

UK Department for International Development

Fostering Trust and Transparency in
Governance:

*Investigating and Addressing the Requirements for
Building Integrity in Public Sector Information Systems
in the ICT Environment*

Final Report
February 2006 to October 2008



International Records Management Trust

January 2009

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACBF	African Capacity Building Foundation
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
DFID	Department for International Development
ESAAG	East and Southern African Association of Accountants General
ESAMI	East and Southern African Management Institute
ESARBICA	Eastern and Southern African Regional Branch of the International Council on Archives
ICA	International Council on Archives
ICT	Information communication technology
IDRC	International Development Research Centre, Canada
IFMIS	Integrated Financial Management Information System
IMF AFRITAC	International Monetary Fund Regional Technical Assistance Centres
IRMT	International Records Management Trust
MDAs	Ministries, departments and agencies
NIC	National Informatics Centre, New Delhi
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PEFA	Public Expenditure and Accountability Framework
PMEC	Public Management Establishment Control database, Zambia
SADC	Southern African Development Community
TLIMS	Tribal Land Information Management, Botswana

CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction	3
Objectives for the Project	3
Purpose and Approach	3
Benefits and Anticipated Outcomes	5
Methodology	6
Consultations with Stakeholders	7
Overview	7
Video Conference Exchange of Case Study Findings	7
Educators' Forum	8
Regional Stakeholders' Meeting	9
Meetings with International Organisations	9
Case Study Findings: Key Lessons Learned	13
Overview	13
e-Government and Electronic Information Systems	13
Human Resource and Payroll Management Systems	14
Land Management	15
Legal and Regulatory Environment	15
Records Policies and Procedures	16
Interface between Manual and Electronic Systems	16
Data Integrity, Security and Access	17
Data Completeness and Accuracy	18
Digitisation	18
New Skills Requirements	18
Consequences for Good Governance, Anti-Corruption and Accountability	19
Conclusions	20
Impact of Poor Records Management in the Electronic Environment	20
A Centre of Excellence for Electronic Records Management in Africa	22
Outputs	24

Overview	24
Case Studies	24
Training Modules	25
Good Practice Guidance and Performance Indicators	25
Route Maps	26
Dissemination	26
Management and Reporting Arrangements	26
Steering Committee	26
Reporting to DFID	27
Project Management/Research Team	28
Next Steps	28
Appendix A Overview of Expenditure	31
Appendix B Logical Framework	35
Appendix C Notes from the Stakeholder Video Conference, May 2007	49
Appendix D Resolutions from the Stakeholders Meeting, April 2008	55
Appendix E Minutes of Steering Committee Meetings	59
Appendix F People Consulted / Project Participants	73
Appendix G Global Dissemination List	91

INTRODUCTION

- 1 This report summarises the findings and achievements of the project between February 2006 and October 2008. It builds upon the annual reports submitted in 2007 and 2008. It describes the research methodology, the research findings, the outputs and outcomes and the management structure for the project.
- 2 The project addressed an issue with significant implications for development in the electronic environment: the absence, in most developing countries, of the infrastructure and capacity needed to manage records input to or generated by Information Communication Technology (ICT) applications.
- 3 The fundamental driver of the project was the recognition that many governments in developing countries are attempting to move to the electronic environment without recognising that there are significant issues that need to be addressed if electronically created records are to remain accessible over time and to provide reliable and accurate evidence of policies, activities and transactions. The project investigated these issues through case studies and through extensive consultations with stakeholders in the eastern and southern African region. It defined strategies for addressing them, drawing upon and adapting emerging international good practice and relating it to the practical realities and constraints identified through the research.
- 4 Drawing on and adapting international good practice, the project developed a set of educational and guidance materials to equip records professionals and assist governments in addressing the challenges of managing records in the electronic environment. These products are being made available free of charge by post in hard and electronic copy, and also via email and through the IRMT's website.
- 5 The project has laid a foundation for managing electronic records as part of the transition to the electronic environment. There now is a significantly higher degree of ownership of the issues involved among records professionals in eastern and southern Africa, as well as a growing awareness of the importance of managing records as evidence among government stakeholders.
- 6 A regional stakeholders' meeting organised through the Project in Pretoria in May 2008, put forward a resolution to establish a Centre of Excellence for Managing Electronic Records. This has aroused a high level of interest, and the report reviews the steps being taken to establish such a centre.

OBJECTIVES FOR THE PROJECT

Purpose and Approach

- 7 The underlying premise of the project was that if computerisation is to provide the basis for informed decision-making and effective service delivery, as well as for

tackling corruption through increased transparency, the information generated in ICT systems must be reliable and trustworthy over time. ICTs are being applied to core areas of government operations, from the management of state resources (principally finance and personnel) to the management of service delivery (including health care, land usage, and justice delivery). The success and sustainability of all of these applications is affected by the quality of the information input to and generated by electronic systems, which should lay an audit trail for accountability.

- 8 The nature of authentic and reliable records is that they are fixed in time and space: they cannot be altered in any way without creating a new record. Electronic records are at risk if they are not managed. They are created, generated, sent, communicated, received, accessed or stored by electronic means that require some form of computer technology. Every time an electronic record is altered, the old record can be lost and a new record created in its place, with the risk of altering the evidence that the records purports to provide. Electronic records also are vulnerable to deterioration and to changes in the hardware and software through which they are accessed. It is critical, therefore, that there should be an appropriate framework of laws, policies and procedures for creating and preserving electronic records that are authentic and reliable evidence regardless of the technology used to create them.
- 9 While the management of records in the electronic environment is of high significance for virtually all areas of governance, the related areas of personnel and payroll management were chosen as the primary focus of the study for several reasons. Taken together, they represent a high impact but under-studied area, where the loss of control of records has a critical impact on the management of two of the most essential state resources, finance and personnel.
- 10 The project examined the capacity for electronic records management and the management of the paper-based information that is input into pay and human resource information systems. Neither issue is receiving sufficient attention at present. The study demonstrated that overall the governments studied are seeking to introduce electronic systems based on manual systems that have been poorly managed or have collapsed and that inadequate attention is being given to the management of the electronic records generated or held by ICT systems.
- 11 The project explored:
 - the management of paper records as inputs to financial and human resource management information systems
 - the management of electronic records as digital outputs
 - the links between them
 - the recordkeeping functionality of the electronic information systems and the long term preservation of digital records.

- 12 It also examined several digitisation projects, including one involving the scanning of personnel records for management and preservation purposes. For comparative purposes, it also gave attention to the management of land records.
- 13 The eastern and southern Africa region was chosen as the principal study area because of the strong regional professional networks, which facilitated the field studies. Originally, the plan was to conduct six case studies of pay and personnel records in Africa and two in Asia in order to provide comparisons. This plan was revised with the agreement of the Steering Committee and the DFID Project Officer for several reasons. In order to gain the confidence of stakeholders responsible for pay and personnel systems and to develop meaningful data, two visits each were made to Ghana, Zambia and Tanzania; only one visit was needed to the smaller countries, Lesotho and Botswana. An additional case study was developed in Sierra Leone, where significant developments were underway in the area of pay and personnel records, drawing on project work undertaken there by the IRMT, making a total of six case studies in Africa. Given the political instability in the proposed South Asia region it was decided to carry out only one Asian case study in Karnataka State in India. To broaden the basis of the study, two of the case studies also examined records relating to land management: Botswana and Karnataka State.

Benefits and Anticipated Outcomes

- 14 The project initiated a new level of awareness of the need to manage electronic records in the eastern and southern African region. Officials involved in the case studies and the stakeholders meetings were introduced to key issues, including the significance of the links between manual and electronic systems, the requirement to develop recordkeeping functionality in computer applications, and the need to consider long term preservation issues.
- 15 The case studies provided the basis for developing a new set of relevant educational materials. Working with a team of international experts from Africa, Europe, North America, Asia and Australia, the Project Team developed five training modules in electronic recordkeeping, including one in human resource and payroll management that should enable teachers and trainers in universities and training institutes to become familiar with records management issues and introduce records professionals to the concepts involved. The wide distribution of these materials should trigger the development of new understanding and appropriate new skills.
- 16 The distribution of the case studies that were developed during the project will enhance the value of the training materials and contribute to the understanding of the issues by officials and development planners.
- 17 A set of records management indicators was developed to measure the degree to which records management is integrated in ICT systems. It presents good practice statements for managing records created and held in ICT systems, based on international standards. The indicators can be used to determine whether or not

good recordkeeping policies and practices are present in existing systems or are being followed in the design and implementation of new systems. This should, for the first time, enable governments to benchmark progress toward integrating records management in ICT systems.

- 18 Overall, the project deliverables should help governments strengthen the evidentiary value of the information that electronic systems are designed to manage and in this way to contribute to the achievement of development goals, including the reduction of poverty and the protection of rights and entitlements. Ultimately, when records management principles become a standard part of governance reform, data integrity will be enhanced, governments will be more transparent in their actions, transactions and decision-making, ICT applications will have a higher success rate and there will be greatly enhanced protection for citizens' rights and entitlements. However, this is a long term goal, and its achievement will require long term efforts in an ever changing, ever more complex environment.

METHODOLOGY

- 19 Working in conjunction with academics from University College London, the University of Ghana and the University of Botswana, the Project Team developed a Research Toolkit to provide background on the issues, set out logistical details and define the research strategy and methodology. The research involved literature searches, gathering data through case studies and consultations with stakeholders.
- 20 The case studies used three methods of gathering information. The aim was to provide as complete a picture as possible and to cross check the information. The methods included:
- *Collecting qualitative information.* This included information about public sector reform, electronic governance initiatives, pay and personnel processes, and records management structures and procedures. The information provided background and context for the research and helped identify links between pay and personnel processes and recordkeeping. A list of likely stakeholders and a set of high level questions was developed to guide the research process.
 - *Mapping information flows.* This method helped to identify weaknesses in control systems for human resource management and payroll. System inputs and outputs were identified, information flows were analysed and current processes and controls were identified.
 - *Conducting quantitative research.* As far as possible, personnel and payroll records were sampled and examined to evaluate the quality of personnel information available for input to payroll systems. This was most successful in Lesotho, Ghana and Zambia, but gaining access to the records was a sensitive area in all of the countries studied, and there were limitations on what it was

possible to achieve. For practical reasons, the samples were small, but they provided useful findings that highlighted key issues.

- 21 Flexibility was needed to address unforeseen complications in data gathering, but the research team was successful in collecting a considerable quantity of information that made it possible to assess the state of records management and its context within the different case study countries. Overall the combined methodologies were effective in providing an understanding of manual and electronic records issues in of the case study countries.
- 22 The methodology led to the successful delivery of research findings that could be related to international good practice in order to produce educational and analytical tools.

CONSULTATION WITH STAKEHOLDERS

Overview

- 23 The project provided a range of opportunities for working closely with government stakeholders who, collectively, offered insight into their governments' aspirations for enhancing the control of state assets and services for citizens through the development of electronic applications. Within the eastern and southern Africa regions, there is a broad commitment to introducing electronic government as rapidly as possible.
- 24 It was clear that policy makers and users had only limited opportunities for direct contact with records professionals. At times senior officials indicated that the discussions on electronic records were an 'eye opener', while at other times the whole concept of university educated professionals being involved in records management appeared to be a revelation. Records professionals also were exposed to high level issues and priorities in government with which they were not familiar. Bringing these two groups together enabled policy makers, users and records practitioners to gain a new understanding of their different perspectives on the issues.
- 25 The Project developed several means of consulting stakeholders, as described below.

Video Conference Exchange of Case Study Findings

- 26 In June 2007, when the case study research had produced a significant set of findings, a video conference was organised to facilitate an exchange of information between stakeholders working in the areas of financial and human resource management, ICT development and records management in Ghana, Tanzania, Zambia and Sierra Leone. The conference successfully linked officials participating from Accra, Dar es Salaam, Lusaka and Freetown; DFID staff in London and World Bank staff in Washington; and

Project Team members participating from several of the conference sites. This gave stakeholders an opportunity to exchange views and experiences in implementing paper-based and electronic human resource and payroll management information systems and to consider the related data integrity issues.

- 27 The participants discussed the key findings arising from the case studies. These included:
- the general state of manual and electronic records
 - the need to put in place or update the regulatory environment and infrastructure for managing records
 - the impact of technology
 - the lack of understanding of the requirement to manage information as evidence
 - the need for sensitisation and training of public officials and records staff on recordkeeping issues.
- 28 The participants repeatedly expressed strong interest in training and education for the region and in the development of appropriate training materials. Their input and comments were valuable during the development of the project deliverables.

Educators' Forum

- 29 An educators' forum took place in July 2007 at the University of Botswana, Department of Library and Information Studies in Gaborone. The purpose was to plan the structure and content of the training materials. Eight educators and senior record professionals participated in the forum. They comprised representatives from the University of Botswana, Moi University in Kenya and University College London, as well as an educational expert/editor who had been appointed to the Protect Team in early 2007 to take responsibility for developing the training materials.
- 30 Following the forum, the editor worked with the forum participants and with an international team of records managers to prepare an overall structure for a package of training materials on electronic records management and to define the contents of each module.
- 31 The consultations, both in Africa and internationally, helped to ensure that the training modules and other materials were planned to take account of global good practice principles and were, at the same time, designed for use in a low resource environment.

Regional Stakeholders' Meeting

- 32 In April 2008, 60 participants from 13 countries in eastern and southern Africa participated in a stakeholders' meeting in Pretoria, South Africa on *Records Management in the Digital Environment: New Findings in Pay and Personnel Information Management*. The countries represented were Angola, Botswana, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Tanzania (including Zanzibar), Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe. Stakeholders included accountant generals, auditors, human resource managers, ICT professionals, e-Government specialists, records managers and national archivists. The list of participants is included in Appendix F.
- 33 The sessions covered international experience of electronic recordkeeping issues and developments in financial management information systems, and there was a review of the project outputs: case study findings, training materials and records management performance indicators. The speakers included a World Bank financial management expert for Africa, a leading electronic records specialist with extensive practical experience in the federal Government of Australia and members of the Project Team.
- 34 There was a positive exchange of views between senior officials and records professionals about improving records management practices, enhancing personnel and payroll records and developing electronic recordkeeping systems in the countries represented. Many of the officials had never before considered the significance of records as evidence for governance, but they said repeatedly that they now saw this as a missing link in their ability to bring about change and tackle corruption. They wanted to collaborate in finding the means to take the issues forward and address the problems that had been identified. A copy of the resolutions passed is at Appendix D. The requirement to establish a Centre of Excellence in Managing Electronic Records was a key resolution.

Meetings with International Organisations

Overview

- 35 Throughout the project, members of the project team held numerous meetings with officials of relevant international bodies. The most significant of these discussions were with staff of the World Bank, the International Council on Archives (ICA), the Eastern and Southern African Regional Branch of the ICA, the East and Southern African Association of Accountants' General (ESAAG) and the Canadian International Development Research Centre (IDRC).

