

# Institutional Evaluation of Caribbean MPAs

## BACKGROUND

This project brief is to inform MPA practitioners, national & regional agencies, NGOs & researchers about work conducted during the project *Institutional evaluation of Caribbean Marine Protected Areas & opportunities for pro-poor management*. This 29 month research project is funded through DFID's NRSP LWI programme and ends in August 2003. It is managed by 2 organisations: MRAG Ltd, UK and UWI NRM Programme, Barbados. Additional partners are CANARI in Trinidad & Tobago. We are also working with the staff at 4 case study MPAs: Princess Alexandra Land & Sea National Park,

Turks & Caicos; Negril Marine Park, Jamaica; Hol Chan Marine Reserve & Glover's Reef Marine Reserve, Belize.

Please contact us for more information about anything mentioned in this brief. Most project outputs are described & posted on our website ([www.mragltd.com](http://www.mragltd.com): select Land Water Interface on left column, select project examples, scroll to R7976 *Institutional arrangements for Caribbean MPAs and opportunities for pro-poor management* and select desired output).

January 2003

Brief # 3

## KEY DATES

- Workshop at 55th GCFI in Nov-02
- Formation of Working Group for Guidelines production in Jan-03
- Production of report on impact of MPAs on poorer communities in Feb-03
- Development of Guidelines in Feb-Jul-03
- Publication of guidelines in August-03
- Next project brief due August-03

## Key project activities:

This table sets out the key activity areas for the project. Reports may be authored by CANARI, UWI or MRAG. To update you on progress, we have summarised some of the recent & current activities on the next page.

Project Activity Areas	Outputs	Status of Report
1. Characterisation of 75 MPAs in Central and Antillean eco-regions of Caribbean (social, institutional & biophysical)	1. Characterisation review (CANARI Technical Report) 2. Project brief 2 3. MPA database on characterisation dataset	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Report complete</li> <li>• Brief complete</li> <li>• Database complete</li> </ul>
2. Understanding of enabling/constraining processes for MPA implementation: institutional surveys at 4 MPAs	4. 2 MSc Theses (UWI Cave Hill) on national policy & legislation at 10 MPAs 5. Legal & policy review for MPAs in the Caribbean, with focus on 11 MPAs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 Theses complete</li> <li>• Draft report complete</li> </ul>
3. Understanding of impacts of MPAs on poor people's livelihoods and the structures/processes that lead to beneficial or harmful outcomes	6. 2 MSc Theses (UWI Cave Hill) on ecological impacts of 4 MPAs 7. 2 MSc Theses (UWI Cave Hill) on socio-economic impacts of 4 MPAs 8. Participatory Appraisals (MRAG) on the impacts of 4 MPAs on poorer communities 9. Presentation: ISRS, Cambridge, Sept-02 10. Presentation: GCFI, Nov-02 (summary of MSc student findings at 2 MPAs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 Theses complete</li> <li>• 1 Thesis complete</li> <li>• 1 under preparation</li> <li>• Case studies complete, Report under preparation</li> <li>• ISRS Abstracts</li> <li>• Paper (Francis <i>et al.</i>) in 55th GCFI Proceedings</li> </ul>
4. Develop methodology and Guidelines concerning how MPA management can improve benefits to livelihoods of poorer communities.	11. Presentations for MPA stakeholders 12. MRAG, UWI, CANARI & CCA Workshop at 55th GCFI meeting, Nov-02 13. Guidelines for improving benefits of MPAs to poorer communities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentations at 3 MPAs</li> <li>• Workshop Report; 55th GCFI Proceedings</li> <li>• Ongoing Working Group development</li> </ul>

## LEGAL & POLICY ARRANGEMENTS FOR MPAs

A legal & policy review was conducted by Winston Anderson (Faculty of Law, UWI), using results from MSc Theses by Richards (2002) & Best (2002). A brief summary follows:

- 3 legal typologies were identified: traditional resource conservation laws, *ad hoc* legislation relating to the creation & operation of specific MPAs, & generic regulations providing a framework for the designa-

tion of such areas whilst injecting some degree of flexibility into the management arrangements applicable to specific MPAs. Whilst the latter may be a preferred regulatory regime, it is neither sufficient, nor necessary, for achieving operational management of an MPA.

- Other factors contributing to operational management were found to include development of systems to

implement specific international obligations, rationalization & clarification of governance structures, the articulation & effective operation of area-specific policies to guide administrative action in respect of all activities impacting the protected area, availability & effective deployment of human & material resources, & meaningful community participation.

## OPPORTUNITIES/CONSTRAINTS FOR PRO-POOR MPA MANAGEMENT

Based on participatory appraisal fieldwork at 4 MPAs, a study by Garaway & Esteban (2002) investigated the impacts on poorer "communities".

- Where it exists, poverty was identified as a factor that, at the very least, exacerbated management performance & therefore, in these cases, the issue of poverty should be relevant to MPA managers.

- 5 specific areas were identified as providing opportunities to address needs of poorer user groups, thereby improving management performance & ultimately the natural resource base itself: empowering poorer communities (leading ultimately to co-management); providing new alternatives/improving access to existing ones (in particular tourism); improving fishery related livelihoods; &

improving the natural environment (recreation, health & safety).

- Results suggested that, whilst there were many successful initiatives from which lessons could be learned, there was still a lot to do to address the needs of poorer groups, & improvements needed to be made in all areas & relationships that contribute to management of MPAs.

## MPA WORKSHOP AT 55th GCFI IN XEL HA, MEXICO

A 1-day workshop on institutional arrangements for Caribbean MPAs was hosted by MRAG, UWI, CANARI and CCA at the 55<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Gulf & Caribbean Fisheries Institute.

The workshop objectives were to disseminate research findings from the case study MPAs; to verify that the research findings (in terms of what would enable "pro-poor" management of MPAs) were as complete & rele-

vant as possible (sharing experience, checking issues raised by research were relevant to the wider Caribbean); & to identify/verify that the means of dissemination and type of Guidelines are relevant & accessible.

The workshop focussed on the research activities that were seen to be particularly relevant to identifying institutional opportunities for pro-poor MPA management.

Working groups focussed on identifying pro-poor opportunities through co-management & community empowerment; Integrated Coastal Zone Management & legal/policy arrangements for MPAs; funding options; providing alternatives & improving existing ones; & fisher livelihoods.

The session on Guidelines recommended that collaborative development takes place.

## WHAT NEXT?

An electronic Working Group has been established as a forum for collaborative development of the Guide-

lines. Stages of development include design (structure & format); review of an annotated Table of Contents, con-

tributions based on experience, review of final draft. The final Guidelines are due for completion in August 2003.

## CONTACT DETAILS

Dr Caroline Garaway, Nicole Esteban  
MRAG Ltd, 47 Prince's Gate,  
London, SW7 2QA, England  
Phone: +44 (0) 207 594 9888  
Fax: +44 (0) 207 823 7916  
Email: n.esteban@imperial.ac.uk

Professor Wayne Hunte, Dr Hazel Oxenford, Dr Winston Anderson  
Natural Resource Management Programme, University of the West  
Indies, Cave Hill Campus, Barbados  
Phone: +1 246 417 4571  
Fax: +1 246 424 4204  
Email: hoxenford@uwichill.edu.bb

*This document is an output from a project (R7976) funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) for the benefit of developing countries. The views expressed are not necessarily those of DFID.*