

**R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

# **Navigating Local Governance in Bangladesh: Pathways for Institutionalising PAPD**

Stuart Coupe, Iftexhar Choudhury and Shadullah Hil Mamun

**R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

Project R8103

***Consensus for a Holistic Approach to improve Rural-livelihoods in  
Riverine-islands of Bangladesh (CHAR)***

This document is an output from a project funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) for the benefit of developing countries. The views expressed are not necessarily those of DFID.

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

<b>Contents</b>	<b>Page</b>
Introduction	3
Political Structure of Bangladesh	3
Local Institutions in Bangladesh	4
Prospects for Reform of Local Government in Bangladesh	4
Ways Forward	9
Workshop Proceedings	10

### Introduction

*It is counterproductive to attempt to resolve contentions over common pool resources through ad hoc measures such as creating project led village natural resources committees....outside the regular organs of village governance. Whatever the short term successes of such measures, in the long run, they are neither sustainable nor politically viable and, much less rooted in local politics. (Shivji, 2002)*

This observation identifies a tendency in the approaches of the donor-NGO poverty alleviation community to attempt to by-pass local institutions. It describes the move to establish alternative forms of governance without any vision of how they will embed into broader institutional frameworks. To a considerable extent this pattern is understandable, as governments across the world do not stop at ignoring the poor. They appear sometimes to be positively cruel and vindictive towards them. But even in the most difficult and regressive circumstances, pro-poor agents should, according to this perspective, enter dialogue with local power elites and begin a process, however gradual, of pro-poor reform of local institutions. This annex outlines the current political sociology of local institutions in Bangladesh, in the continuing search for effective uptake pathways for the adapted PAPD methodology developed in this project.

### Political Structure of Bangladesh

Characterising the prevailing political conditions in Bangladesh, we note from Westergaard and Hossein, (2002, 209) that a process of political inclusion in late developing countries takes place in a context where civil society is weak. This is the case of Bangladesh, which is characterised by an absence of strongly organised trade unions, peasant organisations and other non-state interest groups. The process of incorporation of the majority into the national arena is via clientelism, through the use of vertical networks of patron-client relationships for bringing the lower class strata into national politics. The basic effect of clientelism is the maintenance of the status quo where fundamental class issues are systematically displaced by personalistic squabbles over the distribution of spoils.

A spatial factor further explains the lack of organised civil society groups at the local level (Islam 2002, 97). Bangladesh has open villages with a dispersed, linear pattern of settlement, different from the close or corporate villages found in other parts of South Asia. Villages in Bangladesh are not administrative units and settlement is based on the *para* – a cluster of hamlets. This militates against tight integration of the population and common identity within a local space. These structural characteristics reflect the need for concerted action for common good within the larger social space of the village.

Coming to the mix of actors at the local level, the connectedness of national NGOs to the local bureaucratic and political systems is weak and the UP is not frequently engaged. There is little evidence of engagement between the emerging peoples' organisations developed by NGOs and the representative structures of government. (Thornton 2002, 107) Local communities remain dislocated: the village is the 'done to' institution and the union the unempowered tier of government. Although effective financial power, control and relevant political power lie outside the remit of local institutions, bottom-up participation and influence would help deliver livelihoods opportunities.

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

Essentially, there is a formal institutional vacuum at the village level, which it is all too tempting for projects to fill without looking deeper into the informal village structures which can be used to develop interventions on a lasting basis.

### Local Institutions in Bangladesh

Local institutions are the forms through which resources, land, state-funded development initiatives and religious taxes etc., are allocated. Inherent in these institutions are forms of power that structure everyday life. These institutions can be further characterised as **formal** or **informal**. Formal institutions, *Union Parishad*, (UP), the Municipalities, Upazila government offices, and the Members of Parliament are based upon notions of democracy and representation. Informal institutions; *gushti*, *jama't* and *samaj* are rooted in historical patterns of social organisation and operate through principles of reciprocity and charity.

*Gushti* refers to patrilineage and denotes the hierarchical nature of family structures and the authority of male family leaders. *Jama't* is the term for a congregation of people who worship at the same mosque, while *samaj* refers to the wider Islamic brotherhood operating at the local level. Admission to the *samaj* group is based upon adherence to Islam and Islamic norms. It is autonomous and has no connection with any higher religious organisation.

Both formal and informal institutions employ various forms of social control, including the denial of legally or socially recognised entitlements and brute force. As Bode (2002) has shown in her in-depth study of a UP in Dinajpur, the formal and informal institutions function not as opposites, but in a mutually reinforcing grip on local resources. Essentially, the functioning of formal institutions is shaped by local informal leaders. Publicly they maintain their reputation through reciprocity, redistribution and dispute resolution and privately they establish patron-client relations which maintain the marginalised segments of the community in a chronic state of dependence. Local society is now dominated by a narrow clique of successful families which have effectively navigated simultaneously all these power networks. Yet, these power networks contain contradictions and instabilities which pro-poor agents must come to understand and exploit wherever they are working.

