

Sourcing examples of policy and programming practice for empowering women in a rural context



Dr Una Murray

December 2013



**EVIDENCE
ON DEMAND**

CLIMATE & ENVIRONMENT
INFRASTRUCTURE | LIVELIHOODS



This report has been produced by Dr Una Murray for Evidence on Demand with the assistance of the UK Department for International Development (DFID) contracted through the Climate, Environment, Infrastructure and Livelihoods Professional Evidence and Applied Knowledge Services (CEIL PEAKS) programme, jointly managed by HTSPE Limited and IMC Worldwide Limited.

The author acknowledges comments and suggestions from Ruth Sparrey HTSPE Ltd and Nicolienne Oudwater, DFID. However, the views expressed in the report are entirely those of the author and do not necessarily represent DFID's own views or policies, or those of Evidence on Demand. Comments and discussion on items related to content and opinion should be addressed to the author, via enquiries@evidenceondemand.org

Your feedback helps us ensure the quality and usefulness of all knowledge products. Please email enquiries@evidenceondemand.org and let us know whether or not you have found this material useful; in what ways it has helped build your knowledge base and informed your work; or how it could be improved.

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.12774/eod_hd.nov2013_murray



Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Report Summary | ii |
| SECTION 1 | 1 |
| Potential for inclusion in e-learning | 1 |
| Roadmap for promoting women’s economic empowerment..... | 1 |
| Rwanda’s nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme..... | 3 |
| Evidence from Farmer Field Schools, East Africa | 4 |
| The Agricultural Support Programme (ASP), Zambia..... | 7 |
| The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men | 8 |
| SECTION 2 | 11 |
| Promising but evidence not complete/available | 11 |
| National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme with a focus on Gender Impacts, Tanzania | 11 |
| Effectiveness of agriculture interventions for smallholder farmers in Africa?..... | 12 |
| Enhancing Resilience (ER) Programme, Bangladesh..... | 12 |
| Vitamin A-rich Orange-fleshed Sweet Potato Programme, Malawi | 13 |
| Homestead Food Production Model and women’s ‘empowerment’..... | 14 |
| Linking agriculture programmes to improved nutrition and health | 15 |
| Value chains and ‘empowerment’ | 16 |
| Effectiveness of grants for ‘empowerment’..... | 19 |
| EnGENDER IMPACT website, World Bank | 21 |
| DFID evaluations which had their final reports in 2012/13 | 21 |
| Programmes that benefited rural women workers - ILO..... | 22 |
| SECTION 3 | 23 |
| Evaluation reports – useful for short case studies..... | 23 |
| DFID evaluations..... | 23 |
| FAO livestock evaluation..... | 24 |
| USAID evaluations | 25 |
| ADB evaluations..... | 27 |
| Gender equality and rural development- AusAID’s approach..... | 28 |
| References..... | 30 |
| Useful Websites | 35 |



Report Summary

Introduction and background

This report presents the results of a scoping exercise in preparation for potential eLearning modules on *Empowering Women in a Rural Context for DFID's livelihoods cadre*. The goal of the eLearning will be to promote transformative gender policy and programmes by updating livelihoods advisers' knowledge of gender in a changing agricultural and rural context. In preparation, the requirement for an annotated resource list that provides links to relevant case studies / example material and useful evidence based resources was identified. This report contains such an annotated list.

Approach to the study and its limitations

The overall timeframe allocated for this short study was five working days and this report therefore does not provide a detailed literature review or provide an in depth study. It is a practical piece that takes a quick look at potential case study material that exists from amongst a wide range of development agencies.

The author contacted by email individuals in approximately 60 agencies (bilateral agencies, multilaterals, financial institutions, foundations, and research institutions) to solicit their views on programmes or policies that have promoted transformative gender approaches and had evidence to show the subsequent impact¹. A limited search was also conducted of different evaluation websites (from agricultural agencies), the International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie) and the Agricultural, Learning and Impacts Network (ALINE). Reports and donor evaluation websites were also briefly reviewed.

Although there was significant email traffic (300 emails approximately), the suggestions sent to the author did not always match the criteria for this study. It proved difficult to source high quality materials and strong examples that generated impact because they adopted an innovative approach to rural women, or reports from programmes that achieved positive results for a large number of rural women because they supported women's empowerment or tailored interventions during implementation that purposefully addressed the different constraints of rural women.

Yet many promising approaches were suggested with either anecdotal evidence of impact, or with evaluation reports that demonstrated results, but were limited to an end of programme evaluation. As Doss et. al. (2012) highlight there is little rigorous evidence on which projects do economically empower women in the agricultural sector. It will be some time before more robust evaluation approaches, such as experimental/quasi-experimental evaluation approaches which integrate both quantitative and qualitative research methods can show a long term impact of projects on women's economic empowerment, since they will have to analyse impacts after the projects are completed.

In many cases, the 'how' of the approach as well as the impact was not explored in depth, particularly in evaluation reports. A further challenge is that suggested programmes were often not large scale. On the other hand, the scoping exercise from respondents revealed that there is considerable interest in providing examples of 'what works' in given circumstances, with certain inputs and conditions in place. There are also a number of evidence-based reviews forthcoming by the end of 2013/14 (e.g. from DFID, 3ie, ILO).

¹ A separate contact list will be made available to the Evidence on Demand team and DFID's Heads of Profession (livelihoods).



Report structure and key findings

The report is divided into three sections as follows:

- **Section 1** outlines those programmes identified by this study, that show the most evidence of impact and that could provide good material for the eLearning modules planned.
- **Section 2** contains some promising interventions that have not yet produced evidence of their impact; or evidence was not located within the time frame of this review. However these interventions might be worth exploring further in eLearning materials.
- **Section 3** contains examples of evaluation reports that might have relevance. A range of evaluation reports were sent by individuals in bilateral agencies in response to the email request where those contacted felt their evaluation reports could be reviewed as they potentially matched the criteria for this request.
- A **Bibliography** list has been included and keywords for each intervention are included for all examples in this report.

Key findings Section 1

Of note in this section is the recent report from the UN Foundation and ExxonMobile, which identifies proven, promising and high-potential interventions for **women's economic empowerment**. The 'Roadmap' document referred to in this report contains a summary of 17 research studies based on 136 empirical studies. One of the four themes of research focus was agriculture, thus providing relevant reviews of studies around land ownership and empowerment. It also includes reviews of crop decision-making patterns emanating from an analysis of the Malawian third integrated household survey. One study from the Roadmap is highlighted as an example – a review (from Doss et al.) that provided evidence from thirty-four projects providing agricultural inputs to women.

A survey and a case study of Rwanda's nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme are included in this Section, because of key 'gender related' findings that emerge from the analysis in terms of marital status. The study highlights that women who are not married may become further marginalised because title deeds are linked to marital status whereas those that are married benefit from this land tenure regularisation programme. Three reviews of the popular farmer field school approach (as applied in East Africa) are referenced, because these reports highlight positive impact on female farmers.

A Sida funded agricultural support programme with Zambian extension services, was also identified as having had impact, primarily because those involved were encouraged to disaggregate the household, and not treat needs at the household level in a homogenous way, but recognise how gender roles and relations affect outcomes. The agricultural support programme explicitly focussed on both men and women at the household level.

