



**TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN**

Strives to make Pakistan a better country to live in

**PAKISTAN  
PRE-PROJECT ASSESSMENT REPORT**

(DfID Engineering KaR I2-16)

**ENDING MARCH 31, 2004**

**PRO POOR PROGRAM**

**“To Improve the Transparency, Quality, and Effectiveness  
of the delivery of Water Supply and Sewerage  
to the Citizens of Gulshan Town  
by the use of ICT’s**

**65 – C NATIONAL HIGHWAY  
Phase II Defence Housing Authority  
Karachi**

---

## CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1. Background.....	1
2. Project Justification .....	1
3. Objectives.....	2
4. The Bottom up Approach.....	3
5. Selection of the Sector.....	4
6. Selection of the Site .....	4
<b>APPROACH TO THE PROGRAM .....</b>	<b>6</b>
1. Area of research .....	6
2. Beneficiaries.....	6
3. Participants .....	7
4. Interface between various Stakeholders .....	7
<b>THE ICT MODEL .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>ICT &amp; ACCESS TO INFORMATION.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>PRESENT STATUS .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>THE PRIVATE SECTOR .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>APPENDIX # 1 .....</b>	<b>14</b>
FEBRUARY 06, 2004 .....	14
A. Mr.Eduardo Bohórquez, Director, Transparencia Mexicana.....	14
B. Ms. Ana Milovcic, Executive Director, TI Croatia.....	16
C. Mr. Shaukat Omari, Executive Director, TI Pakistan .....	17
D. Mr. Gopakumar Krishnan, Public Affairs Center.....	19
<b>APPENDIX 2 .....</b>	<b>21</b>
FEBRUARY 7 <sup>TH</sup> , 2004.....	21
Discussion of appropriate ICT tools for each country .....	21
CROATIA.....	21
PAKISTAN.....	21
INDIA.....	22
ROLE PLAYING EXERCISE.....	22
FOCUS GROUPS .....	22
FOCUS GROUP- EDUCATION .....	22
CONCLUDING REMARKS .....	23
<b>ANNEXURES .....</b>	<b>24</b>
ANNEXURE A .....	25
ANNEXURE B .....	27
ANNEXURE C .....	28
ANNEXURE D.....	29
Questionnaire.....	29
<b>SURVEY REPORT.....</b>	<b>32</b>
Executive Summary.....	33
Focus Group Report: Lady Councilors.....	35
Focus Group Report: Teachers and Social Workers.....	37
Statistical Analysis .....	40

### 1. Background

In mid 2003, Transparency International Pakistan confirmed its interest to participate in a program initiated by Transparency International Secretariat. Subsequently we were then requested to complete the necessary documentation provided by DfID as a prerequisite to our participation.

Unfortunately Transparency International Secretariat due to Management and logistical limitations decided to withdraw from the project but due to the continued earnestness and insistence of the participating National Chapters, TI-S decided to request DfID for handing over the Management of this project to One World International. Consequently a request for this change of Management was made to DfID. The DfID considering the keenness of the participants and the importance of this program decided to accept this request.

One World International (OWI) was then entrusted by the Department for International Development (DFID) to conduct the KaR programme on "improving quality, effectiveness and transparency of pro-poor public services" through the use of ICTs. The study period is for 18-months, commencing January 2004 ending June 2005.

The Program as per schedule commenced from January 2004, with the decision to hold a preparatory Orientation workshop to be organized by Transparency International Croatia under the supervision of One World International (OWI)

This Workshop was held in Zagreb between February 7-9, 2004 whereby various decisions were made by the Participating national Chapters of TI, including the selection of Sector and Site for the project. Unfortunately Nigeria could not attend this preparatory workshop. Minutes of this workshop are attached in Appendix # 1. The TI-Pakistan's participation is highlighted.

In this workshop Transparency International Pakistan decided to go ahead with the ICT project and chose the Sector for "**improving delivery of Water Supply and Sewerage**" to the poor living in Shanty Towns and Low Income Areas in Gulshan Town Karachi.

Transparency International Pakistan has signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the Gulshan Town Administration, to attempt to provide a Clean and Transparent Government and through this ICT program benefit the Town in its endeavour to provide and improve the transparency, quality and effectiveness of its pro-poor delivery services.

### 2. Project Justification

Despite considerable investment, public services in most developing countries are widely perceived to be facing several operational challenges in the effective delivery of their services. The poor and disadvantaged in developing countries suffer in relation to delivery of public services. Firstly, they lack access to those services due to physical, financial, informational, political and other barriers. Secondly, they lack effective

mechanisms for feeding back their complaints, views and requests in relation to those services. The poor and the disadvantaged are thus particularly vulnerable as they rely completely on the state for accessing critical services like drinking water, health and education. There is no `exit' option available to these users to seek an alternative provider in case of dissatisfaction with the service provided. (Gopakumar K et al 2002)

The present project focuses largely on access to information and the identifying ways to improve the effectiveness of delivery of public services to the poor and vulnerable sections and the opportunities for ICT to strengthen those mechanisms.

It is however, important to recognise that certain applications of ICT may be relevant to particular local circumstances.

This project intends to identify and use the appropriate ICT to disseminate information to service providers and users and provide an appropriate means by which the poor can provide feedback to governments on the service provided.

The project end-users are those poor women and men who do or could make use of services/e-services in those cases selected for the action research component of the project. The ultimate overall intended end-users of the project are those poor women and men who are, or require being, recipients of public services, including e-services.

The public service providers including all those institutions in the chain of delivery to the poor from central ministry to local office level would comprise the target audience for the project. Providers will benefit from a better understanding of the views (both positive and negative) of the poor about the services/e-services that are being provided.

### **3. Objectives**

To identify, design and implement an effective pro-poor ICT led Model program to improve the delivery of Water Supply and Sewerage to Gulshan Town. It is expected that this program will:

- Help the community to overcome the cultural barriers to information and communication
- Enable the community to access locale-specific, demand-driven content through the use of appropriate technologies.
- Help in the development of local applications in a participatory way.
- Reiterate the need to be gender-friendly, inclusive and transparent, even if they find the new ICTs to be a threat to their corrupt practices. and
- Sensitize the Gulshan Town Administration to the information age and to be more responsive and accountable to their citizens.

The poor and disadvantaged are often marginalized and remote from government processes and this project will provide a clear opportunity to feedback to service providers. Since the response of the Gulshan Town has been positive this will reduce the skepticism on the part of the users of government's ability to provide effective services. It will have the important effect of increasing citizen participation and will represent a move towards empowering both the citizens including the poor and the CSOs to hold governments and public services to account.

The project will also encourage increased dialogue between NGO's, government, the private sector and other actors, which could contribute to the development of strategies to tackle poverty in the target areas and could be used as a model for other countries\regions.

#### **4. The Bottom up Approach**

The proposed project focuses largely on access to information and the inadequate state of grievance redress and feedback mechanisms on services to poor women and men and the opportunities for ICT to strengthen those mechanisms.

Certain applications of ICT may be relevant to particular local circumstances. However, the common core of this project will be to combine ICT with the Report Card Methodology and with other participatory techniques such as Focus Group Discussions (FGD's), Individual Interviews etc. The Participatory approach will provide an appropriate forum for the poor to voice their own demands for changes in public service provision by reflecting their own experiences in dealing with government services and the quality of those services. This bottom up approach is in contrast to traditional ICT approaches (and indeed public service provision) which tend to be top down and are unresponsive to user needs. Results of such surveys carried out will be communicated to the Gulshan Town and other relevant government authorities and also publicised. This will provide a powerful tool for empowerment of the poor and for improved quality of public services (Water Supply and Sewerage) to the poor.

In particular the development of the ICT component will be developed with the full participation of local actors including the poor to ensure that the solutions generated are applicable and appropriate to local circumstances and realities. The development of both existing and new information systems is part of this research and the project will aim to study the effectiveness of these systems. An inclusive approach will be adopted and concrete efforts will be made to ensure that women are consulted, as they constitute a significant proportion of those living in poverty.

