating poverty
- Offers no guidance on linking micro-macro or policy analysis. (DFID/FAO, 2000)

One of the major challenges for the operationalising a sustainable livelihoods framework is how to compare and measure capital assets. There is some agreement over the classification
of assets (financial, physical, natural, social, human) used in the DFID framework, but alternatives are offered. (See Moser 1996). Baumann (2001) suggests that political capital be given equal status as other capital assets. This would offer a basis for a more structured and rigorous analysis of power than the ‘policies, institutions and processes’ box of the SL framework. Some suggest that the SL framework is inoperable unless assets can be directly compared (Maqueen 2001). Bond and Mukherjee (2001) demonstrate an attempt to do this using aggregated scores from participatory assets ranking. (See also Woodhouse et al. 2000)

However, there are particular difficulties in defining, let alone measuring, social capital. In addition social capital may mediate access to other assets, and is not neutral. (Beall 1997, 2001; Fox 1997; Thin 2000)

There is considerable debate about the importance of developing social capital as opposed to human capital. (Ellis 1999). The World Bank (1997) appears to place an emphasis on social capital, but others argue that it will be more productive to work on raising human capital. (Bryceson 2000; Fox 1997; Ellis 1999; Heller 1996)

It is suggested that the framework also needs to broaden institutional analysis beyond governance to include community and familial structures, as decentralisation is not a panacea if underlying social structures are not understood. (Bingen 2000; Johnson 1997; Goldman 1999; Hobley 2001)

There is little direct analysis of sustainability beyond the iteration of Chambers’ (1992) definition, so there is some need to clarify the concept in relation to the management of interventions. Neefjes (2000)

1.4 Implications for interventions and project cycle management

It is agreed that the SLA principles will have implications for the management of development interventions. It is generally acknowledged that SLA interventions need to be flexible, process-based and capable of learning. (Pasteur 2001; Hobley 2000)

Some argue that there must be a shift from projects to networking, information sharing and policy influence. There will be a need for new skills to support new forms of intervention. Good projects will be ‘growth-poles’ (Bevan 2000) and must be able to evolve. Donors must move from being ‘owners’ to ‘stakeholders’, hence it will be necessary to transform the values of staff. (Chambers 1997; Pastuer 2001).

Whilst it may be that large Donors are moving from supporting projects to SWAps, it is not the case that projects will disappear. It is likely that they will continue to be used (although possibly in an evolved format) by both Governments and NGOs.

It can be argued that projects keep donors in touch with ground level realities. (Brown et al. 2001) In addition projects are thought to be a necessary mechanism for innovation, although some disagree as to the innovatory capacity of projects as they have to be designed along ‘acceptable’ lines in order to access funding. (Vivian 1994)

DFID literature maintains that the SLA can be transposed onto existing interventions and some case studies do support this, but they don’t fulfil all SLA principles, and show some limitations to evolution. (DFID 2001; Turton 2000) In addition, Hussein (2000) warns that
interventions may be conventional ‘plus’ livelihoods in approach, as opposed to being overtly livelihoods focussed.

1.5Planning, monitoring and evaluation

One of the greatest challenges for the SLA is to include participatory practices. The literature shows that participation may be interpreted in very different ways. (Estrella & Gaventa 1998; Estrella 2000; Holland & Blackburn 1998)

DFID Sustainable Livelihoods Guidance Sheets state that the aim is to have interventions in which beneficiaries are empowered to play a significant role in the design, monitoring and evaluation of projects. This is the point at which there may be significant divergence between rhetoric and reality. Institutions may not be flexible enough to cater for the required dynamism and flexibility of fully participatory interventions. (Gujit & Gaventa 1998; Gujit 2000).

There is an ongoing tension between the value of increasing participation and the desire for scientific rigour, and in a similar vein between the need to generate rich locally specific data and universally comparable information for policy level analysis. (Gaventa, 2000; Carney 1998; Macqueen 2001).

Questions arise concerning who decides what level of participation is acceptable. In addition, organisations need to be prepared for the pitfalls of the principle, in that it can be very time-consuming, too easy to set unrealistic targets and underestimate the need for feedback and follow-up. (Gujit & Gaventa 2000)

Advocates of participation as empowerment maintain that participatory methods can lead to local people managing their own projects, and forge positive change for the excluded using existing social structures and processes. (Idawo 1995; Johnson & Wilson 2000). In addition, local people respond to the global context as well as a local one, so used in the right way participatory methods can actually allow micro-macro linkages to be addressed as a matter of course. (Dwivedi 2001)

1.6 Indicators and Impact Assessment

New types of intervention will require new types of indicators. There is considerable debate over what form these will take. Again the debate between the need for ‘scientific rigour’ and participation is a key issue.

Some suggest that it will be possible to dispense with formal indicators (Davies 1996), others that models should take their place (Hobley 2000). Roche offers a new acronym for SLA indicators - Subjective, Participatory, Interpreted, Communicable, Empowering and Disaggregated. (SPICED). (Roche – forthcoming in Estrella 2000)

The overall suggestion appears to be that there should not be a search for universal indicators but for ways of measuring and assessing the impact of interventions that can be shared and adapt to change. (Lee-Smith 1997; Roche 1999)

Pinney et al (forthcoming) tested a framework for the identification of indicators based on the sustainable livelihoods approach to ascertain which indicators correlated best with farm
success. Net farm income was used as a proxy for farm success. They specifically address the question of using external and local indicators, and found that locally derived and complex indicators gave the best results.

1.7 Sector Wide and Rights-based approaches

The sector approach obviously has limitations when it comes to taking a cross-sectoral approach, and this is where the SLA could make a contribution to SWAps, Country Strategy Papers and Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers. (Akroyd & Duncan 1998).

SWAps more explicitly deal with the micro-macro linkages, which is said to be a weakness of the SLA. (Brown et al. 2001). Country strategy papers show a move towards funding sector approaches as opposed to specific project interventions. (DFID 1999) Many other bilateral agencies show increasing support for sector assistance and away from projects. In fact the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2001) states that projects should only be used as a last resort.

SWAps need to be able to respond to diversity and to build in upward accountability. (Norton 1998) It is suggested that donors accept a certain loss of control and promote the engagement of front-line staff as researchers and decision-makers. (Norton & Bird 1998) The SLA can add to an analytical understanding of diversity and disaggregation of the poor. Participatory poverty assessments have also made progress in this area. (Norton 2001)

A major area of weakness for the SLA has been in its exclusion of power relationships. Rights-based approaches explicitly deal with power through the advocacy of a universal code of rights and entitlements for all. Most recent work suggests a fusion between the idea of rights and the SLA to produce a ‘livelihood rights approach’. This would follow the premise that rights matter and that the poor must be supported and empowered to claim their rights. (Moser & Norton 2001)

1.8 Conclusion

This summary has attempted to capture some of the major issues that emerge from a broad sweep of the literature dealing with the sustainable livelihoods and the practical strategies for institutionalising ideas about livelihoods into organisational strategy and intervention planning.

It is evident that many questions remain unanswered about the practical complexities and contradictions of the sustainable livelihoods approach. For more detail on the current use of a SLA in Tanzania, Uganda and South Africa refer to the other working papers in this series.

In clarifying where SLA fits with other new approaches to development it is necessary to consider it in relation to development theory. The continuing evolution of the approach will need to take into account ideas about what development means and what it is for. To this end the works such as Sen (1999) on ‘development as freedom’ is included.

The literature reveals questions on all levels about the efficacy and continuing evolution of the sustainable livelihoods approach. It is clear that it has not been sufficiently tested in reality. One of the crucial aspects for investigation will be to analyse whether the rhetoric of new approaches is transformative in practice. It may be that underlying relationships remain unaltered. (Crewe & Harrison 1998)
2. ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Entries are listed by name of the first author. For each entry basic bibliography details are given together with a list of keywords, an abstract or summary of the report, and notes in relation to our research objectives.

Indexes to both the Authors and Titles follow the bibliography entries.
Changing views on change: participatory approaches to monitoring the environment


Keywords: participatory monitoring, evaluation.

Abstract/Summary

Reviews participatory approaches to monitoring environmental change. This refers to approaches that develop partnerships of multiple stakeholders for efficient, effective and socially inclusive monitoring. Despite the promises made there are few examples to support/refute claims. Compromise is necessary for setting indicators but there is a tension between 'scientific rigour' and maintaining local participation: this presents a challenge for innovation to include both.

Notes:

3 types of participatory methods reviewed: PRA techniques, oral testimony, adapted ecological assessment. Few case studies show stakeholder involvement in designing process, analysis and dissemination of findings. However, the most participatory approaches seem to produce more relevant and useful data than those where local people act as data collectors. Questions to be answered re: mechanisms to promote feedback from monitoring to overall dev process, more debate on 'trade-offs' concerning indicators. How is participation being used differentially in SL-based interventions? P45 see case study on abandoning indicators.

Reconstruction from War in Africa: Communities, Entrepreneurs, and States


Keywords: conflict, livelihoods, aid

Abstract/Summary

For Africa to recover from conflict, communities must reconstruct, private sectors revitalise, and states must transform themselves. Aid donors, NGOs and international business can do much to help (and hinder). Unless communities can rebuild and strengthen their livelihoods, neither reconstruction nor growth will be poverty reducing. Communities cannot prosper without private investment, which in turn cannot prosper without a democratically accountable state. The international community can assist through more aid, debt relief and peace keeping.

Notes:

This paper underlines the problems facing people in building sustainable livelihoods in societies that have been disrupted by conflict. The essential point being that without macro-level stability, sustainable livelihoods cannot be created at the micro-level.

The Sector Approach and Sustainable Rural Livelihoods


Keywords: SWAps, SLA

Abstract/Summary

Discusses the extent to which a sector approach could be a framework for improving the sustainability of rural livelihoods. There are concerns that: they are overly top-down, too narrowly sectoral, poverty objectives may be ignored and be too focused on government channels. Limitations of approach need to be recognised, particularly recognition of needs of poor. Government needs to play a co-ordinating cross-sectoral role.

Notes:

Note importance of a cross-sectoral vision to strengthen sectoral approaches.
Agricultural Policy Systems: a changing paradigm for German Technical Co-operation


Keywords: policy, principles

Abstract/Summary

Paper attempts to derive implications for supporting policy delivery systems particularly concerning services for rural development. To this end, firstly new challenges for German Technical co-operation in the field of supporting policy delivery are sketched out. Intervention strategies and lessons learned in rural capacity development from GTZ project experiences are summarised.

Notes:

The term 'sustainable livelihoods' is not used but all the elements of the SLA are found in this document. The guiding principles of GTZ are noted as; focus on self-help by individuals and institutions, sustainability though institutions at all levels, subsidiary principle and 'least intervention maxim', a client-focused participatory approach, orienting objectives and committing to development impact, process orientation and flexibility. Draws up a systems perspective framework for policy advice in technical cooperation. Iterates the point that no project operates in isolation and shows how the systems perspective can address this in interventions.

Sustainable Governance of Livelihoods in Rural Africa: A place-based response to globalism in Africa


Keywords: SL, governance, place-based response

Abstract/Summary

Paper examines the community resource bases in rural Africa as the entry point for understanding the place-based consciousness of organising livelihood activities in Africa. The goal is to present an argument for concerted efforts to utilise the community resource bases to promote sustainable governance of livelihoods in Africa as a place-based response to the globalisation of the rural African world. He argues that globalism disrupts the participation processes of the community resource bases.

Notes:

This article suggests that using the indigenous organisational principles of governance in rural Africa would be a good entry point for the promotion of sustainable livelihoods. How the SL framework deals with indigenous organisation and institutions is not clear, but some important considerations are highlighted: despite the agenda to globalise Africa, over 80% still live in rural areas and depend on their indigenous knowledge system for their day-to-day sustenance. How do case studies use indigenous knowledge and governance?

Sector programme Assistance


Keywords: SWAps

Abstract/Summary

SWAps are restricted by barriers to effective communication on both the recipients' and donor' side. 'Ownership' remains a contested area: still a reluctance to hand over control to recipient governments; donors may be over involved in planning due to lack of in-country technical personnel. Co-ordination between donors is important but difficult to achieve. Donors should make efforts to use nationally derived data for monitoring rather than imposing Donor-specific indicators. There is the possibility of basing SWAps on universal social or economic goals as agreed by the UN, this would get around the problem that different donors emphasise different development goals.

Notes:

The final conclusion shows how a rights-based approach may intersect with a sector-wide approach as a means of generating a common language and common set of goals. Have any SWAps adopted this in practice?
Sustainability; Life chances and education in Southern Africa


Keywords: Sustainable livelihoods

Abstract/Summary

This chapter explores the critical role played by education in shaping lifestyle aspirations and expectations. It is argued that the current form of rural secondary education is probably not sustainable being that the current result of considerable investment by government is a small number of productive workers and a large number of rural dwellers who are to a greater or lesser extent dependent on the urban employed. To this extent it is argued that education provides only limited abilities to sustain rural livelihoods, but fosters aspirations to ‘lifestyles’ that cannot be sustained by the rural environment.

Notes:

An interesting point raised here is the distinction between livelihoods and lifestyle. ‘Livelihoods’ has connotations of meeting basic needs, and as the article says people aspire to a different way of life. Should the SLA be addressing this distinction? Is a right to aspiration to be found in a rights-based approach? What implication does this have for interventions? In addition this chapter highlights the value of a cross-sectoral approach by highlighting the impact that educational policy can have on rural livelihoods.

Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons from early experience

Ashley, C & Carney, D (1999). DFID

Keywords: SLA, SL framework

Abstract/Summary

SLA has been found to be useful in supporting systematic analysis of poverty, promoting a better-informed view of development opportunities, placing people at the centre of analysis and objective setting. Problems can be overcome and effectiveness improved through the learning process.

Notes:

Suggests that SLA can be used a sectoral level, but that it widens the scope of 'projects'. Holistic analysis does not require holistic intervention p17. SLA does not require labeled projects or programmes—support is more likely for SL guided sectorally anchored projects. Pp23/4 details SL relationship to other approaches: SWAps, rights-based but believes that difficulties are mainly down to perception and can be overcome through collaboration. Box 11 suggests that work is needed on SL implications for PCM. Box 12 offers useful summary of lessons up to publication.

The Impact of Tourism on Rural Livelihoods: Namibia's experience


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

Paper assesses the wide range of impacts that tourism has on the livelihoods of rural residents in Namibia. It illustrates that a focus on livelihoods offers a useful perspective on tourism for enhancing local benefits. Taking an SLA helps identify the wide range of impacts- direct and indirect, positive and negative- that matter to local people.

Notes:

Good case study: capital assets analysis has been drawn from interviews. Demonstrates how SL framework can structure analysis clearly when looking at a sectorally specific example. Important point re managing interventions using SLA: that details of how to enhance livelihood impacts are location-specific. The SLA principles recognise that a range of livelihood concerns are important, and supporting systems that enable local people's priorities to be incorporated into tourism decisions, can be generally applied.
Developing methodologies for Livelihood Impact Assessment: Experience of the African Wildlife Foundation in East Africa


Keywords: SL framework, monitoring, evaluation

Abstract/Summary

Describes how key concepts of SLA were incorporated into methods for assessing the impact of wildlife projects in E Africa. Assessment used a wide range of data collection methods and a simplified SL framework to guide analysis and interpretation. Advantages of this are: rich contextual and project level analysis; shift away from narrow project evaluation criteria. Challenges: difficulty in getting comparable data, need for skilled study teams.

Notes:

P15 states that aim of livelihoods assessment is necessarily extractive in this case and approach is not radically participatory. Does this conflict with how others use SLA? Question of need for quantitative data to be generated for policy level: are PPAs altering perceptions about type of data needed for policy making? (text suggests that PM & E relies on qualitative judgments made by local people and implies that some feel that it desirable to attempt some 'neutrality' through the interpretation of quantitative data by outside experts. Is such data neutral? Implies that SLA is most useful at project level-does not question 'projects'

Promoting Practical Sustainability


Keywords: Sustainability, PCM

Abstract/Summary

Guidelines on sustainability designed to provide AusAID staff, contractors, NGOs and other implementing partners with practical guidance on how to address sustainability issues more explicitly and effectively throughout the activity management cycle. States that 'sustainability is a key attribute of high quality aid'. Shows a commitment to extending the length of interventions, engaging a strong sense of local ownership and genuine participation, recognising that development is dynamic and hence interventions should be flexible, integrating management structures with existing local ones.

Notes:

The principles that emerge from this document are largely congruent with those of DFID SLA. However, the AusAID guide deals specifically with the practical implications of trying to build sustainability into development interventions. Without getting overly sidetracked by framework construction- this document examines sustainability throughout the 'activity cycle'. Note that it remains committed to use of logical framework.

Engaging stakeholders: Lessons from three eastern India business case studies


Keywords: institutional decision-making, business, SL framework.

Abstract/Summary

Paper reports on research into the relationship between business activity and vulnerable people in Orissa, India. It considers institutional decision-making processes and their direct impact on these people's lives. Three key situations are considered: privatisation and access to power; contract labour and migration; mining and impact on marginalised groups. Investigation was based upon an assessment of both formal and informal corporate decision-making processes and an assessment of the context and impact on livelihoods.