The purpose of the distinction between 'formal' and 'informal', however, is not to propose the existence of a dual system, i.e. tradition vs. modernity or a 'higher practice' vs. a 'local practice'. Rather, this analysis emphasizes that formal and informal institutions function not as opposites, but together. The relationship between the formal and informal reveals the ways in which informal institutions have adapted to and now permeate democratic forms of governance. As such, focusing on the relationship between formal and informal institutions sheds light on the ways in which local configurations of power operate.

### Prospects for Reform of Local Government in Bangladesh.

Once all gains for which NGOs and central agencies are responsible have been taken into account, the net rate of poverty reduction in Bangladesh is stuck at around one percentage point per year. It is in the context of the need for a radical scaling up of the attack on poverty, from poverty alleviation to poverty elimination (see Annex A) that new engagement with the issues of local governance acquires urgency. All the recent studies of local governance in Bangladesh have emphasised that the research process that can unlock the workings of local institutions in Bangladesh is in its

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

infancy. The following typology provided by Rahman and Islam (2002) is an excellent starting point.

a) **Central/local government dynamic.** The overriding principle at work is to ensure a close supervision of local governments by central administration and a pre-eminent central jurisdiction on local development. Space is allowed for a local political process but development administration currently remains the preserve of higher-level bureaucrats and experts. The powers and responsibilities of local government are invariably defined in general and vague terms, whilst the powers of central government are enshrined in specific and precise terms. For example, it is a general power of the UP to maintain law and order but the specific powers of arrest/bail lie with the magistracy and the police.

*Local Manifestation:* Interview with the Chairman, Satpoa UP, (attached char location) -he was standing down after twenty-five years.

*The total budget allocation is very poor. The UP can raise revenue from market licences, ferry boat licences, animal pounds and a public tax. In the case of a land transfer, also 1% goes to UP. There is also a household tax raising power called the holding tax but this has not been used in the past five years in the UP. Any bank loans secured by the UP are conditional on the production of the holding tax certificate. Of this public tax, 50% goes to the raiser i.e the UP.*

*There are nine village policemen. The government contribution of TK350 is supposed to be contribution to the salary, but because there is no other revenue source they are depending entirely upon the TK350. The holding tax is difficult to raise, people are not ready to pay it, it is more trouble than it is worth.*

*The holding tax should cover –chairman’s honorarium, office expense and salary of the police. As it is there is only a small amount for office expenses.*

b) **“Lived Reality” of State Power.** In the colonial period, one function above all others was invested with strategic primacy – the *control of criminal judicial power*. In the post-colonial era this has fundamentally distorted the polity. The discretionary capacity to punish has become the prized resource of political competitors. This hangs heavy over any initiatives for decentralisation.

*Local Manifestation:* Project Assessment of Khas Land issue in the area including Nadargari village, January 2004 (isolated char project location).

*The movement of the landless people for khas land began in Madarganj in 1983-84. The movement was organised by the Communist Party of Bangladesh (CPB) and the Workers’ Party of Bangladesh (WPB). The movement was a political programme. Because of meetings, demonstrations and gheraos (confine an officer in his office by sit-down of the protestors), the Assistant Commissioner (Land) [AC Land] and the Upazila Parishad (political administrative system introduced by President General Ershad during his tenure) were forced to allocate khas land to 1,000 landless peasants. Out of these landless people, 600 were from Balijuri UP, 200 from Jorakhali and 200 from other UPs. The largest concentration of khas land is located in a place called Plot 20 in the Balijuri UP.*

*Present situation:*

*The landless peasants who received allotment of khas land possess the government allotment papers. But they have not been able to enjoy the possession of land.*

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

*Additional allotment papers of khas land are now being prepared and will be given to landless peasants. However, there is great doubt whether possession of khas land will occur. At present some local influential people, the Kha family and some influential persons of Madarganj are occupying khas land. They do not belong to any political party. These actual occupants of khas land have been able to retain their possession by influencing the AC Land and also utilising political influences.*

*At present the post of AC Land is lying vacant. Showing various pretexts, the UNO is in fact demonstrating little interest on this issue. During the previous regime, Madarganj Muktijoddha Sangshad (Madarganj Freedom Fighters' Association) [which is now supporting the ruling party] tried to use political influence to obtain allotment of khas land. However, they did not receive any allotment. But now they are again trying to get allotment.*

*Applications were submitted in recent weeks to the UNO to get khas land. The UNO declared his commitment to arrange possession. The ideal time for getting possession of land is the dry season. However, as there is only one Surveyor servicing both Sarishabari and Madarganj, he may not be able to find time. Local people are fearing that this will be used as a pretext.*

