

JSRP Paper 6

Annotated Bibliography for the evidence paper ‘Local Understandings and Experiences of Transitional Justice’

July 2013

Akhavan, P. (2001). 'Beyond impunity: can international criminal justice prevent future atrocities?' *The American Journal of International Law*, 95(7): 7-31.

This article examines the impact of international criminal justice on post-conflict peace building and reconciliation, using the examples of the ICTR and ICTY. It finds that these mechanisms significantly contribute to these goals and, it is argued, support the development of a sense of international criminal accountability. The author also proposes a framework for assessing the power of such justice mechanisms in preventing the resumption of large-scale, systematic atrocities.

This article effectively demonstrates that the ICTR and ICTY have had far reaching effects in their respective societies, and that these have contributed to some level of conflict prevention, though this relies largely on compelling- though anecdotal - evidence. Though it cautions against drawing a linear, causal relationship between these factors, this article fails to consider other forces that may have contributed to this outcome.

Though the author notes that this article conducts an "empirical" analysis of these justice mechanisms, it is entirely unclear how this is carried out as methodology, bias, and limitations are never discussed, and assessing the representativeness of the information employed is impossible. It seems the article works largely from news reports and existing literature to draw its analysis. Whilst in doing so it presents a relatively small amount of local level data, its analysis is very thorough and insightful.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Alexander, K., Batchelor, D., Durand, A., & Savage, T. (2011). 'Truth commissions and transitional justice: update on a select bibliography on the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission debate'. *Journal of Law and Religion*, 20(2), 525-565.

Bibliography of the debate on the historical significance of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Ali Adnan Alfeel, 'The Iraqi Special Tribunal under International Humanitarian Law' *Journal of East Asia and International Law*, Vol.11: 2009

Criticizing arguments made against the Iraqi Special Tribunal ,the author supports the creation of the IST as an independent court by examining its Statute. A key argument being that the imposition of artificial standards and the complete revocation of the pre-existing Iraqi judicial structures would have created a process deemed legitimate by the Iraqi people and judiciary that would have undermined the establishment of the rule of law in Iraq.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Missing

Alie, J. (2008). 'Reconciliation and traditional justice: tradition-based practices of the Kpaa Mende in Sierra Leone'. In L. Huyse & M. Salter (Eds.), *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: Learning from African Experiences*. Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

This paper argues that addressing the twin issues of justice and reconciliation through the TRC and Special Court is necessary, but not sufficient. According to the author, of greater import, if peace is to be consolidated, is addressing the causes of the war, which by 'popular consensus' lie in a combination of bad governance, the denial of fundamental rights, economic mismanagement and social exclusion in the context of any peace-building initiatives.

The author deploys a reasonable amount of knowledge yet fails to provide details on how such knowledge was obtained. Whilst the information displayed about Kpaa Mende clearly came from some form of empirical research, this is rarely made clear in the text. The piece is written in a very 'factual' manner yet this is not substantiated by clear evidence. The strength of this piece is the clarity with which it discusses the subject matter; but this is at the cost of detailed and substantiated analysis.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Allden, S. (2007). 'Internalising the Culture of Human Rights: Securing Women's Rights in Post-Conflict East Timor'. *Asia-Pacific Journal on Human Rights and the Law*, 1, pp.0-23.

In order for East Timor to move forward in its transition, the issue of gender-based violence must be addressed seriously. The impunity and lack of attention given to sexual violence during the conflict is a major problem, but the endemic problem of domestic violence also needs to be addressed. Violence against women is a violation of their human rights and should be treated as such.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Allen, T. (2006) *Trial justice : the international criminal court and the Lord's Resistance Army*. London: Zed books

Antipathy towards ICC intervention in Uganda is misplaced. Most Acholis want those responsible for terrible crimes to be held to account and in Northern Uganda it is possible for trials to contribute to peace-building.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Alvarez, Jose E. "Crimes of States/Crimes of Hate: Lessons from Rwanda." *Yale Journal of International Law*. Vol. 24 (1999)

By reflecting on the journalistic account of the Rwandan genocide that emphasizes the ethnic dimensions of the violence, the author draws attention to the possible pitfalls of the state-centric, ethnically neutral approach of the ICTR. Provides an interesting and intelligent argument primarily based on legal scholarship, but does not provide actual empirical evidence.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Anderson, Katrina (2005). 'Turning Reconciliation on Its Head: Responding to Sexual Violence Under the Khmer Rouge', *Seattle Journal for Social Justice*. Vol. 3: 785-823.

The purpose of this article is to challenge the singular approach to reconciliation through the use of judicial mechanisms that are blind to and ineffective with respect to certain crimes, and instead to promote creative approaches focused on grassroots social repair. The Extraordinary Chamber's narrow mandate precludes the possibility of prosecuting those who actually perpetrated the sexual crimes - the lower-level cadre.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Anita Isaacs, 'At War with the Past? The Politics of Truth Seeking in Guatemala', *The International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 4, 2010, 251-274

The case studies reveal how truth initiatives are politicized and how politics interfere with a truth commission's effort to produce a consensus history, end violence or afford reconciliation. The authors suggest that while confronting the past risks undermining the work of transition architects, it may eventually contribute to transforming and strengthening democracy.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Arriaza, Laura and Roht-Arriaza, Naomi. (2008). "Social Reconstruction as a Local Process." *The International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 2(2): 152-172.

This article examines local level approaches to transitional justice and post-conflict community rebuilding. Using the case of Guatemala, it argues that local mechanisms are comparatively more advantageous in helping repair social fabric following horizontal conflict. In making these claims, the author heavily critiques truth commissions and national, international, and hybrid tribunals with potentially true although unspecific points and identifies the problems inherent in reparations programmes. This work feels contradictory, however, as it both cautions against the use of traditional justice tools (in Guatemala - houses of memory, exhumations) and forcefully argues for their merit as tools of community rebuilding.

In addition, the article does not clearly explain why localized processes, which it admits dredge up painful memories, can promote communal healing rather than further entrenching divisions. The author makes a tacit argument for local community rehabilitation hybridized between traditional and formal approaches, though this is not emphasized in the work.

This work does not present a clear methodology and seems to rely on the data provided by secondary sources. It is possible that some of its information on specific aspects of Mayan ritual and Guatemalan traditions is based in primary research, but this is entirely unclear.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	3.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Arzt, D. (2006). 'Views on the Ground: The Local Perception of International Criminal Tribunals in the Former Yugoslavia and Sierra Leone.' *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 603(1): 226-239.

This article compares the ICTY and the SCSL to examine local perceptions of the legitimacy and impartiality of these mechanisms and their larger impact on reconciliation. Through the side by side comparison of these cases, this article offers only a small amount of new insight. Its emphasis on the importance of legitimacy of justice mechanisms is hardly unique. Furthermore, its assertion that localised views on the ICTY/SCSL could approximate views on the ICC is an interesting, though controversial, point that needs much more substantiation than it received.

This work is based on public opinion surveys and grey literature, as well as the fieldwork of others presented in existing literature. This article does not discuss the methods by which the evidence was obtained and, despite the title, does not offer any new, local-level data.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Report of the African Union High Level Panel on Darfur (AUPD). 2009.

AU High-Level Panel findings on Darfur. Ultimately the underlying demand for justice comes principally from the victims of the conflict. Their confidence in any national response needs to be rebuilt with credible measures which ensure their meaningful participation in the proceedings.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Backer, David. (2003) 'Civil society and transitional justice: possibilities, patterns and prospects.' *Journal of Human Rights*, 2(3): 297-313.

The article enumerates the factors that promote and hinder involvement by non-state actors in transitional justice processes and discusses the role that NGOs play, the repercussions of their activities and their relations with government with respect to paths of political development.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Backer, D., Lahouchuc, J. and Long, J. (2010) 'Addressing the Post-Election Violence: Micro-Level Perspectives on Transitional Justice in Kenya'. *Oxford Working Papers*.

The victims expressed a strong desire for past harms and losses to be addressed, but were skeptical that the transitional justice mechanisms in Kenya would effectively meet their expectations.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Backer, D. (2010). 'Watching a Bargain Unravel? A Panel Study of Victims' Attitudes about Transitional Justice in Cape Town, South Africa.' *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 4(3), 443-456.

The article concludes that rigorous, longitudinal studies are needed to document transitional justice phenomena and their impact.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Bahati Ntama, Jacques, and Beth Tuckey, 'Promoting International Support for Community-Based Justice Mechanisms in Post-Conflict Burundi and Uganda'. *Africa Faith and Justice Network Report*, Washington DC

The Ugandan and Burundian contexts demonstrate that the US should transform its justice narrative from one of criminal prosecution to one of community reconciliation.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	3.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Baines, E. 2010, 'Spirits and social reconstruction after mass violence: Rethinking transitional justice', *African Affairs* 109(436): 409-430

The cosmological perspectives of the war-affected in northern Uganda reveal how social repair occurs at the micro-level within societies. More attention should be paid to such socio-cultural processes in transitional justice policies.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Baker, B. (2008) 'Who is policing Sierra Leone?' Chap. 7 in *Multi-choice policing in Africa*. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.

Based on field research, this book reveals the surprising variety of people involved in policing besides the state police. The chapter on Sierra Leone is a case study which provides a detailed understanding of the degree of multi-choice policing in the country and its contrasts to Uganda.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

BBC World Service Trust (2008). 'Building a Better Tomorrow: A Survey of Knowledge and Attitudes towards Transitional Justice in Sierra Leone'. *Foreign Affairs* (pp. 1-37).

Most respondents (96%) are aware of the SCSL but only 2/3 of those aware think positively about it. 89% of respondents are aware of the TRC but less than 25% know of its recommendations (most likely the elite). With high literacy rates, broadcast media should be utilised to increase awareness.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	4
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	8
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Bickford (2007) 'Unofficial Truth Projects', *Human Rights Quarterly*, Vol.29

Civil society has established initiatives to investigate human rights violations (unofficial truth projects) in a way that resembles official truth commissions, having advantages but also limitations if compared to TCs.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Borer, T. A. (2009). 'Gendered war and gendered peace: truth commissions and postconflict gender violence: lessons from South Africa'. *Violence against women*, 15(10), 1169-93. Retrieved from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19706778>

The TRC was not very successful at uncovering the truth about sexual violence under apartheid, due to the definitions of violations, victims and eligibility to amnesty used by the Commission.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Bosire, L.K. 'Sexual and Gender Based violence in CAR, DRC and Sudan: The limits and Possibilities of Transitional Justice', in *Unfinished Business: Transitional Justice and Women's Rights in Africa*. (n.d.) . Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://www.acordinternational.org/silo/files/unfinished-business-transitional-justice-and-womens-rights-in-africa.pdf>

Transitional Justice can make modest contributions to addressiving SGBV. (equates the ICC with TJ)
Complex political crises and underlying causes of violence have to be addressed in addition to criminal symptoms.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Brahm, E (2005). 'Getting to the Bottom of Truth: Examining Truth Commission Success and Impact', *International Studies Association Annual Meeting*, Honolulu, Hawaii.

This article outlines the steps that could be taken to analyze the longer-term effects of TCs on transitional societies. It identifies the implementation record, human rights, and trust as variables

with which to assess impact and predicts that the nature of the mandate, relationship to the public, and the make-up of the commission will influence effectiveness.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Branch, Adam, 2011, 'Uganda's Civil War and the Politics of ICC Intervention', *Ethics & International Affairs* 21(02): 179-198. Available at: http://www.journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0892679400004676

Analysis of the political effects and consequences for peace and justice of the ICC's intervention in northern Uganda. Concludes that the ICC has been instrumentalised by the Ugandan Government and that ICC intervention has led to a depoliticization of victims by promoting a political dependency mediated by international law.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Breen Smyth, M. (2007), *Truth Recovery and Justice after Conflict: Managing Violent Pasts*, Abingdon: Routledge.

Resistance to truth recovery in Northern Ireland is based on the idea that it will be biased toward Republicans, it will exacerbate tensions, and it will disrupt the loyalist community. Future prospects for truth recovery depend on the willingness of all parties to engage in such a process and to weigh the potential risks against the restorative value.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Brooks, R. L., (ed) (1999), *When Sorry Isn't Enough: The Controversy Over Apologies and Reparations for Human Injustice*, New York: NYU Press.

This book is a collection of essays written by scholars, pundits, activists, and political leaders concerning claims from around the world that seek redress for human injustice. The book also includes the voices of the victims of some of the world's worst atrocities, thereby providing a panoramic perspective on an international controversy often marked more by heat than reason.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Brouneus, Karen. (2010) 'The Trauma of Truth Telling: Effects of Witnessing in the Rwandan Gacaca Courts on Psychological Health.' *Journal of Conflict Resolution*. Vol.54 (3)

A psychological study on the relationship between PTSD levels and involvement in Rwandan gacaca courts. The findings show that contrary to the hypotheses of existing literature, witnesses and judges involved in the gacaca proceedings show higher levels of PTSD. The author hypothesizes a link between the protracted nature of the gacaca proceedings and the increased PTSD levels.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Byrne, C. (2009). 'Benefit or Burden : Victims ' Reflections on TRC Participation'. *Journal of Peace Psychology, Vol 10(3)*

Although the author states that she does not wish to evaluate the TRC, she questions, based on her findings, the idea that the South African Commission truly contributed to reconciliation, due to the many negative responses of the survivors interviewed.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Call, C. (2007), *Constructing justice and security after war*, United States Institute of Peace Press.

Based on a series of case studies, post-conflict societies can create systems of justice and security that ensure basic rights, apply the law impartially, and enjoy popular support. However, the effectiveness of military, police, and judicial reforms have been limited in practice, largely as a result of political obstacles, state incapacity, and a preference for local justice mechanisms.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Capeloto, Tessa V. (2008). 'Reconciliation in the Wake of Tragedy: Cambodia's Extraordinary Chambers Undermines the Cambodian Constitution', *Pacific Rim Law and Policy Journal*. Pacific Rim Law and Policy Association.

The Cambodia Constitution requires that Cambodia not pursue policies that undermine truth or healing. However the Extraordinary Chamber's failure to safeguard the impartiality and legitimacy of the tribunal will undermine these principles. The Cambodian government should supplement its tribunal with mechanisms to promote reconciliation.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Collin, Cath, 'State Terror and the Law : The (Re)judicialization of Human Rights Accountability in Chile and El Salvador', *Latin American Perspectives* 2008, 35:20

In proposing a theory of 'post-transitional' justice the author suggests that the domestic mix of actor demands, judicial culture, and political-institutional constraints are crucial in explaining why some countries have experienced a successful and largely peaceful reopening of the human rights question while others have not.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Chapman, A. (2007). 'Truth Commissions and Intergroup Forgiveness : The Case of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Health* (San Francisco), (773576048).

Based on the data collected, the article argues that the TRC's approach to forgiveness and healing was not efficient in the case of South Africa.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.6000000000000001
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Chapman, A. and Ball,P. (2008) 'Levels of Truth: Macro Truth and the TRC', in H. Van der Merwe and A. R. Chapman (eds) *Truth and reconciliation in South Africa: did the TRC deliver?*, Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Despite a significant amount of data collection, the South African TRC failed in its mission to reveal the causes of human rights violations. This case demonstrates that data collection alone will not reveal "macro-truths," rather, a data collection system must focus on determining ultimate responsibility for human rights abuses.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Chhang, Youk. (2007) 'The Thief of History – Cambodia and the Special Court', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 1:157-72.

This article is valuable in that it provides a personal victim account of the need for the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia. The main argument is that the tribunal will put many questions regarding the culpability of the Khmer Rouge to rest through the form of a legal judgment, and that only the tribunal can help victims find answers by bringing forward the truth for all to see.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Chikwanha, Annie Barbara, "Security Sector Reforms for Managing Sexual and Gender Based Violence" in *Unfinished Business: Transitional Justice and Women's Rights in Africa*. (n.d.) . Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://www.acordinternational.org/silo/files/unfinished-business-transitional-justice-and-womens-rights-in-africa.pdf>

The article raises problems of accountability with private military companies, implementation of soft law in the security sector and attitudes about police. It argues that security sector reform is necessary to address SGBV and must involve all stakeholders including civil society and women's voices.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Chirwa, W (1997). 'Collective memory and the process of reconciliation and reconstruction', *Development in Practice*, 7(4): 479-482.

