

## Helpdesk Report: Scaling up non-formal education initiatives and improved cost effectiveness as a result

Date: 5 August 2010

**Query:** What evidence is available on scaling up of non-formal education initiatives (i.e. incorporation into formal education systems) in low-income countries and specifically what is the evidence of improved cost effectiveness as a result?

**Enquirer:** DFID UK

### Content

1. Key documents
2. Additional information

#### 1. Key documents

##### **The Evolution of NGO–Government Relations in Education: ActionAid 1972–2009**

Development in Practice, Vol 20 (4–5), June 2010

This journal article, written by David Archer, provides a brief history, touching on some of the key trends and turning points in ActionAid's education work, and it documents the evolution of the relationship between ActionAid and governments.

##### **NGO Provision of Basic Education: Alternative or Complementary Service Delivery to Support Access to the Excluded?**

Pauline Rose, CREATE, 2007

[www.create-rpc.org/pdf\\_documents/PTA3.pdf](http://www.create-rpc.org/pdf_documents/PTA3.pdf)

While access to state schooling has grown in many countries in recent years, a hardcore of marginalised children continue to be excluded from this. Some of these children are able to gain access to education through non-state provision. The focus of this paper is on primary school aged children who find access through (international) non-government organisations (NGOs).

In particular, section 6 of this paper – titled 'Scaling-up, Coordinating and Mainstreaming NGO Provision for Sustainability' – will be of interest as it asks what evidence there is on the scaling up of NFE programmes.

##### **NGO Provision of Basic Education: Alternative or Complementary Service Delivery to Support Access to the Excluded?**

*Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, Volume 39, Issue 2 March 2009, pages 219 - 233*

Pauline Rose

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909451371](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909451371)

This paper focuses on approaches by non-government organisations (NGOs) to reach primary school-aged children excluded from access to the conventional state education system. It highlights recent shifts in international literature and agency priorities from the

portrayal of NGO provision as a (non-formal) 'alternative' to (formal) state schooling, towards developing approaches for 'complementary' provision. This shift is occurring as a means of making progress towards achieving Education for All (EFA) goals.

The paper then compares these international trends with attention paid to NGO provision in national education plans across four countries (Bangladesh, India, Ethiopia and Ghana). Based on the analysis of international and national approaches, the paper argues that NGO provision continues to be seen as 'second-best' to state schooling, with state schooling remaining the focus of attention for EFA.

### **Scaling Up by Focusing Down: Creating Space to Expand Education Reform**

Joel Samoff, E. Molapi Sebatane, and Martial Dembélé (2003)

[www.rocare.org/SCALE7.pdf](http://www.rocare.org/SCALE7.pdf)

Successful scaling up should aim to scale up the conditions that permitted the initial reform, based on the generation of widespread and locally-rooted demand for it, rather than attempting to replicate specific elements of reform, as is often the case.

This paper provides an overview of experiences of scaling-up education reforms in sub-Saharan Africa, which often relate to those provided by NGOs as innovative pilots, concluding that there are very few successful examples. This evidence suggests that the conditions that can support scaling up include the importance of leadership, sustained local involvement, careful planning for scaling-up from the outset, and the availability of information systems.

### **Formal and Non-formal Education: Exploiting the Synergy Between them for the Benefit of Both: World Education's Integrated Education Strengthening and Adult Literacy Program in Mali**

World Education, 2005

[www.worlded.org/docs/Publications/girlsed/mali\\_unesco\\_case\\_study.pdf](http://www.worlded.org/docs/Publications/girlsed/mali_unesco_case_study.pdf)

This paper looks at a NFAE programme which led to partnership with the formal education sector. World Education's adult literacy program began in response to a request made by the communities with which World Education works. This request led to the establishment of a non-formal adult basic education programme that has as its explicit goal the strengthening of the formal education system. Seven years later, the synergy between the non-formal and formal systems has spread from communities to the national level.

### **Supporting Non-Formal Education Programmes**

UNESCO Bangkok

[www2.unescobkk.org/elib/publications/TrainingManual/MODULE3.PDF](http://www2.unescobkk.org/elib/publications/TrainingManual/MODULE3.PDF)

Training manual for local government representatives in Non-Formal Education, seeing them as the core agents of change in the community. This module aims at providing guidelines on the planning and management of NFE programmes. Firstly it discusses how to identify and assess existing NFE programmes, followed by how to identify learning groups. The numerous case studies have been carefully selected to illustrate concepts and provide ideas that facilitate literacy programmes.

