IS THERE A TEACHER MOTIVATION CRISIS IN TANZANIA?

PAUL BENNELL*
and
FAUSTIN MUKYANUZI**

SEPTEMBER 2005

*Senior Partner, Knowledge and Skills for Development, Brighton, UK
** Managing *Partner, HR-CONSULT*, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Contents

Tables

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We wish to thank everyone who assisted us in this study. Special thanks go to Permanent Secretary at the Ministry of Education and Culture for permitting us to undertake this important although sensitive area of research and also the District Education Officers in Muleba and Temeke and the head teachers and teachers at the ten survey schools. Alan Penny made very useful comments on an initial draft of this report.

ACRONYMS

PEDP	Primary Education Development Programme
DFID	Department for International Development
EFA	Education for All
PEDP	Primary Education Development Programme
MOEC	Ministry of Education and Culture
EMIS	Education Management Information System
TTUs	Tanzania Teacher Union
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
UPE	Universal Primary Education
TSC	Teacher Service Commission
SMCs	School Management Committees
MoF	Ministry of Finance
TSPB	Teachers' Service Professional Board

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 STUDY OBJECTIVES

In Tanzania, as elsewhere, universal primary education with acceptable learning outcomes can only be attained if teachers are adequately motivated. Teachers also have a critical role to play in supporting development activities in the wider community. In short, teachers are central to the realisation of ambitious national and international education and poverty reduction goals. However, there are growing concerns that teachers in Tanzania, as in other developing countries, are increasingly de-motivated, which is reflected in deteriorating teaching performance and learning outcomes. The 1995 Education and Training Policy noted that 'in Tanzania, teachers have experienced low and irregular salary payments, lack of proper housing, inadequate teaching facilities, low status and limited opportunities for professional development' (p.31). Poor incentives also mean that far too few qualified and experienced teachers want to work in schools in rural areas where the large majority of the population and the poor live and where primary school enrolment and completion rates are relatively low

To what extent, then, is there teacher motivation crisis in Tanzania? This report marshals the findings from primary research as well as evidence from other sources in order to answer this question. Given the importance of 'Education for All', the focus is on the 120,000 teachers who work in 13,000 government-funded primary schools right across the country. After two decades of falling enrolment rates, concerted efforts are now being made to ensure that all children complete primary education (Standards 1 to 7) and acquire the basic competencies necessary to lead a rewarding and productive life. To this end, the Government of Tanzania with substantial financial backing from its international development partners is currently implementing the Primary Education Development Programme. Since the abolition of tuition and other fees in 2001, primary school enrolments have increased by over 40 percent - from 4.9 million to 7.0 million in early 2004. Nearly 40,000 classrooms were built between 2000 and 2004.[1]

More than ever, therefore, teachers are under tremendous pressure from politicians, parents, and communities to deliver quality primary education to all children. But how likely is it that they will respond to this challenge given their current levels of pay and the conditions in which they have to work and live?

This study is part of a large international research project on teacher motivation and incentives in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia. The core of the study comprises 12 country studies.[2] The United Kingdom Department for International Development (DFID) has generously funded this research. However, the views expressed in this report are entirely those of the authors and not DFID.

---

[1] According to EMIS, the number of classrooms increased from 58521 in 2000 to 96215 in 2004.

[2] Apart from Tanzania, the countries that have been chosen are: Ghana, Kenya, Malawi, Lesotho, Nigeria, Sierra Leone and Zambia in Africa and Bangladesh, India, Nepal, and Pakistan in South Asia.

1.2 INFORMATION SOURCES

The study draws on three main sources of information, namely action research in a small sample of primary schools, interviews with key stakeholders, and all relevant documentation and available statistics.

School survey

A representative group of 10 government-funded primary schools were surveyed in two locations- an urban district (Temeke in Dar es Salaam Region) and a rural district (Muleba in Kagera Region).[3] Each school was visited for one day in late November-early December 2004. Schools participated in the survey did so on the understanding that their identities would not be revealed. The head teacher and four randomly selected teachers were individually interviewed at each school while the remaining teachers were asked to complete a questionnaire. Five from this latter group of teachers also participated in a semi-structured focus group discussion at each school. Each group was requested to discuss prepared statements that cover all key aspects of teacher motivation and then decide whether they agree, disagree or are not sure about each statement. These same statements were also included in the teacher questionnaire.

Each of these four groups of respondents were asked the same or very similar questions about the overall levels and determinants of teacher job satisfaction and motivation at the school. In this way, it was possible to compare or 'triangulate' their responses, especially in order to assess how consistent they were. Nearly all head teacher and teacher interviews and all the teacher focus groups were conducted in Kiswahili. The teacher questionnaire was also written in Kiswahili.

The school survey collected information from 10 head teachers, 10 teacher focus groups, 35 teacher interviewees, and 149 teacher questionnaires.

Strengths and weaknesses

The school survey was carefully well designed and pre-tested and therefore it was possible to collect good quality information. Each of the four instruments complemented each and enabled information from different sources to be compared, especially for response consistency. However, given the sensitivity of a few questions (particularly those related to parental education, secondary employment, and incomes), the quality of some information is questionable. Also, some head teachers were clearly reluctant to express negative views concerning the level of job satisfaction and motivation, in part because such views may have reflected badly on them.

Stakeholder interviews

A total of 25 semi-structured, confidential interviews were conducted (in English) during late October-early November 2004 with senior officials in the Ministry of

[3] Schools in each district were selected in consultation with the relevant officials in the District Education Office.

Education and Culture, other relevant ministries, bilateral and multilateral development agencies, and education non-governmental organisations. The main purpose of these interviews was to obtain stakeholder assessments of the overall level, trends, and specific determinants of teacher motivation and job satisfaction in primary schools.

Relevant documentation and statistics

Four surveys have been undertaken on teacher motivation and incentives in Tanzania since the early 1990s. In chronological order, they are as follows:

- World Bank, 1990, Conditions of service among primary and secondary teachers in Tanzania.

- TADREG, 1991, A survey of living and working conditions of primary and secondary school teachers on mainland Tanzania by B. Cooksey, A. Ishumi, G. Malekela, and J. Galabawa. The survey was conducted in six regions and 1741 primary and secondary teachers were surveyed

- Teacher Trade Union/Haki Elimu, 2004, Study on the working conditions of teachers in Tanzania, by S. Sumra and others. This included interviews with 74 primary school teachers at 21 schools in seven districts.

- Swai, F., A. Mtavangu, and N.N.F. Shami, 2004, Study on job satisfaction and motivation in teaching in relation to quality EFA initiatives.

The TADREG, World Bank and TTU/Haki Elimu[4] surveys cover both primary and secondary school teachers, whereas the Swai Survey focuses on secondary school teachers and teacher trainers only. Apart from the TTU/Haki Elimu survey, these surveys relied mainly on administering questionnaires to teachers working at relatively large samples of urban and rural schools.

Other relevant documentation was reviewed, in particular the main education and policy reviews and reports since the mid 1980s and, most recently, the comprehensive reports of the annual PEDP Review Teams. Data on teacher deployment and attrition was extracted from MOEC's Education Management Information System since the early 1990s.

1.3 REPORT STRUCTURE

The report has seven main chapters. Chapter 2 assesses the extent to which there is a motivation crisis among primary school teachers in Tanzania. The next four chapters focus on teacher status and occupational commitment, teacher competence, living and working conditions, and pay. Chapter 6 then looks at how teacher motivation affects

[4] Although the TTU/Haki Elimu Survey covers both primary and secondary school teachers, the report does not disaggregate the main findings by type of teacher. This limits it usefulness as a source of comparative information on teacher motivation at primary schools.

the delivery of primary education throughout the country. Finally, Chapter 7 draws together the main conclusions and recommendations of the study.

2. IS THERE A TEACHER MOTIVATION CRISIS?

Newspaper articles and other media reports regularly highlight the plight of teachers in Tanzania.[5] Numerous official documents over the last decade or so have also increasingly drawn attention to the fragility of teacher motivation in the country. For example, the Report on the Education Sector Towards 2000 notes that 'since 1962, the different schemes of service for teachers have not reflected due recognition of the heavy demands of society upon teachers nor the crucial contribution of the latter in moulding the future citizens of society. This attitude has greatly discouraged academically able young men and women from enrolling in teacher training courses. Many dedicated teachers have gone to more caring employers'. In a similar vein, the 1990 World Bank report on teachers' conditions of service concluded that 'in the absence of incentives to perform better, many teachers are currently providing much less and lower quality education than they are capable of …the de-motivation of teachers is a major contributory factor to the abysmally poor learning achievements of primary and secondary students' (World Bank, 1990, p.10).

This chapter draws on the information from the school survey, stakeholder interviews and secondary sources in order to assess the overall levels and trends in job satisfaction and motivation among primary school teacher in Tanzania.

2.1 JOB SATISFACTION AND MOTIVATION LEVELS

Getting good quality information on overall levels and trends in teacher motivation is not easy. In part, this is because of the highly subjective nature of job satisfaction but, as will be discussed below, it also depends very heavily on the way in which the information is obtained.

There are two basic teacher grades in primary schools. Grade IIIB/C teachers were first recruited during the UPE campaign in the mid 1970s. Initally, nearly all of them were primary school leavers, but during the 1980s, some were recruited after completing Form II. They attended teacher-training college for one year and completed a second year of training based in schools.

Grade IIIA teachers must have a minimum of four years of secondary schooling and at least a Grade 3 pass in the national school certificate examination. However, over the years, these minimum education requirements have frequently been ignored and, as recently as 2003, many school leavers were still being recruited with Grade 4 passes. Up until 2002, pre-service primary school teacher trainees spent two years at the TTCs. This has now been changed to a 1+1 system where trainees spend only one year attending college. During the second year, trainees are posted to fill substantive teaching positions in schools and undertake supervised on the job training.

[5] The education NGO Haki Elimu periodically publishes compilations of all newspapers articles on teachers (see Hakie Elimu, 2004).

School survey

The head teacher interview began by asking, in a completely open-ended way, 'what are the main challenges currently facing your school?' What is interesting is that, at the urban schools in Temeke, teacher motivation and staffing issues are hardly mentioned whereas in rural schools staffing issues feature prominently (see Table 2.1).

Table 2.1: Head teacher assessment of two main challenges facing their schools

SCHOOLS	1	2
MULEBA		
	1 De-motivated teachers	Understaffing
	2 Community relations	Teachers overworked
	3 Increased enrolments	Staffing difficulties
	4 Teacher shortage	Shortage learning materials
	5 Large enrolments	Shortage classrooms and desks
TEMEKE		
	1 Pupil absenteeism	Community indifference
	2 Community relations	Poverty of parents
	3 Learning outcomes	Community support
	4 Community support	Na
	5 Teachers living far from school	Teacher specialization

Source: School survey

Tables 2.2 – 2.5 summarise the responses of head teachers and teachers to statements about the overall level of job satisfaction and motivation among teachers at the survey schools. Three out of the five teacher focus groups in Muleba and all five groups in Temeke agreed with the statement that 'teachers at this school are well motivated'. Similarly, only a small minority of the teacher questionnaire respondents disagreed with this statement. However, when asked about their own levels of job satisfaction, 61 percent of these teachers in Temeke rated their level of job satisfaction as 'poor' or 'very poor' compared to only 17 percent in Muleba. A similar pattern of responses is apparent from the teacher interviews. In particular, half of the teacher interviewees in Temeke said that they are dissatisfied with their job, but only 12 percent in Muleba.

Most head teachers believe that the large majority of teachers at their schools are adequately motivated. In their opinion, only 4 percent of teachers are poorly motivated in Temeke and 24 percent in Muleba and that, given a free hand, they would dismiss only 4 percent of teachers in Temeke and 15 percent in Muleba on grounds of poor work commitment. Only two out of 10 head teachers specifically stated in their interviews that the overall level of motivation of their staff is low.