This article explores how local communities, independently of the state, have gone about dealing with the past through collective memory mechanisms. It concludes that such activities can be effective for reconciliation and healing within communities but may not be effective for the nation as a whole.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Clark, Phil. 'Hybridity, Holism, and 'Traditional' Justice: The Case of the Gacaca Courts in Post-Genocide Rwanda', *George Washington International Law Review*. Vol.39 (2007)

The article argues that gacaca should be understood as a hybrid mechanism with hybrid objectives of restorative and punitive justice. It also argues that punishment becomes a central part of the restorative nature of the mechanism along with the parciatory aspect of gacaca.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Clark, J (2009): 'From Negative to Positive Peace: The Case of Bosnia and Hercegovina', *Journal of Human Rights*, 8:4, 360-384

Based on data collected through 171 interviews in BiH in 2008, the author concludes that the ICTY plays a limited role in the process of reconciliation as three 'truths' currently exist, denial is rampant, and a lack of contact between the formerly warring parties perpetuates such divisions and blocks reconciliation between groups. Constitutional reform is necessary to undermine patterns of separation and a TRC is necessary to complement the work of the ICTY.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Clark, P., and Z.D. Kaufman, (2009), *After genocide: transitional justice, post-conflict reconstruction and reconciliation in Rwanda and beyond*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

This volume, comprised of chapters by various scholars on issues related to the Rwandan genocide and its aftermath, ultimately argues that "transitional justice" is an insufficient term to describe the dynamics of post-conflict societies and that the term "post-conflict reconstruction" may be more useful. Different chapters use different research methods.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.1000000000000001
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Clark, J (2009). 'The Limits of Retributive Justice: Findings of an Empirical Study in Bosnia and Herzegovina', *Journal of International Criminal Justice* 7: 463-487.

Through 171 qualitative interviews in May and August of 2008 in BiH, the author concludes (using the ICTY as a case study) that the four most common achievements of criminal trials claimed by their proponents (that they dissipate calls for revenge, individualize guilt, establish a historical record and contribute to reconciliation) are in most cases problematic and not supported empirically. This underscores the need for more realistic expectations, a complementary TRC, as well as further micro-level examinations of purported achievements.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Clark, P. 2010. *The Gacaca courts, post-genocide justice and reconciliation in Rwanda: justice without lawyers*, Cambridge:Cambridge University Press.

The success of the Gacaca courts in providing pragmatic and profound results of reconciliation in many Rwandan communities must be recognized, along with the limitations associated with this locally based process.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.5
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Clarke, Kamari Maxine (2007), 'Global Justice, Local Controversies: The International Criminal Court and the Sovereignty of Victims' in Dembour, M-B. and Kelly, T. (eds) *Paths to International Justice: Social and Legal Perspectives*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Central struggles are over the place of the victims and how best to treat them as social, political beings. The way forward is not to eradicate the ICC but to think more precisely about the meaning and enactment of justice and politics in local contexts.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Maxine Clarke, K. (2009), *Frictions of Justice: the international criminal court and the challenges of legal pluralism in sub-Saharan Africa*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

This book explores how notions of justice are negotiated through everyday micropractices and grassroots contestations. The author details the ways that justice, as a social fiction, is made real within particular relations of power.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Cobban, H. (2007), *Amnesty after atrocity?: Healing nations after genocide and war crimes*. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers.

This book examines the effectiveness of different ways of dealing with the aftermath of genocide and violence committed during deep inter-group conflicts. Cobban discovered that in terms of both moving these societies forward and satisfying the needs of survivors, war crimes trials are not the most effective path. This work provides strategic historical context and includes interviews with a cross-section of the panoply of humanity that makes up any post-atrocity society.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Cook, P. and Heykoop, C. *Children and Transitional Justice*. Retrieved from http://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/pdf/tj_chapter5.pdf

The efforts of the Sierra Leone TRC to involve child participation were generally successful, but the results varied depending on the child participation agencies that cooperated with the Commission.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Corey, Allison and Sandra F.Joireman. "Retributive Justice: The Gacaca Courts in Rwanda." *African Affairs*. Vol 103 (410) (2004):73-89

The article argues that the gacaca courts will ultimately undermine the security of Rwanda because they will aggravate the ethnic fault lines in society. Instead of breaking the cycle of ethnic mobilisation, they will serve to reinforce the longstanding grievances between ethnic groups. The primary reason for this argument lies in the fact that the government differentiates between 'war crimes' committed by the RPF and crimes of genocide.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Coxshall,Wendy, 'From the Peruvian Reconciliation Commission to Ethnography: Narrative, Relatedness, and Silence',*Political and Legal Anthropology Review*, Vol. 28, No. 2, pp. 203–222

This article explores the institutional limitations of truth commissions to understand the complexity of these relations .The author also proposes that anthropological data collection through participant observation and through research by commissions (though partial) offers a possibility of politically engaged anthropology that promotes human rights as a set of ideals.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Crawford-Pinnerup, Anna. (2000). 'An Assessment of the Impact of Urgent Interim Reparation' in *From Rhetoric to Responsibility : Making reparations to the survivors of past political violence in South Africa*, Brandon Hamber and Tlhoki Mofokeng (Eds.)

This article examines the effect of the Urgent Interim Reparations Programme (UIR) that was mandated as part of South Africa's TRC law. It draws on interviews conducted with individuals deemed to be victims by the TRC and who had participated in the UIR programme - this article is a bare-bones account of the findings of these interviews accompanied by a brief discussion.

The author interprets the respondents views of the UIR programme within the frame of Maslow's hierarchy of needs, and groups them into two categories: one whose short term needs were met and one whose short and long term needs still required attention after the UIR period. Respondents often expressed disappointment in not meeting their perpetrators and the wish to participate in other aspects of the TRC, though agreed on the value of UIR as a part of the healing process. UIR is not, it is argued, a substitute for more long-term forms of healing, truth telling, or forgiving/forgetting. The author finds that reparations failed to alleviate family conflict (and at times worsened it) and that they also provoked complicated feelings of jealousy and mistrust from the surrounding community.

The author briefly addresses interview methodology and acknowledges the limited generalisability that results from her small, homogenous sample size. No mention of how potential the response of questioning poor populations about funding programmes is made.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Dancy, G. (2010), 'Impact Assessment, Not Evaluation: Defining a Limited Role for Positivism in the Study of Transitional Justice', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 4(3): 355-376.

A distinction should be made between impact assesment and evaluation, and the role of positivist approaches is best conceived of as contributing to the former. Evaluation should be undertaken by analysts willing to embrace and promote normative ideas. Article also presents a quantitative analysis of transitional justice impact to show how such a logic is good for grounding observers' expectations for different types of transitional cases. Analysis demonstrates that TJ mechanisms do have a uniquely de-stabilizing effect.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Davis, Laura and Priscilla Hayner. (2009). "Difficult Peace, Limited Justice : Ten Years of Peacemaking in the DRC." *International Center for Transitional Justice.*

This report tracks the progress of peace talks in the DRC since 1999 and their impact on justice and accountability. The study concludes that despite the numerous peace agreements and attempts at transitional justice, there has been little in the way of justice or sustainable peace in the Congo. This work touches on the peace - justice tension and notes that the prioritization of peace has contributed to an atmosphere of impunity. The authors attribute the failure of the truth commission to the undue influence of belligerents in its proceedings. This report references the importance of resources in fueling the conflict and providing many with enormous gains, and notes the near impossibility of bringing these individuals to justice. The authors provide a number of

recommendations for pursuing peace in the DRC as well as for specifically strengthening the peace accords.

This study is based on interviews conducted with numerous participants and facilitators of the Congo peace negotiations, including civil society, national/international facilitators, belligerents, and government. No mention however is made of including what could be considered ‘ordinary citizens’ or victims in this study, despite the fact that ultimately the authors attempt to extend their conclusions to Congolese society at large. Line-by-line citations do increase the transparency of this document as it is possible to see the specific source of each point made in the text. Despite this, the overall method of interviewing is not as clearly detailed as would be desirable, and no mention of potential bias is discussed.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Missing
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Davis, Laura (2009) *Justice-Sensitive Security System Reform in the Democratic Republic of Congo*, International Center for Transitional Justice

Recommendations for the EU regarding Security Sector Reform (SSR). Argues that the the SSR programs must incorporate justice-sensitive reform initiatives. Attention is drawn to the risk posed by security forces on the deliverance of justice (through trials), and the circumstantial difficulties (such as economic costs, location of courts, conditions of prisons) faced by ordinary Congolese citizens in utilizing the justice sector.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	1
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	3.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Wilson, R. 2001. *The politics of truth and reconciliation in South Africa: legitimizing the post-apartheid state*. Cambridge: New York: Cambridge University Press.

Wilson shows the TRC's restorative justice approach to healing South Africa did not always serve the needs of communities at a local level. Based on extended anthropological fieldwork, this book illustrates the impact of the TRC in urban African communities in Johannesburg. Wilson argues that the TRC had little effect on popular ideas of justice as retribution.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333333000001
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

De Greiff, P. 2006. *The handbook of reparations*. Oxford ; New York: Oxford University Press.

This volume serves as an encyclopedia of reparations. De Greiff compiles case studies and reproductions of basic documents on reparations in order to examine the history, design and implementation of reparations programs.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Diane M. Nelson, 'Reckoning the after/math of war in Guatemala', *Anthropological Theory* 2010 SAGE Publications Vol 10(1-2): 87-95

The author suggests that quantifying reparations can be difficult in cases where civilians were drafted into para-military services, where such individuals become both the aggressor and the

victim.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Dimitrijevic, V (2003). 'War Guilt and Responsibility: The Case of Serbia III. Two Assumptions of the Rejection of Responsibility: Denial of the Act and Denial of the Rule', *Social Science Research Council Working Paper*

This short working paper argues that two rejections of responsibility for war crimes in the former Yugoslavia coming from Croats and Serbs are the denial of the acts/facts and the denial that such acts are in fact illegal and immoral. Such denials generate strong resistance from "extremists" to prosecution of war crimes through the ICTY.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Dougherty, B. K. (2004). 'Searching for Answers : Sierra Leone's Truth & Reconciliation Commission', *Sierra*, 8 (1).

An account of the occurrences at the special court and at the truth and reconciliation commission, and showing how both can conflict with one another and create competing narratives of the conflict and differing assessments of blame.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Drexler, E. 2009. 'Addressing the legacies of mass violence and genocide in Indonesia and East Timor', in Hinton, A. and K.L. O'Neill (eds) *Genocide: truth, memory, and representation*. Durham: Duke University Press

This chapter addresses the question of how to deal with legacies of mass violence and genocide in Indonesia and East Timor. Drexler explores the dense interconnections between institutions and representations, focusing on the inability of post-independence institutional responses to violence to curb state violence. She concludes that the very conditions that enabled mass violence to occur actually structure the representation of mass violence as well.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Drexler, Michael, 2010 'Whither Justice: Uganda and Five Years of the International Criminal Court', *Interdisciplinary Journal of Human Rights Law*, vol.97

The article argues that the ICC has been an obstacle to peace in Uganda and Court must acknowledge its shortcomings or risk becoming irrelevant.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Drumbl, Martin. 'Rule of Law Amid Lawlessness: Counseling the Accused in Rwanda's Domestic Genocide.' *Columbia Human Rights Law Review*, Vol.19, 1997:543-637

Based on personal experience of interviewing detainees in Kigali central prison as a defence lawyer, Drumbl highlights the procedural gap in criminal defence within Rwandan criminal law. As a further theoretical argument, he contends that retributive justice through trials should not substitute social reintegration, suggesting a power-sharing agreement and free democratic participation.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Duggan, C. 2010, Editorial Note, *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 4(3): 315-328.

Reflections on the promise and pitfalls of evaluating transitional justice. The author argues that evaluation as a field of enquiry and practice is as varied in its methods and ideologies as is social science research.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Duthie, R (2008). 'Toward a Development-sensitive Approach to Transitional Justice'. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 2: 292-309.

This article proposes that no matter how transitional justice is defined, its links to development can be established and therefore transitional justice should be enacted, at a minimum, in a development-sensitive matter. The author further outlines ways in which the two affect and engage with each other and the benefits and risks of transitional justice directly addressing development issues.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Eastmond, Marita, and Selimovic, Johanna Mannergren (2012) 'Silence as Possibility in Postwar Everyday Life', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*. Vol 6 (3)

This article focuses on the role of silence as a form of communication and as a pragmatic method for promoting coexistence between former foes in post war societies. The author argues that silence can offer an alternative perspective to hegemonic narratives. More broadly, the article concludes that transitional justice should not rely on standardized formulas, but rather consider diverse approaches to justice based on local contexts.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.5
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Eijkman, Quirine. 2010, 'Recognising the Local Perspective: Transitional Justice and Post-Conflict Reparations', *Global Jurist*, vol.10

There is no one-size fits all approach to post-conflict reparations in transitional societies, but there are some general lessons to be learned from the case of Bosnia and Hercegovina.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Elizabeth Salmon, 'Truth and Reconciliation Commissions', *International Review of the Red Cross*, Volume 88 (862) June 2006

Interview with Salomon Lerner Febres who was the President of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Peru from 2001 to 2003.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Elizabeth Stanley, 'Torture, Silence and Recognition: 16 Current Issues' *Criminal Justice* Vol. 5 2004-2005

The author contends that while issues relating to 'truth' have been addressed by the Regitt Commission, the issue of torture on the other hand has not been sufficiently recognised by the new 'democratic' state. In Chile torture has remained hidden.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Erik, D. (2008). 'Proper Reconciliation means a collective undertaking to make history', *the Cape Times*, South Africa

Newspaper article on the significance and shortcomings of reconciliation in South Africa. Reconciliation does not equate to the work of the TRC. It rather means a collective undertaking to make history.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Findlay, M (2009). 'Activating a Victim Constituency in International Criminal Justice', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(2): 183-206.

This article argues (theoretically) that international criminal justice presents a unique position for a victim constituency and that the nature of global crime requires a more victim-centered process.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Finnstrom, S. (2010), 'Reconciliation Grown Bitter? War, Retribution, and Ritual Action in Northern Uganda' in Rosalind Shaw, L. Waldorf and P. Hazan (eds) *Localizing transitional justice: Interventions and priorities after mass violence*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

This chapter examines how justice mechanisms have depoliticized the perpetrators. The author argues that each amnesty or related initiative of forgiveness is premised on a hierarchical relationship in which the rebels are reduced from political subjects to children or criminals. Finnstrom suggests both restorative and retributive justice can become weapons of war rather than tools of peacemaking.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Fionnuala Ní Aoláin and Eilish Rooney, 'Underenforcement and Intersectionality: Gendered Aspects of Transition for Women', *The International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 1, 2007, 338–354

Drawing upon concepts of 'intersectionality' and 'underenforcement' in transitional societies, the authors argue that women tend to be marginalized the most. One key recommendation being that there should be a broader understanding of transitional justice, such that it incorporates participation of women as equals.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Fletcher, Laurel E., and Harvey Weinstein, (2002) 'Violence and Social Repair: Rethinking the Contribution of Justice to Reconciliation', *Human Rights Quarterly* 24(3): 573-639.

The article poses the question: how does justice contribute to social reconstruction in the aftermath of mass violence? The author proposes an 'ecological' model of response to social breakdown, which locates justice in the web of possible interventions that must be addressed in order to promote social reconstruction.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Fletcher, Laurel E, and Harvey M Weinstein, (2008), 'Context, Timing and the Dynamics of Transitional Justice: A Historical Perspective', *Human Rights Quarterly* 31(1): 163-220.

Multifactorial, qualitative historical analysis of seven TJ case studies - highlights gap in empirical research in TJ and offers principles that can guide institutional development, scholarship and policy prescriptions in TJ.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Gibson, James. (2002). 'Truth, justice, and reconciliation: Judging the fairness of amnesty in South Africa', *American Journal of Political Science*, 46(3): 540-556.

This article views granting amnesty as an inherently unfair practice, and examines the impact of various forms of justice in compensating for this injustice. Using the South African case, it concludes that both distributive justice and procedural justice matter for the consideration of the fairness of amnesty. The author also finds that while amnesties remain relatively unpopular or are seen as necessary evils, supplementing them with other forms of justice can increase their acceptance within the population. The results identify reparations and public apologies as among the most powerful tools through which to accomplish this.

