

## End of project report

### R 8380 Understanding Interlinkages in Community Driven Development

#### 1. Key findings

##### 1.1 HIV/AIDS and community based care:

- *Lack of institutional support*, in the form of training, resources and supervision, among community based workers was a major problem in the Tanzanian case studies, although in South Africa, institutional support was better arranged. In all cases the introduction of stipends (consistently paid) reflecting the amount of responsibility the hours worked by CBW's would improve the system.
- *Tensions between community members and community-based workers* in Tanzania were related to the influx of external resources and support for AIDS affected families, reallocated by community-based organisations. Such tensions were largely generated by a *lack of transparency and accountability* with regard to selection criteria for beneficiaries and destiny of funds or goods obtained. In South Africa, where the system was more formally institutionalised, there was apparently more transparency and accountability.
- *Individual interests and motivations of* community-based workers related to their social, economic, and political positions strongly affected the relationship between them and the rest of the community. In the case of the sensitive and stigmatised issue of HIV/AIDS, such personal positions and motivations can obstruct confidentiality and trust, and therefore, the actual delivery of services. Implications include the need for training which encourages the challenging of social preconceptions and prejudices.

##### 1.2 Water and community ownership

- *Capacity to sustain services*: There is significant capacity in communities to deliver water supplies and to maintain them (with some additional external resources/support). The availability of water can be improved through community managed schemes.
- *Balance between voluntarism and professionalism*: There is a need to balance community voluntarism with creeping professionalism and bureaucratisation in the development of community based institutions. Significant local skills development should be balanced with the strengthening of mechanisms of accountability which ensure that community members retain control over the water supply arrangements.
- *Equity and the limits of community management*: Despite the ability to manage services there are limits to community management in terms of ensuring equity of access and a poverty focus. This seems to be more likely with external championing, rights based policy and legislative framework and welfare support.

## **2. Background and objectives**

The purpose of the project was to identify the potential and constraints of community driven management and service delivery, by tracking the evolution of participation in selected projects as shaped by the interface between individuals, community workers and institutions.

This project aimed to engage with the current emphasis in international development policy on community driven development as a means of ensuring sustainable livelihoods, good governance and poverty alleviation.

Pro-poor community driven development is both enabled and constrained by individual identities, the actions of community workers and the workings of institutions. The positive aspects can be enhanced through a greater understanding of individual motivations, institutional processes and improved monitoring techniques. However the research also aimed to explore some of the limitations of these.

The research had three objectives (1) to understand individual participation in collective action (2) to understand the contribution of community workers to participatory processes and (3) to understand the possibilities of getting institutions right for pro-poor development.

The research was undertaken through analysing case studies of community driven development activities in relation to water and HIV/AIDS in Tanzania and South Africa. It was undertaken in partnership with the South African based NGO AICDD (formerly Khanya) with the aim of adding value through synergy with their DfID funded Community Based Worker Action research project, and through links to their wider NGO/CBO network. Additionally Professor Bertha Koda at the University of Dar es Salaam provided academic advice on the Tanzanian aspects of the research.

There were a number of changes in project personnel during the course of the research, which shaped the nature of the field work and outputs. Dr Jelke Boesten, a post doctoral researcher was recruited to support Frances Cleaver and Anna Toner by undertaking intensive field work on the HIV/AIDS cases in Tanzania. Tsiliso Tamasane left AICDD before the start of the project and was replaced by Lindiwe Mdhuli who undertook the South African field collection but left AICDD before analysis was completed. Comfort Mfangavo, commissioned to support the aspects of the Tanzanian research relevant to policy, sadly died before the end of the project.

## **3. Methods**

The research combined an actor centred approach with institutional analysis, developing and adapting innovatory techniques with the dual aim of generating data and increasing engagement and capacity of local researchers (much of the data collection was undertaken by local people acting in a variety of capacities). A strategic decision was taken early in the project to limit the number of case studies, in order to facilitate high-quality, intensive data collection, and to ease the management of the local researchers. To balance this highly defined focus we have also

emphasised the development of extensive overviews of policy and project experience in community driven water and HIV/AIDS projects in both study countries.