Lower levels of motivation in urban schools are apparent from teacher responses to two other key motivation indicators, namely whether they would choose to be a teacher again and their future intentions to continue working as a teacher. Whereas barely one-third of urban primary school teachers said they would make the same career choice again, over 80 percent of the rural teachers said they would. Furthermore, 60 percent of teachers in Temeke would stop teaching if they could, compared to only 20 percent in Muleba.[7]

[7] A similar question was asked in the Haki Elimu survey. The report concludes that 'only one-third of teachers stated that they would not leave teaching if they could find alternative

Table 2.2: Teacher questionnaire responses to general statements, November 2004 (rounded percentages)

STATEMENT	MULEBA			TEMEKE		
	Disagree	Not sure	Agree	Disagree	Not sure	Agree
Teachers at this school are well motivated	21	43	36	9	31	60
Female teachers are better motivated than male teachers	41	55	4	34	38	29
Qualified teachers are better motivated than unqualified teachers	25	29	46	25	30	44
Teachers at this school are increasingly de-motivated	21	21	57	47	16	36
Teachers at this school are respected in the community	23	8	69	46	11	43
Teachers and parents get on well together	31	10	58	53	9	37
Teachers think that their trade union is doing a good job	57	30	13	43	31	26
Teachers have the knowledge and skills to do their jobs well	13	10	77	4	15	80
The working environment at this school is adequate	43	14	43	40	8	52
Teachers at this school work well together	17	13	70	7	4	89
Pupil behaviour is not a problem at this school	0	7	93	4	18	78

Source: School survey

The qualification, age and gender profiles of primary school teachers could be important in explaining rural-urban variations in motivation. Table 2.6 shows that, regardless of age, overall levels of job satisfaction are low among all teachers in Temeke, but they are especially low among younger teachers. Apart from younger teachers, levels of job satisfaction are relatively high among teachers in Muleba.

Older teachers, who are generally less well educated and trained (i.e. Grade B/C), are rated by large majorities of teacher and head teacher respondents as being more highly motivated than younger teachers. This may be partly because the older generation feel 'privileged' to be teachers. Research by Angeline Barrett also suggests that it is younger, more educated teachers who find postings to rural schools most difficult. In rural schools, the teachers' work is more challenging, but 'not all communities are capable of morally supporting teachers or holding them accountable. Young men posted to rural schools are often the most demoralised and feel most estranged from the wider education system' (Barrett, 2004a, p.6).

employment' (op.cit. p.21). However, a closer examination reveals that 47 percent of rural teachers and 57 percent of urban teachers said they would leave. One half of rural teachers, but only one-fifth of urban teachers stated that they would advise their children to become teachers.

Table 2.3: Teacher questionnaire responses to personal statements (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA					TEMEKE				
STATEMENT	**Very poor**	**Poor**	**Just OK**	**Good**	**Excellent**	**Very poor**	**Poor**	**Just OK**	**Good**	**Excellent**
My current level of job satisfaction is	3	14	38	45	0	25	36	15	22	2
Opportunities for upgrading professional qualifications are	0	4	57	39	0	9	22	35	27	7
Opportunities for other in-service training are	13	33	20	30	3	19	37	6	34	4
Working conditions at this school are	7	20	27	47	0	13	32	10	48	0
My pay as a teacher is	10	20	47	23	0	30	55	5	9	1

STATEMENT	**Declined significantly**	**Declined**	**Remained the same**	**Increased**	**Increased significantly**	**Declined significantly**	**Declined**	**Remained the same**	**Increased**	**Increased significantly**
My level of job satisfaction over the last five years has	4	1	24	68	0	10	12	32	46	1
My standard of living over the last five years has	4	3	41	52	0	14	24	44	16	1

Source: School survey

Teacher trainees (most of whom are single) are now being mainly posted to harder-to-staff schools where it is difficult to support them as envisaged. Since they are expected to stay at these schools once they have completed their training, there is a danger that they could become quickly de-motivated.

Another key factor is the proportion of teachers who regard where they work as 'home'. Nearly all teachers in Muleba are 'locals' but, in Temeke, most teachers are 'outsiders'. Locally based teachers are more likely to have supportive extended family and social networks, be known to the community at large, and have higher levels of commitment to promoting education and development activities in the locality. In urban areas, on the other hand, the fact that most teachers are not from the immediate localities in which they teach makes it more difficult for them to establish and sustain good relations with the community and, in some instances, may lead to feelings of 'them and us'. Urban teachers at the survey schools tend to come from better off socio-economic background than rural teachers, most of whose parents are farmers.

Table 2.4: Job satisfaction ratings among teacher interviewees, November 2004, (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA		TEMEKE	
Rating	**Female**	**Male**	**Female**	**Male**
Low	14	11	47	100
Average	86	67	40	0
High	0	33	13	0

Source: School survey

Although gender differences in motivation levels are less apparent, around one-half of teacher questionnaire respondents in each location agreed with the statement that 'female teachers are better motivated than male teachers' (see Table 2.2). However, none of the teacher focus groups agreed with this statement and most head teacher interviewees stated that male teachers are better motivated! There are virtually no gender differences with respect to the teacher personal statement concerning levels of job satisfaction.

Table 2.5: Head teacher ratings of teacher motivation levels (rounded percentages)

	Good	**Adequate**	**Poor**	**Would like**
District				to dismiss
Muleba	34	42	24	15
Temeke	57	38	4	4

Source: School survey

Table 2.6: Poor job satisfaction by teacher age (rounded percentages)

DISTRICT	<30	31-40	41-50	50>
MULEBA	75	0	17	17
TEMEKE	71	63	52	56

Source: School survey

Less than half of the teacher questionnaire respondents (Muleba 46 percent Temeke 44 percent) agreed with the statement that 'qualified teachers are better motivated than unqualified teachers'. Only one head teacher indicated that Grade A teachers are generally better motivated than Grade B/C teachers. All but one of the five rural head teachers believes that the opposite is the case, which again is likely to be due to the older age profiles of Grade B/C teachers.

There is a broad consensus among MOEC managers and other stakeholders that most teachers are doing 'just enough' in class. However, poor career progression coupled with the lack of recognition and reward for superior performance is a major concern for most teachers. No action is usually taken against teachers who are performing poorly, which many teachers find de-motivating. A new appraisal system has been introduced, but there are widespread concerns that it is too complicated to be workable. The TTU's position on the new system is that it should only be introduced once the working environment for teachers is more enabling.

Secondary school teachers

It appears that teacher job satisfaction is considerably lower among secondary teachers and that, it many ways, this does amount to a teacher motivation crisis. The 1990 World Bank survey found that, while most primary school teachers stated they had become a teacher through choice, relatively few secondary school teachers had done so. The Haki Elimu Survey reaches a similar conclusion. In the recent survey by Swai et al, only 10 percent of secondary school teachers said that they have no plans to leave and nearly half are 'ready to leave' straight away.

2.2 TRENDS

In the early 1990s, both the World Bank and TADGREG surveys reported that most urban and rural primary school teachers were satisfied with their jobs. If, therefore, the two school survey districts are representative of the country as a whole, it would appear that job satisfaction levels have remained high among primary school teachers in rural areas, but that they have declined quite precipitously among urban teachers.

Stakeholder interview respondents have mixed views on longer-term trends with regard to teacher job satisfaction. Some believe that teachers are much less satisfied now than they were then in the heyday of UPE in the mid-1970s and much of this can be attributed to lower standards of living and respect. One experienced education NGO manager likened teachers to 'wounded soldiers'.

The impact of PEDP

There are quite differing views about the impact of PEDP on teacher job satisfaction and motivation. On the hand, there are those who argue that teachers are now happier because the government is now 'taking primary education seriously' and that working conditions have improved appreciably during the last three years. Teacher recruitment has also expanded exponentially, which is in marked contrast to the situation in the late 1990s when the government planned to downsize significantly the overall teaching force in primary schools. More generally, PEDP has 'identified the teacher in the classroom as the main agent for bringing about qualitative improvements in learning in primary schools' (PEDP, 2003, p.5).

On the other hand, however, it is argued that most of the additional resources provided by PEDP have been devoted to classroom construction and textbooks and very little attention has been given to the needs of teachers. According to Professor Sumra, 'many teachers feel demoralised. Teachers report having to shoulder much of the responsibility of the PEDP, including having to deal with enormous numbers of pupils and longer working hours, without additional compensation' (Sumra, 2003, p.7). They also 'complain about having little opportunity to participate in key decisions regarding plan implementation (ibid, p.3). Other leading educational experts in the country have reached similar conclusions (see, for example, Mbilinyi, 2003 and Rashad, 2003).

On balance, the results of the school survey indicate that teacher job satisfaction and motivation has not declined in recent years. While most of the teacher focus groups agreed with the statement that 'teachers at this school are increasingly de-motivated', only 36 percent of teachers in Temeke and 57 percent in Muleba agreed with the same statement (see Table 2.2). Similarly, sizeable majorities of head teachers (seven out of 10) and teacher interviewees (Temeke 58 percent, Muleba 86 percent) said that teacher motivation is increasing or is unchanged. But, perhaps most significantly, very few of the teacher questionnaire respondents (Temeke 21 percent, Muleba 8 percent) indicated that their <u>own</u> levels of job satisfaction had declined during the last five years (see Table 2.3).

3. STATUS AND VOCATIONAL COMMITMENT

Occupational status and vocational commitment are inextricably inter-related. Both are powerfully shaped by how teachers see themselves as a distinct occupational group. This identity is subject to multiple economic, social and political influences including traditional values, religious beliefs, political ideology, managerial approaches and educational philosophies and policies.

It is frequently argued that the status and vocational commitment of primary school teachers in most developing countries was high in the late colonial and early post-Independence periods, but that both have fallen significantly since then. Similar views are regularly expressed by teachers, teacher leaders, and in the media in Tanzania. Teachers during the 1970s 'used to be revered as special, enjoying gifts from peasants excited at seeing their children read' (Barrett, 2003, p.mm). Government attached top priority to UPE and the dual roles of 'mwalimu' in educating children and the development of communities were universally held in high esteem. Teachers themselves were politically committed to achieving UPE and the wider development objectives embodied in 'Ujamma'. However, it is contended that poverty has undermined the teachers' social status and hence seriously weakened their once strong occupational identity. Other negative factors include high levels of teacher unemployment during the 1990s, declining educational quality, and the increase in female teachers.

If vocational commitment to teaching is low, it would perhaps be better that these individuals do not stay in the profession. However, the lack of other employment opportunities means that few leave (see Chapter 6).

3.1 RESPECT FOR TEACHING

Overview

In 1990, the TADREG Survey found that three-quarters of primary school teachers regarded teaching as a 'respected profession'. According to the Hakie Elimu Survey 'this situation seems to have changed drastically over the last 14 years' (p.15). However, the survey results are not consistent on this issue; Over 70 percent of teacher questionnaire respondents agreed that teachers are respected (76 percent rural, 60 percent urban), but 'the majority of interviewees' said that teaching is not a respected profession anymore.

The school survey also indicates that respect for primary school teachers particularly in urban areas is low. Only one teacher focus group in Temeke and two in Muleba agreed with the statement that 'teachers are respected in the community'. Only 43 percent of the teacher questionnaire respondents in Temeke agreed with this statement compared with 69 percent in Muleba.

A major reason for the perceived difference in respect between rural and urban teachers is that, in the rural areas, 'teachers are the only people with regular income and command respect'. Somewhat ironically, Grade 'A' teachers are more likely to believe that teachers are not respected, which is probably because better educated and

trained teachers are more acutely aware of the status differences between teachers and other professions. The TTU/Hakie Elimu Survey reaches the disturbing conclusion that 'female teachers are despised in the villages'.

The stakeholder interviews highlighted a number of points concerning teacher respect. Some respondents feel that teachers are 'treated like children' by the MOEC and donors. As a result, teacher participation in policy development continues to remain limited. These paternalistic attitudes have been partly shaped by the limited education of UPE teachers who were recruited during the 1970s. The Tanzania Teacher Union (TTU) is also concerned that the 'dilution' of pre-service training with just one year of formal college training will also further lower the status of primary school teachers.

Parental and community attitudes

Teacher status is heavily influenced by the attitudes of the community towards the overall value of education and the relationship between schools and the community. Traditionally, teachers in Tanzania have had a strong sense of moral accountability. 'Teaching is far more than a job in a school, it is a role and position in society and, as such, is associated with honour and responsibility' (Barrett, 2004 p.13). But, as a consequence, teachers are vulnerable to parental and community opinion. 'If the parent values the teacher and the teacher values the parent, you find that the work goes well'. In the past, most concerns about this relationship have focused on rural areas. Parents in the villages are 'unenlightened' and tend not therefore to support schools, which is frustrating and undermining for teachers, many of who feel that they have made considerable sacrifices by working in rural schools. The danger in these situations is that teachers end up becoming estranged from the local community and 'look down on villagers'. A 1993 TADGREG Report noted that 'rural parents are increasingly disenchanted with primary education…Village teachers are characterised as lacking formal training, motivation and professional integrity' (TADREG, 1993 p.28).

