

Institutional Evaluation of Caribbean MPAs

December 2001

CHARACTERISATION REVIEW

Brief # 2

Since the last brief (May-01), CANARI have completed their characterisation review of MPAs in the Caribbean. The review was conducted by Tighe Geoghegan, Allan Smith and Katy Thacker at CANARI through the compilation of information into data sheets for each MPA. These sheets were then completed by key people at each of the MPAs where possible. 75 MPAs from 17 countries were

included in the review.

Below are some of the key results and hypotheses that emerged from this activity. These insights will be further explored, where relevant, during the remainder of the project. In particular, the datasheets are being trans-

ferred onto a database allowing greater ease of access and analytic potential.

The final CANARI report and a document containing the datasheets are available from the MRAG website as PDF documents (www.mragltd.com then select "Land Water Interface" from the left hand banner and you will find the documents under "selected project examples").

The project would like to thank all those who helped CANARI collate this information – a detailed list is included in the report's acknowledgements.

KEY DATES

- Student projects due end Jan-02
- Legal review due end Jan-02
- Field visit planned Jan-March-02
- Change in regional dissemination workshop now Oct/Nov-02
- Final publication of guidelines now Dec-02.

Key results/ideas include:

- Coral reefs are found in 80% of MPAs, mangroves are cited in at least two thirds of MPAs while sea-grass beds are the least represented type of coastal ecosystem. Few MPAs are established specifically to protect endangered species.
- While 'conservation' is emphasised in objectives/mission statements it is clear that management programmes do draw on a wider range of purposes. Namely enhancement of tourism, conservation and sustainable and equitable use of coastal resources.
- An associated trend is noted in the types of management arrangements in place for MPAs: sites established for more than 20 years are generally managed by a single government agency or national trust, while more recent arrangements are more complex involving government partnerships with NGO's, consortia etc. In addition, stakeholders engage 'to some degree' in most MPAs – with more than half including active or formal consultation mechanisms.
- Funding comes from one of three core sources: national government, donor or visitor/user fees. Unsurprisingly, those MPAs with poor tourism capacity and low national priority are more reliant on external donor support, which in turn may increase their vulnerability and lower their likelihood of success.
- With respect to the links between MPAs and poverty, a key focus of this research, it is clear that many MPAs border areas of significant poverty, while others are close to pockets of "at-risk" populations. So while the links between poor people and MPAs are often not yet clearly established, potential for MPAs to benefit the poor exist.
- Fishing is cited as a key use of MPAs in 70% of cases surveyed, yet water based recreation, i.e. tourism, is clearly the predominant use of MPAs in the region. As a corollary, the most frequently identified conflict amongst users is between fishers and divers, with zoning and consultation being the most common forms of management response.
- Previous research and this review suggest again that the sector benefiting the most from MPAs is marine based tourism (with ownership disproportionately expatriate). Access to the benefits from successful MPAs is a key element to understand when considering their potential to address national poverty. Some MPAs actively address the impacts of management on their poorer neighbours, but beyond giving stakeholders greater participation in MPA management, the impact of such programmes is still to be determined.

MPA CASE STUDY SITES

One of the key consequences of the characterisation review was the selection of our case study sites. Sites in four countries have been chosen for the more detailed work (see table below). The six UWI students have completed their fieldwork at 12 sites for their research into ecological, livelihood and

legal/institutional aspects of MPA management. The intensive participatory appraisals (PA) to be conducted by MRAG staff early in the New Year will build on the UWI students' findings and concentrate on four MPAs all considered to have operational management (identified with a tick in the table

below). In addition, the extensive documentation on SMMA (St Lucia) will be drawn upon, but no field visits will be held. We are in the process of finalising Letters of Understanding with each of these MPAs to formalise the research relationship.

COUNTRY	MPA site	Student work	PA focus
Jamaica (large island)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Negril Montego Bay Ocho Rios 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal, ecological, livelihood Legal Legal 	U
Belize (continental)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hol Chan Glovers Reef Gladden Spit Silk Cayes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal, ecological, livelihood Legal, ecological, livelihood Legal Legal 	U U
Turks and Caicos Islands (small island)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Princess Alexandra Admiral Cockburn Chalk Sound 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal, ecological, livelihood Legal Legal 	U
Dominica (small island)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Soufriere/Scott's Head Cabrits 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal Legal 	

We are grateful for the assistance, co-operation, and warm welcome that all of the UWI students received from Government personnel, MPA staff and the communities during their 2-3 months of fieldwork. This was especially so, given the tragic circumstances of September 11, and of Hurricanes Iris and Michelle.

PARTICIPATORY APPRAISALS AT CASE STUDIES

Two UK-based researchers, Dr Caroline Garaway and Nicole Esteban, will undertake the PA work in each of the four MPAs during late January, through February and into March. The objective of this work is to identify

the outcomes of MPA management and the factors that contribute to them with particular emphasis on the impacts that successfully implemented MPAs have on poor people's livelihoods.

We anticipate sending another brief soon after the field site visits with early results and will direct you to the full report when it is available on the website.

CONTACT DETAILS

The project is implemented through a partnership between MRAG Ltd. and NRM-UWI, with the collaboration of the Caribbean Natural Resources Institute (CANARI).

Dr Caroline Garaway, Nicole Esteban (née Kenward) & Vicki Cowan
MRAG Ltd, 47 Prince's Gate,
London, SW7 2QA, England
Phone: +44 (0) 207 594 9888
Fax: +44 (0) 207 823 7916
Email: n.esteban@ic.ac.uk

Professor Wayne Hunte, Dr Hazel Oxenford & Dr Winston Anderson
Natural Resource Management Programme, University of the West Indies, Cave Hill Campus, Barbados
Phone: +1 246 417 4571
Fax: +1 246 424 4204
Email: hoxenford@uwichill.edu.bb

This document is an output from a project funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) for the benefit of developing countries. The views expressed are not necessarily those of DFID.