This work is based on the results of a 3700-respondent survey conducted in South Africa and was supplemented with interviews. The author claims the survey participants form a "representative sample" of adult South Africans, but does not explain this. The author also employs an experimental

vignette as a research tool. Otherwise the author presents a clear research methodology that justifies the internal and external validity of his conclusions. This work presents a significant amount of local level data. It could be improved through a more in-depth analysis of the factors and biases that likely shaped respondents answers to the questions (i.e., Why do blacks support amnesty more than whites? Why is there such a focus on reparations?).

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.299999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Missing
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. (2004). 'Overcoming Apartheid: Can Truth Reconcile a Divided Nation?' *Politikon*, 31(2), 129-155.

This article aims to answer the question “does truth lead to reconciliation” by examining South Africa’s TRC. It concludes that though Blacks remained “not-very reconciled”, White, Coloured, and Asian South Africans were “somewhat reconciled” and overall 44% of South Africans are “somewhat reconciled”. The author believes that this level must be higher than that of the apartheid period and attributes this change to the TRC’s truth telling process. Though the author strengthens his article by theorizing the cognitive dissonance process by which truth leads to reconciliation, it seems a jump to draw a causal connection between these factors. Indeed, intervening variables associated with the end of Apartheid, including the change in political parties, evolution of institutions, opportunities allowed to non-Whites, and the TRC reparations, could have easily affected the sense of reconciliation.

This article provides a good amount of local level data as well as of theoretical insight. The evidence in this article is based on a 2001 survey of 3700 respondents, which attempts to rigorously assess levels of both truth acceptance and reconciliation. it uses agreement or disagreement with 5 “commonly accepted” statements to measure the acceptance of truth. The author does well by considering the local circumstances that affect the external validity and transferability of his conclusions, but fails to examine any potential biases or other limitations his conclusions.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. L. (2004) 'Truth , Reconciliation , and the Creation of a Human Rights Culture', *Law & Society Review*, Vol. 38, No. 1 (March 2004): 5-40

The purpose of this article is to investigate whether a culture respectful of human rights has been created in South Africa. Based on a survey of roughly 3,700 South Africans, the article claims its biggest finding (based on evidence) is that truth - participation in a country's collective memory - can affect the values that individual citizens hold.

The earlier stages of the paper contain a reasonably strong theoretical discussion of the issues. The author claims that his sample survey is representative of the whole of South Africa – whilst his survey does have depth, this is too strong a claim. Additionally, the author does not recognise any potential for bias in his respondents. However, the author is careful not to imply a false causality from his findings (for example p.24). Overall, the author makes a strong argument that whilst the TRC made an impact on understandings of the rule of law in South Africa, this was limited, and related to existing factors in the country.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. (2004). 'Overcoming Apartheid: Can Truth Reconcile a Divided Nation?', *Politikon*, 32(2): 129-155

This paper directly investigates the hypothesis that truth leads to reconciliation. Based on a survey of 3,700 South Africans in 2001, it is claimed that the 'truth' as promulgated by the Truth and

Reconciliation Commission (TRC) is fairly widely accepted by South Africans, of all races; that at least some degree of reconciliation characterizes South Africa today; and that the collective memory produced by the process ('truth') did indeed contribute to reconciliation.

The paper contains a strong theoretical discussion of 'truth' and 'reconciliation'. Rightly, the author points to the need for an empirical investigation of whether truth has actually led to a form of reconciliation in South Africa. Also rightly, the author questions the causal link between the 'evidence' he presents and the claims he makes: the author contends that 'those who are more accepting of the TRC's truth are more likely to be reconciled' yet as the author himself notes 'It may well be that those already predisposed to reconciliation were more likely to accept the findings of the TRC'. Overall, however, this is a reasonably in-depth study of South African views on 'truth' and 'reconciliation', therefore it is a valuable resource, even if 'certain' conclusions cannot be drawn.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.25
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. L. (2005). 'The Truth About Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa', *International Political Science Review/ Revue internationale de science politique*, 26(4): 341-361

Using data from a large national survey of 'ordinary people' in South Africa, the author argues both that the truth and reconciliation process is viewed as effective by most people and that in fact 'evidence' indicates that the process achieved several of its primary goals.

In this paper, the author is more aware of the limitations of his method than on previous ones (see Gibson 2004a, Gibson 2004b & p. 342 of this paper), recognising that a so-called 'national survey' may obscure the views of many communities and not necessarily be generalizable (another aspect to this is that the author does not engage with the 'victims' understanding of 'truth' and 'reconciliation'). Overall, this survey does contribute some evidence to the debate, allowing the author to make a reasonable claim that the TRC has allowed South Africans to come to accept at least some legitimacy to the claims and values of their opponents, opening the door for reconciliation.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. L. (2006). 'The Contributions of Truth to Reconciliation: Lessons From South Africa', *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 50(3): 409-432

The ultimate objective of this article is to assess whether truth and reconciliation processes can have an independent influence on reconciliation and especially on the likelihood of consolidating an attempted democratic transition. The conclusion of this article is that the truth and reconciliation process in South Africa did indeed exert independent influence on the democratization process through its contributions toward creating a more reconciled society.

This is a careful and thorough investigation of whether there is a genuine causal link between the TRC in South Africa and whether it directly caused any reconciliation. The author relies on his previous empirical work (discussed in more detail in Gibson 2004a, Gibson 2004b, Gibson 2005), yet in this text is more measured and takes into account alternative studies to good effect (for example Snyder and Vinjamuri 2003). Overall the author makes a non-conclusive but compelling case that the process of establishing 'truth' in South Africa led to a form of reconciliation, largely since the 'truth' established recognised the harms caused by both sides.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Gibson, J. L., Sonis, J., & Hean, S. (2010). 'Cambodians' Support for the Rule of Law on the Eve of the Khmer Rouge Trials', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 4(3), 377-396.

The purpose of this article is to investigate the baseline condition of Cambodian political culture prior to the ECCC. The survey found that support for rule of law was widespread in Cambodian society well before the ECCC, and might have been a cause for the Court rather than a consequence of it. Should the ECCC disappoint the Cambodian people, support for rule of law might recede.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	4
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Missing
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Glasius, M. (2008), 'We ourselves, we are part of the functioning' The ICC, Victims, and Civil Society in the Central African Republic', *African Affairs*, 108/430, 49–67.

In contrast to many other situations, the ICC's involvement in the Central African Republic was urged on by local civil society but the Court's ability to meet their expectations is questioned by the author, largely due to issues of legitimacy.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Gordy, E (2003). 'War Guilt and Responsibility: The Case of Serbia II. The Milosevic Trial', *Justice and Reconciliation*. Social Science Research Council.

The ICTY, as well as all institutions in the former Yugoslavia, receive consistently low ratings of confidence and legitimacy in Serbian public opinion surveys, which presents a barrier to the use of official or semiofficial channels. Therefore, unofficial initiatives to promote dialogue across groups could be more effective in restoring and promoting peaceful relationships in the region.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Greenawalt, Alexander, (2009), 'Complementarity in Crisis : Uganda , Alternative Justice , and the International Criminal Court', *Virginia Journal of International Law* Vol.1

Although the ICC is structured - through the policy of complementarity - to give deference to domestic proceedings, the application of these provisions to the Ugandan peace process reveals deep uncertainty regarding the ICC's core relationship to domestic governance.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Haddad, Heidi Nichols. (2010). 'Mobilizing the Will to Prosecute: Crimes of Rape at the Yugoslav and Rwandan Tribunals', *Human Rights Revue* 12:109-132.

This article argues that transnational advocacy helped to generate the necessary political will to adopt and implement legal norms regarding crimes of sexual violence at the ICTY and the ISTR.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hagan, J and Sanja Kutnjak Ivkovic (2006). 'War Crimes, Democracy, and the Rule of Law in Belgrade, the Former Yugoslavia, and Beyond', *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*. 605:129.

Based on over 2,000 surveys conducted in Sarajevo, Belgrade, Vukovar, and Pristina, the authors find that Serbs in Belgrade are distinctive in insisting that war criminals be tried in their places of origin, while Serbs in Sarajevo and Vukovar agree with other groups in those settings that war criminals should be tried in the locations where their crimes occurred. They attribute this to the localized influence of cultural norms and competing interests between the 'defended' and the 'defeated' parties.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hamber, B., L. Sevchenko, and E. Naidu. (2010), 'Utopian Dreams or Practical Possibilities? The Challenges of Evaluating the Impact of Memorialization in Societies in Transition', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 4(3): 397-420.

Evaluating the work of three youth programmes linked to the work of the International Coalition of Sites of Conscience (in Bangladesh, Chile and Italy), this research argues that transitional processes should make better use of the specific resources that memorial sites have to offer.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hamber, Brandon. (2010b). 'Masculinity and Transitional Justice: An Exploratory Essay', *Peace Prints: South Asian Journal of Peacebuilding*, Vol. 3, No. 1: Autumn 2010

This article is intended as an exploratory essay on masculinity and transitional justice. It aims to set parameters within which a more concerted study of the subject could be undertaken. The article questions the degree to which violent masculinities in particular are taken into account in societies in transition and in the study of transitional justice.

This is a useful article, given that (as the author states) 'studies on masculinity and transitional justice are all but nonexistent.' It contributes some strong theoretical and empirical insights (of note is the warning against stereotyping ex-combatants as the embodiment of violent masculinity). It relies largely on existing literature along with some various government or NGO reports. The author concludes with four recommendations for future research which are good starting points for transitional justice scholars.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Harper, E. (2005). 'Delivering Justice in the Wake of Mass Violence: New Approaches to Transitional Justice', *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, 10(2), 149-185.

The UNTAET administration's lack of understanding with respect to the population's judicial expectations and legal culture, limited its capacity to create a suitable framework for resolving the nation's legacy of violence, selective impunity and discrimination. A more effective legal model could have developed if UNTAET better appreciated the Timorese population's differentiation between different categories of criminals and that nonjudicial mechanisms would only be accepted for certain types of criminals.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	8
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Missing
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Harris, D, & Lappin, R. (2010). 'The Liberian Truth and Reconciliation Commission: Reconciling or Re-dividing Liberia? Alternatives', *Turkish Journal of International Relations*, 9 (1): 181-191.

This article discusses the dilemma in Liberia to either uphold or ignore the TRC's final recommendations to ban many of the current political elite (including the current president) from office for 30 years, as well as to investigate other high-ranking individuals for war crimes. Reaction to the recommendations is divided and there are severe consequences, both for implementing the recommendations and ignoring them. (It is not apparent that any fieldwork was conducted).

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Haskell, L. 'Justice Compromised: The Legacy of Rwanda's Community-Based Gacaca Courts', *Human Rights Watch*, 2011.

Studies the effect of the *gacaca* proceedings as they comes to an end. Finds that the most serious problem *gacaca* faces is unequal access to justice.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hayner, P B (1994). 'Fifteen Truth Commissions -1974 to 1994: A Comparative Study', *Human Rights Quarterly*, 16(4): 597.

This article describes and compares fifteen pre-1994 truth commissions and presents some of the key issues as well as recommendations for future truth commissions.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hayner, P (2011). *Unspeakable Truths: Transitional Justice and the Challenge of Truth Commissions. Second Edition. New York: Routledge.*

The second edition of this book is a comparative study of 40 TCs in operation from 1974-2009. Hayner gives background on TCs, and also compares how different TCs dealt with similar issues (reparations, naming names, gender, etc). She also discusses the practical methodology and operations of a TC. She concludes that there is a trend towards broader inquiries with more multi-faceted mandates (including reconciliation) covering longer periods of time, with greater use of public hearings and higher public expectations. She sees the greatest potential threats to future TCs as rushed preparation/creation and inability to make the work more effective at the policy level upon conclusion of the TCs work.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Hazan, Pierre, 2006, *Measuring the impact of punishment and forgiveness: a framework for evaluating transitional justice*, *International Review of the Red Cross* 88(861): 19

Little is known about the impact of transitional justice mechanisms. By examining underlying hypotheses and workings of transitional justice and proposing a series of indicators to evaluate its results, this article intends to help fill that gap.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Henry, Nicola. (2009), 'Witness to Rape: The Limits and Potential of International War Crimes Trials for Victims of Wartime Sexual Violence', *The International Journal of Transitional Justice*. Vol. 3. 114-134.

The paper argues that for the victims of wartime sexual violence the experience of giving testimony is mixed. While some victims may suffer under the constraints of the legal process, in the right circumstances war crimes trials may help others to make sense of their suffering. However, it still cannot be expected that such trials achieve complex justice aims.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Herman, J. (2010). *Reaching for Justice: The Participation of Victims at the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia*. Centre on Human Rights in Conflict.

The participation of Civil Parties obviously increases the length and cost of the trial, but their voices provide a much-needed reminder of the purpose of the trial. Given that the ECCC has faced allegations of corruption and political interference, which could potentially affect perceptions of its legitimacy, it may be the participation of victims that leaves a real legacy.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hinton, A. (2010), *Transitional justice : global mechanisms and local realities after genocide and mass violence. Genocide, political violence, human rights series*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press.

The key argument of this volume on the anthropology of transitional justice is that justice is intricately related to locality. Therefore, larger transitional justice initiatives will often fail because they don't consider local knowledge. This volume is a collection of works by different authors; each chapter uses different research methods.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.1000000000000001
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333333000001
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hirst, M. (2005). 'Justice Abandoned? An Assessment of the Serious Crimes Process in East Timor', *International Center for Transitional Justice, Occasional Paper Series, (June)*.

A chronological and structural background of the serious crimes process. Assesses legal aspects and does not touch upon local perspectives and local histories.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Hochschild, Fabrizio. (2004), "It is Better to Leave, We Can't Protect You": Flight in the First Months of United Nations Transitional Administration in Kosovo and East Timor', *Journal of Refugee Studies*. Vol. 17. No. 3. Oxford University Press. 286-300.

The paper argues that the fear of retribution and actual retribution were the principal causes of renewed flight in the first months in Kosovo and East Timor after the establishment of UN administration institutions. The task of creating a comprehensive judicial system was a completely new one for the UN, whose structure lacked the preparedness and experience to carry it out.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hodzic, Refik. (2010), 'Living the Legacy of Mass Atrocities', *Journal of International Criminal Justice*. Vol. 8. 113-136

This paper analyses the perceptions of war crimes among the victims from Prijedor in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The main lesson is that the long-term impact of any judicial attempt to address the legacy of mass atrocities will be severely curtailed if it runs counter to the dominant narrative of the past created and fostered by the government, local intelligentsia and the media loyal to it.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Horn, R., Charters, S., & Vahidy, S. (2009). 'Testifying in an International War Crimes Tribunal: The Experience of Witnesses in the Special Court for Sierra Leone'. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(1), 135-149.

For the witnesses of the SCSL, the experience of testifying was a positive one. When asked directly to rate the experience on a scale ranging from 'very good' to 'very bad,' witnesses overwhelmingly chose positive ratings, with 80 percent saying they would testify again if asked. Witnesses testifying benefit from a thorough preparation period, both by their legal teams and by others responsible for providing support in the pretestimony phase.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	8
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

24 Hours for Darfur, (2009) , *Darfurian voices: Documenting Darfurian Refugees' Views on Issues of Peace, Justice and Reconciliation*.