World Bank

- 36 Meetings were held with World Bank staff in Washington DC at regular intervals throughout the project, both as a means of understanding how records management could support and be positioned in relation to development initiatives and to draw specifically on the experience of experts in financial management, human resource management, ICT development and the development of indicators. World Bank staff input to the development of records management performance indicators was particularly valuable. In addition, three senior Bank staff members (two financial management specialists and a public administration specialist) served on the Project Steering Committee and provided useful advice on project matters. A list of people consulted at the Bank is at Appendix F.

International Council on Archives (ICA)

- 37 Regular meetings also were held with the International Council on Archives (ICA), the primary international body supporting the records profession. Members of the Project Team met ICA officials in Paris, in London, at two Round Table meetings of National Archivists (Curacao, 2006 and Quebec City, 2007) and at the ICA's International Congress (Kuala Lumpur, 2008). Through its elected officials, the ICA, expressed strong interest in supporting records professionals in linking records management to development requirements, developing relevant new training programmes, developing greater collaboration with government officials and building greater capacity to manage electronic records as an aspect of electronic governance. In addition, the ICA has placed an increasing emphasis on records and governance in the electronic environment in its international programmes. It has expressed its interest in collaborating on future training and awareness exercises.
- 38 Members of the Project Team made several presentations to the Congress of the ICA in Kuala Lumpur in July 2008, including:
- *Public Information Systems: Building Data Integrity for Accountability and Transparency*, Dr Anne Thurston (Project Director) and Michael Hoyle (Project Manager)
 - *Training in Electronic Records Management: Introducing a New Educational Package*, Dr Laura Millar (Editor)
 - *Planning and Implementing Electronic Records Management Programmes*, Dr Laura Millar.
- 39 The sessions provided opportunities to consult with senior records professionals from around the world who have a keen interest in professional development in the area of electronic records management.

Eastern and Southern African Regional Branch of the International Council on Archives (ESARBICA)

- 40 The East and Southern African Branch of the ICA, ESARBICA, was a partner in the project, and its President was a member of the Steering Committee. ESARBICA played an important advisory role throughout the research and during the development of the deliverables. Its Board was keen to be kept informed of the project activities, and it identified reviewers for the project deliverables to ensure that the deliverables reflected their local requirements and had practical value. The national archivists of all of the member states in the region are members of the ESARBICA Board. They participated actively where case studies carried were out in their countries, ie Zambia, Tanzania, Lesotho and Botswana. The President of ESARBICA and most of its Board attended the regional stakeholders' meeting in Pretoria.
- 41 Project Team members met with the ESARBICA Board twice in 2008, first in Pretoria and then again in Kuala Lumpur. Other discussions were held throughout the project with individual board members and by telephone and by videoconference. These sessions helped to keep the Project Team informed of developments in the region and to build ownership of the project and its outputs.

East and Southern African Association of Accountants General (ESAAG)

- 42 The East and Southern African Association of Accountants General (ESAAG) also was a partner in the project, and its Chief Executive Officer (CEO) was a member of the Steering Committee. Various discussions with the CEO provided an understanding of the records-related issues facing the accountants' generals in eastern and southern Africa. Most of the meetings took place by telephone or through videoconferences, but the ESAAG CEO attended the regional Stakeholders' Meeting in Pretoria in April 2008, where he made valuable contributions. A good rapport was developed, and ESAAG is keen to collaborate further.

International Development Research Centre (IDRC)

- 43 On the advice of the DFID Project Officer and also of a World Bank Global Knowledge Programme Officer, the Project Director made a series of visits to the International Development Research Centre (IDRC) in Ottawa to meet the Director of ICT for Development. He recognised the project's significance for the IDRC's work on strengthening ICTs and electronic government and on anti-corruption. He felt that the previous lack of attention to records as evidence on the global development agenda represented a high-risk gap, both in terms of ICT development and anti-corruption strategies.
- 44 The IDRC funded two initiatives that directly complemented the research programme. Firstly, it supported the costs of producing a documentary film entitled *Ghost Busting: Establishing Payroll Integrity in Sierra Leone*, which examined a new methodology

developed in Sierra Leone for using records as evidence to verify the civil service payroll. Secondly, it funded a strategic planning meeting for a senior group of records professionals from east, west and southern Africa. The meeting, held in Ottawa in May 2008, also included a senior public administrator from Tanzania, who had oversight of records management work there, and a barrister from Nigeria, who has extensive experience of legal issues in the electronic environment.

- 45 The meeting explored records management issues in relation to new trends in ICT development and identified key areas where further research is required. The aim was to define a strategic way forward for developing records management in relation to information and communication technology (ICT) and anti-corruption policies and strategies. The IRMT prepared a discussion paper on the key issues in relation to records management, electronic government and corruption, which helped to provide a focus for the discussions.
- 46 Participants in the Ottawa meeting were from The Gambia, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Tanzania, Zimbabwe, Canada, the United States (a Vice-President of the ICA) and the United Kingdom. Together, they identified a series of issues in relation to records management, electronic government and corruption that should be addressed by an in-depth research programme. In particular, they identified the need to carry out research aimed at:
- demonstrating the causal relationship between weak control systems, weak accountability, the lack of complete and reliable records and corruption, especially in relation to public sector financial and human resource management
 - defining the consequences for citizens if records management is not built into development programmes with an emphasis on the contribution that good records management can make to service delivery in different sectors
 - identifying new strategies to create awareness among decision-makers and build political will for improving records management as a foundation for national development and anti-corruption programmes
 - defining the management infrastructure needed to support electronic records management, including the policies, responsibilities, organisation structures and standards required to manage electronic records and the costs involved, as well as defining the necessary intergovernmental linkages to enable information sharing.
- 47 The participants at the Ottawa meeting reiterated the need for an African Centre of Excellence for Managing Electronic Records that could raise the profile of records management in Africa, facilitate ongoing research and disseminate the findings, good practices and practical solutions to stakeholders in such a way that it would make an impact on development.

- 48 The IDRC is prepared to consider providing research funding to develop concrete, cross-cutting research that will help to bring records management more implicitly onto the international development agenda.

CASE STUDY FINDINGS: KEY LESSONS LEARNED

Overview

- 49 The case study research produced a range of findings that provided new insights into the significance of records for good governance in the electronic environment, particularly in relation to the management of pay and personnel information. Key issues identified were:
- the generally weak legal and statutory environment for records
 - the lack of clearly defined records policies and procedures
 - the absence of a link between records in paper and electronic formats
 - the need to address issues relating to data integrity, including security and access to records, data completeness and accuracy and digitisation
 - the requirement for education and training.
- 50 None of the systems studied during the case studies took adequate account of the need to incorporate functional requirements for capturing and preserving electronically generated records as part of systems design. Nor were long term preservation requirements being adequately addressed.
- 51 The case studies are included in Part II of this report: the deliverables.

e-Government and Electronic Information Systems

- 52 Each of the case study nations had an ICT strategy. The strategies, which often were linked to broader public sector reforms and development goals, set out the direction for the nation as it moved forward in delivering policies and services electronically. Broadly, ICT was regarded as the solution that would enable governments to manage resources efficiently, support economic development effectively and allow citizens greater access to the governance process and services. The ICT strategies and policies identified areas of government where new electronic information systems were to be implemented and outlined the expected benefits. Records management was seen as a part of e-government strategies in some but not all.
- 53 While stakeholders were in no doubt about the substantial contribution that technology could make to the business of government, there was little recognition of

the requirement to manage the records input or held in the electronic systems. Often technology was seen as the whole answer to all information management problems, and there were unrealistic expectations as to what could be expected from the electronic systems, especially given the often poor state of input data. Furthermore, the systems themselves lacked records management functionality and the capacity to keep unalterable evidentiary information over time. There was little or no professional records management input to systems design, nor was there any real involvement by records staff in the proper management of electronic information. Government officials appeared unaware of the need to plan for the management of records as evidence in the electronic environment.

Human Resource and Payroll Management

- 54 Usually, the payroll was linked to the human resource system through some sort of integrated financial management system. However, even where the systems themselves were integrated, the information that the systems were intended to manage did not work together as a whole. The human resource information held in the agency responsible for the public service management tended to be managed in isolation from the payroll information held in the accounting area of the finance ministry. Furthermore, the paper-based and the electronic human resource information systems tended to operate in parallel without being linked. As a result, the benefits of integration for developing accurate, reliable and integrated information for human resource management and for managing the payroll could not be effectively realised.
- 55 The following systems were examined:
- Ghana: Integrated Personnel and Payroll Database
 - India (State Government of Karnataka): *Vethana* payroll system
 - Lesotho: UNIQUE human resource information system
 - Tanzania: Human Capacity Management Information System
 - Zambia: Public Management Establishment Control System
 - Sierra Leone: Human Capital Accountability module of the Integrated Financial Management Information System.
- 56 The system environment was often dynamic and fluid, with a significant human resource system upgrade either planned or being undertaken. Flexible next generation software, using web-based browser technologies, often was being introduced so that ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs) would have greater system access and control of data. There was a trend toward devolving the central management of human resource information to local agencies and local governments.

- 57 In all case study nations, the human resources systems were being used to drive the payroll, but they did not yet make a significant contribution to personnel planning and management, although this was an aspiration. Business process re-engineering was being driven by procurement considerations as much as by information requirements.
- 58 Weak controls in the paper-based environment resulted in incomplete and sometimes inaccurate paper based records, which had implications for the accuracy of payroll data, both in terms of the lack of reliable input information and of the ability to verify the payroll against legally reliable evidence that could serve as a basis for resolving errors and fraudulent entries.

Land Management

- 59 Two land information systems were studied for comparative purposes:
- India (State Government of Karnataka): the *Bhoomi* computerised land administration system
 - Botswana: the Tribal Land Information Management System (TLIMS).
- 60 The *Bhoomi* system in Karnataka was clearly regarded as very successful. It had been rolled out across the state, it had won a UN award and it was viewed as a leading world system. There was, however, a need to pay greater attention to the long term arrangements for managing land records and transaction information in electronic form.
- 61 The TLIMS system in Botswana was much smaller in scope and was still under development during the case study visit. It had been piloted in two land boards, but it had suffered from a number of project management and records management related challenges. The Government was aware of these difficulties and in the months following the study it has moved to address many of the issues.

Legal and Regulatory Environment

- 62 The infrastructure and regulatory arrangements needed to ensure the survival of reliable and accurate records as evidence in the electronic environment were weak in the case study countries. Most of the countries had legislation relating to records and archives, but often these laws tended to have been developed to address the paper-based environment. With some exceptions, most of the records-related legislation made no specific reference to electronic records. Auditors in particular were aware of these weaknesses. They were concerned that they would not be able to properly fulfil their audit function if the records were not complete, reliable and accessible over time, a situation that would result in a loss of confidence in a government's ability to be accountable for its management of resources.

Records Policies and Procedures

- 63 Few of the case study countries had developed strong records management policies, nor was there a real awareness of the need for such policies. Tanzania was in the process of developing a national records management policy at the time of the case study. Strategies for managing the relationship between paper-based and electronic information in support of ICT initiatives had not been developed. While, generally, senior records staff were aware of the international standard for records management, ISO 15489, there was no evidence that officials in central government agencies had any real understanding of internationally accepted good records management practice.

Interface between Manual and Electronic Systems

- 64 While governments were eager to move away from paper-based systems, large volumes of paper records continued to be created and stored without being managed. The national archival institutions, the statutory bodies responsible for overseeing records management, had limited resources to deal with the ongoing flood of paper records. Procedures were often informal, and there were few procedure manuals. In many cases, the number of trained professionals with the skills and experience needed to address the problems was inadequate. The low status of archival institutions in relation to mainstream government functions made it difficult for them to work effectively with other government agencies on records and information policies; it was rare for records and archives staff to work with senior officials on information policies.
- 65 Usually, the payroll was linked to the human resource system through an integrated financial management system. However, even if the systems themselves were integrated, the information that they were intended to manage was not. The human resource information held in the agency responsible for the public service management tended to be managed in isolation from the payroll information held in the accounting area of the finance ministry. Furthermore, the paper-based and the electronic human resource information systems tended to operate in parallel without being linked. As a result, the benefits of integration for developing accurate, reliable and integrated information for human resource management and for managing the payroll could not be effectively realised.
- 66 The 'disconnect' between the management of paper and electronic records was fostered by the fact that the information held in electronic systems was under the control of technology specialists, who were well trained but did not have an understanding of such issues as records integrity and long term preservation. Of the small number of well trained records managers in the public sector, virtually none had in-depth knowledge of the requirements for managing electronic records. Paper records tended to be looked after by clerical staff with limited training, low status and poor remuneration. Registries tended to be viewed as dumping grounds for junior staff who could not be employed elsewhere.

- 67 Despite the need to populate electronic systems with information from paper-based systems, little work had been done to strengthen the paper-based systems. In many cases, the paper based systems were dismissed as not being an accurate data source, even though they contained a substantial amount of essential information. Upgrading paper-based systems was regarded as not worthy of investment of time and resources.
- 68 Both records and ICT specialists needed training to equip them to work together to introduce international good practice on electronic records management. The practical reality was that for the foreseeable future, records would continue to be generated in both paper-based and electronic formats, and these records would need to be managed as part of a holistic approach to avoid fragmentation. Links need to be made between systems holding related information in different forms until such time that the electronic information can be managed reliably and in accordance with legal requirements and international standards as the sole source of information.

Data Integrity, Security and Access

- 69 In India, biometric (finger or thumb print) access was built into the electronic land administration system, and in other case study countries, audit trails had been developed as part of the system design as a means of checking who accessed and authorised changes to the electronic record. Biometric data also was being entered into the personnel database in Sierra Leone to ensure that the record applied to the correct employee. Personal identification numbers and photographs were being used to ensure that a personal record could only refer to one employee. Typically, changes in electronic data had to be authorised at senior levels.
- 70 Nevertheless, despite these encouraging trends, data integrity issues were identified as an ongoing problem in many of the systems studied, both paper-based and electronic. Security of electronic human resource information was generally protected by password, but this was only partially effective as a means of securing access to information in the database. There was evidence in some countries that staff had been caught tampering with and accessing information inappropriately.
- 71 Security checks and controls also needed to be strengthened for paper-based systems, which provided source data for the electronic systems. Access to paper-based personnel files tended to be loosely controlled, with unauthorised staff being allowed to enter registries to view or borrow files. Personnel information often was held in confidential registries, but in many cases information critical to conditions of employment, for instance, a date of first appointment or date of birth, still could be changed. In some cases, an artificial distinction was made between 'open' and 'confidential' personnel files, with lack of clarity about the categories of documents to be held in each type of file.