Whilst external assessors have sometimes evaluated such initiatives, there has been little or no attempt to date to build in ongoing feedback from poor service. Transparency International Pakistan predicts that such continuous and integrated feedback systems will be essential to ensuring that e-services do meet the real needs of the poor.

For the purposes of this project, the term ICT will be used in its broadest sense and encompass a variety of different mediums including the telephone, internet, television, film, Cable TV, FM radio, Press etc.

The project will be an action research project. It will combine a direct action component to build pro-poor public service feedback systems with a reflective analytical quality component to build knowledge about these systems. In addition to its value in delivering concrete project outputs, action research has also been selected for its value to knowledge building and to the mutual development of understanding between stakeholders through activity driven knowledge sharing.

A detailed two-way chain of feedback between the authorities and the Poor will be developed at the early stage of the project, and implemented throughout the study. In addition, the analysis of citizen's feedback on an ongoing basis will be developed

It is intended to produce Pro-Poor Services Improvement Packs and Pro-Poor eServices Improvement Packs. The purpose of each pack will be to give specific guidance to Gulshan Town, other towns and Union Councils, related government agencies and civil society target institutions on how to implement/improve ICT enabled-feedback/grievance redress systems for public services for the poor. A generic pair of packs for use across all developing countries will also be produced. This will provide public sector organisations with increased capacity in this area and has the potential to contribute substantially to poverty alleviation and improved livelihoods.

The project will have positive socio-economic impacts as it has the potential not only enhance access to information on government schemes and welfare programs but also (if the feedback is acted upon) to improve the provision of such services.

## **5. Selection of the Sector**

The Third World is beset by problems galore, most of them with no solutions in sight. A Lack of education and Health Care facilities, Environmental Pollution, Human Rights, Poverty Alleviation, Lack of Access to Information, Child and Woman abuse, Governance, Corruption and above all not providing the very basic life saving commodity to the Poor – Water.

Transparency International Pakistan understanding the importance of combating corruption, this being its cornerstone, and supporting programs for Access to Information again one of the main tools in combating corruption, felt that there was no better way than to take this opportunity provided to it by DFID whereby we could combine the two through this ICT program. That is, to improve the quality, transparency and effectiveness of the delivery by the government to the poor, of one of the most crucial of amenities – Water.

One can write the story of man's growth in terms of his epic concerns with water. The concerns have not been underestimated or exaggerated by man but unfortunately, he continues to abuse this life saving commodity. Water is not only essential to man, but for animals and the plants that are required to feed him. Thus a balance has to be maintained, where water must be made available to satisfy the requirements not only to man, but of animal and plant life. The cycle is one of interdependence. An unbreakable chain, that will always remain so.

## **6. Selection of the Site**

The Site was as easy to select as was that of the sector. Transparency International Pakistan has been working very closely with the Administration of Gulshan Town Karachi for nearly a year in a program to establish a Clean and Transparent Government – “An Island of Integrity” within a corrupt system. (See Annexure A)

The Administration has not only been very cooperative, but has gone out of its way to maintain its original commitment to support the above program with all its Financial and Human resources available to it. Thus with the support already existing, we felt that this ICT program to be implemented in Gulshan Town will be ideal under the circumstances. In addition we felt that with an environment of cooperation such as we have, the potential for success is far greater than if we had to approach an unfamiliar authority. We

envisage that not only will the program be implemented but that it would to a great extent be a sustainable one. This sustainability, we feel is a basic requirement for any program.

### 1. Area of research

Gulshan Town with a population of about 663,000 is centrally located among the 18 towns comprising Karachi City. It consists of 13 Union Councils and within its boundaries and on the peripheries there exists in relation to the rest of the town a very high density of Shanty Towns and Lower Income Communities which is about 60% of the total population. Gulshan Town itself is well planned and has the basic infrastructure with regards to the Water Supply Distribution, but unfortunately the shortage and intermittent supply of clean potable water and the collection of Sewage to and from the Shanty Towns and Lower Income Communities leaves much to be desired.

The problems in addition to the shortage of water is the management itself, this includes tampering of valves, illegal water connections, excessive leakages in the outdated water distribution lines, penetration of the water lines by roots from trees, the faecal contamination of the water supplied and above all the political intervention and favouritism in giving connections impacts heavily on the quality and effectiveness of the delivery of water to the residents.

The Project site or Union Councils selected for our ICT program is Union Council Number One and Seven (UC # 1 and 7) where a greater majority of the population live in Shanty Towns and Low Income neighbourhoods. (See Annexure B and B-i))

### 2. Beneficiaries

**The Citizens:** The ultimate overall intended end-users and recipients who will benefit from this program are those poor women and men of Gulshan Town who do and will make use of improvement in the delivery of services/e-services in this case Water Supply and sewerage selected for the action research component of the project.

**Civil Society Organizations:** Those civil society organisations that seek to represent the needs and views of the poor. These organisations will benefit through use/demonstration/knowledge of improved feedback/grievance redress systems. It is through these organisations specifically that the poor are to be reached via this project's dissemination strategy.

**The Elected Representatives:** One of the main beneficiaries to this program will be the elected representatives of the newly instituted devolution program whereby in August 2001 the Government of Pakistan decided to hand over the reins of government through devolution of government to the elected representatives of the people. That the people were for the first time to be masters of their own destiny.

The Elected representatives through this ICT program would now be aware of the priorities of citizens who elected them. They would no longer go under the assumption



that they knew what was good for the citizens within their constituencies but what the people within their constituencies really wanted. The feedback from the Survey, the Focus Group Discussions, the individual interviews and the Computerized Complaint centres established would keep them well informed. The Grievances when defined and looked into will bring the elected representatives closer to the citizens. It would help them respond more positively to their grievances and with certain knowledge of the requirements of the people.

**The Government Authorities:** The Public Service Providers including all those institutions in the chain of delivery to the poor, from the Karachi Water and Sewerage Board through the Union Councils, Gulshan Town, the City District Government to the Provincial Ministry for Local Government will benefit from a better understanding of the views (both positive and negative) of the poor and about the quality, transparency and effectiveness of services/e-services that are being provided.

It is expected that in addition to the direct benefit to the poor of Gulshan Town and to its administration, the Karachi Water and Sewerage Board the Public Service Provider will substantially benefit, in that it will help the Board improve its services to other Towns of Karachi City.

The Provincial Government of Sindh of which Karachi is just one city will be able to replicate this program in other Cities and Towns of the province. There is a great possibility that if success can be achieved this program can also be extended and replicated by the three other provinces of Pakistan. Becoming aware of this program, we have already been approached by the Provincial government of the NWFP to make a presentation on the scope and benefits of this ICT program.

### **3. Participants**

In anticipation that the ICT program will not only be totally implemented by the Gulshan Town authorities, but that it will be a successful and sustainable program, Transparency International Pakistan has taken a participatory approach in the involvement of the stakeholders within Gulshan Town – i.e. its residents. We have selected for the Focus Group Discussions (FGD's) citizens from the community who represent different and varied disciplines. We hope to take the support of these FGD members whom we have called upon not only to understand the problems being faced by the them but hope that these same members will continue with the program as monitors for its continued implementation and ultimate success through sustainability. The members of the Focus Group Discussions include:

- The present elected Union and Town Council members (Men and Women -See Annexure B)
- The Women citizens residing in the project area
- Technocrats – Engineers, Doctors, Teachers and lawyers.
- Representatives from Civil Society and Welfare Associations.
- The representatives of Union Council 1 & 7.

### **4. Interface between various Stakeholders**

It is hard to describe the interface between the beneficiaries especially those living in Shanty Towns and Lower Income Communities and the authorities i.e. the Karachi Water & Sewerage Board which is basically a Public Agency. Public Officials as in other

countries are supposed to be Public Servants, unfortunately this is not the case in a third world country such as Pakistan. And even though their salaries are paid by tax payers, the attitude is one of condescendence. It may be the right of the citizens to get good and adequate services, but most public servants do not feel this way. It is more as a means of getting rich at the expense of the citizens.