This section also includes useful information on a comparative review of the impact of economic resource transfers to women and to men. The findings from this systematic review highlights some gender issues related to conditional/unconditional cash-transfer programmes, grants to micro-enterprises, and microcredit programmes.

Key findings Section 2

Section 2 contains some promising interventions that have not yet produced evidence of their impact. This is not to say that reports and systematic reviews are not available, but they have not yet been located or studied in depth. As mentioned the timeframe for locating these materials was very short. The reviews of some of those interventions included in this section are still ongoing.



Some studies that are ongoing and that should soon have promising results around the theme of empowering women in a rural context are mentioned in this section because the forthcoming evaluation study will look at gender related impacts. For example the review of the *National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme, Tanzania*; and a forthcoming review on the effectiveness of agriculture interventions for smallholder farmers in Africa. Other programmes included in this section are the: *Bangladesh Enhancing Resilience Programme* implemented by the World Food Programme because of its strong empowerment focus; and, the *Vitamin A-rich Orange-fleshed Sweet Potato Programme* in Malawi that targets women and men in the household. More efforts can be made to locate impacts studies if any particular programme focus in this section is of interest.

Although a number of reports on the homestead food production model disseminated by *Helen Keller International* were located, and these reports stressed nutritional aspects, many of these reports did not provide adequate evidence of the impact of the model on household decision-making. Hence these reports are included in Section 2 rather than Section 1.

Innovative methodologies for integrating gender into value chain approaches (e.g. *Gender Action Learning Systems*) seem to be gaining popularity, but few consolidated reports of evidence of impact has yet been located on gender and value chains. This is not to say that such evidence is not available, it has not been located during the timeframe for this report and warrants further research. However, one report, drawing from four projects in the IFPRI-ILRI Gender, Agriculture and Assets Project (Quisumbing et. al 2013) is included here. Sets of value chain case studies are also highlighted in this section, and reference to approaches to gender and value chains.

Other promising reports mentioned in Section 2 include a systematic review of the effectiveness of grants for 'empowerment'; and an example from one grant programme that provided grants to rural women with a focus on information technology to improve their rural enterprises.


Section 2 also presents the recently launched enGENDER IMPACT website which brings together information about World Bank related Gender Impact Evaluations (about 160 studies so far). Two forthcoming review reports that highlight gender issues in evaluations are also mentioned in Section 2 (one from DFID and one from ILO on rural women workers).

Key findings Section 3

A range of evaluation reports were sent by individuals in bilateral agencies and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in response to the email requesting evidence based examples. Section 3 contains references to such evaluation reports. These may be useful for developing short case examples in eLearning materials. However the body of evidence to support the statements in these evaluation reports can be limited, because it may be too early to determine impact, and end of programme evaluations usually take place under time pressures, with often small sample sizes or less statistical evidence. This is not to say these evaluation reports do not provide a body of evidence within the context of an 'end of programme' evaluation. The author has included some in this report that focus on rural women or empowerment.

Other relevant work identified

Much work is being undertaken to mainstream gender equality in agricultural research and development (see for example Manyire & Apekey, 2013; Meinzen-Dick et. al. 2011). In parallel, much work is currently being undertaken towards improving the measurement of women entrepreneur's economic empowerment. For example a literature review in September 2013 (Wu, 2013) for the *Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED)*, provides definitions of women's economic empowerment and identifies current measures and practical ways forward for measuring household level change in women's economic



empowerment. This, and innovative work such as *The Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index* (WEAI) (IFPRI, 2012) which attempts to measure the empowerment and inclusion of women in the agriculture sector, and the *Gender, Agriculture, and Assets Project* supported by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation are allowing researchers to study how initiatives could pay more attention to measuring gender differences.

The recently launched enGENDER IMPACT website (mentioned in Section 2) should be a very useful resource for World Bank related Gender Impact Evaluations. In addition Harvard University's Women and Public Policy Program will soon launch the [Gender Action Portal](#) to gender-related impact evaluations, UN Women recently launched the [Knowledge Gateway for Women's Economic Empowerment](#), and groups like [3ie](#) and [J-Pal](#) have played important roles in producing and disseminating rigorous evidence on important development topics broadly, including in areas related to gender equality.

Only by access to practical approaches and identifying methods for results measurement can pathways of change be documented. Fortunately a lot of work is currently taking place in this area. Keeping abreast of such work, and summarising lessons learned should ultimately lead to programme teams being better able to identify and prioritise indicators that can help to determine gender related change with respect to rural women's livelihoods.



SECTION 1

Potential for inclusion in e-learning

This section provides an annotated list of potential examples that might be considered in further detail for the development of learning materials. A summary of all resources is included at the end of this report. There are five examples in this section:

- A roadmap for promoting women's economic empowerment
- Rwanda's nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme
- Evidence from Farmer Field School evaluations
- The Agricultural Support Programme in Zambia
- The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men.

Roadmap for promoting women's economic empowerment

This is a report published by the UN Foundation and ExxonMobil (Buvinic et. al. 2013) in September 2013. The report is based on 17 research studies (136 empirical studies database) that were commissioned to identify the most promising strategies for maximising investments in women's economic empowerment.

Essentially the *Roadmap* to promote women's economic empowerment is built from the results of a research programme that identified proven, promising and high-potential interventions that increased women's earnings potential in varying contexts both on farm and non/off farm. The Report/Roadmap is intended to serve as a guidepost for funders, implementing organisations and policy makers interested in supporting women to further economic development.

What the report highlights

The report focuses on four areas based on 17 research studies: i) entrepreneurship ii) wage employment iii) farming, and iv) young women's employment. It outlines lessons learned for each of the four categories. Among proven interventions three generalisations are made based on the evidence from research studies:

- **Savings and micro savings really make an impact.** Savings accounts are particularly important in increasing women's business earnings. More interventions in this area are particularly recommended for women.
- **Access to land, property, title to land really makes a difference in terms of productivity for women farmers.** Formal ownership and control over farmland improves women's productivity and economic security; farmer groups and collectives can strengthen access to markets for women producers. Female autonomy is an important determinant of rural women's earnings and should be taken into account when designing interventions.
- **Childcare** is an intervention that is proven to work for women in *urban* areas.

Other general points:

- Interventions have to be adapted for women's situations. For example the *Roadmap* stresses interventions for very poor women in agrarian economies, have to be very different for women in cities.
- For very poor women, there are no silver bullets. A combination of approaches (credit and technical assistance with training) works best.



- Microfinance alone is not sufficient to grow the businesses of very poor women. However, a relatively large capital transfer, if paired with income generation training and follow-up technical visits, can transform the occupational choices of very poor women.
- Business training alone does not result in the growth of women-owned businesses, however the impact can be improved by increasing the quality and duration of the training, combining training with expert business advice, and targeting women running larger firms.

References

Buvinić, M, Furst-Nichols, F and Courey Pryor, E, (2013), A Roadmap for Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment, United Nations Foundation, ExxonMobil.
http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/sites/default/files/WEE_Roadmap_Report_Final.pdf

Only summaries of commissioned studies are available in RoadMap report itself, although the studies can be located on the website database: <http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/>.