*Future:*

*Even if the peasants get access to khas land they will not be able to retain it for various reasons. The peasant will lose ownership of his land by selling his land to the previous land user or give up his ownership right due to intimidation.*

**c) The “Wheat Culture” of Local Development.** A defining moment in the evolution of a passive development culture at the local level was the introduction of a food for work program with the ‘Basic Democracy programme’ of the Pakistan government in the 1960s. “Wheat” became the new language of development leading on to the emergence of an enduring nexus, binding politicians, administrators and local government functionaries in a truncated vision of development built on institutional corruption. It represents a political accommodation between aspiring local leadership and the bureaucratic state.

*Local Manifestation: Any initiative in development administration is driven forward by the Member of Parliament and his/her relatives: Sharishabari in Jamalpur is no different. Road and bridge construction funded by Asian Development Bank projects are the prestigious elements to bring in since they remain as monuments to political clans that were responsible for securing them (the uncle of the current incumbent was the MP between 1991 and 1996, most of the bridges in the constituency carry a plaque in his honour). Micro-infrastructure projects in char lands to improve livelihoods are currently non-existent. The chaoras favour the idea of local economic development plans but currently lack access to investment funds.*

*Given the large numbers of landless households, the lack of regional economic development and off-farm opportunities, constituents’ expectations upon local leaders involve access to state sponsored infrastructure and developmental resources. The ruling party MP becomes locked into a path of securing these prestige projects, but their ability to implement them effectively is hamstrung by the same informal patronage networks which they must feed to maintain their place at the zenith of the local power structure.*

**d) Absence of Champions** There are no organised actors who can drive the local government agenda as a consistent strategic goal. This is true of local NGOs as well

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

as of politicians and bureaucrats. Attitudes are strongly influenced by the notion of a zero sum game for control of power, the development process and donor resources. Community capacities to champion their own development are minimal and social capital has actually declined during the independence period for many reasons. Siddiqui (2000;137-8)) provides an exhaustive presentation of these factors, but calls for a much more rigorous comparative analysis of the organisation of village society in Bangladesh with, for example, West Bengal.

Case Study on Local Government Reform: Report on Introduction of Gram Sarkar (Village Councils)

*In questions of food security, poverty alleviation and public welfare- local government can play a significant role. But in the Bangladesh political system, politicians', researchers', think tanks' and common people's needs are not harmonized. This is a matter for great concern*

*Politicians have not used the local government system as anything more than their playground. Up to today the bureaucrats have used the local government for their own interest and benefit only. Social and economic life admittedly moves at a slow pace, but the political administrative system is characterised by a total absence of change. The local government system is a subsystem of the national political/administrative system. This is very deep seated.*

*The legal system is still the old British system, virtually ineffective now. People do not go to the legal system except as a last resort. A common saying is that "the foot is cut to fit the shoe" – people are forced to fit into the system. The hierarchical, top-down nature of the system is not raised in official discussions of local government reform. Constitutional amendments and new laws all subscribe to the interests of national bureaucrats/politicians.*

*The Constitution of Bangladesh has the following provisions for a local government system.*

- 1. Legally elected bodies will have authority over administration*
- 2. Elected bodies will handle activities of administration, discipline, public works for economic development and related planning and implementation.*
- 3. Revenue raising, budgeting, maintenance of funds.*

*These local government clauses have been amended twelve times, moving administration further and further away from democratic controls. There are two tiers of administration – functional (government departments) and territorial.(district, upazilla and union). Parliamentary committees exist for each ministry providing for an albeit weak scrutiny. But there is no external scrutiny of district, upazilla or union operations. The constitution states that elected bodies over part of the administration, but exactly which part is not defined. This has opened the way for upazilla and district authorities to be demarcated as purely administrative and structured for convenience of administrative arrangement.*

*The purpose of local government purpose is therefore to execute centrally planned activities. Budgets are regulated by government departments and administrative offices. The list of activities ascribed to local government is very long.*

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

These processes explain the differences between de jure and de facto management and outcomes. With respect to the local level institution of the Gram Sarkar, for instance, the blueprint states:

*Villages themselves are to contribute in village development under a law passed in 2003. A summary of its provisions follows:*

*The Gram Sarkar is to be formed by the following local representatives.*

*UP ward member  
Respected man (IP)  
Trained village defence (man)  
Trained village defence (4 women)  
Farmer  
2 Landless farmer  
Co-op member  
Freedom Fighter  
Teacher  
Businessman  
Professional  
Woman UP member.*

*Ten per cent of eligible voters of the ward must be present to select the body, under the guidance of the supervising body (Upazilla officials).*

*Elected body to take oath within 30 days and work for five years.*

*Ten per cent of voters must be present at six monthly review meetings.*

*Sub –committees are to be formed for specific activities.*

*Budget from Union council and from other sources.*

*Of the 40347 villages in Bangladesh – 39650 have been designated as eligible for Gram Sarkar.*

*The Gram Sarkar in practice.*

The Upazilla Executive officers and their deputies formed the GS within 30 days. The responsible officer for the Union was sent notification.