Thus illegal water connections are rampant, proper supply is at a cost. Much needed water is diverted as per the capacity of the briber. The Lineman / Valve operator is king of all the distribution network under him. He has given himself discretionary powers with regards to the control of Valves in his jurisdiction far beyond the allowable. His fairness in evenly distributing the water is commensurate with the payment of speed money greasing his palms. Official recoveries of water and sewerage tax is abysmally low. With such existing conditions it is difficult to put claim to any sort of interface between the beneficiaries and the authorities.

Fortunately, following the Local Government Elections of August 2001 the situation is changing. The elected representatives are more responsive to the need of the people, and the ready acceptance of this ICT program is proof of the cooperation of the local elected representatives to improve conditions within their constituencies. Interviews were also carried out with the representative of the Karachi Water & sewerage Board, who was not only very cooperative in giving us an interview but at the same time gave us all the information on the Gulshan Town that was available with him. (See Annexure C)

The ICT program envisaged by Transparency International Pakistan to improve the service delivery of Water and Sewerage facilities to the residents of the Shanty Towns and Lower Income Communities of Gulshan Town, shall include not only a means by which the Citizens can approach the authorities but that the authorities will be able to communicate with the citizens and in turn solve their grievances. It is anticipated that the ICT program will help bring all the stakeholders closer. It is also envisaged that the program will bring pressure on the authorities to perform more efficiently and help them put their act together towards a better management of the utilities. To do this we shall try to provide the following facilities within the project area and shall include among other things:

- Establishing an efficient Computerized Complaint Center.
- Setting up a Website towards an OPEN system of government to reduce the possibility of Corruption.
- Organizing Regular “Meet the Citizens” Public Meetings where the authorities will meet the Public to hear their grievances and where the authorities can discuss future development programs.
- Contacting TV Cable Operators to cooperate with the authorities as a means of communicating with the Citizens in informing them of the closure and / or change in timings of the distribution and delivery of water.
- Put forward a proposal to the authorities to establish a local FM radio Station as a means of communicating with the Citizens with regards to problems of closure and /or change in timings in the distribution of and delivery of water
- The authorities to Print and Distribute Flyers and Pamphlets informing citizens of various activities.
- Arrange to set up small committees within each community to check inefficiency and mismanagement of the Water and Sewage collection and distribution.

## ICT & ACCESS TO INFORMATION

The total ICT program is envisaged as incorporating most of the following. The idea is to incorporate only those with a chance of successful implementation and sustainability. The ICT model will probably include:

- **Access to Information.**
  - E-Government - Computerized Complaint Centres.
  - Internet accessibility for local information
  - Public Information Counters
  - OPEN system of government.
  - V – Government – Voice Accessibility to Complaints /Grievance
  - Public Forums / Hearings / Meetings
  - Public Notices in Town and Council Offices.
  - Cyber Cafes for access to Complaint Centers
  
- **Dissemination of Information.**
  - Press Media
  - Electronic Media – Radio & Television networks
  - Local FM Radio Station
  - Through Local Cable Networks - scrolling messages
  - Town Website (dual languages) for Information / complaints
  - Mobile Infotainment Units
  - Printed Material – Programs, Application Forms /procedures /Information

To carry out the above program the following has been accomplished to date:

- Met with the Gulshan Town authorities for their cooperation and approval to the ICT program.
- Carried out presentations to the Mayors and Members of the Towns and Union Councils appraising them of the extent and benefits of the program. (Power Point Presentation See annexure D)
- Met the relevant representative of the Water & Sewerage Authority for data collection.(See Annexure C)
- Appointed Consultants to carry out a survey of the satisfaction / dissatisfaction and need assessment of the Citizens of the selected Project Area.
- Prepared a Questionnaire with the assistance of the Consultant to carry out the above survey. (See Survey Report Annexure E.)
- Carried out the survey as dictated by the Questionnaire. (Report attached See attached Survey report.)
- Carried out Focus Group Discussions. (See attached report.- interviews)
- Discussed the possibilities with the Gulshan Town authorities to set up a FM Radio Station.
- We have prepared an outline of the Computerized Complaint Center as part of the total ICT program and made a power point presentation to the authorities which explains the scope and extent of the Complaint center.
- We have also initiated the preparation of a software program for this Complaint center incorporating within it a networking of all the complaint departments of the authorities. This would be in line with the OPEN system of government. This Computer center will cater not only to the grievances / complaints of the Citizens but with the establishment of a dedicated website for registering complaints will serve the community as a means of communicating with the authorities and provide the necessary feed back to improve the delivery of Water and Sewage to the Community. It is designed as a Pro-poor program, serving the community in general but at the same time allowing for the poor to be heard. (See Power Point Presentation - Annexure F)

**Note:**

- We would like to mention here, that it was decided with the recommendation of the Consultant that along with the survey of the satisfaction / dissatisfaction with regards to Water and Sewage, we would also enquire into three other public service deliveries viz. Telephone. Gas and Electricity, as this would then give us a basis for comparison with other utilities with regards to improving the delivery of Water & sewerage relative to other utilities.

## IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING

It is envisaged that special committees will be established, the members of which will be from amongst those who attended the Focus group discussions, from citizens who responded positively to this in the questionnaire.

## THE PRIVATE SECTOR

We shall approach the private Sector especially the Multinational Companies to support the program by:

- Setting up of complaint centres.
- Financing schemes for improvement of existing facilities.
- Providing Hardware for the Computerized Complaint centers.
- Supporting the maintenance of Complaint centers.

**MINUTES FROM THE WORKSHOP  
Zagreb 5-8 February 2004  
“DFID Pro-poor ICT Research Project”**

**FEBRUARY 06, 2004**

**A. Mr. Eduardo Bohórquez, Director, Transparencia Mexicana**

Presentation of two programs implemented in Mexico:  
CITIZENS MANUAL and NATIONAL SURVEY OF CORRUPTION

**Citizens Manual**

- tool developed in order to increase citizens' complaints, increase general information and to reduce the cost of complaints
- intended to increase social comptrollership in social programs
- prior to introduction of the Manual, there were 35 social programs operating in the country, citizens were overburdened with rules and information
- first task was to reduce the information and translate it into something comprehensible
- negotiation with the government, including 400 SCOs, took place to create access to the same system
- components: access to information, social comptrollership at the local level, website, Citizens' Consulate, coordination of agencies

**Results:**

- revealed that social participation was more intense before implementation of ICT
- people were not ready; they were used to traditional ways of participation, more comfortable with protests.
- simplification of information was appreciated but new ways were not accepted, hence the number of complaints lowered
- people complained about not understanding how the program works
- new stakeholders were discovered; local authorities and Congress
- there was low collaboration between the agencies, balance of power was broken
- CSOs wanted discretion, were not willing to lose their power

**National Corruption and Governance Index**

- measuring corruption in a traditional way
- bribes were used as proxy for corruption



- survey of households to find out whether they had to pay bribes to get a public service
- 38 public services were selected
- 16 000 households were surveyed with national margin error of 1%
- head of household was surveyed whenever possible
- cooperation with National Census Authority who provided them with good sampling both rural and urban

#### Results:

- a total of 2.4 billion \$ worth of bribes
- 10 \$ found to be an average bribe paid by a Mexican household; 7.9% of income of an average household
- information was subsidized to local stakeholders
- all 32 states were mobilized simultaneously and a lot of information was gathered
- competition was created among states in the use of ICT
- key issues in public service delivery were identified
- corruption index eventually decreased by 2%, 11 out of 32 states improved their index
- A market was created with civil society acting as a regulator

#### **Lessons Learned**

- need to focus on ends rather than means
- need to focus on end-users, identify them
- giving results to general public should be considered
- information is more crucial than technology
- new stakeholders should be involved
- opportunity to create/regulate new markets

#### **CONCLUSION**

*"We should ask ourselves how often we use ICT in our daily life?"*

Question: How was the Manual disseminated?