Notes:

The SL framework was used in this study as one of a range of methodological frameworks. It is argued that by moving the agenda away from poverty relief to the development of capacities and capabilities a space is created in which the contribution of business may be identified.
Two complimentary and integrated land uses of the western High Atlas Mountains, Morocco: the potential for sustainable rural livelihoods

http://www.elsevier.com/locate/apgeog

Keywords: SL

Abstract/Summary

This paper examines the status of traditional agriculture in two areas of Azilal province in the Atlas Mountains, seeking to identify what is needed to counter any breakdown in livelihood strategies and improve the quality of life enjoyed by the farmers. Village studies show that supportive social capital ensured challenges were being met and beneficial innovations were being made to farming practices.

Notes:

Diversification is seen as an appropriate response to the need for sustainable livelihoods. This analysis is not an explicitly SLA.

Sustainable Livelihoods and political capital: Arguments and evidence from decentralisation and natural resource management in India


Keywords: SL framework, political capital, social capital.

Abstract/Summary

The SL framework is a useful analytical tool due to its ideological neutrality. However, the inclusion of political capital as an endogenous asset is critical because: political capital will mediate access to other assets; it explains the relationships between people, and transforming structures and processes. The balance of power and location of political capital is not fixed and is under constant challenge. Not including political capital within the SL framework will weaken its analytical analysis of politics in specific interventions.

Notes:

The political dimension is missing from the existing SL framework, and it is vital that political context is recognised by those involved with development interventions. However, the distinction between social and political power might be more contested. Instead of codifying political capital it might be better to modify the entire framework to incorporate the mediating influence of the political context, both at an assets level and within transforming structures and processes. How do case studies deal with 'power', do any of them address it explicitly?

Linking Development With Democratic Processes in India: Political Capital and Sustainable Livelihoods Analysis


Keywords: SLA, political capital

Abstract/Summary

This paper examines how far SL analysis helps in understanding the complex power relations influencing the rightful access by the poor to assets and entitlements. These also influence the range of feasible livelihoods options, and the type and level of benefits that they generate. These power relations have political dimensions, and to consider them in terms of a sixth capital asset-political capital- provides the basis for a more structured and rigorous analysis of power than is generally achieved if they are considered part of the 'policies, institutions and processes' within the SL analytical framework.

Notes: Power relations govern access to assets. What are the implications of making 'political' the sixth capital asset? How would it be measured? Political capital is seen to be critical in moving the SL framework from analysis to action; both by understanding how the benefits of poverty programmes are captured illicitly by more powerful groups, and how the poor can be supported to enhance their own political capital.
Goodbye to Projects?

Integrating participatory research methods in a public agricultural research organisation: a partially successful experience in Morocco


Keywords: participatory monitoring, evaluation

Abstract/Summary

Reports on a project of institutional capacity development for participatory research by INRA in Morocco. Fieldwork comprised PRA training and a second stage of developing and testing a locally adjusted methodology for participatory research programme planning. Whilst the duration of the project was too short for impact to be manifest, a number of lessons can be drawn with regard to the institutionalisation of participatory methods.

Notes:

Interesting conclusions drawn: successful efforts to institutionalise participatory research need to engineer a triple shift in organisational focus: 1. From science and academic research to a broader view of innovation (which will include a great deal of adaptive research and innovation support services). 2. From technical but politically naïve concept of participation to a concept more appropriate to plurality and exercise of power in institutional development. 3. Need to give consideration to overall strategy and policy environment of research organisations. Does this raise questions about tacking on PM & E to existing projects?

Living in the present, investing in the future: household security among the urban poor


Keywords: rural-urban linkages, frameworks

Abstract/Summary

Understanding the complexity of micro-level social relations makes for more congruent policy outcomes, but the proliferation of frameworks must be viewed with caution. There is a case for an integrated framework focusing on interplay between access and resources. Addresses how urban dwellers aim for longer-term security and looks at links to larger scale processes.

Notes:

SLA may be too rigid and too eager to codify complexity. There is a problem with conceptualising assets as they must not be reduced to neo-classical concepts. Not helpful to view poor as 'strategic managers (Moser 1998:5) but should take a wide conception of resources that people need to access, in the process of composing a livelihood. Gender and generational analysis is not being explicitly dealt with but should be intrinsic. Are mechanisms for redistribution more critical than production and reproduction? The SLA needs to address the inefficiency of poverty which wastes people's social/human capital otherwise it is not 'sustainable': poor need to invest in future.

Social Capital in Waste- A Solid Investment?


Keywords: social capital

Abstract/Summary

Both decentralisation and civic engagement are key concerns in current debates. This paper examines two examples of community involvement in solid waste management. It shows that expectations based in the concept of social capital are wanting because of the way in which it obscures problems having to do with local power structures.

Notes:

Social capital is not a neutral concept- how does SLA deal with structural inequalities of power?
Building on Poor People's Capacities: The Case of Common Property Resources in India and West Africa


**Keywords:** poverty, common property resources.

**Abstract/Summary**

Article examines the relation between poor women and men and common property resources (cprs). Locates poor peoples use of cprs within a wider focus on SL. Development interventions need to build on people's assets and strengths and identifies cprs as a crucial element of coping strategies. Cprs provide a good entry point for understanding poor people's perceptions of poverty and for building on their capacities.

**Notes:**

Main conclusion: management regimes must be specifically designed to include poor people and particularly poor women, otherwise 'community'-based NRM may be externally supported and controlled by élites.

Community Stability and the Relationship between Economic and Social Well-Being in Forest-Dependent Communities


**Keywords:** social capital

**Abstract/Summary**

Examines the connection between economic and social well-being. Finds that three phenomena cannot be reflected in economic indicators: quality of work, social cohesion and local empowerment.

**Notes:** Interesting analysis dealing with how to assess social well-being.

Programme Approaches: Spaces and Entry Points for Social Development

Bevan, P. (2000a). *DFID Social Development Department SD SCOPE paper no.11*

**Keywords:** projects, social development

**Abstract/Summary**

Paper aims to pinpoint what DFID's SDD has been trying to achieve through the processes whereby it engages with people in poor countries to work towards social development. Approach to projects: recognise that a flexible and open approach is necessary for the sustainability and wider impacts of activities and benefits; ring-fenced enclave projects often leave no trace; good projects act as 'growth poles'.

**Notes:**

Conclusions are that: despite problems with projects it is very hard to escape the format if donors want to specify funds for a particular purpose. Seems likely that old-fashioned projects based on short time scales will be phased out, process projects will fulfill planning and budgetary functions but in a flexible and participatory manner.
Goodbye to Projects?

Strengthening Policy Reform by Addressing the Needs, Interests and Rights of Poor and Vulnerable People


Keywords: sector wide approaches, social development, programmes, SL

Abstract/Summary

Paper aims to pinpoint what the Social Development Department is trying to achieve in its activities related to DFID's interventions to strengthen policy reform by addressing the needs, interests and rights of poor and vulnerable people, and to define outcomes from these activities. Methods to steer policy in a pro-poor direction include budget support with earmarking for health and education, institutionalising participatory political mechanisms and poverty assessment etc. Evidence shows indicators could be improved by more consideration of social factors, and should attempt to deconstruct categories such as 'poor' and 'women'.

Notes:

This paper although not specifically focused on the SLA has some useful points within it, particularly with reference to the dangers of the 'managerial performance indicator culture', and the emphasis on integrated and sequenced approach to interventions at all levels. The DFID SL framework used too rigidly is in danger of oversimplifying social capital; this paper points out the necessity of engaging with the complexity of social capital as a part of pro-poor policy formulation.

Institutions and Sustainable Livelihoods


Keywords: SLA, policy, institutions.

Abstract/Summary

In order to improve the analysis and understanding of institutions and sustainable livelihoods this paper aims to: improve understanding of types of institutions and relationships that influence/are influenced by livelihoods, It presents some illustrations of institutional arrangements that support livelihoods and suggest ways in which methods for institutional analysis might be improved.

Notes:

DFID institutional analysis has been limited to 'governance structure'; this paper broadens the analysis to include familial, social, community, collective institutional arrangements, and suggests focus on the inter-relationships of institutions. Proposes need to distinguish between organisations, 'institutions' and 'structures' to strengthen project design. Projects need to respond to 'emergent capital'. (p22) P23 points out decentralisation etc are not panaceas if there are other 'ties that bind'. People live in multi-institutional settings so need allies and advocates who negotiate nested institutional relationships.

Who changes? Institutionalising participation in development


Keywords: participatory approaches, organisational change

Abstract/Summary

This book draws together lessons and experiences from key development agencies around the globe on the institutional change needed to make participation a reality. It focuses specifically on adapting methods from micro to macro organisations and the type of changes required by an organisation to implement participatory approaches effectively. It is concluded that participation is being institutionalised but awareness must be raised about the pitfalls of scaling up too quickly, and that there must be both a personal and organisational commitment to change over the long term. Participation is about a vision not just a methodology.

Notes:

Key considerations for SLA: suggestion that significant timeframes are required in order to engender real participation- 10 years is proposed as a minimum; organisational procedure must harmonise with participatory vision or the success of the strategy will be compromised. Offers a role for projects as areas for experimentation before scaling up.
Ethical Trade and Sustainable Rural Livelihoods- Case Studies

Blowfield, M. & Gallet, S. (2000). Natural Resources Institute

Keywords: fair trade, SRL

Abstract/Summary
This is a case study examining the work of the Ghanaian company 'Volta River Estates Ltd.', which produces bananas for the European fair trade market. This study uses a broad livelihoods analysis to examine the context in which the company operates, and what impact the company has had on the creation of sustainable rural livelihoods. It suggest that banana plantations can increase livelihood opportunities for certain groups of people without negatively affecting the natural resource base, but the distribution of earned income may not extend to family units. Involvement with fair trade has specifically strengthened the social capital of the workforce, and also allows the company to compete on the European market.

Notes:
Recognises the need for the contribution of fair trade to sustainable rural livelihoods to be assessed beyond the community level. A broad SLA analysis is shown to offer an instructive perspective on how a commercial organisation has used the advantages of fair trade to improve its own financial standing, whilst improving the financial and social capital of the workforce, and without damaging levels of natural capital.

Livelihoods Asset Tracking (LAST) A case from Rajastan


Keywords: SLA, impact monitoring

Abstract/Summary
Outlines an attempt to make capital assets comparable using locally derived scoring criteria to give an aggregate livelihoods score. This method has only recently been trailed and there are some questions concerning its replicability and comparability. Suggests that additional analysis is required to understand assets at an intra household level.

Notes:
Interesting study—would be useful to see trailed in other case studies to answer outstanding questions. Are there examples in case studies of similar methods being used elsewhere?

Implementing a SL framework for policy-directed research: Reflections from practice in Mali


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary
Paper discusses the experience of carrying out research in a village in Mali as part of a multi-country, comparative research programme on SL. Second part places field experience in the broader context of the relationship between research and policy, particularly in terms of the exchange and flow of information between different stakeholders in the development policy process.

Notes:
Areas where SLA could have an impact on policy making: promoting broader understanding of livelihoods as systematic and dynamic; project design and monitoring, participatory action research.
Goodbye to Projects?

Participatory Poverty Assessments and Public Services: Key Messages From the Poor

Keywords: Participatory poverty assessments

Abstract/Summary
Improving public services and policy are vital elements in sustainable development strategies. An important innovation has been emergence of PPA. PPAs seek to understand poverty from the standpoint of the poor themselves and have led to a deeper understanding of their poverty. This report summarises the key messages that poor people around the world are sending to policy makers, without wishing to standardise a global view.

Notes:
Conclusions support SL core principles- poor understand their poverty, value self-reliance and hold many answers to their situation. Implications for SWAps noted: lack of sectoral integration reinforces the perception that public sectors are failing to take account of the complexities of livelihoods. (p25)

The Status of Sector Wide Approaches

Keywords: SWAps

Abstract/Summary
A summary of experiences of SWAps to date of publication. Addresses: ownership, partnership & conditionality, management, dealing with poverty, participation & political accountability, capacity building, target setting, monitoring, and financial accountability.

Notes:
SWAps manage a clearer relationship between policy and implementation than in 'projects'. Successful SWAps appear to fulfill more SL principles than unsuccessful. Suggests more civil society participation is required and better understanding of poverty. An SL SWAp? Concern from some donors that they will 'lose touch', and belief that projects encourage innovation p34.

Trade-off Analysis for Participatory Coastal Zone Decision-Making

Keywords: trade-off analysis

Abstract/Summary
Guide to undertaking a trade-off analysis approach to participatory coastal zone decision-making. This is an interdisciplinary tool that can provide support to decision makers. It draws on stakeholder analysis, multi-criteria analysis and consensus building techniques.

Notes:
Interesting case study of Buccoo Reef Marine Park in Tobago, showing how it is possible to tackle cross-sectoral factors and build participatory decision-making processes.

Rural Africa at the Crossroads: Livelihood practices and policies
Bryceson, D (2000). ODI Natural Resources Perspectives Number 52

Keywords: Diversification, livelihoods

Abstract/Summary
African peasant societies have been extremely responsive to neo-liberalism with as yet unclear implications for social and economic fabric of African countries. SRL theory has developed in response. Too much emphasis may be given to social capital, more focus on building human capital may be required.

Notes:
Raises a good point concerning emphasis on different forms of capital. Would be interesting to see if interventions tend to concentrate on one particular type of capital.
Implementing the Sustainable rural livelihoods approach


Keywords: SRL, SLA, framework

Abstract/Summary
Short paper summarizing current thinking on SRL: discusses framework and moves on to consider action and to suggest ways in which DfID activities, skills and partnerships will need to change in order to promote SRL

Notes:
P5: need to negotiate indicators of success with local people but asks is there also a need for indicators of sustainability to be compulsory? P6: need to elevate learning process within project, be more systematic in terms of experimentation with approaches. P11 suggests there are more/less robust ways of making decisions-interesting to assess what they might be.

Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: What Contribution can we make? (Introductory chapter)


Keywords: SLA, framework for SRL, capital assets.

Abstract/Summary
Intro chap. Summarises core elements of DfID SRL framework the value of which lies in dynamic cross-sectoral analysis, building on strengths, attempting to understand full impact of change, micro-macro links and sustainability emphasis.

Notes:
The much-quoted DfID vision of a SLA. Raises concerns about the ability of DfID staff to employ approach, and whether DfID's structure will allow cross-sectoral working. Potential problems with DfID project cycle being too time consuming and risk averse. (Would be interesting to see how DfID has managed some of these issues.) Suggests that sector programmes may be at odds with SLA (see Akroyd & Duncan in same volume), but should not become area-focused. Text stresses that entry points for intervention are multi-level but can the SRL framework operate in the same way at each level.

Agriculture Sector Programmes


Keywords: SWAps, donor funding, institutional implications, accountability

Abstract/Summary
DfID/Neda view on how SWAps can contribute to improving livelihoods and reducing poverty. Discussion of how to adjust operational dimensions, including changing role of donor from 'owner' to stakeholder.

Notes:
Interesting points: How is a sector being defined? SWAps as a way of managing government. Stresses wider linkages of sector and need to include bottom-up and decentralised planning processes. (SWAps as a key part of SLA?)

Livelihoods Approaches Compared


Keywords: SLA, frameworks, assets

Abstract/Summary
Comparison of Livelihoods approaches of DFID, CARE, Oxfam and UNDP

Notes:
Some differences in use of frameworks but all broadly similar. Oxfam is particularly interesting as it is a highly decentralised organisation and appears to be less inclined towards formalising an SLA. There are differences about the sustainability aspect. Would be interesting to study interventions managed by these agencies to identify practical differences in approach. (This work is currently being updated)
Goodbye to Projects?

The sustainability enigma: aid dependency and the phasing out of projects: the case of Swedish aid.


Keywords: projects, aid dependence.

Abstract/Summary

This paper explores the complications in the relationship between aid dependence and project phase out in Tanzania. It concludes that project phase out is complicated by the lack of financial sustainability of the supported institutions, caused by the level of technical ambition, lack of finance, organisational and financial skills, government expectations and donor replaceability, perverted project incentive structures, lack of attention to cost-effectiveness during projects, and the vested interests of stakeholders.

Notes:

Recommendations made by the report are that aid should become demand driven and performance oriented; aid should be shifted from primarily being a gov to gov undertaking to aid that responds to the whole of society; aid should be focused on becoming a knowledge-based service venture rather than an administrator of aid flows.

Responsible Well-Being- A Personal Agenda for Development.


Keywords: participation

Abstract/Summary

Drawing on experience with participatory approaches and methods that enable the poor to express their realities, responsible well-being is proposed as a central concept for the development agenda. This links with capabilities and livelihoods, and is based on equity and sustainability as principles. The primacy of personal actions and non-actions in development points to the need for a pedagogy for the non-oppressed.

Notes:

Included this in the review because it raises some interesting points that may be relevant to SLA. Some readings have suggested that the language of SLA is too specialised: so how do SLA interventions explain themselves, are they self-aware? Could SLA transform personal working practice?

Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: Practical Concepts for the 21st Century


Keywords: SL, capabilities, equity, sustainability

Abstract/Summary

This paper is the foundation for much of the following work on SL. It was intended to provoke discussion by exploring and elaborating on the concept of sustainable livelihoods. Livelihoods need to be socially and environmentally sustainable: requires new concepts and analysis for policy and practice. Normative aim is SL for all; this should be a focus for the 21st century and signpost priorities for policy and research.

Notes:

P4-6 develops concepts that can be used analytically to generate insight, and as a focus and tool for decision-making: capability, equity, and sustainability. Provides useful insight into foundations of SL concepts, covers more of political dimensions than current DfID work. P7/8 source of much quoted definition of sustainable livelihoods. It is critical of conventional decision-making and explains that it isn't always necessary to know 'how much?'. knowing 'more' or 'less' is often better. Proposes composite criterion measuring net SL. P30 the key to assessment are local experts. P31/2 Policy implications aimed at enhancing capability, improving equity, increasing social sustainability.
The New Dynamics of Aid: Power, Procedures and Relationships.


Keywords: poverty reduction, accountability, trust

Abstract/Summary

Effective poverty reduction requires narrowing the gap between words and actions, making trust and accountability real within and between organisations, at all levels and between all actors. Aid agencies today are shifting emphasis from projects and service delivery to a language of rights and governance. They have introduced new approaches and requirements, stressing partnership and transparency. But embedded traditions and bureaucratic inertia mean old behaviours, procedures and organisational cultures persist. The way forward is to achieve consistency between personal behaviour, institutional norms and the new development agenda.

Notes:

Does the SLA offer transformation of development interventions? This paper suggests a shift in control of power is needed but that the gap between rhetoric and reality has widened. A move away from projects is required to programmes which are less confident about cause/effect, that are transparent and accountable, where the language is less technical and more 'power' related, and where procedures are based around negotiated principles and process. Do this argue against the development of an SL framework? Does such a framework over codify and reinforce gap between policy analysts and 'people'? What do case studies show? Would a fusion of SLA/RBA principles make a better way forward?

Extension, Poverty and Vulnerability: Inception Report of a Study for the Neuchatel Initiative


Keywords: poverty, vulnerability, extension

Abstract/Summary

Paper reviews recent trends in poverty, vulnerability and extension, and the policy context in which extension is located, in order to identify key areas for further investigation. It takes an SL view of poverty and defines the purpose of extension as being the broadening of choice. This paper questions how priorities should be set: between the aim of reaching the poorest producers or performing triage on the existing system, in order to benefit the poor as consumers and labourers. Extension now needs to be able to facilitate diversification strategies.

Notes:

This paper represents new questions to be answered by case studies to be performed in Uganda, Nicaragua and Vietnam. The results will be of direct relevance to SL analysis and other new approaches aimed at reducing poverty. New forms of extension will need new forms of intervention, if as in this paper, it has been informed by an SLA/ other new approaches.

Community Based Rural Development: Reducing Poverty from the Ground Up


Keywords: empowerment, social capital, projects, programmes, community-based organisations.

Abstract/Summary

According to World Bank experience, projects that are implemented with 'community based techniques' can contribute to poverty reduction by: building social capital and empowering the poor, changing the way citizens and government view each other, increasing access to physical, social and economic infrastructure. The challenge is to turn social capital into economic capital. Communities are central to the process, making decisions over subprojects, setting-up their own accounts, accessing funds from a variety of sources, managing and implementing projects. Sustainability, mainstreaming and replicability of CBRD are achieved through links with governments and the private sector.

Notes:

CBRD returns to a holistic approach to rural development that had been abandoned after the failure of integrated rural development. CBRD is viewed as being fundamentally different through a decentralised and participatory decision-making process. Specifically outlines management procedure for CBO involvement with 'projects', dealing specifically with CBOs as project managers. Both resources and information need to be supplied to CBOs, in order that resources are used 'productively and efficiently'.
Goodbye to Projects?

Participation: The New Tyranny?

Keywords: Participation

Abstract/Summary
This book fundamentally challenges the universal rhetoric of participation, which promises empowerment and appropriate development. It points out how participation as practised by consultants and activists, can actually lead to the unjust and illegitimate exercise of power. There are very real concerns about the naivety of assumptions about the authenticity of motivations and behaviour in participatory processes; how the language of empowerment masks a lack of management effectiveness; and how an emphasis on the micro level of intervention can obscure, and indeed sustain, broader macro-level inequalities and injustice.

Notes:
A particularly interesting comparison can be made between Hildyard et al’s contribution to this book, 'Pluralism, participation and power: Joint Forest Management in India and Hobley (2000a). The chapter in this book is critical of the local forest management bodies that constituted participation by local people in the management of the forest. However, in contrast Hobley's report speaks of the success of the same groups and how the set-up might be used as a model for participatory forest management. What this shows is that participation cannot be used uncritically as a principle without first disaggregating what the term actually means.

Beneficiary, Consumer, Citizen: Changing Perspectives on Participation for Poverty Reduction.

Keywords: participation

Abstract/Summary
This study examines the rise of terms such as 'participation', 'partnership' and 'empowerment'. This paper discusses some of the dilemmas of institutionalising these concepts, by drawing out the complexity of participation and the paradoxes contained within it. In relation to projects, Cornwall argues that despite much criticism and rumours of their demise; projects may be rescued by 'community driven development'. Questions are also raised about claims to 'authenticity' embodied in policy processes such as PPAs. The conclusion is that while 'invited participation' has opened up 'new spaces' for engagement in the development process, this is not enough to tackle exclusion and poverty. People need to make and shape their own space of engagement.

Notes:
This study is critical of the notion that participation can ultimately pull people out of poverty. It highlights the need for caution when using a term like 'participation' in the context of SLA lists of principles. What do SLA interventions mean by participation? Do they or can they offer more than 'invitations'. Can SLA interventions use participation to enable people to 'make and shape their own spaces' and to hold local and global institutions to account?

Bridging the gap: citizenship, participation & accountability
Cornwall, A. & Gaventa, J. (2001). IIED PLA Notes no.40

Keywords: participation, empowerment

Abstract/Summary
Traditional forms of political representation are being re-examined, direct democratic movements are increasingly drawn upon to enable citizens to play a more active role in decisions. Therefore questions of how citizens express voice and how institutional responsiveness and accountability can be ensured have become paramount. Article examines contemporary participatory mechanism that link micro-macro.

Notes: Included in review, as the idea that participation if approached in the right way can actually address micro-macro links is an important one in relation to the SL framework. Can we find a case study that has enabled beneficiaries themselves to tackle micro-macro links? This reconfigures the boundaries of 'expertise'-what are the implications?
Sustainable Livelihoods, Policies and Policy Formulation- An Issues Paper


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

Setting the stage for dialogue contributing to conceptual and operational understanding of the policy analysis, formulation and management needs for SLA. Need to evolve understanding of SLA as a multitrack/stakeholder strategic planning and management process, a box of tools, a policy analysis, formulation and management agency, and national development framework.

Notes:

This conception of SLA appears to work at quite a different level to DFID. Specific projects are absent from the analysis which advocates: 'that SLA should provide the operational basis for citizen initiated and managed 'development' (p2)

Whose Development? An Ethnography of Aid


Keywords: development, policies & practice.

Abstract/Summary

The authors use ethnographic case material from aid projects in Africa and Asia to examine a number of deep-seated assumptions in the minds of 'developers'. An exploration of the relationship between expatriate development personnel, local government officials and beneficiaries of aid reveals how deeply embedded are power inequalities based on race, class and gender.

The power of 'developers' is questioned and the need for a more 'nuanced, contextual account' of the complexities and relationships within development interventions is required.

Notes:

This book adds to Chambers' call for reform of interventions to begin with a reassessment of personal values. The SLA is no different. Do new approaches to intervention address the power inequalities in the aid relationship or are they simply redefined? The design of interventions transmits a certain world view (ideology). What do case studies show? Do SLA, RBA, SWAps have the potential to transform ideology?

An evolutionary approach to facilitating organisational learning: An experiment by the Christian Commission for Development in Bangladesh


Keywords: participatory approaches

Abstract/Summary

In 1994 CCDB planned a deliberate experiment with a programme to abandon the use of 'indicators'. This paper is a summary of the experiment and raises questions about the evaluation of monitoring schemes.

Notes:

Interesting experiment: shows some successes in using stories of change as a monitoring tool. However, process was still initially subject to distortions by the hierarchy of the organisation, but using the evolutionary approach the system was able to adapt and change. Questions also remain concerning the need for translatable external information.
**Goodbye to Projects?**

**Migrants, Livelihoods, and Rights: The relevance of migration in development policies**


**Keywords:** Livelihoods, migration, policy

**Abstract/Summary**

Paper aims to inform development policy debates with an improved understanding of migration. It starts with the idea that these debates pay too little attention to the contribution of migration to poverty reduction: policies tend to ignore migration or have the explicit or implicit aim to reduce migration. Building on ideas about SL this paper argues that we need a better understanding of the capabilities and strategies of poor people, in their own perspective, and that this will help to improve development policies. The paper reveals the complexity of the composition of migrant streams and that it is a common element of livelihood strategies.

**Notes:**

Recognising the importance of migration highlights the need for a dynamic conceptualisation of households' livelihoods. Policy should therefore understand the role of migration in livelihood strategies and not merely aim to reduce it, but seek to support and protect migrants from the potential costs of migration.

**Income risk, coping strategies and safety nets**


**Keywords:** assets, coping strategies

**Abstract/Summary**

Households in developing countries face considerable risks which threaten their livelihoods. This paper discusses the different strategies that households use to cope with this risk. It focuses specifically on income-based strategies, on assets as self-insurance and on informal insurance arrangements. Income-based strategies are limited due to entry-constraints into profitable activities. Self-insurance is limited by access to assets and the poor functioning of assets markets when crises occur. Informal insurance arrangements are affected by sustainability constraints, which often exclude the poor; and economy-wide shocks cannot be handled by these arrangements.

**Notes:**

The main conclusions are that: economic policies could contribute to better protection against risk. Increased access to diversified income streams or public safety nets may offer some protection to vulnerability. Public safety nets can undermine informal arrangements. More work is required to explore how to strengthen self-insurance such as group-based savings.

**Tanzania Country Strategy Paper**

*DFID (1999a). DFID CSP*  

**Keywords:** Tanzania

**Abstract/Summary**

Country strategy paper for DFID activities in Tanzania; commitment to five impact areas: improved public resource and economic management, improved education and health status, improved productive opportunities, enhanced participation in dev process by poor people and improved awareness of their civil, social and political rights.

**Notes:**

DFID states a commitment to a range of areas but projected spending is significantly focused at public resource and economic management - SWAs.
South Africa Country Strategy Paper

*DFID (1999b). DFID CSP*

**Keywords:** South Africa

**Abstract/Summary**

CSP stresses the need to focus on the poorest people as inequality is so large in SA, and in monetary terms DFID's contribution to gov is small. DFID is specifically committed to sustainable wealth creation, improving the effectiveness of gov for service delivery, and developing SRL and initiatives with direct benefit to poor people.

**Notes:**

Emphasis of DFIDSA is on building 'partnerships' with gov, civil society and business. Expenditure breakdown shows a decrease in specifically earmarked funds. Increased funding towards more general heading e.g. policies and actions that promote SL. How does this changing emphasis show up in interventions?

Sustainable Livelihoods Guidance Sheets

*DFID (2000). DFID*

**Keywords:** SLA

**Abstract/Summary**

Series of outlining the background to DFID SLA, its uses, methods etc. Series 1-4, 8 available, 5-7 planned for future.

**Notes:**

Interesting to note that 'projects' are themselves not questioned-gives impression that SLA is to be imposed onto existing structures. Series 8 is a useful guide to literature and websites. Limited discussion of sustainability.

Achieving Sustainability: Poverty Elimination and the environment

*DFID (2000a). DFID- strategies for achieving the IDTs (Oct 2000)*

**Keywords:** sustainability, poverty reduction

**Abstract/Summary**

Paper argues that for development to be sustainable there needs to be effective management of the environment and equal attention paid to social, economic and environmental factors. Misconceptions about the links between poverty and the environment are discussed and the need for a greater emphasis on causes of poverty asserted. Report recommends country-led strategies with emphasis on improved governance.

**Notes:**

Briefly mentions SL - section 3 looking at experience. Talks more in general terms about making interventions more people-centred, working with civil society, private sector and governments. P43 outlines specific recommendations for DFID projects and programmes: encourage managers to take a longer term perspective, create a stronger network of environmental advisors across sectors, use environmental screening earlier in project design, provide a responsive and reliable source of environmental advice.

Better Livelihoods for Poor People

*DFID (2000b). DFID proceedings of a workshop held in Pretoria, 9-11 May 2000*

**Keywords:** SLA

**Abstract/Summary**

Workshop aimed to review progress of DFID SLA/country strategy in SA, to identify future joint work with partners and review ways to improve partnerships. Specific recommendations were: greater involvement of DFID partners, better info sharing, support for partners and consultants, simplified project management

**Notes:** Most interesting is section 5.1, which breaks down the strengths and weaknesses of the DFID/SA partnership. It appears to suggest that DFID can be seen as arrogant and overly top-down, with overly complex funding procedures. Does this represent a gap between rhetoric and practice in the SLA? Do DFID administrative procedures constrain changes to interventions? Some good suggestions arise e.g. funding complementary baskets of projects as opposed to isolated ones.
Realising human rights for poor people


Keywords: human rights, poverty reduction

Abstract/Summary

Paper presents a strategy for the achievement of human rights and fundamental freedoms of poor people; this is based on 3 principles: participation, inclusion and fulfilling obligation (in terms of strengthening policy and institutions to meet human rights standards)

Notes:

Recommendations for action potentially match some of SLA principles: greater participation of poor in decision-making process, and increased capacity to claim their rights. At a national level the reform of legal frameworks, policy and service delivery to respond to the needs, interests and rights of all. DFID's main stated contribution is to giving priority to linking poor people's perspectives with national and international policy

The DELIVERI programmes


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

Overview of DELIVERI programme decentralisation of Livestock Services in the Eastern Regions of Indonesia. Programme was not initially designed using SLA but later adopted it.

Notes:

NB the project format restricted responses to data that arose from SL analysis.

Inter-agency Experiences and Lessons: from the forum on operationalising SLAs


Keywords: SLAs

Abstract/Summary

Report on debate from forum that examined the background to SLA and considered the lessons learned so far, and identifies the limitations and grey areas of the approach. SLA add value through key principles which were widely agreed upon. Issues needing further clarification: whether SLA could reach poorest, most effective entry points, best way to app policy, how to prioritise interventions, indicators to use and inadequacy of DFID framework.

Notes: Interesting critique of DFID framework. Suggestion that it requires revision to: make people visible, distinguish levels of analysis of assets, recognise socio-economic differentiation, incorporate historical and dynamic elements, to be sufficiently flexible to identify social networks that bind different livelihood systems together, address cultural specificity (reports suggest the concept is not easily translatable), incorporate the political dimension. Notes that SLA has been slow to penetrate other DFID fields that favour SWAps. Tension noted between need to design more flexible projects and donor funding/accountability structures
Environmental Movements in the Global South: Issues of Livelihood and beyond

**Keywords:** Livelihoods, environmental movements.

**Abstract/Summary**

Article looks at the struggles and actions over environmental issues in the context of the developing world. Looks at the strengths and weaknesses of SLA, which seems to dominate analysis of the environmental movement. Livelihoods approach may be appropriate to explain resource conflicts, the study of movements requires attention to political variables: actors, stakes and practices and so forth. Calls for the integration of collective action theory with SLA.

**Notes:**

SLA used here in relation to environmental movements: meaning that it is assumed that people organise around threats to livelihoods. Useful point here for our analysis is that actually people organise around alternative visions for development. This highlights that linking micro-macro issues is not a straightforward process, in that local people are concerned with local-global linkages and not just with responding to specific contextual conditions.

**Household Strategies and Rural Livelihood Diversification**


**Keywords:** diversification, household analysis

**Abstract/Summary**

Article reviews recent literature on diversification as a strategy of rural households in developing countries. The conclusion reached is that removal of constraints to, and expansion of opportunities for, diversification are desirable policy objectives because they give individuals and households more capabilities to improve livelihood security and to raise living standards.

**Notes:**

Main point is that a better understanding of diversity is needed to underpin social safety net and poverty reduction policies. Does the SLA implicitly/explicitly deal with diversity? How is recognition of diversity built into policy and action?

**Livelihood Diversification and SRLs**


**Keywords:** Diversification, SRL

**Abstract/Summary**

Rural households depend on a diverse portfolio of activities and income sources. A combination of participatory methods and small scale sample surveys is likely to prove the most cost effective means of determining the livelihood strategies of rural households. In general, the positive effects of diversification outweigh the negative. Interventions should be designed to allow the poor to take up opportunities to diversify income.

**Notes:**

Key conclusion is that assumptions about livelihood strategies should always be tested- to what extent is this shown in case studies?
Goodbye to Projects?