A list of some studies in the UN Foundation/ExxonMobil publication that are relevant to this review include:

- Women's economic empowerment in agriculture. Doss, Bockius-Suwynet al. (2012)
- Women who save – a comparative analysis of Ecuador, Ghana and Karnataka. Doss, Deere et. al (2012)
- Financial services for low-income women. Mehra et. a. (2012)
- An analysis of land rights and women's economic well-being. Rodgers & Menon (2012)
- Successful women farmers and interventions associated with their success. The authors find that female headship and land ownership are associated with females cultivating profitable cash crops. Dimova & Gang (2013)
- Learning from Value Chain Development in Africa and Asia. Quisumbing et. al. (2013) (see Section 2 under Value Chains)
- Increasing the productivity and earnings of rural women: what works. A review of 40 evaluations of projects designed to increase rural women's productivity and earnings, assessing the effectiveness of 10 categories of these programmes. Knowles (2013)
- Female entrepreneurs who succeed in male-dominated sectors in Uganda. Campos et. al. (2013)

Keywords: economic empowerment; agriculture

(i) Example from RoadMap: Supporting women farmers

One example review taken from the UN Foundation/ExxonMobile *Roadmap to Women's Economic Empowerment* Report is a review of 100 projects that specifically supported women farmers. This paper reviews the effectiveness of agricultural interventions that target women, and identified case studies of interventions that were considered to be successful by project implementers and experts in the field.

What the report highlights

The following is highlighted as effective in the review:

- farmers' groups as sources of social and economic empowerment;
- women's financial empowerment via loans, savings, and asset ownership;
- harvesting, processing, and storage technologies that ease time women's burdens or work with women's schedules; and



- training that is accessible to women in location, instructor, time commitment, and delivery.

The right tools were considered to be just one aspect of a successful project. The most effective interventions used several of these tools to create integrated approaches. For example, projects that encouraged savings and loans so that women could buy improved inputs, which the implementing organisation then trained the women how to use. Projects were even more successful when they took advantage of local businesses, governments, and community structures to implement the project. It is proven most effective to target women as a member of the household and the community. The most successful projects targeted men as well as women, with a focus on women's partners and male community leaders. This approach avoids isolating women or angering men, building a better social environment for women's success specifically and community success more generally.

Using integrated approaches and targeting women as members of a larger household and community require implementers to clearly see women's multifaceted role in the agricultural supply chain and in rural society. Organizations working with women must see them as not just farmers, but buyers, sellers, community leaders, wives, mothers, processors, and innovators. Projects that targeted women in more than one of their roles proved the most effective.

Robustness of evidence

Strong - The authors contacted over 100 researchers and practitioners, identifying 34 projects to serve as their case studies.

Reference

Doss, C., Bockius-Suwyn, Z. and D'Souza, S. (2012). *Women's economic empowerment in agriculture: Supporting women farmers*. Prepared for the UN Foundation.
http://api.ning.com/files/y4dy-j9rq*gCepwdf7TaaELGzGL6nmYoBdpXceiw7nIWtbUr9J3t29G-oNqekwH6teyrY8LS7d1cL7XU4FLsK0du84WxFm**/WomensEconomicEmpowermentinAgriculture.pdf

Keywords: economic empowerment; agriculture inputs


Rwanda's nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme²

Both a World Bank survey and a case study produced by the *Evidence on Demand* Help Desk (Gillingham, forthcoming) looked at the effects of the Land Tenure Regularisation Process in Rwanda. The World Bank survey examined the short-term impact (2.5 years after completion) of the pilots undertaken to fine-tune the approach in Rwanda's nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme (2011). The forthcoming *Evidence on Demand* case study, focuses on DFID support to the Land Tenure Regularisation Programme (LTRSP) and outlines the LTRSP process in detail.

What the reports highlight

The World Bank survey highlights that individuals whose parcels had been registered through the national land tenure regularisation (LTR) programme, in particular female-headed ones, were much more likely to invest in soil conservation measures on their land. Clarification and documentation of rights reduced the uncertainty over who would inherit land and this had benefits for female children who might otherwise have been discriminated against. Legally married women were significantly more likely to have their informal

² Also note that a case study on the Rwanda Land Programme funded by DFID is due to be available in November, this case study would also be a useful resource here.



ownership rights documented and secured after registration. But, women who were not legally married saw diminished property rights.

In summary two key 'gender related' findings emerge from the World Bank analysis:

- The programme improved land access for legally married women (about 76 percent of married couples) and prompted better recordation of inheritance rights without gender bias.
- The report finds a very large impact on investment and maintenance of soil conservation measures, which is particularly pronounced for female-headed households, suggesting that this group had suffered from high levels of tenure insecurity, which the program managed to reduce.³

The *Evidence on Demand* Case Study on the DFID funded LTRSP in Rwanda will provide an outline of how land tenure reform can work under particular conditions, as well as a summary of the specific approach taken to ensure gender equality in land rights. Despite the significant contribution that the land registration made to bringing about gender equality, the case study will highlight that the situation of non-formally married wives or multiple wives remains a challenge.

Robustness of evidence

The World Bank study comprised a survey to some 3,500 households on both sides of the boundaries of the four pilot cells. Econometric methodology, relying on the use of spatial fixed effects that are used to interpret the data. The study used a geographic discontinuity design with spatial fixed effects for the Environmental and Gender Impacts of Land Tenure Regularisation nation-wide land tenure regularisation programme.

The *Evidence on Demand* case study was built from three months research after Phase I of DFID support to the LTRSP had been completed and included a review of various reports related to the programme.

References

Ali, D. A., Deininger, K. & Goldstein, M. (2011). Environmental and gender impacts of land tenure regularization in Africa: pilot evidence from Rwanda. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series*, 5765. <http://elibrary.worldbank.org/doi/pdf/10.1596/1813-9450-5765>

Gillingham, P. (forthcoming) Rwanda Land Tenure Regularisation Case Study. *Evidence on Demand*. DFID


Carpano, F, (2011) Strengthening Women's Access to Land in IFAD Projects: The Rwanda Experience. http://www.ifad.org/english/land/women_land/WomenAndLand_Rwanda_Report_Eng.pdf

Keywords: land tenure; female headed households

Evidence from Farmer Field Schools, East Africa

Farmer Field Schools (FFS) have become a very popular extension and education method worldwide. Having started in Asia (Indonesia) at the end of the 1980s, they are now operational in at least 78 countries and have expanded through many parts of Sub-Saharan

³ Also another finding 3. Land market activity declined, allowing rejection of the hypothesis that the program caused a wave of distress sales or widespread landlessness by vulnerable people.



Africa. Much debate focuses on whether the FFS approach is sustainable and whether or how it can be incorporated into mainstream extension services. Three FFS reports were reviewed to examine the evidence with respect to an 'empowerment' focus.

