

Section 2 - Impact of Migration on Social and Economic Development

Information on Impacts of International Migration

The original hypothesis was:

Migration is leading to increased inequalities within and between sending communities and regions and areas where there is less or no migration.

There is a variety of information and data available on the social and economic impacts of international migration in South Asia. However, put together, this information comprises more of a patchwork than a comprehensive assessment of impacts. The information and analyses available vary from: a range of country-level assessments mainly of the economic impacts of migration (Amjad 1989; Addleton 1992; Seddon et al 2000; Dunham and Jayasuriya 1998); a number of state and province level assessments of economic and some social impacts (on Kerala Nair 1998, Prakash 1998, Ramachandran 1998; on Nepal Seddon et al 2000; on Bangladesh Islam 1995; on Sri Lanka Gunatilleke 1998a) and a variety of local level studies which often approach migration from very different perspectives (referred to in the table below).

Addleton's (1992) review of the impact of international migration from Pakistan to the Gulf states for the 1970s and 1980s is, perhaps, the most comprehensive and useful overall assessment. Addleton examines a wide range of data from a single perspective, namely that migration to the Gulf had the effect of marginalising central government planning and development efforts to the benefit of rural areas and households. He looks at the development of policy and draws on country-level statistics and surveys, examining impacts at a province and district level and compares these with a wide-range of local-level studies both published and unpublished. Addleton's review is complemented by a number of local level studies from different areas and periods, including Ballard (1983, 2001) on Kashmir, Naveed-i-Rahat (1990) and Lefebvre (1999) on Punjab, and Watkins (2001) on NWFP.

Seddon has attempted a similar approach in the work on international migration and labour markets in Nepal carried out for DFID (Seddon et al 2000; Seddon and Subedi 2000). As is noted in the report, there is remarkably little data on international migration from Nepal and its impacts. For the purposes of the report some fieldwork was carried out in an attempt to begin to fill in these gaps.

The information available for Sri Lanka, Bangladesh and India is far more patchy. For example, for India, most of the work available concentrates on Kerala, where up to 50% of the migrants to the Gulf states have come from. There are a number of recent analyses of the state level impact, looking mainly at economic impacts but also at some aspects of social impact (Nair 1998, Prakash 1998, Ramachandran 1998). The most useful local level study in Kerala is that carried out by Osella and Osella (1999, 2000). There are few studies carried out elsewhere in India, the main ones being Ballard's (1983) work in the Punjab and Hansen's (2001) research on migration of Muslims from Bombay.

For Sri Lanka, there are two recent papers that summarise the national level economic impacts of migration (Dunham and Jayasuriya 1998; Gunatilleke 1998a). There are two complementary local-level studies, one collection based on work carried out in the 1980s (Eelens et al 1992), and one more recent study of women who migrate as housemaids (Gamburd 2000). For Bangladesh there is only a brief examination of the impacts of migration in two districts (Islam 1995) and Gardner's (1995) detailed study of the social and cultural effects of migration in Sylhet.

These studies will be examined in the following section. The first part is an examination of the main sending areas for international migration from the region, looking at the historical origins of many of the migration flows. The second part will look at the variety of evidence on the social and economic impacts of migration, drawing on a range of sources, from micro-level studies to country reviews. An attempt is made to focus on three sets of indicators of impact, where the information exists:

At the Country Level - Unemployment Rates, percentage of GDP, percentage of foreign exchange earnings

At State/Province/District Level - Consumption levels, wage rates, land-holding patterns

At the Local Level - household incomes/ livelihood strategies, and local economies

The information available for India, Sri Lanka and Bangladesh does give a sense of the overall impacts of international migration. However, a more comprehensive assessment, along the lines of the work of Addleton (1992), Seddon et al (2000) and Seddon and Subedi (2000), would be of great value, given the rapidly changing situation set out in the first section. Certainly for Sri Lanka and Bangladesh, it would be possible to carry out a similar exercise, drawing on locally available material on policy and statistics, and utilising local-level studies where available, supplemented with small-scale fieldwork where no data exists. Before carrying out such an exercise in India, it would be necessary to obtain and analyse data at a state level in order to identify states other than Kerala for more detailed study.

In order to look at the issue of migration and poverty, I suggest that it is necessary to take account of migration as a whole, comparing the work on international migration discussed above, with a range of work on regional as well as internal migration (for Bangladesh, Faraizi 1993, Mortuza 1992, Samaddar 1999; for India, Breman 1985, Rogaly et al 2001, Mosse et al 1998; for Nepal, Seddon and Subedi 2000; for Pakistan, Selier 1988, and; for Sri Lanka, Spencer 2001). Again, the latter work is somewhat patchy and, in many cases, there is no reliable statistical data or county-level analyses to provide a broader context. However, the comparison does highlight some patterns in the social and economic groups which participate in migration and the impacts of the migration on these groups and the areas from which they originate.

Finally, the growing interest in transnational communities suggests that one of the most important impacts of migration is the linkages that are established and maintained between sending areas and migrant communities. While it is beyond the scope of this research to look at this issue in detail, a number of examples are presented of the informal nature of much migration (Longva 1997; Watkins 2001), the development of

transnational networks (Ballard 2001b) and the influence of migrant communities (Hansen 2001b, 2001c; Østergaard-Nielsen 2001).

The Impact of Migration in South Asia - looking at the reasons for migration and at the impact on the poor. looks at globalisation from below, at the development of networks and linkages among migrants and between migrants and their original communities and at how migrants can influence developments in their home countries.

The Impact of International Migration

Sending Areas

There is surprisingly little detailed information on the main sending areas for international migration from South Asia. One of the main sources is the literature on migration from South Asia to the Gulf states. In addition, some of the research on migration to the UK has looked at the most important sending areas. An examination of the sending areas for migrants is important in understanding how migration flows start and persist over time.