The research was therefore shaped around case studies of community based development services delivered through different organisational arrangements:

**Tanzania:**

Water            Water Users Association  
                      District Water Supply Project  
                      Village water supply (no external intervention)

HIV/AIDS       Village Health Workers  
                      Regional women’s organisation  
                      People Living with HIV /AIDS organisation

**South Africa**

Water            NGO intervention in association with Municipality and local  
                      community

HIV/AIDS       Community based workers associated with formal health system.

The research methodology drew on a combination of methods. The table 3.1 below provides an indication of the range used in each case study. These methods were adapted to suit each local context and issue. For instance, in the HIV/AIDS case studies the diaries of community-based workers were more effective as a research tool than in the water case studies.

**Table 3.1 Overview of research methods**

Focus	Methods	Sampling	Scale	Recording
Individuals	Life-histories	Representative drawn from community profile	20-30	Taped and transcribed
	Auto-ethnography-reflective diaries, research	Local researchers CBWs	2/3	Taped/written as preferred
	Peer research (with hard to reach groups)	Volunteers	10-15	As above
Community Profiling	Individual interviews	Key points- water pumps, dispensaries, church, markets	80-100	Written reflections/recording of key points
	Group interviews	As above	10+	Observer taking notes
	Participant observation	N/a	N/a	Written reflection/photos

Institutional Evolution	Process documentation (reports, minutes of meetings, observation)	Key stakeholders-meetings, constitutions	Over 1 year	Written records, observations
	Interviews/secondary data	Meso/macro stakeholders	Snowball process starting from known sources	Written records Collection of documentation

One interesting challenge of our approach to methodology, working in partnership with local people and with an NGO with a focus on action research, has been to develop consistent analysis across inevitably dissimilar and ‘lumpy’ case studies, spanning different communities and sectors in two countries. Part of our strategy for doing this is to emphasise opportunities for dialogue and reflection between the researchers ( including in-country, local researchers), with reference to common analytical frameworks. A number of workshop style meetings have taken place to further joint analysis (see details under dissemination).

Some of the challenges of working closely with local people in generating the research included issues of translation and interpretation, the positionality of the local researchers (especially in respect to HIV/AIDS) , the need to negotiate social hierarchies, providing ongoing training and supervision, meditating the tensions between ‘academic’ and ‘action’ research (eg regarding education about safe sex). We addressed these through constant reflexive dialogue between members of the research team and have reflected further on some of the implications in Working Paper 11 ‘Methodology: reflections of local research in action’ (Attached).

#### 4. Findings

We present here summary findings with reference to working papers in which these points are substantiated and discussed further.

##### 4.1 Individual participation

Individual participation is shaped by a number of factors, some of which are *structural* (age, gender, wealth) but others of which are related to the *capacity of an individual to exercise their own agency*). In order to better understand who shapes community-driven development it is first necessary to understand, more generally, which individuals participate in which collective spaces and actions. The research endeavoured to investigate two main dimensions of individual participation; 1/the participation of community members in participatory activities and 2/ the activities of community based workers and how they exercise agency.

In order to understand the involvement of individuals we developed a typology of participation in community based activities as follows:

- **Livelihoods:** Very localised participation in daily social and re(productive) activities, but no participation in village-level collective activity
- **Social:** Participation in organized social and small-scale collective activity  
Social/recreational participation through religious groups and sport clubs for example.
- **Public:** Active membership of village-level organisations such as the UWUA, Village Council or KIWAKKUKI (a women's HIV/AIDS regional NGO),
- **Leadership:** Formal and informal leadership positions.