- (i) An IFPRI Study (Davis et. al. 2010)
- (ii) A FAO evaluation report (Majoor & Ton, 2012)
- (iii) A study from Kenya on the impact of FFS on gender relations (Friis-Hansen et. al. 2012)

(i) IFPRI Study on Farmer Field Schools, East Africa

An IFPRI Discussion Paper from June 2010 (*Davis et. al. 2010*) examined the impact of Farmer Field Schools on Agricultural Productivity and Poverty in East Africa

What the report highlights

The **IFPRI study** covered Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya. The IFPRI study results demonstrated that the Farmer Field School (FFS) approach was more beneficial for female-headed households than for male-headed households. The results suggest that the FFS approach could serve as a key strategy to provide agricultural extension services to female farmers, whose access to agricultural extension in Sub-Saharan Africa is generally poor. It has been shown that women gain greater benefits than men when they have access to the same inputs. The FFS approach can thus be considered as suitable for targeting women farmers and female-headed households while still reaching men. The study highlights that the FFS program not only allowed women to participate but also led to significant benefits in terms of income and crop and livestock production. Women constituted 50 percent of participants in the project.

The FFS program appeared to be more beneficial for female-headed households than for male-headed households. FFS programs can be used to provide agricultural extension services to women, who contribute the most in agricultural production and yet have poor access to agricultural extension services compared with male farmers.

Robustness of evidence

Strong. Based on a household survey used to analyse the quantitative impact of the FFS project on participants (1,126 households were randomly selected from villages with FFSs and villages without FFSs). Re-sampling of respondents from the original 2006 baseline survey. Two-stage random sampling technique. A list of all newly registered FFSs (as of 2006) in the IFAD-FAO FFS project districts made up the sampling frame. A total of 20 FFSs per country were randomly selected from purposively selected districts. The number of farmers selected was proportional to the number of field schools in each district and diversity of agro-ecological zones. Next, lists of households were used to randomly select household members, the number of members being interviewed being proportional to the total membership in FFSs. For the non-FFS participants, a list was obtained of all villages in the district where the selected FFS households were located. A list of households in each village was drawn up, and households randomly sampled. The survey instrument was a closed-ended questionnaire that was modified from the baseline survey instrument (to include more data on production and income).

Reference

Davis, K., Nkonya, E., Kato, E., Mekonnen, D. A., Odendo, M., Miiro, R. & Nkuba, J. (2010). Impact of farmer field schools on agricultural productivity and poverty in East Africa. *World Development*, 40, 402-413.

<http://www.ifpri.org/sites/default/files/publications/ifpridp00992.pdf>



Keywords: agriculture extension system for women

(ii) FAO evaluations of Farmer Field Schools

FAO evaluations of Farmer Field Schools examined during this review included a SIDA funded FAO study on Central & Eastern Africa (and a study in French on the impact of Farmer Field Schools on Food Security).

What the SIDA/FAO evaluation highlights

The 2012 SIDA FAO evaluation report concluded that FFSs were shown to have positive impact on production and income among women, low-literacy, and medium land size farmers. Participation in FFS increased income by 61%. Participation in FFS improved agricultural income and crop productivity overall. This implies that farmer field schools can be a useful approach to increase production and income of small-scale farmers in East Africa, and that the approach can be used to target women and producers with limited literacy.

Robustness of evidence

Low – for FAO evaluation. The external evaluation to assess the progress of the project included a desk review, interviews with project staff, donors, semi-structured questionnaires, stakeholder interviews carried out in all beneficiary countries. The interviews explored the status of implementation, the constraints, opportunities and contribution of and possible cooperation with other actors.

References

Majoor, H. & Ton, P. FAO (June 2012) Mid-term evaluation report Addressing HIV and Gender Inequities through a Food Security and Nutrition Response in Eastern and Central Africa - OSRO/RAF/010/SWE FAO Office of Evaluation (June 2012)
http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/OSRORAF010SWE_2012_ER.pdf.

Another FAO evaluation study from Angola available in French:

FAO (2012). Office of Evaluation Programme Spécial de Sécurité Alimentaire (PESA) Soutien des politiques publiques et le renforcement des capacités pour améliorer la sécurité alimentaire en Angola sous le Plan d'Action National pour la Sécurité Alimentaire et la Nutrition. GCP/ANG/033/SPA April 2012
http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/GCPANG033SPA_2012_ER.pdf


Keywords: agriculture extension system for women, farmer field schools

(iii) Impact of FFS on Gender Relations, Kenya

A study on the impact of Farmer Field Schools on gender relations took place in Kenya. It highlights the importance of working with both men and women and applying a differentiated approach to different groups and within households.

What the report highlights

The study from Kakamega District Kenya examined the impact of collective action in Kenyan Farmer Field School groups on household gender equity. Qualitative fieldwork revealed significant changes in household division of labour and decision-making; in gendered customs and traditions, and in men's work ethics and their view of women. The study concludes that Farmer Field Schools generate gender impacts not only because it empowers women but because it also provides opportunities for the men, the agent of oppression in this case, to change their view on women. This suggests that equity in household gender relations may be improved through the active engagement of both women



and men in non-formal adult education within mixed collective organizations.

Robustness of evidence

Low. The study was based on interviews with 22 current or graduate FFS participants and eight group interviews (10-25 participants). Two theoretical frameworks were used; collective action and gender relations and transformative learning theory, to understand how the participatory education experience in collective action groups impacts spousal relations.

Reference

Friis-Hansen, E., Duveskog, D. and Taylor, E. (2012) Less noise in the household: the impact of Farmer Field Schools on Gender Relations. *Journal of Research in Peace, Gender and Development* (ISSN: 2251-0036) Vol. 2(2) pp. 044-055, February 2012

Keywords: gender relations; empowerment

The Agricultural Support Programme (ASP), Zambia

The Sida funded Agriculture Support Programme (ASP) in Zambia is outlined as demonstrating evidence of impact on rural women. The goal of the Zambian ASP (2003-2008)⁴ was to stimulate attitudinal change amongst smallholders to the way farming is conducted. A further report (Farnworth, 2010) examines how gender aware approaches were implemented in the agriculture sector to draw lessons from five evaluations of different programmes.

What ASP report highlights


The ASP report (Farnworth & Munachonga, 2010) highlights how household gender relations affect the intra-household distribution of commodities and the ability of each gender to use particular commodities. Wealth may not be divided according to the share brought in by each household member. Division of wealth is determined by relative power. In most cases, men hold more power than women and thus wield more control over assets and expenditure. The ASP adopted a *household focused approach*, which disaggregated the household as an analytical unit.⁵

The ASP in Zambia provides some evidence that fully involving women does indeed result in increased production, productivity and overall farm resilience. According to the authors, the ASP demonstrated that if implemented through individual household visits, involving all adult household members: husband, wife and older children, progress can be made, with the guidance of the extension officer, families together developed a household action plan and mobilized resources together. Both husbands and wives participated in workshops, training and exposure visits. Women attending entrepreneurship training established their own business enterprises. This example may provide some insight into how gender approaches to programme design can be applied. For example adopting affirmative action for training and other interventions with farmers, attempting to mainstream gender in staff induction training and in management information systems.

Impact: According to Farnworth and Munachonga (2010) the ASP was effective in reaching women, producing tangible changes in gender relations at the household level and enhanced women's position in the community. Women's access to, and control over, resources and household incomes have increased. Relationships between women and men

⁴ Funded by Sida and a small grant from Norad in phase 3.