Answer: With the help of 400 organizations - meeting with the President.

Ministry of Social Development has a network of shops; they were notified of the presence of the Manual.

Question: Name 2 to 3 crucial readiness factors that made effort to introduce ICT successful.

Answer: Make local governments compete, make agencies compete, allow a month to see what is going on then meet to review results

Question: Should results be shared with public officials before using ICT? Is it necessary?

Answer:

- demand must not be invented
- necessary to understand what is important, to know what exactly complaints are about

## **B. Ms. Ana Milovcic, Executive Director, TI Croatia**

### Citizen's Anti Corruption Hotline

#### Why this project?

- Increase of citizen's requests for establishment of help service.
- Significant number of citizen's letters of complaints and reports on corruption cases.
- Assessment of Hotline set up by Police Department for Curbing Corruption and White-Collar Crime.
- The fact that was a lot of reference in the media regarding corruption but with no mention of effective ways for preventing or curbing it.
- Missing communication channels between citizens and public officials.
- Inefficient knowledge about legitimate ways for seeking the citizen's rights.
- The misperception of corruption.
- The fear and hesitation citizens show when talking or reporting corruption cases.
- Willingness to establish mechanism that will help unprivileged and poor.

#### Preparatory period

- Preparatory period (two months period) included advertising campaign, organisation on the workshop for volunteers and setting up database.
- Testing period - 7 days.
- Launching of the line.
- Regular press conferences
- Establishing contacts with national institutions

#### Challenges experienced

- Insufficient knowledge of the citizens about what is corruption and what isn't.
- General negative attitude of Croatian citizens who often believe everyone is corrupted – from --the prime minister to the lowest public official.
- Insufficient acquaintance of the citizens with the jurisdiction of country's institutions.
- Lack of trust in this kind of initiative by the citizens, who don't believe any real results can be accomplished this way.

## **C. Mr. Shaukat Omari, Executive Director, TI Pakistan**

### **Background on anti-corruption measures and laws in Pakistan**

- **1860 first Anti-Corruption Act by the British valid until 1999**
- **in 1999, new President, rise in accountability and anti-corruption reforms taking place**
- **National Accountability Bureau was set up to monitor corruption, measures introduced to help the poor**

### **Reforms**

- **Power given back to people; through Devolution of Government and has helped reduce corruption**
- **government was made more accessible, more answerable to citizens**
- **-Citizen Community Boards were set up**
- **Freedom of Information Ordinance**
- **Access to Justice Program introduced to reform the judiciary**
- **Public Procurement Authority- to regulate all procurement in the country**
- **Code of Governance**
- **All Government information became available on websites**
- **Police reforms**
- **National Anti-Corruption Strategy implemented as well as Awareness Program**
- **Money-laundering reforms**

### **TI Initiative**

- **All political parties and the Government signed a pledge of fighting corruption**
- **The Government made a commitment to set up websites to show how money is allocated (big achievement initiated by USAID)**
- **TI challenged IDB to show where funds are spent**

### **TI Pakistan**

#### **Information-giving organization;**

- **working with National Accountability Bureau to develop an anti-corruption initiative**
- **Integrity Pact with Karachi Water and Sewage Board**
- **program with Karachi City Police to help with corrupt departments-finalized recommendations**
- **program with Gulshan Town; Integrity Pact being implemented, open governance**
- **working with education department to introduce corruption awareness in schools**
- **anonymous corruption complaints passed on to Bureau and anti-corruption agencies**
- **carried out corruption survey regarding police corruption, finding that 60 to 70% can be converted to legal sources (ex. higher salaries for policeman)**

## **Gulshan Town Project**

- **Project for setting up clean and transparent government**
- **TI recommended Integrity Pact and Open Governance**
- **Financial and Procurement Departments made all payments time-based**
- **A comprehensive website was set up which started with a Complaints Center with names of people that can be contacted. All forms are available, can be downloaded.**
- **Public notice boards were put up**

**Question: Do you keep track of reports that you pass on?**

**Answer: -no support or cooperation from agencies involved, hence no feedback**

**Question: Do people come to the office physically?**

**Answer:**

- **yes, which creates problems.**
- **problem with people giving names, actual documentation which makes it difficult for TI to pass documents on**

**Problem: -TI has no investigative power**

**Question: Is this an opportunity for Croatia's project since implementation was successful?**

**Answer: Yes, could be adapted.**

#### **D. Mr. Gopakumar Krishnan, Public Affairs Center**

- Indian Government spent 1 billion dollars on IT in 2002
- 20 states in India have an IT Policy
- sectors with most potential; Police, Treasury, Land Records, Irrigation and Justice

##### Major profiles:

- e-administration- creates data repositories, computerization of records
- e-services- online forms etc.
- e-governance- publishing policies and programs
- e-democracy- using IT to facilitate wider participation; online disclosure policy, only grievance redress forums

#### **How enabling are state policies?**

- agriculture and health are neglected
- there are very few local websites, no promotion of local languages
- little attention is placed on the use of IT to help the socially disadvantaged
- e-services are predominant
- there is an overall lack of clarity and vision

#### **Down sides of using IT:**

- equity issue; there are gender divides, literate vs. illiterate (attention must be paid to where kiosks are situated, whether people can pay for access to technology, cultural barriers)
- transparency; issue of eShame- naming most corrupt officers, problem created by people using public shaming via Internet

#### **Problems:**

- 85 % of websites are obsolete
- problem of contesting the State; just because the information is available, it does not mean it can be utilized
- manipulation of information available on the Internet
- selling private information about citizens to commercial firms
- corruption of people operating kiosks

#### **Assumptions:**

- potency to draw upon local resources
- ability to contribute to local economic and social development
- creating replicable model of state and non-state agencies in mutually reinforcing relations

#### **Pitfalls of Expectations:**

- limited local participation
- lack of availability of local resources
- fractured relations with state agencies
- limited integration of local CSOs
- consistent overestimation of expected outcomes and underplaying failures
- another problem present QUANGOs; no grounding in the local context

#### **Key actors:**

- User (citizen), CSOs (intermediary), service provider + higher levels in government
- sustainability of project

- type of information generated
- access and use- it can be accessed but can it be used
- satisfaction with services
- responsiveness of service providers
- cases of bribes; extortionate vs. voluntary

### **STRATEGIES**

- which services/agencies are crucial
- which are accessible
- short-term vs. long-term strategies
- identifying partners
- identifying quick wins
- identifying capacity building and resources requirements

### **PROJECTS BY COUNTRY**

- importance of clarity
- identifying and defining public services
- service-users must be dealt with

#### **India**

- service-users- slum dwellers who need police protection

#### **Croatia**

- health sector
- access to information in hospitals

### **PAKISTAN**

- **Gulshan town**
- **Open governance**
- **delivery of services to the poor- Water and Sewerage**

### **DISCUSSION OF SECTORAL ASSESSMENT**

Points discussed:

1. Availability of existing quantitative data
2. Collecting quantitative and qualitative information/data as a benchmark for assessment in the later phases
3. Exploring the community resources- physical manpower
4. Exploring potential allies/stakeholders/institutional mechanisms
5. Specific aspects on the form and the content of the ICT model- possible options

**FEBRUARY 7<sup>TH</sup>, 2004**

**Discussion of appropriate ICT tools for each country**

### **CROATIA**

- using one experimental hospital
- find out which hospital is most frequently visited by the poor; using information from the Bureau of Statistics
- possibility of using touch screen monitors/information kiosks in hospitals; not feasible financially unless existing kiosks are used
- using volunteers to man machines
- dissemination of information using media; radio, newspaper, leaflets, brochures...
- cooperation with Ministry of Health to create a website with information
- possibility of using a hotline at TI office to provide information; providing information available on hospital website to people calling TI hotline
- creating weekly bulletins to be put up on boards in hospital
- cooperation with Ministry of European Integration: to get information on European standards and to explore possibility of using their information kiosks which are already installed in libraries, universities, etc...