The findings of the school survey show that, in both the rural and urban districts, head teachers and teachers are concerned that community support for schooling is generally low due mainly to high levels of poverty (which in towns is often compounded by various illegal activities) and adverse 'cultural values.' Most head teachers indicated that parents generally respect teachers, but that this is only 'average'. Nearly all the teacher focus groups disagreed with the statement that 'teachers and parents at this school work well together' and only slightly more than one-third of teacher questionnaire respondents in Temeke agreed with this statement compared to 58 percent in Muleba. This is worrying given that schools and teachers are now expected to be fully accountable to parents and communities (see Table 2.2).

Education and employment outcomes

Professional status is closely linked to client perceptions of the quality and overall value of the service that is being provided. It is frequently asserted that the perceived value of education is falling in most households in Tanzania. This is due to three factors namely, declining education quality, increased household expenditure on education,[8] and deteriorating employment prospects for school leavers.

Obtaining good quality data on trends in learning outcomes is very difficult. Examination results are notoriously unreliable except where they are criterion-referenced in a rigorous manner. Primary school leaving examination results have been improving quite appreciably since the late 1990s. However, the results of independent tests administered to large samples of primary school pupils show that learning outcomes are both low and declining (see Chapter 7).

The demand for primary education is also heavily dependent on the proportion of primary school completers who are able to progress to secondary schooling, since it is this level of education that provides access to 'good jobs'. The transition rate from primary to secondary education has doubled since the mid 1990s - from 15 to 30 percent.

While poorer learning outcomes have been counteracted to some extent by increased access to secondary education, wage employment opportunities for male secondary school leavers deteriorated appreciably during the 1990s. Interestingly, though, these opportunities have remained relatively constant for female Form IV leavers (see Mukyanuzi, 2003).

3.2 VOCATIONAL COMMITMENT

Employment of the last resort

Teaching in Tanzania is widely perceived as employment of the last resort. As one NGO respondent put it 'no one wants to be a teacher so why should they be respected'. However, among primary school teachers at least, this contention is not supported by any of the school surveys. Only 12 percent of the teacher respondents in the TADREG Survey in 1990 said they joined the teaching profession because 'I couldn't get the job I wanted' and only 5 percent said that 'there was no alternative to teaching'. Over ten years later in 2003, the Haki Elimu Survey found that 'most of the primary school teachers stated that they became a teacher through choice, because teaching appealed to them' (p.15). Similarly, among the survey schools in Muleba and Temeke, fewer than one in five teacher interviewees stated that they became a teacher because of a lack of alternative employment opportunities. In contrast, however, the results of the Swai Survey suggest that most secondary school teachers opted for teaching as very much a last resort.

[8] In late 1990s, households with children in primary or secondary school paid over half of the total cost per student. Source?

Given the shortage of wage employment opportunities, the demand for teaching jobs is extremely high. There were 150,000 applicants for the 10,000 pre-service places at teacher training colleges in 2002. Unlike in the past, Form IV leavers now have to put teaching as one of their three top occupational preferences (out of six) in order to be selected for teacher training college. The fact that the second year of the new pre-service training course is completed in schools is also intended to discourage those who are not fully committed to a teaching as a lifelong career.

Teacher unemployment

The future employment prospects of the newly qualified teacher are a key determinant of vocational commitment. The UPE campaign during the 1970s necessitated the introduction of a crash-training programme for mainly primary school leavers who were unable to proceed to secondary school. However, pretty much all teacher trainee graduates who wanted to teach were able to find employment. Given the rapid expansion of primary education, teachers accounted for nearly 20 percent of all wage employment in Tanzania by the late 1980s.

With the advent of structural adjustment in the late 1980s, the government rapidly liberalised the economy and retrenched large numbers of public sector workers.[9] However, the education sector was largely 'protected' from budget cuts and retrenchments. The 1999 Education Public Expenditure Review describes the education sector as an 'employment sink' and concludes that teacher employment was maximised at the expense of addressing other urgent resource needs of the education system, in particular classrooms and learning materials. However, with little or no increase in the total number of primary school teachers employed in government schools throughout the 1990s coupled with minimal staff attrition, only around one-quarter of teacher trainee intakes ended up working as teachers in primary schools.

By the late 1990s, it was anticipated that this situation would get even worse. The education PER concluded that 'projections of student numbers suggest that there will be a sharply reduced need for new teachers in the short term'. World Bank experts even recommended that all 35 public teacher-training colleges should be closed own and converted into secondary schools. However, the impact of PEDP has been dramatic; in the space of a few years, the prospect of a large and growing surplus of primary school teachers and an indefinite hiring freeze have been replaced by mounting concerns about how to meet anticipated teacher shortages.[10]

[9] Public service employment fell 30 percent between 1993 and 1998. Target 225,000 by 2002 in which case teachers would account for over a half.

[10] Nearly 40,000 unemployed Grade 'A' graduates were recruited between 2000-2004.

3.3 OCCUPATIONAL SOLIDARITY AND POWER

Strong feelings of professional and workplace solidarity coupled with 'industrial muscle' can provide a significant fillip to the status and vocational commitment of an occupational group. However, both remain weak among teachers in Tanzania. A key reason for this is that teachers were only allowed to form their own independent trade union in 1993 and, even then, its powers were heavily circumscribed. In particular, until very recently, there has been no collective bargaining over pay and other conditions of service and strikes have been illegal.

Well over half of the teachers at the survey schools in Muleba and Temeke disagree with the statement that 'teachers at this school think that their trade union is doing a good job' (see Table 2.2). Only one teacher focus group in each location agreed with this statement. This is despite the fact that most teachers belong to the Tanzania Teachers Union and are obliged to pay a membership levy of two percent of their pay. Levels of union activity are quite low, especially in Muleba.[11]

A Teacher Service Commission was established in 1986 in order to support the professional interests of teachers. However, the Commission was largely ineffectual and has now been disbanded. There is also widespread confusion about who exactly is the teacher's employer. According to the Public Service Act, the newly created Teacher Service Department in the Civil Service Department (which has replaced the TSC) is the formal 'appointing authority' but, with decentralisation, district and municipal councils 'enter into contracts of service and are responsible for the payment of salaries'. At the very least, such fragmentation of key human resource functions does little to promote a sense of professionalism and occupational solidarity among teachers. Certainly, neither teachers nor their trade union want local councils to become their employer.

[11] Males are more likely to attend unions meetings than their female colleagues. 63 percent and 33 percent of male teachers at the survey schools in Temeke and Muleba respectively had attended at least one meeting during the previous 12 months compared to 44 percent and 0 percent among female teacher respondents.

4. TEACHER COMPETENCE

There are two inter-related aspects of occupational motivation- 'will-do' and 'can-do'. Will-do motivation refers to the extent to which an employee has adopted the organisations goals and objectives. Can-do motivation, on the other hand, focuses on factors that influence the capacity of individuals to realise organisational goals. For example, a teacher may be highly committed to the attainment of the school's learning goals, but she may lack the necessary competencies to teach effectively, which ultimately becomes de-moralising and de-motivating. The actual and perceived competence of primary school teachers is therefore a key issue.

4.1 OVERALL ASSESSMENT

Teachers at the rural survey schools have less formal schooling than their colleagues working at the urban survey schools; 37 percent of teachers in Muleba have only primary education compared to 25 percent in Temeke.[12]

All except one of the teacher focus groups agreed that 'teachers in this school have the knowledge and skills to do their jobs well'. Similarly, only small minorities of teacher questionnaire respondents disagreed with this statement - 13 percent in Muleba and 4 percent in Temeke (see Table 2). Teacher interviewees were also generally quite satisfied with their teaching competence. Head teachers estimated that 22 percent of teachers in Muleba and only 4 percent in Temeke have 'poor competence' and that, given a free hand, they would dismiss only 12 percent of teachers in Muleba and 2 percent in Temeke on grounds of incompetence.

However, these views are in marked contrast to the conclusions of nearly all external assessments during the last decade of teaching and learning outcomes in primary schools. This is despite the fact that, nationally, the overall qualification profile of primary school teachers has improved appreciably since the early 1990s. In 1991, only 34 percent of teachers were Grade A but, by 2004, this figure had increased to 58 percent. Most recently, the 2004 PEDP Review Team expressed serious concerns about the overall teaching practice of primary school teachers. It concludes that 'the overall quality of teaching is poor' (p.34). In particular, it is mainly teacher-centred with little use of textbooks and other learning materials.

A key reason for unsatisfactory teaching standards in primary schools is that the quality of pre-service teacher training is poor with two-thirds of teacher trainers under-qualified.[13] The academic background of teacher trainees is also weak, which has been lowered still further by the PEDP policy of ensuring gender parity in pre-service teacher training intakes.[14] Slightly more than 40 percent of female recruits in 2003 for the new accelerated, 1+1 pre-service teacher training programme had only a division four pass in their 'O' level examinations. Despite inadequate academic

---

12 However, in the much larger Haki Elimu Survey, 40 per cent of rural teachers had only primary education compared to less than 10 per cent in urban schools.

13 Teaching trainers get paid little more than classroom teachers.

14 Apart from English and Kiswahili, about 60 percent of trainees had obtained Grade D or lower in their 'O' level examinations in subjects they are training to teach in primary school.

preparation, the teacher- training model continues to be based on the assumption that students have adequate subject knowledge and concentrates on pedagogy.

Previous reports have made similar observations.[15] The on teacher training report prepared for the Education Sector Review Development Programme noted that the 'teacher education institutions have tended to produce half-baked teachers due to the inadequate preparation of teacher educators' (p. 3).

4.2 IMPROVEMENT STRATEGY

Despite these concerns, the reform of the teacher training system has not been adequately addressed by the PEDP. There are three main areas where efforts are being made to improve teacher competence, namely teacher qualification upgrading, the accelerated pre-service teacher training programme, and continuous professional development.

Teacher upgrading

The competence of Grade B/C has been consistently identified by external reviews as a serious constraint to the attainment of effective learning outcomes. The reliance on primary school leavers during the UPE era led to a 'cascade of criticism from parents and government officials' (Sumra, 2004, p. 29). To make matters worse, these teachers were trained 'haphazardly in order to meet the demands of the time' (ERSDP, 2000, Annex 12 p.12).

In order to resolve this problem, in 1999, the MOEC announced that all Grade B/C teachers would be given five years to upgrade their qualification to Grade A. Failure to do so would lead to dismissal. However, most of these teachers have only been able to enrol on an in-service distance learning programme, which is poorly resourced, and most have struggled to find the time to meet course requirements. Consequently, dropout rates have been high and pass rates low, which is demoralising for teachers. Currently, 25,000 (i.e. 50 percent) of Grade B/C teachers are upgrading to Grade A. However, given the acute shortage of primary school teachers that has resulted from the rapid expansion of primary school enrolments between 2001 and 2003, the 1999 upgrading policy has been effectively shelved. Even so, it has engendered considerable anxiety among many of the targeted teachers.

Around one-third of teachers in Temeke are not happy with the opportunities for upgrading their professional qualifications compared to only 4 per cent in Muleba (see Table 2.3). This is probably because most teachers in Temeke are Grade A and the scope for upgrading to diploma level is limited. It should also be pointed though that over 80 percent of teachers in both locations are currently studying for further qualifications of one sort or another, which reflects the strong desire on the part of most teachers to advance their careers.

[15] The 1990 World Bank study found that there are 'no staff development plan for teachers, and in-service training is developed haphazardly by numerous institutions whose activities are uncoordinated and limited by lack of financial and human resources' (World Bank, 1990, p. 23).

Accelerated pre-service teacher training

To meet the rapidly growing need for fully qualified primary school teachers, an accelerated training programme has replaced the traditional, college-based, pre-service training course. Since 2002, teacher trainees spend only one year in college (instead of two) and are then posted to schools for supported on the job training for another year. Teacher trainees are given substantive teaching responsibilities and are paid 80 percent of the Grade 'A' starting salary.

The TTU sees this new 1+1 crash training programme as part of a wider attempt by government and the donors to reduce the income and power of teachers. In particular, the union believes that only one year of formal study in college is far too short to establish a strong sense of teacher identity and professionalism. The 2004 PEDP Review Team also has serious concerns about the programme. In particular, the previous two-year curriculum has been crammed into one year, (which means that there is insufficient subject content), teachers are not adequately supported and mentored (particularly by their colleges during the second year), and their teaching allowances are paid very late. Most trainees 'are very fearful of being posted to remote schools and being forgotten' (p. 36).

Continuous professional development

It is MOEC policy that teachers should receive an average of ten days of in-service training a year. However, for most teachers, in-service training remains very patchy, poor quality, and ad hoc. The accelerated, pre-service training programme is also increasingly crowding out in-service training activities at the teacher training colleges. The 400 teacher resource centres are ineffective mainly because they lack operational budgets.