Islam suggests that two districts in Bangladesh have been the sources of most international migrants from the country: "over 90% of Bangladeshi immigrants in Britain have come from Sylhet"; and the majority of migrants to the Middle East come from Chittagong (Islam 1995: 360). Gardner has looked at both the Bangladeshi community in the UK and at international migration from Bangladesh. She confirms that the majority of migrants to the UK came from Sylhet, while most of those migrating from Chittagong and Noakhali went to the Middle East (Gardner 1995: 45). She also observes that migrants to the Middle East came from all over Bangladesh and that some of those Sylheti families who had done well from UK migration were able to take advantage of these new opportunities in the Gulf. Within Sylhet, Gardner also highlights the fact that the major sending areas were specifically those ones near the major river in the district (ibid: 41).

For India, there are a number of states where there are substantial numbers of migrants to the Middle East. According to Premi the most important are, Kerala, Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu (Premi 1998: 221), while Nair also mentions Karnataka, Punjab, Gujarat and Goa (Nair 1998: 260). Of all of these states Kerala is by far the most important, accounting for 50% of the total outflow of migrants from India to the Middle East (Nair 1998: 260). Within Kerala, the majority of migrants come from the coastal districts and areas where there is a substantial Muslim population (ibid: 265).

The western and eastern hill regions have had the most significant out migration, with over two thirds of the overseas migrants from the country coming from these areas (Seddon et al 2000: 35). The other significant area of outmigration has been the urban and peri-urban areas of the Kathmandu Valley (ibid: 35).

In Pakistan, all of the provinces have been sources of migrants to the Middle East to some extent. However, the majority of these migrants have come from Punjab and NWFP, with relatively small proportions from Sindh and, particularly Baluchistan (Addleton 1992: 89-90; Azam 1998). Again, within the provinces, there are specific areas where there are significant levels of outmigration. As Addleton points out, the majority of these districts from NWFP and Punjab are rain-fed agricultural areas, known as *barani* areas (ibid: 92). For migration to the UK, Ballard highlights the fact that as much as two thirds of Britain's Pakistani population comes from either Mirpur district in Azad Kashmir or one of its immediate neighbours (Ballard 2001: 3)

For Sri Lanka there is much more limited evidence of the main sending areas. Eelens et al mention that in the 1980s 70% of Sri Lankan migrants came from the Colombo and the neighbouring Gampaha Districts (Eelens et al 1992: 5). Rodrigo quotes similar figures for the period 1979-84, that 70% of migrants came from the Colombo, Gampaha and Kalutra Districts (Rodrigo 1995: 44-5).

From this brief examination of the main sending areas within the region, it can be concluded that some of the poorer areas, as well as some of the better off areas have participated in international migration. A range of authors suggest that the explanation for specific sending areas lies elsewhere. Gardner, for example, goes into some detail on the history of migration from Bangladesh. The pioneer emigrants from the area were *lascars*, or Indian sailors, employed by British ships docked in Calcutta (Gardner 1995: 36). The districts of Noakhali and Chittagong had an established tradition of men working as sailors, which developed into a general migratory tradition (ibid: 36). For Sylhet, Gardner suggests that migration in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was an opportunity, which those who were better off and those in areas with established links to Calcutta took advantage of (ibid: 40-1).

Other authors trace similar, very local histories of migration in the region. For example, Ballard suggests that international migration from Mirpur was a matter of chance and demand. The Mirpur population was traditionally employed on the construction and crewing of boats on the River Jhelum (Ballard 2001: 4). When this river trade was brought to an end by the construction of the railways, the men of Mirpur were fortunate to find that another opportunity opened up as workers in the engine rooms of the new steam ships operating out of Bombay and Karachi (ibid: 4-5). This opportunity in turn provided the entry point and the means for migration to the UK in the post-war period.

For Nepal, Seddon et al link overseas migration to recruitment by the British army in the nineteenth century in the western and eastern hill regions (Seddon et al 2000: 35). Addleton argues that Pakistan as a whole was a mobile society, in part due to army recruitment and the establishment of canal colonies (Addleton 1992: 27-39). Migration from NWFP in particular has been of long-standing importance, given the general lack of opportunities in the province. Army recruitment drew on Pathans, especially from the relatively poor rain-fed areas (ibid: 31). This 'culture' of migration from the province, led to large numbers of Pathans seeking new opportunities within the newly formed Pakistan, in the construction of canals, the capital Islamabad and then the development of Karachi (ibid: 37). Many of these men were working for construction companies which then moved from Pakistan to Saudi Arabia and other Gulf states at the start of the 1970s (ibid: 37-8).

Gulf migration has offered opportunities particularly to Muslims in South Asia. Pakistan has been one of the main beneficiaries of these opportunities. In India and Sri Lanka, Gulf migration has provided specific chances to poorer and often marginalised Muslim communities. Hansen has described how Gulf migration has offered opportunities of escape for Muslims from Mumbai and, indeed, to Muslim migrants to the city from the poor states of Bihar and Uttar Pradesh (Hansen 2001a). Gamburd, similarly records for

Sri Lanka that "While Muslims make up only 7% of the Sri Lankan population in general..., Muslim women make up 22-33% of the housemaids..., and Muslims make up as high as 27.8% of the total migrant population" (Gamburd 2000: 40). The high demand for Muslim housemaids in the Gulf states means that sponsors in the Gulf pay considerably more to recruitment agencies in Sri Lanka for them, which in turn means that Muslim women have to pay lower fees to recruitment agencies (ibid: 62, 69).

In conclusion, international migrants from South Asia tend to come from specific areas and, in turn, travel to specific destinations. This is often a matter of historical chance and of demands for specific types of labour or labourers. It is, hence, difficult to predict where and when demand will come from and what the response will be.

Social and Economic Impacts

There are a range of studies from across the region at different levels which can give a perspective on the differing impacts of international migration on specific social and economic settings. As a guide the following table summarises the studies used in the analysis which follows.