Project to document views held by Darfurian refugees in Chad on issues of peace, justice and reconciliation.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.5
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	1.75
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Hovil, Lucy, and Moses Chrispus Okello, (December 2009), 'Where Justice is a Dream: A report of formal and informal justice mechanisms in Adjumani', *Special Report of Adjumani District Local Government, German Overseas Development Program, The Refugee Law Project.*

Post-Conflict formal justice mechanisms in Adjumani, Northern Uganda, are dysfunctional. Traditional justice mechanisms have a key role to play and should be revisited in Adjumani and the rest of the country.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Human Rights Watch (2008), *Courting History: The Landmark International Criminal Court's First Years.*

HRW assessment of ICC's operation to date. Concludes that OTP must improve its capacity to conduct investigations; to improve its outreach and enhance its level of field engagement.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	1
Total score (out of 8):	2.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Human Rights Center, University of California and Centre for Human Rights, University of Sarajevo (2000), *Justice, Accountability and Social Reconstruction: An Interview Study of Bosnian Judges and Prosecutors*. Berkley: University of California

An excellent study of the judges and prosecutors in BiH trying to clarify objections and resistance of the ICTY by examining judges and prosecutors acceptability of the criminal tribunal and relation to social reconstruction.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Hund, John. (2004), 'African witchcraft and western law: psychological and cultural issues', *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 19(1): 67-84

Standard models of anthropology and psychology have tended to treat belief in witchcraft as symptomatic of superstition or madness. This article argues that by approaching these belief systems from a Jungian perspective, new ways of thinking about them are introduced that can help find a solution to the problem of witchcraft violence in South Africa.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Huyse, Luc. (2008), 'Introduction: tradition-based approaches in peace-making, transitional justice and reconciliation policies', in *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: Learning from African Experiences*, Luc Huyse and Mark Salter (eds). International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

This chapter collects information on the similarities and differences between the tradition-based justice and reconciliation mechanisms in five African countries and critiques current approaches towards the study of 'traditional justice'

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

ICTJ and Human Rights Center, Berkeley. (2004). "Iraqi Voices: Attitudes toward Transitional Justice and Social Reconstruction." Berkeley: University of California

This report examines Iraqi attitudes toward transitional justice during summer 2003. In doing so, it makes recommendations for comprehensive social repair and transitional justice, with a specific emphasis on SSR and judicial reform. It exposes human rights abuses and injustice under the old regime as well as the complicated and often resentful position of Iraqis to the international community. The authors find broad support for trials, reparations, and an historical truth-seeking process but a rejection of the possibility of amnesty for perpetrators. This study represents one of the first instances where Iraqis could speak about the atrocities committed under Saddam Hussein, and provides key information on what was at that point a largely understudied population. In assessing its conclusions regarding the needs for SSR and the feasibility of trials, it is important to

remember that this field-work was done in 2003, and would likely produce different recommendations today, particularly regarding international involvement in Iraq.

This study is based on primary interview and focus group research and provides a very clear description of its methodology. The authors include interview questionnaires and acknowledge the role that security impediments played in this study, particularly in terms of random sampling. It provides information regarding the social groups surveyed and achieves a believably representative sample. Though a very strong report, this work could be improved by including an assessment of the role of potential bias (recall, interview, selection, etc) in the methodology and analysis, which is currently not addressed.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Igreja, Victor, and Beatrice Dias-Lambranca. (2008), 'Restorative Justice and the role of magamba spirits in post-civil war Gorongosa, central Mozambique' in Luc Huyse and Mark Salter (eds.). *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: Learning from African Experiences*, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

In spite of official neglect, war survivors living in the former epicentres of the civil war in Gorongosa have neither resorted to violent revenge nor gone along with the official authorities who urge survivors to 'forgive and forget'. Instead, they have developed thier own socio-cultural mechanisms to create healing and attain justice in the aftermath of civil war.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Igreja, Victor. (2012). 'Multiple Temporalities in Indigenous Justice and Healing Practices in Mozambique', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 6 (3):404-422.

The author argues that mainstream transitional justice literature focuses on linear temporalities, but local and indigenous understandings of justice often involve multiple temporalities. The research focuses on the daily lives of war survivors in Gorongosa, Mozambique and suggests that transitional justice is best understood as an open-ended process without a definitive end.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Ingelaere, Bert. (2008). 'The Gacaca Courts in Rwanda', in Huyse, L., & Salter, M. (Eds) *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: Learning from African Experiences*. Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance. Retrieved from http://www.idea.int/publications/traditional_justice/index.cfm

This author argues that the 'new' Gacaca courts are an 'invented tradition'. It is argued that state intervention through legal and social engineering has designed and implemented a novelty, loosely modelled on an existing institution.

The research has a great deal of depth, and on this basis this article is a strong contribution to the discourse. The author used a wide range of research techniques in order to gain a detailed understanding of Gacaca courts. However, this piece is written in a very 'factual' manner, yet beside the initial claim that it is based on detailed research, it is not clear how exactly this has informed the author's views: there is no quantification of results, or detailed narrative on any of the interviews/ethnographic studies undertaken. This is a shame given the obvious knowledge contained in the article. The author does make good uses of local primary sources on Gacaca courts.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Ingelaere, Bert. 'Does the truth pass across the fire without burning? Locating the short circuit in Rwanda's Gacaca courts', *Journal of Modern African Studies* Vol.47 No.4 (2009):507-528

The article argues that the Gacaca proceedings forced 'truth-telling' in a particular form upon the population; this resulted in a 'crisis of transparency' that worsened social attitudes towards the 'other group' as a clash between the official line of 'truth' and an underlying societal discourse that became pronounced.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.8999999999999999
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ivkovich, SK and Hagan, J (2009). 'The ICTY, its Constituency, and the Politics: The Battle for Hearts and Minds'. Available at SSRN: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=1442907>

Based on seven surveys administered throughout the former Yugoslavia between 1997 and 2005 (strategically timed to follow significant events), the author concludes that post-2003 surveys indicated substantially more negative attitudes towards the ICTY. This decrease of confidence is mirrored by an increase of confidence in local courts.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

January, Sativa (2009) 'Tribunal Verité: Documenting Transitional Justice in Sierra Leone', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(2): 207-228.

This paper is highly theoretical about how the court disseminates information to the public and the limitations experienced by journalists. Although not providing significant quantitative data/information, it is useful in showing how the Court shapes its image to the public and how this affects positive/negative reception.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Jarvinen, T. (2004). 'Human Rights and Post-Conflict Transitional Justice in East Timor', *Finnish Institute of International Affairs*, 47.

Interviews are mainly of NGO/UN personnel rather than local population. More of a historical account of the various transitional/judicial processes in E.Timor following independence rather than an insightful analysis. This paper presents the five currently existing international/national processes of transitional justice and discusses their human rights implications.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.25
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Jaye, T (2009). 'Transitional Justice and DDR : The Case of Liberia', *International Center for Transitional Justice Research Brief*. June 2009

The article very generally examines the relationship between DDR and transitional justice in Liberia and concludes that the sustainability of the fragile CPA was due to the implementation of the DDR program separately and prior to the TRC and any other transitional justice mechanisms.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Pradeep Jeganathan (2010) 'In the ruins of truth: the work of melancholia and acts of Memory', *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies*, 11:1, 6-2.

Highly theoretical paper where the author deconstructs the notion of truth and highlights the inadequacies of 'truth' produced in truth commissions. He claims that 'truth' is truth if it is one of pain and trauma. He goes further to theorise whether more reconciliation is drawn from remembering (memorialisation) or forgetting.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Joanna R. Quinn and Mark Freeman, (2003) ‘Lessons learned’, *Human Rights Quarterly* 25: 1117-1137

This paper provides a general overview of the truth commissions in Guatemala and South Africa, the structure, mandate, procedures adopted, similarities/differences between the two bodies.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Kelsall, T. (2005). ‘Truth, Lies, Ritual: Preliminary Reflections on the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in Sierra Leone’, *Human Rights Quarterly*, 27(2): 361-391.

This article explores truth telling processes in Sierra Leone. It concludes that in these proceedings, the truth is often not told, but performance and rituals of forgiveness are sufficient to forge reconciliation. The author explains the absence of truth as a result of many factors: fear of prosecution/misunderstanding of the relationship between the TRC and SCSL, lack of resources for the TRC, the presence of ex-RUF soldiers in the hearings, and the absence of cultural connection with confession/truth telling.

This article is based on a single, incredibly detailed ethnographic description of multi-day hearing proceedings in one location in Sierra Leone. The author notes having adopted an ethnographic approach, though no other methodological information is given. While the author relies on audience reaction to determine the veracity of some testimonies, he seems to extrapolate these few reactions to a large proportion of testimonies and reinforce their apparent falseness by noting the

disconnectedness of the individual testifying. Less clear even is how he determines that rituals have instilled a sense of reconciliation that the truth telling process failed to achieve. While these points are detailed and theorised to good effect, it is difficult to believe the claims of the article given the information presented. Similarly, the author makes a number of broad claims that need to be better backed up than they are, for example: “If this reading is correct, it suggests that witnesses did not generally accept the idea that the Commission was a platform upon which to enact grief, catharsis and healing, either for their own benefit or for that of the nation.”

Though it makes potentially important contributions, this work could be improved by combining his observations with interviews of those in attendance and observing the proceedings at other sites throughout Sierra Leone.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kelsall, T. (2009). *Culture under cross-examination international justice and the special court for Sierra Leone*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

The book examines some of the challenges posed by the fact that the Speical Court for Sierra Leone operated in a largely unfamiliar culture, in which the way local people thought about rights, agency and truth-telling sometimes differed radically from the way international lawyers think about these things. By applying an anthro-political perspective to the trials, Kelsall unveils a variety of ethical, epistemological, jurisprudential and procedural problems, arguing that although touted as a promising hybrid, the Court failed in crucial ways to adapt to the local culture concerned.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Kent, L. (n.d.). 'Community views of justice and reconciliation in Timor-Leste'. Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://devnet.anu.edu.au/db 68-pdfs/14 Kent 68.pdf>

The majority of deponents interviewed felt freer following their participation in the CAVR, yet also felt that the process was incomplete without higher-level perpetrators being held accountable. Victim respondents who participated in the CAVR also felt that reconciliation cannot be complete without addressing serious crimes. The author holds that the CAVR without addressing serious crimes would be counter-productive.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Rachel Kerr & Jessica Lincoln, 'The Special Court for Sierra Leone: Outreach, Legacy and Impact,' *Draft Interim Report of the War Crimes Research Group, Department of War Studies, King's College London, July 2007*

Good insight into the structural problems of the SCSL and how this impacts public views on its legitimacy, although the interviewing methods are not clear. This paper begins by showing the outreach efforts of the SCSL and its limitations, and the public's detachment from the process given the limitations. The paper also shows the continual struggle for victim/public inclusion.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kersten, Mark. (forthcoming 2013) 'Justice After the War: The ICC and Post-Gaddafi Libya', in K. Fisher and R. Stewart (eds) *Transitional Justice and the Arab Spring*, London:Routledge

Unsuccessful and rival attempts by both Libya and the ICC to bring accountability to senior level members of the Gaddafi regime have threatened to undermine post-conflict justice in Libya.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Khmer Institute of Democracy (2006). 'Outreach activities: Khmer Rouge Tribunal Project' funded by OSI

Valuable information but unclear methodology. KID conducted outreach activities across Cambodia and reported back on candid concerns the participants had regarding the ECCC.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	1.5
Total score (out of 8):	3
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Kim, H. and Sikkink, K. (2010). 'Explaining the Deterrence Effect of Human Rights Prosecutions for Transitional Countries', *International Studies Quarterly*, 54(4).

This article examines the deterrent effect of human rights prosecutions during transitional periods. Through an assessment of 100+ cases, the author finds that prosecutions in transitional periods lead to human rights protections both in their home country, as well as in other countries. The authors attribute this result to both the normative power of prosecutions as well as the material punishment they provide, and find that truth commissions have a positive (though smaller) impact on human rights.

This paper draws on a new dataset of prosecutions to provide a quantitative analysis of the research question. The authors transparently present the methodology used for compiling the dataset and for its analysis, which accounts for reversed causality as well as omitted variables. This is a solid paper, though with two apparent drawbacks. First, the author’s classification of transitions seems problematic as it classifies transitions in ways that may be unrealistic (i.e. democratic transition OR transition from civil war). Additionally, the binary assessment of prosecutions ignores the variations in substance of the prosecutions (ie. High vs. low profile, type of crime, etc) which seem important to the research question at hand.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Theidon, Kimberley (2007), 'Transitional Subjects: The Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration of Former Combatants in Colombia', *The International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 1, 2007, 66–90

Integration of disarmament, demobilization and reintegration (DDR) programmes within transitional justice, in order to ensure reintegration of former combatants into civilian life.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kingston, J. (2006). 'Regaining Dignity: Justice and Reconciliation in East Timor', *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 227-242.

This paper includes interviews with President Xanana Gusmao and Foreign Minister Jose Ramos-Horta and chronicles the president's calculated response to reconciliation. The author believes that

total satisfaction for victims is impossible and that modest satisfaction entails recognition of their suffering and acceptance by Indonesia.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kingston, J. (2006). 'Balancing justice and reconciliation in East Timor', *Critical Asian Studies*, 38(3), 271-302.

This paper includes interviews with President Xanana Gusmao and Foreign Minister Jose Ramos-Horta, along with NGO workers, and is more of a chronological account of the process of reconciliation. It is an expansion of Kingston's other 2006 paper "Regaining Dignity: Justice and Reconciliation in East Timor". The author concludes that in the absence of either retributive or restorative justice, the prospects for reconciliation seem remote.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kirschner, S. a, & von Stein, J. (2009). 'The Pieces of Peacemaking: Understanding Implementation of Civil War Settlements', *Civil Wars*, 11(3), 279-301. [doi:10.1080/13698240903157529](https://doi.org/10.1080/13698240903157529)

This article examines the implementation of, and adherence to, civil war-ending peace agreements. By analyzing the cases of Mozambique, Angola, El Salvador, and Guatemala, it finds that implementation is most likely to succeed in the presence of international support. This paper also finds that the balance of government capabilities between government and rebel forces exhibits an inverse-U shaped relationship with implementation. This paper is situated at the intersection

between democratic consolidation and post-war recovery and stability, and draws from the literatures of all three in its framing and analysis.

This paper investigates its question by developing a series of indicators related to both implementation success and variables thought to affect implementation. The author provides a partial explanation of the methodology used, including case selection, identification strategy, and notes the limitations of small-N research, though does not detail the sources of his basic information beyond “secondary sources” and news sources dating from 1993 and 1994. This article shows an innovative approach and does well in recognizing its limitations. This paper’s weakness, however, is that it ignores what could be substantial reverse causality. Another causality is that this paper treats each country as a single case and does not account for regional variations in implementation and adherence to agreements.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	1.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Kohen, Ari, Zanchelli, Michael, and Drake, Levi. ‘Personal and Political Reconciliation in Post-Genocide Rwanda’, *Social Justice Research* Vol.24 No.1 (2011): 85-106

Assessment of the gacaca proceedings and their impact on reconciliation. Argues that the lack of transparency and political honesty harms the reconciliation process.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Kritz, N. J. (1995). *Transitional justice: How emerging democracies reckon with former regimes*. Vol. 1 (of 3). Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press.

Volume 1 assembles a variety of legal, political, and philosophical perspectives on how societies emerging from repression can deal with that legacy. The book specifically examines emerging democracies and how they grapple with transitional justice mechanisms.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Kritz, N. J. (1995), *Transitional justice: How emerging democracies reckon with former regimes*, Vol 2 (of 3) Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press.

Volume II examines more than 20 transitions from World War II to 1995, including the de-Nazification programs of the 1950s, democratic transformations in southern Europe in the mid-70s and Latin America in the '80s, and de-communicization efforts in the '90s.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Lamin, a R. (2003). 'Building Peace Through Accountability in Sierra Leone: The Truth and Reconciliation Commission and the Special Court', *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 38(2-3), 295-320.

This paper focuses predominately on comparing the SCSL/TRC to similar international bodies, such as the S. African TRC and the ICTY/ICTR. It then compares the SCSL to the TRC and shows where both overlap, an area which both parties must clarify to ensure the effectiveness of both institutions .

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Laplante, L. (2007). 'On the Indivisibility of Rights: Truth Commissions, Reparations, and the Right to Development.' *Yale Human Rights & Development Law Journal*, 10: 1-33.

Using the example of Peru, this article examines the concept of the indivisibility of rights and how truth commissions reveal the interplay between violations of civil/political rights (CPR) and economic/social/cultural rights (ESCR). It concludes that economic inequalities contributed the onset of violence, the knowledge of which contributed to the development of the TRC's reparations programme. This work finds that these individual and collective reparations are perceived as development initiatives rather than CPR-specific compensation. This has resulted in frustration among victim populations and is indicative of a lack of political will on the part of the government to provide victims with redress for past abuses. Through this analysis the author draws larger conclusions of the indivisibility of individual and collective generational CPR and ESCR and the role of transitional justice mechanisms in addressing both.