### **Structure and participation**

The participation of individuals categorised by gender, age and wealth was then plotted against these activities. Generally this analysis generated a picture of participation in village governance patterned by inequitable social structures: local development is dominated by older, well-off men and some influential women. Interestingly very wealthy people sometimes chose not to participate at all although some wealthy people originating in the community but absent in towns or abroad were able to exercise influence over local affairs through their 'agents'. Additionally such patterns were not rigid; 'norms' of respect for elders are in some circumstances shifting, opening up opportunities for younger people (usually wealthy ones) to take leadership roles.

### **Agency and participation**

Through in-depth interviews, observations and the diary keeping exercises we also developed a typology of factors which shaped the ability to exercise agency both by ordinary individuals in the community and by community based workers. These included

- **cosmologies** (generally accepted ideas about the 'right' way of doing things and the relationship of the individual to the community, the natural and supernatural worlds),
- complex individual identities ( affecting motivations and capacities – for example the community based worker may also be a farmer, mother, carer with multiple responsibilities),
- the **unequal interdependence of livelihoods** (the interconnectedness of relations of patronage),
- **structure and voice** ( the ways in which social inequality shape people's ability to articulate and be heard in public fora),
- **embodiment** (the physical dimensions of participation and community work)
- **emotionality** (the conscious and sub-conscious feelings that motivate/demotivate people - very apparent in community based workers described feelings about their work)

The implication of this analysis for approaches which promote local participation in service-delivery and management is that it raises questions about the efficacy of creating new spaces for participation. Given the interaction of structure and agency in shaping collective spaces, it is likely that the same individuals will tend to populate and appropriate new spaces unless there is external promotion and facilitation of the rights and abilities of others to do so.

## 4.2 Contribution of community based workers to participatory processes

### What is a CBW?

There is a lack of clarity and considerable variation in definitions of a community based worker ranging from part-time volunteers to salaried employees of government or NGO's based in the community. A very basic definition is that the *CBW is a community member who delivers a service to other community members at a micro level.*

AICDD have identified 5 models of community based workers (Working Paper 3):

- *5-8 hours per week unpaid volunteer:* These are volunteers who provide community support for 5 to 8 hours a week after which they continue providing for their own livelihood;
- *20 hours per week unpaid:* unpaid except for expenses – expected to support livelihoods through other means.
- *20-30 hours per week paid volunteer:* Modest stipends often paid to cover costs and some remuneration.
- *Private sector worker:* the CBWs are compensated with a direct payment from the client served for the work undertaken, e.g. by selling drugs, charging for construction of a toilet, etc.
- *40 hours a week paid community worker:* These people are typically co-ordinators of other CBWs.

This research suggests the need to expand the definition of community based workers to include *community representatives* ( who may put in considerable time in civic duties and incur associated costs). The prevalence of some sort of payment to the CBW's raises a question about the place of voluntarism in the definition of CBW's.

### Monitoring performance of CBW's.

- Reviews of literature and development interventions involving CBW's reveals a *dearth of consistent monitoring* of their activities and their impact; capturing reliable data about what is often a voluntary activity at a micro level (within people's homesteads or community settings) is problematic ( AICDD 2006, Working Paper 1).
- The research revealed considerable *variation in ways of working*, in the ability of individual CBW's to access resources and expertise and in their relationships with communities and supervising institutions. Despite this variability consistent themes did emerge from the data on CBW activities:
- *Autonomy/responsibility/accountability* – CBW's are often highly dependent on external institutions for support so limiting their capacity to independently 'represent' communities, circumscribing community 'ownership' and confusing lines of accountability.
- *Issues of motivation and reward*, selection and equitable cooperation of CBW's critically shape levels of satisfaction amongst and about CBW's. Local CBW's are not necessarily good champions of equity issues; personal motivations and interests, related to socio-political position in the local

community often shape the relationships between CBW and beneficiary. CBW's may reflect general prejudices (for example with regard to HIV positive people) which limits their effective functioning.