Table 7 - Sources of information used for assessing impacts of migration

	Country level	State/ Province level	Local level
Bangladesh		Islam (1995)	Gardner (1995)
India		Kerala Nair (1998), Prakash (1998), Ramachandran (1998)	Osella and Osella (1999, 2000) Ballard (1983) Hansen (2001a)
Nepal		Seddon et al (2000)	Seddon et al (2000)
Pakistan	Addleton (1992)	Addleton (1992)	Ballard (1983, 2001) Lefebvre (1999) Naveed-i-Rahat (1990) Watkins (2001)
Sri Lanka	Dunham and Jayasuriya (1998) Gunatilleke (1998a)		Eelens et al (1992) Gamburd (2000)

In looking at the various studies, a number of common measures of impact will be examined for comparative purposes. These measures are:

At the Country Level - Unemployment Rates, and remittances as a percentage of GDP, a percentage of foreign exchange earnings

At the State/Province Level - Consumption levels, wage rates, and land-holding patterns

At the Local Level - migration as a contribution to household incomes and livelihood strategies, and the impact on local economies

Shah (1994) provides an overview of some of the impacts at a country level, specifically the contribution of remittances to GDP and export earnings.

Table 8: Migrant Worker Remittances In Relation To GNP And Export Earnings (Source Shah 1994)

Country	Year	Remittances as percentage of	
		GNP	Exports
Bangladesh	1977	0.8	14.2
	1980	1.7	31.4

	1983	2.3	68.7
	1986	3.9	68.6
	1990	3.7	37.5
India	1977	0.6	7.8
	1980	1.2	15.1
	1983	1.1	14.4
	1985	1.0	13.2
	1988	0.8	10.2
Pakistan	1977	8.4	78.9
	1980	10.3	67.1
	1983	11.3	71.9
	1986	8.4	56.7
	1990	4.8	27.4
Sri Lanka	1977	0.7	2.1
	1980	3.1	8.7
	1983	6.0	20.9
	1986	5.1	18.2
	1991	4.9	17.2

The figures show that remittances have been of varying importance to the national economies of South Asia. The specific importance to individual economies is examined below.

Bangladesh

There is relatively little information available on the impacts of migration on Bangladesh as a whole. The figures from Shah (1994) show that remittances have grown in importance relative to GNP, seeming to level off in the late 1980s. There are no assessments available on the impact of migration on unemployment rates, though Stalker, using estimates, suggests that migration is unlikely to make much of a contribution to a reduction in rates (Stalker 2000: 76). In very general terms Islam states that "The export of manpower and the resultant in-flow of remittances have largely been acclaimed as the crucial factors in keeping the Bangladeshi economy afloat in recent years (ibid: 360).

At a district level, Islam (1995) looks at the effects of migration in Sylhet and Chittagong, recording a range of changes, some resulting in increased differentiation, some showing general improvements. For example, land purchase is a major investment for migrants, so that migrant households have become the main landholders, while landlessness has increased among non-migrant households (ibid: 363). In addition many migrant households have moved out of agriculture altogether to focus on work in trades and services (ibid: 364). At the same time, there has been a shortage of labour in the area, which has raised agricultural wages by 50% and has attracted migrant labour from other districts, though this has had a negative impact on non-migrant peasant households (ibid: 364). Finally Islam concludes by highlighting the sharp reduction in the infant mortality rate in migration areas (ibid: 365), which would suggest a general improvement in income and consumption levels.

Gardner (1995) looks in detail at international migrants from small area in Sylhet, Bangladesh. In Sylhet, Gardner makes it clear that, international migration was an opportunity that was only available to rich or middle-income rural families (ibid: 40). In the case of migration to the Middle East, those involved tended to be from prosperous families, related to those already in the UK (ibid: 57-8). Migration was, then, associated with economic transformation and economic differences within the village were explained with reference to the different opportunities available at home and away (Gardner 1993: 5). Those with savings from migration have been able to invest in land, which in turn has given control over life and security (Gardner 1995: 66-7).

India

Again, at the country level there have been no assessments of the impact of migration. The figures from Shah (1994), show that remittances make a small contribution to GNP and to export earnings and that the percentage has been gradually declining. There has been no assessment of the impact of migration on unemployment, although general assessments for Kerala have shown little impact, with some growth in unemployment (Nair 1998: 284).

At a regional level there have been a number of assessments of the impact of migration on the economy of the state of Kerala (Nair 1998, Prakash 1998, Ramachandran 1998). In terms of participation in migration, the bulk of migrants come from districts where the Muslim population is substantial (Nair 1998: 265). Surveys have shown that the majority of migrants come from poor households (Prakash 1998: 3212), though Nair notes that the extremely poor tend not to migrate (Nair 1998: 267).

In terms of impacts, the main changes that have shown up in regularly conducted surveys have been rises in expenditure and consumption, taking the figures for Kerala above the Indian average (Ramachandran 1998: 220-1). Prakash also notes that income levels in the state have generally improved (see also Nair 1998: 283), through remittances, but also local generation of employment, particularly in construction, and increases in the wages rates, partly due to local shortages of skilled workmen (Prakash 1998: 3212).

Overall Prakash argues that migration has had a positive effect on what is often described as Kerala's backward and stagnant economy, with remittances contributing to around 22% of the State Domestic Product (Prakash 1998: 3210). Nair takes a more cautious view, arguing that unemployment has continued to grow and that the economic performance of the state has been poor (Nair 1998: 280). At the same time he notes that there has been significant growth in the construction and tertiary sectors and that there have been improvements in consumption and asset holding levels, as well as in housing conditions at the micro-level (*ibid*: 281 and 283).