This article is based on the author's extensive participant observation in the field, which achieves a believably representative sample. The author however does not clearly describe her specific data collection or analysis approach, nor does she discuss any potential biases. A consideration of circumstances specific to Peru that impacts the generalisability of this article's findings would have been beneficial.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Latigo, James Ojera. (2008), 'Northern Uganda: tradition-based practices in the Acholi region' in Luc Huysse and Mark Salter (eds) *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: Learning from African Experiences*. International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

A major challenge for the use of local rituals in northern Uganda is the disagreement between different ethnic grounds over which communal principals and practices should be employed. Local TJ processes unfold in dynamic environments that involve state or internationally run institutions eg. Amnesty Commission and ICC.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Laura Arriaza and Naomi Roht-Arriaza, 'Social Reconstruction as a Local Process', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 2, 2008, 152–172

National-level initiatives for transitional justice are insufficient to capture the meaning of the conflict for people living in specific villages, towns, 'hills' or other local spaces, whose experience may vary widely from that of people elsewhere in the country. Suggests that individuals assessing past efforts and contemplating new ones should look at independent initiatives arising from the local level as an integral part of the post-armed conflict justice landscape.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Lie, T. G., Binningsba, H. M., & Gates, S. (2007). 'Post-Conflict Justice and Sustainable Peace. Post Conflict Transition', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* 4191, 1-33.

This article investigates the long-term effect of post-conflict justice on the duration of peace after conflict. It concludes that post-conflict trials lead to longer periods of peace in both democratic and non-democratic states, and that truth commissions have a strong, significant effect on peace duration in post-conflict democracies.

Though interesting, this work is categorized by the same problems that are seen to haunt the field of transitional justice at large: trying to universalize the experience and meaning of justice. Previous work has shown these concepts to have different meanings not only across societies but also across individuals. This approach also ignores the subtle differences between different mechanisms of the same classification – for instance, it doesn't capture the differences between the TRC and the ICTR or SCSL.

This work builds on a new dataset previously constructed by the authors that categorizes various forms of post-conflict justice, as well as the UCPD, to define post-conflict society. This presents problems not acknowledged in the text, such as the representation of cases of diffuse violence in small countries (like those with <25 battle related deaths: would South Africa have been included? Argentina?). Though this approach is questionable, the authors do examine the internal and external validity of their results to good effect, and caution that these results are weak.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Lincoln, J. (2011), *Transitional justice, peace and accountability: outreach and the role of international courts after conflict*. London: New York: Routledge.

This book critically examines the role of outreach within international justice focusing specifically on the role of outreach at the Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL). Through empirical analysis, the book provides an insight into individual and community perceptions of international justice.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ling, C. W. (2005). 'Forgiveness and Punishment in Post-Conflict Timor', *UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs*, 1.

The Timorese two-track system is a unique example of post-conflict justice which seeks to balance international and national ideas of accountability, yet the Serious Crimes Panel and Reconciliation Commission do not truly reflect Timorese views on post-conflict justice. Rather than resorting to claims of universalism, international organisations such as the UN can play an important mediating role between national and international interests.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Laplante, L.J. and Theidon, K., 'Transitional Justice in Times of Conflict- Colombia's Ley de Justicia Y Paz', *Michigan Journal of International Law*, 50, 2006-2007

The article argues that the legitimacy of transitional justice lies in a 'space where people can balance legality with politics' and that transitional justice and DDR should not be separated.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Laplante, L.J. and Phenicie, K., 'Media, Trials and Truth Commissions: 'Mediating' Reconciliation in Peru's Transitional Justice Process', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 4, 2010, 207–229

The authors examine the impact of the local media on transitional justice mechanisms and suggest the establishment of a constructive societal dialogue, through the reform and support of local media.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Louis Bickford (2007), 'Unofficial Truth Projects', *Human Rights Quarterly*, 29: 994

The article analyses the lessons that can be learnt from the contribution of unofficial truth projects (UTPs) to transitional justice and reflects on their non-state status. It also provides some general conclusions about the strengths and weaknesses of UTPs.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Lundy, Patricia, and Mark McGovern, (2008), 'Whose Justice? Rethinking Transitional Justice from the Bottom Up', *Journal of Law and Society* 35(2): 265-292.

The paper argues that transitional justice needs to adopt a participatory approach to achieve longer-term sustainability. A Northern Ireland initiative, the Ardoyne Commemoration Project, is explored in depth, illustrating how 'bottom up' truth telling process can make a significant contribution to TJ. The Mendeley score is on the basis of the evidence presented in this paper, not the Ardoyne Commemoration Project itself.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Lutz, E., & Sikkink, K. (2001). 'The justice cascade: The evolution and impact of foreign human rights trials in Latin America', *Chicago Journal of International Law*, 2(1).

This article examines the shifting landscape of international justice and human rights proceedings between 1982 and 1999. It argues that in Latin America, this period was characterised by a "justice cascade" of rapidly evolving liberal norms stemming from increased international networks of activists and lawyers and increased attention to democracy and human rights in this region. These norms along with the international justice mechanisms they spawned, it is argued, continue to transform the behavior of politicians and militaries and give individuals a sense that justice will be served. This article is very solidly framed theoretically and traces the origins of these developments through the impact of American and European human rights cases, including that of Pinochet and the larger work of the transnational justice network.

This article provides little new local level data and seems to draw primarily on existing literature along with a handful of interviews and news reports. The authors are not transparent about the methods used to obtain this information or about the potential biases/limitations in their analytical approach. There are a number of claims made in this paper regarding the impact of the “justice cascade” that, though they may be factual, are largely unsubstantiated in the text. Similarly, the authors draw direct causal links between judicial proceedings and international policy development that also need to be substantiated. Despite these flaws, this is a solid theoretical article that provides useful insights and a historical account of justice in Latin America.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Mallinder, L. (2008), *Amnesty, human rights and political transitions: bridging the peace and justice divide*, Oxford: Hart Publishing.

This book aims to investigate whether an amnesty necessarily entails a violation of a state's international obligations, or whether an amnesty, accompanied by alternative justice mechanisms, can in fact contribute positively to both peace and justice. This book argues that international actors should work to limit the more negative forms of amnesty by encouraging states to make them conditional and to introduce complementary programmes to repair the harm and prevent a repetition of the crimes.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Mani, R. (2005), 'Rebuilding an Inclusive Political Community After War', *Security Dialogue* 36(4): 511-526

The paper introduces the paradigm of 'reparative justice'. It underscores the need for a broader framework based on reparative justice to respond to the deeper and often unmet need in post-conflict societies to rebuild inclusive political communities.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Mani, R (2008). 'Editorial – Dilemmas of Expanding Transitional Justice, or Forging the Nexus Between Transitional Justice and Development', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 2: 253-265.

This editorial introduces a special issue on the relationship between TJ and development. It addresses 4 dilemmas between TJ and development -social injustices as underlying causes of conflict, the cost of TJ, war economies, and postconflict criminal and societal violence –' and calls on practitioners to expand the notion of TJ to encompass issues of social justice/development.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Margolis, J Eli (2007). Trauma and Trials of Reconciliation in Cambodia', *Georgetown Journal of International Affairs*. 8.1: 153-162.

This paper provides some valuable insight through individual interviews. It argues that the ECCC is billed as an undertaking for the Cambodian people. However, the trials may be more for the benefit

of the international community than for ordinary Cambodians. Whatever risks they pose, and whomever they benefit, the trials cannot be stopped now and efforts should go into helping Cambodians achieve a more tangible and long-lasting justice. In the flurry surrounding transitional justice, international supporters must not lose sight of the importance of good governance.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Marieke Wierda, Habib Nassar and Lynn Maalouf, 'Early Reflections on Local Perceptions, Legitimacy and Legacy of the Special Tribunal for Lebanon', *Journal of International Criminal Justice* 5 (2007), 1065-1081

The authors suggest that The Special Tribunal for Lebanon ('STL') faces challenges with respect to its legitimacy. These challenges can be overcome by through their operations, including the transparent selection of judges and senior officials; attracting funding from a variety of states; and effective outreach.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Martin-Beristain, C., Paez, D., Rime, B., & Kanyangara, P. (2010), 'Psychosocial effects of participation in rituals of transitional justice: A collective-level analysis and review of the literature of the effects of TRCs and trials on human rights violations in Latin America', *Revista de Psicología Social*, 25(1), 47-60.

This article examines the psychological impact of participating in transitional justice mechanisms as well as traditional justice rituals using evidence from South Africa, Rwanda, and Latin America. In

interrogating the assumption that TRC-type proceedings and rituals yield healing and reconciliation, this work finds that participating in these mechanisms has both positive (empowerment, return of dignity) and negative (increased negative emotion) psychosocial outcomes among participants. These patterns are also seen at the collective society level, where they contribute to a negative social climate while at the same time promoting social cohesion and reinforcing human rights.

This work draws on a significant amount of previously conducted fieldwork and studies, which it fully explains and utilises to good effect. The authors use this work as the basis for a collective-level assessment to explore whether trials and truth commissions have a positive macro-social impact. Sound identification of variables is provided which details measurements of human rights, trials, and presence of TRC. The article also does well in noting omitted variables, though fails to account for any bias in its methodological/analytical approach.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

McCargo, D. (2011), 'Politics by other means? The virtual trials of the Khmer Rouge tribunal', *International Affairs*, 87: 613–627. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2346.2011.00993.x

This paper provides great insight into the international and local tensions of the ECCC. McCargo argues that Courtroom trials are paralleled by 'virtual trials', soft power contests between the international community and the states where war crimes have taken place. The ECCC looks set to become the first such tribunal where authoritarian practices and values gain a decisive upperhand. The ECCC is failing, and it is time the UN seriously considered withdrawing its support for this deeply flawed tribunal.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

McCourt, Kerstin. (2009). 'Judicial Defenders: Their Role in Postgenocide Justice and Sustained Legal Development', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(2): 272-283.

This article explores the role of the Corps of the Judicial Defenders in Rwanda. It concludes that this body was successful in providing short-term legal representation in domestic courts and contributing to the long-term development of the judicial system in Rwanda. The article also provides information regarding the recruitment, training, and deployment of the defenders as well as insight into their perspectives. The author identifies this programme as potentially useful as a larger transitional justice package in other settings.

The article is based on interviews, project documents, and evaluations, though its interview methods are not transparent. While interviewing members of the Corps on their own experiences is valuable, interviews with victims/perpetrators/families/civil society should have supplemented these, as the author makes claims about the larger impact of the Corps. This would have allowed for a more representative view and enhanced the validity of the conclusions. The author also fails to mention any other potential biases and limitations in the methods of this paper.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

McEvoy, Kieran, and Lorna McGregor, (2008), *Transitional Justice From Below: Grassroots Activism and the Struggle for Change*. Oxford, UK, and Portland, OR: Hart Publishing

The book emphasises the need for bespoke solutions to different transitions rather than 'off the shelf' models. It urges institutions to explore ways in which transitional justice can broaden ownership and encourage the participation of those who have been most directly affected by conflict.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

McGrew, L. (2006). 'Transitional Justice Approaches in Cambodia', in *Justice Initiatives: The Extraordinary Chambers*, Open Society Institute, 139-150.

The author assesses what means are available for Cambodians to address their past, such as the Courts, possible reconciliation methods, and historical memorials.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Meernik, James. (2005), 'Justice and Peace? How the International Criminal Tribunal Affects Societal Peace in Bosnia', *Journal of Peace Research*. Vol. 42 No. 3. 271-289.

The article is based on a quantitative analysis that found that in large part ICTY actions produced little effect on societal peace in Bosnia.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Megwalu A and N.Loizides. 'Dilemmas of Justice and Reconciliation: Rwandans and the Gacaca Courts', *African Journal of International and Comparative Law*. Vol.18No.1 (2010):1-23

The author argues that, despite the reservations shown by certain factions of the population, the overall benefit of gacaca proceedings outweighs its negative effects, and has the cumulative effect of strengthening the judicial system.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Mekonnen, D. (2010), 'Indigenous legal tradition as a supplement to African transitional justice initiatives', *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*, Vol 10(3): 101-122

Taking the example of international legal tradition as practiced in Eritrea the author explores the concept of *ubuntu's* similarity to restorative justice and argues in favour of promoting the role of international legal tradition in African transitional justice initiatives, eg. by incorporating them into TRCs.

Coder initials	hp
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ballengee, Melissa. 'The critical role of non-governmental organizations in transitional justice: a case study of Guatemala', *UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs*. 477, 1999-2000

Taking the example of the REHMI initiative in Guatemala, this paper highlights the role that NGOs and other civil society organizations can play in establishing transitional justice.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Mendeloff, D. (2009) 'Trauma and Vengeance: Assessing the Psychological and Emotional Effects of Post-Conflict Justice', *Human Rights Quarterly*, Vol 31 (3) August 2009, pp. 592-623.

Empirical evidence does not confute nor support the claims of positive or negative psychological and emotional effects of transitional justice.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Mertus, J. (2004). 'Women's Participation in the International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia', *Hunt Alternatives Fund Report*.

This study examines the role of women in the creation and operation of the ICTY. It finds women played a crucial role at every level of the ICTY (as officials, judges, employees, witnesses, etc) along with women's advocacy groups and those trained with specific expertise in gender issues. This involvement contributed to the ICTY's precedent of GBV as a war crime and the overall success of the tribunal. The study notes the role of GBV in creating international momentum for establishing the ICTY. In addition, this study reveals the practical concerns related to increasing women's participation.

Overall, this is a strong report, which contextualises its findings in a history of the ICTY and women's activism and participation in its proceedings. The authors do well in identifying their assumptions, clearly framing of the issue, and defining key terms. This study is based on interview-based and participatory field work, as well as on both academic and grey literature. Though it is clear that this study is grounded in significant fieldwork, little more information on data collection procedures was provided and it is hard to assess how representative this study's sample population might be. Additionally, issues of methodological bias are not addressed in this text, despite the fact that they may be significant when dealing with topics as sensitive as those of this study.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Michalsky, Milena. 2007. 'Cultural Representation of Atrocity and Repentance'. *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*. Vol.7:3. 497-508.

Using film as a cultural representation, through individual interpretations of particular narratives, treating the legacy of atrocity and war crimes has the potential to promote catharsis and bring about a process of coming to terms with the past.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Millar, G. (2010). 'Assessing Local Experiences of Truth-Telling in Sierra Leone: Getting to "why" through a Qualitative Case Study Analysis', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 4(3), 477-496.

The author interviewed 62 people from the Makeni region. It was found that there is a significant difference between elite and non-elite populations in terms of reception of the TRC. The elite see it as positive because they have also had financial gains through increased jobs and inclusion in NGO training activities. Whereas the non-elite feel that they were 'provoked' to unearth traumatic memories for no compensation (in Makeni, the terms 'help, support, consider, remember, appreciate' all mean to provide resources/money).

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Minow, M. (1998). 'In Practice Between Vengeance and Forgiveness : South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Negotiation Journal*, (October), 319-355.

The author assesses the meaning and power of truth-telling for the purpose of the reconciliation of a divided society in South Africa.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Mncwabe, N. (2010), 'African Transitional Justice Research Network: Critical Reflections on a Peer Learning Process', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 4(3): 497-508.

A review of the peer learning process of the African Transitional Justice Network. Peer learning is only a complement to other evaluation methodologies available to the TJ field and its reliance on interviews makes this approach better suited to organizational strengthening than to isolating variables and trying to prove causality.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Mahdev Mohan (2009), 'Re-constituting the "Un-Person": the Khmer Krom & the Khmer Rouge Tribunal', *Singapore Yearbook of International Law*

This paper provides an interesting perspective on an often-forgotten ethnic group that was persecuted by the Khmer Rouge. The paper argues that the Khmer Krom victims have been reduced to the status of "un-persons" by the ECCC. It matters to survivors that the crimes they suffered are properly characterized, especially where they were persecuted or their loved ones were eliminated because they belonged to a particular group.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Missing

Wisner, Monica. 'Is Time Ripe for Transitional Justice in Afghanistan?', MALD 2008, *Al Nakhlah*, Fletcher School Tufts University: Fall 2008

Outlines the steps taken to advance transitional justice in Afghanistan, the various elements that obstruct it and the suggestions that can be carried out today.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Musoke, Harriet. 'The Human Face of Armed Conflict: Transitional Justice Questions Related to Female Survivors of the Armed Conflict in the Greater North of Uganda (GNOU)' in *Unfinished Business: Transitional Justice and Women's Rights in Africa*. (n.d.) . Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://www.acordinternational.org/silo/files/unfinished-business-transitional-justice-and-womens-rights-in-africa.pdf>

The article provides a human face to women in conflict, lays out the complexities that deter justice and reconciliation in northern Uganda and argues that there should be peace and justice for everyone, with women central to post-conflict rehabilitation.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	1
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	3
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Mutua, Makau. "Interrogating Transitional Justice: Sexual and Gender-based Violence" in *Unfinished Business: Transitional Justice and Women's Rights in Africa*. (n.d.) . Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://www.acordinternational.org/silo/files/unfinished-business-transitional-justice-and-womens-rights-in-africa.pdf>

Gender issues should be central to transitional justice projects, giving priority to crimes of gender based violence. TJ should go beyond truth commissions alone and look at social and institutional reforms and address economic and not only political and social rights.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Muvingi, I. (2009) 'Sitting on Powder Kegs: Socioeconomic. Rights in Transitional Societies', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 3, 2009, pp163–182.

