

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhophadhay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.



ESRC End of Award Report

For awards ending on or after 1 November 2009

This End of Award Report should be completed and submitted using the **grant reference** as the email subject, to reportsofficer@esrc.ac.uk on or before the due date.

The final instalment of the grant will not be paid until an End of Award Report is completed in full and accepted by ESRC.

Grant holders whose End of Award Report is overdue or incomplete will not be eligible for further ESRC funding until the Report is accepted. We reserve the right to recover a sum of the expenditure incurred on the grant if the End of Award Report is overdue. (Please see the ESRC Research Funding Guide for details.)

Please refer to the Guidance notes when completing this End of Award Report.

Grant Reference	RES-167-25-0520		
Grant Title	Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision		
Grant Start Date	1 August 2010	Total Amount Expended:	£ 128,427
Grant End Date	30 September 2012		
Grantholding Institution	Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi		
Grant Holder	Michael Walton		
Grant Holder's Contact Details	Address	Email	
	Harvard Kennedy School 79 JFK St Cambridge, MA, 02138, USA	Michael_walton@harvard.edu	
		Telephone +1 202 251 8702	
Co-Investigators (as per project application):		Institution	
Partha Mukhophadhay		Centre for Policy Research	
Veena Das (collaborator)		Johns Hopkins University	
Ranen Das (collaborator)		Johns Hopkins University	
Jeff Hammer (collaborator)		Princeton University	

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhopadhyay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

I. Non-technical summary

Please provide below a project summary written in non-technical language. The summary may be used by us to publicise your work and should explain the aims and findings of the project. *[Max 250 words]*

In Indian cities, as in most developing countries, many people live in marginal areas or “slums”, without security of housing and land tenure, and with inadequate provision of the range of public services considered normal in wealthier countries and locations, from water and sanitation, electricity, garbage collection, policing, local roads and public transport. Levels of deprivation, in terms of incomes, health and security, are often severe on average, with widespread differences even within these slums. The research project explores the nature of the interaction between individuals living in such areas and the state, exploring the strategies of slum-dwellers in the context of local social functioning and the behaviour of state actors. The meaning and practice of citizenship is analysed in relation to these daily struggles. The research project included systematic surveys of households in four slums in greater Delhi, in two political jurisdictions, plus extensive interviews of the range of other actors involved, including community leaders, politicians, local party workers, managers and frontline workers in state agencies. A particular focus is on health conditions, in light of the links between local public goods and health status, with typical failures in water, sanitation and environmental conditions. We find substantial heterogeneity in living conditions and access to services. This is related to the nature of citizenship in these slums, as manifest in the variety of strategies pursued by slum-dwellers to solve daily problems, via the political system, engaging with other state actors, or through private resolutions.

2. Project overview

a) Objectives

Please state the aims and objectives of your project as outlined in your proposal to us. *[Max 200 words]*

The research has three objectives.

- (a) To undertake an exploration of the nature, pattern and formation of interactions between households, social groups and the state and how these are related to the (under)provision of public goods and the distribution of deprivation, in a small number of marginal communities in urban India, with an initial focus on greater Delhi
- (b) To extend conceptually our interpretation of the meaning of "citizenship" in terms of the processes of learning amongst individuals and groups in practical struggles over material resources, learning that shapes both strategies and goals;
- (c) To deepen our understanding of the kinds of information that can be obtained from different empirical techniques, to underpin both interpretation and the design of public action in relation to state-society interactions in marginal urban communities.

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhopadhyay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

b) Project Changes

Please describe any changes made to the original aims and objectives, and confirm that these were agreed with us. Please also detail any changes to the grant holder's institutional affiliation, project staffing or funding. *[Max 200 words]*

We decided to concentrate on a deeper study of conditions in four slums rather than replicate a lighter research approach in additional slums; this change submitted to ESRC in annual reports. Prerna Singh (political scientist, Harvard) was added to the academic collaborators to deepen political science interpretations, at no project cost.

c) Methodology

Please describe the methodology that you employed in the project. Please also note any ethical issues that arose during the course of the work, the effects of this and any action taken. *[Max 500 words]*

The research involved mixed methods, drawing on empirical and conceptual approaches from anthropology, economics and political science.

The core empirical work is outlined here: this involved in-depth case studies of four slums in the greater Delhi area: two slums in Noida (that is formally part of the state of Uttar Pradesh) and two in the state of Delhi.

Within these slums there were two broad categories of empirical work.