Rural Livelihood diversity in developing countries: evidence and policy implications
Ellis, F. (1999). ODI natural Resource Perspectives Number 40

Keywords: diversity, SLA

Abstract/Summary
Key conclusions: Reform for good governance is required to ensure an enabling and facilitating environment. Human capital is the key to successful divers; education requires ongoing emphasis. Infrastructure merits priority, in addition to continued improvement to micro-credit schemes. Enhancing the asset status of women also merits attention.

Notes:
Would be interesting to look at extent and recognition of diversity of livelihoods in development interventions. Diversity can play a role in improved resilience, stability and adaptability. Benefits of diversity are context-specific and Ellis suggests that high standards of living result from a move towards specialisation. (?) Ellis recommends that practical applications of SL framework need to place diversity high on the policy agenda for the alleviation of poverty.

Rural Livelihoods and Diversity in Developing Countries

Keywords: Livelihood diversity, SL framework

Abstract/Summary
Sets out rural livelihoods approach within the larger context of past and current themes in development using diversity as a principal theme. Explores implications of diverse RLs for ideas about poverty, agriculture, environment, gender and macro-economic policy.

Notes:
P241 RLA useful as an organising framework used in a processual way being left deliberately broad. Notes the adoption of the framework as the way forward, but warns that it must not become over-codified and obligatory. This would have the effect of 'suspending imagination' and 'intelligent observation'.

Learning from change: Issues and experiences in participatory monitoring and evaluation

Keywords: PM & E

Abstract/Summary
Draws together a range of case studies of PM & E: outlines a range of emerging issues: need to clarify concepts of participation, identify appropriate methodologies, develop and build on capacity for PM&E, scale-up PM&E and promote institutional learning.

Notes:
P9 re indicators note new suggested acronym to add to SMART- SPICED- subjective, participatory, interpreted, communicable, empowering, disaggregated. (Roche, forthcoming). Reinforces point that PM&E is necessarily dynamic and that trying to capture the process is like trying to hit a moving target.
Who Counts Reality? Participatory monitoring and evaluation: a literature review
Keywords: participatory monitoring, evaluation
Abstract/Summary
Literature review covers experiences in PM & E used in differing contexts and involving all kinds of stakeholders. It introduces the key principles of PM & E, its applications for differing purposes, and a number of tools and methods used, including participatory learning methodologies as well as more conventional approaches.
Notes:
Notes the widely differing use of PM&E, and relative lack of information detailing actual experiences as opposed to 'how to' manuals. 4 challenges for future research and implementation are identified: understanding PM & E as a social process, methodological issues; the institutionalisation and scaling up of PM & E; and need for more documentation.

The European Policy in Support of Rural Development in Developing Countries
Keywords: policy
Abstract/Summary
Paper lays out the background and focus for EU rural development policy. The key commitment is to improving rural livelihoods. Policy will be designed to seek the following results: more peaceful, equitable, open and democratic rural societies, more effective and accountable rural institutions, economic policies enabling rural growth, enhanced individual assets of rural dwellers, more sustainable natural resource management, more coherence between EU agricultural, trade, environmental and immigration policies and the commitment to improving rural livelihoods.
Notes:
EU proposes to be more selective with aid and countries must meet certain political requirements in order to receive it. Proposes that plans should be negotiated with beneficiary countries but only after defined and prepared strategies are drawn up.

Sustainable Livelihoods, Rights and The New Architecture of Aid.
Keywords: SLA, rights approach, PRSPs, MTEFs, CDFs
Abstract/Summary
This paper gives an overview of the range and provision of new aid vehicles, mainly derived by Washington-based institutions, and assesses how they might relate to existing approaches to development, specifically sustainable livelihoods and rights-based approaches. New approaches seek closer orientation of country development programmes with requirements stipulated by the poor themselves, with a high degree of ownership by partner governments. Such programmes need orientation towards appropriate principles and the challenges and opportunities presented by globalisation.
Notes:
SLA are based on many of the same principles as RBA but are less concerned with normative judgments about entitlements, but concentrate on the consequences of different entitlements for different groups. SLA can complement new approaches by identifying entry points, offering a qualitative perspective on the needs of the poor and providing a 'reality-check’ on the growing macro focus of aid.
New Approaches to Development Co-operation: What can we learn from experience with implementing SWAps?


Keywords: SWAps, direct budget support

Abstract/Summary
Outlines the rationale behind sector programmes in the context of evolving thinking on aid effectiveness. Discusses need for sector programme to nest within wider government policy; and problems of co-ordinating donors and Gov.

Notes:
SWAps should increase government capacity, but should build on structures/mechanisms in place. Ownership and commitment to process by donors and government is required. Ideal is for government to co-ordinate donors but reality is widely variable, donors exert influence at every level.

Sector Programme Approaches: Will they work in Agriculture?


Keywords: sector approach

Abstract/Summary
Article explores why SWAps, in which donor funds support a single sector plan under government leadership, have performed less well in agriculture than in the social sectors. Many problems stem from the more limited, more contested and shrinking role of the state in the agricultural sector. It argues that sector programmes have worked best where the key constraints on sector development are the responsibility of a single ministry, whereas agricultural development requires co-ordination across sectors. Swaps may have a limited role in delivering better focused agricultural services, but fundamental policy questions need to be resolved first. This is more likely if reform is channelled through central economic ministries.

Notes:
The agriculture sector shows more barriers to swaps that other social sectors, and some of these may support the continued use of projects. However, the authors argue that despite the difficulties progress may be made if a SWAp is based on good diagnosis of the sector's problems. It may be necessary to focus efforts more on central economic policy, and in assisting government to define it's role in the sector. Some suggestion is made that decentralisation will be necessary to make the SWAps locally responsive. There would be potential for the SLA to contribute to this and in developing a better understanding of the multiple influences on the sector.

The World Bank and Social Capital: contesting the concept in practice


Keywords: social capital

Abstract/Summary
World Bank loans influence the environment for social capital formation. They may have positive or negative effects. This paper reviews experience in rural Mexico, concluding that in many cases the Bank appears to be contributing to the dismantling of social capital more than its construction.

Notes:
Interesting point concerning assumptions about the neutrality of funding. Suggests that WB funding in certain Mexican states supports government and therefore undermines the social capital of opposing groups. This may be a concern re SWAPs, and something that SLA can be sensitive to at the micro-level.
Operationalising Household Livelihood Security: A Holistic Approach for Addressing Poverty and Vulnerability


Keywords: Household livelihood security, holistic analysis, participatory processes

Abstract/Summary
Outlines how CARE has officially adopted Household Livelihood Strategy as a programming framework. Addresses the implications for strategic planning, diagnosis, design, implementation, monitoring, reformulation, evaluation

Notes:
Utilises a different conception of SLA to DfID/alternative models but broadly similar. Good overview of trying to apply an SLA to development interventions. How effective is focus on 'household' as unit of analysis? CARE gathers information through rapid livelihood security assessments, which are not explicitly participatory. P21/2 project design framework is iterative, and non-linear. Projects should be linked to a focused strategy. Does not address issues of power within main text, but appendix ii advocates using a right-based approach to cover this dimension.

Sector Approaches, Sustainable Livelihoods and Rural Poverty Reduction


Keywords: SLA, SWAps

Abstract/Summary
This article examines the relationship between sector-wide approaches (SWAps), SLAs and rural poverty reduction. The authors suggest that SLAs provide one means by which SWAps can focus more effectively on poverty reduction, whilst SWAps provide an entry point via which government and donor initiatives can be made more supportive of the livelihoods of the poor. This article puts forward guidelines indicating the core issues upon which donors should focus to enhance the poverty impact of SWAps.

Notes:
The SWAp process will be strengthened by the SLA principles. Projects may still be useful in countries where Governments have limited capacity. Note four recommendations: Donors must work to develop pro-poor political will, donors must be realistic about the organisational capacity and resources available to government, and impact from moves such as decentralisation; coherent analysis of poverty and its causes- where SLA can assist; SWAps should be viewed as a long-term process, new projects and programmes must be considered within a framework which explicitly deals with the status of these core factors which influence aid effectiveness.

Addressing food security in Africa via multiple livelihood strategies of women farmers


Keywords: livelihood strategies

Abstract/Summary
Food security is primarily a problem of low household incomes and poverty, and not just inadequate food production, so projects and programmes for food insecure African Farmers which aim at increasing production of subsistence crops may be ineffective. Different development interventions, both in policy and in technology, are therefore needed to address food security and economic transformations in Africa in the long and short term.

Notes:
Four suggestions for increasing food security are made: encourage women's income generating activities and multiple livelihood strategies, complement this with agricultural research programs aimed at increasing women's returns to their land, realise women are not a homogenous group and more than one recommendation will be needed, in short run provide the poorest women farmers with productivity-enhancing safety nets. This analysis appears to follow a similar approach to SLA-good example of application to a particular area of research.
Bridging citizen voice and client focus into service delivery

Keywords: governance, voice, participation, accountability

Abstract/Summary
This paper is a study of efforts to improve the responsiveness of public service providers to the needs of service users. It examines over 60 case studies of both public sector reform to foster stronger client focus in service delivery, and civil-society initiatives to demand improved services. The primary concern was to identify ways of amplifying citizen 'voice'. It concludes that citizens need the 'right' more meaningful forms of participation. Formal recognition of citizen groups within government decision-making would be crucial, although public sector providers need mechanisms to assess the legitimacy of the 'voice' of such groups.

Notes:
This analysis addresses how to translate from micro-macro level. It would be interesting to relate the range of case studies and conclusions to the mechanisms for hearing 'voices' that SLA and other interventions use. Again the crucial role of front-line delivery staff is underlined. Is their position used to effect by SLA interventions? A final point is that participation has its limits, and may not always be desirable.

Institutional Support for SRL in SA: results from Zimbabwe, Zambia and SA

Keywords: SLA, institutions

Abstract/Summary
SLA provides a fresh optic in poverty analysis. This paper reports on work carried out with partners in Zimbabwe, Zambia and South Africa by Khanya for DFID, and addresses the key findings from the four case studies according to levels of support and action, types of organisation, policy issues, and the process of managing change to promote SLs.

Notes:
Key conclusions: SLA helps identify support required to assist poor; to provide this support, decentralised policies and action need to be strengthened. New approaches are needed for village level service delivery and to link community based planning with local government. Approaches to public sector reform need to increase effectiveness. National strategies must be based on real understanding of micro-level reality. Joint learning programmes are needed between SA countries and donors to explore new answers to poverty: policies and structures of both may need significant change.

Decentralisation and SRL

Keywords: Decentralisation, SRL

Abstract/Summary
Decentralisation is seen as a way of giving people a voice in local affairs. Attempts to address the institutional issues relating to SRL and focuses on people as citizens who have a fundamental right to democratic accountability and a role in the decision-making services that they receive are examined.

Notes:
One argument is that decentralisation can provide a responsive, learning environment for development. Interventions should be 'process projects, responsive and flexible, with an appropriate orientation, milestones and support process- how would these be decided?'
Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation: Learning from change

Keywords: participatory, monitoring, evaluation

Abstract/Summary
Development organisations need to know how effective interventions have been, but who should make these judgments and on what basis? PM & E can reveal valuable lessons and improve accountability. However it is a challenging process that encourages people to examine their assumptions about what constitutes progress, and to face up to conflicts and contradictions about what emerges.

Notes:
Projects and programmes will be fundamentally challenged by PM & E. Would be interesting to study degree of participation in case studies, and particularly to establish if results from participation are changing the way that interventions are implemented. Common mistakes noted are: assuming all stakeholders want to be involved, using inappropriate indicators and methods, being unclear how the info will be used and by whom; collecting unnecessary info, starting too big, too soon.

Methodological issues in PM&E

Keywords: participatory monitoring and evaluation.

Abstract/Summary
Chapter discusses the methodological issues that arise from the principles behind PM&E: who needs the info, in what form, at what point and for what. This requires a new openness to learning, new types of indicators (or their absence) and new roles for established partners. Challenges do not lie with creating methods or perfecting indicators. Criticises project cycle as heavy-handed and suggests that PM&E does not fit easily in it.

Notes:
Identifies problems with projects that require pre-defined plans to meet pre-defined objectives. The time scale is a particular problem. How does SLA then manage trade-off between participatory principle and project format?

Business development services and the policy environment

Keywords: micro-finance, SLA

Abstract/Summary
SL analysis of micro-enterprise

Notes:
Conclusion: SLA suggests more concentration by agencies on improving policy environment and persuading public officials to use micro-enterprises to run public services. Both methods involve working closely with and through city authorities rather than setting up local projects'.

Social Capital as a product of Class Mobilization and State Intervention: Industrial Workers in Kerala, India

Keywords: social capital, synergy

Abstract/Summary
Argues that state intervention and class mobilization in Kerala have produced two forms of social capital. High levels of social development and successful redistributive reforms are the result of mutually reinforcing interactions between a programmatic labour movement and a democratic state. This synergy has created the institutional forms and political processes required for negotiating between redistribution and growth.

Notes: Kerala provides an interesting example of the importance of social capital for development. The synergy between state and labour is an interesting relationship that might be explored further. Such synergy might be considered in relation to SWAps, and SLAs
**Goodbye to Projects?**

**Whose reality, whose effects?**


**Keywords:** PM & E

**Abstract/Summary**

Presentation detailing experience of PM & E and identifying some key principles: local people as active participants, stakeholders evaluate, outsiders facilitate, focus on building stakeholder capacity for analysis, process builds commitment to implementing corrective actions.

**Notes:**

Used a tool called relationship perception mapping for design, implementation, monitoring and change, which can be used at all stages of the project cycle.

**The Reality of Trying to Transform Structures and Processes: Forestry in Rural Livelihoods**


**Keywords:** SLA, NR management

**Abstract/Summary**

Overview of Western Ghats Forestry Project, in Karnataka, setting out the main lessons for change: support needed for process and institutional change, wider involvement in visions for change, stimulation and management of debate. In terms of PCM a 'process' project means the management of relationships. Constraints to effectiveness lay in lack of engagement at different levels and in particularly with political

**Notes:**

Interesting (if complex) analysis of a project that seeks to manage 'process change'. Suggests implications for PCM: necessary to set out a higher-level framework against which to evaluate means and ends. A need for 'models' as opposed to indicators to measure progress was seen to be necessary. See Box 7: The Kotter model of transformation which is pointed out as being a useful framework for institutional change processes but should not be used as a blueprint.

**Institutionalising SLAs**


**Keywords:** SLAs

**Abstract/Summary**

Brief series of notes that expand on presentation (see previous references)

**Notes:**

Specific implication for PCM are given on p4: development of broad-based consultation processes, responsiveness to contingencies, dev of feedback mechanisms and space for learning, iterative design and diagnosis, action-learning, inter-disciplinary, flexibility in entry-points, sequencing of support over longer time frames, shift away from projects to networking/information sharing, policy influence/strategic interventions, new forms of partnership with private and civil sectors and other agencies, new skills to support these approaches- to analyse and support institutional change.
Unpacking the PIP box


Keywords: SL framework, policies, institutions and process

Abstract/Summary

Paper draws together some of the key issues from seven papers produced by DFID PIP sustainable livelihoods sub-group. This attempts to examine what links governance to decentralisation to institutional and organisational change. How does new institutional economics help us understand linkages between different institutional arrangements, what are the practical implications for poor people and what is the role of traditional and new institutional arrangements for improving farmers' voices and ability to access services. What all the papers highlight is the importance of a) intervention at all levels and b) changing power relations in both the so-called supply and demand sides.

Notes:

Process identified the main questions and issues still to be addressed concerning PIPs: what level of change is required by organisations in order to support SL interventions, and how should change be supported? What tools and processes will be useful for developing linkages between clients and policy makers? What is the role of politics and political capital? What is the role of the state (at all levels) in relation to citizens, service delivery and the private sector? How can we develop linkages with traditional institutions and social capital? Where is the market in relation to all this? How can we increase citizen empowerment and state responsiveness? What is the role of information and the media? What mechanisms are there for increasing choice?

Trust and Economic Development


Keywords: social capital, trust

Abstract/Summary

Trust affects economic development. Trust-based relations appear to foster development just as mistrust undermines them. This paper explores the issue and looks at the possibilities for fostering trust.

Notes:


Sustainable Livelihoods and Livelihood Diversification


Keywords: SL, diversity

Abstract/Summary

Preliminary output of a programme looking at alternative routes to SL pursued by people in contrasting agro-ecological settings. Overall aim is to understand how institutional arrangements determine people's entitlements. Proposed that they construct livelihoods via three strategies; agricultural intensification, livelihood diversification, migration.

Notes:

p21 diversification is seen to affect social and institutional relationships e.g. women may displace men in certain activities. Institutions may change in response but there is little existing evidence about cause and effect.
Goodbye to Projects?

Rural institutions in environmental management in Kenya
Idawo, C (1995). Environmental Management in Developing Countries vol 3
Keywords: participatory approaches

Abstract/Summary
Explores the notion that in order to achieve sustainable development rural institutions in Kenya must be incorporated in the planning, implementation and running of NRM projects.