⁵ The programme was implemented by the Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives (MACO) staff at the local level, but was management by a Programme Management Unit located outside MACO.



have been strengthened and their workloads shared. Women's self-esteem and confidence have increased, as they have become entrepreneurs and leaders in their home as well as the broader community. Women's skills were enhanced and productivity increased. Women gained the confidence to become involved in what traditionally were predominantly male enterprises.

Robustness of evidence

Medium but mainly qualitative. The research team conducted interviews with several former ASP stakeholders in Lusaka. At the District Level, the research team conducted discussions in Kabwe and in Petauke with Provincial Agricultural Coordinators, Senior Agricultural Coordinators and extension workers who had been employed in the ASP. Fieldwork was conducted with groups of ASP-coded farmers. At each research site, the research team split up to talk to women and men farmers separately. Over 50 farmers were consulted, each representing a different household. The research sites were selected in order to test the hypothesis that the application of ASP's methodology would be hampered or enabled by prevailing cultural norms.

References

Farnworth, C. and Munachonga, M. (2010) Gender Approaches in Agricultural Programmes – Zambia Country Report A special study of the Agricultural Support Programme (ASP) UTV Working Paper 2010:8 Sida, Sweden
<http://www.sida.se/Global/Gender%20in%20Agriculture%20working%20paper%202010-8%20Zambia.pdf>

Farnworth, C. (2010) Gender Aware Approaches in Agricultural Programmes. A Study of Sida-supported Agricultural Programmes. Sida Evaluation. Sweden
www.Sida.se/publications
<http://www.oecd.org/countries/burkinafaso/46145893.pdf>

Keywords: household level focus; agricultural support

The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men


A 2012 **systematic review** assessed the evidence of the impact on family well being of giving economic resources to women relative to the impact of giving them to men. The review concerns programmes such as conditional and unconditional cash transfers, microcredit programmes and old-age pensions.⁶

What the systematic review highlights

Generally, there appear to be some differences in family outcomes from transfers to women compared with transfers to men, such as improved child health and nutrition, but there seems to be very differential impacts depending on the programme/country where the transfers take place, so drawing conclusions is difficult. The authors of the systematic review concluded there is a need for further research comparing the differential impacts of economic-resource transfers to women versus transfers to men on indicators of family and household well being.

Conditional cash-transfer (CCT) programmes: Studies from the Mexican *PROGRESA* CCT find relative difference in expenditure, (including health, school, clothing, food), investments (in business, agriculture and small livestock) and school enrolment for transfers to women versus men. In this case, female transfer recipients appear to behave differently from male transfer recipients by being more likely to invest in small livestock and in

⁶ From 3ie website



business. It is often questioned whether the impacts of CCT programmes are because they are specifically targeted at women or because of the conditionality attached. From the studies reviewed, the authors believe conditionality is playing a significant confounding role in the effects of the cash transfers. There is also some evidence specifically from the Red de Protección Social (Nicaragua) that the effect of the positive impact on school enrolment and food and milk per capita expenditure does not decrease when the woman of the household is less powerful ('less powerful' in this particular study was measured by relative years of schooling completed).

Unconditional cash-transfer programmes: The authors found no studies that examined differential effects for unconditional cash transfers to men versus women on household investment or female empowerment. Differential impacts on male versus female household members due to cash transfers to women could have varying impacts on women's position and decision-making, but these impacts are speculative. Examining South Africa, old-age pensions for women appear to have a positive impact on children and younger adults in the same household, including school enrolment, nutrition and expenditures. This is not the case with pensions for men. In addition, the pension does not seem to have an impact on the pensioner but rather on family members living with the pensioner. The authors also find that pensions given to women reduce net household income by decreasing the labour supply of prime-aged men and women.

Grants to micro-enterprises: Only one study (from Sri Lanka) reported measured effects of transfer of grants between men and women. The authors find that accumulation of assets and durables increases when grants are made to men rather than women. They also suggest that female entrepreneurs, in contrast to male entrepreneurs, do not use small grants to make investments and do not gain returns on investments made from large grants. There is no evidence suggesting higher investment in schooling or health by women compared with men. However, women who are more "empowered" (measured in this instance through reported involvement in household purchasing, reported ability to make input and purchase decision without spousal input, and agreement that spousal input increases profits) seem to invest their grants more efficiently.

Microcredit: The effects across programmes are heterogeneous but provide evidence of beneficial effects of microcredit given to women in terms of schooling, expenditures, assets, height-for-age in children and measures of women's empowerment.

Robustness of evidence

Strong - The authors conducted a systematic search of academic databases. The authors included empirical studies reporting on the differential impact of unearned economic-resource programmes targeted at women versus men. Relevant outcomes were the well being of the household, the family, or specific family members. According to 3ie, the review uses reasonably clear inclusion criteria. The authors searched for studies in any language and assessed study quality systematically, identifying 5,774 citations. Filtering of papers to match the specific criteria resulted in a total of 15 articles for in-depth study from seven countries in South Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean and sub-Saharan Africa. Four studies report findings from unconditional cash-transfer interventions, three from conditional cash transfers, and two from grants to household enterprises and six from microcredit to household enterprises. Study designs include four randomised control trials, one survey and three retrospective studies. The literature largely focuses on Latin America and South Asia, leaving regions such as sub-Saharan Africa, the Pacific, North Africa and the Middle East understudied.



Reference

Yoong, J., Rabinovich L. & Diepeveen, S. (2012) The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men. A systematic review. Technical Report. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London
<http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=q7MJCBgRUsQ%3d&tabid=3306&mid=6204>

Keywords: resource transfer; social protection; grants; cash transfers; conditional cash transfers; microcredit



SECTION 2

Promising but evidence not complete/available

This section firstly provides an annotated list of some promising interventions that have not yet produced evidence of their impact. Secondly, for other interventions outlined in this Section, complete evidence of impact was not found. This is not to say that reports and systematic reviews are not available, but they have not yet been located or studied in depth. The reviews of some of the interventions included in this section are still ongoing.

There are 12 examples in this section organised around the following:

- *Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme* with a focus on gender impacts, Tanzania
- A review on the effectiveness of agricultural interventions for smallholders in Africa
- The World Food Programme's *Enhancing Resilience (ER) Programme* in Bangladesh
- *Vitamin A-rich Orange-fleshed Sweet Potato Programme*, Malawi
- The *Homestead Food Production Model* and its relevance for empowerment
- Value chains and empowerment (4 reports)
- Effectiveness of 'Grants' for enabling an empowerment process (2 reports)
- The World Bank's *enGENDER IMPACT* website
- DFID gender review of 2012/13 evaluations
- ILO programmes that benefitted rural women workers.

National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme with a focus on Gender Impacts, Tanzania

What the impact study will highlight

The study will seek to evaluate Tanzania's National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme with a gender focus on incomes, agricultural production, food consumption and food security. The study should determine the effect on women farmers, as well as harmful gender norms, weak property and contractual rights and lack of initial investments for inputs. Also it will estimate the programme's cost-effectiveness. This will be the first impact evaluation of input subsidies as a mechanism to enhance productivity and improve food security on a large scale. It is an ongoing study, so no results are available yet.