At the local level in Kerala, Osella and Osella (1999) have noted that, while the lower caste groups have been able to participate in migration to the Middle East, they have not yet been able to accumulate sufficient resources to become socially mobile. Their work focuses on members of the Izhava Community, ex-untouchables who have taken advantage of the opportunities available for migration to the Gulf States (Osella and Osella 1999: 992-4). Both those who migrate to work and those who labour at home compete for status through the purchase of consumer goods and fashion items as a means of objectifying the family's progress (*ibid*: 1011-2). However, it is a longer-term strategy to build up the resources to be able to invest in major sources of family prestige such as land and houses (*ibid*: 1013). Only by making such major investments can members of the Izhava Community compete on equal terms with the upper castes (*ibid*: 1020).

Ballard's work (1983), comparing the impact of migration to the UK from Jullundur in the Indian Punjab with Mirpur in Pakistan, stresses the importance of the local context from which migrants come. There is a contrast between the impact in Jullundur, which

has a fertile environment for migrant returnees and offers a wide variety of opportunities for investment, and Mirpur where there are few opportunities for investment; agricultural equipment and inputs are expensive and the basic infrastructure is poor (Ballard 1983: 130). In Mirpur, then, migrant remittances have led to stagnation and there is ongoing dependence on migration (ibid: 129). In Jullundur, in contrast, there has been social change as a result of rapid economic growth. In particular the lower castes have benefited and have been able to move out of agriculture to migrate to urban areas or to the Gulf, to be replaced by migrants from other parts of India (ibid: 122-4).

In Mumbai, India, Hansen records that Muslims, who tend to be among the poorest groups in India, found it easier to obtain work permits for the Gulf states (2001a: 270). He notes that different groups have tended to go into different professions in the Gulf; so that, Muslims worked mostly as skilled workers and unskilled labourers, Hindus went into professional fields such as accounting and engineering, and those from the trading communities became involved in the labour agencies (Hansen 2001a: 270). For the least skilled, then, labour migration became "an exit option and a highly welcome alternative to the hardships of employment in the small-scale sector in Mumbai, and often also an avenue to savings and accumulation" (ibid: 269). In addition, Muslims migrating from the poor states of Bihar and Uttar Pradesh to work in Mumbai, have over time been able to accumulate sufficient resources to themselves migrate to work in the Gulf (ibid: 268).

Nepal

At the country level, Seddon et al quote the official estimates of remittances, showing a rapid growth over the last two decades; from Rs 90.7 million in 1974-5, and Rs 216.8 million in 1980-1, to Rs 2,906.7 million in 1994-5, and Rs 2,938 million in 1996-7 (Seddon et al 2000: 22). However, they suggest that these figures are a gross underestimate and suggest a more likely figure of Rs 35 billion for 1997, a figure close to the total foreign exchange earnings from all sources and the equivalent of 13% of GDP (ibid: 23). The Nepal Living Standards Survey Report suggests that 23% of the households in the sample received remittances and that this money contributed 27% on average to their total household income (ibid: 20).

Considering the importance of migration from Nepal, there are surprisingly few local-level studies of its impact. Seddon et al have reviewed what is available in some detail and also carried out a small number of field studies in 1999 to supplement what is available. A general conclusion is that "the increasing importance of remittances in the rural areas has also led to the greater integration of the local (regional) economy through the flows of capital (income in remittances receiving points) and labour (in areas with lesser extent of outside earnings) associated with migration and remittances" (ibid: 44).

The studies in the Terai found considerable variation between village in the rates of migration. In a village in Nawalparasi District less than 2% of households had family members working abroad and around 6.5% had members working elsewhere in Nepal. The poorest in the village had to depend on labouring within the village for a living and were often locked into tied labour arrangements with better off families (ibid: 67). In Dhanusha District the study in one village found that 9.8% of the households had access to 'off-farm' employment in Nepal, while 32.7% were involved in foreign labour migration, with 215 people working in India and 276 working in the Gulf states (ibid: 70-1).

The main study in the hill areas, in Kaski District, found in one village that 45% of all households had one or more members working away from home (ibid: 47). One of the main impacts of remittances in the village itself was the creation of new wage labour and land-renting opportunities, most of which were taken up by the landless and marginal farm households (ibid: 50). However, the main investment of savings was in the towns, in small businesses, housing and the development of industries, all of which attracted labourers from outside (ibid: 50).

Pakistan

Addleton, in his book *Undermining the Centre*, has analysed the economic and social effects of Gulf Migration from Pakistan in the 1970s and 1980s, drawing on a wide range of material including large numbers of local level studies. Starting at the country level, remittance levels grew rapidly from a starting point of \$125 million in 1972-3, to a peak of \$3 billion in 1982-3 and levelling off at around \$2 billion through most of the 1980s (Addleton 1992: 113). Throughout this period remittances exceeded foreign aid levels, were a significant factor in Pakistan's overall balance of payments accounts and helped to sustain relatively high growth rates (ibid: 113-6, 123). Addleton argues that migration made a modest contribution to unemployment levels, although it did have an impact on the labour market in the country, bringing about greater flexibility (ibid: 180-6). However, for Addleton, the most important impact was that remittance money was, for the most part, out of the control of central government with its tendency to bias towards the privileged classes. The bulk of money went to rural areas and priorities were decided by those who earned the money (ibid: 118-9).

The main impacts of Gulf migration were, then, on households and particularly the estimated 1.2 million households in rural areas, predominantly in the poorer, rain-fed areas of Punjab and NWFP (ibid: 137). For these households there were marked improvements in quality of life, with better housing, better clothing and better food (ibid: 142-7). However, the positive impacts were not confined to migrant households alone and Addleton argues that, in sending areas, the "shift toward more complex and diversified village economies with stronger links to neighbouring urban areas was very much associated with the migration process.... In general, migration helped integrate isolated rural areas into the national economy" (ibid: 148). General increases in wage rates, which can be associated with migration, are recorded for a range of manual workers (ibid: 177-80).