### **PAKISTAN**

- **Water supply & Sewerage in Gulshan town**
- **using templates provided by the town**
- **using tracking sensors**
- **using cable TV networks**
- **FM radio channel- popular**
- **mobile infotainment units (slogan- "Water is Our Right")**

#### **Where**

- **kiosks in community centers, council halls**
- **cable TV (scrolling information during TV programs)**

#### **What it would contain**

- **information on duration, timing, and entitled amount of water, protection from diseases**
- **sample households will provide key service tracking data then put into database**

**Contextual adaptation- Urdu mirror site**

**Resources**

- private sector support for kiosks
- website maintenance

#### **Spin off**

- website information passed on to higher authorities
- tracking sensors
- contracted carriers
- pilot intervention; committees to track water use, control of distribution
- enable community to monitor water distribution system
- advocate to link information from tracking system to payment of services rendered by private contractors

#### **Cable TV/Radio**

- scrolling script at the bottom of TV screen during programs
- TV and VCR to show popular films/songs- key messages beamed between the songs
- pamphlets will be distributed

### **INDIA**

- OWSA- provides facilitator
- working with both service-users and service-providers
- ICT model based on current information providing in slum clusters
- Cable operators- 2-3 minute clips for hospitals to broadcast information
- Loud speakers on cars
- Cooperation with service-providers; convincing them the project would enable them to disseminate information
- Intermediaries; asking software companies to donate equipment
- training youth in slum clusters to operate cars with loudspeakers
- software will show whether there has been an improvement

### **ROLE PLAYING EXERCISE**

#### **FOCUS GROUPS**

- should be 3-10 people, never more
- 3<sup>rd</sup> person effect- people should not be related
- avoiding leading questions
- it is better to use segregated groups
- possibility of using questionnaires with scores on a scale from 1-10
- finding focus groups; local CSOs, support groups, centers...

#### **FOCUS GROUP- EDUCATION**

- group of five female students from various universities  
Common problems that university students experience:
- attitude of professors, university staff towards students; they are unapproachable, often condescending
- students are not informed when rules change, i.e. shifting deadlines for exams



- there are no teacher evaluations, hence no way of controlling professors' work or sanctioning unacceptable/unfair behavior
- there are student associations but they have no real power, ineffective
- students reluctant to complain or fight for their rights- do not believe in favorable results
- fear of retribution in case of complaining, professors may punish individual students for making complaints against them
- insufficient use of technology even though computers are available

### **CONCLUDING REMARKS**

- Successful workshop
- suggestion for improvement: it could have been useful to involve and meet with other CSOs



TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN  
Strives to make Pakistan a better country to live in

**PAKISTAN  
PRE-PROJECT ASSESSMENT REPORT  
(DFID Engineering KaR I2-16)  
ENDING MARCH 31, 2004**

**ANNEXURES**

*Consumers Satisfaction & Need Assessment  
Basic Five Civic Amenities*

**65 – C NATIONAL HIGHWAY  
Phase II Defence housing Authority  
KARACHI**

**MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING  
With GULSHAN TOWN  
for the  
“Implementation of the Integrity Pact & OPEN System”**

An agreement has been reached on December 1, 2001 between Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council and Transparency International - Pakistan to implement the following Programs

- \* “Integrity Pact” for Transparency in Public Procedures
- \* The On-line Procedures Enhancement for Civil Applications System “OPEN System” in Gulshan-e-Iqbal; Town.

**Both parties agree to perform the following services/responsibilities;**

1. Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council agree to implement the Project of “Integrity Pact” including the OPEN System.
2. Transparency International Pakistan agrees to provide all required professional services to Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council at no cost to the Town Council.
3. Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council will provide all the information to the Coordination Committee and also to the Transparency International - Pakistan.
4. Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council agree that Access to Information is the Key element in setting up of the Transparent Procedures and shall be part of the Integrity Pact..
5. Both the parties agree to jointly monitor the implementation of the Integrity Pact with the cooperation of the Civil Society and Professional Associations.
6. The Town Nazim will constitute a Seven Member Coordination Committee for the purpose of implementing the Integrity Pact, comprising of Six (6) representatives from Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council and City Administration, and One (1) representative from Transparency International - Pakistan.
7. The Coordination Committee will be fully authorized to take all decisions.
8. The Town Council agree to implement all decisions taken by the Coordination Committee.

9. The Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council has the responsibility to inform the local public and all interested individuals/institutions/organizations with regards to the decisions taken by the Town Council.

10. In accordance with this agreement, Transparency International Pakistan will provide professional services for 12 months beginning from 1 December 2001

It is also agreed that Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town Council will continue the Integrity Pact even after the completion of this project, and will provide any information whenever Transparency International Pakistan requires for the purpose of replication of this Project.

**Mr. Abdul Wahab,  
Town Nazim, Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town,  
DMC Office,  
Karachi East**

**Syed Adil Gilani,  
Project Director, "Integrity Pact"  
Transparency International,  
Pakistan, Karachi.**

**Date December 21, 2002.**

**Location Gulshan-e-Iqbal Town - Karachi**

**ANNEXURE B**

**GULSHAN-E-IQBAL TOWN**

NAZIM  
NAIB NAZIM  
TOWN MUNICIPAL OFFICER  
OFFICE ADD:  
NO. OF UNION COUNCILS  
NO. OF TOWN COUNCILS  
Project Site

ABDUL WAHAB  
SALEEM AZHAR  
MATANAT ALI KHAN  
DMC OFFICE KARACHI - EAST  
13  
19  
Highlighted below.

Name of Town	S. No	Name of Union Council	AREA	Charge	Circle	Pop as per Census of 1998
GULSHAN E-IQBAL TOWN (Town-S)	1	Delhi Mercantile Society	Dhoraji, Society, Bangolre Town, CP & Berar Society	(E)08	(Full)	46,656
	2	Civic Center	Ghousia Colony, Jail Qts. Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block – 14 & Part of Societies area	(E)6 (E)7	(1 & 2) (Full)	63,491
	3	P.I.B. Colony	P.I.B. Colony, Nafeesabad, Iqbalabad and Aminabad	(E)5	( 1 - 4 )	37,687
	4	Essa Nagri	Essa Nagri, Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block 12	(E)6	( 3 - 8 )	58,276
	5	Gulshan-e-Iqbal – I	Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block – 1,2,&5	(E)10	( 3 – 8 )	41,663
	6	Gellani Railway Station	Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block-8,15 & 16, 13-A,B & C	(E)42 (E)9	(Full) ( 1 - 4 )	57,696
	7	Shanti Nagar	Shanti Nagar, Dalmia, Mujahid Colony, Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block 9 and 19	(E)09	(5 - 9)	43,711
	8	Jamali Coloy	Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block 13, Zia-ul-Haq Colony, Madina, Rahmania and Jamali Colonies	(E)10	(1,2&9-14)	48,577
	9	Gulshan-e-Iqbal – II	Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block-3,4,6&7	(E)11	(1,2,4-7)	42,598
	10	Pahlwan Goth	Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block-II, Gulistan Johar (Part), Pahlwan Goth	(E)43 (E)12	(Full) (1 - 2)	56,271
	11	Metroville Colony	Metroville-III, Railway Society, Gulshan-e-Iqbal Block-4A, Rajput Colony, Quid-e-Azam Colony	(E)11 (E)44	(3,8-10) (Full)	65,354
	12	Gulzar-e-Hijri	Bakhar Goth, Sickandar Goth, Bless Homes, PCSIR	Charge Gujro 05	(6-8&12)	42,132
	13	Safooran	Safooran, Jaffer Complex, Dani Bux Goth, Bachal Khan Gabol Goth, SUPARCO TIBAT Sanitorium	- do -	(9-11, 13&14)	42,550
						<b>6,46,662</b>