Notes:
p111 PRA as an empowering tool to enable local people to play an active role in the organisation of their own village-based projects: local people need to be trained to manage their own projects. Community Action Plans enable local institutions, government departments and NGOs to work together. It is envisioned that the plan would be implemented and sustained through the village leaders and institutions.

Poverty Reduction Strategies: A Part for the Poor
Keywords: PRSP

Abstract/Summary
In order to trigger debt relief, countries are being asked to produce PRSPs with inputs from all sections of society. While previous experience shows that a lot can be done to make policy processes more responsive to the needs of poor people, it also reveals the many challenges and pitfalls involved. Heeding these lessons will be vital if this new approach is to live up to its ambitious rhetoric.

Notes:
Questions raised about PRSPs are similar to those raised about SLA, in particular concerns re making SLA principles mandatory. This paper raises the question of who decides what standard of participation is acceptable. Ideas about possible pitfalls may also be relevant to SLA: unrealistic or unstated expectations, insufficient time, inadequate dissemination, representation (in terms of failure to represent poorest groups.) and lack of follow-up and feedback. Do case studies show this?

Special issue on participatory monitoring and evaluation. PLA notes 31
Keywords: participatory monitoring, evaluation

Abstract/Summary
There are a growing number of exciting experiences with PM &E. One weakness has been the lack of documentation and this issue aims to inspire others to document their experiences

Notes:
Issue highlights the many forms that PM&E can take. Each one will have differing impacts for PCM. The notes recommend that PM &E should be treated as a process and not an activity, and therefore, this principle should have dramatic effects for the way projects are planned.
Principles of Sustainable Livelihoods


Keywords:  SL

Abstract/Summary

Lays out some key determinants of SL as derived from a North American consultation exercise. By this definition an SL is based on a web of functional interrelationships in which every member of the system is needed and participates. SLs provide meaningful work that fulfills the social, economic, cultural and spiritual needs of all members of the community--human, non-human, present and future--and safeguards cultural and biological diversity.

Notes:

Included to illustrate that alternative definitions of SL are in operation. This definition has a much more wider reach than the more general Chambers one relating to the capacity to withstand shocks and stresses. Different definitions of SL will result in different interventions. Can we find evidence for this in case studies?

The Participatory Approaches Learning Study: Executive summary and recommendations

INTRAC (1998).  DFID Social Development Division

Keywords:  Participatory approaches, PCM

Abstract/Summary

PALS examined the potential for increasing stakeholder participation in DFID country programmes. Its recommendations include proposals on staff development, on ways to make the PCM system more flexible and accountable, and on making participation a stronger characteristic of DFID itself.

Notes:

Good analysis of problems with PCM: excessively strong focus on planning and design, more far reaching consultation with stakeholders needed, over dependence on short-term consultants/advisers (disrupts transfer of learning, monitoring often focused at too high a level. Log frame should be used more creatively and flexibly; limited time frame is a barrier to institutional development. Recommends move to sector investment programmes as long as stakeholders are not marginalised.

Women, Human Capital and Livelihoods:  An Ergonomics Perspective


Keywords:  capital assets, SLA

Abstract/Summary

Human capital is often considered in terms of new skills that dev initiatives seek to impart. This paper argues for complementary perspectives, which are also consistent with a livelihoods app. It first outlines the factors that need to be addressed if existing human capital is to reach its full potential, and suggests what contribution ergonomics can make to safeguarding and enhancing human capital

Notes:

Jeffrey argues that ergonomics can contribute to interventions by encouraging re-assessment of the relationship between workers, equipment and working environment. Does this contribute to the SLA-where has this analysis been used. What were the implications?
Goodbye to Projects?

Rules, Norms and the Pursuit of SL
Keywords: SL, institutions

Abstract/Summary
Paper reviews current understanding of how institutional arrangements can either discourage or encourage the pursuit of SL. It explores the relationship between resources and capital, examining the nature of property rights and regimes, looking at the ways in which social exclusion affects the pursuit of SL and critiquing Common Pool Resource theory.

Notes:
Concludes that socially shared rules can encourage SL provided the rate at which individuals extract benefits from the resource base remains relatively low, and distribution of benefits remains wide. However, when such rules reinforce narrow distributional patterns, livelihoods can become more unsustainable, irrespective of the physical state of the resource base. (This is a good point to take to an analysis of capital assets - social capital can mediate and constrain access to natural capital.) Also raises consideration of informal norms and rules and the importance of considering how policies are interpreted on the ground.

Biting the Bullet: Civil Society, Social Learning and the Transformation of local Governance.
Keywords: institutional sustainability, participation

Abstract/Summary
Paper focuses on how three actors of dev interventions negotiate and manage their interrelations, interests, goals and outcomes of actions in contexts of social inequality and relative power. Research takes an action-oriented app to analysing the structured and active representation of roles and interests in dev initiatives. Key question is how socially hierarchical structures and processes might be managed to create positive change for excluded.

Notes:
Example of an attempt to bring together stakeholders specifically to negotiate a proposal for intervention. By using an agenda as a structure it was possible to quickly identify difference and commonalities between groups. Researchers and NGO lobbied for beneficiaries to take part and adapted the process to work in two languages. Paper underlines the complexity of building state-civil partnerships based on 'participation'. Again emphasises multiple meanings of 'participation'.

Issues in designing new projects and programmes in Sustainable Urban Livelihoods
Keywords: sustainable urban livelihoods, SWAPs, SL framework

Abstract/Summary
Considers whether the SL framework is sufficient to provide a mechanism for design and implementation of new projects and programmes in the urban context. There is insufficient evidence so far to conclude that the SL framework actually adds significantly to efforts aimed at alleviating poverty

Notes:
p3 sceptical that SWAPs actually alter conditions on the ground, concern is that they are useful for efficiency of donor support but often are not adequately targeted. P6 projects can be changed, in response to local conditions, depending on the capacity for change management. P9/10 SL can be useful in improving the design of projects and programmes but some issues remain; not explicit about poverty, where is the holism?, can it address political dimensions?, need to clarify 'sustainability', does it place a burden on the poor?
SLA in operation: A gender perspective
Keywords: SLA, gender, indicators
Abstract/Summary
Consideration of gender issues arising from UNDP's SEPED proposed SLA.
Notes:
Main challenge of SLA is to ensure that indicators used are gender sensitive.

Rural planning for Sustainable Livelihoods in South Africa
Keywords: rural planning, SRL
Abstract/Summary
This country study provides review and critical analysis of rural planning in South Africa, covering past and current systems and practices, methodological approaches and institutional frameworks. The sustainable livelihood approach was used as a framework of analysis. Recommendations are made for 'sustainable livelihood-based planning' through: planning around people, changing institutional processes at national and provincial level, mainstreaming the environment and holistic approaches, trade-offs between short-term and long-term impacts.
Notes: Khanya's analysis shows how SL analysis may be applied across levels, so that links between micro and macro are made, in terms of institutional practice and policy planning.

Towards Operationalisation of the Sustainable Livelihoods Approach in Kenya (Draft Discussion Paper)
Keywords: SLA
Abstract/Summary
This paper documents proposed mechanisms for channeling UNDP Country Co-operation Framework (CCF) support for the Government of Kenya in tackling poverty eradication. Within this the SLA was recognised as the major strategy for grappling with the poverty challenge, particularly at the grassroots level. SLA is new to the Government of Kenya and UNDP. The paper presents four strategic activities of an SLA in Kenya: capacity development activities for officials and organisations at the district/urban level and below, strengthening of relationships and interlinkages between community development activities and district/urban development systems; participatory development activities; the Information Education Communications (IEC) strategy.
Notes:
In common with much work on SLA, this document contains much normative analysis. Would be interesting to see follow up on Government of Kenya/UNDP collaboration on SLA.
**Stakeholder Approaches to planning participatory research by multi-institution groups**


**Keywords:** stakeholder analysis, institutions.

**Abstract/Summary**

NGOs have more experience in participatory research and development but their localised and personalized experience limits the scale of their operations. In contrast the state has the ability to create favourable policy environments and therefore have a valuable role in scaling up NGO experience. One way forward is to plan research as a partnership- to analyse reasons for participation, the capabilities of different stakeholders and what each wants.

**Notes:**

Addresses key issue of how to scale up from localised participatory planning, M & E to the policy level. Details how stakeholder approaches used in a multi-institutional context can improve the level of mutual understanding between stakeholders and thereby improve the basis for negotiated actions. They are also powerful tools when used in an action-reflection loop.

**Community-based Indicators: A guide for field workers carrying out monitoring and assessment at the community level**

Lee-Smith, D. (1997). *IUCN; Tools and Training Series*

**Keywords:** monitoring, evaluation

**Abstract/Summary**

Method of developing indicators based on a common understanding that human well-being is dependent on the well-being of the surrounding ecosystem. At whatever level sustainability is assessed the process involves setting common goals, identifying conflicting interests, devising and applying strategies and ways of measuring. It is a learning process involving reflection, argument, negotiation, strategising, measurement and continuous reassessment.

**Notes:**

Details working out indicators in a processual manner using participatory input. Stresses that the aim is not to find universal indicators but for ways of measuring and assessing that can be shared. Does this point to a fundamental problem in SL: projects can be made locally responsive but scaling up requires universal indicators. How does SL framework negotiate this gap: tackling the micro-macro links whilst retaining contextual sensitivity?

**Social Capital and Gender in South Africa**


**Keywords:** social capital

**Abstract/Summary**

Report on a study that sought to examine the differences in Men and Women's access to social capital. Used five quantifying measures: formal and informal group membership, family and non-family networks, civic engagement, trust, and perceptions of violence. A sample of families in rural and urban settings were surveyed

**Notes:**

How are others measuring social capital?
Working for SL and food security: Voices from the grassroots


Keywords: SL, food security

Abstract/Summary

Paper argues that an outcome of international mobilization around food security and SL issues may be a rallying flag for community empowerment and democratisation at the local and national level. The piece aims to convey the voice of grassroots communities from the economic south and the experience of those who work with them trying to foster SL and food security.

Notes:

Good attempt to take a cross-cultural comparative study of SL and food security issues with grassroots groups. Groups wanted greater democracy in the development process and the opportunity to work in partnership with gov and NGOs. Groups advocated recognition of the human rights element of food security. This again lends support for idea of fusing SLA with RBA. Are there any examples of this being done in practice?

Measurement Malaise - is the SL approach inoperable?


Keywords: SLA, capital assets, indicators.

Abstract/Summary

Short paper that critiques DFID view that: ‘at a generic level there is no suggestion that we can -or should- quantify all assets, let alone develop some kind of currency that allows direct comparison between assets’ (DFID, 1999) Maqueen argues that without some means for direct comparative measurement between assets the SLA is inoperable.

Notes:

Interesting perspective taken by Maqueen: he suggests constructing a scoring matrix for livelihood capital assets (see table 1)- categories would be numerically scored so that aggregate scores for different options might be compared. Paper has an emphasis on quantitative indicators and makes no mention of participatory involvement, but the points about how to measure capital assets are useful in relation to our study- are interventions attempting to quantify assets?

Brazilianising the SL Approach


Keywords: SLA, framework, principles

Abstract/Summary

This brief paper outlines the results of a series of workshops held by DFID in Brazil to explore and discuss the SLA. Focus appears to be on the ‘tools’ associated with the approach. The framework was unpacked and reconstructed in the process. The PIP box was found to be too full, and an area where potential action gets lost. The term social capital was not found to be adequately translatable into Portuguese and so was replaced by ‘the ability to influence policy making’. It was felt that new principles were required covering gender, rights and poverty. In addition it was felt that recognition should be made of the horizontal and vertical relationships between the poor and between rich and poor.

Notes:

Demonstrates that the SLA framework and principles need to be adapted for differing ‘cultural’ contexts. Underlines that the approach is not yet a ‘common language’. Participants indicated that they would like to work more on the practical applications of the approach.
Goodbye to Projects?

'Power Tools' Tools for working on policies and institutions, series: 1, Getting Started

Keywords: policies, institutions, tools

Abstract/Summary
The aim of the 'Power Tools' series is to provide some practical help to those working to improve the policies and institutions that affect the lives of poor people. The first tool sheet describes what can be involved in such work, why it is worth doing, who should get involved and how to get started.

Notes:
How useful are these tool suggestions. Are they used in development planning processes?

The Participatory Approach: Contradiction and Co-option in Burkina Faso

Keywords: participation, people-centred approaches

Abstract/Summary
'Participation' has become overwhelmingly popular in recent years without sufficient attention paid to its ambiguities. This paper critically examines participatory development, first by presenting an overview of types and degrees of participation and then through the analysis of a case study of a non-formal education project in Burkina Faso. The intention is to articulate the difficulties in implementing the 'genuine' participation that is espoused at academic and policy levels, by presenting a case in which different stakeholders employ participation to their advantage and the realities of the field act as barriers to participatory development.

Notes:
Highlights some potential problems with the use of participatory and people-centred approaches, which the SLA must take into account if it is to be operationally effective. Participation may be used as a way to generate efficiency savings by implementing bodies, participation may place excessive demands on beneficiaries, and beneficiaries may be skilled at manipulating competing interventions. Planners and academics need to adapt participatory frameworks to be more responsive to field-level realities.

To Claim our Rights: Livelihood security, human rights and sustainable development

Keywords: SLA, rights based approach

Abstract/Summary
Paper explores the potential contribution of a human rights perspective to the development of policies and programmes that strengthen the sustainability of poor people's assets and livelihood security. It outlines a conceptual framework for addressing issues of empowerment and poverty reduction by examining the link between human rights and asset and livelihood security as they relate to the issue of sustainable development.

Notes:
A long detailed look at livelihoods and rights, which goes someway to addressing the missing dimensions of the SL framework. Key conclusions: Rights matter and help us to understand power; poor people need to effectively make claims and need support with accessing info, group solidarity, skill development, advocacy in international domains, access to regulatory power; civil society is critical to 'livelihoods rights approach'; donor agencies can make a difference; need to close the circle of linkages between rights and livelihoods.
Confronting crisis: a comparative study of household responses to poverty and vulnerability in four poor urban communities


Keywords: Social capital, capital assets

Abstract/Summary
Comparative study of household responses to deteriorating conditions, using an analysis of vulnerability. Ability to reduce vulnerability relies on access to assets. Income data only gives a partial picture of the range of factors that affect the poor. Assets identified: labour, social and economic, infrastructure, housing, household relations (also associated with inequality), social capital.

Notes:
Differing conceptualisation of assets to those used by DFID (see exec summary) incorporating more structural conditions than seen in the DFID framework. Actions suggested: support households in role as safety nets, alleviate constraints on women's labour supply, ensure social capital is not taken for granted, develop social policy that integrates human and social capital. P68 shows using an asset vulnerability matrix to develop potential solutions for decreasing vulnerability.

From Project to programme assistance


Keywords: projects, programmes

Abstract/Summary
Argues that aid has become more effective since funding was more focused to programmes and away from projects. Criticises projects for bypassing governments. Claims that projects do still have a role when aimed very specifically at areas of high priority.

Notes:
How are projects being used? For what development ends are they being used and who by?

Livelihoods Research: some conceptual and methodological issues


Keywords: Livelihoods research

Abstract/Summary
Paper offers a review of conceptual and methodological issues in pursuit of livelihoods research, with particular reference to Southern Africa. Disparate and partly overlapping frameworks of investigation are outlined, with an emphasis on three key questions: How is empirical research at the micro-level related to analysis of the structural, historical and institutional elements of the macro-context? What combination of methods allows us to trace trajectories of change in diverse livelihoods over time? How are livelihood frameworks most usefully deployed to investigate and understand processes of differentiation, accumulation and impoverishment?

Notes:
Key questions about whom livelihoods are sustainable for and by what criteria. Emphasises need for participatory analysis to be founded on rigorous political, economic and social macro-analysis.
Women in Transition out of poverty

Murray, J & Ferguson, M (2001). Women and Economic Development Consortium, Canada

Keywords: SL framework, assets, vulnerability

Abstract/Summary

This paper is about women and their transition out of poverty. It explores the process by which women use enterprise development as a vehicle to make changes in their lives, enhancing independence and building a livelihood. It adapts the DFID SL framework as an analytical tool to explain how women move towards sustainable livelihoods through enterprise development.

Notes:

An interesting application of the SL framework as a tool for deepening analytical understanding of transitions out of poverty for women in Canada. The text argues that projects are too limited and favours investment-based strategies.

The Contribution of People's Participation: Evidence from 121 Rural Water Supply Projects


Keywords: participatory processes

Abstract/Summary

Two overriding messages emerge: 1. Beneficiary participation is critical for achieving project effectiveness and building local capacity. 2. Rural water projects have to be fundamentally redesigned to incorporate participation.

Notes:

Projects can be reworked to incorporate participation at all stages of the project cycle: see appendix 3 for summary of differences between blueprint and learning process approaches.

Voices of the poor


Keywords: participatory poverty assessments

Abstract/Summary

Report of an extensive World Bank study to capture the views of the poor on what it means to be poor and what they perceive as being the ways out of poverty. Calls for change at three levels - professional, institutional and personal to tackle pro-poor development strategies and to produce new paradigms.