Addleton argues that the benefits of migration were spread through the sending areas with improved communications, transportation, banking and growth in small-scale industry (ibid: 148). In addition, remittances formed an important source of financing in many rural areas (ibid: 149). At the very least the direct benefits of individual households being involved in migration could be increased consumption by such households and the absence of labour (ibid: 153-4). In the case of NWFP, Addleton records that large scale migration from the province took place at a time when vast numbers of Afghans were seeking refuge in Pakistan. Afghans, thus, provided a major source of unskilled daily wage labour in many areas of NWFP (ibid: 89-91). In conclusion, Addleton points out that poverty levels in Pakistan declined in the 1970s and 1980s but that, at the same time, inequality increased (ibid: 162-3).

Many of these conclusions are confirmed by individual, detailed local studies carried out since Addleton's work. Ballard has, over the last two decades, recorded and analysed the impact of migration on villages in Jullundur in India and Mirpur in Pakistan (Ballard 1983 and 2001). In the 1980s Ballard argued that the policy context in Mirpur meant that migrant remittances led to a stagnation of the economy (Ballard 1983: 129). Returning to Mirpur in 2000, Ballard has found that the economic impacts of migration to the UK and

then to the Middle East have been mixed (Ballard 2001). The small minority who were able to migrate to the UK in the 1960s have done extremely well for themselves in economic and social terms and continue to maintain contact with Mirpur (ibid: 2-3). The experiences of those who migrated to the Gulf have been more mixed, with opportunities drying up with more competition for work from new arrivals such as Bangladeshis and Indonesians (ibid: 1-2). Overall, however, the impact on Mirpur has been substantial and the area, despite the limited investment opportunities, continues to boom economically, with migrants investing in just three areas, buying land and building either residential or commercial property (ibid: 8).

In Dir, one of the poorer districts of NWFP, for some villages migration has become a way of life. Watkins (2001) has looked at the history of migration from a village in Dir District, Pakistan, over at least a century. With few opportunities in the home village, most households have come to depend on migration of one sort or another. In the colonial period various men from the village found work as mullahs in Baluchistan or wandered further afield in Bengal, living off their wits. The first real opportunities opened up after independence when larger numbers of men found work as labourers or small contractors in canal construction in the Punjab. They then moved on to Karachi in the 1960s in the same work and over time a small community of local men developed there. The first pioneers from the village went to the UAE in the early 1970s with Pakistani construction companies. They soon found better opportunities working as individuals in the mountain areas and were able to build up relationships with local sponsors.

By the early 1990s virtually every household in the village has at least one man working in the UAE or Saudi Arabia and migration had become the key element of household livelihood strategies, with increasing dependence on remittance money. In the main, the money was invested in homes, that is providing a better quality of life for the people of the home and ensuring the children had the best education possible and building new houses for the extended families to live in. The other main investment was in establishing and maintaining kin networks, which provided both opportunities for migration and support for households (Watkins 2001).

Two studies in the Punjab, by Naveed-i-Rahat (1990) and Lefebvre (1999) reach similar conclusions on the economic reliance on migration and its impacts. Naveed-i-Rahat, writing about a village close to the capital, Islamabad, argues that international migration is part of a process of rural diversification, brought about by population pressure on limited land resources and a lack of agricultural productivity (Naveed-i-Rahat 1990: 26-7). In the period of study, around half of the working men of the village were living and working outside, so that migration was the main source of income besides agriculture (ibid: 29). She concludes that the longstanding importance of various forms of migration have converted the village from "a farming community into a peri-urban settlement" (ibid: 42). Lefebvre confirms the continued importance of migration in two villages in northern Punjab, one to the north of Lahore, the other south of Rawalpindi. He argues that migration is the most reliable solution to economic problems in the villages, such as limited land and low wage levels (Lefebvre 1999: 142).

Sri Lanka

There are a number of assessments of the macro-economic impacts of international migration on Sri Lanka. The figures from Shah (1994), show that remittances made a growing contribution to GNP through the 1980s, with a decline at the start of the 1990s. Gunatilleke updates the figures, reporting that "Private remittances in gross terms contribute about 14% of the foreign exchange receipts in the current account of the country's balance of payments, excluding official transfers (1995). The gross flow of private remittances amount to about 31% of the national savings, equivalent to 6% of GDP (Gunatilleke 1998a: 143-4). Gunatilleke has carried out a detailed analysis of the contribution of migration to the reduction in unemployment. He records a decline in unemployment from 16% in 1990 to 11.9% in 1995 and concludes that migration has contributed to this reduction, though "the extent of the contribution is not easy to determine (ibid:131, 113).

Economic analysts Dunham and Jayasuriya (1998) have examined the growing importance of remittances from Sri Lankan migrants in West Asia. The state in Sri Lanka played a prominent role in basic needs provision until the late 1970s when this became no longer affordable (ibid: 3153). However, since the mid-1980s, there has been a shift to other forms of support, in the main, employment in the armed services, small-scale tea growing, employment in the garment export sector and remittances from West Asian employment (ibid: 3153 and 3155). The authors conclude with a warning of a "fragile and highly brittle peasant economy....where there is no identifiable and sustainable way out of rural poverty" (ibid: 3153-4).

There are no available analyses of the impacts of migration at a district level.

In a collection of papers on international migration from Sri Lanka, Eelens, Schampers and Speckman (1992) a number of studies take a more qualitative view, including: Mook's presentation of a Village Case Study; Jacobs and Pacma on the socio-economic position and religious status of Sri Lankan women, and; Brochman on housemaids in the Middle East. Generally the papers identify migration as a survival strategy and suggest a hierarchy of spending, starting with repaying debts and followed by daily consumption. There is general agreement that the quality of life is better for households involved in migration. Overall the papers highlight three issues:

- The large number of indebted households
- An improvement in economic status but a decline in the social esteem of migrant households
- Note a slow process of change in terms of gender positions and status of migrant households.