**LIST OF UC'S NAZIM AND NAIB NAZIM GULSHAN TOWN**

<b>SR.</b>	<b>NAME OF NAZIM</b>	<b>NAME OF NAIB NAZIM</b>	<b>U.C NAME.</b>	<b>LOCATION</b>
01.	Muhammad Junaid	Amir Rafi	Delhi Mercantile	Opp.Maka Masjid Council Office Johar Road, Karachi.
02.	Muhammad Nasir Dawood Verain	Muneeruddin	Civic Centre	Ghousia Colony Behind Central Jail Karachi,
03.	Haji Manzoor Ahmed	Engr.Sabir Ahmed	P.I.B Colony	Ladies Park, Block 14.
04.	Rehman Gul	N.Numash Khan	Essa Nagri	Gulshan-E-Iqbal.
05.	Nasimuddin	Majid Ali Khan	Gulshan E Iqbal	Narial Park Block 5,Gulshan E Iqbal
06.	Eg.Abdul Aziz	Syed Khizar Baqi	Gillan	Main Gulshan E Iqbal
07.	Ghulam Akbar	Mohd S.Zareef Shah	Nagar	R-21 Block E,National Cement Society 10-A, Gulshan E Iqbal , Khi
08.	M.Yaseen Nagori	M.Usman Ghani	Jamali Colony	Water Board Build Gulshan
09.	Abdul Rasheed	Muzaffar Iqbal	Gulshan 2	Ghowring Gulshan E Iqbal
10.	Ali Mohd Mughal	Qamber Ali Bangash	Pehlwan Goth	Kda Office Safari Park
11.	Mohd Tariq	Fawadul Zafar	Metrovill III	Land Office Metrovill Iii
12.	Ibrahim Gabol	Syed Mohd Ehsan	Gulzari Hijri	Ex Octori Office Super Highway
13.	Karim Bux	Ibrahim Soomro	Safoora	Near Safoora Chowrangi Water Board Office.

**Questionnaire**  
**ICT- Gulshan Town.**  
(Improving Transparency and Quality  
in the delivery of services / e-services to the poor)

1. Name of the Respondent: \_\_\_\_\_
2. Address: \_\_\_\_\_
3. Profession & Nature of work: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Number of Earners in your Family: \_\_\_\_\_
5. Number of members of your family.  
Adults\_\_\_Children\_\_\_ (4-12 years) \_\_Babies\_\_\_\_\_ (upto 3-years)
6. Is this your own house: - Yes\_\_\_\_\_ Rented\_\_\_\_\_
7. What is the size of your plot? \_\_\_\_\_ Square yards
8. If rented then what is the monthly rent? Rs. \_\_\_\_\_
9. Approximate family monthly income Rs. \_\_\_\_\_
10. Do you have the following facilities? If no what alternative arrangements have you made?  
Electricity: - Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Alternative \_\_\_\_\_  
Gas: - Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Alternative \_\_\_\_\_  
Water connection: - Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Alternative \_\_\_\_\_  
Telephone: - Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Alternative \_\_\_\_\_  
Sewerage/Sanitation Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Alternative \_\_\_\_\_
11. What is your average monthly expenditure in each one of them including the maintenance cost? Rs. \_\_\_\_\_  
Electricity \_\_\_\_\_  
Gas \_\_\_\_\_  
Water \_\_\_\_\_  
Sewerage/Sanitation\_\_\_\_\_

Telephone \_\_\_\_\_

12 Give your opinion on the following:

Electricity Satisfied\_\_\_\_ Not satisfied\_\_\_\_ No Opinion\_\_\_\_

Gas Satisfied\_\_\_\_ Not satisfied\_\_\_\_ No Opinion\_\_\_\_

Water Satisfied\_\_\_\_ Not Satisfied\_\_\_\_ No Opinion\_\_\_\_

Sewerage/Sanitation Satisfied\_\_\_\_ Not Satisfied\_\_\_\_ No Opinion\_\_\_\_

Telephone Satisfied\_\_\_\_ Not Satisfied\_\_\_\_ No Opinion\_\_\_\_

13 If you have a problem with any of the utilities do you make a complaint to the authorities.  
Yes\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_

14 Where do you register your complaints?

Electricity\_\_\_\_\_

Gas \_\_\_\_\_

Water \_\_\_\_\_

Sewerage/Sanitation \_\_\_\_\_

Telephone \_\_\_\_\_

15 Out of the five which one gives prompt response / service? In order of response  
Electricity\_\_\_ Gas\_\_\_ Water\_\_\_ Sewerage/Sanitation\_\_\_ Telephone\_\_\_

16. Regarding these services do you think conditions have improved under the City /Town Management?

Yes\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

If Yes, How do you assess this? \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

If No please explain \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

17. Have you met your local Nazim / Naib Nazim? Yes\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_

18 Who is your area Town / Union Nazim\_\_\_\_\_

19. What is his name.\_\_\_\_\_?

20 Have you ever approached him/her for complaints about these services?

Yes\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

Was he/her helpful? Yes \_\_\_\_\_ No \_\_\_\_\_

If not why? \_\_\_\_\_

21 Do you think that your Town/Union Nazim friendly and accessible.

Yes\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_

22 Would you like a complaint center in your Town / Union Council

.Yes\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_



- 23 If there is a complaint center set up in your Town / Union Council would you go there to make complaints. Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 24 Do you think that a committee set up in your Town / Union Council would help you better to hear and follow up your complaints? Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 25 Would you like to be a member of this committee? Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 26 Do you or anyone in your family know how to use a computer?  
Yes\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_
- 27 Do you or anyone in your family own a computer?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 28 Do you have a computer in the house? Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 29 Does your neighbour have a computer? Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 30 If you can use a computer would you use it to make complaints to the Complaint Center/ Web site?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 31 If you do not know how to use or have a computer, would you ask your neighbors / friends / your office computer to make a complaint?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 32 If anyone makes a complaint through a computer do you think that there will be a better response from the authorities? Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
33. If you have a telephone would you make a complaint if any one of your utilities are not functioning. Yes\_\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_\_
- 34 If you do not have a telephone and small Complaint Cells / centers are set up for communicating complaints would you use these cells centres?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 35 If the cells / centers charge for the cost of the telephone call or computer Complaint would you pay the nominal charge Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
36. Would you like a computerized Complaint center where your complaint is recorded and you can monitor / see the results of your complaint?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 37 Would you like that these Cells / Centers be available in all parts of your town / Union Council  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_ -
- 38 Would you like that these Cells / centers are controlled by the town / Union  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 39 Would you prefer that these cells / centers are run by Private Organizations?  
Yes\_\_\_\_ No\_\_\_\_\_
- 40 Would you like to own and run a cell / center if given an opportunity?  
Yes\_\_\_\_\_No\_\_\_\_\_
- 41 I would like to thank you for the interview and the time that you have given me.



TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN  
Strives to make Pakistan a better country to live in

**PAKISTAN  
PRE-PROJECT ASSESSMENT REPORT  
(DFID Engineering KaR I2-16)  
ENDING MARCH 31, 2004**

*SURVEY REPORT*

*Consumers Satisfaction & Need Assessment  
Basic Five Civic Amenities*

**65 – C NATIONAL HIGHWAY  
Phase II Defence housing Authority  
KARACHI**

### Respondents' Profile: -

- The Survey was conducted on behalf of Transparency International Pakistan in a pre-selected area of Karachi i.e. Union Councils 1 and 7 of Gulshan Town.
- Majority of the respondents belonged to the lower and middle socio-economic strata residing in Shanty Towns and Low income communities living in small houses and apartments.
- Apart from a few Doctors and Engineers the majority of the respondents were self-employed as Carpenters, Sales and Insurance Agents and Accountants.
- On an average, the earner per family was 1 to 2 only amongst a household of 7 to 8 persons.
- Majority of the respondents were in the income bracket of Rs. 5000 to Rs. 10,000.(for the whole family)
- Out of 200 respondents, 175 were living in their own houses and only 25 were in rented house, paying on average Rs. 1784 rent per month.
- With the exception of a very few all had electricity, Gas and Sewerage. The facility of the Telephone was lacking from 61 households. Water connection from 73 homes.
- Out of the five utilities selected for survey, the most troublesome cited was Water, followed by Electricity and Sewerage. The least being Gas.
- In case of problems with the utilities, 90% do register complaints and 10% suffer in silence because they feel it is of no use or they wait for their neighbours to do so.
- In Registering Complaints to the concerned authorities, the Telephone appeared to be the most popular mode, followed by personal visits and to their Union Council (UC) members.