Notes: SLA responds to many of the central concerns that are expressed in the report. The suggested paradigm shifts at the professional, institutional and personal levels might be good analytical devices for ensuring that interventions are adequately poverty focused.

Environments and Livelihoods: strategies for sustainability


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

Book introducing key theories and suggesting strategic questions that development professionals should ask. Looks at relationship between poverty and environment. Rooted in experience of NGOs. Considers SL framework and breaks down each element.

Notes:

Interesting to add Oxfam perspective: p94 resists the idea that SL framework is an approach, and should be seen only as a 'tool'. P98 SL framework can be seen as too abstract for field level, it is used in planning but little in appraisal; framework did prove useful in improving project management.
Brochure 'Sectoral Support'


Keywords: SWAps

Abstract/Summary

Short brochure detailing the background and reasons for using Swaps: the Netherlands decided in 1996 to target support at 21 countries for bilateral dealings on a sectoral level. Sectoral support is used as a means of coordinating support to selected sectors, it is also used to strengthen national institutions and make better use of public money. It is stated that civil society must be involved. Policy dialogue is used to push Dutch priorities, which are: good governance, poverty reduction, and women in development, institution building and the environment. It is critical of continued use of project approach which it suggests might even be an obstacle to structural reform.

Notes:

States that the rule of thumb should be "Programme support where, possible, projects where necessary", suggesting that projects may be used where government and donors are not sufficiently co-ordinated. However, it goes on to say that even then "there are ways of transcending project support".

A Rough Guide to Participatory Poverty Assessments: PPA an introduction to theory and practice


Keywords: participatory poverty assessment, policy change

Abstract/Summary

A handbook for designing and assessing need in PPAs (not to be viewed as a blueprint). Section 2 explores the nature of PPAs, history and origins. Section 3 outlines considerations for developing a PPA. Section 4-illustrative case studies

Notes:

PPAs are most effective when geared to a national context, also useful to stimulate public debate, assist NGOs in planning and improving understanding, assisting marginalised groups make claims. (p14) Problems: ethical considerations, reliability, power p21-3. Vital to understand social context and to focus data collection p39-40 within a flexible structure. Case studies show: importance of linking PPA to policy processes, PPA as an ongoing process. Ugandan case study shows effective PPA being fed into policy making, challenging perceptions of poverty and building links with Civil Society.

Social Development issues in SWAps. Social Development working paper no.1


Keywords: SWAps, social analysis

Abstract/Summary

Summary of some issues in SWAps from a social development perspective, which provides guidance for tools and methods to strengthen the social dimension of sector programmes. Sector programmes need to: acknowledge and respond to social diversity, build upward accountability in policy & institutional systems, develop social analytical and learning capacity, and enhance the capacity of excluded to demand change.

Notes:

Projects reduce government capacity, limit impact to 'islands', impose a range of management models, which undermine sector capacity. Key role for social analysis to shape processes of participation so that they resist capture of benefits by élites. Many forms of assistance will remain 'projectised' but will have to relate to wider context in terms of building capacity/ensuring sustainability: 'sector-wide thinking'. Donors need to accept loss of direct control, build relationships, and be flexible about use of project planning tools. There is potential for using front line staff as researchers and decision makers.
Goodbye to Projects?

The Potential of Using Sustainable Livelihoods Approaches in Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers


Keywords: SLA, Rights-based approach, PRSP, projects

Abstract/Summary

Addresses whether an SLA has value at policy level in PRSPs. Concern is that it is stronger at micro level and does not address politics and power, but does have considerable potential to improve PRSP in terms of diagnosis, design and monitoring.

Notes:

Further work needs to be done on how SLA could be strengthened by incorporating a rights analysis. Tension between creating locally owned, accountable processes and the conditionality of donor finance supporting the PSRP. Tools need further development to extend SL analysis beyond description to consider implications of alternative policy prescriptions. Para 38, 39 discuss move from projects to sector support and suggests that an SLA will depend on government attitude. Box 5 refers specifically to use of SLA to PRS, which is interesting in relation to the implications for SLA use at national level. Does SLA have to sacrifice holism at this level? Para 68 questions how to marry SLA to conventional economic analysis. Conclusion questions usefulness of DfID principles but suggests SLA is a good way of disaggregating poor-potential should be tested by pilots such as Mongolian PPA and Uganda PEAP.

Change on the horizon: participatory forest management in Sri Lanka - recent experiences from the dry zone


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

Investigation of livelihood strategies of two communities as part of a feasibility study for a new participatory forest management project that aims to alleviate poverty through improved natural resource management. SL analysis revealed weak local institutions for forest management that could provide the basis for participatory management and sustainable institutional development.

Notes:

Conclude that SLA has potential to contribute to project design (when complimented by conventional sectoral analysis) by: widening scope of intervention (in this case factoring in income generation), increasing duration (recognition that institutional support is gradual), greater use of process type approaches, greater focus on micro-macro linkages.

A new approach to SL: African youth and agriculture


Keywords: SL, capacity building

Abstract/Summary

A brief reflection on the work of Songhai in Benin in strengthening the capacity of African youth to engage in agricultural practices promoting sustainable livelihoods. He looks at the complex situation facing African youth today and at ways to foster their creative energy, vision and ability to forge their own lives through community work.

Notes:

Songhai Environmental Rehabilitation Centre is claimed to be an indigenous response to African poverty. It comprises a model farm, research centre and training ground for young African farmers. The Author believes that the way to achieve SL is through the stimulation of synergy and entrepreneurship, with development being driven form the bottom-up. Can we find SLA case studies similar to this? It would make for interesting comparative analysis.
What can we do with a rights-based approach to development  
**ODI (1997). ODI Briefing paper 1999(3) September**  
**Keywords:** rights-based approach  
**Abstract/Summary**  
A rights-based approach to development sets the achievement of human rights as an objective of development. It uses thinking about human rights as the scaffolding of development policy. It invokes the international apparatus of human rights accountability in support of action. In all of these, it is concerned not just with civil and political rights but also with economic, social and cultural rights.  
**Notes:**  
RBA would involve increasing accountability via citizen participation in policy making: in this sense complementary to SLA. (Save the Children Fund have attempted to formulate a strategy along these lines; focused on the rights of the child)  

Learning and Livelihoods: The experience of the FSIPM project in Southern Malawi  
**Keywords:** Farming systems, participatory monitoring and planning, livelihoods  
**Abstract/Summary**  
Report on a project seeking to investigate the use of integrated pest management in Malawi. The project was designed around the assumption that crop losses form pest and diseases were the most important constraint for smallholders, however it turned out that farmers’ priorities were different but the project structure was not sufficiently flexible to accommodate them.  
**Notes:**  
Projects must address the problems that most deeply affect the livelihoods of their clients. Projects need greater freedom to listen, to learn and to experiment.  

Crossing the Great Divide: Coproduction, Synergy, and Development  
**Keywords:** synergy  
**Abstract/Summary**  
Coproduction is a process through which inputs from individuals who are not ‘in’ the same organisation are transformed into goods and services.  
**Notes:**  
Critical of existing efforts of capacity building and increasing participation. Suggests that coproduction of goods and services by government and citizens organised in ‘polycentric’ systems could be crucial in improving welfare. Can this idea be supported by SLA?
**Goodbye to Projects?**

**Tools for Sustainable Livelihoods: Livelihoods Monitoring and Evaluation**

*Pasteur, K.* (2001). *IDS Feb 2001 Draft for comments*

**Keywords:** Sustainable livelihoods, Monitoring and evaluation,

**Abstract/Summary**

SLA can improve conventional M & E tools through: focuses beyond project outcomes, livelihoods principles allow for more innovative methodologies, framework helps design of more relevant indicators.

**Notes:**

Stresses SLA principles in designing tools for M & E but doesn't seem to have a clear idea about how participatory processes to be used. Outlines need for beneficiaries to design indicators but this idea is not incorporated in practical tools for M & E. Draws distinction between conventional, participatory and livelihood M & E. However, conventional tools such as logframe can be used in a participatory way. Ignores 'assumptions' column in logframe, which might achieve some of the goals relating to 'learning' that is outlined. Would be useful to see how suggested techniques are being used in case studies.

**Thinking about Logical Frameworks and Sustainable Livelihoods: A short critique and possible way forward**


**Keywords:** SLA

**Abstract/Summary**

Short ideas note that examines the use of the logical framework with respect to its potential use within the SLA. This suggests that logframes and SLA are not compatible and proposes the outline for a new framework. Specific criticisms are that the logframe is dis-empowering, the methodology is lacking, and it is inflexible, demands rigid reporting and is unsuited for macro/policy work. The alternative suggestion arose form a brainstorming session at IDS and follows the vertical format of the logframe. Three elements would be agreed between partners: a goal, non-negotiable principles and negotiation about process.

**Notes:**

Strongly critical of logframe makes a start at moving beyond them. Are interventions using logframes because donors demand them or because they find them useful? Can logframes be used in a more SL friendly way if SLA principles are followed? It is suggested that the new 'framework' should not be called a framework with the intention being to emphasis its processual basis. Are general principles required as opposed to codifying processes?

**Changing organisations for Sustainable Livelihoods**


**Keywords:** organisational transformation, SLA, institutions

**Abstract/Summary**

Booklet concerns changing government organisations for SL: directions and dimensions of change, why it happens, the process and tracking of change.

**Notes:**

Interesting outline of how organisations might incorporate SL principles (DFID definition) Examples given are brief. Would be interesting to test some of the suggestions in the text against larger case studies- particularly how to develop 'culturally appropriate' strategies when agencies are working cross-culturally.
Tenure and shelter in Sustainable Urban Livelihoods


Keywords: sustainable urban livelihoods, participatory approaches

Abstract/Summary
Access to secure land and shelter is a pre-condition for survival in urban areas. Urban regulatory regimes are often imported and unsuitable and do not facilitate improved livelihoods. SLA places poor at the centre, better than previous approaches that concentrate on growth or building institutional capacity.

Notes:
Most interesting point is that way forward lies with multi-stakeholder partnerships/ public private initiatives which will entail implications for PCM.p12-4

Capital Assets and Natural Resource Improvements: Linkages and new challenges


Keywords: capital assets

Abstract/Summary
Sustainable systems increase the capital base over time. In practice we find trade-offs between different forms of capital. Natural and social capital can be easily run down but can also be regenerated. Clear that social capital is a pre-requisite for sustainable, productive and long-term management of NR. Despite widespread adoption of the language of sustainability/ participation too few solutions have emerged.

Notes:
SLA generally uses assets pentagon but would be useful to look at how assets are defined and how assets are understood to be linked. Pretty's analysis of the relationship of social/natural capital is a useful starting point. Perhaps need to explore this dynamic in relation to specific interventions.

People's Self-Development


Keywords: development, policies and practice.

Abstract/Summary
This book is centred on development through collective local initiatives by people themselves and how to promote such action. He outlines an alternative development paradigm rooted in a philosophical and methodological perspective that sees the fulfillment of the human urge for creative engagement as the primary task in development effort. The need is for external intervention to promote people's self development rather than new forms of dependence.

Notes:
Again important questions raised with which to test current interventions, particularly with respect to participatory approaches. One major point that Rahman raises is about labeling people as poor. He suggests that endogenous development will not occur unless people have pride in themselves as worthy human beings. Classifying people as poor may in effect devalue them and their belief in their creative abilities. New approaches to development often talk about being 'poverty-focused', and the SLA talks about working from people's strengths. Are the two then contradictory?
Indicators for the success and sustainability of farming based livelihoods in the Eastern Cape, South Africa


Keywords: Indicators, capital assets, SL framework

Abstract/Summary:
This paper is the first volume of the main report on the activities and conclusions of this research project. It explores an attempt to test a framework for the identification of a set of indicators based on the sustainable livelihoods approach. Indicators were identified according to the capital assets as defined in the DFID SL framework. The results of field work with farmers in South Africa were then used to find the best exploratory indicators when measured against net farm income as a proxy for success.

For Whom and for What? Principles, Criteria, and Indicators for Sustainable Forest Resources Management in Thailand


Keywords: sustainable forest management, criteria and indicators.

Abstract/Summary
This collaborative study has developed criteria and indicators (C&I) in order to operationalise the concept of sustainable forest management in Thailand. The C&I are a hierarchical system with four levels of increasingly normative specificity. The four levels are called principle, criterion, indicator and verifier, respectively. The purpose of C&I are to: describe the facts and to monitor the internal capacity of the system to reproduce itself in terms of ecology, social, production and policy aspects; and to disclose the social constructions, the ideas, values norms and ethics embedded in legal and regulatory framework, institutional framework, financial institutions and information.

Notes:
The use of C&I is another way of conceptualising and operationalising a SLA, from a Danish/Thai perspective, anchored in the Forestry Sector.

Impact Assessment for Development Agencies: Learning to value change


Keywords: impact assessment

Abstract/Summary
This book considers the process of impact assessment and shows how and why it needs to be integrated into all stages of development interventions from planning to evaluation. Its basic premise is that impact assessment should refer not to the immediate outputs or effects of a project or programme, but to any lasting or significant change that is brought about.

Notes:
Impact assessment goes hand in hand with the principle of participation. Roche's case studies demonstrate (again) the multiple interpretations of participation. Roche suggests the following good practice: keep impact assessment simple and user-friendly; embed impact assessment in all stages of the project cycle; focus on the key questions; recognise diversity and crosscheck; ensure that the system evolves too; ensure organisational coherence. Do SLA interventions follow such models of impact assessment?
Seeking an understanding of poverty that recognises rural-urban differences and rural-urban linkages


Keywords: rural-urban linkages, frameworks

Abstract/Summary

Whilst there are often neglected links between urban and rural areas, which are critical to livelihood strategies, there are crucial differences in the vulnerability contexts that need understanding.

Notes:

P18 concludes that gov departments and international agencies know little about the local context in which projects/programmes operate: how will SLA improve this?

Beyond the Impasse: New Directions in Development Theory


Keywords: Development theory

Abstract/Summary

This book explores the theoretical impasse that development studies faced in the early 90s. Existing theories were found to be internally inconsistent and intellectually inadequate for explaining the increased diversity and unevenness of development in the developing world. Among the questions explored are the implications of post-modernist thinking for development studies; what role should ethics play in determining the purpose and practice of development; the meaning of development as a process; the relevance of academic research and theorising for the task of combating poverty; changing research frontiers thrown up by social movements and dialectical relationships with other development actors; and increasing sensitivity to gender and environmental

Notes:

The debates in this book offer some conception of the theoretical background to new forms of development interventions. How successful are approaches such as SLA in answering some of the challenges outlined at the theoretical level.

Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: A framework for analysis


Keywords: SL framework, indicators

Abstract/Summary

SL is increasingly important to development debate. Paper outlines a framework for analysing SL in relation to 5 key indicators. It shows how SL are achieved through a range of resources in pursuit of livelihood strategies. Central to the framework is analysis of in/formal organisational /institutional factors that influence SL outcomes. Considers briefly practical, operational, methodological importance of SLA.

Notes:

p5/6 assessing outcomes:5 key elements: creation of working days, poverty reduction, well-being and capabilities, livelihood adaptation, vulnerability and resilience, natural resource base sustainability. P12/3 explores the necessity of understanding institutional matrix. Recognition of complexity should allow scope for innovation in planned interventions. P13 framework should guide questions to be asked using range of methods. P14 suggests that SL is about getting institutional and organisational settings right. Planning starts with negotiation (question over at what level), and is necessarily iterative and dynamic.
**Development as Freedom**


**Abstract/Summary**

Sen argues that the main purpose of development is to spread freedom to the 'unfree'. Freedom is seen to be the ultimate goal of social and economic arrangements and the most efficient means of realising general welfare. Social Institutions like markets, political parties, legislatures, the judiciary and the media contribute by enhancing individual freedom and are in turn sustained by social values. Values, institutions, development, and freedom are all closely interrelated and an analytical framework is developed for them. However, Sen states that there is no formula for development but a process of enhancing individual freedoms and the social commitment to help bring that about.

**Notes:**

This book provides a theoretical bedrock for right-based approaches. It argues for the avoidance of development formulas and engagement with multiple possibilities. In addition, a reassessment of development beyond being a mechanism for economic growth is called for, as is a critical engagement with markets. However, the freedom to exchange is seen as being a fundamental human freedom.

**Analysing Policy for SL**


**Abstract/Summary**

SLA framework provides little guidance on how to link micro-macro level or policy analysis. This report argues that SLA can be used as a starting point to bridge the gap between bottom up livelihoods analysis and top-down policy analysis, but doing so requires 3 elements: a clearer understanding of social and political capital, a model of interactions between policy and livelihoods, and a policy analysis approach that feeds into and from SLA.

**Notes:**

Proposes a five-part plan for building up institutional analysis from the micro to the macro level. What will case studies show: how do they tackle this? Or is it an area of weakness? Is the plan described sufficiently dynamic-what definition of an institution does it assume?