- ❖ Very few voters were present
- ❖ Not all types of professional were present
- ❖ Supporters of the current political party in power were present
- ❖ Gram Sarkar already formed – the names were just read out.
- ❖ Political parties of the area changed the composition to suit themselves

The whole process of GS election and formation was marked by irregularities and favouritism

The GS were given a statutory budget allowance of 5000 Tk in 2003 and 10000 Tk in 2004. Large percentages grabbed at Upazilla and Union before even this meagre resource reached the GS. Then elected GS members took the remainder of the money for their own benefit. They understood that it is meant for their own use (expenses)

Other characteristics of the Gram Sarkar to date that have been observed:



## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

They are faithful to government party and the GS has focused on political activities which are designed to extend its influence down to grassroots level. Their other core activity has tended to be resolution of disputes, an institutionalisation of the informal salish justice system which tends to be biased in favour of the elites that run it.

The Gram Sarkar have also been involved in bargaining for relief materials. In 99.9% of cases no general meeting has been organised and there has been no evidence of local revenue raising up to now.

The main stated aim or objective of the introduction of village councils was to identify grassroots problems and encourage dialogue on rural development with written reports to be submitted to union chairmen on progress. The Union council was then to review these and send on to the Upazilla. Upazilla offices were then to review and send a general report to the District Commissioner. However, no reporting has been forthcoming, and no attempt has been made by the government to organise it. Upazilla/District, did not receive any instruction from the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development. There is therefore little or no institutional or political momentum behind village development. A prominent jurist, Kamal Hossein has argued that the reform does not meet the guidelines of the constitution because once again the Gram Sarkar is being administratively constituted. In no case was 10% of the electorate present. Rather the bodies have been formed by the administration in consultation with MPs and other political leaders in isolation. Any democratic efforts of villagers are flouted by the administration.

### **Ways Forward**

The development community is starting to acknowledge and better understand the role of the formal and informal institutional environment and the way in which it shapes opportunities or obstacles for change. Of priority now is to transfer this understanding to GO and NGO agencies and service providers. To some extent it is likely that current practice can be consolidated by a new emphasis on social and political processes at local level. For some development related agencies, though, it may be that a radically different approach would be required.

To date, however, both donor and government initiatives tend to be proscriptive with little room for building a better understanding of more open-ended planning processes.

**ITDG Bangladesh is organising a national policy forum in September 2005 on institutional uptake of PAPD. The findings of the conference will form the second part of this annex.**

**Workshop Proceedings**  
**Participatory Action Plan Development: Experiences of Practical Action**  
**Venue: VIP Lounge, National Press Club, Dhaka, Bangladesh**  
**Date: 07 September 2005**

The national workshop on “Participatory Action Plan Development” was jointly organized by Unnayan Shamannay and Practical Action (formerly ITDG). *Mr. Shahin ul Alam*, Director of Unnayan Shamannay, introduced the distinguished guests and participants to the audiences of the workshop and invited the honorable chair as well as the paper presenter of the workshop to take their seats on the stage. He then invited Ms. Veena Khaleque, the Country Director of Practical Action, to deliver her welcome address.

### **Speeches**

In her speech *Ms. Veena Khaleque* welcomed all to the national workshop highlighting major objectives of the organization. Introducing the Char Manual to the participants she under scored Char areas need (1) timely planning and (2) proper implementation of development projects in which development practitioners, govt. officials as well as NGOs need to work together. Finally she apprised the audience of the change in the name of the organization from ITDG to Practical Action and concluded by thanking all.

The first paper was presented by *Dr. Atiur Rahman*, Chair, Unnayan Shamannay, where he began with the remark that effective participation is a prerequisite to achieve sustainable development. In conceptualizing participation he focused on the multiplicity and complexity of definition, dimension and typology of participation. According to him the core elements of participation are (1) people first, and (2) people in group. He went on saying that commitment, ownership of ideas, confidence and capacity are crucial for effective community participation. About 6.5 million people of Bangladesh live in the Char areas who live from hand to mouth and desperately need different institutional supports for sustainable development. He gave the instances that Participatory Action Plan Development (PAPD) approach is playing a significant role towards the livelihood development of char people in char Nandina and char Nadagari of Jamalpur district. He concluded by stressing the necessity of a separate budget allocation for the Char people along with proper coordination among different institutions- local, national and international.