Gamburd's (2000) more detailed and long-term ethnographic work provides a useful and much more fine-grained commentary on the issues raised in the papers above and gives particularly interesting insights on the long-term changes that are taking place. The key issue that Gamburd brings out is the motivation of migrants. Poverty is cited as the main reason why women went abroad, with families unable to keep themselves above the poverty line on a man's wages as a casual labourer. Migrants see improvements in the

quality of life of their families as the main motivation for migration: "Although migrants did worry about leaving their children behind, they argued that they went abroad primarily to benefit those children by providing them with money for food, clothing, and school fees; a new and better house; and better prospects for the future" (ibid: 200).

On the issue of indebted households, Gamburd provides an interesting counter view. She suggests that assets accumulated through migration are spread through kin networks: "In close-knit kin community, relatives claimed mutual access to assets, and family obligations operated to level out differences in material and economic well-being. Those who accumulated significant assets without redistributing their wealth to poorer relatives made choices about which of their kin ties to sustain on their way up the ladder and which to abandon" (ibid: 137). In addition she found that many women who migrated became moneylenders to those wishing to migrate, so that, "With ready cash in short supply in Naeaegama, those with financial assets rarely banked the; instead, money circulated rapidly from those who had to those in need, returning more slowly, with interest" (ibid: 81).

On the other issues of economic and social status and the slow process of change, Gamburd suggests that it takes time for those who are poor to improve their position through migration, "Poor families needed a number of years to get out of debt and save enough to buy land and build a house" (ibid: 242). Assets accumulated through migration offered families opportunities to improve their economic position but also to break out of the rigid social hierarchy of caste. Many lower caste families from the village studied chose to purchase land and build houses away from the home village, in areas with greater concentrations of lower caste households. Gamburd describes a process that could be seen either as the displacement of lower caste households by upper castes or as lower castes having the opportunity to choose to escape domination. The end result is a movement towards single-caste villages, which also has the effect of accentuating caste differences (ibid: 170-2).

Finally, Gamburd identifies the start of major shifts in attitudes towards work and gender roles: "Taking domestic work out of the domestic economy has sent a series of shock waves through village social hierarchies, giving migrant women leverage to bring about transformations in gender relations. This leverage stems not so much from changes in what work women *do* as from changes in what work *means*, which is associated with shifts in women's employers, work places and earnings" (ibid: 124).

Conclusions

At a country level, migration over the last twenty years appears to have made some contribution to development. India and Pakistan benefited considerably from migration to the Gulf states in the 1980s. India has seen a resurgence in the importance of migration, whereas for Pakistan migration has declined in importance. For Bangladesh, Nepal and Sri Lanka international migration has grown in importance since the 1990s and looks set to become even more important. Seen in national terms, however, the contribution of international migration has been relatively small

An important point, made by Addleton, is that resources from migration have tended to go directly to the rural areas where most migrants come from. In some cases there have been an increases in inequality with migrant households investing in land, thus skewing land-holding patterns. However, overall, at a state/province/district level, migration has increased income and consumption levels, primarily for those participating in migration but also in more general terms. In areas of migration wage rates have increased providing opportunities for those who have not migrated and attracting workers in from other areas. Migration has also contributed to the development of more complex and diversified local economies, with greater integration into the wider economy.

At the local level, migration is an important part of rural livelihood strategies in many areas of South Asia. For those households involved in migration there have been improvements in their economic status and quality of life. Resources are often spread more widely through kin networks, either through gifts and assistance or through help to other households to migrate. There is evidence that migration has led to status improvements for poorer and marginalised groups, particularly Muslims.

Migration and Poverty

To understand the linkages between migration and poverty, it is necessary to take a much broader perspective than up to now, looking only at international migration. In order to do this a comparison is made between the studies on international migration discussed above and a number of studies of internal and regional migration discussed in Section One. The tables for comparison are on the following pages.

The comparison between the two sets of studies shows that there is a distinction between:

Survival and sub-survival migration - generally migration of the very poorest, who tend to be the least mobile; that is due to their lack of resources or entitlements, such as money, food, networks and contacts, the poorest are unable to take advantage of the opportunities that some forms of migration can offer. The impacts of such migration are limited to the households taking part and prevent only further decline.

Migration as a medium to long-term livelihood strategy - migration with the potential to improve current household living conditions and to bring improvements to the next generation through investment of savings in health care and education. Participation in such migration is variable. The benefits of migration tend to be much more widespread and general.

Studies of both international and internal migration suggest that migrants come from situations where there is a lack of development which benefits the poor, and where there are often few options to develop viable livelihood strategies. For example Faraizi (1993) looking at Bangladesh, argues that increases in landlessness due to the lack of land reform and limited industrial development in the urban sector, has meant that there few opportunities, other than seasonal migration in rural areas. Lefebvre (1999) similarly argues that the lack of serious land reform in Pakistan and industrial development which has encouraged low-wage labour in the country and has limited the opportunities for rural households. As a result many households in rural areas of Punjab have become involved in international migration (Lefebvre 1999: 176). Poor governance can also be a factor which limits the opportunities for poor people. Mahmood (1998) has pointed out that corruption in the process of obtaining travel documents in Bangladesh can force the poorest to migrate in the worst circumstances, as illegal migrants to neighbouring countries or in the hands of traffickers (see also Samaddar 1999).

There is a need for further research which looks at both international and internal migration in South Asia and which takes a much broader perspective on policy, looking at issues such as land reform and resource rights, language and ethnicity, economic development and labour markets, and so on. There is a need to consider the ways in which policy is implemented and the impact of these policies on household livelihood strategies.

In terms of the impacts of migration it can be concluded that: migration generally seems to have a positive impact on the households involved and; migration has the potential to contribute to poverty reduction, with widespread and generally beneficial impacts.