**The rhetoric of the community in project management: the case of Mohlakeng township**

*Sihlongonyane, M.F. (2001). Development in Practice, volume 11, number 1, February 2001*

**Abstract/Summary**

The concept of community became a popular buzzword towards the end of the 20th century. However, its meaning is increasingly vague because of its rhetorical use in politics, as well as in development, gender and environmental circles. Based on the experience of a Mohlakeng Township Site and Service Scheme that was undertaken between 1990 and 1994, the paper examines some of the implications of the flexible use of the term 'community' in South Africa.

**Notes:**

This contribution makes a good point about the definition of concepts such as 'community' and 'participation'. It underlines the need to see community as a dynamic phenomenon that alters with the context in which it is employed.
Employment and Natural Resources Management: A Livelihoods Approach to Poverty Reduction


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary
Conference paper discussing the UNDPs vision for interventions based on an SLA. The paper examines, using an SL lens, employment and natural resource management and suggests some appropriate policies. It then goes on to outline the necessary action in order to turn policy into action. These include: a political will to eradicate poverty and invest resources in the poor, create political space for empowerment of the poor, view poor as the solution, due to erratic nature of foreign investment focus on mobilising domestic resources, engage poor as partners, share rights and responsibilities.

Notes:
This vision of an SLA would appear to recognise the importance of political will and space within an SL analysis. For instance it makes the point that some reallocation of resources may be needed away from the non-poor, and directly engages with the conceptual shifts that will be required by governments in order to achieve SLs for the poor.

Making Livelihoods more sustainable


Keywords: SL

Abstract/Summary
Article assesses how SL concept has evolved and highlights progress made in policy development and programming. Also discusses the challenges to be met by development organisations and governments, in the implementation of programmes promoting improved and sustainable livelihoods. Two key constraints are identified: the underlying dichotomy of applying a cross-sectoral approach in a sectoral world, and establishing the link between micro realities and macro policies. A third challenge is the practical integration of strategic and technical approaches. Argues that the next steps needs to be the long-term development of macro-micro linked cross-sectoral policy analysis and a shift in implementation strategies.

Notes:
Paper suggests that the development of a common SL language is required for the long-term shift necessary to support sustainable livelihoods at all levels. Some clear suggestions for government policy are trade agreements that favour local needs, full-cost accounting to incorporate social and environmental costs and benefits, and policies to support worker rights, debt relief and local control over resources. How freely are countries able to implement such policies in the face of WTO, World Bank and IMF free trade policy?

Household food security in semi-arid Africa- the contribution of participatory adaptive research and development to rural livelihoods in Eastern Kenya


Keywords: SRL, participatory research

Abstract/Summary
This paper describes specific household security problem diagnosis and a range of research interventions planned within a more SRL framework. Working with local farmers, the project implemented a range of applied research and linked development interventions that showed promise in easing food security through a broadening of the livelihood base. To ensure that research results are utilised and farmers have access to new technology and markets, there is the need for external or public sector support to integrated longer-term development initiatives. Need to remove boundaries between research, extension and development functions, and increase farmer participation in the whole process.

Notes:
Note that in order to assess the sustainability of interventions research projects need to be at least five years in duration.
Goodbye to Projects?

Sector Support: From Policy making to Implementation Processes

Keywords: sector wide approach

Abstract/Summary
This paper discusses issues facing donors in their assessment of national sector policies and capacities prior to and during sector support in LDCs. It explores the gap between the reality of policymaking and implementation, which diverges from the ideal of a democratically formulated policy implemented effectively by capable and accountable institutions. Four conclusions are made: (1) Policy making in LDCs is primarily about mobilisation and use of resources; therefore they are significantly influenced by stakeholders. (2) Implementation processes and resource scarcities determine the outcome of sector policies; policy can change overnight, but implementation will change slowly. (3) Over reliance on detailed policy documentation. (4) Constant reforms leads to de-capacity building.

Notes:
This paper offers the view that sector approaches tend towards 'blueprints' for policy that neglect 'reality', and possibly replace 'projectitis' with 'reformititis', that may actually lead to reduced capacity for LDC government policy making and implementation. The authors propose that sector support should be approached through 'continuous experimentation' in which normative ideas about policy making are minimised and existing capacities are respected and nurtured.

Characteristics of DFID-Funded Projects

Keywords: projects, social capital

Abstract/Summary
Review of DFID projects looking at how they tackle social development in order to understand the implications for practice. Suggests that projects are not yet taking an integrated approach to livelihoods, and need to be more explicit about power and the 'dark side' of social capital. Projects with experimental SD dimensions will need longer span and possible deferral of indicators of social progress.

Notes:
Paper is from an SD perspective but highlights point for SLA. Thin critiques NR work as being overly production-oriented. SLA directly addresses this but the same implications then apply for projects re: timescales and indicators.

African PRSPs: Social Policy and Sustainable Livelihoods Perspectives

Keywords: poverty reduction strategies, social policy, SLA

Abstract/Summary
Review of PRSPs. PRS documents recognise that poverty is multidimensional but tend not to pay attention to SL strategies or to social dimensions of anti-poverty strategies. May indicate need for technical assistance with concepts or political difficulties with these issues. World Bank/IMF JSA offer macro-economic and governance analysis and there is scope for further international dialogue re: analytical rigour, data use and strategic detail.

Notes:
p17 'livelihoods' appear in few PRS documents: need to develop appreciation of multidimensionality of livelihood strategies. SL framework could provide a good basis for analysis in order to focus poverty reduction interventions. Social capital is seldom referred to, possibly due to lack of theoretical underpinning. Human and physical capitals are adequately addressed, but understanding of financial and natural capital needs to address linkages with poverty. P17 'sustainability' as a concept is seldom analysed. P18 Urban livelihoods are barely addressed. Section 4.7 details explicit and implicit assumptions made about growth and productivity gains that ignore questions about the security, equity and sustainability of proposed gains.
Sustainable Livelihoods Approaches at the Policy Level

Thomson, A. (2000). Draft paper for FAO e-conference and forum on Operationalising participatory ways of applying an SLA.

Keywords: SLA, policy, institutions.

Abstract/Summary

Paper examines the implications of applying an SLA at the policy level. An SL-friendly policy process would give an active role to communities and civil society organisations. Author feels that the best possibility for achieving a sustainable improvement in livelihoods policy is to focus on increasing the above. This has implications for the focus of external assistance, both technical and financial.

Notes:

P4 accepts Akroyd and Duncan (1998) criticism of SWAps but feels that they retain some value as long as they are sufficiently participatory. Adopting SL can place additional demands on limited technical capacity at ministry level. (p8) However, emphasis should be on improving capacity and access for grassroots and CBOs to lobby to influence policy. This shifts focus for external assistance: does this imply a move away from directly managed projects?

The Sustainable Livelihoods Approach and Programme Development in Cambodia


Keywords: SLA

Abstract/Summary

An overview of experience of using the SL approach at CSP and programme level in Cambodia. SL framework used as an analytical tool at CSP level: to structure information and draw out key linkages. Useful for strategic planning, better targeting, crossing sectoral boundaries, advocacy, making project learning more structured and quicker.

Notes:

SLA is seen to add to PCM by being used as a planning tool to ensure 'fit' of individual activities and projects with livelihoods of poor; also as a management tool to provide a common framework that would improve synergy and consistency between projects and activities. In addition it is suggested that SLA can be part of a broader more encompassing process on which to forge links with partners.

SL and Project Design in India


Keywords: SLA, project design

Abstract/Summary

Paper reviews the design of two DFID projects in India. Both aimed to contribute to GoI's efforts to eliminate poverty through support to its watershed development programme. Project design ran parallel to development of SLA and framework. Both recognised that improving NR can contribute to livelihoods but are not a panacea. Place increasing emphasis on enabling poor to participate in institutional processes.

Notes:

SLA added value to the project design process which presents DFID with new challenges: how do projects prioritise activities? To what extent can Donors alter underlying causes of poverty, which are rooted in power structures? Implications for project implementation: learning processes are crucial- can donors and implementing partners cope with the demands of greater flexibility?
Goodbye to Projects?

**Participatory Assessment and Planning for Sustainable Livelihoods: A critical assessment through the investment lens**

UNDP (1998). UNDP draft

**Keywords:** participatory assessment, planning, indicators, systems

**Abstract/Summary**

Meta-evaluation of PAPSL process as conducted in country offices. Micro-level dynamics of social capital, non-monetised exchange systems etc are areas that link sectors and demand a systems approach to understanding. Meso-level: complexity and contradiction in identifying effective investment. Macro-level: process by which investment strategies in one area can be weighed against investment in another.

**Notes:**

P11 need to develop learning organisations that are connected to and influenced by the people that they serve—should operate like a group of smaller organisations: flexible, responsive, and continuously learning.

**USAID's New Approach to Development**


**Keywords:** policies, institutions

**Abstract/Summary**

Speech outlining the new approach to be taken to aid and development by the incoming US administration. Explicitly states that the term 'sustainable development' is to be dispensed with, as only experts 'know what it means'. Iterate a commitment to management as a pure science and the need to recruit more technical experts. Does concede that economic growth does not deal with poverty without having some form of redistribution.

**Notes:**

USAID shows no inclination towards addressing cross-sectoral issues. It's overall aim remains to advance US interests overseas. However, there are signs that it maybe willing to allow interventions to work in a more experimental way, although any discussion of participation is absent

**Civil Society and the Aid Industry**


**Keywords:** civil society, NGOs, CBOs

**Abstract/Summary**

The problem with the language of civil society is that it has been used to describe a great many things: from social disintegration in N. America, to the democratic movements in China. This book argues that such a general conception does not help in formulating action on the ground. It is a mistake to see civil society as a mechanism for encouraging democracy, reducing the state and encouraging the free market. Another mistake is to view CSOs in instrumental terms, and there are problems with operationalising donor support to civil society. Donor emphasis is often on fixed-term projects, they like to fund the most familiar organisations or organisations constructed in their own likeness.

**Notes:**

Although there are problems with the concept of civil society, this book argues that the value of civil society is to be found in that: it forces us to put aid in its place, it forces us to take civil organising seriously, it makes us look at power in society, and it makes us look to NGOs and beyond. However, working with civil society should not be a headlong rush but a long-term building process.
NGOs and Sustainable Development in Zimbabwe: No Magic Bullets

**Vivian, J. (1994).** *Institute of Social Studies*

**Keywords:** projects, sustainable development, donors

**Abstract/Summary**

It is argued that a major obstacle faced by NGOs is the demand upon them to find simple, neat and comprehensive solutions to complex problems. The tendency on the part of the donors and NGO supporters to expect success is labeled the 'magic bullet syndrome', and it is argued that this emphasis on simplicity and success is unrealistic and counterproductive.

**Notes:**

Interesting comments on a project approach: literature tends to assume that micro-level experiences are generalisable, but rarely explores mechanisms through which project-oriented NGOs can transcend the spatial and temporal limitations of the project approach. Evidence shows that NGOs are no more innovative, far-reaching or participatory than government. Projects which are 'acceptable' attract funding; donors expect success so this creates barriers to learning from failure. Funding and organisational structure is tied to project. Magic bullet assumes that successful projects are replicable. Project outcomes need dissociated from funding.

**Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons Learned from Global Programme Experience**


**Keywords:** SLA

**Abstract/Summary**

A brief synopsis of lessons learned from design and implementation of SL programmes at the country level. Notes the continued disproportionate presence of external experts at the expense of developing local capacities, the increased time frame required by SL in order to build solid foundations for programmes and to ensure all actors are comfortable in their roles. Specific lessons are that there is an urgent need to develop sustained learning capacity within government for SL planning- this will require institutional reform. In addition, the reality of participatory approaches is that they become institutionalised and bureaucratically oriented, rather than allowing people to formulate their own community action plans.

**Notes:**

Some useful points on the gap between rhetoric and reality in UNDP SL interventions.

**Sustainable Livelihoods in Malawi: A case study**


**Keywords:** SLA

**Abstract/Summary**

Brief document outlines how the UNDP commitment to the concept of sustainable livelihoods is translated from theory into practice. It is perceived that the SL concept creates a bridge between macro policies and micro-realities, which it is claimed that neither poverty reduction programmes nor participatory development initiatives have been able to accomplish. The SL provides an integrated, holistic framework for analysis. The paper then goes on to attempt such an analysis for three villages in Malawi and outlines some potential entry points for intervention.

**Notes:**

Brief document but gives some idea of SL as conceived by UNDP. Note that SLA is seen as being strong in addressing macro-micro links, whereas others have flagged this as an area of weakness.
**Goodbye to Projects?**

**HIV/AIDS and Rural Livelihoods in Sub-Saharan Africa**


*Keywords:* livelihoods, household analysis

*Abstract/Summary*

HIV needs to be understood as having an impact across all sectors involved in development. Much research has examined coping strategies at household level. Given the importance of households and extended families, both within and between communities, it may be necessary to move beyond the existing emphasis on the individual household as the unit of analysis.

*Notes:*

SLA takes the household as the basic unit of analysis, although it does acknowledge intra-household diversity. This paper suggests diverting attention from the household as the key entry point for programme intervention and to encourage intervention to take account of the complex linkages between different groups. One possibility might be to carry out case studies that track the connections and exchanges among households.

**A Framework for Research on Sustainability Indicators for Agriculture and Rural Livelihoods**


*Keywords:* SL framework, indicators

*Abstract/Summary*

This paper sets out an analytical framework based on a SLA, which is used to generate a matrix of potential indicators compatible with ‘five dimensions of sustainability’ from commonly used indicator frameworks. In setting out to test the applicability of the framework it was felt that a balance had to be drawn between not wishing to rely on a pre-determined set of indicators, and having an external framework that could be compared across different study sites.

*Notes:*

A good attempt to draw together several sustainability frameworks to produce indicators that test changes in ground-level sustainability. The tension between externally derived methods and locally designed indicators is apparent.

**Expanding the Measure of Wealth: Indicators of Environmentally Sustainable Development**

*World Bank (1997). World Bank: Environmentally Sustainable Development Studies and Monographs Series no.17*

*Keywords:* social capital

*Abstract/Summary*

Chp6 Social Capital: The Missing Link? Of all capital assets least progress has been made in measuring social capital and in determining empirically its contribution to economic growth and development. World Bank recognises need to take social capital into account when designing projects and policy advice. However, there are difficulties in measuring social capital as definitions vary widely. See Boxes 6.2, 6.3 for suggestions on indicators.

*Notes:*

Notes that donor agencies have a role in stimulating the creation of social capital through 5 areas: assess local context to avoid imposing structures that weaken existing social capital, use local level capital to deliver projects, create enabling environments, invest in social capital through participatory processes, promote research and learning particularly exploring the micro-macro links between social capital and economic.
**Mongolia-Sustainable livelihoods project**


**Keywords:** SL

**Abstract/Summary**

Assesses the country and sector issues around livestock, decentralisation and social protection in Mongolia. Main issues identified were: increasing poverty and inequality, an ambiguous institutional structure, inadequate capacity building, weakness of pastoral risk management system, inadequate community participation and sustainability, underdevelopment of the financial system. In response to these the government of Mongolia drew up a program called the 'Household Livelihood Capacity Support Programme', which will be operated through a program management unit responsible of organising activities through local government.

**Notes:**

Note that although the report specifically highlights that there has been a weakness in local participatory mechanism, any plan to promote such mechanisms is absent from the proposed programme, which appears to be very top-down.

*Additional Entry*

**Monitoring and Evaluating Impact on Livelihoods: Lessons from experience**


**Keywords:** Monitoring, evaluation, livelihoods approach

**Abstract:**

This paper draws on issues raised in a livelihoods-oriented analysis of the monitoring and evaluation system being established by a DFID-supported agricultural research project in Nepal. It aims to compare conventional, participatory and livelihoods approaches to M&E. It argues that livelihoods M&E should draw on a range of quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis methods; it should be a flexible and negotiated process amongst stakeholders.

**Notes:**

There is a note of caution sounded that current plans for the M&E system for the project are too formalised and ambitious to be sustainable beyond the project term. It is suggested that further consultation with farmers would move the project beyond being conventional M&E 'plus' livelihoods.
Goodbye to Projects?