In his short paper *Mr. Mokhlesur Rahman* from CNRS defined PAPD as the managing of resources by people at the local level through their active participation and integrating into the planning process and focused on the role of PAPD for consensus building among stakeholders. In this process, as he mentioned, different types of stakeholders are included such as primary and secondary stakeholders. He argued that through PAPD local community building could be initiated. At the conclusion of his discussion he made a number of recommendations with PAPD’s usefulness to solve local problems. These include utilization of *Khas* land for fisheries and unused land for cultivation, and establishment of a sanctuary in encroached land.

In his short speech *Dr. Stuart Coupe* of Practical Action (UK) mentioned that in the isolated charland their project had to encounter challenges like dealing conflicts among interest groups vying for *Khas* land. He defined PAPD as a process of increasing technical capacity and options of char people can be consolidated by

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

undertaking projects like goat rearing, livestock facilities, maize cultivation (cash crop), vegetable production, etc. He vouched the utility of char-specific PAPD characterized by community feelings and accommodation of the interest of diversified groups like beneficiaries, UP members, UNO, and other relevant service providers. People are introduced to the ideas and strategies of PAPD by imparting training for six months among the local people. Practical Action helped raising awareness among the charland people, explaining their potentials and mobilizing local resources. Making PAPD a success the following points are to be taken into account: (1) Timing (timely supply and delivery of inputs and services), (2) Role of formal institutions, (3) Role of informal institutions (religious groups, elites, samaj, gosthi and the like), and (4) The meaning of success (i.e. pointing the development of linkages between formal and informal institutions with the capacity to interact with people). Finally he focused on the following key lessons learnt from the field: (1) PTD is a good ice-breaker, (2) a win-win scenario exists, (3) community enthusiasm can drive planning process, (4) adopted process suited NGOs at the local and district levels.

### Open Floor Discussion

*Dr. Atiur Rahman* invited the participants at large in the workshop to take part in the open floor discussion. Following is the summary of the open floor discussion that encodes people's views and perspectives regarding char livelihood.

#### *I. Md. Khalilur Rahman, Char Nadagari, Jamalpur*

- Charland resources have to be explored, developed and fully utilized.
- The pattern of education, water supply and sanitation, economy, financial support and livestock management are quite poor in the locality.
- Administrative support for the development of char areas is inadequate.
- These issues should be taken seriously for the development of charland and livelihood of char people.

#### *II. Md. Abdur Rahman, Char Nandina, Jamalpur*

- It is due to Practical Action that they have been able in getting access to the Jalmahal for fish cultivation.
- Invested 300 Taka for fish cultivation that proved a success for them.
- It is problematic to give renewed share.

#### *III. Md. Anzam Gani, Karmakutir, Bhola*

- He mentioned about shelter problem of the people living in Bhola during cyclone period.
- Vulnerability leads people to death.
- Few NGOs (for example funded by ActionAid) are working in the chars to provide "decline credit".

#### *IV. Ms. Nadira Mallick, South Asia Partnership (SAP)*

- Road constructions in the chars are poor and there is the lack of monitoring whether this can sustain or not.
- Local govt. offices are situated in the mainland and this seems to be a problem for the char people.
- The so called "ideal village" is not properly planned.

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

- There is the need for separate budget allocation as these chars are different from the main land.
- In terms of gender perspectives of Stuart's process the importance of adolescent group is missing and they are needed to be more valued.

### *V. Dr. Maleka Begum*

- Worked in Char Fasion for the shelter of the people.
- From the TMSS they have been engaged in giving the support of legal advocacy for char people.
- There is the need for regular participation of different service providers into local community for overall development.

### *VI. Eng. Enamul Hoque*

- There is the need for more discussion on char/river erosion and its impact on the people.
- For sound development two/three thanas can be given to chars where service providers are to be taken to work.
- A "Riverine District" can be established along with a rehabilitation budget.

### *VII. Mohammad Ferdous, AD, Department of Social Services*

- There is no monitoring of the NGOs working at the field-level and Dept. of SoF runs monitoring program in the chars.
- Women are lagging behind in terms of education.
- There is the need for increasing social awareness among the char people.

### *VIII. Gayanath Sarker, Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)*

- Char people do not get proper support for education, health, water supply and sanitation.
- Due to the lack of family support and govt. facilities the service providers do not go the chars.
- Flood shelters are needed for the survival of people and resources in the chars.

### *IX. Rafiqul Islam Tota, UP Member, Balijhuri Union*

- There are only discussions but less work done regarding char development.
- Need practical solution/action in the char development.
- Women are more effective in the chars and hence needed to be encouraged.
- Need to develop a committee integrating central, NGO and UP members.

### *X. Ms. Salma Begum*

- Need institutional support.
- Looking for need assessment.