### **Complementary Education Models and Strategies for Achieving EFA Series**

USAID Equip2

[www.equip123.net/webarticles/anmviewer.asp?a=360&z=92](http://www.equip123.net/webarticles/anmviewer.asp?a=360&z=92)

To meet the EFA goals, simply investing in the expansion of the regular public system is not sufficient. It is important to consider how to best organise schools that respond to the particular needs of a country's most disadvantaged families and children. The problem of reaching all children-and reaching them with an education that will be effective-cannot be addressed through the continued pursuit of a centralised, uniform administration of schooling.

This page hosts several working papers, case studies and policy briefs from EQUIP2.

### **The Roles of Non-State Providers in Ten Complementary Education Programmes**

*Development in Practice* Vol 20 (4-5), June 2010 by Joseph DeStefano

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a923069286~frm=titlelink](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a923069286~frm=titlelink)

This article reviews ten case studies of complementary education programmes conducted by the USAID-funded Educational Quality Improvement Program 2. The state-non-state relationship in each case is explored to reveal the arrangements that permit non-state providers to extend the reach and improve the effectiveness of education, particularly for populations that are underserved by the state system. Non-state providers improve on the standard models of state schooling by changing the mix of inputs at the school level, altering the institutional incentives that govern how schools operate, and setting up political accountability relationships closer to the points of service delivery.

### **Reaching the Underserved with Complementary Education: Lessons from Ghana's State and Non-State Sectors**

*Development in Practice* Vol 20 (4-5), June 2010 by Leslie Casely-Hayford and Ash Hartwell

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/title~db=all~content=g922685513](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/title~db=all~content=g922685513)

Between 1995-6 and 2005-6, more than 85,000 children between the ages of 8 and 14 years participated in a complementary education programme in rural areas of northern Ghana. School for Life, a non-profit organisation, provides nine months of instruction in the children's spoken language. An impact assessment of the programme demonstrates that complementary education programmes are able to help children attain basic literacy in their mother tongue within a shorter timeframe and more cost-effectively than formal state primary-school systems can.

### **The Role and Impact of Public-Private Partnerships in Education**

World Bank, 2009

[http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EDUCATION/Resources/278200-1099079877269/547664-1099079934475/547667-1135281523948/2065243-1239111225278/Role\\_Impact\\_PPP\\_Education.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EDUCATION/Resources/278200-1099079877269/547664-1099079934475/547667-1135281523948/2065243-1239111225278/Role_Impact_PPP_Education.pdf)

This book examines five ways through which public-private contracts can help countries meet education goals:

- Public-private partnerships can increase access to good quality education for all, especially for poor children who live in remote, underserved communities and for children in minority populations
- Lessons for innovative means of financing education can be particularly helpful in post-conflict countries undergoing reconstruction.
- Lessons about what works in terms of public-private partnerships contribute to the development of a more differentiated business model especially for middle-income countries.
- The challenge of meeting the education Millennium Development Goals in less than a decade is a daunting one in the poorest countries. Understanding new partnership arrangements within a broad international aid architecture in education can help bring us closer to those goals.
- Some very innovative public-private partnership arrangements are happening in Arab countries, and lessons can be drawn from their experience.

Evidence is emerging from evaluations of the impact of projects, for example in Kenya, Mexico, Pakistan and the Philippines of initiatives aimed at reducing service provider absenteeism; giving financial and technical support to the expansion of private schooling for the poor; and funding school facilities, new education technologies, and parental participation.

The concept of a public-private partnership (PPP) recognises the existence of alternative options for providing education services besides public finance and public delivery. Although

there are many forms of PPPs, including partnerships where private organisations support the education sector through philanthropic activities and high engagement ventures, this study examines PPPs in which the government guides policy and provides financing while the private sector delivers education services to students. In particular, governments contract out private providers to supply a specified service of a defined quantity and quality at an agreed price for a specific period of time. These contracts contain rewards and sanctions for non-performance and include situations in which the private sector shares the financial risk in the delivery of public services.

### **The Role of Non-Governmental Organisations and Faith-Based Organisations in Achieving Education for All: the Case of Sierra Leone**

*Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, Volume 39, Issue 2 March 2009, pages 281-295 by Mikako Nishimuko

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909462606~frm=titlelink](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909462606~frm=titlelink)

The Sierra Leonean government's capacity to provide educational services remains weak, and still over 30% of children in the country are hard to reach and do not have access to primary education. This paper discusses the role of non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and faith-based organisations (FBOs) in the provision of primary education by supplementing governmental efforts. Through the exploration of forms of services delivered by NGOs and FBOs, this paper argues that the collaborating work among the government, NGOs, and FBOs has made progress towards achieving Education for All (EFA) in Sierra Leone.