Index of Titles

A Framework for Research on Sustainability Indicators for Agriculture and Rural Livelihoods................................................................. 61
A new approach to SL: African youth and agriculture................................. 51
A Rough Guide to Participatory Poverty Assessments: PPA an introduction to theory and practice............................................................ 50
Achieving Sustainability: Poverty Elimination and the environment........... 28
Addressing food security in Africa via multiple livelihood strategies of women farmers.......................................................... 32
African PRSPs: Social Policy and Sustainable Livelihoods Perspectives ....... 57
Agricultural Policy Systems: a changing paradigm for German Technical Co-operation ................................................................. 13
Agriculture Sector Programmes ................................................................ 23
An evolutionary approach to facilitating organisational learning: An experiment by the Christian Commission for Development in Bangladesh.................. 27
Analysing Policy for SL ............................................................................. 55
Beneficiary, Consumer, Citizen: Changing Perspectives on Participation for Poverty Reduction ...................................................................... 25
Better Livelihoods for Poor People.............................................................. 28
Beyond the Impasse: New Directions in Development Theory.................... 53
Biting the Bullet: Civil Society, Social Learning and the Transformation of local Governance .......................................................... 43
Brazilianising the SL Approach................................................................. 44
Bridging citizen voice and client focus into service delivery ....................... 35
Bridging the gap: citizenship, participation & accountability.................... 25
Brochure 'Sectoral Support' ...................................................................... 48
Building on Poor People's Capacities: The Case of Common Property Resources in India and West Africa.................................................. 18
Business development services and the policy environment .................... 36
Capital Assets and Natural Resource Improvements: Linkages and new challenges................................................................. 52
Change on the horizon: participatory forest management in Sri Lanka - recent experiences from the dry zone........................................ 49
Changing organisations for Sustainable Livelihoods.................................. 51
Changing views on change: participatory approaches to monitoring the environment......................................................... 12
Characteristics of DFID-Funded Projects .................................................. 57
Civil Society and the Aid Industry .............................................................. 59
Community Based Rural Development: Reducing Poverty from the Ground Up ................................................................. 25
Community Stability and the Relationship between Economic and Social Well-Being in Forest-Dependent Communities.............................. 18
Community-based Indicators: A guide for field workers carrying out monitoring and assessment at the community level........................................ 43
Confronting crisis: a comparative study of household responses to poverty and vulnerability in four poor urban communities............................... 46
Crossing the Great Divide: Coproduction, Synergy, and Development .......... 50
Decentralisation and SRL........................................................................ 35
Development as Freedom ........................................................................ 55
Annotated bibliography

Employment and Natural Resources Management: A Livelihoods Approach to Poverty Reduction ................................................................. 56
Engaging stakeholders: Lessons from three eastern India business case studies .......... 15
Environmental Movements in the Global South: Issues of Livelihood and beyond .......... 30
Environments and Livelihoods: strategies for sustainability........................................ 47
Ethical Trade and Sustainable Rural Livelihoods- Case Studies ............................... 20
Expanding the Measure of Wealth: Indicators of Environmentally Sustainable Development ................................................................................. 61
Extension, Poverty and Vulnerability: Inception Report of a Study for the Neuchatel Initiative .................................................................................. 25
For Whom and for What? Principles, Criteria, and Indicators for Sustainable Forest Resources Management in Thailand ........................................... 53
From Project to programme assistance ...................................................................... 46
HIV/AIDS and Rural Livelihoods in Sub-Saharan Africa ............................................. 61
Household food security in semi-arid Africa- the contribution of participatory adaptive research and development to rural livelihoods in Eastern Kenya ......................... 56
Household Strategies and Rural Livelihood Diversification ......................................... 30
Impact Assessment for Development Agencies: Learning to value change .................. 53
Implementing a SL framework for policy-directed research: Reflections from practice in Mali ........................................................................................ 20
Implementing the Sustainable rural livelihoods approach ............................................ 22
Income risk, coping strategies and safety nets ............................................................... 27
Institutional Support for SRL in SA: results from Zimbabwe, Zambia and SA .......... 35
Institutionalising SLAs ................................................................................................. 37
Institutions and Sustainable Livelihoods ..................................................................... 19
Integrating participatory research methods in a public agricultural research organisation: a partially successful experience in Morocco ........................................ 17
Inter-agency Experiences and Lessons: from the forum on operationalising SLAs ...... 29
Issues in designing new projects and programmes in Sustainable Urban Livelihoods .. 41
Learning and Livelihoods: The experience of the FSIPM project in Southern Malawi 48
Learning from change: Issues and experiences in participatory monitoring and evaluation ......................................................................................... 31
Linking Development With Democratic Processes in India: Political Capital and Sustainable Livelihoods Analysis ......................................................... 16
Livelihood Diversification and SRLs .......................................................................... 30
Livelihoods Approaches Compared ........................................................................... 23
Livelihoods Asset Tracking (LAST) A case from Rajastan ......................................... 20
Livelihoods Research: some conceptual and methodological issues ........................... 46
Living in the present, investing in the future: household security among the urban poor. .......................................................... 17
Making Livelihoods more sustainable........................................................................ 56
Measurement Malaise - is the SL approach inoperable? .............................................. 46
Methodological issues in PM&E ................................................................................. 37
Migrants, Livelihoods, and Rights: The relevance of migration in development policies ................................ ................................................................. 27
Mongolia-Sustainable livelihoods project ..................................................................... 60
Monitoring and Evaluating Impact on Livelihoods ..................................................... 60
New Approaches to Development Co-operation: What can we learn from experience with implementing SWAPs? .............................................................. 33
NGOs and Sustainable Development in Zimbabwe: No Magic Bullets ...................... 60
Goodbye to Projects?

Operationalising Household Livelihood Security: A Holistic Approach for Addressing Poverty and Vulnerability ................................................................. 34
Participatory Assessment and Planning for Sustainable Livelihoods: A critical assessment through the investment lens .............................................. 59
Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation: Learning from change ................................ 37
Participatory Poverty Assessments and Public Services: Key Messages From the Poor. .................................................................................................................. 21
People's Self-Development ......................................................................................... 52
Poverty Reduction Strategies: A Part for the Poor ...................................................... 39
'Power Tools' Tools for working on policies and institutions, series: 1, Getting Started 45
Principles of Sustainable Livelihoods ......................................................................... 40
Programme Approaches: Spaces and Entry Points for Social Development .......... 18
Promoting Practical Sustainability ................................................................................ 15
Realising human rights for poor people ........................................................................ 29
Reconstruction from War in Africa: Communities, Entrepreneurs, and States .......... 12
Responsible Well-Being- A Personal Agenda for Development .................................. 24
Rules, Norms and the Pursuit of SL ............................................................................. 41
Rural Africa at the Crossroads: Livelihood practices and policies .............................. 22
Rural institutions in environmental management in Kenya ........................................ 39
Rural Livelihood diversity in developing countries: evidence and policy implications. 31
Rural Livelihoods and Diversity in Developing Countries ............................................... 31
Rural planning for Sustainable Livelihoods in South Africa ...................................... 42
Sector Approaches, Sustainable Livelihoods and Rural Poverty Reduction .............. 34
Sector Programme Approaches: Will they work in Agriculture? ................................. 33
Sector programme Assistance .................................................................................... 13
Sector Support: From Policy making to Implementation Processes ......................... 57
Seeking an understanding of poverty that recognises rural-urban differences and rural-urban linkages ........................................................... 52
SL and Project Design in India ...................................................................................... 56
SLA in operation: A gender perspective ...................................................................... 42
Social Capital and Gender in South Africa .................................................................. 43
Social Capital as a product of Class Mobilization and State Intervention: Industrial Workers in Kerala, India ................................................................. 36
Social Capital in Waste- A Solid Investment? .............................................................. 17
Social Development issues in SWAps. Social Development working paper no.1 ...... 48
South Africa Country Strategy Paper ......................................................................... 28
Special issue on participatory monitoring and evaluation. PLA notes 31 ................. 39
Stakeholder Approaches to planning participatory research by multi-institution groups. ........................................................................................................... 43
Strengthening Policy Reform by Addressing the Needs, Interests and Rights of Poor and Vulnerable People ............................................................. 19
Sustainability; Life chances and education in Southern Africa .................................. 14
Sustainable Governance of Livelihoods in Rural Africa: A place-based response to globalism in Africa .............................................................. 13
Sustainable Livelihoods and Livelihood Diversification .............................................. 38
Sustainable Livelihoods and political capital: Arguments and evidence from decentralisation and natural resource management in India ...................... 16
Sustainable Livelihoods Approaches at the Policy Level ............................................ 58
Sustainable Livelihoods Guidance Sheets ................................................................. 26
Annotated bibliography

Sustainable Livelihoods in Malawi: A case study. ............................................................. 60
Sustainable Livelihoods, Policies and Policy Formulation- An Issues Paper ................. 26
Sustainable Livelihoods, Rights and The New Architecture of Aid. .............................. 32
Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons from early experience ............................................ 14
Sustainable Livelihoods: Lessons Learned from Global Programme Experience ......... 60
Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: A framework for analysis ........................................... 54
Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: What Contribution can we make? (Introductory chapter) .......................................................... 22
Tanzania Country Strategy Paper ................................................................................. 27
Tenure and shelter in SUL ......................................................................................... 52
The Contribution of People's Participation: Evidence from 121 Rural Water Supply Projects .......................................................... 47
The DELIVERI programmes ...................................................................................... 29
The European Policy in Support of Rural Development in Developing Countries. ..... 32
The Impact of Tourism on Rural Livelihoods: Namibia's experience. ......................... 14
The New Dynamics of Aid: Power, Procedures and Relationships ............................. 24
The Participatory Approach: Contradiction and Co-option in Burkina Faso ............... 45
The Participatory Approaches Learning Study: Executive summary and recommendations. .......................................................... 40
The Potential of Using Sustainable Livelihoods Approaches in Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers ........................................................................................................... 49
The Reality of Trying to Transform Structures and Processes: Forestry in Rural Livelihoods ................................................................................................................... 37
The rhetoric of the community in project management: the case of Mohlakeng township .......................................................... 55
The Sector Approach and Sustainable Rural Livelihoods ......................................... 12
The Status of Sector Wide Approaches ........................................................................ 21
The sustainability enigma: aid dependency and the phasing out of projects: the case of Swedish aid ............................................................................................................... 23
The Sustainable Livelihoods Approach and Programme Development in Cambodia . 58
The World Bank and Social Capital: contesting the concept in practice. ................. 33
Thinking about Logical Frameworks and Sustainable Livelihoods: A short critique and possible way forward. .......................................................... 51
To Claim our Rights: Livelihood security, human rights and sustainable development. ....................................................................................................................... 45
Tools for Sustainable Livelihoods: Livelihoods Monitoring and Evaluation ......... 51
Towards Operationalisation of the Sustainable Livelihoods Approach in Kenya (Draft Discussion Paper) ................................................................. 40
Trade-off Analysis for Participatory Coastal Zone Decision-Making .......... 21
Trust and Economic Development ............................................................................. 38
Two complimentary and integrated land uses of the western High Atlas Mountains, Morocco: the potential for sustainable rural livelihoods ......................................................................... 16
Unpacking the PIP box ................................................................................................. 38
USAID's New Approach to Development .................................................................. 59
Voices of the poor ........................................................................................................ 47
What can we do with a rights-based approach to development? ......................... 50
Who changes? Institutionalising participation in development ......................... 19
Who Counts Reality? Participatory monitoring and evaluation: a literature review .. 30
Whose Development? An Ethnography of Aid ............................................................. 26
Goodbye to Projects?

Whose reality, whose effects? .................................................................................................................. 37
Women in Transition out of poverty. ........................................................................................................ 47
Women, Human Capital and Livelihoods: An Ergonomics Perspective .......................... 40
Working for SL and food security: Voices from the grassroots. ................................. 44
Index of Authors

Abbot, J.................................................. 12
Addison, T. ........................................... 12
Adger, M.N........................................... 21
Akroyd, S ............................................. 12
Albert, H............................................. 13
Anani, K............................................. 13
Answer, N............................................. 14
Ashley, C........................................... 14, 15
AusAID ............................................... 6, 15
Barney, I............................................. 15
Barr, J.................................................. 43
Barrow, C.J......................................... 16
Baumann, P......................................... 16
Baur, H............................................... 17
Beall, J............................................... 17
Beall, J............................................... 17
Beck, T............................................... 18
Beckley, T......................................... 18
Bevan, P........................................... 18, 19
Bingen, J........................................... 19
Bird, B............................................... 48
Blackburn, J....................................... 19
Blowfield, M....................................... 20
Boesen, J........................................... 57
Bond, R............................................... 20
Brock, K........................................... 20, 48
Brocklesby, M................................. 21
Brown, A........................................... 21, 33
Brown, K........................................... 21
Bryce, D.......................................... 21
Carnegie, J....................................... 35
Carney, D.......................................... 14, 22
Catterson, J....................................... 23
Chambers, R..................................... 23, 24
Coirolo, L......................................... 24
Conway, G....................................... 23
Cooke, B........................................... 25
Cornwall, A....................................... 25
Costantinos, B.T.............................. 26
Crewe, E........................................... 26
Davies, R........................................... 26
de Haan, A....................................... 27
Dercon, S....................................... 27
DFID. 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 14, 15, 18, 19, 21, 22,
26, 27, 28, 29, 35, 37, 38, 40, 44, 46, 47,
53, 57, 58
Drinkwater, M................................... 22, 34
Duncan, A........................................... 12, 34
Dwivedi, R........................................... 30
Ellis, F............................................. 30, 31
Engberg-Pedersen, P................. 57
Estrella, M....................................... 31, 32
EU ................................................. 6, 32
FAO........................................... 6, 29, 58
Farrington, J................................. 24, 32
Ferguson, C....................................... 45
Ferguson, M....................................... 47
Foster, M........................................... 21, 33, 49
Fox, J............................................. 33
Frankenberger, T......................... 34
Gallet, S........................................... 20
Gaventa, J........................................ 25, 32, 35, 36
Gilling, J.......................................... 34, 57
Gilman, J......................................... 56
Gladwin, C. H.................................... 34
Goetz, A.......................................... 35
Goldman, I....................................... 35
Gujit, I........................................... 12, 36
Haddad, L......................................... 43
Harper, M......................................... 36
Harrison, E....................................... 26
Hayler, G......................................... 43
Heller, P........................................... 36
Hicham, H.......................................... 16
Hitinayake, G.................................... 49
Hobley, M....................................... 37, 38
Holland, J........................................ 19, 21
Howlett, D....................................... 53, 61
Humphrey, J...................................... 38
Hussein, K....................................... 15, 38
Idawo, C......................................... 39
IDS .. 20, 23, 24, 32, 35, 36, 38, 39, 41, 51,
54, 55
IIED ........................................... 12, 25, 39, 45, 54
IISD................................................. 40
INTRAC .......................................... 40
Jeffrey, T........................................... 40
Johnson, C....................................... 41
Johnson, H....................................... 41
Jones, S........................................... 34, 41
Kakande, M........................................ 48
Katepa-kalala, P........................... 42
Kela, N........................................... 35
Khanya ...................................... 1, 3, 4, 35, 42
Kidd, A........................................... 24
Kothari, U....................................... 25
Goodbye to Projects?

Kradi, C. .................................................. 17
Kulemkea, P.............................................. 42
Lawrence, A.............................................. 43
Lee-Smith, D. ............................................. 43
Lindahl, C................................................. 23
Maluccio, J................................................ 43
Mancusi-Materi, E. .................................... 44
Maqueen, D............................................... 44
Marumo, M............................................... 35
Marzetti, G. .............................................. 44
Maxwell, D. ............................................... 34
Mayers, J................................................. 45
McGurk, D................................................ 41
McLean, K................................................ 24
Michener, V.J........................................... 45
Mokoli, M. ................................................ 24
Moser, C................................................... 46
Mokherjee, N............................................ 20
Murray, C.................................................. 46
Murray, J.................................................. 47
Mwale, E................................................... 35
Narayan, D............................................... 47
Naschold, F. ........................................... 21, 33
Neeffjes, K. .............................................. 22, 47
Nelson, J................................................... 38
Nesmith, C............................................... 18
Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs... 9, 48
Norton, A................................................. 21, 45, 48, 49
Ntongo, S.................................................. 35
Nurse, M................................................... 49
Nzamujo, F................................................ 49
ODI., 14, 15, 16, 17, 21, 22, 24, 26, 31, 33,
35, 37, 40, 43, 45, 49, 50, 58
Orr, A. et al.............................................. 50
Ostrom, E.................................................. 50
Pastor, K................................................... 51
Payne, G................................................... 52
Petit, J..................................................... 24
Pinney, A................................................. 53
Pretty, J................................................... 52
Rahman, A................................................. 52
Rasmussen, J........................................... 53
Rigby, D. .................................................. 53, 61
Robinson, E............................................. 61
Roche, C................................................... 53
Rusinow, T............................................... 22
Ryan, A.................................................... 24
Satterthwaite, D. ...................................... 54
Schmitz, H................................................. 38
Scoones, I................................................. 54
Scott-Villiers, P........................................ 24
Sen, A........................................................ 55
Shah, P..................................................... 24
Shankland, A............................................ 55
Sihlongonyane, M.F................................. 55
Singh, N................................................... 22, 56
Subir, S.................................................... 16
Sutherland, A.J.......................................... 56
Tacoli, C................................................... 54
Therkildsen, O.......................................... 57
Thin, N..................................................... 57
Thomson, A.............................................. 58
Turk, C..................................................... 48
Turton, C................................................... 58
Underwood, M......................................... 57
UNDP ..................................................... 6, 22, 26, 42, 56, 59, 60
USAID ...................................................... 6, 59
Van Rooy, A............................................. 59
Vivian, J.................................................... 60
Vizard, P................................................... 45
Wannanli, S............................................. 22, 60
White, J..................................................... 61
Wilson, G................................................ 41
Woodhouse, P.......................................... 53, 61
World Bank.. 6, 7, 24, 33, 46, 47, 56, 57, 61,
62