Migration, even for the poorest can help to prevent further declines in households and the loss of assets such as land (Breman 1985; Mosse et al 1998; Mortuza 1992). In the best circumstances migration can contribute to substantial improvements in the quality of life of households taking part (Garder 1995; Lefebvre 1999; Naveed-i-Rahat 1990; Osella and Osella 2000; Watkins 2001). Where migrants are able to send or bring back substantial resources the benefits can be spread widely. In many cases resources are shared through kin networks and even increased consumption by migrant households can help to stimulate local economies (Gamburd 2000; Seddon et al 2000). Migrants' investments in construction of new homes and the development of small businesses also has a beneficial affect for the community as a whole, providing wage labour opportunities, new jobs and helping to develop a more vibrant local economy (Ballard 1983, 2001; Seddon et al 2000). A number of studies also suggest that migration has the effect of increasing local diversification and of developing linkages to the wider economy (Naveed-i-Rahat 1990; Addleton 1992; Seddon et al 2000).

Migration can, then, contribute to development and to poverty reduction. Further work is needed to look in more detail at circumstances where migration, of any type, contributes substantially to development, as well as understanding situations where migration increases inequalities.

International Migration

	Participation	Impacts
Bangladesh	Gardner (1995) - Better off families, those already involved in migration able to participate Islam (1995) - Existing migrant areas participate in new migration	- Evidence of inflation of land prices and of resources being concentrated in the hands of migrant families - Evidence of increased inequalities and also of general improvements
India	Ballard (1983) - Those already involved in migration participate in new migration Hansen (2001a) - Poor communities of Muslims from Mumbai Osella and Osella (2000) - Better off participated initially, poorer able to participate more recently	- General improvements to the local economy - Migrants from poorer states able to find escape route - Evidence of limited social mobility for poorer groups
Nepal	Seddon et al (2000) - Many migrants come from poorer hill regions	- General improvements to communications and the economy in migration areas
Pakistan	Ballard (1983, 2001) - Poor rural area with existing migration Lefebvre (1999) - More migration from village with rainfed agriculture Naveed-i-Rahat (1990) - Area of existing migration to urban areas Watkins (2001) - Poor area of NWFP with widespread participation Addleton (1992) - Mixture of poorer and better off districts	- General improvements in the local economy - Migration seen as solution to local economic problems - Evidence of rural diversification and improved linkages to urban areas - General improvements in quality of life of households - Significant resources going directly to poor rural households
Sri Lanka	Eelens et al (1992) - Districts nearest to Colombo Gamburd (2000) - poorer households, with a high proportion of Muslims	- High levels of indebtedness. Improvements in economic status of migrating households - Improvements in quality of life for poor households. Resources spread through kin networks
General Points	Participation in migration is varied, with existing migrants, those who are better off and poorer households able to take advantage of specific opportunities, such as demand for Muslim housemaids	Some evidence that migration increases inequalities with land price inflation and landholding concentrated with migrants. Generally evidence shows that benefits are widely spread, through kin networks and through growth in the local economy

Internal and Regional Migration

	Participation	Impacts
Bangladesh	Samaddar (1999) - Regular movements of poorer groups for seasonal labour, cross-border migration as a survival strategy Mortuza (1992) - Impoverished rural households moving to urban areas as a survival strategy Faraizi (1993) - Landless wage labourers involved in seasonal migration and urban migration	- Migration part of a survival strategy for the poorest rural households - Improvements in household circumstances, access to services - Continued migration as part of livelihood
India	Breman (1985, 1996) - impoverished tribals and landless labourers, poorest have most limited mobility Rogaly et al (2001) Muslims, tribals and poorer groups from poorest areas Mosse et al (1998) - poorest tribals involved in seasonal migration	- Migration prevents further loss of assets and decline - Access to better wages than in home areas, unable to access services - Migrants avoid further dependency and bondage, although unable to work out of debt
Nepal	Seddon and Subedi (2000) - Poorest are the least mobile, tied to local labour arrangements. Poorer and more marginal groups have limited mobility and tend to migrate within Nepal	- Heavy reliance of households on remittances from within Nepal from both rural and urban areas
Pakistan	Selier (1988) - Impoverished rural households from mountain areas of NWFP and Punjab	- Circular migration part of livelihood strategy of rural households
Sri Lanka	Spencer (2001) - Poorer groups lacking land involved in rural-rural migration to find new land. Widespread internal displacement due to conflict. Poorest in Sri Lanka are the landless and those without source of livelihood	- Continued displacement and insecurity
General Points	Poorest and most marginal are the least mobile, tend to move in the worst circumstances and are tied to the poorest opportunities	Benefits of internal and regional migration are limited to the households involved. Generally households are continually involved in migration in order to prevent further decline

Globalisation from Below

While receiving states seek to control immigration, a number of writers have recorded a tendency for the process to become more informal over time. Longva (1997) has described how the immigration control has been delegated to ordinary Kuwaiti citizens, with the system relying on an individual relationships between Kuwaiti sponsors and foreign migrants (described in more detail below). Gamburd (2000) has examined the process by which the early migrants to the Gulf states built up their own relationships with sponsors in order to obtain jobs and visas for family and friends back home. As women became more familiar with the process of migration they have used personal networks to find cheaper and more reliable employment (Gamburd 2000: 70-3). Other recent analyses (Shah 1998b; Gunatilleke 1998b), show the importance of social networks to migrants in finding better and more secure jobs.

Migration can have a disruptive effect on states in South Asia, such as those described by Addleton (1992) and Samaddar (1999). Addleton has argued that Gulf migration from Pakistan, "dramatically altered the character of development in Pakistan and contributed to fundamental changes in the country's economy and society" (Addleton 1992: 3). As was discussed above, remittances had a major impact on Pakistan's economy, but perhaps more important, was the effect on households and local economies, with resources directly in the hands of rural people. A great deal remains to be written about the cultural and political effects of the long-term linkages between Pakistan and migrant destinations, such as Saudi Arabia. In a similar vein, Samaddar has written about the destabilising effects on state authority in South Asia of cross-border migration. He argues that for the migrant "moving to another place is not just an economic choice, but also a political one" (Samaddar 1999: 45) and that "The immigrant's flight is his/her form of resistance" (ibid: 150).