Data Completeness and Accuracy

- 72 The completeness and accuracy of paper and electronic information was a key focus of the study of the management of personnel and pay records. There were many cases of missing files at both the central and the MDA levels. Hard copy files often were incomplete or difficult to retrieve. Multiple files for public servants were common, and there was little or no agreement about which documents should be held where and whether personnel records should move with officers when they were transferred from one MDA to another. It was not unusual for information about employees, for instance dates of birth or of first appointment or the spelling of names, to vary between the file in the MDA, the file in the central department for establishment matters and the electronic systems. Incomplete and inaccurate data had an impact on pensions, leave applications and other entitlements.
- 73 Many problems occurred because paper personnel files were not properly maintained. Papers could often take months to be filed, and information was sometimes stolen, altered, lost or misfiled. In most of the countries, system developers had tried to obtain the most accurate possible personnel information before entering data into the database, and head counts and other verification exercises had been undertaken with mixed success. Much more rigorous approaches were needed to ensure the accuracy of the information.
- 74 Completeness and data accuracy was also an issue in relation to land records. In Botswana, problems in obtaining accurate information had a major impact on the government's ability to accurately populate the TLIMS database because files had been poorly managed in the land boards.

Digitisation

- 75 Digitisation was being undertaken in a number of the countries studied, particularly in relation to personnel information. It was recognised that scanned information could provide a useful secure backup, reduce storage costs and make information easily accessible, but there was less recognition of the problems that result from digitising records without a full understanding of the issues involved. More expertise was needed to avoid the tendency to scan too much or too little information and to build in business processes for regularly updating the digital information and linking it to the electronic system.

New Skills Requirements

- 76 The speed with which ICTs are being adopted is not matched by the skills and infrastructure needed to manage the records that the new systems generate. Whereas in many developed countries records managers have begun to make significant contributions to e-government initiatives, often led by national archives

organisations, records management professionals in the developing world have had little involvement with planning and development of ICT systems and e-government strategies. Governments are beginning to recognise information as a key issue, but few records professionals in developing countries are able to make an informed and authoritative contribution to ICT and e-government discussions or to develop solutions; in some cases there has been no significant records management profession at all until recently.

- 77 Governments in Europe, North America and Australia are investing in research leading to strategic approaches for managing electronic information in order to address the risks associated with information integrity, security and long-term accessibility. New skill sets are being developed, and the records profession internationally is setting standards and requirements for electronic record keeping, and communicating strategic objectives to senior stakeholders.
- 78 The lack of parallel programmes in Africa presents governments with a range of challenges, from increased opportunities for fraud and corruption, to the inability of citizens to protect and assert their rights, for example in relation to land administration. Records professionals need to be empowered to contribute to the policies, regulations and systems that govern the way that information and records are created, used and managed. An intensive effort is needed to build appropriate skills. Emerging solutions need to be positioned within a strategic framework that sets a coherent and comprehensive direction for progress.
- 79 The loss of control of pay and personnel information and the resulting impact on the management of financial and human capital assets illustrates the fundamental importance of introducing solutions to address this issue. Nevertheless, many governments do not have the means to tackle the gaps in infrastructure and skills.

Consequences for Good Governance, Anti Corruption and Accountability

- 80 Specifically, the lack of complete and accurate documentation of the employment of public officials had undermined the ability to apply employment controls and payroll management in terms of:
 - reporting within government
 - tracking changes to the personnel establishment and to the payroll
 - identifying and removing ghost workers
 - identifying employees who were due to retire
 - devolving responsibility for payroll and personnel management from centralised authorities to ministries and districts

- meeting national and international audit requirements
- reporting to donors and lenders.

CONCLUSIONS

Impact of Poor Records Management in the Electronic Environment

- 81 Whereas ten or fifteen years ago computer technologies were seen as tools used by governments and institutions in wealthier, more developed countries, they are now seen increasingly as essential resources in African countries and in developing countries around the world. The increasing prevalence of information technologies presents challenges for governments in terms of establishing complete and reliable information that will be accessible and trustworthy over time.
- 82 Many officials still believe that information technologies will provide the solution to information management problems, and often computer equipment is installed in organisations without a clear understanding of how the information generated and held by ICT systems, ie the records, will be managed.
- 83 The research highlighted the fact that it is not possible to achieve control simply by automating inadequate and incomplete manual information systems. Weak records systems, paper or electronic, open the door to fraud, corruption in procurement, misuse of resources and services, and money laundering. Ordinary citizens are the losers. When recordkeeping is poor, delivery of justice is impaired, human rights cannot be protected, freedom of information cannot be implemented, services such as health care are compromised, and civil society cannot hold governments to account. National and international efforts to reduce poverty, improve services, control corruption and strengthen democracy all depend on reliable records. There is a need to define strategies for strengthening the control of records as evidence and to support the implementation of these strategies internationally.
- 84 Many government operations that traditionally have depended on information derived from paper records have become partially or wholly automated. As African governments migrate to an on-line environment, records in electronic form are providing the basis for conducting business, serving the public, managing state resources, measuring progress and outcomes, and protecting their own and others' rights. Governments are increasingly dependent on information in electronic systems to carry out their day-to-day functions, make decisions and provide services.
- 85 In too many cases, ICT systems are introduced without incorporating the essential processes and controls needed for the capture, long-term safeguarding and accessibility of electronic records. This undermines trust in the information generated by government ICT systems; it erodes governments' ability to deliver programmes and services, and to achieve strategic priorities.

- 86 Even as it brings benefits, ICT is exposing governments and citizens to new risks. Electronic media deteriorate, software changes and hardware becomes obsolete. Essential data can be difficult and costly to retrieve after a few years. Millions of dollars are being invested in information systems that do not capture records in a form that will be intelligible, unalterable and usable over time. The widespread use of ICT in Africa and globally has created unparalleled opportunities for scammers and fraudsters. Technology is only one part of the solution to establishing efficient and effective electronic government. Records management, that is, an infrastructure of policies, standards, procedures and trained staff to manage records, is another.
- 87 The study concluded that citizens of African countries are at risk if governments do not develop the means to address the management of records as evidence in the electronic environment. Some of the challenges are:
- Unless sufficient attention is paid to the quality of the source data on which successful ICT implementations depend, information management systems can fail to deliver their intended benefits.
 - Currently, there is no single strategy for addressing and ‘solving’ electronic records management issues.
 - Generally the approach to electronic records management has been *ad hoc* or reactive, and there is a need now for a strategic approach based on international good practice and the lessons learned by the developed world.
 - Electronic records are entirely dependent upon technology; rapid changes in technology require continuous review and modification of electronic records management methodologies. The long-term management of, and access to, information requires a range of new skills that need to be upgraded continually.
 - Records professionals need to approach electronic records management with a long-term vision and with an awareness of their responsibility to continue to upgrade their knowledge about electronic records and current technologies.
 - Digital media are especially vulnerable to loss and destruction, making preservation measures, both more difficult and more important than in the paper environment.
 - Records management policies and controls should be strengthened before ICT systems are introduced. Otherwise, after implementations fail or produce less than optimum results, time and money will be wasted in trying to make systems compliant with records management requirements.
 - Ideally, records management policies and controls should be strengthened before ICT systems are introduced. Otherwise, time and money will be wasted as efforts to establish control after implementation produce less than optimum results or have to be repeated.

- The requirements for managing electronic records generated by or associated with computerised systems should be defined as part of the systems development planning process and should take account of international records management standards.
- Introducing an electronic system for managing documents and records without introducing records management controls will inevitably result in long term difficulties in terms of the integrity, reliability and accuracy of the records and of the ability to preserve them over time.
- A successful electronic records management programme must take account of the legal and organisational environments in which records are created and used.
- It is essential that there should be high-level ownership of the goal of establishing accurate documentary evidence for employment and payroll management. Senior executives should be involved in oversight of programmes for managing records as evidence.
- Records staff must be thoroughly committed to and feel ownership of records management improvement programmes; they must be recognised for their essential contribution to data integrity.
- Integrating recordkeeping in ICT systems requires a team approach involving specialists from IT and records management, audit, legal affairs and security. Successful integration must also involve the managers of the government business processes that are, or will be, supported by ICT systems.

A Centre of Excellence for Electronic Records Management in Africa

- 88 The need for training was repeated as a constant theme in the consultations with stakeholders. The need to establish a Centre of Excellence as a focal point for capacity development and awareness building emerged from the Stakeholders Meeting on *Data Integrity and Recordkeeping in the Digital Environment* In Pretoria in April 2008. The resolutions of the meeting highlighted the requirement for a Centre of Excellence to build capacity in electronic records management and to serve as a forum to bring together stakeholders so that issues of common concern in relation to records management, e-government and ICT initiatives could be tackled as a collaborative and information sharing effort.
- 89 These ideas were endorsed when the IDRC hosted a strategic planning session in Ottawa in May 2008 for a team of African records and information specialists, legal and justice sector and public sector reform experts. The participants noted that new skills were essential to equip records professionals to play a modern and relevant role in managing electronic records in networked business systems and in the desktop

environment; they strongly supported the concept of a Centre of Excellence to achieve this objective.

- 90 In June 2008, the Project Steering Committee examined the requirement for a Centre of Excellence. It recommended that the Project Team explore the possibility of establishing the Centre at the East and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI) in Arusha, Tanzania. It went further to recommend that the African Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF) based in Harare, Zimbabwe should be approached to support the development of the Centre. The Project Team explored this recommendation with a range of African government officials and with development advisers (at DFID and the World Bank), all of whom endorsed the idea. It also was supported unanimously by the ESARBICA Board when it met in Malaysia in July.
- 91 When members of the Project Team visited ESAMI in October 2008, ESAMI management agreed to support the concept of a Centre of Excellence for Electronic Records Management and offered to provide facilities for the delivery of relevant courses. A memorandum of agreement between ESAMI and the IRMT is now being developed. ESAMI, established in 1980 as an intergovernmental regional management development centre with the primary objective of providing high-level specialised management training, is owned and used by member governments that comprise Kenya, Uganda, Tanzania, Mozambique, Malawi, Namibia, Zambia, Seychelles, Swaziland and Zimbabwe. Other countries that are also major users of ESAMI services include Lesotho, Botswana, Rwanda, Burundi, Ghana, South Africa, Nigeria, Angola, Sierra Leone, the Ivory Coast, The Gambia, Sudan, Ethiopia, Eritrea, Liberia and Burkina Faso. ESAMI has field offices in Dar es Salaam, Nairobi, Kampala, Harare, Lusaka, Lilongwe, Maputo, Windhoek and Mbabane. Its programme areas include information technology, governance and public management, financial management and health management.
- 92 Also in October 2008, Project Team members visited the ACBF in Harare. The ACBF recognised the requirement to develop competencies in the management of electronic records and the potential contribution that a Centre of Excellence could make to knowledge management and good governance in Africa, particularly in relation to public administration and to financial management and accountability. The ACBF invited the IRMT to prepare a project proposal for the development of the Centre. The Foundation sees the management of evidence in the digital environment as complementary to the work of its knowledge management and training programmes. It also recognises the potential for a link to the Microsoft initiative to build ICT Capacity in Africa through the public sector and civil society, which is being delivered in collaboration with ESAMI.
- 93 The Department of Library and Information Studies at the University of Botswana also expressed the wish to participate in the Centre for Excellence for Electronic Records Management and has offered to make research in this area a priority. It expects to be able to provide staff time and airfares and subsistence to support a research initiative over time. Since its inception in 1979, the Department has made an outstanding contribution to the education and training of library, records, archives and information

personnel in Botswana and the sub-Saharan Africa regions. An internationally recognised centre of excellence in its own right, the Department perceives information as a key resource in development and has made a unique contribution through research, publication and service to the development of these disciplines throughout Africa.

94 From discussions with the various stakeholders consulted, the purpose of the Centre of Excellence for Electronic Records Management would be to support governments in establishing control of electronic records as an essential foundation for electronic government by helping to:

- build new skill sets for trainers and records staff to support professional, technical and change management requirements, with an emphasis on relating international good practice to real practical problems
- define and promote sustainable legal and regulatory frameworks
- create awareness and ownership of the risks, challenges and responsibilities associated with electronic information, particularly at the senior management level, including policy makers, financial managers, auditors, human resource managers and justice sector officials
- develop and promote standards, good practice models, professional tools and training materials
- develop and promote risk and performance assessment tools.

OUTPUTS

Overview

95 The tools and other products developed by the project are expected to make a significant contribution to the process of strengthening documentary evidence as a basis for transparency and accountability in government. Used to build awareness among stakeholders and to create new skills, they will help to improve the success of ICT initiatives and the achievement of development goals.

Case Studies

96 The case studies enable comparisons between governments' experience and the lessons they have learned as they move from manual to electronic systems. The studies provide new insights on the state of traditional and electronic recordkeeping, particularly in the area of pay and personnel management.

Training Modules

- 97 Experienced educators and practitioners from around the world were invited to participate in the development of a set of the training modules. Contracts were issued to electronic records experts in Australia, Botswana, Canada, Kenya, Singapore, South Africa and the UK in October 2007; content was submitted in December 2007.
- 98 During the first half of 2008, the editor worked on preparing drafts of five training modules:
- *Understanding the Context of Electronic Records Management*
 - *Planning and Managing an Electronic Records Management Programme*
 - *Managing the Creation, Use and Disposition of Electronic Records*
 - *Preserving Electronic Records*
 - *Managing Personnel Records in an Electronic Environment.*
- 99 Peer reviewers were identified, including reviewers nominated by the ESARBICA Board from across the east and southern African region. Comments and feedback were received and integrated in the modules. Copies of the modules are in a separate document containing the deliverables for the project. Full lists of the participants in the Educators Forum as well as the authors and reviewers of the training modules are at Appendix F.

Good Practice Guidance and Performance Indicators

- 100 Good practice guidance material was developed in the form of records management indicators derived from statements of good practice. A tool was produced that defines internationally recognised good practices on the management of electronic records and links them to a set of performance indicators that can be used to measure whether these practices are being followed. The tool assesses performance in the following areas:
- the framework of laws, policies, accountability, governance, strategies and evaluation mechanisms that must be in place to ensure effective integration of records management in ICT systems
 - the integration of recordkeeping in ICT systems during the phases of the systems development life cycle
 - the capability of ICT systems to meet recordkeeping requirements.

- 101 A draft of the indicators was presented for feedback to the Stakeholders Meeting in Pretoria (April 2008), to the Strategic Planning Session in Ottawa (May 2008) and at the ICA Congress in Kuala Lumpur (July 2008). The indicators also were reviewed by senior World Bank staff members who are expert in indicators design, ICT systems and financial management. All of the comments received were integrated in the document.