Table 4.1: Teacher interviewee ratings of in-service training Provision by grade (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA		TEMEKE	
	A	**B/C**	**A**	**B/C**
Adequate	50	62	33	40
Fairly adequate	0	0	0	40
Not adequate	50	38	66	20

Source: School survey

Table 4.1 shows that Grade A teachers at the survey schools are less satisfied with their in-service training activities than Grade B/C teachers and, perhaps surprisingly, the teachers in the rural district are more satisfied with their in-service training.

5. WORKING AND LIVING CONDITIONS

The overall quality of the environment in which teachers live and work powerfully influences overall levels of job satisfaction and motivation. This is even more so when, as is the case in Tanzania, teachers often have little choice about where they work. There are many contributory factors that create a good work environment. In schools, the most important are the size and quality of classrooms, teacher workloads (number of pupils in each class and teaching and other activities), pupil behaviour, teacher management and support and living conditions.

5.1 OVERALL ASSESSMENT

The 1990 World Bank study highlighted the 'harsh professional environment' in which teachers have to work. The study also concluded that most teachers find poor working conditions 'more discouraging than their salary levels' (p. 22).

The results of the school survey suggest that poor working conditions can be just as trying for teachers working in urban schools as in rural schools. Nearly half of the teacher questionnaire respondents in Temeke rated their own working conditions as 'very poor' or 'poor' compared to only one-quarter in Muleba (see Table 2.3). The responses of the teacher focus groups and the teacher questionnaire respondents to a similar statement ('the working environment at this school is adequate') are also indicative of high levels of discontentment. Only one group in Temeke and two in Muleba agreed with this statement. Well over half of the teacher interviewees in both locations rated their working conditions as 'de-motivating' (see Table 5.1). Women teachers in Muleba are particularly unhappy.

Table 5.1: Teacher interviewee ratings of working conditions (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA		TEMEKE	
	Female	**Male**	**Female**	**Male**
Motivating	0	0	7	0
Fairly motivating	14	44	43	33
De-motivating	86	56	50	66

Source: School survey

Good working relations between teachers are a key motivator, particularly for teachers posted to more remote and difficult locations. All the teacher focus groups (except one in Muleba) agree with the statement that 'teachers at this school work well together'. There is also a high level of agreement among the teacher questionnaire respondents.

5.2 SCHOOL LOCATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE

In early 1990s, the TADREG Survey found that at least half of the schools in both urban and rural areas that were visited were in 'a state of disrepair'. Not surprisingly, therefore, classroom construction has been a major focus of the PEDP. Despite this, only around one-quarter of teacher interviewees in Temeke rated the location of their school as 'unattractive'. The lack of proper fencing creates security problems in many

urban schools. As one teacher in Temeke put it,'the school compound is no good because it is always penetrated by thugs and other unwanted people'. Classroom construction in rural areas has to date still been quite limited. For example, only one of the schools in Muleba has attractive buildings.

5.3 TEACHER WORKLOAD

Except for Standards 1 and 2, specialised subject teachers are responsible for all teaching in primary schools in Tanzania. This is quite unusual since class teachers are the norm in most primary school systems in sub-Saharan Africa and elsewhere. It is perhaps surprising therefore that, as part of PEDP, subject teaching has been extended to Standards 3 and 4. As with secondary school teachers, subject teachers tend to have relatively low teaching loads compared to class teachers who usually spend most of the school day with their own class.

Reaching robust conclusions about the level and trends in teacher workloads is quite complicated. A lot of detailed information is required about what teachers actually do each day, which can only be obtained with any real accuracy over relatively long, multi-day visits to representative schools. Although this kind of research has never been undertaken in Tanzania, there is nonetheless a widespread perception that primary school teachers have relatively light workloads. This was certainly a key conclusion of the 1990 World Bank study. However, many argue that PEDP has led to a significant intensification of teacher's work mainly as a result of larger classes and the introduction of double shifting. There have been repeated calls for the 'rationalisation' of primary teaching loads. A target of 40 periods per week (27 hours) is now official policy.

School and class size

The official pupil-teacher ratio norm is 45. The national PTR increased by exactly 50 percent - from 38 to 59 - between 1998 and 2004 (see Table 5.2). The main reason for this is that primary school enrolments increased by 74 percent, but the total number of teachers in post increased by only 13 percent. The PTRs at the survey schools are almost the same (59 Muleba, 61 Temeke). However, PTRs are as high as 90 in some districts (see Chapter 7).

With the rapid increase in enrolments, many urban primary schools have become unmanageably large. Many primary schools in Dar es Salaam have well over 2000 pupils. To deal with this problem, the MOEC has established an enrolment ceiling of 840 pupils for primary schools.

Table 5.2: Total enrolments, repeaters, teachers and streams at primary schools, 1995-2004 (rounded '000)

Year	Enrolments	Repetition	Teachers	Streams	Pupil-teacher Ratio	Stream-teacher Ratio	Enrolment-stream Ratio	Repetition Rate	Transition Rate Form 1
1995	3872	74	105	108	36.9	1.0	35.9	1.9	14.6
1996	3943	114	109	109	36.2	1.0	36.2	2.9	16.9
1997	4058	84	110	112	36.9	1.0	36.2	2.1	15
1998	4046	110	106	112	38.2	1.1	36.1	2.7	19.1
1999	4190	133	104	116	40.3	1.1	36.1	3.2	18.8
2000	4371	115	107	121	40.9	1.1	36.1	2.6	21.7
2001	4876	123	106	130	46.0	1.2	37.5	2.5	22.4
2002	5960	144	112	151	53.2	1.3	39.5	2.4	21.7
2003	6532	388	115	166	56.8	1.4	39.3	5.9	30.1
2004	7042	376	120	190	58.7	1.6	37.1	5.3	na

Source: MOEC/EMIS

Teaching load and working hours

According to the1990 World Bank study, primary school teachers taught for an average of only 16 hours each week in urban schools and 19 hours in rural schools. When all other activities are included (in particular preparation and marking), the overall workload was 27 hours in urban and 32 hours in rural primary schools. As civil servants, teachers are expected to work a 35-hour week. The report notes that 'increasing workloads could have important benefits. If teachers taught more hours a week, fewer of them would be needed and the resulting budgetary savings could then be used to increase teacher's salaries. Also, more classes could be added, enabling more students to attend school' (p. 19).

The average number of teaching periods per week at the survey schools is 30.4 (19.9 hours) in Muleba and considerably less than this - 23.9 periods (15.1 hours)- in Temeke.[16] Nearly 40 percent of teachers in Muleba teach more than 30 periods, but only 12 percent of teachers in Temeke (see Table 5.3). If these two districts are representative of rural and urban locations then it would appear that the teaching load has decreased slightly in urban schools and increased slightly in rural schools since 1990. The total workload reported by teachers in both locations is 25-26 hours, which in the case of Muleba is appreciably lower than the 32 hours reported for rural primary schools in 1990. Rural primary school teachers may be compensating for higher teaching loads by reducing the amount of time on other activities, in particular preparation, marking and extra-curricular activities (see Table 5.4). More generally, 'the understaffing of rural schools results in the timetable slipping to an alarming extent. Classes are frequently unattended by teachers and children spend much of the afternoon playing outside' (Barrett, 2004b).

Table 5.3: Percentage breakdown of weekly periods taught at survey schools

	MULEBA	TEMEKE
<10	4	5
10 to 15	4	3
15-20	0	9
21-25	18	32
26-30	36	40
30>	39	12

Source: School survey

By international standards, teaching and workloads for teachers in Tanzania are reported to be relatively low. However, the TTU believes that teaching load norms should be reduced to 25 periods per week for primary school teachers, and 24 and 20 periods for lower and upper secondary teachers respectively.

The large variations in the number of periods taught by teachers in the same school can generate a strong sense of unfairness, which is further compounded by the lack of performance-based promotion (see below). This tends to be seriously de-motivating

[16] The Haki Elimu Survey also reports much heavier workloads among rural primary and secondary school teachers. Almost half of teachers in rural schools teach more than 30 periods a week compared to only 20 percent among urban teachers.

for teachers with relatively large teaching loads. The teaching load of Grade C teachers in Muleba is also relatively high. Further research is needed in order to establish if this is typical in rural areas.

Table 5.4: Time allocation between teacher work activities (hours/week)

ACTIVITY	MULEBA	TEMEKE
Preparation	2.3	3.1
Marking	2	4.4
Teaching	19.9	15.1
Extra duties	0.9	2.3

Source: School survey

Multiple shifting

The Cooksey Survey found that one-quarter of primary schools were operating double shifts in 1990. EMIS data suggests that the incidence of teachers having to work more than one shift has increased appreciably since then. In particular, the stream-teacher ratio for all primary schools rose from 1.1 in 2000 to 1.6 in 2004. However, the length of each shift is now typically only around four-five hours at most schools.[17]

Most of the survey schools were operating a double shift. However in Temeke, only I in 10 of the teachers stated that they were teaching in more than one shift compared to one in five teachers in Muleba.

Over and under staffing

The formula for calculating the number of streams and thus teachers in each primary school is based on the PTR norm of 45.[18] Given the continuing shortage of classrooms, urban teachers tend to have larger classes, but lower teaching loads. Because urban primary schools tend to be so overcrowded, this gives the impression that teachers at these schools have to work harder, when in fact this is generally not the case. Typically, teachers in urban primary schools spend more time in the staff room marking exercise books and preparing lessons than they spend in the classroom.

5.4 PUPIL BEHAVIOUR

In some countries, particularly in Europe and North America, pupil misbehaviour is a major de-motivator for teachers, which can lead to very high rates of teacher stress and attrition. In Tanzania, this does not appear to be such a burning issue. While most of the teacher focus groups in Muleba and Temeke disagreed with the statement that 'the behaviour of pupils in class is not a problem for teachers at this school', nearly all teacher questionnaire respondents agreed with this statement and teacher interviewees rarely mentioned pupil behaviour.

[17] Attendance patterns for each standard are frequently quite complicated. For example, the hours of attendance at one of the Temeke survey schools are as follows: Stds. 1 and 2 1100-1530, Std. 3 1100-1630, Std 4 and 5 0730-1200, and Stds. 6 and 7 0730-1400.

[18] Interestingly, though, head teachers at the survey schools did not know how many teacher vacancies they had at their school.

Pupils at rural primary schools are generally well behaved. In urban areas, teachers have more trouble controlling the movements of pupils in and out of the school, especially where schools do not have adequate security fences, which is still common.

5.5 TEACHER MANAGEMENT

The quality of management at all levels (school, district, region and Ministry headquarters) is critically important in ensuring that teachers are adequately motivated. Management effectiveness is the combined outcome of management systems and the commitment and competence of individual managers. Teachers in most rural schools feel particularly isolated, which in turn increases the importance of good school management. As noted early, younger teachers posted to rural schools often have a strong fear of being forgotten.

Considerable scope exists to improve the management capacities of head teachers at the survey schools. A key reason for this is that head teachers have generally received little or no good quality management training.[19] Only one of the schools in Temeke was exceptionally well managed and the impact that this has on teacher motivation and performance is clearly evident. In Muleba, no quality management was clearly observable at any of the survey schools.

Teacher interviewees at eight out of the ten survey schools are averagely satisfied with how their schools are managed. Seven out of the 10 teacher focus groups (two in Temeke and one in Muleba) disagreed with or were not sure about the statement that 'teachers in this school are well managed.' Similarly, only 43 percent and 18 percent of teacher questionnaire respondents agreed with this statement in Muleba and Temeke respectively (see Table 5.5). However, the large majority of these respondents still feel that their 'head teacher leads by example' and that they do not spend too much time away from schools either on official duties or doing their own private business. Most also agreed with the statement that 'the head teacher regularly observes classes at this school'.

School governance

Ensuring effective accountability of teachers and school managers to parents and communities has become a major policy objective in recent years. This is to be achieved through improved school governance with School Management Committees expected to play a major role in all aspects of school management, including the utilisation of the recently introduced per capitation grants. However, progress to date with respect to school governance is limited, mainly because SMCs have only been recently established in most primary schools, parents tend to be mainly concerned with improvements to school facilities and know very little about the teaching process, and social capital is often quite limited, especially in very poor and depressed urban locations.

[19] The ADEM in Bagamayo runs management training courses for all MOEC staff..