- The *sustainability of service delivery* reliant on CBW's is questionable. Many CBW's are motivated by the hope of ultimately getting a paid job; if this does not materialise they may cease volunteering – attrition rates and therefore continuity of CBW's is high. . Different perceptions of roles and remuneration may cause dissatisfaction. For example in one of the water studies public tap attendants were seen by the water supply trust as self employed and liable for debts, whilst the attendants perceive themselves as voluntarily providing an insufficiently remunerated service to the community. Increasing professionalism ( through salaried appointments and training) of CBW's may improve quality of service delivery but distance CBW's from the communities they serve.

#### **4.3. Getting institutions right**

- **Multiple and overlapping institutional responsibilities**

Much delivery of services in the community is embedded in existing institutional arrangements with complex lines of responsibility, accountability and authority. This can ensure social appropriateness and acceptability on the one hand or a lack of clarity and capacity on the other. For example the delivery of home-based care in the Tanzanian case studies was devolved to a variety of local organisations. The relationships between them were complex and overlapping and local collective action was not coordinated. (Working paper 5)

- **Community ownership versus professionalism**

There is often a tension between community ownership and a shift towards professionalism in the interests of sustainability. This was particularly notable in the water case studies where the imperative to keep the infrastructure functioning, often through collection of fees tended to lead to increased professionalism and bureaucratisation of the water supply organisation. The gains of improved service provision and efficiency of operation of community based services have to be balanced against the distancing effects of professionalism; when the initiative is no longer run by community members alone, and they may perceive responsibility and accountability to reside elsewhere (Working Paper 6). Conversely enthusiastic amateurism (as in the case of the volunteer people living with aids) has enormous benefits of accessibility and community relevance but is limited in its reach (Working Paper 5). The challenge would seem to be for external agencies to be able to provide consistent and ongoing support and facilitation to community based organisations, without disengaging them from their local environment.

- **Local 'ownership' and equity**

There was little evidence that local institutions necessarily prioritised equity concerns or designed measures to ensure access to the poor and marginalised. Local institutions ( and the ranks of community based volunteers) were largely dominated by the more wealthy and literate members of the community; poorer members of the community were often catered for through patronage relationships. For example where fees were

charged for water there was little consideration by the local institutions of ability to pay and access to water as a basic need. The apparent need for external championing of equity considerations (through advocacy, legal rights, regulation or subsidy) raises questions about which is the appropriate body to do this; central government, strengthened local government, NGO's or donor agencies? For example in the case of South Africa national legislation ensuring a right to basic water supplies to all is a step towards ensuring access to all although much work remains to be done on increasing people's awareness of this and ensuring consistency of implementation. (Working paper 3)

- **Local governance, resources and patronage.**

The promotion of local development activities by external agencies represented a considerable opportunities for those in positions of power and influence. Where an external donor was involved those community leaders/representatives in direct contact with them were able to increase their positions of power and patronage through such mediation with the community (Working Paper 6). Additionally where tangible resources were to be distributed through community mechanisms they became the means of reinforcing/recreating relations of patronage (Working Paper 5). In these cases questions arise about how far democratically elected village governments are bypassed/undermined by such initiatives and what the impacts for the poor are.

#### **4. 4 Community driven development**

We hesitate to generalise about community driven development as a whole on the basis limited number of case studies. However, the reviews of policy on community driven development, HIV/AIDS and Water in Tanzania and South Africa did raise issues pertinent general issues:

- Coverage of community services is patchy and highly dependent on the resources and capacities of particular communities. A question must be raised then whether the focus on localism is serving to reinforce inequities of provision.
- There is a common and little discussed assumption in policy of the benefits of participatory approaches and little attention given to the need to support inclusive processes or to specifically protect the poor. Legal and institutional frameworks provide the enabling environment for community driven development, but are often weak and ill coordinated. Examples include legislation on gender equality, domestic violence and rights to access resources and services. The lack of coordination in policy and implementation approaches, competition for resources between different implementing agencies and lack of knowledge of rights means that community-based organisations often operate in an arena of contradictory messages/initiatives.
- Creating an 'enabling environment' through improved coordination and regulation of funds, improved and *targeted* legislation and implementation the creation of social safety nets and specific advocacy/championing of the rights of the poor would increase the possibilities effective community based approaches.