Robustness of evidence

Should be strong (review evidence when available)

Reference

Padian, N. Gautam, M. Msolla, M. (forthcoming) Enhancing Food Production and Food Security through Improved Inputs: An Evaluation of Tanzania's National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme with a Focus on Gender Impacts Ongoing 3ie Funded Studies.

<http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/impact-evaluations/details/230/>

<http://www.kilimo.go.tz/>

Keywords: social protection; input subsidies; food security; voucher scheme



Effectiveness of agriculture interventions for smallholder farmers in Africa?

A review on the effectiveness of agricultural interventions for smallholders in Africa is forthcoming from 3ie.

What the review will highlight

With a focus on agricultural reform, agricultural credit, agricultural extension in Sub-Saharan Africa, the available evidence on the range of interventions being funded and the complexity of causal pathways will be reviewed systematically. The review consists of three stages. Stage 1 will map the existing systematic review evidence on smallholder agricultural interventions in Africa. Stage 2 will map the size and scope of evidence in the form of impact evaluations not covered by existing systematic reviews. Stage 3 will involve undertaking one or more focussed systematic reviews of evidence, the topics of which will be informed by the earlier phases 1 and 2. In stage 2 which interventions target young farmers and / or women specifically will be addressed.

Robustness of evidence

Should be strong (review evidence when available)

Reference

Stewart, R. Korth, M., Zaranyika, H., Rebelo Da Silva, N. Langer, L., Randall, N. van Rooyen, C. and de Wet, T. (2014 forthcoming). *What is the effectiveness of agriculture interventions on agricultural investment, yields, and income for smallholder farmers in Africa?* 3ie Systematic Review. <http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/systematic-reviews/details/244/>

Keywords: agricultural interventions; smallholder farmers; young farmers; women farmers

Enhancing Resilience (ER) Programme, Bangladesh

The World Food Programme's (WFP's) Enhancing Resilience (ER) programme integrates asset creation activities with community training to build resilience to climate change. It has a rural, ultra-poor, especially women focus. Capacity building is offered to reduce risk, with innovative ways to address interactions between hunger, nutrition and climate change.

What the ER programme highlights


The ER programme has a strong empowerment element; prioritising women; and local level planning focus. Men's participation in the work phase is important to ensure both men and women feel ownership of the schemes. It combines 'protection' with 'promotion'. Cash transfers are streamlined. For the 2013 'promotion' element, all participants have cash grants for investment transferred to individual bank accounts. The ER programme integrates asset creation activities with community training to build resilience -rural ultra-poor, and focus on women. Potential case study for a focus on Climate Change to show how a programme with a strong empowerment element is implemented in practice.

Robustness of evidence

Ongoing, so no evidence yet.

References

WFP in Bangladesh Annual Report 2012, Pages 10 and 11
<http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/newsroom/wfp261105.pdf>



MRFCJ (2012) *A New Dialogue : Putting People at the Heart of Global Development*. Page 47 Hunger, Nutrition, Climate Justice Conference Papers 15-16 April 2013 - Dublin, Ireland. <http://www.mrfcj.org/pdf/hncj/conference-papers.pdf>

Vitamin A-rich Orange-fleshed Sweet Potato Programme, Malawi

Implemented through the International Potato Centre (CIP), Malawi, the Irish Aid funded 'Rooting out Hunger in Malawi with Nutritious Orange-fleshed Sweet Potato' (OFSP) project aims to improve vitamin A and energy intake for at least 70,000 rural households. Apart from a nutrition focus and linkage with the *Scaling Up Nutrition (SUN)* movement,⁷ the programme also aims to ensure that at least 20% of households growing OFSP earn at least US\$100 per year from OFSP sales, and increase their average sweet potato yields by 50%. Agricultural researchers, NGOs and farmers pooled knowledge /resources to develop, distribute and promote new vitamin-enriched and drought-resistant sweet potato varieties.

What the research highlights

The Vitamin A- Rich Orange-fleshed sweet potato programme in Malawi has a purposeful focus on women, particularly pregnant women, and young children. However, recognising that men play an important role in household decision-making, the programme included men in all aspects of the OFSP intervention from training, the establishment of decentralized OFSP vine multipliers and the dissemination of vine cuttings. CIP linked to government of Malawi's policy on gender, the Agriculture Sector Wide Approach and the SUN 1000 special days initiative. Working with both women and men in the household proved effective. In 2011-12, two thirds of the 24,000 farmers supported through the vine cuttings voucher scheme were women. Overall, of the more than 4,000 agricultural extension workers and lead farmers trained by the project, 43 per cent are women. A gender survey on the approach will be published in early 2014. Phase II of the project will support women's empowerment along the OFSP value chains.

Similar research is taking place in Uganda and Mozambique (under the HarvestPlus challenge program) and a report from Uganda is forthcoming from 3ie.

Robustness of evidence

On going programme so need more evidence

References

Sindi, K., Kiria, C., Low, J.W., Sopo, O., Abidin, P.E. (2013). Rooting out hunger in Malawi with nutritious orange-fleshed sweetpotato: A baseline survey report. Blantyre, Malawi. International Potato Center (CIP) <http://cipotato.org/publications/pdf/006116.pdf>

Nyekanyeka, T., Kapalasa, E., Chipungu, F., Botha, BI and Abidin, P. (2013). Improving Food Security, Nutrition and Gender Empowerment. CIP, Malawi, Department of agricultural Research Services (DARS) and Irish Aid Malawi.

CIP (2013) International Potato Centre News. http://cipotato.org/resources/publications/cip-newsletter/CIPNewsletter_July_2013.pdf

Gilligan, D. C.McNiven, S. Musoke, C. Hotz, C. and Kiguli, G. (forthcoming) *A bio fortification Program To Reduce Vitamin A Deficiency In Uganda*. 3ie Funded Evaluation

Keywords: nutrition; targeting women and men; biofortification

⁷ <http://scalingupnutrition.org/>



Homestead Food Production Model and women's 'empowerment'

Many donors and agencies such as the World Bank, Irish Aid, UKAID, and AUSAID mention the Helen Keller International's (HKI) *Homestead Food Production Model*, which aims to increase production and consumption of fruits and vegetables, and women's decision making ability. Many reports were reviewed, however most reports on the *Homestead Food Production Model* focus on nutritional outcomes, rather than evidence of improved household decision-making. Some evidence was located to support the hypothesis that women's involvement in household decision-making improves, as a result of successfully learning and applying the HKI homestead food production model.

Experience from Scaling-Up Programs, Bangladesh, Nepal, Cambodia, Philippines

This study focused on how scaling up the Homestead Food Production Model contributes to improved household food security, nutrition and female empowerment in Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, and Philippines.

What the study highlights

Between 2003 and 2007, the HFP program was implemented among ~30,000 households in Bangladesh, Nepal, Cambodia and the Philippines. This study (March 2010) regarding the HKI Homestead Food Production Model (HFPP) outlined the impact amongst these households. Outcome indicators measured included household food availability, consumption and income, as well as anaemia prevalence in women and children 6 to 59 months. Evaluations claimed:

- Improved availability and consumption of vegetables, fruits and animal products such as egg and liver in participating households
- Anaemia among women and children decreased in some countries.
- Household income increased as a result of the homestead food production activities.
- *Women's involvement in household decision-making improved.*

The conclusion in report was that HFPP has the potential to improve dietary intake and nutritional status of women and young children and likely improves household food security and nutritional status of household members. However, it is unclear whether there is sufficient evidence to support this claim.