- In the opinion of the respondents, the Gas department gave the most vigilant service, followed by Electricity and Telephone. The worst being the Water and Sewerage departments.
- Respondents were of the opinion that conditions have improved a little with the new Devolution of government to the Town management, however almost an equal number felt that the new system has not made any difference.
- Interaction with their respective area Nazim (Mayor) Councilor appeared to be congenial, 85% knew the correct name of the Councilor, and 64% knew the telephone number of their representative Council member.
- About 72% had met their local Nazim (Town Mayor), 64% felt he was accessible and friendly.
- With the exception of four respondents all showed interest in the idea of setting up of computerized complaint centers within their Union Council. Some even suggested that the centers should be in every lane through Cyber Cafes. A Majority i.e. 82% were in favour of committees to be set-up at UC level for follow-up of complaints. However, 55% were also interested in becoming members of the Local Committees to coordinate with their Town in Monitoring..
- 84% respondents favoured private sector management of complaint centers. 67% were willing to spend Rs.20 to Rs. 50 per month for such a facility provided it showed result.
- In spite of being under economic constraints most of the respondents i.e. 71% were not interested in opening of such complaint centers as an income generating project.
- Out of 200 households, 106 had no computers but 94 had a computer at home.
- Majority i.e. 74% felt that a computerized complaint center under private sector management might provide faster relief to the complainants. However the Focus Group participants were not sure about its success. They felt that corruption and lethargy prevailed in all these five departments at all levels, and unless and until these ailments are weeded out, computerization will be of no help.

## Focus Group Report: Lady Councilors

Held on: Thursday March 11<sup>th</sup> 2004  
Venue: Gulshan Town Office  
Time: 11:45 am to 1:30 pm  
No. Of Participants: 13 Lady Councilors

### Participants Profile:

Age Group: 30 years to 60 years  
Marital Status: All Married  
Education: Primary to B.ED and MSC  
Status: Town Councilors -----4  
Labour Councilor -----1  
General Councilor -----8

### Socio-Economic Status:

With the exception of two, all 13 belonged to the lower middle class. Their husbands were either retired or were small Businessmen and working in Private offices and in Government and semi-government jobs.

The discussion took place in a relaxed manner. And after preliminary introductions all participants were vocal. Following a general conversation; the discussion was geared towards the Civic Amenities and the Introduction of a computerized system of Complaint Centers.

Out of the following five utility services three Water, Sewerage and Electricity were unanimously mentioned as the most trouble some.

#### ❖ **Water:**

Problem is too acute in areas like Shantinagar. Consumers are paying water and conservancy charges plus they have to bribe the valve man to release water in their line. The Banglows are getting water in plenty, their tanks are over flowing and the poorer areas do not get water at all. Solution suggested was that the valve man to be substituted with mechanical device and some sort of fine on the consumers who over use.

#### ❖ **Sewerage: Frequent Complaints: Choking.**

The Town office has perhaps only one suction machine, therefore most of the Councilors pool money and hire sweepers for Rs. 100- Rs. 150 who clear the sewerage whenever called for. Permanent solution suggested, new Sewerage line is needed almost in the whole town.

❖ **Electricity:**

**Frequent complaints: Excessive billing**

All participants, were vocal against the New Meters, Kunda (illegal connections) system is still prevalent. Suggestions were to remove the New Meters immediately, improve the computer department of KESC billing section and instead of sending accumulated bills. They should work like Telephone department i.e. after due date and after two warnings disconnect the Electricity.

The problem of bad roads, especially front and back lanes and removal of garbage were other acute issues.

The Lady Councilors themselves felt helpless in an environment of dishonesty, inefficiency and lack of resources at the departmental level, ignorance, illiteracy and poverty at the society level.

The members of the panel were skeptical about the computerized system of complaint centers, some of the apprehensions were: ---

- ❖ With the erratic electricity system the computers will not work most of the time, especially in summers.
- ❖ The complaints will ultimately land in the concerned department, such as KESC, KWSB etc, where only influential and rich are entertained.
- ❖ Bad governance prevails and lack of resources exists in all the five departments with plus minus.
- ❖ At the end of the discussion the panelist were of the opinion that the Computerized Complaint Centers may facilitate the consumers suffering to a certain extent, but will not be a fool proof system to answer to their woes.
- ❖ Out of 13 members, 10 ladies had computers at home, and were being used by their sons, daughters and brothers. None of the ladies used the computer themselves.

## Focus Group Report: Teachers and Social Workers

Held on: Saturday March 20<sup>th</sup> 2004  
Venue: Meadows School Gulshan-e-Iqbal  
Time: 11:30 am to 1:30 pm  
Number Of Participants: 6 schoolteachers and 6 school teachers and voluntary Social workers

### Participants Profile:

Age Group: 24 years to 60 years  
Marital Status: Single 3  
Married 9  
Education: Primary to B.A to MEd & MSC

### Socio-Economic Status:

All participants were themselves educated, vigilant and vocal. They all belonged to the middle and upper middle class. Among the twelve, 7 had computers at home and the remaining 5 had no computers. Their family background was quiet strong their fathers/husbands are also either professionals or working in Semi private or private organizations.

The discussion took place in a relaxed manner. All participants were vocal., After an introduction through generalized conversation the discussion was geared towards the Civic Amenities and introduction of computerized system of Complaint Centers.

Out of the following five utility services three Water, Sewerage and Electricity were unanimously mentioned as the most trouble some.

Water: -

- Irregular supply, dirt and brownish color with smell have been the most vehemently coated complaint. All the participants said that this water is not used for drinking at all. The drinking water is being purchased from the market, which add burden to the family income, apart from the annual tax, which the consumers pay to the Government. Purchasing from the market or installing filter equipment at home is an expensive alternative, which they are forced to adopt.
- Broken pipelines were frequently noted in the whole of Gulshan town. They felt that these lines are deliberately damaged with the connivance of the staff of the Karachi Water & sewerage Board by the residence of the Shanty Towns, who wash their clothes and take the water home from these broken lines.

- Those residing in old flats face a real suffering from water crises in spite of the fact that they pay double tax that is both to the Apartment Unions and also the Karachi Water Board. During summer quarrel is a common occurrence among the residents as they steal each other's water or have heavy water suction pumps to directly draw water from the lines. They are therefore forced to use tanker services that are another Mafia. One respondent gave an example that in her area, where all the residents pooled money and changed their whole pipeline. This sorted out the problem to a great extent.
- All the members of the panel were of the opinion that the linemen employed by the Karachi Water & Sewerage Board are most corrupt. They should be completely withdrawn and some other method be adopted. Since the Water and Sewerage Board has no functioning complaint cell or a uni number such as the 18 for telephone complaints. Not having such a backup facility therefore no prompt service has ever been given by this department.

Sewerage: -

- The members of the panel were all unanimous in the opinion that perhaps Gulshan-e-Iqbal had no sewerage system at all. The gutters are choked everywhere and one can see gutter water flowing in all lanes. There is no real organization to redress their complaints and have no other option but privately hire sweepers who cost from Rs. 50 to Rs. 100 per visit. The gutter sweepers have also become blackmailers. It was felt that when they need money they deliberately open the Sewerage Manholes and throw garbage, plastic bags, and stones to block and choke the gutter, It is was also pointed out that most of the sweepers seem to be drug addicts.
- Those living in flats register their complaints with the Apartment Unions/Societies and the Union usually has sweepers on call to clean the choking of gutters.