(a) household questionnaires

Households were selected within each slum on the basis of a mapping of slum streets, and a random selection of dwellings within streets, including within this a subset of immediate neighbours of households chosen in the initial selection. 1200 households were surveyed in total.

The questionnaire included modules on household demographics, private assets, public services, interactions with state actors to solve problems, health status, networks, political consciousness, migration and aspirations. In addition to extensive specific questions, a set of vignettes were developed within the questionnaire to explore responses and attitudes (e.g. to marriage choice).

(b) interviews and participant observation

Interviews were conducted drawing in part from the initial findings from the household survey, including with:

- (i) 60 local leaders including 19 political party workers (since surveys found traditional leaders, or pradhans, were only important in one locality), plus 20 NGOs;
- (ii) 32 households, randomly drawn from the overall sample to explore interactions with state actors in greater depth; structured to include households that were relatively asset-rich and asset-poor, and within each category relatively political

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhopadhyay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

- active and inactive;
- (iii) 43 interviews in areas in which resettlement had been announced and plans periodically reactivated;
- (iv) 85 parents and children to explore issues around school drop-outs.

Participation observation was conducted on the two elections held in this period –for Municipal Council in Delhi and for the State Assembly in Uttar Pradesh. Researchers followed candidates from different political parties in their rallies and interviewed 34 party workers or local leaders involved in elections.

With respect to the behavior of state actors, additional research was undertaken in two areas:

- (i) documentation of an ongoing process of in-site upgrading and temporary resettlement in one of the slums (Kathputli)
 - (ii) interviews with front-line workers, and local brokers, for two categories of service delivery in Delhi (electricity and water) and selected middle level managers.
- Finally documentation of the legal basis for service delivery in slum areas was undertaken.

d) Project Findings

Please summarise the findings of the project, referring where appropriate to outputs recorded on the ESRC website. Any future research plans should also be identified. *[Max 500 words]*

A full interpretation of findings will be undertaken in the coming months as we analyse the empirical material. Several products are in process or planned in the following areas:

- the practice and meaning of political engagement and citizenship for slum-dwellers, and implications for theory
- how individuals present the salience of caste identities across different domains of living
- the process of in-situ upgrading of one slum to date, focusing on the behaviour of state actors and interactions with slum-communities
- the nature of health problems in relation to local public goods (e.g. drainage) and how this relates to micro/within-slum spatial variations; we also particularly interested in exploring how health, and health-seeking behaviours, links to interactions with state actors, including via political processes
- the role of political party workers, around elections and in interactions with state actors
- patterns of dropping out from school
- documentation of behaviour of water and electricity providers.

Some very selective and preliminary findings include:

- a high degree of heterogeneity in both private assets and access to services across households within slums
- major issues on low quality of provision of public amenities, with heterogeneity across services: water, toilets, drainage and garbage removal are major issues, and considered so by slum-dwellers; electricity is almost universal (albeit with some connections illegal)

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhophadhyay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

--relations with state actors are consistently mediated through elected representatives and party workers - thus the relation between governance and politics, which is usually conveyed as forms of corruption in the literature actually works among the poor in getting them access to public goods, and is not presented as clientelism in their own reflections on the issues
--health issues are pervasive, and there is evidence of links to local spatial variation of the public environment, with a correlation between diarrhoea and open drains
--a majority of slum-dwellers have some degree of political engagement and awareness, most have voting cards, most vote
--households pursue multiple strategies for solving daily problems—both through engaging directly with state actors (especially local politicians), and through private solutions with other households or intermediaries
--pradhans (traditional politicians) are much less important than often thought, with the exception of one slum where state action encouraged their involvement; but there are a variety of other intermediaries, and a notable role for party workers; NGOs have a low presence
--the discourse on caste, as presented by households, is of low salience in political decisions (e.g. who you say you vote for), relatively low salience on social interactions, but still high salience over marriage

e) Contributions to wider ESRC initiatives (eg Research Programmes or Networks)

If your project was part of a wider ESRC initiative, please describe your contributions to the initiative's objectives and activities and note any effect on your project resulting from participation. *[Max. 200 words]*

n/a

3. Early and anticipated impacts

a) Summary of Impacts to date

Please summarise any impacts of the project to date, referring where appropriate to associated outputs recorded on the Research Outcomes System (ROS). This should include both scientific impacts (relevant to the academic community) and economic and societal impacts (relevant to broader society). The impact can be relevant to any organisation, community or individual. *[Max. 400 words]*

While much of the potential impact will await the completion of the analysis, there have been some initial impacts via three workshops.