Route Maps

- 102 Three route maps were prepared to provide sequenced strategies for moving from a paper-based to an electronic information environment. The first accompanies the training modules and is intended to map the stages in introducing electronic records management in governments or organisations. The second and third together support the good practice guidance: one provides an overview of the phases of a records management improvement programme; the other maps the integration of records management in the systems development life cycle.

Dissemination

- 103 The project's deliverables are being distributed by hard copy, by soft copy and through electronic links, as shown in the table at Appendix G. They also will be available to be downloaded free of charge from the IRMT's website.

MANAGEMENT AND REPORTING ARRANGEMENTS

Steering Committee

- 104 A steering committee was appointed to guide and monitor the methodology and outputs of each stage of the project.
- 105 Stephen Sharples, Senior Financial Management Adviser Africa, DFID, chaired the committee. The Project Director and Project Manager worked with him to agree the make up and logistics of the Committee. The other Steering Committee members were:
- Andrew Griffin, Research Officer and UK Director, International Records Management Trust
 - Jerry Gutu, Chief Executive Officer, East and Southern African Association of Accountants General (ESAAG) (2006)
 - Cosmas Lamosai, Chief Executive Officer, ESAAG (2007 and 2008)

- Kelebogile Kgabi, Chair, Eastern and Southern African Branch, International Council on Archives (ESARBICA), and Director, Botswana National Archives and Records Services (2006)
- Peter Mlyansi, Director, Tanzania Records and National Archives Department and Chair of ESARBICA (2007 and 2008)
- Ranjana Mukherjee, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Asia Region, World Bank
- David Sawe, Director of Management Information Systems, Government of Tanzania
- Nicola Smithers, Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank
- Gert Van der Linde, Lead Financial Management Specialist, Africa Division, World Bank.

106 The first Steering Committee meeting was held in December 2006. It was conducted by video conference using World Bank facilities and linked participants at the Bank in Washington with DFID London, DFID Pretoria and DFID Dar Es Salaam. The second meeting was held in November 2007 and the final meeting for the project took place in June 2008. The minutes of the meetings are at Appendix E.

107 The Committee played a strong role in guiding the direction of the project and provided useful advice on various aspects of the deliverables. The IRMT would like to thank the members for their time and input. In addition, the IRMT gratefully acknowledges the World Bank for the use of its video conference facilities, as well as DFID staff for technical assistance, in linking the various locations of the members.

Reporting to DFID

108 The Project Director held regular meetings with DFID staff, including:

- Stephen Sharples, Chair of the Steering Committee (2006 to 2008)
- Dylan Winder, Central Research Department, Project Officer (2006 to 2007)
- Abigail Mulhall, Central Research Department, Project Officer (2007 to 2008).

109 Monthly briefing notes were distributed to the relevant DFID staff, to the Steering Committee and to the Project Team.

110 Financial statements were submitted to Shirley Capstick, (2006 to 2007) and to Liz Harmer (2008).

Project Management/Research Team

111 Members of the project management and research team included:

- Dr Anne Thurston, Project Director and International Director of the IRMT
- Michael Hoyle, Project Manager and Lead Researcher
- Dr Pino Akotia, University of Ghana
- Andrew Griffin, UK Director of the IRMT
- Peter Mazikana, consultant, Zimbabwe
- Dr Laura Millar, Developer and Editor of the Training Modules
- John McDonald, Canadian records and information expert
- Dr Peter Sebina of the University of Botswana
- Dr Justus Wamukoya, University of Botswana (2006 to 2007) and Moi University, Kenya (2007 to 2008).

112 Project co-ordination support was provided by Anthony Hurford (2006) and Luis De Carvalho (2007 to 2008).

113 Full lists of participants at the Educators Forum as well as writers and reviewers of the Training Modules are included in Appendix F.

NEXT STEPS

114 The IRMT is presently engaged in ongoing consultations with stakeholders within the eastern and southern African region and with international professional organisations in relation to the creation of a Centre of Excellence for Electronic records management and research on the relationship between records and governance. This involves:

- reviewing draft memoranda of agreements with ESAMI and the University of Botswana
- preparing a research proposal for IDRC and more broadly, seeking means of conducting ongoing research that demonstrates the significance of records for development, the risks inherent in ignoring the requirement to manage records in the electronic environment and the gaps in the professional and management infrastructure of managing the records

- preparing a proposal for the African Capacity Building Foundation (a Project Identification Note has already been submitted)
- liaising with international professional bodies, particularly the ICA and ARMA International, to identify experts in the field of electronic management who can provide a teaching resource for the Centre (both organisations have already expressed an interest in forming links with the Centre and sharing their members' expertise).

Logical Framework

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
<p><i>Goal:</i></p> <p>1 Governments will be better able to account to their citizens and to make effective use of national and international resources to reduce poverty.</p>	<p>1.1 Theft of state assets is reduced and services to the poor are improved. .</p>	<p>1.1 Country Financial Accountability Assessments</p>	<p>1.1 Government officials accept the need to account to citizens and to increase resources dedicated to supporting the needs of the poor.</p>	<p>It will require sustained effort to achieve this goal. Significant foundations have been laid in terms of awareness and the availability of capacity building material and performance measures. The Sierra Leone case study illustrates the benefits of records management for reducing the theft of state assets.</p>
<p><i>Purpose:</i></p> <p>1 Accurate and reliable records and information will be available in the electronic environment to underpin measures aimed at monitoring policy, managing</p>	<p>1.1 Records management is used as a means of enhancing transparency in government spending in relation to poverty reduction and economic growth.</p>	<p>1.1 Public Financial Management Performance Framework indicator scores improve.</p>	<p>1.1 Governments, donors and international financial institutions give greater priority to records and information as a basis for analysis, decision-making, service delivery and the use of resources to reduce poverty and corruption.</p>	<p>The project products will support governments in improving the quality and integrity of information in ICT systems, thereby strengthening government capacity to access and use accurate and reliable information.</p>

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
resources, reporting financial expenditure and measuring accountability.				
<i>Outputs</i>				
1 Governments will be able to build the infrastructure needed to manage records and information in the electronic environment.	1.1 Laws, policies, procedures and facilities are introduced to protect and preserve records, paper and electronic, over time; records professionals are accorded greater status and play a greater role in national development.	1.1 Benchmarking using the E-Records Readiness Tool and the Records Management Capacity Assessment System (RMCAS)	1.1 Governments support the development of the infrastructure needed to manage records, paper and electronic; donors support records management initiatives as components of development initiatives, including ICT development.	The performance measures/good practice tool and training modules provide a means of empowering records professionals to plan and manage electronic records management programmes; dialogues have been introduced between records professionals and government officials in eastern and southern Africa that have enabled the participation of National Archives institutions in e-government initiatives.

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
				Performance measures have been created in a form that can easily be used for training purposes.
<p>2 Government officials and records professionals will have easy access to sound and cost effective guidance and capacity building material for managing paper and electronic records as evidence.</p>	<p>2.1 Appropriate good practice guidance and capacity building material, compatible with international good practice, is readily available as a basis for building an appropriate level of capacity.</p>	<p>2.1 Good practice guidance and capacity building material is available on the Internet without charge.</p>	<p>2.1 Government officials and records professionals are aware of the good practice and capacity building material and committed to using it.</p>	<p>The project produced a suite of five training modules, authored and peer reviewed by international experts, practitioners and educators in records management. These are consistent with international good practice and designed to be relevant in low resource environments. The project also produced performance measures and seven case studies providing comparative experience. Seventy five hard copy sets and 500 CD sets of all of this material have been distributed free of charge to a wide range of national and</p>

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
				international stakeholders; the material can also be downloaded from the IRMT website without charge.
3 Governments will be able to measure progress toward accountability	3.1 Indicators are developed and used to verify and measure the accuracy of records as evidence in relation to Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers.	3.1 PRSP monitoring reports	3.1 It is be possible to develop indicators that are appropriate for use in relation to PRSPs and other poverty reduction strategic planning tools.	The project developed an assessment tool to measure records management functionality in ICT systems and promote the integration of records management in the design of new ICT systems. Records management functionality includes, for example, data integrity, audit trail and preservation of evidentiary information over time.
4 There will be a higher success rate of e-governance applications with a better use of technical assistance spending.	4.1 E-governance strategies include the management of e-records; electronic records requirements are captured in the specifications for e-applications projects (eg	4.1 The management o electronic records features in e-records readiness assessments.	4.1 Governments and donors recognise that accountability in the electronic environment must include the capture and preservation of electronic records	The project produced comprehensive good practice statements and indicators for integrating records management in ICT systems. Compliance with these good practices

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
	IFMIS development)			will ensure ICT systems are introduced with the essential processes and controls for the capture, long-term safeguarding and accessibility of electronic records.
5 The rights of the poor to access accurate information to assert their rights, entitlements and interests and to raise questions about the use of public resources will be strengthened and protected in the electronic environment through improved availability of records and information.	5.1 Records containing evidence needed to support citizens' rights and entitlements are protected in an accurate and reliable form.	5.1 Citizens, donors, NGOs and journalists are better able to access reliable public sector information; access to information statistics	5.1 Governments are committed to a policy of openness and enhancing the rights of the poor	The case studies, tools and other products developed by the project are expected to contribute to strengthening transparency and accountability in government. Good practice guidance and capacity building materials will enable governments to build public sector information systems that better protect information integrity and evidentiary records.
6 Services to citizens will be delivered on the	6.1 Corruption, leakage and theft of state assets is easier to trace; levels of	6.1 Anti-corruption reports; Country Financial Accountability	6.1 Governments are committed to improving the living conditions of the	The case studies, focusing on payroll and personnel management and land

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
basis of accurate information and resources are more effectively targeted to the poor.	unvouched expenditure diminish; Service provision is enhanced	Assessments, audit reports; PRSP monitoring reports.	poor.	administration systems, enable comparisons between different governments' experience and lessons learned as they move from manual to electronic systems. A new methodology developed in Sierra Leone for removing 'ghosts' from public sector payrolls is presented; substantial savings are documented.
7 The international development community will be able to raise questions about the management of records and information and provide sound advice based on solid research and experience.	7.1 The materials are produced recognised as significant and are used by international donor and financial institutions; the management of electronic records features in international literature on ICT development.	7.1 Technical assistance project reports, country assistance strategies	7.1 The international community makes good use of the project outputs.	The products of the project provide new insights and guidance on the state of recordkeeping, particularly in the area of pay and personnel management. The tools and training modules provide a means of improving the success rate of development initiatives that include ICT systems for managing state resources and services.

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
<p><i>Activities:</i></p> <p>1 A toolkit is developed to enable data collection as a basis for developing records management indicators and designing good practice materials.</p>	<p>1.1 The methodology and toolkit are distributed to team members and form the basis of the training for the research team.</p>	<p>1.1 The tool kit is available on the Internet.</p>	<p>1.1 A research methodology can be developed that results in meaningful data collection linked to development objectives and indicators.</p>	<p>The Toolkit is available on the IRMT website.</p>
<p>2 Senior stakeholders in eastern and southern Africa hold a two day planning meeting on the nature of the research and the best means of maximising its value.</p>	<p>2.1 Eighteen stakeholders from the six participating African countries meet for a two day planning meeting, probably in Tanzania, facilitated by four members of the research team and with inputs from two subject specialists.</p>	<p>2.1 Briefing papers, a record of the proceedings of the meeting and materials presented are available on the project website and described in project reports.</p>	<p>2.1 Stakeholders attend and participated actively in the meeting.</p>	<p>The meeting took place in Pretoria in April 2008. See also Activity 10.</p>
<p>3 The research team and assistants are trained in methodology and data collection in a</p>	<p>3.1 A training programme is prepared. Research team members (four senior researchers and 12 research assistants) are</p>	<p>3.1 The training programme is available on the Internet.</p>	<p>3.1 The training workshop takes account of local realities and international accountability concerns.</p>	<p>Research assistants trained during case study visits.</p>

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
two day training workshop.	trained over 2 days in data collection and research methodology			
4 Case studies are carried out in Africa and an overview report is prepared.	4.1 Seven case studies are conducted in east and southern Africa and one in West Africa and are used as a development resource for reference and teaching purposes. Each study involves three weeks field research by two senior researchers and two research assistants (countries to be agreed with DFID and partner organisations).	4.1 Case studies are available on the Internet.	4.1 Government officials contribute effectively to the case studies.	Seven case studies were compiled and posted to the IRMT website. It became clear that one visit to each country was not enough to gather the information required in the larger countries, two visits each were made to Ghana, Tanzania and Zambia. Studies were completed in Lesotho and Botswana and a study was developed based on IRMT experience in Sierra Leone.
5 Case study findings are exchanged and compared between the participating countries.	5.1 A video conference is held, in two four-hour sessions, to enable up to ten stakeholders from each participating country to examine and compare the case study findings.	5.1 The programme, list of participants and proceedings of the video conference are available on the Internet.	5.1 Technical facilities are available to support videoconference and electronic discussions (World Bank Institute Global Distance Learning Network or DFID). Stakeholders participate	5.1 A video conference of stakeholders took place in June 2007, linking senior government officials in Accra, Dar es Salaam and Lusaka with DFID and World Bank staff as well as project team members in

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
	5.2 A facilitated three-week electronic discussion is conducted to debate and disseminate the findings.	5.2 Summaries of the electronic discussion are available on the internet	actively in the sessions.	Washington, London and Freetown. A summary was posted to the IRMT website. 5.2 Stakeholders felt that an electronic discussion would not be helpful at this stage, so views were exchanged through the video conference and the regional stakeholders' meeting.
6 Comparative case studies are carried out in Asia.	6.1 Two studies are conducted (countries to be agreed with DFID).	6.1 Case studies are available on the Internet.	6.1 Government officials contribute effectively to the case studies.	The case study in Karnataka State, India was completed and posted to the IRMT website.
7 A route map for making the transition to managing electronic information is developed and peer reviewed.	7.1 Five senior researchers, one resource person and one educator attend a six-day planning meeting to prepare a route map strategy for moving from paper-based to electronic information environment and define	7.1 The route map is accessible on the Internet	7.1 The Project Team is able to synthesise international and regional research findings and other experience to agree clear stages and milestones for the transition to managing records in an electronic	Project Team members, educators and other records professionals developed a draft route map in July 2007 during a meeting in Gaborone, Botswana. This map was reviewed and developed further, working with