Table 5.5: Teacher questionnaire responses to management-related statements (rounded percentages)

STATEMENT	MULEBA			TEMEKE		
	Disagree	Not sure	Agree	Disagree	Not sure	Agree
Teachers at this school are well managed	13	43	43	26	55	18
Our head teacher leads by example	11	4	86	11	11	78
Our head teacher is often away from school on official duties	46	4	50	65	16	19
Our head teacher is often away from school on private business	86	7	7	83	12	5
Our head teacher regularly observes classes	0	7	93	3	7	90
School inspectors regularly visit this school	26	4	70	8	9	83
Teacher transfers are managed well and fairly	18	39	43	7	11	82
Teacher salaries are paid on time	73	10	17	78	10	12
HIV/AIDS has not had a big impact on teachers at this school	17	21	62	9	32	60
Teachers at this school come to work hungry	57	32	11	38	41	21
Teacher absenteeism is not a problem at this school	52	11	37	37	14	49
Teachers at this school come to work on time	17	0	83	7	10	83

Source: School survey

System management

There are longstanding concerns about the overall management of the public education system in Tanzania. One stakeholder interviewee described the public education system as 'a circus without a ringleader'. Basic functions are poorly managed. Teachers are particularly disgruntled about the payment of salaries and allowances (see Table 5.5).

The 1990 World Bank report noted that the Inspectorate is well staffed and that most teachers are inspected annually. Most teacher questionnaire respondents in both locations agreed with the statement that 'inspectors regularly visit this school'. However, stakeholder interviewees (including inspectors) stated that staffing shortages and other resource constraints (most notably transport) prevent most primary school inspectors making regular visits to rural schools. Primary school inspectors are based in districts. Most have to endure poor working conditions and lack suitable transport to be able to visit schools as prescribed. Consequently, teachers are isolated and are under relatively little pressure to perform.

In the short term at least, decentralisation has complicated and, in some key areas, negatively impacted on the management of primary schools. In particular, a relatively large number of Councils have re-directed money intended for teacher allowances to other uses.

5.6 LIVING CONDITIONS

The living conditions for most teachers are unsatisfactory and, for many, they are 'intolerable'. The availability of reasonable quality and affordable housing within easy travelling distance of the school is a key issue for nearly all teachers.

Marital status and spouse separation

A sizeable majority of teachers in both Muleba and Temeke are married and are living with their spouses (see Table 5.6). However, over one-third of female teachers working at schools in Muleba are, for whatever reasons, separated from their spouses, which could be an important de-motivator.

Table 5.6: Marital status of teachers at survey schools (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA		TEMEKE	
	Female	**Male**	**Female**	**Male**
Married	64	89	74	64
Living with spouse	63	84	79	78

Source: School survey

Housing

Housing conditions for primary school teachers are generally poor. The scarcity of 'decent accommodation' is a constant refrain of nearly all reports, both official and by independent researchers. The 1990 World Bank report states that 'typically, rural primary teachers live in dilapidated, poorly-maintained school or government accommodation on or near the school compound'. The TADREG Survey similarly concludes that 'most houses are in a sorry state of disrepair'.[20]

Almost all teacher interviewees and head teachers at the survey schools commented on the lack of decent housing. Only 2 percent of teachers at these schools are housed (Muleba 3.4 percent, Temeke 1.7 percent). Most inspector reports also highlight teacher complaints about their housing conditions.[21]

Government made various commitments to improve teacher's housing during the 1990s. Most notably, the high profile report on the Education Sector Towards 2000 stated that 'efforts will be made to ensure that all schools and colleges have, in their vicinity, an adequate number of teachers' quarters. ... By 2000 all teachers shall have suitable housing accommodation' (MOEC, 1997). Despite these commitments, very little progress has been made in improving the housing situation. According to EMIS, nearly 10,000 government houses for teachers were built between 1991 and 2004. However, the overall share of primary school teachers who could be housed only increased from 24 to 27 percent. In other words, most teachers still have to find their own accommodation.

[20] Housing conditions for secondary teachers have generally been much better. 'The overwhelming majority of secondary teachers live in a modern style house with electricity and water' (World Bank, 1990, p.23), but rents tend to be high in relation to salaries.

[21] EMIS data indicate that 6.5 percent of teachers in Temeke were housed in 2004. The data for Muleba appears to be incorrect since there are reported to be 1563 houses for 1297 teachers. *and* 19 percent of teachers in Muleba were housed in 2000.

To date, PEDP has also failed to tackle the housing issue. During 2003 and 2004, only around 20 percent of the housing budget was disbursed.[22] Numerous reasons are advanced for this 'woeful performance' (p. 28) and the serious imbalance between the number of classrooms and houses built. The lack of political commitment is a major factor. Both politicians and community leaders tend to be mainly interested in building classrooms. Some even suggest that communities are resentful of teachers being accommodated in better houses than their own. Understandably, local teachers usually prefer to stay in their own homes.

Travel to school

Many teachers have to commute long distances between home and school, which is time-consuming, costly and tiring. This issue is particularly acute for urban teachers. The TADGREG Survey found in 1990 that only around one-third of urban teachers lived near their school compared to three-quarters among rural teachers. The average distance from home to school is 10 kilometres for teachers at the Temeke survey schools, but only three kilometres in Muleba. Consequently, nearly all teachers in Muleba walk to school whereas over half of teachers in Temeke have to commute by bus.

Medical aid

Teachers in Temeke, complained bitterly about the government's medical aid scheme, to which they are obliged to contribute 3 percent of their salary. The quality of the service they receive at government health facilities is very poor, especially because drugs prescribed to them are not available. However, teachers in Muleba were a lot more positive about the scheme mainly because the locally assigned hospitals provide a reasonably good service.

5.7 THE IMPACT OF THE AIDS EPIDEMIC

The AIDS epidemic in the worst affected countries in Africa is expected to lower seriously the morale and productivity of teachers as a result of higher levels of morbidity (sickness) and mortality. Even for teachers who are not directly affected, workloads are likely to increase as teachers are asked to cover for sick colleagues who are no longer able to work on a regular basis.

The 2004 PEDP Review noted that 'the prevalence of HIV/AIDS related diseases and symptoms among teachers is rising alarmingly' (p.48). On the basis of fragmentary data collected during district visits, the report estimates that 'optimistically', the mortality rate among teachers is 3.5 percent annually. However, EMIS data gives a very different picture with an overall mortality rate (i.e. both AIDS and non-AIDS related deaths) among primary school teachers of 0.75 percent in 2004.[23] Nonetheless, the number of teacher deaths (from all causes) has increased appreciably - from 345 (0.37 percent) in 1991 to 893 in 2004. Teacher mortality rates vary very

[22] Only 20 percent of the planned 5611 houses were built in 2002.

[23] Data provided by the Teacher Service Commission give slightly higher levels of mortality. According to this source, the mortality rate for all teachers was ***1*** percent in 2002.

considerably across the country. Six regions (Dar es Salaam, Iringa, Kagera, Mbeya, Morogoro, and Mwanza) accounted for 54 percent of all deaths in 2004, but employed only 38 percent of all teachers. Iringa Region had the highest mortality rate of 1.7 percent and Arusha and Manyara the lowest with 0.2 percent.

The results of the Adult AIDS Mortality Study since the early 1990s also show that the impact of the epidemic is highly variable. In Dar es Salaam, 62 percent of female and 50 percent of male deaths were AIDS-related in 2003, but in Morogoro, the corresponding figures were only 23 percent and 27 percent respectively (see AAMP, 2004).

Although HIV prevalence rates are believed to be much higher among females, there was hardly any difference between female and male mortality rates among primary school teachers in 2004. In fact, male mortality rates were much higher throughout the 1990s.

The results of the school survey suggest however that, for most schools, the epidemic has not had a serious impact to date. None of the teacher focus groups in Muleba and Temeke disagreed with the statement 'the impact of HIV/AIDS on teachers at this school has not been serious'. Similarly, only 10 percent of teacher questionnaire respondents disagreed with this statement (Muleba 17 percent and Temeke 9 percent). One head teacher interviewee indicated that there is one sick teacher at his school and two others stated that two teachers had died in 2003 and three during 2002 and 2003. But, generally speaking, both head teachers and teachers believe that the epidemic has not significantly affected teachers at their schools. The overall mortality rate during the last year for the Muleba survey schools was 3.5 percent and 0 percent in Temeke. Fewer than two percent of teachers stated that they were in poor health. As yet, teachers in Tanzania have not been able to access life-prolonging anti-retroviral drugs. But in countries where they have been able to do so (most notably Botswana), there has been a major impact on morbidity and mortality (see Bennell, 2004).

6. PAY AND OTHER BENEFITS

Surprisingly little analysis of teacher remuneration has been undertaken in Tanzania. In part, this may be because there has been no collective bargaining over pay. To date, the TTU has been mainly preoccupied with allowances rather than the level and structure of basic pay.

6.1 PAY LEVELS

Net pay

The net starting salary of a Grade IIIA primary school teacher is currently T.Sh. 69,000 per month (US$60.6). The average net salary was higher in the rural survey schools (T.Sh. 97,000 compared to T.Sh. 90,400) because rural teachers tend to have more work experience. .

Take home pay increases only very slowly with experience so that a primary school teacher with over 30 years experience earns, on average, only 75 percent more than a newly qualified teacher. However, the average net earnings of Grade C teachers at the survey schools are 20 percent higher than Grade A teachers mainly because they generally have more years of teaching service and promotion prospects have been relatively good for primary school teachers as whole.[24] The difference between gross and net pay is around 30 percent for the highest paid teachers, but only 5 percent for those with less than five years experience. Data is not available, but "fresh" primary school teachers probably earn around 40 percent less than newly qualified secondary school teachers. Little is known about teacher pay at private schools although elite international schools pay two-three times more than in government schools.

All teacher and head teacher interviewees indicated that teacher salaries are inadequate. However, while 85 percent of teacher questionnaire respondents at the Temeke survey schools rated their pay as 'very poor' or 'poor', only 30 percent did so in Muleba (see Table 2.3). The main reason for this difference in response is the much higher cost of living in urban areas, and Dar es Salaam in particular. Average household monthly expenditure is nearly 2.5 times the average monthly net teacher salary in Temeke (T.Sh. 231,000) compared to 1.2 times for teachers in Muleba (T.Sh.124,000).[25] Expenditure on some major items (particularly food, housing and transport) is at least twice as high for teachers in Dar es Salaam (see Table 6.1). Teacher's earnings only reach the official Minimum Living Wage of T. Sh. 85,100 (in 2004) after 10-15 years of service. Teachers, especially those in urban areas, manage to survive because other household members are in wage employment[26] or teachers

[24] In the past, secondary school teachers have been resentful of the better promotion prospects enjoyed by primary teachers

[25] According to the 2000/01 Household Expenditure Survey, mean monthly household expenditure in Dar es Salaam was T.Sh. 117,900, 'other urban' T.Sh.78,100, and 'rural' T.Sh. 52,600.

[26] On average, there are 1-2 other wage earners in teacher households in both Muleba and Temeke. The Cooksey study in 1990 reported that half of teachers said there was at least one other wage earner in their household and half of these said that they earned more than they did.

themselves earn additional income from private tuition and other types of secondary employment (see Chapter 7).[27]

Table 6.1: Average monthly expenditure by major item among teachersat survey schools (T.Sh. rounded '000)

	MULEBA	TEMEKE
Housing	10	49
Food	56	100
Transport	16	33
Education	23	30
Health	19	19
Total	124	231

Source: School survey

Around one-third of teacher questionnaire respondents and (all the focus groups) in Temeke agreed with the statement that 'teachers sometimes come to school hungry'. In Muleba, only 20 percent agreed with this statement (see Table 6.1).

The influential 2002 World Bank study on the financing of Education For All in developing countries argues that, as a general norm, teacher's pay in low income developing countries should, on average, be equal to 3.5 times Gross Domestic Product per capita (see Bruns et al, 2002). Average net pay among teachers at the survey primary schools is T.Sh. 96,600, which is 3.3 times GDP per capita. However, given that current pay levels are so far below survival income levels for most teachers, the World Bank salary norm is not helpful in the Tanzanian context. The 2003 PEDP Review also notes that 'there is no strong evidence that teachers are overly compensated for their qualifications and skills in the context of the Tanzanian labour market, particularly with regard to the pay structure of civil servants' (p. 5).