## 5. Dissemination and promotion

### Advisory/Review Meetings

All partnership meetings were utilised as the opportunity to disseminate ‘work in progress’ ideas and findings between the British, South African and Tanzanian partners.

- Initial partner meetings to select local researchers, case studies and refine methodology, BCID (2004).
- Tanzania 2004, 2005; training of local research teams. Case studies selected to reflect community-based initiatives in rural water supply and in HIV/AIDS care
- South Africa- January 2005-partner meeting with AICDD to discuss methodology and approach
- Bradford May 2005, BCID meeting with Patrick Mbulu, AICDD coordinator
- Tanzania, July 2005, meeting with research team, including Lindiwe Mdhuli-Research co-ordinator for South African case studies
- Bradford January 2006, week long workshop with Lindiwe Mdhuli (AICDD) and Bradford based team to standardise analysis and agree findings.
- Bradford June 2006, Workshop on Community Driven Development ( see below) with participation of Ian Goldman from AICDD.

### Workshops and conferences

- **Workshop on Community Driven Development and Local Actors**  
University of Bradford June 2006 (programme & proceedings appended)  
Presentations included ‘Who participates in collective action?’ (Anna Toner), Health Care Provision, community volunteers and HIV/AIDS in a roadside town’ (Jelke Boesten) ‘Four Country Community Based Worker Project in Sub Saharan Africa’ (Ian Goldman AICDD), ‘Rethinking Agency in Collective Action’ (Frances Cleaver). Summary of proceedings can be found at  
[http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/bcid/seminar/interlink/CDD\\_workshop\\_June\\_14.pdf](http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/bcid/seminar/interlink/CDD_workshop_June_14.pdf)
- **African Studies Association Conference:** 2 panels of the African Studies Association Annual conference coordinated by Jelke Boesten, SOAS, London September 2006. Sessions titled ‘Understanding community action with regard to water and HIV/AIDS’ and presentations by ‘Precarious future: community activism and HIV/AIDS in a Tanzanian roadside town’ (Jelke Boesten), ‘Striking a balance: community participation and bureaucratic management of water service provision in Tanzania and South Africa.’ (Anna Toner) ‘ and ‘Rethinking agency in community action’ (Frances Cleaver).  
(see website for programme, abstracts and summary of proceedings  
[http://www.bradford.ac.uk/acad/bcid/seminar/interlink/summary\\_of\\_proceedings.pdf](http://www.bradford.ac.uk/acad/bcid/seminar/interlink/summary_of_proceedings.pdf))

- **Africa Prospects for Peace and Development Conference:** 1 panel at the ‘Africa: Prospects for Peace and Development’ conference organised by the Departments of Peace Studies and International Development in Bradford, November 2006. Papers presented: Frances Cleaver, ‘Social Embeddedness of Natural Resource Management in Africa’, Anna Toner ‘Water Provision in Tanzania and South Africa’, and Jelke Boesten, ‘Community Activism and AIDS: a case-study from Tanzania’.(Presentations to be combined for a chapter of an edited book forthcoming from the conference –see below.)
- **Posters** detailing research in progress presented at University of Bradford’s Annual Research Showcase, 2004, 2005, 2006.

### **Additional funding for research**

Building on this study, Jelke Boesten, secured an ESRC grant to study ‘AIDS Activism, Stigma and Violence in Tanzania and beyond’. (Grant awarded as part of the ESRC Non-Governmental Public Action Programme.) She will continue dissemination activities through the work on the ESRC project.

## **6. Publications**

To date our publications strategy has focussed on policy and practitioner dissemination and completing a series of working papers for electronic publication in order to solicit feedback. We are now concentrating on developing more academic papers for publication in peer reviewed journals and books.