Robustness of evidence


Limited as less emphasis in the report on women's involvement in household decision-making. However homestead food production methodology widely used as component in other programmes.

References

Talukder, A., Haselow, N., Osei, A., Villate, E., Reario, D., Kroeun, H., Sokoing, L., Uddin, A., Dhunge, S. & Quinn, V. (2000). Homestead food production model contributes to improved household food security and nutrition status of young children and women in poor populations. Lessons learned from scaling-up programs in Asia (Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal and Philippines). *Field Actions Science Reports. The journal of field actions.*

Other references to HKI programmes

Hillenbrand, E. (2010) Transforming gender in homestead food production. *Gender and Development Vol. 18, No. 3, November 2010* ISSN 1355-2074 print/1364-9221 online/10/030411_ 15 – Oxfam GB 2010



Lesser Blumberg, R., Dewhurst, K. & Sen, S. G. (2013). *Gender-inclusive Nutrition Activities in South Asia: Volume 2. Lessons from Global Experiences*. The World Bank. http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2013/08/20/000442464_20130820101220/Rendered/PDF/710890v20REVIS0balExperiences0FINAL.pdf

Talukder, A., Sapkota, G., Shrestha, S., De Pee, S. & Bloem, M. W. Year (2004). Homestead Food Production Program in Central and Far-western Nepal Increases Food and Nutrition Security: An Overview of Program Achievements. In: Home Gardens in Nepal: Proceeding of a workshop on " *Enhancing the contribution of home garden to on-farm management of plant genetic resources and to improve the livelihoods of Nepalese farmers: Lessons learned and policy implications*", 6-7 August 2004, Pokhara, Nepal. *LI-BIRD, Bioversity International and SDC. Local Initiatives for Biodiversity, 2006. 27.*

HKI Website: <http://www.hki.org/reducing-malnutrition/homestead-food-production/>

Keywords: nutrition; gender; targeting women; large-scale agriculture programmes; markets; homestead food production

Linking agriculture programmes to improved nutrition and health

An overview of the literature linking agriculture and nutrition to gender from 2012 was published by IFRPI. The categorization of various agricultural interventions into three key areas of intervention may be useful for organising e-learning messages around the different types of interventions in this area DFID could potentially support.

What the report highlights

Three distinct types of agricultural interventions are discussed:

1. **Programs that link smallholders to markets** – for these types of interventions, the authors highlight the importance of ensuring that women are included in contracts, small-holder groups, and training opportunities, and that economic opportunities for men are also taken into account in order to minimize the likelihood that they will take over women's profitable activities.
2. **Large-scale agriculture** - employment in these arrangements can have beneficial impacts on nutrition by increasing household income and increasing the amount of income controlled by women. However the authors stress that women face insecure labour contracts, domestic work passed on to daughters at the expense of their education, and excessive exposure to agro-chemicals. Nevertheless employment on other farms does provide a source of income.
3. **Homestead food production** – this model is similar to the HKI model mentioned in Section 2. The authors highlight women have been integrated into the homestead food production model, but suggest the need for an increased focus on women's income generation (from the food produced) in order to further improve health and nutrition.

Robustness of evidence

Strong – also based on work of Arimond, et. al (2010) whose review is based on systematic searches of recently published literature and a limited search of unpublished documents, as well as personal contacts with project officers and international agency staff. The searches primarily aimed to identify studies of agricultural interventions that had evaluated individual-level nutrition outcomes, such as child nutritional status, individual food or nutrient intakes and diet quality. Some studies also documented household-level impacts on food consumption. In most cases, these interventions had explicitly included nutrition improvement among their objectives. Several thousand published articles were reviewed for relevance.



References

Meinzen-Dick, R., Behrman, J., Menon, P., & Quisumbing, A. (2012) *Gender: A key dimension linking agricultural programs to improved nutrition and health*. In: S. Fan and R. Pandya-Lorch (Eds.), *Reshaping agriculture for nutrition and health: An IFPRI 2020 book* (135-144). Washington, DC: IFPRI

Other references linking nutrition, gender and health

Meinzen-Dick, R., Behrman, J. Menon, P., & Quisumbing, A. (2011) *Gender: A key dimension linking agricultural programs to improved nutrition and health*, in *Leveraging Agriculture for Improving Nutrition and Health*. 2011, IFPRI: New Delhi, India.
<http://www.ifpri.org/sites/default/files/publications/2020anhconfbr09.pdf>

Richards, E., Theobald, S., George, A., Kim, J. C., Rudert, C., Jehan, K. & Tolhurst, R. (2012) Going beyond the surface: Gendered Intra-household bargaining as a social determinant of child health and nutrition in low and middle income Countries. *Social Science & Medicine*.
<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22809796>

Kerr, R. B., Berti, P. R. & Shumba, L. (2011). Effects of a participatory agriculture and nutrition education project on child growth in northern Malawi. *Public health nutrition*, 14, 1466-1472.
http://journals.cambridge.org/download.php?file=%2FPHN%2FPHN14_08%2FS1368980010002545a.pdf&code=9f373423fcdf8de5d1724b76fbc7feb

Keywords: targeting women; nutrition; decision making


Value chains and ‘empowerment’

Reference to various methodologies for integrating gender into value chain approaches (e.g. Gender Action Learning System) were found during this review. However no consolidated reports of evidence of impact has yet been located on gender and value chains, except perhaps the preliminary report from IFPRI-ILRI (below). Three other reports are outlined which may be interesting to review in more detail. The eLearning module will be taking a look at other resources on gender and value chains.

(i) IFPRI-ILRI Gender, Agriculture, and Assets Project (GAAP)

This research under the Gender, Agriculture, and Assets Project (GAAP) jointly implemented by the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) and the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI), brings out initial findings of the impact of value chain development projects on men’s and women’s abilities to accumulate assets. The projects of focus are dairy in Bangladesh and Mozambique implemented by CARE/Bangladesh and Land O’Lakes; horticultural crops in Burkina Faso implemented by Helen Keller Institute, and the expansion of orange flesh sweet potato production by HarvestPlus in Uganda.

According to the authors, preliminary findings suggest that the agricultural interventions studied have successfully increased the stock of both men’s and/or women’s tangible assets, but particularly those assets jointly owned. The projects have also increased the stock of social and human capital, particularly for women. By providing training and facilitating the return of benefits to the women who are producers and suppliers, the projects follow principles for gender-equitable value chain development. Each study emphasizes the role of investments in human and social capital through training programs and the formation and management of different types of farmer associations —as facilitating the accumulation of other types of physical and natural assets. The authors highlight that other targeted support to the farmers’ groups may be needed to translate these gains into ability to purchase physical assets to expand agribusinesses and enter the non-production nodes of



the value chain. The development and operation of a value chain appears to influence the way that people are both able to accumulate assets and the specific assets in which they are able to invest.