Electricity: -

- Frequent complaints of excessive and erratic billing. They also pointed out that K.E.S.C has started disconnecting the electricity supply on non-payment of their bills. However they neither inform the user either on telephone or by issuing the notice.
- They were all apprehensive that summer had arrived and a new phase of suffering is ahead, that is load shedding especially at night. There is also a lot of fluctuations in the Power supply causing damage to the electric appliances.



- They usually register their complaints on telephone, they rarely visit complaint centers, perhaps they have alternatives as some have Gas lights, and stand-by emergency lights etc.
- An interesting fact from this survey has emerged that the literate and the affluent did not know the telephone numbers of their Union Council member or Nazims (Mayors) or even the name of the area councilor.
- Regarding the computerized complaint centers they were of the opinion that it will work only when the concerned departments are more organized and prompt. At present all three departments are the most corrupt, inefficient, untrained and the employees are not hired on merit. This will only destroy the whole computer system that will be installed.
- Another system of corruption has emerged in these department which is political for example the K.E.S.C engineer may belong to a particular Political party, and the supervisor from another political party. There is therefore not only no cooperation but in many cases even deliberately hinder efforts of each other in maintenance of the systems. Unfortunately, in most cases it is the consumer who suffers.
- Some of the panelists were school owners and they were extremely vocal against all the three departments, who shamelessly ask for bribe not every month but more often, and some time they share the amount among themselves.

## Statistical Analysis

### Q-1 Respondent gender status:

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Male	165	82.50%
Female	35	17.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

### Q-2 Address/ Locality:

<b>Locality</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Mujahid Colony+ Dalmia	69	34.50%
Sharfabad+ C.P.Berar	41	20.50%
Bahadurabad+ Delhi Mercentile	34	17.00%
Shantinagar + Gulshan Block-19	19	14.50%
Dhorajee	27	13.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-3 Profession & Nature of Work:**

<b>Locality</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Self Employed	56	28.00%
Private Job Non-Executive	55	27.50%
Business	42	21.00%
Govt. Service Non-Gazatted	20	10.00%
Un-Employed	7	3.50%
Doctor	5	2.50%
Retired	5	2.50%
Engineer	3	1.50%
House Wife	7	3.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-4 Number of Earners in your Family:**

*Total Earner = 349*

*Average Earner per Family 1 to 2 Persons Per H.H*

**Q-5 Number of members of your family:**

Adults	<b>869</b>	Children	<b>385</b>	Babies	<b>180</b>
	(Above 15Yrs)		(4-14Yrs)		(0-3Yrs)

Family Composition	Members Per Family	Percent
Adults	4.35	60.60%
Children	1.93	26.85%
Babies	0.90	12.55%
<b>Total</b>	<b>7.18</b>	<b>100%</b>

- Average Members per H.H about 7 to 8 Persons.

Q-6 Is this your own house: -  
 Yes \_\_\_\_\_ Rented \_\_\_\_\_

	No	Percent
Own House	175	87.50%
Rented	25	12.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100%</b>

Q-8 If rented then what is the monthly rent? Rs. \_\_\_\_\_

- Average Rent Per House = Rs. 1784

Q-9 Approximate family monthly income  
 Rs. \_\_\_\_\_

In PK Rs	No	Percent
Below 5000	12	6.00%
5001 to 10000	79	39.50%
10001 to 15000	42	21.00%
15001 to 20000	30	15.00%
20001 to 30000	25	12.50%
Above 30000	12	6.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-10 Do you have the following facilities? If no what alternative arrangements have you made?**

<b>Facilities</b>	<b>Availability</b>	<b>(Alternate)</b>
Electricity	198	02 (Lantern)
Gas	197	03 (L.P.G)
Sewerage / Sanitation	192	08 (Soak Pit )
Telephone	139	61 (PCO / Cell )
Water Connection	127	73 (Boring / Tanker)

**Q-11 What is your average monthly expenditure on each one of them including the maintenance cost?**

<b>Facilities</b>	<b>Avg. Exp Per Family In PK Rs.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Telephone	1015.35	34.45%
Electricity	986.36	33.46%
Water	584.33	19.82%
Gas	290.66	9.86%
Sewerage / Sainitation	70.82	2.40%

**Q-12 Out of the above five which one is most troublesome and faulty?  
Elaborate the problem?**

<b>Facilities</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Water	111	55.50%
Electricity	55	27.50%

Sewerage / Sainitation	19	9.50%
Telephone	14	7.00%
Gas	1	0.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-13 If you have a problem with any of the utilities do you make a complaint to the authorities?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	179	89.50%
No	21	10.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-14 How do you make a complaint?**

<b>Source</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Telephone	117	37.99%
Personal visit	81	26.30%
Use of Union council members	70	22.73%
Use of contacts	37	12.01%
Others	3	0.97%
<b>Total</b>	<b>308</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

▪ *Total Exceed from 200 Because of Multiple Answer.*

**Q-15 Where do you register your complaint?**

<b>Facilities</b>	<b>Complaint Center</b>		<b>U.C.Office</b>		<b>Flat Committee</b>		<b>On Phone</b>	
	No.	Percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
<b>Electricity</b>	115	<b>80.42%</b>					28	<b>19.58%</b>

Water	39	30.47%	78	60.94%	11	8.59%		
Telephone	24	21.24%					89	78.76%
Sewerage / Sainitation	31	28.97%	67	62.62%	9	8.41%		
Gas	26	44.07%					33	55.93%

**Q-16 Out of the five which one gives prompt response / service?  
In order of response**

Facilities	1		2		3	
	No.	Percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Gas	118	59.00%	3	1.28%	-	-
Electricity	39	19.50%	108	53.85%	81	40.45%
Telephone	31	15.50%	77	38.46%	34	16.85%
Water	7	3.50%	12	5.77%	29	14.61%
Sewerage / Sainitation	5	2.50%	1	0.64%	56	28.09%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-17 Regarding these five services do you think conditions have improved under the City / Town Management?**

Response	No.	Percent
Yes	103	51.50%
No	97	48.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-18 Do you know your union council number?**

Response	No.	Percent
Correct Recall	129	64.50%
Wrong Recall /Do not Know.	71	35.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-19 What is the name of your area Nazim?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Correct Recall	171	85.50%
Wrong Recall / Do not Know.	29	14.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-20 Have you ever met your local Nazim?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	145	72.50%
No	55	27.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-21 Do you think that your Union Nazim is friendly and accessible?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	128	64.00%
No	44	22.00%
Don't Know	28	14.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-22 Would you like a complaint center in your Union Council? Which will give free service?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	196	98.00%
No	4	2.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>



**Q-23 If there is a computerized complaint center set up in your Union Council would you go there to make complaints?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	196	98.00%
No	4	2.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-24 Would you like a committee to be setup in your Union Council to hear and follow up your complaints?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	165	82.50%
No	35	17.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-25 Would you like to be a member of this committee?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	74	44.85%
No	91	55.15%
<b>Total</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-26 Do you think that the complaint center will work better under private sector management. (Such as PCO)**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	169	84.50%
No	31	15.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-27 If yes would you like to pay a nominal amount for this service?  
(How much)**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	135	67.50%
No	65	32.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

- *Average Suggested Amount is Rs.20 to 50 Per Month Depending on locality*

**Q-28 Would you like to open such complaint center which will generate income for your home**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	57	28.50%
No	143	71.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-29 Do you have a computer in your house?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Do Have	94	47.00%
Do not Have	106	53.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-30 If you can use a computer would you use it to make complaint to the Complaint center?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	53	56.50%
No	41	43.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-31 If no, would you be able to use your neighbors / friends / Office computer for complaints?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>No.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	93	46.50%
No	107	53.50%
<b>Total</b>	<b>106</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

**Q-32 If any one makes a complaint through a computer do you think that there will be a better response from the authorities?**

<b>Response</b>	<b>Nos.</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Yes	148	74.00%
No	52	26.00%
<b>Total</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>100.00%</b>