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
	good practice and capacity building materials required to support it.		environment	international contributors; ultimately, three route maps were produced; one supports the educational modules, and two support the assessment indicators.
8 Good practice guidance materials, including records management indicators are developed and peer reviewed.	8.1 A set of at least five good practice documents are produced and are used in government agencies and training agencies, covering such subjects as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◇ laws and policies ◇ staff responsibility and accountability ◇ effective standards and practices ◇ staff capacities ◇ budget requirements 	8.1 The good practice guidance materials are available on the Internet with a high number of downloads.	8.1 The Project Team is able to synthesise international good practice and local requirements.	The good practice material was developed in the form of performance indicators and was consolidated in one tool. It has been posted to the IRMT website.
9 Training modules are developed for use in training institutions and peer reviewed.	9.1 Four capacity building modules are produced and are used regularly by educators and national records and archives institutions covering subjects including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◇ mapping information 	9.1 The training modules are available free of charge on the Internet, with a high number of downloads.	9.1 The project team is able to synthesise international good practice and local requirements; international and regional partners support the active dissemination of the materials and raise	An initial list of modules and draft content was prepared during the meeting of educators and other records professionals meeting in Gaborone, Botswana. Five modules were prepared

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
	<p>flows to key government functions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◇ managing electronic records ◇ preserving digital records ◇ managing records in relation to public sector development 		<p>awareness of their availability and applicability.</p>	<p>with international contributions and have been posted to the IRMT website.</p>
<p>10 The findings and outputs are presented to regional stakeholders.</p>	<p>10.1 Thirty senior stakeholders from the six participating African countries attend a two-day review meeting facilitated by the five senior researchers.</p>	<p>10.1 A resource pack developed for the meeting is available on the Internet.</p>	<p>10.1 Participation is at a sufficiently high level to make an impact on governance strategies.</p>	<p>The meeting was combined with Activities 2 and 11. In April 2008 sixty senior officials from eastern and southern Africa met for a two day workshop in Pretoria, South Africa. Sessions on current developments on electronic records and effective financial management were presented. The meeting discussed current developments in personnel and payroll and the need for effective recordkeeping. The</p>

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
				programme, list of participants and resolutions have been posted to the IRMT website.
11 One day national workshops are delivered to widen stakeholder involvement in the participating African countries.	11.1 Up to 20 senior government officials attend a one-day seminar in each of the six participating African countries. One member of the research team travels to each country to facilitate the workshops.	11.1 Reports of the meetings are available on the Internet.	11.1 Governments are prepared to endorse the seminars.	Stakeholders advised that it would be most effective to hold one high profile regional stakeholders; meeting, so this activity was combined with Activity 10.
12 Products are linked to RMCAS and disseminated widely.	12.1 The products are linked to the RMCAS analytic matrix, added to the capacity materials database and added to the capacity materials database.	12.1 An updated version of RMCAS is available without charge on the Internet.	12.2 The project outputs can be mapped to the existing capacity assessment system.	Given the developments in technology over the life of the project, it has been recognised that RMCAS needs to be redeveloped using open source software. The training materials will be linked to RMCAS at that time.

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
13 Steering Committee meetings and meetings with international organisations will be held annually to ensure relevance of the outputs and effective support and buy-in by stakeholders.	13.1 One Steering Committee meeting will be conducted annually by video conference for up to ten Steering Committee members; Project Director will travel internationally to visit at least ten partner and international organisations or governments annually.	13.1 Reports of the meetings will be available on the Internet	13.1 Steering Committee members are available to participate in the meetings; meetings can be arranged with international organisations.	Three steering committee meetings were held and the minutes have been posted to the IRMT website. Regular meetings were held with the Chair of the Committee and with individual members. Ongoing meetings were held with international organisations including the World Bank, the International Development Research Centre, the International Council on Archives, the East and Southern African Branch of the International Council on and the East and Southern African Association of Accountants General.
14 Project Management	14.1 Progress will be monitored regularly against the log frame and milestones	14.1 Activities are carried out in consultation with officials at DFID including budget management and	14.1 The Project Team is in place and available to undertake these activities.	The Project Team worked together closely through telephone calls, onsite meetings and video conferences. The project

Project Summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions and Risks	Comments
		reporting. Briefing papers, notes of meetings and reports are prepared and made available.		budget was monitored weekly and regular reports were submitted to DFID. Monthly notes were circulated to the steering committee. Minutes of meetings and project deliverables were posted to the IRMT website as they became available.

Notes from the Stakeholder Video Conference 13 June 2007

Welcome and Introduction of Participants

The meeting was chaired by Michael Hoyle, who invited the participants at each site to introduce themselves.

Overview of the Project

Michael Hoyle, as Project Manager, gave an overview of the project, outlining the key focus of the research, the methodology and deliverables of the project, and the location of the case studies. To date the primary focus has been on human resources and payroll systems, although some comparative work was recently undertaken on land information and finance systems in Karnataka State, India. One further comparative study is expected to be completed, most likely on court records. Some of the issues emerging include moving from first to second generation software, migration and planning for changes in ICT.

Key Issues Arising from the Case Studies

The Chair asked participants to speak about strengths, weaknesses, and issues in their ICT and records system, based on the case study summaries or on their general experience and knowledge. Each of the Case Study nations outlined their experiences with the development of their human resources information and payroll systems. The key issues raised are summarised below.

Ghana

Moving from paper to the computerised environment has proved challenging. With the introduction of electronic systems, officials believed that all information would be transferred into an electronic format. This has not proved to be the case. Manual systems are still in use, and they tend to be centralised, while electronic systems are decentralised. This has contributed to a loss of control of data integrity. In the decentralised environment, for example outside the capital city, files cannot be kept up to date centrally because many records relating to activities at the local level do not reach the centre. There is a need to match functions and records at appropriate levels.

Vendor dependency also is problematic. The first Integrated Personnel and Payroll Database (IPPD) was not robust. There were problems with data entry, and data was tampered with and corrupted. This situation led to a renewed recognition of the need for paper records. Information management remains problematic, in particular the interface between manual and electronic records. With the introduction of IPPD2, there is a strong

emphasis on integrity and reliability of electronic information. Validation of data is currently being undertaken. Many officials lack understanding of the importance of keeping accurate information. Records staff need short course training. In addition, there is a requirement for regulations to guide the management of records in the electronic environment. These need to take into account local policies and practices, for example for those relating to human resource management.

Tanzania

Development of the Human Capacity Management Information System (HCMIS) commenced in 2000. In 2004 the system was rolled out to a number of ministries. Change management was proving challenging. Alternatives need to be found for updating information in the electronic environment. Planning has commenced in managing electronic human resource records. Reliability of infrastructure in the decentralised environment has proved problematic. In addition, there is no single national infrastructure for managing human resources. Technology has proved limited in resolving this issue.

Zambia

The Public Management Establishment Control (PMEC) database is not yet a fully fledged human resource management system. While PMEC does not contain all of the necessary human resource information, and manual systems still are required. In the manual environment there have been issues of duplication and fraud. Records at district level are hard to manage as payroll is managed differently in the districts and information does not flow between central and district levels. Since the data which is essential the PMEC system is centrally controlled, officials in the districts to need to travel to Lusaka to input information into the system. Eventually, PMEC will be rolled out to the regions and districts.

The disconnection between manual and electronic records is viewed as a problem. Computerisation is seen as the solution, but there still is a lack of understanding of the need to manage manual systems. The National Archives is digitising some historical records for preservation purposes. Both paper and electronic versions will be maintained. There are a number of issues concerning the legal framework for recordkeeping and the revisions that are needed in the Public Finance Act and regulations.

Sierra Leone

There are 16,000 civil servants. Many do not have personnel files. Often files are missing key documents, such as the letter of appointment. Master files are kept by the Establishment Secretary's Office/Human Resource Management Office, while working files are kept by the ministries. These two sets of files need to match. The Records Management Improvement Project that is being funded by DFID initially involved four pilot sites for records work, including the Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education, Ministry of

Agriculture, and Establishment Secretary's Office. Work on personnel records now is being carried out across the whole civil service.

Next Steps: Development of Training and Other Materials

The Project Manager asked what training would be useful. The Editor for Project Deliverables asked a follow up question about what training materials (format and structure) and methods or delivery methods would be most useful. The key discussion points are summarised below.

Tanzania

Records management is a very important discipline. To be effective in their jobs, employees need to be encouraged to seek more training in records management. There are two audiences. The first are the users of the systems, while the second are the decision makers. Both audiences need training as governments move from manual to electronic systems. In addition, as officials move from position to position within government, there often is a need for retraining of staff. Managers need to be empowered to educate and develop their employees. Today many public servants have little or no experience with computers and there is a general lack of knowledge about ICT issues. Training for local trainers is essential. There is a need for a strong team within government to train new people in electronic records systems. Public service colleges provide training to public servants and non-public servants. The services of the colleges should be used. Archives directors also can impart knowledge.

Ghana

There is a need for training in the use of computers. All civil servants require ICT training. Human Resources staff need to learn how to properly compile data in electronic environments. In addition, records staff require more specific help in learning about electronic records management. The mix of development between those still using manual systems and those who have moved to an electronic environment means that records staff have to switch between manual and electronic records. While the technical issues are a challenge, there needs to be a strong move to the electronic environment. The benefits of electronic records need to be made clear. Managing both paper and electronic records have challenges. There is a need for workshops, training for trainers and manuals. Hands-on training is essential. Information on how to work electronically is required. A core group must follow up this training. Training should not be limited to records staff. Treasury and other officials need to know the importance of electronic records.

Zambia

Standardised processes across government for manual records make it easier to train people. The management of electronic records also requires standardised processes. The benefits of ICT need to be emphasised. The introduction of electronic systems improves storage and access to records. While training is important, compliance with procedures is a continuous problem. Staff often do not stay in positions long, so repetition of training is necessary. In addition, many public servants move to the private sector once they are well trained so there is a need for ongoing training. Training for trainers, workshops and links with institutions and colleges all are required.

Sierra Leone

The Project case studies will help show similarities across jurisdictions. There is a need to identify key people for training. For example, the ability to train local trainers is important. Stakeholder perception of the calibre of records officers is an issue. There is a strong need to raise the profile of records professionals. Records officers are often viewed as low calibre staff, and the records centre still is considered a dumping ground. Training to perform records audits and to develop effective electronic records and recordkeeping infrastructure is required.

Concluding remarks

The Chair asked each country to make some concluding remarks.

Tanzania

Records management is important for service delivery.

Ghana

Sensitisation is important. Staff need to value electronic records. Records must not be lost from old or outdated computers.

Zambia

Records management is important for the delivery systems of government. The initiative of the IRMT and DFID is appreciated.

Sierra Leone

This is an important venture by the IRMT and DFID. It is hoped that something useful will come out of the process.

Washington

The Chair closed the meeting by thanking Stephen Sharples, Senior Governance Adviser, Africa Policy Department, DFID and Chair of the Project Steering Committee for DFID's assistance in co-ordinating the video conference link ups. He thanked Nicola Smithers, Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank Project and Steering Committee Member for her assistance in the use of Bank facilities, and he thanked Anthony Hurford, the IRMT Project Co-ordinator for bringing all the participants together; and all the observers and case study stakeholders for participating in the video conference.

Appendix D

Conference on Data Integrity and Recordkeeping in the Digital Environment: New Findings in Pay and Personnel Information Management

Pretoria, South Africa, 14 to 16 April 2008

Resolutions

Preamble

The participants in the conference on *Data Integrity and Recordkeeping in the Digital Environment* wish to sincerely thank the Government and the people of the Republic of South Africa for their kind and warm hospitality. In particular we wish to thank the Director and staff of the National Archives for the excellent arrangements for the conference.

We also wish to thank Dr Anne Thurston, International Director of the IRMT and the entire IRMT Team for organizing this particular conference.

The conference drew delegates from thirteen (13) African Countries and comprised Directors of National Archives, Senior Officers from Offices of the President, Accountants General, Auditors, Human Resource Managers, IT professionals, E-Government specialists, Government Archivists and other Senior Government Officials

Observations

Arising out of the conference presentations and discussions, a number of observations have been made; these include:

1. Some National Archives in the region are not playing a strategic and key role in providing guidance on records management in most Government business processes.
2. The Archives function is invisible in most Government departments leading to lack of recognition of archives and records management in a number of strategic Government initiatives and development projects.
3. There is a lack of skills and competences among archives and records management personnel in the area of electronic records management, leading to inability to play an active role in designing and implementing electronic records management systems. Where there has been some skills enhancement, retention of the skilled staff has become very difficult due to levels of pay and work environment facilities.

4. There has been an absence of opportunities to collaborate on capacity building initiatives for records management and related aspects in the region, especially in respect of training institutions.
5. Progress has been made in a number of countries in the region to computerise financial and HR systems. However, due consideration has not been given to the component of records management.
6. In order to ensure effective and functional computerised systems, it is critical that the existing manual systems and processes are comprehensively streamlined.
7. There is a direct relationship between records management and accountability, transparency and delivery of public services.
8. A number of countries in the region lack a functional policy and legal framework that supports effective records management. In some of the countries there are policy inadequacies in this regard, while in others there is weak enforcement of the policy and legal framework for archives and records management.
9. The efforts of the IRMT towards developing training materials are noted with appreciation and gratitude and we request that before these materials are made operational, broad consultation should be furthered in the region to ensure relevancy to all stakeholders.
10. The importance of developing performance indicators in records management that are linked to institutional strategic objectives has been noted.
11. There is an urgent need to enhance awareness across Governments in the region about the importance and critical role of the archives and records management function for effectiveness and efficiency in Government business.
12. The archives and records management function seems to be gradually getting usurped by the ICT function, a trend that seems to emanate from lack of role clarity and in-house inconsistencies.

Resolutions

Following the above observations, these resolutions are made as a way forward in improving record keeping in the digital environment both at national and regional level:

1. Governments should be urged to incorporate the archives and records management function in the various reform initiatives e.g. IFMS, IPPS, HRMIS etc and other service delivery enhancement programmes. There is need for deliberate linkages of archives and records management with all other Government business processes and to ensure that there are solid partnerships with all Government institutions in this regard.

2. National Archives and Records Management personnel are urged to be more proactive as a means of emphasising the importance of the archives and records management function. This should be used to address the need for attitude and culture change.
3. Similarly this should be supported with training that not only needs to be focused on equipping personnel with IT skills that can be translated into effective records management in the digital environment, but also needs to be based in terms of prevailing Government business as a means of ensuring retention of the trained personnel.
4. There is also a need to ensure that Governments create an environment that enhances professional skills and targets young graduates.
5. IRMT / ESARBICA, working in cooperation with training institutions in the region, need to explore possibilities for bringing trainers together to work out strategies that can address issues of common concern, e.g. professional standards, mechanisms for facilitating exchange and influencing Government policy direction. To start with, focus could be on the development of a regional Centre of Excellence, the creation of a permanent forum that brings together personnel in the arenas of ICT, E-Governance, Archives and Records Management to facilitate exchanges on best practices and other related aspects.
6. Efforts should be undertaken to streamline current Government business processes as a means of effecting quick wins that support effective implementation of electronic records management, support accountability frameworks that are evidence based, and support effective public service delivery.
7. As a means of enhancing awareness by Governments in the region of the role of archives and records management, and as one of the critical undertakings that should be followed up after this conference, consideration should be given to:
 - the use of video materials (e.g. those used at the conference)
 - benchmarking of best practices from countries in the region (e.g. those shared by Tanzania)
 - use of attachments and training at centres of excellence.
8. As a means of ensuring that performance indicators for records management are developed, it is important that Governments in the region develop these indicators as part of their strategic plans.