### *XI. Mr. Mazharul Islam*

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

- Effective community participation and new technology are a must.
- Routine institutional linkages are less and there is the need for a separate budget for the charlands.
- Higher officials are to be encouraged to go to the charlands.

### *XII. Md. Abdul Mannan Mia, Fisheries Department*

- People feel encouraged when govt. service providers visit and support them.
- Proper linkages will also motivate people to go to the chars.
- Need proper channel for development in the chars regarding fisheries, livestock.

### *XIII. Mr. M.A. Aziz, Director, DAE*

- Monitoring mechanism, evaluation processes as well as limitations are missing from the findings of the workshop.
- Infrastructural development is to be generated through integrating gender perspectives.
- Development of CBOs through maintaining a proper channel between GO, NGOs and other local level people.
- Establishment of a market to sell the products for income generation.

### *XIV. Mr. Gulam Mustafa, former Joint Secretary, GoB*

- There is the lack of education in the chars and in some areas there is no school.
- Need proper support for separate budget allocation in the chars if development is to be made sound.
- There is the need to change the mentality of govt. service providers so that they should go to the chars and work for the char people.
- A “national highlight” on the chars is to be set.

### *XV. Ms. Monowara Talukder, Gaibandha*

- Women of the char are to be given proper attention.
- Systematic marketing opportunity to market their product.
- Maize cultivation is to be increased.

### *XVI. Ms. Airin Akhter, Practical Action*

- How much this can be active?
- Power will have to be invested.

### *XVII. Mr. Shah Alam, DUA*

- An integrating system is strongly needed.
- What can be done to help people in providing them with micro credit along with vulnerable state mechanism?
- Separate budget allocation for the chars in the national policy.
- Need proper marketing system.

### *XIX. Tapan Kumar Nath*

- Tracing Indigenous Knowledge based technology.

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

- Integrated Char Development Plan through the slogan “Our Village, Our Organization”.
- Health, education and sanitation facilities are to be enhanced.
- Providing low costing households for the landless.
- Specific Govtment Policy for charland.

### *XX. Mihir Biswas, BAPA*

- Questioned about environment and proper flow of water.
- Need appropriate maternal care.
- In planning there is the need for “In situ Environment Management”.

### *XXI. Mr. Shah Alam*

- Need education and infrastructural support.
- Need building highland in the vulnerable char areas.

### *XXII. Mr. Abdur Rouf Bhuiyan*

- There is no escape from river erosion which is a natural course.
- Short term and long term based “Char Rehabilitation Zones” for chars can be built.
- Basic infrastructure.
- Mobile health clinic.
- Proper organizational development.

### *XXIV. Mr. Abu Mustafa Kamal Uddin*

- There can be an institutional development and arrangement.
- How can the project sustain without the support from Practical Action will have to be taken into consideration.
- How to make the vulnerable chars more fixed can be a major concern for their development.

### *XXV. Mr. Mukhlesur Rahman*

- How to integrate landless and marginal farmers for increasing power?
- How to make development sustainable by taking lane stature?

### *XXVII. Md. Gulam Kibria, RDSM, Jamalpur*

- PAPD bringing sustainability including learning from the success stories.
- Training on food processing has helped them to increase their production.
- There is the need to make linkage on different products.
- Maize cultivation has been successful and this can b generated more.

## **Comment by the Moderator**

In this session of the workshop Dr. Atiur Rahman, moderator of the workshop, outlined a number of recommendations that sprang out of the open floor discussion. These are:

- Char issues ought to be included in the PRSP of Bangladesh.

## **R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

- Separate budget allocation is required for the char people to expedite the pace of their development.
- Proper infrastructural development in the chars (including people, land, livestock) and the role of the concerned persons.
- Energy crisis: Bio-gas plantation can be incorporated in the char areas.
- Development in the education sector.
- Necessity of community organization and community based planning and decision making.

### **Vote of Thanks and End of the Workshop**

The workshop came to an end with vote of thanks from where following points have been generalized:

- Practical Action is going to present concrete findings in the chars.
- Char-based institutional establishment by integrating local-national agencies.
- Government policy with additional resource allocation.
- A short or long term plan in the hands of the char people and to relate it to the national policy.
- Practical Action tried to understand the condition of the people.
- Solutions are within the community.
- Solar energy system is working in two char villages and can be generated more.
- The chance for char cultivation is high with "Pit Cultivation" in different seasons.
- PAPD will be taken for further treatment in these chars.
- This would help CLP further.
- This would help them in achieving MDGs target.