The 1990 World Bank study stated that 'substantial increases in salaries are essential if educational improvement efforts are to be successful' (p. iv) ... To ensure a reasonable standard of living and to increase productivity significantly in the public service would probably require increases by a factor 3 to 5 times their existing levels' (p. 18).[28] In a similar vein, the government's medium term pay policy for the public sector states that 'current salary levels especially for technical and professional groups are too low to sustain an acceptable level of employee motivation and performance' (GOT, 1999, p.1). Furthermore, 'schemes of service are out of line with the corresponding salary structures'. However, acute macroeconomic and fiscal constraints continue to prevent such large pay increase from being awarded. The government's current agreements with the IMF and World Bank do not allow expenditure on public sector salaries to exceed 4.8 percent of GDP. The TTU therefore 'blames the IMF for low teacher pay'.

Both government and donors shy away from looking seriously at teacher pay and other conditions of service because the budgetary implications of increasing

[27] Among the respondents in the Hakie Elimu Survey, 61 percent of urban and 62 percent of rural teachers estimated that their pay would need to increase by at least 75 percent in order to attain 'adequate' levels.

[28] Teacher respondents in the TADREG Survey stated that they needed 'four times the present average salary' in order to meet their basic, minimum household needs.

remuneration substantially are simply too large. Personnel emoluments already account for 90 percent of total recurrent expenditure for primary schools. An important policy target is to reduce this to 80 percent by 2005, which 'may entail retrenchment'.

Allowances

No sizeable allowances, most notably for housing and transport, are currently paid to primary school teachers in Tanzania. However, this has not always been the case. During the 1980s, teachers received a 'teaching allowance', which was around 50 percent of their basic salary. The government removed this allowance in 1989. In the early 1990s, teachers still received a housing allowance of 10 percent of their salary.

Teachers also complain that they are not paid anything extra for teaching double shifts. According to the 2003 PEDP Review Team 'agreed actions' by the government include 'the gradual provision of incentives to teachers involved in double shift teaching', but, to date, this has not been implemented.

6.2 PAY RELATIVITIES

Teacher pay differentials

In accordance with the principles of Ujamaa, the Nyerere Government adopted an egalitarian wage policy during the 1970s. As a result, the salary differential between teachers with the lowest qualification (Grade B) and the highest (science degree) fell from 2.4 to 1.6 between 1978 and 1990. Lower level teachers gained most from the salary awards that were made during the late 1980s. Thus, the 1990 World Bank Report concluded that 'the highest priority is to increase the salary differentials between primary and secondary school teachers'.

Relative pay

Teachers' pay compares favourably with other civil service occupations. Table 6.2 shows that in the early 1990s the starting (gross) pay of Grade 'A' primary teachers was the same as or less than equivalent posts in the health and agriculture sectors, but by 2004 their pay was higher. Thus, it appears that, if anything, the government has been giving preferential treatment to teachers. However, it is argued that teachers have fewer opportunities for job-related secondary income activities (see Chapter 7).

Trends

In real terms, teacher's pay plummeted between the mid 1970s and the late 1980s. The 1990 World Bank study observed that teacher pay is 'grossly inadequate' with salaries at only 35-64 percent of their 1978 levels. Beginning in the early 1990s, the government has made quite concerted efforts to restore teacher's pay to its former levels. Between 1992 and 2004, average net starting pay of teachers increased by 130 percent in real terms. In the last five years, average net pay among teacher interviewees has increased by 34 percent in real terms. However, nearly half of the teacher questionnaire respondents in Temeke (but only 4 percent in Muleba) indicated

that their standard of living had declined during the last five years. Once again, this highlights the very difficult living conditions for teachers in the capital.

Table 6.2: Teacher starting pay compared with equivalent occupations in the public sector (T.Sh. '000/month)

	1990/91	1995/96	2000/01	2004/05
Teacher Grade A	4.5	19.6	51.5	87.1
Teacher Diploma	5	20.7	55.1	108.8
Teacher Degree	5.5	22.5	69	140
Nurse	3.7	19.6	44.3	80.6
Nursing officer	4.5	20.7	48.1	107.9
Assistant medical officer	6.6	24.1	73.6	139.4
Doctor	7.6	25.9	112	210.7
Agriculture assistant	4.5	20.7	48.1	80.6
Assistant agriculture officer	4.5	20.7	48.1	80.6
Livestock officer (degree)	7.4	22.5	112	178.7
Agricultural officer (degree)	6.6	24.1	73.6	139.4
Assistant accountant	4.5	20.7	48.1	107.9
Accountant (degree)	5.5	22.5	67	139.4
Economist (degree)	5.5	22.5	67	139.4
Administrative officer (degree)	5.5	22.5	67	139.4

Source: Civil Service Department

6.3 SALARY ADMINISTRATION

Teachers are resentful about the late payment of salaries and allowances (for leave and transfers). This is particularly the case in rural areas such as Muleba where not only are salaries generally paid late, but teachers have to travel to District Education Offices to pick up their salaries, which is costly both in terms of time and money.[29] Teachers frequently have to queue up in front of a small hatch, which most find undignified and humiliating.

Government has given a commitment that teachers will be paid on time on the 25th of every month. However, three-quarters of the teachers at the survey schools in Muleba and 40 percent in Temeke did not receive their pay until after the 5th of the following month. A common feeling among teachers is that 'teacher salaries and allowances should be paid on time in order to show that the government cares'

Late payment has resulted in sizeable arrears, which the MOEC is having difficulty clearing.[30] In late 2004, a high-level Prime Ministerial Probe Committee was established in order to investigate and make recommendations on salary

[29] The Cooksey Survey found that 56 percent of teachers spent one day or more collecting their salary. Over one-third said that they spent over T.Sh. 500 per month collecting their salary, which is nearly 10 percent of the average teacher salary at that time.

[30] The size of these arrears is contested with MOE claiming that they amount to T.Sh. 4 billion and the TTU T.Sh.18 billion.

administration for teachers.[31] The TTU submission to the Committee highlighted teacher concerns in three major areas:

Poor communication channels: Four government institutions ministries (MOEC, RALG, CSD, MoF) have responsibilities for handling teacher personnel issues.

Inadequate remuneration: Unpaid teachers' allowances have become a burning issue. A good proportion of 'other charges' for teachers end up being paid to district development directors, district commissioners, and education officials. These constitute a substantial part of the budget which otherwise be paid for teacher allowances. Nor do teachers receive transport and subsistence allowances when they are posted to a new school. Teachers are also expected to sign payroll slips without knowing exactly the value of their gross salaries and thus are unable to verify exactly whether they are receiving the correct net pay. Sometimes it takes up to nine months for a newly appointed teacher to receive their first salary payment.

Limited career advancement and development: Promotions are often seriously delayed without obvious cause and are inequitably awarded even among teachers. And once promotions are approved it still takes two-three years for salaries to be adjusted. Long-term study leave is also rarely given to teachers. Most district officials are unable to make proper training needs assessment of their staff.

[31] The Committee's report had still not been released by March 2005.

7. IMPACT ON SERVICE DELIVERY

As with any other occupational group, pay, working and living conditions and other incentives determine the level and patterns of motivation among teachers. Incentives also powerfully influence the deployment of teachers to schools across the country. It is widely believed that low levels of job satisfaction and motivation are adversely affecting teacher behaviour in Tanzania, which in turn is resulting in lower quality education. Demoralised teachers are likely to want to find another occupation, be absent or late to work, and not do what is expected of them in the classroom in order to meet the learning needs of their pupils. They may even engage in unethical behaviour, such as excessive drinking and sexual relationships with pupils.

This chapter considers the extent to which these concerns can be substantiated both with respect to teacher deployment and key aspects of teacher behaviour, most notably resignations, absenteeism, indiscipline and learning outcomes.

7.1 TEACHER DEPLOYMENT

The major staffing challenge for public education systems in most low-income developing countries is how to achieve an equitable spatial distribution of teachers between rural and urban areas. The perceived unattractiveness of working in rural schools is usually compounded by the lack of additional incentives for teachers to work in these locations. As a consequence, rural schools generally have relatively less qualified and experienced teachers, teacher turnover is higher and, with higher vacancy rates, teachers have to work harder than their colleagues in urban schools.

It is difficult to analyse deployment issues in Tanzania mainly because it is not possible to breakdown schools by rural and urban locations using EMIS data. However, almost all major reviews and education policy documents comment on the serious problems caused by poor teacher deployment. Most recently, the 2004 PEDP Review Team observes that, generally speaking, ‘the proportions of Grade ‘A’ teachers and female teachers decrease as one moves away from district centres’ (p.35).

Detailed information is not available, but a disproportionate share of newly qualified teachers are from better-off, mainly urban-based households and they are not therefore accustomed to coping with the additional problems of living in rural areas. Moreover, the incentives to work in towns continue to increase mainly because the scope for secondary employment and the opportunities for further study are so much less than in rural areas.

Qualification, experience and gender profiles

According to the TTU/Haki Elimu Survey, in 2003, only 8 percent of (primary and secondary) teachers at urban schools had only primary school education compared to 32 percent of teachers at rural schools. With respect to professional training, 71 percent and 38 percent of urban and rural teachers respectively had the Grade ‘A’ qualification.

The overall qualification profile of primary school teachers has improved appreciably in recent years. In 1991, only one percent of districts had more than half Grade 'A' teachers, but, by 2004, this had increased to 81 percent. Even so, the degree of inequality in the distribution of fully qualified teachers was greater in 2004 than in 1991 (see Table 7.1).[32]

Table 7.1: Spatial distribution of diploma and grade A primary school teachers across district in Tanzania, 1991-2004

	Number of Districts with these Proportions of Diploma and a Grade Teachers							
Year	**10 to 19%**	**20-29%**	**30-39%**	**40-49%**	**50-59%**	**60-69%**	**70-79%**	**80%>**
2004	0	1	2	18	46	29	14	1
1996	0	3	39	45	10	3	0	0
1991	3	44	37	12	1	0	0	0

Notes: Numbers in each cell show the number of districts with this proportion of diploma and A grade teachers
Source: MOEC/EMIS

Experience profiles of teachers cannot be generated from EMIS data. It is likely though that, given the higher proportions of Grade B/C teachers in rural areas (most of whom were recruited during the UPE era in the mid-late 1970s), these teachers are more experienced than in the urban areas. This certainly is the case at the survey schools. The average years of teaching experience is 17.5 years in Muleba and 12.5 years in Temeke.

A gender-balanced teaching force is critically important in order to eliminate educational attainment disparities between girls and boys. In the early 1990s, half of female teachers were working in urban schools compared to only 30 percent among male teachers. With the increasing share of female teachers in the primary education system, this gender inequality in the spatial distribution of female teachers is likely to have increased considerably since then.

Workload

The most widely used indicator for measuring variations in teacher workload is the pupil-teacher ratio. Primary school teachers in Tanzania are deployed according to prevailing vacancy rates in the districts, which are derived on the basis of the official PTR staffing norm of 1:45. Table 7.2 shows that the PTR varies very considerably across districts and that this variation has been increasing during the last 10-15 years. It is also noticeable that 'urban' designated districts have much lower PTRs. Nine out of the 13 districts with PTRs of less than 45 are 'urban'. On the basis of an examination of regional PTRs, the 2004 PEDP Review Team concludes that 'teacher deployment is not being undertaken on an equitable basis' (p. 44).

Table 7.2: Regional variations in pupil-teacher ratio, 2004

PTR	**20-30**	**31-39**	**40-49**	**50-59**	**60-69**	**70-79**	**80-89**	**90>**
Number of districts	2	6	26	34	32	13	2	3

Source: MOEC/EMIS

[32] Standard deviation was bb in 1991 and nn in 2004.

Another key indicator of teaching load is the stream-teacher ratio. Table 7.3 presents EMIS data for 2004. Although these ratios vary very considerable across the country, in all but two districts, teachers are responsible for at least one stream (class). In 18 districts, the average STR is over two, which indicates that there are very serious teacher shortages. Eight of these under-staffed districts are in the predominantly rural and remoter Kagera and Mwanza Regions.

The school survey gives a more detailed picture concerning spatial differences in teacher workloads. The average STR in Muleba is 1.32 compared to only 0.7 in Temeke, which again is indicative of over-staffing in urban schools. According to the World Bank study, the STRs for 'non-urban' and urban primary schools in 1990 were 1.03 and 0.7 respectively. Assuming that the school survey districts are representative of urban and rural schools as a whole, the workload of rural teachers may therefore have increased considerably during the last 15 years, but decreased slightly for urban teachers. As noted earlier, a key reason for urban over-staffing is that MOEC is obliged to post most married female teachers to schools in urban areas in order that they can be with their [33]spouses. Married women probably now account for 40 per cent of all primary school teachers. Given this staffing constraint, the current policy of increasing the proportion of female teachers could seriously frustrate another key objective, namely the equitable staffing of primary schools, especially in rural areas where poverty is most concentrated and educational under-provision is most acute.