Minutes of Steering Committee Meetings

Meetings were held by video conference on:

19 December, 2006

8 November, 2007

10 July, 2008

19 DECEMBER, 2006

Present

London (1 pm)

Stephen Sharples, Chair of the Steering Committee, Senior Governance Adviser, Africa Policy Department, DFID

Andrew Griffin, Project Research Officer and Deputy Director, International Records Management Trust

Pretoria (3 pm)

Cosmas Lamosai, Chief Executive Officer, East and Southern Association of Accountants General

Kelebogile Kgabi, Chair, East and Southern African Branch, International Council on Archives, and Director, Botswana National Archives and Records Services

Gert Van der Linde, Lead Financial Management Specialist, Africa Division, World Bank

Dar es Salaam (4 pm)

David Sawe, Director of Management Information Systems, Government of Tanzania

Washington (8 am)

Ranjana Mukherjee, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Asia Region, World Bank

Anne Thurston, Project Director, International Records Management Trust

Michael Hoyle, Project Manager, International Records Management Trust

Welcome and Introduction of Participants, *Paper A*

The meeting was chaired by Stephen Sharples, who invited the participants in each site to introduce themselves. All members of the Steering Committee were present with the

exception of Nicola Smithers, Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank, who was on assignment in Sierra Leone.

Discussion of *Paper B*, Overview of the Project

The Project Director and the Project Manager gave an overview of the project outlining the key focus of the research, the methodology and deliverables of the project, and the location of the case studies. Partly due to logistical difficulties, and with the agreement of the DFID Central Research Department, the number of study sites has been reduced from the original research proposal. This will enable the team to gather more in-depth information from the countries studied. It is agreed that this was a sensible decision, but it was noted that the reduced number of sites may limit information about the scope of the challenges being faced by the various governments, particularly in relation to software and system vendors.

All three of the countries where case studies have been carried out are reviewing current practices and are either introducing new computerised HRIS systems or significantly upgrading current software. At present, the situation is something of a 'moving target', as big changes are occurring in the computerisation of pay and human resources information. It is important that records management functionality should be included in the systems and that questions be asked about recordkeeping issues and migration strategies. It is noted that vendors will 'do what you want them to do', and that when introducing such systems, there is a need to consider all the important issues, including records, at the beginning of a project. It is agreed that it would be useful to engage with consultants involved in introducing HRIS computerised systems to gain an understanding of the big picture and current practice.

Discussion of *Paper C*, Case Study Summary Reports: Lesotho, Ghana and Tanzania

The Project Manager outlined the Lesotho case study and was asked whether paper records are being well managed. He noted that the situation varies from ministry to ministry; in most of the ministries visited, the records are relatively well kept, but in many instances filing is not up to date. Records in Lesotho are generally better kept than in the other case study countries. Andrew Griffin outlined the Ghana study, noting that there is no linkage between paper records and the computer systems. Picking up on the question of timeliness of filing, he said that paper filing systems are generally in a very poor state. He also outlined the findings in Tanzania, and the Director of Management Information Systems for Tanzania, added supplementary information about the move to managing human resource information, data cleansing and migration strategies. At present the HRIS systems in all three case study countries are only running the payroll and are generally not managing information about staff, although the intention is to do so.

Discussion of *Paper D*, Key Issues Arising from the Case Studies

Discussion opened regarding the issues arising from the case studies. Steering Committee members made helpful suggestions, including:

- The issues as set out in *Paper D* could be structured systematically in future presentations. For instance, the discussion could be organised under headings to cover paper and electronic records management issues in relation to completeness, reliability and the ability to trace and audit the record.
- Consultation should be undertaken with system developers, software engineers and vendors. This could occur either on site (if available) in the case study countries, or through company head offices. Liaison with local and expatriate system implementers would also provide information on recordkeeping functionalities of the electronic systems.
- There also is an issue in terms of measuring the state of recordkeeping against standards to manage risks, and the project team should consider methods for achieving this.
- It could be helpful to trace the records and processes needed to support human resource management backwards from pensions. The payment of pensions has proved problematic, and these difficulties may provide a means of convincing governments that good information management is required.
- There is a need for clarification and agreement on what is meant by records in the context of this project. Is it the data in the file? Is it the information in the database? Is it the totality of paper and electronic data? What are the records and where are they held? Again, the project team can usefully provide guidance.
- Several cross-cutting matters have an impact on managing pay and human resources processes and records, and these should be addressed in the deliverables. These include decentralisation and the way in which responsibility is being moved away from central control to ministries, departments and agencies. In the future, public servants are likely to have more responsibility for managing their own records, and this needs to be seen alongside the responsibilities of records staff. The project team needs to think about how to articulate the impact of these developments and changes and to provide useful guidance in the deliverables.

Discussion of *Paper E*, Making the Findings Meaningful (the ‘So What?’ factor)

Key discussion points included:

- It will be helpful, in presenting the findings of the case studies, to find means of quantifying the problems that are being observed. For instance, what are the implications of not managing the payroll properly and what is the impact of retired staff not getting their pensions?
- It will be important to mobilise stakeholders to support the objectives of the project. In particular, organised labour and trade unions should have an interest in this research.
- AFROSAI, the African Branch of the International Organisation of Supreme Audit Institutions, would be a valuable partner in the project, and there was general agreement that AFROSAI should be approached as a partner.
- Government stakeholders need to indicate what they would like to see achieved by the project. Obtaining their buy-in to the deliverables is essential. The forthcoming stakeholder's meeting will provide an opportunity to explore this.
- There is a further six months of case study research to be undertaken, and it will then be the right time to meet government stakeholders in order to present the findings, draw comparisons between countries and explore stakeholder concerns. The Committee agreed that the planning for such a meeting needs to begin early in 2007 and that the project team needs to put forward a proposed timeframe as soon as possible.
- It is hoped that it will be possible to invite as many countries as possible from the east and southern African region, in order to take account of a wide range of views, build ownership and ensure that the deliverables are relevant. The importance of inviting accountants general, auditors general, civil service reform managers and national archivists was agreed, and the project team will need to review what is possible within the exiting budget.
- It was suggested and agreed that a small preliminary stakeholders meeting could be convened by videoconference, involving representatives from the four case study countries. The meeting would also include members of the project team and representatives of regional partner organisations. The findings of this meeting should feed into the planning for the larger meeting. It would be helpful if the delegates could share specific experiences in order to engage the delegates and to draw on their experience. Again, the project team will examine the budget and make a recommendation.

Conclusions and Date of Next Meeting

The video link broke up just at the end of the meeting, so it was not possible to agree on the date of the next meeting, but dates will be proposed to the Steering Committee members.

8 NOVEMBER, 2007

Present

London (1 pm)

Stephen Sharples, Chair of the Steering Committee, Senior Governance Adviser, Africa Policy Department, Department for International Development
Anne Thurston, Project Director and Director, International Records Management Trust
Andrew Griffin, Project Research Officer and Deputy Director, International Records Management Trust

Washington (8 am)

Ranjana Mukherjee, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Asia Region, World Bank
Nicola Smithers, Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank
Michael Hoyle, Project Manager, International Records Management Trust

Welcome and Introduction of Participants, *Paper A*

The meeting was chaired by Stephen Sharples, who invited the participants in each site to introduce themselves. A number of members of the Steering Committee were unable to attend including Cosmas Lamosai, Chief Executive Officer, East and Southern Association of Accountants General and Gert Van der Linde, Lead Financial Management Specialist, Africa Division, World Bank Both provided written comments to papers. In addition, David Sawe, Director of Management Information Systems, Government of Tanzania was unable to participate due to miscommunications regarding access to video facilities and Peter Mlyansi, President, East and Southern African Branch, International Council on Archives; Director, Records and Archives Management Division, Government of Tanzania could not be contacted prior to the meeting.

Discussion of *Paper D*, Records Management Performance Indicators

Due to time constraints the Records Management Performance Indicators were discussed first. The Project Director introduced the topic.

Key discussion points included:

- The Debt Management Improvement Indicators and Public Expenditure and Accountability (PEFA) Indicators were noted as examples. The Debt Management indicators provided a good example of a drill down assessment within the context of PEFA. It was suggested that a similar drill down model could be developed for personnel records.

- There is also a need for a generic approach to records management indicators: a simple set of indicators that could be built into larger assessment processes and be aimed at the higher level for senior management. There should be four or five such indicators at most, linked to PEFA indicators. Whatever indicators were developed they should not be too ambitious in their scope particularly if they are to be brought into the main stream.
- The small set of generic indicators could also be linked to the Government Anti Corruption Actionable Indicators (GATI) being developed by the World Bank. The IRMT should get in touch with those responsible for this work. Feedback could be provided from a Sector Board meeting which was due to discuss GATI.
- Indicators should be pitched at the output and outcome level. They should measure the operational performance of systems and how they are functioning on the ground. For example, the indicators should not assess the existence of a legal and organisational infrastructure but the performance one would expect to see if the legal and organisational infrastructure was in place. It is important to avoid being prescriptive. There can be different infrastructure models with the same performance outcomes.
- Records management needs to be seen as a key component of e-government and e-services.
- Indicators should provide a snapshot of the records management situation. They needed to be presented in a way that is understood and they must be useable by non-specialist staff.
- Motivations and possible outcome statements are important consideration. For example, an indicator of whether employees can get information regarding their rights and entitlements would provide a motivation for improvement.
- While the indicators could be short and high level the guidance material could be more detailed.
- To develop meaningful indicators consideration could be given to what sort of things would one expect to find regarding recordkeeping in any nation. Examples would be particular outcomes of having a legal and organisational infrastructure for managing government records; placement of recordkeeping within government. The role of the national archives and local records management profession in achieving certain outcomes; and the existence and application of retention rules for records.
- Records management needs to be brought into the mainstream. It is hard to get an audience or to make officials focus on records management. Recordkeeping must be linked to the bigger picture. 'Enforcing accountability/transparency through good records management' makes the link. It is essential to find new ways of articulating the linkage between records management and the bigger picture. The Project Director reported on her discussions with the International Development Research

Centre (IDRC) in Ottawa and the proposals for work on the links between good governance, corruption and records.

Discussion of Paper B, Key Issues Arising from the Case Studies and Stakeholders' Meeting

Key discussion points included:

- Case studies must move beyond the issues, many of which are obvious, and include recommendations and good practice guidance. Positive examples are needed as well as indications as to what can go wrong (disaster stories). 'Do's and don'ts' would be useful. There is a need to articulate the 'end vision.' It was confirmed that recommendations and good practice guidance would be discussed with regional stakeholders in a meeting in May 2008.
- In the IFMIS context the question remains to what extent IFMIS systems and their implementation generally fall short of maintaining reliable audit trails (manual and or electronic). Do the conclusions and findings on HRIS and payroll equally relate to IFMIS implementations as well? Which of the IFMIS supported and or created processes, records and results are most at risk? What has been done in some countries to mitigate against these risks?
- Disaster recovery is a fundamental area when developing policies and plans for records management.
- There should be integrated Audit Programmes developed to enable auditors to conduct appropriate audits of the system. This alerts the need to involve the auditors in the trainings, etc. as one of the main stakeholders.
- Although there can be challenges with decentralisation it can also lead to opportunities. Records in decentralised environments are closer to people to whom they apply. Local government and district land issues in Bangladesh were discussed.

The Project Director confirmed that further case studies would be undertaken. Personnel and payroll systems in Sierra Leone and Cameroon are likely to be included. The possibility of case study using data from Congo was discussed. A study of office information systems in India was also under consideration, to be undertaken through the National Informatics Centre (NIC) in Delhi. If a further study is to be undertaken in India, it was suggested that the IRMT needs to be certain what it was trying to achieve. For example, can the NIC learn from us? Further research on the land registration system *Bhoomi* should not be undertaken as it had already been extensively studied. Working in South Asia is difficult at present due to the political situations in Pakistan and Bangladesh and the lack of records in Afghanistan. Foreign donors were also seen as needless intrusion.

Discussion of *Paper C*, Educators' Forum and the Development of the Guidance Material, Training Modules and Route Map

The Project Director introduced the paper. A larger number of modules than originally planned were being developed. These would be shorter and their use would be flexible. The Guidance Material would be aimed at a higher level.

Key discussion points included:

- The issue of the audience for the guidance material and modules was raised. Participants at the planning session for the training and guidance materials had spent some time on this issue. There is a need to get the right balance and that further work is required on getting a good level for the guidance material.
- The possibility of a 12th module on IFMIS was raised. Clearly there is a link to the current work on Human Resource Information Systems and personnel and payroll records.

Discussion of *Paper E*, Plans for Remaining Activities

The Project Manager outlined the paper. It is essential to link the planned National Workshops to other activities in the region, for example workshops being run by the IMF AFRITAC, SADC and anti corruption commissions. Without this link the audience for the workshops will be limited. The IRMT is urged to look at other activities on accountability and good governance and determine whether it was possible to be part of these, thereby achieving higher visibility.

Date of Next Meeting

The next and final meeting was tentatively set for June or July 2008 following the development of the training and guidance materials and the May Regional Stakeholders meeting.

10 JULY, 2008

Present

London (1.30 pm)

Stephen Sharples, Chair of the Steering Committee, Senior Governance Adviser, Africa Policy Department, Department for International Development
Andrew Griffin, Project Research Officer and UK Director, International Records Management Trust

Walter Mansfield, Project Research Officer and Project Manager, International Records Management Trust

Washington (8.30 am)

Ranjana Mukherjee, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Asia Region, World Bank

Nicola Smithers, Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank

Anne Thurston, Project Director and International Director, International Records Management Trust

Michael Hoyle, Project Manager and Lead Researcher, International Records Management Trust

Dar Es Salaam (3.30 pm)

David Sawe, E-Government Adviser, Government of Tanzania

Welcome and Introduction of Participants, Paper A

The meeting was chaired by Stephen Sharples. A number of members of the Steering Committee were unable to attend, including Cosmas Lamosai, Chief Executive Officer, East and Southern Association of Accountants General; Gert Van der Linde, Lead Financial Management Specialist, Africa Division, World Bank; and Peter Mlyansi, President, Eastern and Southern African Regional Branch, International Council on Archives and Director, Records and Archives Management Division, Government of Tanzania.

Discussion of Paper B, Stakeholders Meeting, Pretoria, South Africa April 2008

The Project Manager summarised key aspects of the meeting, with additional comments from the Project Director and Project Research Officer. A number of the senior officials indicated that the event had opened their eyes to the issues surrounding electronic records management. The meeting was a success, with officials and records professionals constructively addressing the issues and a dynamic interchange between a range of stakeholders who do not normally meet.