Empirical evidence on Zimbabwe shows that unaddressed social and economic aspects in a transition create social unrest and conflict.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Nabukeera-Musoke, Harriet, 2008, 'Transitional justice and gender in Uganda : Making peace , failing women during the peace negotiation process', *Exchange Organizational Behavior Teaching Journal*: 121-129.

Explores the initiatives of women activists in Uganda during the peace process. Women must continue to document thier activities, successes, challenges and lessons learnt.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Nalepa, M (2007). 'Why do they return? Evaluating the Impact of ICTY on Reconciliation', Department of Political Science project, Rice University. Retrieved from http://www.yale.edu/macmillan/ocvprogram/OCV_Nalepa.pdf

Using UNHCR data supplemented by data from indictments, transcripts, ICTY decisions, and census data, the author compared several independent variables with numbers of minority refugee returns in a given year in a given municipality to determine explanations for refugee returns (a proxy for reconciliation). The author concludes that ICTY plea bargaining (exchanging truth for reduced sentencing) has contributed more to reconciliation in comparison with pure sentencing.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Naniwe-Kaburahe, A. (2008). 'The Institution of Bashingantahe in Burundi' in Luc Huyse and Mark Salter (eds), 2008, *Traditional Justice and Reconciliation after Violent Conflict: learning from the African Experiences*, Stockholm: International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance: Learning from African Experiences.

Shows how the traditional institution of *bashingantahe* can act complementarily with other judicial structures in helping the transition and leading to reconciliation.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ndlovu, M. (1980) 'What transitional justice in Zimbabwe? Women of Zimbabwe Arise (WOZA) prepares for popular participation', *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*,

The article discusses the need for, and the debate over, the establishment of a transitional justice mechanism in Zimbabwe, about the situation in the country, and about a civil society programme to educate members about transitional justice mechanisms.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Nee, A. and P. Uvin, (2010) 'Silence and Dialogue: Burundians' Alternatives to Transitional Justice'. in Rosalind Shaw, L. Waldorf and P. Hazan (eds) *Localizing transitional justice: Interventions and priorities after mass violence*, Standford: Stanford University Press.

Nee and Uvin's research found very little support in the Burundian communities for either prosecutions or a truth commission. The chapter describes how their informants feared that a post-conflict justice or truth telling mechanism could endanger the political transition that brought the country some measure of peace and stability.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Nettelfield, Lara (2010). 'From the Battlefield to the Baracks: The ICTY and the Armed Forces of Bosnia and Herzegovina', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* Vol 4(1), pp 87-109.

The paper examines the attitudes among the Armed Forces in BiH about the war and the ICTY. The research identified a lack of knowledge about the ICTY and inadequate education concerning International Humanitarian Law among army members. The respondents generally believed that the Court has made contributions to peace and security in Bosnia.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Nettlefield, Lara. (2010) *Courting Democracy in Bosnia and Herzegovina: The Hague Tribunal's Impact in a Postwar State*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

A study that illustrates some of the positive legacies of international justice in general, and how the ICTY has advanced Bosnian process of democratization, in particular.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ngowi, R. (2002). 'Rwanda's truth courts aim for reconciliation: Legal system simply inadequate to deal with violence on a massive scale'. *Edmonton Journal (Alberta)*, June 19.

The Gacaca courts in Rwanda are intended to provide expedited justice given the scale of the violence. Concern over the effectiveness of the courts is divided along ethnic lines, but the hope is that the Gacaca process will provide a less punitive form of reconciliation.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.7
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	1.5
Total score (out of 8):	3
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Noticias Financieras (2008). Interview with human rights promoter Dorota Gierycz; Q&A: 'No Peace Without Justice'. July 18, 2008.

This interview with Dorota Gierycz, former representative of the UNHCR in Liberia discusses her experiences with transitional justice and the particular difficulties faced.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Nwogu, N V (2010). 'When and Why It Started: Deconstructing Victim-Centered Truth Commissions in the Context of Ethnicity-Based Conflict'. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol 4(2): 275-289.

This article argues that truth commissions' focus on victims and sensationalized grand narratives undermines the repair of social relations in the long term. More focus should be placed on the motives of perpetrators and 'why' certain crimes were committed in order to foster greater understanding and societal reconciliation.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

O'Connell, J. (2005) 'Gambling with the Psyche. Does Prosecuting Human Rights Violators Console Their Victims?', *Harvard International Law Journal*, Vol. 46 (2)

Criminal and civil legal proceedings have psychological effects on the victims of human rights violations: mainly positive, they are found to have negative aspects when victims actively participate in the proceedings.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Obarrio, J. (2010), 'Beyond equivalence: The gift of justice (Mozambique, 1976, 2004)', *Anthropological Theory* Vol 10(1-2) pp 163-170

Article shows how a broad range of practices identified as 'customary' engage with the space of 'official law' in a specific postcolonial juridico-political space, in local courts in Nampula province in post-war Mozambique.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	4
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, 2007, 'Making Peace on Our Own: Victims' Perceptions of Accountability, Reconciliation and Justice in Northern Uganda', August 2007, available at: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/46cc4a690.html>

Qualitative research study that explores perceptions among northern Ugandans on themes of accountability, reconciliation and transitional justice. The study aims to amplify the voices and perspectives of the victims of violence. Respondants views diverge significantly.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Missing

Okello, M. C., and L. Hovil. 2007, 'Confronting the Reality of Gender-based Violence in Northern Uganda', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* Vol 1(3): 433-443. Available at: <http://ijtj.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/doi/10.1093/ijtj/ijm036> [Accessed June 7, 2011].

Levels of GBV are chronically high within IDP camps in northern Uganda. There is a critical need for a preventive and responsive approach to policy programming in order to mitigate this and better deal with the structural causes of GBV.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Olsen, Tricia D., Leigh A. Payne, and Andrew G. Reiter (2010), 'The Justice Balance : When Transitional Justice Improves Human Rights and Democracy', *Human Rights Quarterly* Vol 32(4)

The article supports a justice balance approach to TJ and concludes that truth commissions alone have a negative impact on the two political objectives but can contribute positively when combined with trials and amnesties.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Missing

Olsen, T.D, Payne, L.A, Reiter, A.G, & Wiebelhaus-Brahm, E. (2010). 'When Truth Commissions Improve Human Rights', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol 4(3): 457-476.

This article challenges the notion that truth commissions foster human rights. The authors find that TCs have a negative impact on human rights when used alone, but have a positive impact when used in combination with trials and amnesties, and serve complementarily. They therefore promote a 'justice balance' approach in order to contribute to human rights improvements.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Olsen, Tricia D, Leigh A. Payne, and Andrew G. Reiter, (2010) *Transitional Justice in Balance: Comparing Processes, Weighing Efficacy*, Washington DC: United States Institute of Peace

Analyses the effect of TJ on democracy and human rights during 91 transitions in 74 countries from 1970-2004. Authors find some significant and positive effects 10 years after transitions began but are unable to draw strong conclusions.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Oppelt, P. 'Remorse Opens Up the Rainbow's Wounds' in *The Moscow Times*, 23rd September 1998.

The personal experience of a South African journalist, who explains how the TRC has not healed her wounds, but rather has opened up some that were unthought of until the Commission had started its work.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Orentlicher, D. F, (2007), 'Settling Accounts' Revisited: Reconciling Global Norms with Local Agency', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 1(1): 10-22.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Orentlicher, D (2010). 'That Someone Guilty Be Punished: The Impact of the ICTY in Bosnia'. *Open Society Justice Initiative*. International Center for Transitional Justice. New York: Open Society Institute.

Through qualitative interviews this article addresses the perceptions of 'Bosnians' (does not specify between ethnic groups in most cases) on the achievements of the ICTY seventeen years later. Many specific notions are addressed but overall it concludes that despite the large gap between Bosnians' expectations and the reality of the ICTY, its creation was overall a positive achievement, and preferable to 'doing nothing.'

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Orentlicher, Diane. 2008. 'Shrinking the Space for Denial: The Impact of the ICTY in Serbia'. Open Society Justice Initiative. Open Society Institute. New York.

The paper examines the impact of ICTY in Serbia and seeks to enrich the public debate about the tribunal and to test some of the assumptions made about it. The study is rich in content and detailed analysis of the shortcomings and influence of the ICTY.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Orford, A (2006). 'Commissioning the Truth', *Columbia Journal of Gender and Law*, Vol. 15(3): 851-883.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Oxfam International, (2007), 'The building blocks of sustainable peace The views of internally displaced people in Northern Uganda', *Oxfam Briefing Paper* (September): 1-29.

In the context of the Juba Peace Talks, the concerns of the people directly affected by the conflict in Northern Uganda must not be neglected. Challenges of post-conflict transition must be dealt with as a matter of urgency.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Pajibo, E (2007). 'Civil Society and Transitional Justice in Liberia: A Practitioner's Reflection from the Field', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 1: 287-296.

This article calls for the engagement of civil society in the Liberian TRC process if it is to be meaningful and contribute to a durable peace.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Palmer, Nicola. 2012. 'Transfer or Transformation?: a Review of the Rule 11 bis Decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda', *African Journal of International and Comparative Law* Vol 20 (1):1-21

This article examines the Rule 11 bis decisions in the context of the concurrent operation of ICTR, the Rwandan national courts and the localised gacaca courts. It argues that the rulings highlight the severe disconnect between the work of the Tribunal and that of the domestic systems of justice in post-genocide Rwanda.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Park, a S. J. (2006). 'Other Inhumane Acts': Forced Marriage, Girl Soldiers and the Special Court for Sierra Leone', *Social & Legal Studies*, 15(3), 315-337.

Girls experience discrimination based on gender and age and the SCSL should take this particularity into account. Whilst making 'forced marriage' a crime is an advancement for girls, it is not enough and a TRC may be able to make deeper social, economic and political changes needed to prevent sexual and domestic slavery.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Park, A. (2010). 'Community-based restorative transitional justice in Sierra Leone', *Contemporary Justice Review*, 13(1), 95-119.

Restorative justice (RJ) takes on many meanings and the author finds that the best way to achieve long-term reconciliation for the people (her definition of RJ) is through community-based restorative transitional justice mechanisms, such as the Fambol Tok in Sierra Leone. This is considered to be a 'mini-commission' where perpetrator is met with victim and they both speak to each other.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.5
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Parker, Sara. (2008). 'The International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia: The Promise and Reality of Reconciliation in Croatia', *Peace and Conflict Studies*, 15(2): 81-101.

This article examines the impact of the ICTY on national reconciliation. It concludes that local actors are critical to establishing national reconciliation, and need to be supported at the local, state and national levels. The efforts of the ICTY to promote reconciliation, it is argued, were undermined by the failure to consider bottom-up approaches into national-level policy. The author specifically examines the impact of the ICTY in Croatia, and the larger failure of the proceedings to engage with the Croatian public. The author provides a sound theoretical argument grounded in other case studies to substantiate her claim for bottom-up initiatives, though never justifies why these cases should be considered comparable to the ICTY in this respect.

This work effectively interrogates the assumptions surrounding the ICTY, most notably the peace-justice-reconciliation link. Ideally this would have drawn more closely from this work to establish both failure of reconciliation as well as the cause of this failure, the first of which received far less attention. The methodology employed is not transparent, and as such it is impossible to grade its quality. Though this work does present some new local level data, it is only about 10%.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Payne, Leigh A (2008) *Unsettling Accounts: Neither Truth Nor Reconciliation in Confessions of State Violence*. Duke University Press

Contentious debate about truth enhances democratic practices by provoking political participation, contestation, and competition.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Perriello, T., & Wierda, M. (2006). 'The Special Court for Sierra Leone Under Scrutiny', *International Centre for Transitional Justice: Prosecutions Case Studies Series*, (March 2006).

This report by the ICTJ focuses predominately on the history of the SCSL and the legal organisation/framework of the Court. Local perceptions of the Court were marginal in this paper, limited to a little over one page.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Perrielo, Tom and Wierda, Marieke (2006). 'Lessons from the Development of International Judges and Prosecutors in Kosovo', International Center for Transitional Justice.

The paper analyses the hybrid courts' attempts and their implementation in Kosovo. In Kosovo the new administration had to establish and run a judicial system from scratch. The experience of the international judges and prosecutors are of utmost importance for the future procedures and efficiency of other tribunals.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, Phuong, P.Vinck, M.Wierda, E.Stover, A. Di Giovanni. (2005). 'Forgotten Voices: A population based survey on attitudes about peace and justice in Northern Uganda', International Centre for Transitional Justice.

This study aims to assess the impact of LRA violence on populations in Northern Uganda that are often not considered immediate stakeholders, i.e. IDPs, non-active civil society, general population. It concludes that this population has been exposed to high-levels of violence and are most immediately concerned with peace and food security. It also finds that though peace and justice are not seen as mutually exclusive, accountability for crimes committed on all sides is a high priority and would allow for some form of conditional amnesty. Perhaps most importantly, the prospect of formal justice mechanisms and ICC involvement in the conflict is poorly understood and often

characterized by false alternatives. The report includes recommendations for promoting peace and justice in the region.

This report is based on a quantitative analysis of a large-N interview study conducted in Northern Uganda in two Acholi and two non-Acholi districts. The authors provide a very detailed description of both data collection and statistical analysis. Unlike most studies, this work includes a recognition and direct engagement with the limitations of its approach.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, J. P. (2006). 'Liberia and Sierra Leone: A Study of Comparative Human Rights Approaches by Civil Society Actors', *Interdisciplinary Journal of Human Rights Law*, 1.

This article chronicles the histories of Sierra Leone and Liberia, then chronicles the development of civil society in both countries, and then compares the two with each other. There is no analysis on how local populations view the SCSL or the TRC and how they best view reconciliation and peace-building.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, Phuong N et al. (2007) ,*When the War ends: A population based survey on attitudes about peace, justice and social reconstruction in Northern Uganda*, Human Rights Centre, Berkeley, Payson Center, ICTJ.

Population based survey in eight districts of Northern Uganda which seeks to capture attitudes about peace, justice and social reconstruction while peace talks were taking place between the Ugandan Government and the LRA in Juba, Southern Sudan. In 2005 a similar survey was conducted by the same team in Northern Uganda and findings are compared throughout the report.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, P., and P. Vinck. (2007), ‘Empirical Research and the Development and Assessment of Transitional Justice Mechanisms’, *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 1(2): 231-248.

Paper demonstrates methods of empirical research available to transitional justice practitioners and scholars. Conclude that such methods offer policy makers a systematic way to consult a population and construct a a comprehensive view of what this population has experienced. Such knowledge is essential for developing effective evidence-based transitional justice programmes.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, P. N., and P. Vinck, (2010), 'Transitioning to Peace: A population based survey on attitudes about social reconstruction and justice in Northern Uganda', Human Rights Center, University of California, Berkeley, School of Law.

Report presents the results of a large-scale population based survey about peace, justice and reconstruction in northern Uganda. It intends to capture community views on matters that affect ordinary people after 20 years of conflict.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.25
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Pham, Puong Ngoc, Patrick Vinck, and Harvey Weinstein. (2010). 'Human rights, transitional justice, public health and social reconstruction', *Social Science and Medicine* 70(1): 98-105.

This article examines the intersection between transitional justice, public health and social reconstruction using the cases of Eastern DRC and Northern Uganda. The author presents a potential framework for integrating transitional justice and public health outcomes by looking at the links between human rights violations, health/trauma and participation in mechanisms of transitional justice. It suggests involving health practitioners at a high level alongside diplomats, human rights advocates, and politicians to more holistically address issues of societal health and reconstruction. From field surveys, the authors find that virtually all respondents in Northern Uganda and Eastern DRC perceived themselves as victims and had experienced trauma. It also found that those with PTSD were less likely to accept amnesties to end the conflict, though those who had lost a family member in the conflict were more likely to accept amnesties as an avenue to peace.

This article provides some new theoretical insight regarding the specific role of health in transitional justice. It draws on a number of past studies and work, as well as the author's own field surveys, though the methods by which these were conducted are not transparent. The authors do however discuss issues related to study design, measurement and classification, which increase the transparency of this article significantly.