### **Public-Private Partnership in the Provision of Basic Education in Ghana: Challenges and Choices**

*Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, Volume 39, Issue 2 March 2009, pages 135-149 by Kwame Akyeampong

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909455081~frm=titlelink](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909455081~frm=titlelink)

Growing private-sector participation in basic education service delivery in many developing countries has led to calls for greater partnership arrangements with the public sector to improve access for poor and disadvantaged groups. In Ghana there is some interest in forging closer public-private partnerships to improve access for children who have been out of mainstream education or have difficulty accessing public schools. By examining three examples of non-state provision that have had links with the public sector to improve access, this paper evaluates the impact of such partnerships to draw lessons for policy and practice. An important conclusion the paper draws is that for public-private partnerships that serve the needs of disadvantaged groups to work, it is important that they take into account both the diversity and context-specific educational access needs of the groups concerned.

### **Non-formal basic education as a development priority: Evidence from Nicaragua**

*Economics of Education Review* Vol 28 (4), pp 512-522, August 2009

by Sudhanshu Handa, Heiling Pineda, Yannete Esquivel, Blancadilia Lopez, Nidia Veronica Gurdian and Ferdinando Regalia

Almost 900 million adolescents and adults are illiterate in the developing world, yet most policy discussions focus on the educational circumstances of primary aged children. As a result, non-formal educational programmes for adolescents and adults are given very little support, and this group is virtually ignored in international agreements such as the millennium declaration. This article presents the first serious attempt at evaluating the impact of a non-formal education programme. Results show significant learning achievement over the academic year, as well as strong development impacts in non-learning dimensions of participants' lives. These positive impacts, plus the significantly lower unit costs and self-targeted nature of the programme provide strong evidence that this type of programme can be an important part of the poverty reduction and human capital enhancement strategy of developing countries with large illiterate adult populations.

### **Non-formal Education, Out-of-school Learning Needs and Employment Opportunities: Evidence from Mali**

*Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, Volume 39, Issue 2 March 2009, pages 249-262 by Frédérique Weyer

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909489876~frm=titlelink](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a909489876~frm=titlelink)

Non-formal education (NFE) is now considered as playing a critical role in the achievement of the objective of Education for All, by reaching the learning needs of youth and adults who do not have access to formal education, increasing their employment opportunities and therefore contributing to poverty alleviation. Yet there is still insufficient knowledge available on the relationships between NFE, learning needs of out-of-school youth and adults, and employment. This article discusses both the data collected in rural Mali and the evidence drawn from a household survey on the outcomes of the Educational Centres for Development (CED), which address out-of-school youth in rural areas. This paper argues that the effective approach of the CED programme is similar to formal schooling, with some adjustments in order to meet what is considered as the specific learning needs of out-of-school youth. However, CEDs are more adapted to boys' learning needs than they are to girls'. This paper also demonstrates that the CED programme has no effect on the scope of activities of young people as they stay in their village but do improve the way these activities are carried out and widens their employment opportunities as they migrate.

### **Marching to Different Rhythms: International NGO Collaboration with the State in Tanzania**

*Development in Practice* Vol 20 (4-5), June 2010 by Sheila Aikman

[www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a923069291~frm=abslink](http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/content~db=all~content=a923069291~frm=abslink)

This article examines relationships between international NGOs and state education institutions in their efforts to achieve Education for All. It does this through an investigation of Oxfam GB's multi-level and multi-strategy approach to education in Tanzania. It explores what a 'one-programme approach' means for Oxfam GB's education work and investigates its partnerships and advocacy relationships at the local and national levels with different state education institutions and agents.

### **Reaching the Marginalized. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2010**

[www.unesco.org/en/efareport/reports/2010-marginalization/](http://www.unesco.org/en/efareport/reports/2010-marginalization/)

Leaving school too early is strongly linked with marginalisation. While the factors behind dropout are varied and complex, the consequences are uniformly severe. Students who drop out typically earn 30% to 35 % less than students with a secondary school diploma. Equal opportunity in education is a basic human right. Moreover, fair and inclusive education is one of the most powerful levers available for making societies more equitable, innovative and democratic. Overcoming the extreme and persistent disadvantages that marginalised groups experience is a vital element in the wider agenda for inclusive education.

Extending opportunity to these groups requires more than the general expansion of education and the improvement of average learning achievement levels. It requires policies that target the underlying causes of disadvantages in education and beyond.