Key discussion points by members of the Steering Committee included:

- Stephen Sharples asked whether the stakeholders' discussed re-skilling records staff whose jobs might become redundant in the electronic environment. Observation 6 in the meeting's resolutions was queried and in particular what training was going to be required so that records managers can contribute to the streamlining of business processes as ICTs are introduced. Linked to this issue is the current low status and pay of records staff, which discourages career development. The Tanzania scheme of

service for records management was noted, whereby registry assistants were retrained or phased out. It is now one of the most popular civil service streams, both within the Civil Service and beyond to employers in the private sector. There is a need to take a 'holistic view' of records management capacity building and the importance of maintaining a balancing act between status, pay and training.

- There is an urgent need to develop a regional Centre of Excellence if records management staff are going to be able to address electronic recordkeeping issues in the future. Training is the key. The establishment of an education programme or centre would help to meet the demand. David Sawe, Tanzania's E-Government, articulated the need clearly.
- Overall it was felt that records and archives staff have been sidelined in the past, but it is essential that they should now play a stronger role and that senior officials should pay more attention to records issues.

Discussion of *Paper C*, Development of the Training Modules

The Project Manager and Project Director described the modules that have been developed through the project and outlined their focus. The modules will be available free of charge to developing countries and will be made available through the IRMT's web site and in hard and soft copy.

Key discussion points included:

- There was a query as to who might use the modules. It was noted that during the meeting in South Africa, the Project Director and Project Manager met with various professional records trainers to discuss how the modules can be utilised. The aim is to make the modules flexible and adaptable to different environments, including university and management institute programmes and in the work place. A regional Centre of Excellence would be a good place to empower local trainers through use of the modules.
- Compact disks and DVD's were mentioned as a way of distributing the modules. It was suggested that video conferencing could be a useful way to present material. This would cut down on costs. A recent example of such an approach from South Korea was outlined.
- It is important to move from the 'why' to the 'how.' The Pretoria meeting had alerted officials to the issues. Now there is a need for action plans to address the challenges of electronic records management. Buy-in from the highest level is required.
- Piloting the modules in the judicial sector would be very useful. The IRMT could, if the resources were available, undertake some 'back room' reengineering to make the materials relevant to the electronic records created and used in courts. The IRMT has

considerable experience working in the judicial sector, both to improve court recordkeeping and to specify requirements for case management systems.

Discussion of *Paper D*, Recordkeeping Performance Indicators

The IRMT's UK Director introduced the paper. An assessment tool is under development which will provide a guide to integrating recordkeeping in ICT systems; describe good practices for managing records created and held in ICT systems and provide selective indicators that can be used to determine objectively whether or not good recordkeeping policies and practices are being followed.

Key discussion points included:

- There was a query about how the indicators would be used in practice. Reference was made to the benchmark used in Sierra Leone. It was stated that the Sierra Leone indicator was at the record level and was not realistic in that it did not take account of the realities of the history of document creation. The indicators that are being developed as part of the research project are at a higher level and aim to assess whether the required policies and practices are in place and whether they are used and monitored for compliance. The indicators are not intended to provide an audit at the transaction level.
- It was noted that the indicators should be capable of being used at the 'front end of the process' (ie, at the stage where ICT systems are being planned) and that they should be actionable. The assessment tool should outline what action needs to be taken and how to fix problems.
- The model of the PEFA Framework indicators has been studied carefully. It is essential to be clear about the actual aims of the recordkeeping indicators and about different kinds of users. Some users will use them for analysis purposes, while others may use them as guidance.
- The indicators will need to be used to assess recordkeeping integration periodically. However, they are not designed to be applied repeatedly, ie each month, to assess whether recordkeeping is being properly implemented.

Brief Update on the Sierra Leone and Botswana Case Studies

The Project Director noted that case studies on personnel and payroll systems in Sierra Leone and land records in Botswana have been undertaken. Reports are being prepared and will be finalised by the end of the project.

IDRC Strategic Planning Meeting and Report Back

The Project Director described a small strategic planning meeting funded by the IDRC and held in Ottawa in May 2008. Eight senior African professionals in the fields of public administration, law and records management were invited to explore the contribution that records management could make to public sector reform and the consequences if it does not do so. They considered the areas where records management could make the greatest contribution. The IDRC is interested in supporting further research in these areas, and this could feed into a programme of work at a centre of excellence that would focus on strengthening records management as an element of public sector reform, particularly in relation to e-government.

Next Steps and Conclusions

The summing up took place largely between London and Dar es Salaam because the video link from Washington had to be severed since another meeting was scheduled. Key points included:

- The Eastern and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI) might provide an excellent base for a centre for excellence. ESAMI is located in Arusha, Tanzania, and is strategically placed for the whole of the eastern and southern Africa. It also was suggested that the Africa Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF) might be interested in being involved in supporting the centre. The IRMT will follow up on these suggestions. Stephen Sharples offered to follow up with Mark Smith, the link point at DFID for the ACBF and Anne Thurston offered to follow up with Sahr Kpundeh, the link point at the Bank.
- Areas of focus for future programmes could usefully include court/judicial records, land records and cyber laws in relation to information requirements in the public sector.
- There is a capacity issue to be addressed in relation to existing records staff: currently, they lack the skills and status to be involved more directly in ICT planning and e-government programmes. If they were to acquire these skills, they could make a very valuable contribution, but it would be more difficult to retain them as records managers in the public service.
- A Centre of Excellence should have a focus on sharing resources, skills, good practices and practical solutions. Governments would be able to look to the Centre for advice on how to protect data integrity in the electronic environment. David Sawe stressed again the urgency of achieving this.
- The IRMT should bear in mind the need to regularly update the training modules and other products that it has produced as the electronic environment changes.

- Further consideration needs to be given to how governments and stakeholders can be persuaded of the critical importance of records and information management. There is a need to articulate the consequences of not doing so and to consider what role politicians, civil society and trade unions have to play and how FOI can work as a driver. The African Peer Review Mechanism was noted, and consideration should be given to whether it could have a records management component.

People Consulted/Project Participants

CASE STUDIES

Botswana

Ministry of Lands and Housing

Mr George Mutale, IT Manager
Mr Oduetse Tshukudu, Records Manager

Department of Lands

Mrs Karakubis, Principal Lands Officer
Mrs Molly Nonkonyane, Records Assistant

Department of Land Board Services

Mr Ketlhoilwe Ketlhoilwe, Senior Systems Analyst
Mrs Josephine Kandjii, Principal Records Officer
Mr Kebaabetswe Rammilong, Records Officer

Department of Town and Regional Planning

Mr Lord Vasco, Principal Planner, Research

Land Boards

Mrs Monageng, Acting Deputy Land Board Secretary, Kweneng Land Board
Mrs Rosihah, Mokhange, former Records Officer, Ngwato Land Board
Mrs Julia Monkutlwatsi, former Records Officer, Ngwato Land Board

University of Botswana

Dr Kgomotso Moahi, Head, Department of Library and Information Studies
Professor Nathan Mnjama, Senior Lecturer, Department of Library and Information Studies
Dr Segomotso Keakopa, Lecturer, Department of Library and Information Studies

National Archives

Ms Kelebogile Kgabi, Director
Mr Kago Ramokate, Deputy Director
Ms Linda Magula, Principal Archivist
Ms Lorato Motsaathebe, Assistant Records Manager

Ghana

Office of the Head of the Civil Service

Mr Joe Issacher, Head of the Civil Service
Mr Barnes, Chief Director
Mr Frank Braimah, Director ICT
Mr W K Kemevor, Director, Human Resources
Mr Johnson Principal, MIS, IPPD Section
Mr Theophilus IPPD Section
Ms Vivian IPPD Section
Mr Caesar William Sowah, Senior Punch Operator, IPPD Section
Mrs Elfreda, Personnel File Registry Supervisor

Public Records and Archives Administration Department (PRAAD)

Mr Cletus Azangweo, Director
Mrs Eugenia Adomako-Gyasi, Acting Director
Mr Leo Woode
Ms Thelma Ewusie

Controller and Accountant General's Department

Mr Christian Sottie, Controller and Accountant General
Mr Kwabena Adjei-Mensah, Deputy Controller and Accountant General, Financial Management Services
Mr Abraham Mantey, Deputy Controller and Accountant General, Finance and Administration
Mrs Elizabeth Osei, Director of Payroll
Mr Gilbert Nyaledzigbor, Deputy Head of Payroll
Mr Andy Atakpa, Head of PPD Accra Region
Mr John Agbenyenu, PPD Accra Region
Ms Agnes Abdulai, Head of PPD Upper East/Upper West Region
Ms Adisa Braimah, Salary Advances
Ms Agnes Mills, Payroll Technical Team
Mr Moses Akagla, Payroll Technical Team

Ministry of Public Sector Reform

Mrs Rebecca Amou Aboagye, Chief Director
Mr Jones Ackor, Consultant on Payroll

Audit Service

Mr Edward Dua Agyeman, Auditor General
Mr Francis Mensah, Assistant Auditor General
Mr Peter Aggrey, Head of Payroll Section

Ministry of Food and Agriculture

Dr Gyiele Nurah, Chief Director
Mr H Baah-Adade, Financial Controller
Mr Mensah, Supervisor, IPPD Section
Ms Adej, IPPD Section
Ms Abdoulie, IPPD Section

Public Services Commission

Mr William A. Botchway

Civil Servants Association

Mr Chigabatia, Executive Secretary
Mrs Helen

UK Department for International Development, Ghana

Dr Daniel Arghiros, Governance Adviser

Karnataka, India

Chief Secretary, Karnataka Public Service

Sri Pralhad B Mahishi, Chief Secretary

Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms

Smt Geetha Ramesh, Deputy Secretary, Administrative Reforms

Public Service Commission

Dr H V Parshwanath, Secretary

Sri K. Anil Kumar, Deputy Secretary

Sri M N Gururaja Rao, Assistant Secretary (Administration)

Sri Mahest M. Nadugeri, Senior Programmer, Computer Section

Department of Treasuries

Sri Purushotham Singh, Assistant Director, Treasury Network Management Centre

Sri Nanda Gopal, Senior Database Administrator, Treasury Network Management Centre

Department of Education

TM Vijay Bhaskar, Secretary, Primary and Secondary Education, Education Department

E-Governance Secretariat

Smt G Sathyavathi, Joint Secretary

Sri Shiva Rudraiah VS, Project Officer, Bhoomi Monitoring Cell,

Sri Elisha Andrews, Tahsildar, Bhoomi Monitoring Cell

Smt Shylaja Priadarshini, Tahsildar, Bhoomi Monitoring Cell

Sri Gurusurtha, Deputy Tahsildar, Bhoomi Monitoring Cell

Sri PS Kantharaj, Tahsildar, Bhoomi Kiosk Centre, Mysore District

Sri Anand, Deputy Tahsildar, Bhoomi Kiosk Centre, Mysore District

National Informatics Centre, Ministry of Communications & Information Technology

Sri A Venkatesan, Senior Technical Director and State Informatics Officer

Sri V Mahadesha, Team Leader, e-Gov Network Groups, Software Technology Parks of India (STPI)

Citizens Service Centre, Mysore City Corporation

Sri Nanjunda Swamy, Statistical Officer

Karnataka State Archives

Dr Usha Suresh, Director
Sri Ranjendra Prasad, PA to Director
Sri J E Mallikarjunappa, Administrative Officer
Dr Ambijakshi, Archivist, Historical Records Section,
Sri Swamy, Assistant Archivist, General Records Section
Sri K N Naveen Kumar, Consultant, Indigo Information Systems
Sri Gavisiddaiah, Archivist in Charge, Divisional Archives, Mysore

Department of Archaeology, Museums and Heritage, Mysore

Dr G V Gayathri, Deputy Director

Natural History Museum, Mysore

Dr B Venugopal, Scientist in Charge

Lesotho

Ministry of Public Service

Mrs P Ramaqele, acting Principle Secretary
Mr Moji, Human Resources Manager
Mrs Seala, Assistant Administrative Office, Head of Registry

Ministry of Finance and Development Planning

Mr Ken Hlasa, Accountant General, Treasury
Mr Richard Letsoela, Deputy Accountant General, Treasury
Mr Tsukulu, Assistant Accountant General, Treasury
Mr Molefi, Human Resources Manager, Treasury
Mr Motalingoane, Head of Salaries, Treasury
Mr Muso Mokeno, Operations Supervisor, Treasury
Ms Marha Nthare, Senior Accountant, Treasury
Ms Mahelena Lephoto, Chief Internal Auditor
Mr Peter James, Project Manager, Public Financial Management Programme
Mr Robert Flanagan, Treasury Adviser, Public Financial Management Programme
Mr David Watt, Advisor, Public Financial Management Programme
Ms Tjonga Selaolo, Advisor, Public Financial Management Programme
Ms Motseoa Masheane, Adviser, Public Financial Management Programme
Ms Patricia Baristo, Adviser, Public Financial Management Programme

Office of the Auditor General

Mrs Lucy Liphafa, Auditor General
Ms Monica Besetsa, Assistant Auditor General, Research and Development
Mr Kopno Mou, Assistant Auditor General, Parastatal Audits

Ministry of Communications, Science and Technology

Dr Nketsi Makhera, Director, ICT Department

Ministry of Local Government

Mrs Malitlallo Majara, Director Human Resources, Department of Human Resources and Member Local Government Services Commission
Mrs Mathato Matlanya, Chairperson, Local Government Services Commission
Ms Pontso Lebotsa, Member, Local Government Services Commission
Mr Thabo Ntai, Member, Local Government Services Commission
Mr Rajeeve Ahal, Advisor, Decentralisation and Rural Development, Lesotho – German Decentralised Rural Development Programme (Ministry of Local Government and GTZ)

Ministry of Agriculture

Mrs Setefane, Human Resource Manager
Ms Dineo Pitso, Assistant Systems Support Officer

Ministry of Education

Mr Odilon Makara, Deputy Principle Secretary
Ms Moeketsi, Human Resources Manager
Mr Mapetla, Chief Education Officer (responsible for Teachers Services Department)
Ms Likele Thulo, Senior Executive Officer, Teachers Services Department

Ministry of Tourism, Environment and Culture

Mr JT Metsing, Principle Secretary
Ms Ntina Qhobosheane, Principal Archivist, State Archives
Ms Tebello Moseme, Archivist, State Archives

European Union

Mr Daniel Aristi, Acting Head of Delegation
Ms Funa Sepiso

Irish Aid

Ms Paula Nolan

Department for International Development (UK)