There has been growing interest in established groups of international migrants, or transnational communities, that is international social networks involved in labour, business, political movements and cultural flows (see for example the ESRC funded Transnational Communities Programme at the University of Oxford). Much of the research takes an "actor-directed view of globalisation", described as being a view of globalisation from below. Portes sets out to provide a counter view of globalisation, where "what people have done in response to the process of globalisation is to create communities that sit astride political borders" (Portes 1997: 3). As he points out, in contrast to the accepted view, "immigrants come to the wealthier nations less because they want to than because they are needed" (ibid: 5). Migrants, then, respond to demand and, in turn, establish social networks, both to enable others to take advantage of the opportunities available and to maintain important social, cultural, political and economic links.

A number of papers from the Transnational Communities Programme have drawn out various aspects of the importance and influence of transnational communities. both look In an increasing number of cases internationally migrants are lobbied by their sending countries for economic and political support (Østergaard-Nielsen 2001: 9; Kennedy and Roudometof 2001: 7-8). It has been argued that participation by those outside of their

home communities can benefit democratic processes at home, though Østergaard-Nielsen sounds a note of caution that this influence is difficult to 'measure' (Østergaard-Nielsen 2001: 18). Kennedy and Roudometof argue that the formation of new transnational communities or the participation in established ones is empowering for individuals and groups, such as second, third or fourth generation migrants or disadvantaged tribal or ethnic groups (Kennedy and Roudometof 2001: 25, 29). Further, they point to the potential for such communities to "shape nation-states and local economies as well as global political, social and economic life (ibid: 30).

There are different ways in which these transnational communities operate. For example, Ballard has recently described the ways in which kinship is used by different groups to gain access to migration opportunities through transnational networks (Ballard 2001b). He describes kinship networks as an 'entrepreneurial resource' (ibid: 8-9), as a means whereby people can "disentangle themselves from the marginalised positions out on the periphery in which they have hitherto been confined, and.... tap into the much richer spectrum of opportunities available in some sectors of the metropolitan core (ibid: 2). Ballard contrasts the ways in which networks have been developed by different communities from South Asia. Punjabi families from Jullundur in the Indian Punjab have, through the development of strategic marriages, been able to develop global networks, giving access to employment markets in Hong Kong, Singapore and North America (ibid: 35-6). Mirpuri from Pakistan families have continued to develop and maintain close linkages between the original homeland in Pakistan and newer communities in the UK, with around 10,000 spouses per year coming to the UK (ibid: 41).

Hansen has recently been engaged in research on the Indian community in South Africa (Hansen 2001b, 2001c). He has looked at the various attempts made by the community, in the post-Apartheid period to re-establish links with India and with the Indian diaspora. In the first case (Hansen 2001b) he describes what he calls 'roots tourism', the search for an ancestral village and family members or a more general search for spiritual roots, and the difficulties that many have on adjusting to the realities of present day India. In the second case (Hansen 2001c) he examines the development links with the Indian diaspora, through organisations such as the Hindu nationalist VHP and the more business oriented Global Organization of People of Indian Origin, GOPIO. GOPIO has been very successful in lobbying the Government of India to recognise the importance of the diaspora (ibid: 25). In particular, in response to this lobbying, the Indian government began to issue PIO cards in early 1999, giving holders "almost quasi-citizenship rights in India - multiple entry for 10 years, rights to do business, transfer foreign currency, own land and property" (ibid: 26).

Evidence from research such as this shows the ongoing importance of kin networks to many groups involved in international migration. Family and kin networks are important resources to those who to migrate and to those involved in migration. Far from destroying or weakening such relationships, many migrants invest in and strengthen these vital links, converting resources into social capital. In addition, the current forms of temporary migration encourage migrants to develop and maintain such linkages. The experiences of other countries with major populations of migrants, such as the Philippines and Mexico,

have shown that migrants can be an important resource economically, as well as politically, socially and culturally. This is an area that should be explored more fully for South Asia.

Conclusions and Recommendations

In response to the original hypothesis:

Migration can result in increased inequalities between sending and non-sending households, such as the concentration of land in the hands of migrant households, inflation in land values and increased landlessness for non-migrant households.

Migration has a generally positive impact on the households directly involved. Even for the poorest households involved in survival migration, there is evidence to suggest that it can prevent a further loss of assets and can result in improvements in quality of life.

Generally most research has reported positive impacts on local economies as a result of migration, including demand for labour, increased wage levels locally, increased levels of consumption and demand for services, investments in local industries and improvements in linkages.

In addition:

Specific sending areas are often a matter of demand and historical chance. However, once migration flows are established they tend to result in long-term linkages of various sorts between sending and receiving areas. This is an area with considerable potential for development and should be explored further.

Given the scale and importance of international migration, there is a need for a more detailed assessment of the impacts at a range of levels. The evidence available at present is both mixed in focus and reliability and patchy in terms of coverage. It would be particularly valuable to carry out assessments along the lines of Addleton (1992) on Pakistan, and Seddon et al (2000) and Seddon and Subedi (2000) on Nepal. Such assessments would: look at data from a country, district/province and local level together; would need to consider policy and statistical data alongside local-level studies, and; would potentially require further survey work and field studies to fill in gaps where information does not currently exist. These assessments would be useful for updating the work on Pakistan and for developing a similar picture for Bangladesh and Sri Lanka. A similar exercise for India would have to focus at a state level and so would have to be preceded by a more detailed assessment of the main areas of migration for the country as a whole.

It is often the poorest households which have the most limited choices in deciding to migrate. At the same time, migration can provide opportunities for long-term improvements in household quality of life. To better understand the linkages between migration and poverty, there is a need, then, to widen the scope of research to look at a wider range of policies, on language, economic development, agriculture, etc, and to consider the ways in which policies are implemented and their impact on household livelihood strategies.