Table 7.3: Variation in stream-teacher ratios across districts, 2004

	<1.0	**1-1.1**	**1.2-1.3**	**1.4-1.5**	**1.6-1.7**	**1.8-1.9**	**2.0>**
Number of districts	2	9	20	31	25	12	18

Source: MOEC/EMIS

It is alleged that PEDP (and especially the abolition of school fees) has led to more rapid increases in enrolments in urban areas, which has pushed up class sizes. However, the numbers of teachers employed at urban schools invariably far exceeds the combined number of streams, which are usually taught in two (morning and afternoon) shifts. Thus, it is the shortage of classrooms rather than teachers that is the critical constraint.

7.2 TEACHER POSTINGS

The centralisation of teacher recruitment and deployment in Tanzania has been recognised as a major problem for many years. The Basic Education Medium Term Strategy 1997-2000 states that deployment problems will be 'addressed by greater delegation to district/school authorities' (p. 5). However, in order to try to redress persistent inequities in the deployment of teachers, MOEC head office still centrally deploys newly qualified teachers. With continued annual deployments of large numbers of these teachers coupled with much reduced (inter-district) transfer opportunities, centralised deployment could lead to a fairly rapid reduction in urban-rural staffing disparities. The key issue is the extent to which newly trained teachers actually take up and stay in their assigned posts. In the early 1990s, the World Bank

[33] The MOEC in 2003 was seeking to post teachers to needy areas without considering their marital status. Alternatively teachers could be hired directly by councils on application so marital status was not to be a factor.

report notes that 'most teachers do not accept assignments far from home' (p. cc). This still appears to be a problem.[34] In 2003, for example, nearly 2000 out of 9000 newly qualified teachers refused to be posted to their assigned schools.[35] As a result, some remoter areas received only 50 percent of the new teachers allocated to them. The 2003 PEDP Review Team found that 'in 2002, there was some reallocation of teachers towards and within rural areas, but this process did not go very far'.

Unlike other countries, bribery is not common in either the recruitment or deployment of teachers in Tanzania. Moreover, 'only a handful' of primary school teachers use 'connections' in order to get their desired postings. However, the 1999 Education Public Expenditure Review noted that that head teachers at secondary schools have little or no control over the recruitment of teachers. 'There appears to be considerable pressure to recruit the spouses of civil servants who are qualified secondary teachers, regardless of the establishment controls that the Civil Service Department attempts to maintain and this seems to result in excess teacher numbers in most if not all the urban areas'.

7.3 TEACHER TURNOVER

There is a high level of teacher turnover in primary schools in Tanzania. Almost one in five teachers at the rural survey schools had left in the previous year. Interestingly, though, turnover among teachers at these rural survey

Table 7.4: Rates of teacher turnover by reason during 2003 school year

District	Overall	Transfer	Promotion	Study leave	Resignation	Retirement	Death	Medical	Dismissal	Other
Muleba	18.6	10.2	3.4	0	0	0	3.4	0	1.7	0
Temeke	14.2	10.3	2.7	0	0	0	0	0.5	0	0.5

Source: School survey

schools is only slightly higher than at the urban schools. Most of the difference is due to higher mortality rates in Muleba (see Table 7.4).

Resignations

A high level of teacher resignation is symptomatic of low job satisfaction and poor motivation. In Tanzania, though, resignation rates among primary school teachers are negligible. Only 0.13 percent of teachers resigned in 2004 (see Table 7.5). Thus, while many teachers (especially Grade A teachers) say that they would leave teaching if they could, alternative employment opportunities are virtually non-existent. The loss of pension and other terminal benefits if teachers resign is also reported to be a major deterrent.

[34] However, it is also suggested that teachers do not often want to be posted to their home areas because of the burden of extended family obligations.

[35] The World Bank Study reports that, in Morogoro Region in 1989, one-third of primary school teachers refused to take up assigned posts.

Resignation rates are not only very low, but they also appear to be falling. National attrition rates were reported to be, on average, 3.2 percent per annum for primary school and 10.5 percent per annum for secondary school teachers between 1985 and 1989 (see World Bank, 1990). Given likely mortality rates and the age profiles of teachers, nearly all of this attrition would have been accounted for by resignations. No teacher at any of the 10 survey schools resigned during 2003.

Transfers

Transfers are either voluntarily initiated by teachers themselves for personal reasons or they are involuntary. In other words, teachers are re-assigned to another school by senior managers. High rates of voluntary transfers have been reported from rural schools in Africa and elsewhere. For example, a survey of rural primary schools in Malawi in October 1999 found that nearly one-quarter of teachers had left their schools since the start of the academic year in January (IEC, 1999). With such high rates of transfers, teachers spend on average relatively short periods at each school, which has seriously adverse implications for the teaching and learning outcomes.

In Tanzania, 10 percent of teachers employed at both the rural and urban survey schools were transferred sometime during 2003 (see Table 7.5). Information was not requested on the breakdown of voluntary and involuntary transfers, but the incidence of voluntary transfers, particularly between districts, is reported to have fallen dramatically since local councils have become the principal employers of teachers. This is because, apart from teachers who have valid medical reasons or need to be with their spouses, a teacher who wants to move to another location has to find a teacher from that location who is willing to replace them at their current school. The average annual transfer rates for all teachers in Muleba and Temeke since the start of their teaching careers are 22.3 percent and 16.7 percent respectively, which also suggests that transfer rates have been much higher in the past. Currently, though, teachers in both locations have, on average, spent 2.8 years at their schools. While relatively fewer teachers in Muleba have been at the same school for more than five years, it is noticeable that Temeke schools have much larger proportions of teachers who have been at their schools for only one year or less (see Table 7.6).

Table 7.6: Breakdown of years at current school for teachers at survey primary schools (rounded percentages)

	MULEBA		TEMEKE	
Years	**Female**	**Male**	**Female**	**Male**
<1	20	5	37	55
2 to 5	80	84	43	36
6 to 10	0	11	18	0
10>	0	0	1	0

Source: School survey

Table 7.5: Annual rates of attrition among primary school teachers, 1991-2004

		2004			2000			1996			1991		
Attrition reason	**Sex**	**A**	**B+C**	**ALL**	**A**	**B+C**	**ALL**	**A**	**B+C**	**ALL**	**A**	**B+C**	**ALL**
Resignation	Female	0.11	0.04	0.07	0.13	0.33	0.23	0.16	0.11	0.13	0.17	0.16	0.16
	Male	0.17	0.16	0.17	0.21	0.23	0.22	0.37	0.19	0.26	0.35	0.32	0.33
Retirement	Female	0.08	0.13	0.01	0.31	0.7	0.51	0.07	0.3	2	0.09	0.29	0.24
	Male	0.05	0.09	0.06	0.54	0.92	0.74	0.16	0.52	0.37	0.21	0.58	0.46
Death	Female	0.64	0.83	0.7	0.41	0.59	0.5	0.3	0.54	0.44	0.23	0.37	0.33
	Male	0.72	0.82	0.77	0.47	0.74	0.61	0.32	0.6	0.48	0.38	0.4	0.39
All	Female	0.83	1	0.9	0.84	1.63	1.25	0.52	0.95	0.77	0.49	0.82	0.72
	Male	0.94	1.08	1	1.23	1.89	1.58	0.85	1.31	1.12	0.96	1.3	1.19

Relatively large numbers of teachers (40 percent Muleba, 34 percent Temeke) say that they would like to transfer to another school, especially among male teachers in Muleba. However, hardly any have actually made formal requests for a transfer, which is probably because of the difficulty of doing this. The cost of transfers and the long delays in the payment of transfer allowances are also major deterrents. Teachers in Muleba want to move mainly because they want to be near their homes in order to look after aged parents, work on their own farms (shambas), which can be a major source of income, and stop paying rent. In Temeke, teachers want to transfer to schools which are well managed or are more accessible. Limited transfer opportunities can therefore seriously increase the levels of frustration and seriously de-motivate teachers.

7.4 TEACHER ABSENTEEISM AND TIMEKEEPING

High rates of teacher absenteeism have been consistently reported in recent studies in Africa, Asia and South America and these are directly attributed to low levels of commitment (see Halsey et al, 2004). Similarly in Tanzania, researchers have reported 'chronic levels' of absenteeism and a 'certain casualness about attending classes, which tends to increase when teachers run out of money' (Barrettt, 2004a). According to the TTU/Haki Elimu Survey, in 2003, 41 percent of rural (primary and secondary) teachers had been absent at least once in the previous three months compared to only 18 percent among urban teachers.

Neither head teacher nor teacher interviewees identified teacher absenteeism as a major problem at the survey schools. However, only one out of the five teacher focus groups in Temeke and two out of five groups in Muleba agreed with the statement that 'teachers absenteeism at this school is not a problem'. Data supplied by the teacher questionnaire respondents indicates that teacher absenteeism rates at the survey schools during the previous week were 13 percent in Muleba and 3.5 percent in Temeke. With respect to gender differences, while male absenteeism was much higher at Muleba schools, the opposite was the case in Temeke. Information on teacher absences on the day of the survey broken down by reason was also collected from each head teacher. Table 7.7 shows that overall absenteeism was high, especially in Muleba, but most of this was for legitimate reasons. In fact, non-authorised absences were only 2-3 percent in each location. On the day prior to the survey, nearly one-third of teachers were absent from Muleba schools mainly because of attendance at in-service training workshops. Absence due to illness was also quite high (9 percent Muleba and 5 percent Temeke).

Table 7.7: Teacher absenteeism by reason and lateness (percentages)

District	Overall yesterday	Illness	Duty	Leave	Authorised	Non-authorised	Overall today	Overall late
Muleba	32.2	8.5	16.9	1.7	3.4	1.7	18.6	6.8
excluding duty	15.3							
Temeke	13.7	4.9	3.8	0	10.9	3.3	7.1	2.7
excluding duty	9.8							

Source: School survey

More research is needed to understand why teacher absenteeism appears to be higher in rural areas. Possible reasons include higher levels of illness and authorised absences, especially to collect pay from district education offices. Also, given the

much higher concentration of Grade IIIB/C teachers in rural schools, in-service training activities may be more frequent. Working on shambas and participation in cultural activities are also likely to key factors. Teachers in rural areas perform more leadership functions in their local communities than is the case in the towns and cities.

Lateness has also been linked with low teacher motivation. However, it was not cited as a major problem in either the rural or urban survey schools. All of the teacher focus groups agreed with the statement that 'teachers at this school usually come to work on time'.

7.5 TEACHER MISCONDUCT

The press and other media in most African countries including Tanzania regularly report on the teacher misbehaviour of one sort or another. Based on her own direct observations in a relatively large number of schools, Angeline Barrett estimates that as many as 1 in 7 male teachers at rural primary schools have a drink problem. Parent hostility to the exploitation of their children by teachers under the guise of self-reliance activities has also been widely observed. According to a 1993 TADREG Survey, 'children spend most of their time doing extra-curricula activities in farming and fetching water for their teachers' (p.vi). However, none of the head teachers or teacher interviewees at the survey schools had any major criticisms concerning the professional conduct of teachers. The MOEC has also exerted strong pressure on teachers to desist from such activities.

According to the Teacher Service Department, between 200-300 teachers out of a total of over 150,000 are dismissed for misconduct each year. Sexual misconduct by teachers is likely to be rare at primary schools, especially at urban schools, which are staffed predominantly by female teachers.

7.6 SECONDARY EMPLOYMENT

Incidence

Sumra observes that 'if you are a committed teacher, you do not have time to engage in another activity' (Sumra, 2003, p.44). However, three-quarters of teacher interviewees in Muleba and two-thirds in Temeke undertake additional income generating activities in order to supplement their salaries.[36] Secondary employment has been commonplace among teachers for at least twenty years. Three-quarters of the primary school teachers included in the World Bank Survey said they earned extra income in this way. The expansion of double shifting has significantly reduced the working day for most teachers, especially in urban areas, which has increased the amount of time available for secondary activities.

[36] Only 22 percent of teacher questionnaire respondents in Temeke said that they undertake secondary activities compared to 80 percent in Muleba. Given the sensitivity of this issue, the responses from the teacher interviews are likely to be considerably more accurate. Only 20 percent of urban and 29 percent of rural teacher questionnaire respondents in the Haki Elimu Survey admitted to secondary employment activity.