Two were aimed at selected groups of slum-dwellers, and run by ISERRD:

(a) Patel Nagar, Delhi August 13th, 2012.

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhophadhay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

This workshop involved 30 slum-dwellers and local leaders from Punjabi Basti slum and focused on sharing and discussing results on education and health. There was great interest in the low quality of schooling, and in health problems. Some of the findings related to health were clearly new information for the participants, for example on the link between diarrhoea and open drains, and on mistaken notions of treatments for particular ailments.

As a result of the workshop, the participants planned to mobilise around drains and garbage removal, requested ISERRD to follow up with a book club, and advice on appropriate treatment protocols, and on mechanisms to assess schooling quality.

(b) Noida, Uttar Pradesh, August 14th, 2012

This workshop involved 25 young men and young women attending college from the Noida slums and a low-income part of East Delhi (since few women in the sample from the Noida slums attended college). It focused on the challenges of attending higher education, inter-gender issues, caste and marriage, and led to a highly engaged discussion including on the issue of taunting of young women. The group asked for a follow up lecture series from ISERRD to continue the exploration.

(c) Bangalore, September 28 and 29, 2012.

A third workshop was aimed to development practitioners in urban issues and was jointly held by the Centre for Policy Research and the Indian Institute for Human Settlements, Bangalore, an academic institution focused on the study of urbanization in India.. This workshop brought together a mixture of urban development experts, senior government officials at state and local levels, including the Urban Adviser to the Chief Minister, local and state level politicians and political representatives, e.g. Member of Legislative Assembly and corporators, NGOs and academics under the theme of “the negotiation city”. Initial results from the slum surveys were presented, and this formed the basis for an extensive two-day discussion on how issues of public goods were tackled, the sources of failures and options for policy.

b) Anticipated/Potential Future Impacts

Please outline any anticipated or potential impacts (scientific or economic and societal) that you believe your project might have in future. *[Max. 200 words]*

We anticipate future impacts in two broad areas—in the worlds of academia and practice.

In academia, we anticipate contributions to theoretical views on the nature and formation of political concepts amongst poor people engaged in the resolution of daily problems, to empirical exploration of the how slum-dwellers interact with state actors, to the drivers of behaviour within state actors and to a number of specific domains—e.g. on influences on health status and health-seeking behaviour, on drivers of dropping out from schooling, on the role of identity in behaviour.

In the domain of practice, this is a time of intense debate and practical design in India on

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhopadhyay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

urban development, on the incorporation of the poor people into cities, and of how to make publicly provided services work. CPR is connected to these debates via specific links to the government, an ongoing seminar series targeted at the urban development community, regular op-eds in newspapers. We will develop a range of instruments as the analysis unfolds.

You will be asked to complete an ESRC Impact Report 12 months after the end date of your award. The Impact Report will ask for details of any impacts that have arisen since the completion of the End of Award Report.

To cite this output:

Walton, M, Mukhophadhay, P, (2013) Citizens and the state in urban India: an in-depth investigation on emergent citizenship and public goods provision
ESRC End of Award Report, RES-167-25-0520. Swindon: ESRC.

4. Declarations

Please ensure that sections A, B and C below are completed and signed by the appropriate individuals. The End of Award Report will not be accepted unless all sections are signed. Please note hard copies are **not** required; electronic signatures are accepted and should be used.

A: To be completed by Grant Holder

Please read the following statements. Tick **one** statement under ii) and iii), then sign with an electronic signature at the end of the section (this should be an image of your actual signature).

i) The Project

This Report is an accurate overview of the project, its findings and impacts. All co-investigators named in the proposal to ESRC or appointed subsequently have seen and approved the Report.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
---	-------------------------------------

ii) Submissions to the Research Outcomes System (ROS)

Output and impact information has been submitted to the Research Outcomes System. Details of any future outputs and impacts will be submitted as soon as they become available.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
or This grant has not yet produced any outputs or impacts. Details of any future outputs and impacts will be submitted to the Research Outcomes System as soon as they become available.	<input type="checkbox"/>

iii) Submission of Data

Data arising from this grant have been offered for deposit with the UK Data Service.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
or Data that were anticipated in the grant proposal have not been produced and the UK Data Service has been notified.	<input type="checkbox"/>
or No datasets were proposed or produced from this grant.	<input type="checkbox"/>