Ms Diana Webster, Field Officer

Sierra Leone

Public Service Reform Unit, Governance Reform Secretariat

CB Osho Coker, Coordinator of Public Service Reform

Office of the President

Dr Julius Sandi, Senior Assistant Secretary to the Secretary to the President

Public Archives Department and Records Management Improvement Team

Albert Moore, Head and Team Leader

Establishment Secretary's Office

A C Ngaujah, Acting Establishment Secretary
Mrs Avril Cummings, Deputy Establishment Secretary I
Ansu Samuel Tucker, Deputy Establishment Secretary II
F E Keita, Secretary Training and Recruitment
Charles Ashley, Records Officer
Joseph Sesay, Administrative Officer, Records
Mrs Fatmata Kabba, Staff Superintendent

Accountant General's Office

Cyprian Kamaray, Accountant General

Kebbe Kouroma, Deputy Accountant General
Fanta Lamin, Records Officer

Institutional Reform and Capacity Building Project: Public Financial Management Reform Unit

Vidal Paul-Coker, Financial Management Specialist

Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Food Security

Mohamed A Nallo, Permanent Secretary

Ministry of Health and Sanitation

Kai Moses Kpakiwa, Permanent Secretary

Ministry of Education and Technology

TR Gbetuwa, Deputy Secretary
Mrs G N B Leigh, Personnel Manager, and records staff

Auditor General's Office

Mrs Anna Ceaser, Auditor General
Mr Leslie Johnson, Deputy Auditor General
J Syl-Bauns, Deputy Auditor General

Public Service Commission

Mr N Elba, Secretary to the PSC

Tanzania

Presidents Office, Public Service Management

Mrs Ruth Mollel, Principal Secretary
Mr David Sawe, Director Management Information Systems
Mr Emmanuel Mlay, Assistant Director Establishment
Mr Bilal Murtaza, Database Administrator

Presidents Office Records and Archives Management Division

Mr Peter Mlyansi, Director
JM Ndauka, Assistant Director
Mr AB Kolokota, Assistant Director
Ms Jenipher, Marandu, Records Officer

Ministry of Finance

Mr Azizi Kifile, Assistant Accountant General
Mr Joel JK Mwanza, Assistant Accountant General
Ms Bernadette Kamazima, Director of Computer Services

Office of the Auditor General

Mr Ludovick SL Utouh, Controller & Auditor General

Ministry of Agriculture

Mr Augustine Mdogo, Director of Administration and Personnel

Ministry of Education

Mrs Mghanga, Director Administration and Personnel
Ms Anna Reuganyosa, Principal Admin Officer
Mr Hashim Butalla, Admin Officer

Ministry of Health and Social Welfare

Mr Leonard Kekuu, Director Administration and Personnel

World Bank

Ms Denyse Morin, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Public Sector Reform and Capacity Building
Mr Denis Biseko, Public Sector Specialist

Department for International Development (UK)

Ms Wamuyu Gatheru, Governance Adviser

Government of Zambia

Public Service Management Division

Mr Ignatius Kashoka, Permanent Secretary

Mr Akim Sakala Director, Payroll Management and Establishment Control (PMEC)

Ms Cathy Mkala Director, Human Resource Information and Planning

Mr Sanford Sekelechi Assistant Director, Records Management Systems and Policy Development

Mr Pharaoh Mweempwa, Development Officer, Records Management Systems and Policy Development

Ms Rebecca Zulu, Inspection Officer, Records Management Systems and Policy Development

Mr Lubasi Sakwiba, Technical Support Specialist, PMEC

Ms Peggy Chirwa, Acting Director, Recruitment and Planning

Mr Lukwesa, Assistant Director, Recruitment and Planning

Ms Joyce Nyama, Acting Assistant Director, Recruitment and Planning

Ministry of Finance

Mr Mike B. Goma, Accountant General

Mr Joel M. Ukwimi, Deputy Accountant General

Office of the Auditor General

Mr Kalunga, Director, Human Resources and Administration

Mr George S Kafutu, Senior Human Resources Officer

Mr W Chilangwa, Chief Accountant

Cabinet Office

Mr Davis Munga, Head of Cabinet Documentation

Ministry of Agriculture

Mr B C Nalishiwa, Director Human Resources and Administration

Mr Webster Chilala, Chief Human Resources Officer

Ms Jane Phiri, Chief Coordinator of Agriculture Training Institution

Mr Sidney Zulu Human, Resources Management Officer

Ministry of Home Affairs, National Archives

Mrs. Chileshe Lusale-Musukuma, Acting Director
Ms Judith Namutowe, Acting Assistant Director
Ms Marja Hinfelaar, Consultant Historian, Digitisation Project
Mr M C Mwiinga, Acting Director, Records Centre
Mr Patrick Chisenga Clerical Officer ,Accounts

University of Zambia

Mr Crispin Hamooya, Lecturer in Archives and Records Management, Department of Library and Information Studies

Ministry of Immigration

Ms Ndiyoi Mutiti, Chief Immigration Officer, formerly Director, National Archives

Department for International Development (UK)

Mr Wilfred Kupelelwa Mwamba, Governance Adviser
Dr Bruce Lawson-McDowall, Governance Adviser

STAKEHOLDER VIDEO CONFERENCE, MAY 2007

Ghana

Mr Christian T Sottie, Controller and Accountant General
Mr George Winful (on behalf of Mr Eduard Agyeman, Auditor General)
Mr Samuel Antwi-Gyekye, Assistant Computer Programmer, Office of the Head of the Civil Service (on behalf of Mr Joe Issachar, Head of the Civil Service)

Sierra Leone

Mr Albert Moore, Senior Archivist and Records Manager, Sierra Leone
Mr Muniru Kawa, Consultant, International Records Management Trust
Ms Nicola Smithers, Project Steering Committee Member and Public Sector Specialist, Africa Region, World Bank (observer)
Mr Tony Bennett, Public Financial Management Adviser, DFID (observer)

Mr Stephen Catchpole, HRMO Project Team Leader, Public Administration International (observer)

Tanzania

Mr Priscus Kiwango, Acting Director, Management Information Systems, President's Office Public Service Management

Mr Ernest N Kabohola, Senior Administrative Officer, Office of the Controller and Auditor General (on behalf of Mr Ludovick SL Utouh, Controller and Auditor General)

Ms Denyse Morin, Senior Public Sector Specialist, Public Sector Reform and Capacity Building, World Bank (observer)

Zambia

Mr Mike B Goma, Accountant General, Ministry of Finance

Ms Cathy Mkala Director, Human Resource Information and Planning, Public Service Management Division

Mr Sanford Sekelechi Assistant Director, Records Management Systems and Policy Development

Mrs Chileshe Lusale-Musukuma, Acting Director, National Archives

United Kingdom

Mr Stephen Sharples, Chair of the Project's Steering Committee, Senior Governance Adviser, Africa Policy Department, DFID (observer)

STAKEHOLDERS MEETING, PRETORIA, SOUTH AFRICA, APRIL 2008

Participants Attending the East and Southern African Regional Meeting of Stakeholders on Recordkeeping in the Digital Environment: 'New Findings in Pay and Personnel Information Management', Pretoria, South Africa, April 2008

Angola

Mr Helder Baptista Antunes, Acting Deputy Director (INAM)

Mrs Teresa Graciete Evangelista, Acting Deputy of Training and HR (INAM)

Mrs Maria Alexandra Miranda Aparicio, Senior Archivist, National Historic Archives of Angola

Mr Honore Mbonga, Senior Researcher - National Historic Archives of Angola

Botswana

Mr Moagi Baleseng, Chief Systems Analyst, Office of the President
Mr Bethuel Moreme, HR Information Systems Manager, Directorate of Public Service Management
Ms Kelebogile Kgabi, Director, Botswana National Archives and Records

Professor Nathan Mwakoshi Mnjama, Senior Lecturer, University of Botswana

Kenya

Mr Julius Musyimi Kilinda, Accountant General
Mr Justus Ongera, Senior Auditor ICT
Mr Lawrence I Mwangi, Director, National Archives
Mr Richard Wato, National Archives and Secretary General of ESARBICA

Lesotho

Ms Thato Masiloane, Deputy Principal Secretary
Mrs Kelebogile Masita Mohale, Director of Information
Ms Nthabeleng Sefako, Director of information Systems

Malawi

Mr George Norwin Banda, Chief Accountant General
Mr Isaac Saulosi Zimba Bondo, Director of Management Services, Department of Human Resource Management
Mr Paul Lihoma, Director, National Archives

Mozambique

Mr João Sebastião Ambrósio Metambo, Director of ICTS
Mr Adriana Albertina Jacob, Director Human Resources
Mr Santos Francisco Jaieie, National Documentation and Information Centre (CEDIMO)
Mr Joel Maurício das Neves Tembe, Director, Arquivo Historico de Mocambique

Namibia

Mr Karel Nel, Chief Systems Administrator Public Service (EDRMS)
Mr Rathwynn Clarens Feris, Chief Programming Systems Advisor (EDRMS)
Mr Werner Hillebrecht, Director, National Archives

South Africa

Ms Tshavhu Mukhodobwane, Chief Information Officer
Ms Nadia Carolissen, SAMDI - Manager of Research
Mr Graham A. Dominy, Director, National Archives
Ms Mandy Gilder, Deputy National Archivist
Mr Clive Kirkwood, Deputy Director: Records Management and Information Systems
Mr Cosmas S Lamosai, Chief Executive Officer, ESAAG
Mr Gert Van Der Linde, Lead Financial Management Specialist Africa, World Bank

SWAZILAND

Ms Khabonina Mabuza, Accountant General,
Mr Goodwill Matsebula, Ministry of Public Service and Information
Mrs Kholekile F. Mthethwa, Director, National Archives
Ms Zodwa Simelane, Archivist, National Archives

Tanzania

Mr Emmanuel Jerome Mlay, Assistant Director, Personnel and Information Systems
Mr Athanas Pius, Assistant Auditor General
Mr Peter Mlyansi, Director, National Archives and President ESARBICA
Mr Joseph Rugumyamheto, former Permanent Secretary, President's Office Public Sector Reform

Zanzibar

Mr Salum Maulid Salum, Deputy Principal Secretary, President Office
Ms Mwanaidi Abdalla, Deputy Principal Secretary, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training
Mr Hamad Omar, Director, Archives and Museums

Uganda

Mr Deogratious Kizit, Commissioner, Records and Information Management
Ms Savia Mugwanya, Assistant Commissioner, Payroll Management
Mr Alex Ajum Okello, Government Archivist

Zambia

Mr Edson Nachimwenda, Cabinet Office
Mrs Chileshe Lombe Lusale-Musukuma, Director, National Archives

Zimbabwe

Mrs Judith Madzorera, Accountant General

Mr Simon Cosmas Chigwamba, Director, Central Computing Services

Mr Dunmore Maboreke, Acting Chief Archivist

DEVELOPMENT SPECIALISTS

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)

Nick Manning, Chief of Division, Public Sector Management and Performance

Edwin Lau, Project Leader, E-Government Project, Innovation and Integrity Division

World Bank

Africa Division

Helga Muller, Head

Nicola Smithers

Sahr Kpundeh

Mike Stevens (Consultant)

South Asia Division

Ranjana Mukherjee

Latin America Division

Jeff Rinne

Public Financial Management

Tony Hegarty

Ivor Beasley

Gert van der Linde

Bill Dorotinsky

Marius Koen

Poverty Reduction and Economic Management

Gregory Kisunko
Collum Gharity

Information Solutions Group

Deepak Bhatia
Elisa Liberatori Prati
Arleen Seed
April Miller

Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability Secretariat (PEFA)

Frans Ronsholt
Peter Fairman
Frank Bessette

Participants, Educators' Forum

Dr Laura Millar, Developer and Editor, Training Modules
Dr Justus Wamukoya, University of Botswana
Dr Peter Sebina, University of Botswana
Dr Segomotso Keakopa, University of Botswana
Geoffrey Yeo, University College, London
Andrew Griffin, UK Director, International Records Management Trust
Kelvin Smith, National Archives of the UK
Michael Hoyle, Project Manager and Lead Researcher

Authors, Reviewers and Contributors, Training Materials

- Christine Ardern, Canada, contributor
- Keith Bastin, United Kingdom, reviewer
- Adrian Brown, United Kingdom, contributor
- Donald Force, United States, editor
- Elaine Goh, Singapore, contributor
- Andrew Griffin, United Kingdom, contributor, reviewer

- Greg Holoboff, Canada, graphic artist
- Michael Hoyle, United States, contributor
- Shadrack Katuu, South Africa, contributor
- Segomotso Keakopa, Botswana, contributor
- Lekoko Kenosi, Kenya, contributor
- Charles Kinyeki, Kenya, reviewer
- Barbara Lange, Canada, desktop publisher
- Helena Leonce, Trinidad and Tobago, reviewer
- Mphalane Makhura, South Africa, reviewer
- Walter Mansfield, United Kingdom, contributor
- Peter Mazikana, Zimbabwe, contributor, reviewer
- John McDonald, Canada, contributor
- Laura Millar, Canada, contributor, editor
- April Miller, United States, contributor
- Patrick Ngulumbe, South Africa, reviewer
- Greg O'Shea, Australia, contributor
- Lori Podolsky Nordland, Canada, contributor
- Peter Sebina, Botswana, contributor
- Anthea Seles, Canada, contributor
- Elizabeth Shepherd, United Kingdom, reviewer
- Kelvin Smith, United Kingdom, contributor
- Jim Suderman, Canada, contributor, reviewer
- Setareki Tale, Fiji, reviewer

- Louisa Venter, South Africa, reviewer
- Justus Wamukoya, Kenya, reviewer
- Richard Wato, Kenya, reviewer
- Geoffrey Yeo, United Kingdom, reviewer
- Zawiyah Mohammad Yusef, Malaysia, reviewer.

Global Dissemination List

		Hard copy - Mod 1-5 - Add Resources - Glossary	Hard copy Indicators	Hard copy Case Studies (7)	Soft copy CD - All materials	Ghost Busting DVD	Link to SL Case Study	Link to Indicators	Link to Ghost Busting DVD	Link to Module 5	Link to all Modules (1-5)
List A	National Archive Institutions in Commonwealth Countries	X	X	X	X	X					
List B	Presidents' / Prime Ministers' Offices in Commonwealth Countries					X		X			X
List C	Central Government Human Resource Management Offices in Commonwealth Countries						X	X	X	X	
List D	E-Government Secretariats in Commonwealth Countries							X	X		X
List E	Governance Advisers in National/ International Development Organisations							X	X	X	
List F	National/ International Professional Associations for Archives, Records and Information Management				X	X					
List G	Key Universities (mainly Africa), with Programmes for Records Management Education and Research	X	X	X	X	X					
List H	SA Conference Participants (from ESARBICA Region)				X	X					
List I	Selected individuals in a position to Support Professional Development in their Organisation				X	X					