Chapter 3 particularly identifies problems facing those children who are marginalised due to location and livelihoods. They live in the areas with the most limited access to basic services, including education. Since the World Education Forum in Dakar in 2000, many developing countries have removed school fees and primary school enrolment has often increased steeply as a result. Benefits for the marginalised have been most positively pronounced when the withdrawal of fees has been combined with incentives for school attendance by disadvantaged groups – such as young girls and street children – and social protection measures that reduce vulnerability. Some countries have also deployed qualified teachers to underserved areas, provided additional resources to 'failing' schools, and implemented intercultural and bilingual education programmes.

Many governments have also recognised the need to prioritise disadvantaged areas in school construction. While public spending patterns continue to favour wealthier groups and regions

in most countries, several countries have acknowledged that levelling the playing field in education requires a commitment to redistributive financing in favour of the marginalised.

Non-government organisations have also demonstrated that progress is possible. They have been instrumental in developing and implementing innovative strategies that reach some of the most marginalised, including street children and pastoralists. These strategies are increasingly being integrated into government systems. One example has been the development of second chance programmes allowing children and youth denied the chance to develop literacy and numeracy skills during their primary school years the opportunity to develop skills for employment, gain qualifications and re-enter the formal education system.

The evidence presented in Chapter 3 demonstrates that strategies for 'reaching the marginalised' work – but they have to cut across the borders of traditional policy-making. More important, they have to be integrated into a coherent policy framework that simultaneously tackles the multiple underlying causes of marginalisation.

**Reaching the Marginalized. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2010. Background Papers**  
[www.unesco.org/en/efareport/resources/background-papers/2010/](http://www.unesco.org/en/efareport/resources/background-papers/2010/)

**Girls' Education in Tanzania, 2003**

[www.tanzaniagateway.org/docs/Girls\\_education\\_in\\_Tanzania\\_2003.pdf](http://www.tanzaniagateway.org/docs/Girls_education_in_Tanzania_2003.pdf)

With the successful mainstreaming of Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania (COBET), the learners have done just as well as those in formal schools in national examinations, so UNICEF is focusing on supporting COBET scaling up to cater for the 11-13 who have been left out of the formal system.

**Participatory Approach Revives Adult Education in Tanzania**

[www.unesco.org/education/efa/known\\_sharing/grassroots\\_stories/tanzania.shtml](http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/known_sharing/grassroots_stories/tanzania.shtml)

Massive school drop-out rates and failure to enrol in basic primary schooling are contributing to increasing illiteracy in Tanzania. Two innovative approaches to adult learning are poised to change that. They both aim at reducing donor dependence in favour of enhanced sustainability and greater sense of community ownership of adult learning programmes.

The two programmes are the Integrated Community Based Adult Education (ICBAE) and the Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania (COBET). While ICBAE targets the traditional crop of adult illiterates, COBET aims at giving a second chance to orphans and children of single parents especially girls, who for one reason or other, could not continue with formal education.

### 3. Additional information

#### Author

This query response was prepared by **Sandra Baxter** [S.Baxter@ids.ac.uk](mailto:S.Baxter@ids.ac.uk)

#### Contributors

David Archer, ActionAid  
Lyndsay Bird, IIEP-UNESCO  
Joe De Stephano, (Equip2), RTI International  
Mary-Luce Fiaux Niada, ADEA Working Group on NFE  
Ulrike Hanemann, UIL-UNESCO  
Adama Ouane, UIL-UNESCO (and others in team)  
Alan Rogers, UEA  
Pauline Rose, UNESCO GMR

**About Helpdesk reports:** The HDRC Helpdesk is funded by the DFID Human Development Group. Helpdesk Reports are based on up to 2 days of desk-based research per query and are designed to provide a brief overview of the key issues, and a summary of some of the best literature available. Experts may be contacted during the course of the research, and those able to provide input within the short time-frame are acknowledged.

For any further request or enquiry on consultancy or helpdesk services, please contact [just-ask@dfidhdc.org](mailto:just-ask@dfidhdc.org)

**Disclaimer**

*The DFID Human Development Resource Centre (HDRC) provides technical assistance and information to the British Government's Department for International Development (DFID) and its partners in support of pro-poor programmes in education and health, including nutrition and AIDS. The HDRC services are provided by three organisations: Cambridge Education, HLSP (both part of the Mott MacDonald Group) and the Institute of Development Studies. The views in this report do not necessarily reflect those of DFID or any other contributing organisation.*