### **6.1 Peer reviewed journals:**

Boesten J, F Cleaver and A Toner ‘Dilemmas of community based workers in service delivery’ Draft paper to be submitted to refereed journal January 2007.

Boesten, J., ‘Precarious Future: Community volunteers and HIV/AIDS in a Tanzanian roadside town.’, to be submitted to *Development and Change* in early 2007. (paper appended)

Boesten, J., ‘Transactable Sex and Unsafe Practices, HIV/AIDS in a Tanzanian Roadside Town’. Draft paper to be submitted to refereed journal January 2007.

### **6.2 Books and book chapters**

Boesten J, F Cleaver and A Toner (forthcoming 2007) Participatory development at the village level: evidence from Tanzania’ in N.Poku and J.Weiss (eds) *Peace and Development in Africa* ( publisher to be confirmed).

Boesten, J., and Poku, N. (eds.) *Gender and AIDS in the Developing World*, Ashgate, 2008.

### 6.3 Policy/practitioner briefings

Cleaver F ( 2006) ‘ Local institutions and participatory development’ Sustaining Livelihoods in Sub-Saharan Africa, Issue 18, February. (Disseminated through AICDD Africa wide network of CBO’s, NGO’s and government officials throughout Africa- estimated readership 3000).

Boesten, J., ‘HIV/AIDS and community action: Volunteers need institutional support’ BCID Research Briefing, University of Bradford, October 2006.

### 6.5 Electronic dissemination

The working papers for the research project are published on the University of Bradford website at

<http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/bcid/research/poverty/projects/interlink/papers/index.php>

Date	Title	Author
January 2007	CDD Working Paper No 12. Findings: Community Driven development – Understanding the interlinkages between individuals, community based workers and institutions.	Jelke Boesten, Frances Cleaver, Anna Toner.
December 2006	CDD Working Paper No.11. Methodology : Reflections on Local Research in Action by	Jelke Boesten, Frances Cleaver, Anna Toner.
August 2006	<a href="#">CDD Working Paper No.10. Case Study: Community-based workers and HIV/AIDS in Bloemfontein, South Africa .(PDF)</a>	Lindi Mdhuli, African Institute for Community-Driven Development
July 2006	<a href="#">CDD Working Paper No.9. Case Study: Kileuo Village - the role of community-based workers in maintaining a gravity-fed pipeline with no external intervention.(PDF)</a>	Anna Toner
July 2006	<a href="#">CDD Working Paper No.8. Case Study: Hai District Water Supply Project. (PDF)</a>	Anna Toner
July 2006	<a href="#">CDD Working Paper No.7 Case Study: Tsogang Water and Sanitation project, Lefahla village, Limpopo Province. (PDF)</a>	Lindi Mdhuli, African Institute for Community-Driven Development

Date	Title	Author
July 2006	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.6</a> <b>Case Study: Uchira Water Users Association.</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	Anna Toner
June 2006	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.5</a> <b>Case Study: Community-based HIV/AIDS prevention and care systems, Northern Tanzania.</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	Jelke Boesten
May 2006	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.4</a> <b>Policy Overview: HIV/AIDS Policy in South Africa.</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	African Institute for Community-Driven Development
May 2005	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.3</a> <b>Policy Overview: Community-Driven Development in South AfricaM</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	African Institute for Community-Driven Development
November 2005	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.2</a> <b>Policy Overview: A review of policy and practice in relation to water and HIV/AIDS in Tanzania.</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	Comfort Mfangavo, with Frances Cleaver, Anna Toner and Jelke Boesten
November 2005	<a href="#">CCD Working Paper No.1</a> <b>Literature Review: Community-based Workers and Service Delivery</b> ( <a href="#">PDF</a> )	Jelke Boesten

The working papers related to the water related case studies and findings are also published on a new website reporting research on Water Governance at <http://splash.bradford.ac.uk/home/> which is likely to reach a wide audience of academics, policy makers and practitioners in water and development.