Coder initials	DS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, P.N, Vinck P, Balthazard M, Hean S. (2011). *After the First Trial: A Population-Based Survey on Knowledge and Perceptions of Justice and the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia*, Human Rights Center, University of California, Berkeley.

This report presents the results of a survey of 1,000 Cambodians, on the topic on justice and the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia. This study sought to (1) monitor public awareness and knowledge of the ECCC’s work, as well as of outreach and victim participation initiatives organized by the tribunal and local non-governmental organizations, (2) assess attitudes about justice and the desire for reparations for past crimes, and (3) recommend ways in which the ECCC, civil society, and the international community can continue to engage Cambodians in the work of the ECCC.

This is a comprehensive paper, which utilises an in-depth survey to outline a number of important recommendations. The papers methodology is clear and takes into account the potential bias of the surveys respondents. This paper seeks to take the ‘end-user’ seriously, engaging in a systematic and thorough way with the opinions of the Cambodian population. Additionally, it is written with a great deal of clarity, underpinned by good use of the existing literature on the topic (including court, government and NGO reports.).

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Pham, P. N., Vinck, P., Balthazard, M., Hean, S., & Stover, E. (2009). *So we will never forget: a population-based survey on attitudes about social reconstruction and the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia*, Human Rights Centre, University of California, Berkeley.

In-depth study which shows that the those who lived during the khmer rouge and those who were born after have differing views on the ECCC and therefore outreach should be tailored as such. Furthermore, respondents cited the economy and infrastructure as their main priorities while justice was seldom mentioned.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	4
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	8
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Pigou, P. (2003). 'Crying Without Tears: In pursuit of justice and reconciliation in Timor Leste'. *International Center for Transitional Justice, Occasional Paper Series, (August)*.

Insightful paper that focuses directly on the local population's views on justice and reconciliation.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Pillay, A (2009). 'Views from the Field: Truth Seeking and Gender: The Liberian Experience', *African Journal on Conflict Resolution Vol 9(2)*

This brief article is based on Pillay's experience as the gender advisor to the Liberian TRC. The author concludes that while the level of women participation was laudable, the TRC's narrow interpretation of gender blocked potential for significant change in social thinking, attitudes, and behavior. It does not address local level perceptions.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Porter, H. E. (2012), 'Justice and rape on the periphery: the supremacy of social harmony in the space between local solutions and formal judicial systems in northern Uganda', *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 6 (1):81-97.

This article focuses on rape, and examines what justice means for Acholi women in the vacuum of justice created by the decayed state of former local methods of responding to wrongdoing and the still inadequate role and legitimacy of Uganda's judicial system and the International Criminal Court. The research indicates that notions of appropriate punishment are oriented by the degree to which the perpetrator is seen as important to future social harmony.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Prieto, Juan Diego. (2012). 'Together after War While the War Goes On: Victims, Ex-Combatants and Communities in Three Colombian Cities', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 6 (3):525-546.

This article presents the findings from a 2010 field study conducted in four neighborhoods of the cities of Bogota, Medellin and Valledupar. It argues that everyday experiences of coexistence in these areas are mainly conditioned by local factors, such as poverty and insecurity, and by the past experiences of individual victims, ex-combatants and other citizens in the midst of Colombia's ongoing, nonethnic conflict.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Quinn, Joanna R, (2004), 'Constraints: The Un-Doing of the Ugandan Truth Commission', *Human Rights Quarterly* 26(2): 401-427

The Ugandan Truth Commission, set up in 1986, has been under-researched. Its final report, produced in 1994 was not widely disseminated. The Commission was endowed with neither proper funding nor political support. It was therefore a failure in providing a platform for improving the social infrastructure.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Quinn, Joanna R. (2007), 'Social Reconstruction in Uganda: The Role of Customary Mechanisms in Transitional Justice' *Human Rights Review* 8(4): 389-407.

Customary mechanisms can help to bring about societal acknowledgement of past conflict. These traditional practices have been neglected but can augment the re-building process in Uganda.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Ramji-nogales, Jaya, (2010), 'Designing bespoke transitional justice: a pluralist process approach', *Michigan Journal of International Law* 32(1): 1-73.

Before we can measure whether TJ is working we must begin with a theory of what it is trying to achieve. Once we have a coherent theory we must use it *ex ante* to design effective TJ mechanisms, not just to assess effectiveness *ex post*. Concludes that most effective TJ mechanisms are those that successfully reconstruct social norms opposing mass violence.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Ramji, Jaya (2000) 'Reclaiming Cambodian History: The Case for a Truth Commission', *Fletcher Forum of World Affairs* 24: 137.

This article argues that an international tribunal for Cambodia may be most effective if limited to the prosecution of top leaders, and for there to be a truth commission for lesser members of the Khmer Rouge. A truth commission is consistent with Cambodian history and culture and is necessary to paint a larger picture of Cambodian history, which is vital to heal Cambodian society.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Ramji, J. and B. Van Schaack. (2005), *Bringing the Khmer Rouge to justice: prosecuting mass violence before the Cambodian courts*. Lewiston: E. Mellen Press.

This volume of essays explores the legal issues surrounding accountability for the crimes of the Khmer Rouge and crimes of mass violence more generally. Comprising chapters by legal academics, lawyers, historians, artists, and others, the volume presents thorough analyses of the complex problems inherent to accountability efforts and novel ideas as to how to address them.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Rangelov, Iavor, and Ruti Teitel. (2011), 'Global Civil Society and Transitional Justice' in M. Albrow and H. Seckinelgin (eds) *Globality and the Absence of Justice*, London: Palgrave Macmillan.

CS includes a broad range of actors and forms of engagement in TJ and its scale of operation and organisation extends from local and national to the regional and global. Second, in the current period, CS relates to a polycentric framework of governance and interacts increasingly with internationalised structures and processes of TJ. Finally, CS advances plural and often conflicting conceptions of justice.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Rawski, F. (2002). 'Truth-Seeking and Local Histories in East Timor', *Asia-Pacific Journal on Human Rights and the Law*. 3(1)

The author poses the question as to whether a Truth Commission (TC) is more effective if it sets a historical narrative, or if it would be more productive if the process of history-telling developed itself through the TC. The TC's effectiveness is contingent on if and how it can incorporate local historical narratives into its own public discourse on history and reconciliation. The author draws on an example of two feuding groups in Timor-Leste, whose rivalry history goes beyond 1999.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Refugee Law Project (2005), *Peace First, Justice Later: Traditional Justice in Northern Uganda*.

The report aims to examine the various meanings of 'peace' and 'justice' in Northern Uganda and to clarify what people on the ground appear to be saying. Respondents emphasised that while the role of traditional mechanisms of justice has been diminished in the current context of war, those mechanisms still have currency. They also argue that peace must be established before justice is pursued.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Reis, Chen. 'Trying the Future, Avenging the Past: The Implications of Prosecuting Children for Participation in Internal Armed Conflict', *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* Vol.28 (1996): 629-656

Examines the treatment of minors in internal conflict in international law by using the case of Rwanda.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Retting, M. (2008) 'Gacaca: Truth, Justice and Reconciliation in post-conflict Rwanda', *African Studies Review* Vol.51 No.3 (2008): 25-50

Using public opinion surveys from one community, this paper argues that gacaca proceedings have had negative effects regarding ethnic tensions/divisions.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.3999999999999999
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Riaño Alcalá, Pilar, and Erin Baines. (2012). 'Editorial Note', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 6 (3):385-393.

This editorial note, preceding a special issue of the IJTJ, focuses on the role of justice and social repair in everyday life. The authors consider the limitations of linear conceptions of justice, the spatial dimensions of justice, the reconstruction and renegotiation of interpersonal relationships, and the role of silence in facilitating coexistence. The contributors to this issue aim to raise the importance of the everyday in the field of transitional justice.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Roberta Bacic, 'Dealing with the Past: Chile -Human Rights and Human Wrongs', *Race Class* 2002 44: 17

Pensions and compensation cannot be a substitute for justice and that truth and reconciliation commissions do not always deliver assurance if not complemented by structural changes in the state.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Roht-Arriaza, N., and J. Mariezcurrena. (2006), *Transitional justice in the twenty-first century: beyond truth versus justice*, Cambridge:Cambridge University Press.

This volume examines the way in which truth and justice can be pursued simultaneously, the various types of transitional justice mechanisms, and the different levels, from local to international, at which transitional justice occurs.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ross, F.C. 2003. *Bearing witness: women and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa*, London:Pluto Press

The work of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa framed women as victims rather than political activists or forces of resistance during the apartheid regime. Women's testimony at the TRC focused on broader suffering rather than personal violations. The silencing of women's experiences and the difficulty in bearing witness after the event represents the limitations of human rights testimony.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.25
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Rozen, L (2002). 'How the mighty have fallen'. Salon.com. February 20, 2002 Feature.

Through interviews with a handful of human rights workers in the former Yugoslavia, this article argues that despite largely anti-NATO sentiments in the region, Serbs are generally separating themselves from Milosevic as he goes on trial. However, the tribunal suffered from the initial lack of outreach to the general population.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	1.3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Rushton, B. (2006). 'Truth and reconciliation? The experience of Truth Commissions', *Australian Journal of International Affairs*, 60(1): 125-141

The author argues that truth commissions have failed to discern and report accurate and complete records of past atrocities, but that they are 'socially and politically purposive'. Furthermore, it is contended that whilst truth commissions do not achieve reconciliation, they can catalyse it.

This article is rather theoretical and relies heavily on existing literature. The author does not engage with the empirical claims she makes in any depth, aside from occasionally citing very limited examples of past truth commissions. This means that the author's conclusion – that truth commissions can make important contributions to reconciliation – are not substantiated by the work the author presents.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Sarkin, J. (2001) 'The Tension Between Justice and Reconciliation in Rwanda: Politics, Human Rights, Due Process and the Role of the Gacaca Courts in Dealing with the Genocide', *Journal of African Law* Vol.45 (2001) 143-

Examines the political situation of post-genocide Rwanda in the context of human rights protection and genocide trials. Suggests the shortcomings of a reconciliation strategy based on prosecutions. Primarily legal analysis.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Savage, Tyrone (2006) 'In Quest for a Sustainable Justice: Transitional Justice and Human Rights Security in the Democratic Republic of the Congo', *Institute for Security Studies Paper* 130

Explores the various transitional justice mechanisms employed in the context of the democratic transition of the DRC; employs a narrow definition of transitional justice as mechanisms of achieving justice in a transitional process. Assesses three different mechanisms: domestic, international and TRC. Concludes that the domestic judiciary had been successfully in meeting the challenges of domestic law in dealing with mass atrocities, etc; the ICC is encumbered by high expectations; and TRC has ultimately been a failure. Suggests that a nationwide dialogue is needed to build a consensus regarding which method should be used.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Scanlon, H., & Muddell, K. (2008). 'Gender and transitional justice in Africa : Progress and prospects', *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*, 9-28.

Examines how transitional justice processes have dealt with gender-based human rights violations in Africa. Argues they fail because of too narrow an understanding of women's experiences of conflict. Re-examine priority of violations, recognize continuums of violence and how men are affected by gendered dynamics of conflict.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Sesay, A. (2007). 'Does One Size Fit All ? The Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation Commission Revisited', *Discussion Paper 36*, Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, Uppsala

The first half of the paper covers the history of the conflict in SL and then there is a literature review for TRCs and post-conflict reconciliation. Data has been collected on how the population defines truth, their views on victimhood and perpetrators, the role of the TRC in reconciliation, the governments role, and possible local mechanisms. In sum, the paper concludes that popular expectations from the TRC have not been met.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.75
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Shaw, R. (2005) 'Rethinking Truth and Reconciliation Commissions. Lessons from Sierra Leone' *Special Report 130*, United States Institute of Peace, February 2005

The truth-telling practices of the TRC in Sierra Leone went against the widespread understanding of reconciliation and healing as social forgetting.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Shaw, R. (2007). 'Memory Frictions: Localizing the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in Sierra Leone', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 1(2), 183-207.

This paper shows how the local population cannot reconcile from past atrocities because their present lives are deeply hindered by the past. Shaw shows the scepticism towards the TRC, how many felt better after having gone public about their past, but also how lack of reparations prevents the TRC from being fully successful.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Shaw, R., L. Waldorf, and P. Hazan, (eds). (2010) *Localizing transitional justice : interventions and priorities after mass violence*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

This collection of articles traces how ordinary people respond to—and sometimes transform—transitional justice mechanisms, laying a foundation for more locally responsive approaches to social reconstruction after mass violence and egregious human rights violations.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.6000000000000001
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Shulman, K (1999). ‘Facing up to War Crimes: Interview with Martha Minow’, *Newsweek*. February 15, 1999. Atlantic Edition: Page 68.

This short interview with Martha Minow addresses very broadly questions of transitional justice and the prosecution of heads of state.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Sikkink, K., & Walling, C. B. (2007). 'The Impact of Human Rights Trials in Latin America', *Journal of Peace Research*, 44(4): 427-445, doi:10.1177/0022343307078953

The authors created a new dataset of two main transitional justice mechanisms: truth commissions and trials for past human rights violations. With the new data, they document the emergence and growth of the use of truth commissions and domestic, foreign, and international human rights trials in the world. The authors then explore the impact that human rights trials have on human rights, conflict, democracy, and rule of law in Latin America. They argue that the 'pessimistic claims of skeptics that human rights trials threaten democracy, increase human rights violations, and exacerbate conflict' are not supported by empirical evidence from Latin America .

The authors use quantitative datasets to sustain their position – however, it is not clear that simply because there is a correlation between a given human rights trial and (for example) an improvement in the human rights situation of a country, there is causation behind it. The authors are right to try and assess under what conditions human rights trials can take place (and what the effects of them are), yet their evidence alone is not enough to make such an assessment.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Smith, A (2009). *After Genocide: Bringing the Devil to Justice*, New York: Prometheus Book.

This book critically reviews the record of international attempts at achieving justice in post-conflict societies, primarily focusing on the international tribunals for Rwanda, Yugoslavia, and Sierra Leone. Smith concludes that domestic courts should be preferred to international attempts as they better serve the interests of post-conflict societies.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Smith, L. Alison A, and Sara Meli. (2012) . *Making Justice Count: Assessing the impact and legacy of the Special Court of Sierra Leone in Sierra Leone and Liberia*. Report for the Special Court for Sierra Leone and No Peace Without Justice.

The survey that the report is based on aims to establish the impact of the SCSL on Sierra Leone and Liberia through its judicial proceedings, its legacy work and its outreach program. According to the findings, the overall feeling towards the SCSL and the work it has carried out over the past 10 years is very positive. The report identifies 6 main recommendations and lessons learnt that have emerged as a result of this survey and that are important for other courts and tribunals to consider.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.3333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Socolovsky, J (2000). ‘Tribunal and truth commissions around world with BC-Netherlands-and justice for all’, Associated Press Worldstream. March 11, 2000; Saturday, International News.

The article very briefly addresses surface-level pros and cons of tribunals, truth commissions, and commissions of inquiry as accountability mechanisms.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Sriram, C L (2007). 'Justice as Peace? Liberal Peacebuilding and Strategies of Transitional Justice', *Global Society*, 21(4): 579-591.

Sriram highlights the risks and critiques of transitional justice as part of the larger liberal peacebuilding project.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Steflja, Izabela. (2010). 'Identity crises in post-conflict societies: the ICTY's role in defensive nationalism among the Serbs', *Global Change, Peace & Security* Vol. 22. No. 2. 231-248.

The impact of ICTY has contributed to identify crises among the Serbs and the emergence of a defensive nationalism which had already been in place. The paper argues that a new alternative and positive identity is needed in order to move forward and accept the war crimes.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Ekern, Stener (2010) 'The modernizing bias of human rights: stories of mass killings and genocide in Central America', *Journal of Genocide Research*, 12(3), 219-241

Demonstrates the need for using more social and historical contextualization when analysing violence in non-Western settings, as well as for increased social and political sensitivity in designing policies that legalize human rights.

Coder initials	VS
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	No significant new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Stensrud, Ellen (2009) 'New Dilemmas in Transitional Justice: Lessons from the Mixed Courts in Sierra Leone and Cambodia', *Journal of Peace Research* Vol 46.(1) 5-15

This paper argues that a fruitful approach to the study of mixed courts is to look at the criteria under which they are perceived locally as legitimate, it must include a legacy for both the national judiciary and contributions to both truth-telling and the historical record.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Stover, E., and H. Weinstein. (2004). *My neighbor, my enemy: justice and community in the aftermath of mass atrocity*, Cambridge: New York: Cambridge University Press.