## R8103: FTR - Annex B-v

### Participant List

Sl. No.	Name of the Participant	Organization
1.	Mr. Atwar Rahman	Practical Action
2.	Mr. Mokhlesur Rahman	CNRS
3.	Mr. Abdullah Mahmud	Media Link
4.	Ms. Jahanara Sharif	Practical Action
5.	M.A. Quaiyum	Practical Action
6.	Mr. Abul Hossain Rana	Coastal Development Partnership, Khulna
7.	Mr. Mizanur Rahman	Practical Action
8.	Mr. Abdur Razzaque	Practical Action
9.	Mr. Jitendra Nath Halder	Practical Action
10.	Md. Kamal Hossain	Practical Action
11.	Mr. Abdur Rob	Practical Action
12.	Md. Ferdous	DSS
13.	Delwara Khanom	Practical Action
14.	Ms. Veena Khaleque	Practical Action
15.	Mr. Shazad Khan	Practical Action
16.	Mr. Sajjad Hossain Mian	Practical Action
17.	Md. Zamal Uddin	Practical Action
18.	Mr. Sunil Kumar	MRF
19.	Mr. Ruhul Amin	Radio Bangladesh
20.	Ms. Rehana	SAWAG
21.	Ms. Monowara Talukder	PBKS, Gaibandha
22.	Mr. Harun-Ar-Rashid	AAS
23.	S.M. Zahedul Islam Chowdhury	BIDS
24.	Mr. Gayanath Sarker	Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)
25.	Mr. Golam Parvez	The Daily Manabjamin
26.	Mr. Didarul Hasan	Oxfam-GB
27.	Mr. Mostafa Sohel	Democracy Watch
28.	Anzamal A. Muneer	Karmakutir
29.	Bart Neacs	Netherlands Embassy
30.	Mr. Shah Abdus Salam	Development Wheel (DEW)
31.	Mr. Shiblul Bari	Ex Chairman, Balijhuri
32.	Mr. Khalequr Rahman	CBO, Nadagari, Jamalpur
33.	Mr. Monzurul Hoque	CBO, Nadagari, Jamalpur
34.	Md. Abdul Muttalib	CMC, Nandina, Jamalpur
35.	Md. Rafikul	Member, CBO, Jamalpur
36.	Mr. Ali Ahsan	ESDO
37.	Mr. Firoz Ahmed	BD News
38.	Mr. Halim Ahmed	The Daily Jugantor
39.	Md Mahedi Parvez	Unnayan Shamannay
40.	Mr. Rezaul Bari	SB
41.	Mr. Kamruzzaman	Channel S
42.	G.M. Suhravardy	Shamunnay
43.	Mr. Pantha Ghosh	Shamunnay
44.	M.S. Mamun	Practical Action
45.	K.N.M.N. Azam	GUP
46.	Mr. Hamid Sarker	The Daily Nayadiganta
47.	Mr. Matiru Rahman	Save the Children UK
48.	Ms. Fatema Zohora	ARSH



**R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

49.	Ms. Bilkis Nahar	The Daily Amader Shamay
50.	Dr. nathu Rana Sarker	BLRT
51.	Dr. ME Hossain	Dept. of Livestock Services
52.	Ms. Maleka Parveen	TMSS
53.	A.K.M. Hassan	Proshika
54.	Md. Tajul Islam Advocate	Nagorik Uddyog
55.	Md. Showkat Ali	DOF
56.	M.A. Aziz	DAE
57.	M. Tuhin	Hunger Free World
58.	Mihir Biswas	BAPA
59.	Hasan Imam Rubel	The Daily Prothom Alo
60.	Mr. Zahid Rahman	SAMATA
61.	A.R. Siddique	SLGDF
62.	Mr. Kazi Mashrafi	Writer
63.	Mr. Jamil	The Daily Star
64.	M.A. Khaleque	Shilpa Bank
65.	Mr. Rezaul Shipon	Banglabazar Patrika
66.	Mr. Samjag Khuda	Desh Bangla
67.	Z.B. Keka	Channel-I
68.	Mr. Kazim Reza	BASOS
69.	Mr. Shafiqul Islam	GENESIS
70.	M.M. Shah Alam	Rural Development Bangladesh
71.	Mr. Sarwar Hossain	The Daily Khabar Patra
72.	Mr. Khaled Haider	The Daily Dinkal
73.	Mr. Sushil Kumar	The Daily Gonojagoron
74.	Mr. Murshed	Shamunnay
75.	S.I. Lalin	The Daily DeshBangla
76.	Mr. Jahangir Kajol	The Daily Amardesh
77.	Mr. Rafiquzzaman	BDNEWS
78.	Mr. Ahmad Salahuddin	IRRI
79.	Naul Mag	IRRI
80.	Mr. Mamunul Haque	IRRI
81.	Dr. Atiur Rahman	Unnayan Shamannay
82.	Mr. Shaheen ul Alam	Unnayan Shamannay
83.	Md. Waliul Islam	Unnayan Shamannay
84.	Md. Zubair Ahmed	Unnayan Shamannay
85.	Md. Shahin Sultan	Unnayan Shamannay
86.	S.M. Arif Mahmud	Unnayan Shamannay
87.	Md. Gias Uddin	Practical Action
88.	M.A. Islam	CNRS
89.	Md. Mazharul Islam	BRDB
90.	Mr. Shamsul Huda	USJ
91.	Dr. Stuart Coupe	Practical Action
92.	Mr. Roger Lewins	Independent
93.	Mohammad Ali	Practical Action
94.	Mr. Wahiduzaman	Practical Action
95.	Mr. Nazmul Islam Chowdhury	Practical Action
96.	Md. Ashraf Uddin	Practical Action
97.	Dr. M.A. Razzaque	Practical Action
98.	Mr. Bazlur Rahman	The Financial Express
99.	Md. Gulam Kibria	RDSM
100.	M. Inamul Haque	BHWDB
101.	Md. Said	The Daily Prothom Alo