Activities

Almost all of the primary school teachers in Muleba and around half in Temeke who earn secondary incomes grow crops or rear cattle. Trading and artisanal activities (garment making, carpentry, etc) make up the remainder. Surprisingly, only 10 percent of these teachers in Temeke and none in Muleba say that they offer private tuition. The World Bank Study reports that 18 percent of urban primary school teachers and 6 percent of primary school teachers were involved in private tutoring in 1990. Similarly, in the Cooksey Survey, 32 percent of male and 21 percent of female primary school teachers reported spending more than four hours per week on private tuition. One reason for the possible under-reporting is that, in 2003, the MOEC outlawed all private tuition on school premises either during or after the school day. Other respondents indicated that private tuition is common among Standard 4 and 7 pupils in the major urban areas.

Private tutoring is far more common in secondary schools. According to one donor respondent, it is 'an addiction' in Dar es Salaam and the other major urban centres since 'everyone feels as though they must do it'. Among secondary school leavers in 1995, 37 percent at rural and 56 percent at urban schools said that they had paid for private tuition (see Mukyanuzi, 2003). These percentages will have almost certainly increased since then.

The impact of secondary employment activities on teaching and learning outcomes is a growing concern in many countries. Certainly, 'moonlighting' by civil servants in much of Africa has seriously lowered the overall efficiency and effectiveness of the public sector. However, none of the head teachers at the survey schools felt that the performance of their staff is affected by their extra-income earning activities, mainly because these activities are undertaken outside of working hours (which in many schools are no more than 5-6 hours) and they are 'sub-contracted out' to family members and paid workers.

With pupils becoming an important source of income, there are also concerns that teachers engage in opportunistic behaviour in order to maximise their income from private tuition. It is even alleged that some teachers deliberately do not teach all the prescribed curriculum to their pupils so that they are obliged to attend after-school lessons. However, there is no evidence from the school survey that such practices are commonplace in primary schools in Tanzania.

Secondary incomes

The average incomes from secondary employment reported by the teacher questionnaire respondents were T.Sh. 35,000 in Temeke and T.Sh.29, 500 in Muleba, which is about one-third of their net income from teaching. It is likely, though, that teachers have seriously under-reported these earnings. Also, a sizeable proportion of farming activity is for self-consumption. Most teacher interviewees stated that they could not survive without this additional income.

7.7 LEARNING OUTCOMES

Tanzania has participated in the SADC wide Southern African Consortium for the Monitoring of Educational Quality (SACMEQ). This entails the periodic administration of reading and mathematics tests to large samples of children in primary schools right across the country. On the basis of recently completed SACMEQ tests, learning outcomes among primary school children remain unacceptably low.

8. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Two main conclusions can be drawn from this study. First, while job satisfaction and motivation levels among primary school teachers in Tanzania are not as critically low as is frequently suggested, they are still far below what are required in order to ensure that teachers deliver quality basic education to all children by 2015. And second, given likely developments in the future, motivation levels could fall quite rapidly over the next five-ten years. Both head teachers and teachers at the survey schools were specifically asked what they thought would happen if the current problems facing primary teachers were not properly addressed in the near future. Most stated that teacher motivation will decline and this will seriously affect teaching and learning on the part of the pupils.

Both urban and rural locations have their own special challenges for teachers. A key finding of the study is that urban teachers tend, if anything, to have lower levels of job satisfaction than rural teachers. This is despite the fact that their workloads are quite a bit lower than they are for rural teachers. To some extent, this locational difference in job satisfaction levels is due to the different age and qualification profiles of teachers in rural and urban schools, but increasingly this difference can be attributed to the much higher living costs and other demands that urban teachers have to deal with on a daily basis.

Another key issue is that the age profile of primary school teachers will change quite significantly over the next ten years as the older generation of UPE teachers retire and very large numbers of new teachers continue to be recruited. The school survey highlights the much lower levels of job satisfaction and motivation among younger teachers. Unless this problem is properly addressed, teacher motivation could reach crisis proportions very soon.

8. 1 WHAT SHOULD BE DONE?

The following discussion summarises the views of head teachers and teachers, the TTU, and government and donors about what should be done to improve teacher job satisfaction motivation.

Head teachers and teachers

The responses of head teacher and teacher interviewees to an open-ended question, ‘what should be done to improve teacher job satisfaction and motivation at this schools?’ are summarised in Table 8.1. As expected better pay and allowances feature prominently in both groups, especially in Temeke. However, it is noticeable how often teachers mention the need for better management procedures and practices. Improved housing appears to be more of a priority among urban teachers whereas rural teachers and head teachers are more preoccupied about reducing workloads and ensuring a more equitable distribution of teachers among schools. As noted earlier, relatively little importance is attached to improving teacher competence.

Table 8.1: Suggested improvements by teachers and head teachers to improve teacher job satisfaction and motivation (rounded percentages)

	TEACHERS		HEADTEACHERS	
Intervention	**Muleba**	**Temeke**	**Muleba**	**Temeke**
REMUNERATION				
Pay	16	19	16	12
Allowances	16	19	11	29
Other	0	0	5	6
Sub-total	32	38	32	47
WORKING CONDITIONS				
Reduced workload	11	2	16	0
Housing	8	14	5	29
Classrooms and materials	8	5	16	6
Other	3	12	0	0
Sub-total	30	33	37	35
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT	11	7	5	12
TEACHER MANAGEMENT				
Salary administration	8	4	0	0
Merit-based advancement	8	9	11	0
Greater teacher participation	0	4	0	0
Other	11	5	16	6
Sub-total	21	22	27	6

Source: School survey

Teacher trade union

The TTU made three recommendations to the Prime Minister's Probe Committee concerning teachers' rights, teacher registration and professional self-regulation, and teacher appeals.

Teachers' rights: These include (i) new procedures to deal expeditiously with teachers' complaints and other issues; (ii) taking firm and prompt action against officials who misuse financial resources intended for teacher remuneration; (iii) creation of an autonomous agency for school inspection; (iv) increasing the duration of teacher training; (v) payment of a Teacher Special Hardship Allowance; (vi) postponement of the new teacher performance appraisal scheme until an enabling teaching environment is restored; (vii) full participation of the TTU in policy and curriculum reviews; (viii) give retiring teachers six months notice before the anticipated date; (ix) Deceased dependants of teachers should be transported back to their homes; (x) Improved health insurance services, including the availability of drugs; (xi) The Teachers' Service Department should cover all teachers, regardless of level or type of education.

Establishment of a Teachers' Service Professional Board: The main functions of the TSPB would be to: teacher training accreditation and teacher registration, enforcement of profession standards, provision of in-service training, elimination of ad hoc hiring of teachers.

Submission of Teachers' Appeals to the Labour Court: The President should not be the final authority of appeal in connection with teachers' cases. Instead all

teachers' appeals should be directed to the Labour Court under the provisions of the Employment and Labour Relations Act, 2003.

Government and the donors

Both government and its international partners recognise the need to improve teacher job satisfaction and motivation in order to raise educational quality. However, the commitment to take the steps that are required to do this is relatively weak. In part, this is because the main political pressure is to expand primary and secondary[37] school enrolments rather than improve the quality of service delivery. A key objective is to create enough capacity to enrol all seven year olds by 2005. The target enrolment for EFA is eight million children. Given current staffing norms, this will require an almost 50 percent increase in the teaching force, which has major implications for the likely affordability of improved pay and housing. Moreover, likely teacher shortages are likely to seriously affect the quality of learning. Experience from many countries shows that, faced with this situation, governments and donors look for ways of increasing the workload of teachers in a variety of ways, most notably by increasing class sizes and teaching load norms. However, technocratic fixes of this kind have rarely worked since they fail to take into account the very difficult working and living conditions that teachers have to endure.

8.2 PRIORITY INTERVENTIONS

There is a long shopping list of things that need to be done to improve teacher job satisfaction and motivation in Tanzania. But, given acute resource constraints, it is clear that some interventions, most notably sizeable pay increases and the introduction of non-trivial transport and housing allowances, are unlikely to be feasible for the foreseeable future. The fact that teachers are already relatively well-paid compared to other key service delivery cadres in the public sector is also another major factor.

A national strategy is needed that lays out in a comprehensive and coherent manner the steps that will be taken by government to improve teacher job satisfaction and motivation over the next ten years. Current proposals are both ad hoc and lack any clear commitment with regard to implementation.

Housing

Better housing for teachers is probably the top priority. While there are some signs that housing will be given greater attention in the latter stages of PEDP,[38] an expected funding shortfall from donors might well stymie this. The availability of teaching housing could be expanded very rapidly and cost effectively through the introduction of well-designed rental and housing loan schemes.

---

37 The rapid expansion of secondary school enrolments could drain primary schools of many of their best teachers.

38 Staff housing accounts for only 17 percent of the total school construction budget for the period 2001/02 to 2011/12.

Teacher management

Far more effort should be devoted to improving management performance at all levels. A national Primary School Management Development Programme with dedicated management trainers in every district could be highly cost-effective. It is also essential that pay and other incentives of senior managers at head office and in the regions and districts are sufficiently attractive in order to ensure the requisite levels of commitment and expertise.

Teacher deployment

The serious over staffing of urban schools and under-staffing of schools needs to be rectified through the introduction of new staffing norms that are based on teaching loads (rather than student-teacher ratios). More staffing flexibility is also needed in particular greater reliance on class (as opposed to subject) teachers, which will also enable greater scope for multi-grade teaching.

The introduction of across-the-board rural allowances is unlikely to have much impact on improving the staffing situation in rural schools, mainly because the increases in teacher's income that are likely to be needed in order to attract and retain able teachers in these locations are not affordable. Rural incentive schemes for teachers have been largely unsuccessful in other developing countries. A more effective approach is to place greater reliance on locally recruited teachers who are expected to work in their home areas combined with the use of carefully targeted incentives (including housing) for teachers in the most difficult to staff schools.

Urban girls are increasingly being taught by female primary school teachers, but most girls in rural areas continue to be taught by male teachers. This unintended consequence of deployment and gender policies needs to be addressed.

Career progression

There is an urgent need to create a more attractive, merit-based career structure with sufficiently large pay differentials that reflect differences in teaching performance.

Teacher competence

The lack of self-awareness among school managers and teachers themselves of the need to improve significantly teaching practice in primary schools is an important reason why more attention has not been given to this issue. But a comprehensive strategy is needed that effectively institutionalises continuous professional development for all teachers. Properly resourced, peer-based in-service training based on innovative approaches has proved to be very effective in many countries. Concerns about the dilution of pre-service training should also be seriously addressed

Trade union capacity

The capacity of the TTU to operate as an effective professional organisation for all teachers needs to be considerably strengthened. This is particularly important with the advent of collective bargaining.

HIV/AIDS

A comprehensive AIDS in the workplace strategy should be implemented immediately based on a detailed risk assessment, effective school and district-level HIV prevention programmes, and the provision of anti-retroviral drugs to all teachers who need them.

REFERENCES

Barrett, A. M. 2004a. Teacher accountability in context: Tanzanian primary school teachers' perceptions of local community and education administration. Compare, forthcoming

Barrett, A.M. 2004b. African teacher narratives in comparative research. Mimeo.

Bennell, P.S. K. Hyde and N. Swainson. 2002. The impact of HIV/AIDS on primary and secondary teachers in sub-Saharan Africa. Centre for International Education, Sussex University.

Domasi, 2000, What happened to the teachers? A teacher mobility study in Mangochi and Balaka Districts., Malawi. IEC Malawi Team,

Mblinyi, M. 2003. Equity, justice, and transformation in education: the challenge of Mwalimu Julius Nyerere today. HakieElimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.5.

MOEC 1999 Education Sector Public Expenditure Review

Mukyanuzi, F. 2003. Where has all the education gone in Tanzania? Employment outcomes among secondary and university leavers. Knowledge and Skills for Development and Institute of Development Studies, Brighton.

Rajani, R. 2003. Is primary education heading in the right direction? Thinking with Nyerere. Haki Elimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.4

Sumra, S. 2003. Implementation of the Primary Education Development Plan: voices from the community. Haki Elimu Working Paper Series No. 2003.7

Swai, F., A. Mtavangu, and N.N.F. Shami, 2004, Study on job satisfaction and motivation in teaching in relation to quality EFA initiatives. FSSS International, Dar es Salaam

United Republic of Tanzania. 2004. Basic statistics in education. Ministry of Education and Culture, Dar es Salaam. July

United Republic of Tanzania. 2004. Secondary education development plan 2004-2009. Final document. Ministry of Education and Culture , Dar es Salaam. March.

United Republic of Tanzania. 2003. Joint review of the Primary Education Development Plan. Ministry of Education and Culture , Dar es Salaam. December.

World Bank. 2001. Primary Education Development Program. World Bank, Washington D.C. August