Based on extensive surveys in Rwanda and the former Yugoslavia, the authors explore what people think about their past and their future. The conclusions controversially suggest that international or local trials have little relevance to reconciliation. The authors offer an ecological model of social reconstruction and conclude that coordinated multi-systemic strategies must be implemented if social repair is to occur.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.3999999999999999
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.8333333330000001
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Stover, E (2005). *The Witnesses: War Crimes and the Promise of Justice in the Hague*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

This book is a review of the experiences of witnesses testifying before the Hague. It is based on 127 interviews and highlights the gap between the expectations and actual experiences of witnesses in regard to their concept of justice and that of the Hague, yet stresses that the witnesses still felt the need to reveal the truth. The author concludes by offering suggestions of how to better meet the needs of witnesses testifying before war crimes courts in the future.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Stromseth, J. E., D. Wippman, and R. Brooks. (2006) *Can might make rights? : building the rule of law after military interventions*, Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press.

This book looks at why it is so difficult to create 'the rule of law' in post-conflict societies such as Iraq and Afghanistan, and offers critical insights into how policy-makers and field-workers can improve future rule of law efforts. The book shows how a narrow focus on building institutions such as courts and legislatures misses the more complex cultural issues that affect societal commitment to the values associated with the rule of law. The authors outline a pragmatic, synergistic approach to the rule of law during transitions to democracy and post-conflict reconstruction.

Coder initials	MF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Suh, Jae-Jung. 'Truth and Reconciliation in South Korea' *Critical Asian Studies*, Vol.42 No.4 (2010): 503-524

Assesses the performance of the TRC in the South Korean context, concludes that structural limitations curtailed effective performance.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Svard, P. (2010). 'The international community and post-war reconciliation in Africa : A case study of the Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*, 10(1), 35-62.

The efforts of the TRC and its recommendations are not being followed up by the government. Despite the TRC, reconciliation is not possible if the root causes of the conflict are still present. People need to gain faith in the government and recommendations of the TRC implemented for the process to gain legitimacy.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.5
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Missing
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Theidon, K. (2007). 'Transitional Subjects: The Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration of Former Combatants in Colombia', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 1(1): 66-90

The author argues that traditional approaches to DDR have focused almost exclusively on military and security objectives, which in turn has resulted in these programs being developed in relative isolation from the growing field of transitional justice and its concerns with historical clarification, justice, reparations and reconciliation. Drawing on a case study of Colombia, the author contends that the 'R' of DDR has been neglected, and a more holistic approach is now required, incorporating new transitional justice norms.

The author clearly draws on a wealth of knowledge of Colombia's political and social situation to make well argued claims. The work is quite nuanced, since the author takes into account the

different biases of those interviewed as part of the article. One of the author’s conclusions raises a strong point – that if armed paramilitaries are disarmed then the state needs to fill the void left by them. However, whilst basing some of her work on interviews, the author does not present a clear methodology.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Theissen, G. (2008). ‘Object of Trust and Hatred: Public Attitudes towards the TRC’ in *Truth and reconciliation in South Africa: did the TRC deliver?*, by H. Van der Merwe and A. R. Chapman (eds), Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Based on public opinion polls, the South African TRC has had mixed results in shaping collective memory. TRCs should not primarily strive for public consensus, but rather to create a new version of history that in the long run may become the dominant narrative.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, using existing data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Thompson, Mark. (2002). ‘New Means for Regional Analysis. The South East Europe Public Agenda Survey’, *International IDEA. Policy Brief No. 2.*

The paper is a regional public opinion survey with some basic data but not much analysis. It is a product of the International IDEA, an international NGO based in Sweden.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Thoms, Oskar N.T, James Ron, and Roland Paris. (2008), 'The effects of transitional justice mechanisms', *Centre for International Policy Studies Working Paper* (April).

This report takes stock of what is known about the effects of TJ mechanisms eg. the field's state of empirical knowledge. It finds there is little evidence that TJ produces either beneficial or harmful effects; further TJ research is likely to find more reliable findings.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Thoms, O. N. T, J. Ron, and R. Paris (2010), 'State-Level Effects of Transitional Justice: What Do We Know?', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 4(3): 329-354.

Empirical evidence of positive or negative effects of TJ is still insufficient to support claims. More systematic and comparative analysis of the transitional justice record is needed in order to move from faith-based to fact-based discussions of transitional justice impacts.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Urs,Tara (2007) ‘Imagining Locally-Motivated Accountability for Mass Atrocities: Voices from Cambodia’, *SUR 70* (Sao Paulo, Brazil: Human Rights University Network)

Many of the claims made about what the Court can accomplish are not founded in the reality of what is known about international justice generally and Cambodia in particular. It is unlikely that the ECCC will achieve rule of law in Cambodia, provide justice for victims or foster reconciliation. Once the unrealistic expectations for this process are cleared away, it becomes apparent that other culturally-specific models, rooted in the desire of the Cambodian people, have a greater chance at making long-term impact and satisfying victims.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

The International Republican Institute with USAID (2009). *Survey of Cambodian Public Opinion*.

This report provides valuable quantitative data about Cambodian sentiments towards the Khmer Rouge Tribunal but this particular report provides no analysis of the data and appears to be a part of a larger body of work.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Van Der Merwe, H., V. Baxter, and A.R. Chapman. (2009). *Assessing the Impact of Transitional Justice: Challenges for Empirical Research*, United States Institute of Peace Press.

This volume discusses the strengths and weaknesses of various methodologies for empirical research on transitional justice. The editors advocate for increased empirical research on transitional justice mechanisms in order to clarify key concepts and the utility of transitional justice, as well as further develop the field.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Vinck, Patrick et al. (2007), 'Exposure to war crimes and implications for peace building in northern Uganda', *Journal of the American Medical Association* 298(5): 543-54.

This study finds high prevalence rates for symptoms of PTSD and depression in Northern Uganda. Respondants reporting symptoms of PTSD and depression were more likely to favour violent over non-violent means to end conflict.

Coder initials	AM
Score data quality (out of 4):	4
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.5
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Vick, Patrick and Phuong Pham (2008) 'Ownership and Participation in Transitional Justice Mechanisms: A sustainable Human Development Perspective from Eastern DRC', *International Journal of Transitional Justice* Vol.2 (3) : 398-411

The article argues that TJ is a necessary objective for sustainable development, but lack of empirical evidence limits the ability to assess the contribution of TJ to sustainable development. Findings show that the existence of physical security is important in increasing the effectiveness of TJ mechanisms, as well as the existence of a wide consultation process.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	4
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Vink, P, P. Pham, S. Baldo et al (2008). 'Living With Fear: A Population Based Survey on Attitudes about Peace, Justice and Social Reconstruction in Eastern DRC', Human Rights Center, Berkeley; Payson Center Tulane and ICTJ

A survey of the public attitudes of residents of Eastern DRC, regarding a wide range of questions pertaining to the conflict and subsequent democratic transitions. Supplemented with individual comparative interviews. The study concludes that peace and security remain the highest priority for Eastern DRC residents and most feel that living standards have remained constant regardless of the democratic transition.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	6
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Quantitative, gathering own data Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Vinck, P. and Pham, P. (2010) 'Outreach Evaluation: The International Criminal Court in the Central African Republic', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, Vol. 4, 2010, 421–442.

The ICC's outreach is problematic because of informal channels that communicate 'poor-quality' information. Outreach should be local.

Coder initials	ND-L
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.7000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	4
Total score (out of 8):	7.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Vinck P, Pham PN (2010). 'Building Peace, Seeking Justice: A Population-Based Survey on Attitudes about Accountability and Social Reconstruction in the Central African Republic', Human Rights Center report, University of California, Berkeley

This report provides the findings from a survey of 1,879 adults, residents of the Central African Republic. This report provides an analysis of results on a range of topics related to the population's priorities and needs, exposure to violence, security, community cohesion and engagement, access to information, conflict resolution, reintegration of former combatants, transitional justice, and reparations for victims.

This is a comprehensive paper, which utilises an in-depth survey to outline a number of important recommendations. The papers methodology is clear and takes into account the potential bias of the surveys respondents. This paper seeks to take the 'end-user' seriously, engaging in a systematic and thorough way with the opinions of the Central African Republic population. As with the other reports

in this series (for example Pham (2011)) it is written with a great deal of clarity, underpinned by a strong understanding of the issues faced by ‘end-users’ in the CAR.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	3
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.25
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Vinck P, Pham PN, Kreutzer T. (2011). ‘Talking Peace: A Population-Based Survey on Attitudes about Security, Dispute Resolution, and Post-Conflict Reconstruction in Liberia’, Human Rights Center report, University of California, Berkeley

This study in Liberia was undertaken to contribute to a deeper understanding of: (1) the population’s priorities for peacebuilding, (2) Liberians’ perceptions of their post-war security, and (3) existing disputes and dispute resolution mechanisms. They conclude with a number of recommendations for the government of Liberia, the civil society, and the international community.

This is a study of great depth, drawing on a nationwide survey of 4,501 respondents randomly selected in each of the counties to represent the views of the adult population in Liberia. As with other reports in this series from Pham et al. (2011) and Vinck et al. (2010), this is a comprehensive piece, which seeks to take the ‘end-user’ seriously, drawing policy recommendations directly from those whom policies most affect. The methodology is transparent and attempts to deal with potential bias (p. 17). It is written with a great deal of clarity and distils clear recommendations from the detailed field work.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3.25
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	A considerable amount of new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Waldorf, Lars. (2006) 'Mass Justice for Mass Atrocity: Rethinking Local Justice as Transitional Justice', *Temple Law Review* Vo.79 (1);1-88

Counters the claim that local level TJ initiatives in the case of Rwanda (gacaca) contributes to the restoration of society. Refers to a rich array of literature, including those that utilise empirical evidence but does not directly integrate them into his argument.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Waysdorf, S (1991). 'Popular Tribunals, Legal Storytelling, and the Pursuit of a Just Law', *Yale Journal of Law and Liberation*, 67-84.

This article argues that legal storytelling, in the form of popular tribunals, can provide the connection between justice-seeking values and the narrative form, in the context of more traditional legal discourse. That, as a popular notion of justice, includes the excluded and mitigates failure of the traditional justice system.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Weinstein, H. (2011). 'Editorial Note: They Myth of Closure, the illusion of Reconciliation: Final Thoughts on Five Years as Co-Editor-in Chief', *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 5(1): 1-10.

In this editorial, the author argues argue it is essential that scholars who engage in the field of transitional justice stop repeating the assumptions about reconciliation, closure, justice and what 'victims want,' and address head on the differences among the disciplines that seem to inhibit a

coherent approach to social reconstruction. Often, the author argues, huge amounts of money are plied into projects whose goals remain fuzzy and ambiguous, and may have little meaning to people on the ground. Overall, it is a call for caution, subtlety and greater academic analysis in the field.

Since this is an editorial, there is no empirical evidence per se, although the author does draw on existing studies in order to make his points.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	A considerable amount of insightful analysis and theoretical insight

Wells, Sarah (2005) 'Gender, Sexual Violence and Prospects for Justice at the Gacaca Courts in Rwanda', *Southern California Review of Law and Women's Studies*: 167-196

Argues that gacaca has a different impact on female victims compared to male victims, due to the overall structure of society. TJ methods should take into account the societal perception of gender.

Coder initials	YH
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Winterbotham, Emily. (2012). *Healing the Legacies of Conflict in Afghanistan: Community Voices on Justice, Peace and Reconciliation*, Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit.

In Afghanistan, efforts to produce peace have largely excluded the promotion of justice and reconciliation. However, justice remains a high priority among Afghans and the success of the peace process relies on the simultaneous promotion of justice and reconciliation.

Coder initials	JF
Score data quality (out of 4):	3.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	6.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

World Bank (2006) *Gender, Justice, and Truth Commissions*. Retrieved June 24, 2011, from <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTLAWJUSTINS/Resources/GJTClayoutrevised.pdf>

Describes gender dimensions of truth commissions in South Africa, Peru and Sierre Leone and describes how formal and informal justice systems have responded to gender-relevant findings of TCs. Concludes the WB could support loans and projects with a gender approach in the recs of TC including reparations.

Coder initials	HP
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, interview Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

World Bank. (2011). *World Development Report 2011: Conflict, Security, and Development*

The central message of the Report is that strengthening legitimate institutions and governance to provide citizen security, justice, and jobs is crucial to break cycles of violence. The report recommends refocusing assistance on preventing criminal and political violence, reforming the procedures of international agencies, responding at a regional level, and renewing cooperative efforts among lower-, middle-, and higher-income countries. The Report envisages a layered approach to effective global action, with local, national, regional, and international roles.

This is a report with a great deal of breadth, covering a huge range of topics and regions in the world. In this respect it is an impressive resource. However, whilst the authors are aware of

methodological limitations in writing such papers (p. xix), they fail to truly account for them in the text. It relies heavily on existing literature and datasets. It does not seriously engage with the ‘end-user’ perspective of those in conflict-affected states (despite recommendations which include working with local people). Overwhelmingly, statements are made as if they are factual, when in fact they require backing up with a great deal of empirical evidence – the expertise in this paper needs to be demonstrated more transparently.

Coder initials	CV
Score data quality (out of 4):	
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	
Total score (out of 8):	
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	More than 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Insufficient empirical information to determine
How insightful in terms of data/information?	NA
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Ximene, F. B. (n.d.). ‘The Unique Contribution of the Community-Based Reconciliation Process in East Timor’ Retrieved June 24, 2011, from [http://www.jsmp.minihub.org/Resources/2004/ICTJ\(e\).pdf](http://www.jsmp.minihub.org/Resources/2004/ICTJ(e).pdf)

This paper focuses purely on the legal aspects of transitional justice rather than on-the-ground local perspectives. The paper argues that CAVR should not be generalised under the uniform interpretation of other TRCs (amnesty) given that it is a mixture of justice and reconciliation. It is of utmost importance to use the CAVR to build upon existing formal judicial processes.

Coder initials	JT
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2000000000000002
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	2.5
Total score (out of 8):	4.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Less than 10%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation Other
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	No significant new analysis or theoretical insight

Young, L & Park, R (2009). ‘Engaging Diasporas in Truth Commissions: Lessons from the Liberia Truth and Reconciliation Commission Diaspora Project’, *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(3): 341-361.

The authors of this article were involved in the LTRC Diaspora Project which incorporated diaspora members into the Liberian TRC process. They conclude that most diaspora members, as direct or indirect victims, are entitled to participation and information and that their inclusion is relevant, feasible and important.

Coder initials	RH
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight

Zverzhanovski, Ivan. (2007) ‘Watching War Crimes: The Srebrenica Video and the Serbian Attitudes to the 1995 Srebrenica Massacre’, *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*. Vol. 7. No. 3. 417-430.

The paper discusses the size of the impact of showing the Srebrenica video in public in Serbia with respect to changing perceptions about the war and the role of Serbian forces in it. It is an example of how international justice relies on the media to report trials and how this video helped local capacity building for war crimes prosecution.

Coder initials	PA
Score data quality (out of 4):	2.2999999999999998
Score quality analysis (out of 4):	3
Total score (out of 8):	5.5
Quantity of data/information used (% of paper):	Between 10% and 50%
Type(s) of data/information used:	Qualitative, observation
How insightful in terms of data/information?	Some new evidence presented
How insightful in terms of analysis/theory?	Some new analysis or theoretical insight



This publication is an output of a research programme funded by UK aid from the UK Government. However, the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK Government's official policies



THE LONDON SCHOOL
OF ECONOMICS AND
POLITICAL SCIENCE ■

The Justice and Security Research Programme is an international consortium of research partners, undertaking work on end-user experiences of justice and security in conflict-affected areas. The London School of Economics and Political Science is the lead organisation and is working in partnership with:

- African Security Sector Network (Ethiopia)
- Conflict Research Group, University of Gent (Belgium)
- Social Science Research Council (USA)
- South East European Research Network (Macedonia)
- Video Journalism Movement (Netherlands)
- World Peace Foundation, Tufts University (USA)

Contact details:

email: Intdev.jsrp@lse.ac.uk

Web: lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/JSRP/jsrp.aspx

Tel: +44 (0)20 7849 4631