**R8103: FTR - Annex B-v**

102.	Ms. Sadika Akhter	Plan International
103.	Ms. Hasena Khatun	Naripokkho
104.	Md. Mustafizur Rahman	JS (GPR)
105.	md. Abdur Mannan Mian	DOF
106.	Dr. Sharif Ahmed Chowdhury	BLRI
107.	Mr. Khan	UNB (News Agency)
108.	Ms. Salma Begum	Practical Action
109.	Ms. Ireen Akter	Practical Action
110.	Ms. Nadira Mallik	SAP-Bangladesh
111.	Md. Abdur Rahman	GS, CBO, Nandina, Jamalpur
112.	Syed Nurul Alam	SAP-Bangladesh
113.	Ms. zohura Kabir	Practical Action
114.	Mr. Faruque Hossen	Practical Action
115.	Md. Rizanur Khan	The Daily Khabar Patra
116.	Md. Raquib	Practical Action
117.	Engr. Anayet Hussain	Practical Action
118.	Kazi Rahim Shahriar	The Daily Khabarpatra
119.	M.A. Awal	TARD
120.	Md. Shaduzzaman	Mohammadpur, Dhaka
121.	Abu M. Kamal Uddin	PDO-ICZMP
122.	Md. Salauddin	The Daily Inqilab
123.	Dr. QME Huque	BLRI
124.	Dr. Md. Nazrul Islam	BLRI
125.	Mr. Anwar Hossain	Proshika
126.	Mr. Mehtab Khan	Dhaka University
127.	Mr. Raghu Nath Raha	Brotee
128.	Mr. Faisul Kabir	Handicap International
129.	Mr. Shafiul Azam Ahmed	World Bank
130.	Mofakh-kharul Khan	BGS
131.	Mr. Taufique Mohouddin	TIB
132.	Mr. Monirul Alam	The Daily Prothom Alo
133.	Zinat A. Shebu	Manusher Jonno
134.	Mr. Saif Iqbal	Steps Towards Development
135.	Mr. Ataur Rahman	Nari Uddug Kendra
136.	Md. Bubul Ahmed	Aporajeyo Bangladesh
137.	Ms. Shanchita Shita	The Daily Amader Shomoy
138.	Mr. Aminul Haque	The Independent
139.	Md. Zia Uddin Alam	The Daily Ekushe Sangbad
140.	Mr. Abdul Mannan	The Daily Desh Bangla
141.	M. Alauddin	MIDAS
142.	Mr. Amirul Islam	The Daily Vorer Dak
143.	M.A. Murid	The Daily Meillat

**Bibliography.**

**Bode, B. 2002.** In Pursuit of Power: Local Elites and Union-Level Governance In Rural Northwestern Bangladesh, Care Bangladesh.

**Islam, S.Aminul, 2002, The informal institutional framework in Bangladesh, in** Toufique K and Turton, C. *Hands not Land: How Livelihoods are Changing in Rural Bangladesh*, DFID/BIDS, Dhaka.

**Rahman and Islam, 2002, Local Governance and Community Capacities, The Search for New Frontiers**, Dhaka UP.

**Shivji, I.G., 2002,** Village Governance and Common Pool resources in Tanazania, **Common Pool Resources Policy Paper 3**, DFID-NRSP

**Thornton, P, 2002** The formal institutional framework of rural livelihoods on Bangladesh in Toufique K and Turton, C. *Hands not Land: How Livelihoods are Changing in Rural Bangladesh*, DFID/BIDS, Dhaka.

**Westergaard K. and Hossein, A. 2002.** Local Institutions in Bangladesh, An Analysis of Civil Society and Local Elections, in Webster and Engberg Petersenn (ed) *In the name of the Poor: Contesting Political Space for Poverty reduction*, Zed Books, 2002