Robustness of evidence

Strong. Builds on research and impact/baseline reports from the four case studies. The review of the Uganda project is based on the impact evaluation report of the (REU) project in Mozambique and Uganda (de Brauw et al. 2010) and ongoing work under the GAAP project (e.g., Gilligan et al. 2012). The CARE Bangladesh evaluation uses two counterfactual comparison groups (eligible non-beneficiary farmers in areas where the *Strengthening the Dairy Value Chain* Programme operates and eligible farmers in areas without chilling plants). The evaluation of the Mozambique dairy value chain case study compares early and late recipients of dairy cows. This discussion draws on the baseline (Ahmed et al. 2009) and midterm reports (Alam et al. 2011), findings from the qualitative work, and tabulations of imputed baseline assets data for *Strengthening the Dairy Value Chain* and the draft qualitative report (Waithanji et al. 2011) for Land O'Lakes. Both horticulture value chain project information stem from reports from a randomized control trial evaluation methodology, involving quantitative baseline and endline surveys and qualitative studies.

References

Quisumbing, A. Rubin, D., Manfre, C., Waithanji, E., van den Bold, M. Olney, D. and Meinzen-Dick, R. (2013). Closing the Gender Asset Gap: Learning from value chain development in Africa and Asia. Paper developed for the UN Foundation and ExxonMobil Foundation research collaboration on “Building a Roadmap for Women’s Economic Empowerment”. Unpublished manuscript, International Food Policy Research Institute.

Keywords: Value chains; livestock; dairy; horticulture; assets; gender

(ii) A methodology for gender sensitive value chain development, Oxfam Novib

Potential of study

Gender Action Learning System (GALS) is an innovative community led methodology developed with an IFAD grant and support to Oxfam Novib, for gender-sensitive value chain development (Mayoux, 2012). It was piloted in Uganda under the WEMAN Programme, spearheaded by Oxfam Novib. GALS consists of a series of simple, pro-poor, visual diagrams that are used by a team of trained facilitators to help poor women and men farmers to critically reflect together on their livelihoods and identify what are the changes that need to be pushed forward in different spheres of their life — at the household, community and the market level — in order to increase production and income. Having been initially piloted in Uganda, it is now replicated in several other African countries.

Robustness of evidence

No evidence located yet. There may be some evaluation studies on GALS available from IFAD or Oxfam Novib.


References

Mayoux, L. (2012). Gender mainstreaming in value chain development: Experience with Gender Action Learning System in Uganda. *Enterprise Development and Microfinance*, 23(4). 319–37

Web references

<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/feature/ruralwomen/ifad-good-practice.html>

www.wemanresources.info



<https://webapps.ifad.org/members/eb/107/docs/EB-2012-107-R-8-Rev-1.pdf>

http://www.wemanglobal.org/2_GenderActionLearning.asp

The report on IFAD effectiveness 2012:

http://www.ifad.org/pub/ruralyouth/youth_policybrief.pdf highlights GALS

Keywords: participatory approach; poverty; gender sensitive value chain

(iii) KIT, Agri-ProFocus and IIRR, an empowerment matrix

Laven and Pyburn (2012) have outlined details of key issues around gender sensitive value chains, and provide an “*engendered value chain empowerment matrix*” as a framework, which may be useful to gauge how value chain interventions are faring.

What the report highlights

The ‘engendered value chain empowerment matrix’ was used to analyse 25 case studies of women in agricultural value chains. The matrix includes the following four dimensions: chain activities, chain governance, agency (women’s capabilities), and structure (contextual and institutional opportunities for change). From the case studies, there are several examples of women who took on increased leadership positions as part of their productive activities and subsequently engaged in leadership activities within their communities. Most case studies include examples of women who have increased their paid employment, which can likely be attributed at least in part to the fact that the projects emphasized women’s involvement in value chains. Also, in some examples, men increased their contributions to domestic work, easing women’s responsibilities within the home.

Robustness of evidence

The case studies are largely qualitative and describe examples of projects or business activities within value chains where women’s involvement and equity were emphasised.

Reference

Laven, A. & Pyburn, R. (2012) *Challenging chains to change: Gender equity in agricultural value chain development*. KIT Publisher.

<http://www.kitpublishers.nl/net/KITPublicatiesoutput/ShowFile2.aspx?e=2008>

Keywords: case studies; empowerment matrix; gender sensitive value chain

(iv) Improving opportunities for women in smallholder-based supply chains: case studies

Man-Kwun and Barrientos (2010) produced a guide for businesses working with women smallholders in value chains. The guide and case studies were commissioned by Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation.

What the report highlights

Although there are solid ethical reasons for seeking to redress gender imbalances, this guide sets out the business case for a focus on women smallholders in supply chains. Detailed case studies of seven projects and initiatives in Africa that have adopted innovative measures to improve opportunities for women in smallholder-based supply chains are presented. The guide provides practical guidance for companies on how to address the constraints that women producers face. The guide also strives to convince businesses about the importance of addressing gender issues in their smallholder supply chains.



Robustness of evidence

The guide is based on findings from research conducted by the authors between July 2009 and March 2010. The study included: internet research conducted on approximately 30 global food companies and their existing programs and activities to support smallholders in Africa; a review of existing international development literature on the constraints faced by women smallholders and effective methods for addressing these constraints. Over 60 references were reviewed overall. Telephone and face-to-face interviews with U.K.–based and U.S.–based representatives of 11 international food companies were conducted to learn more about their current smallholder support activities, specific initiatives to support women smallholders, and the business case for supporting these activities. Field visits to Ghana, Kenya, Uganda, and Tanzania took place to interview stakeholders and identify the lessons and achievements from seven projects that have adopted innovative measures to support women farmers.

Reference

Man-Kwun, C. and Barrientos, S. (2010) Improving opportunities for women in smallholder-based supply chains: business case and practical guidance for international food companies: case studies. Report prepared for the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation. <https://docs.gatesfoundation.org/Documents/gender-value-chain-guide.pdf>

Keywords: case studies; business focus; women and value chains

Effectiveness of grants for ‘empowerment’

Agricultural interventions often require particular strategies to increase the adoption of such technologies. One such strategy is to provide smallholder with grants. These grants may improve shortcomings in systems and stimulate farmer engagement in technology generation and general agricultural innovation. Grants can be direct or indirect drivers of change, often allowing individuals and groups to plan themselves to undertake activities they would otherwise have not been able to do. There is little systematic research on the impact and effectiveness of smallholder grants on gender and empowerment, particularly grants that stimulate increasing technology adoption and innovation. Two reports are worth examining with regard to grants for innovation.


(i) Effectiveness of Innovation Grants on Smallholder Agricultural Producers

Ton et. al., (2013) have completed a systematic review of the effectiveness of grants on smallholder agricultural producers. One hypothesis has a specific reference to women, but the summary findings are quite general with little explicit attention to gender.

What the report highlights

This systematic review examined the effectiveness of grants on smallholder agricultural producers with particular focus on the outcomes for poor people and women. Outcome patterns of innovation grants were looked at on two levels: those directly, influencing farmer practices and livelihoods, and/or indirectly, changing the innovation system that the farmer is taking part of. The systematic review covered three modalities of disbursing these grants to smallholder farmers and their organisations: vouchers, competitive grants and farmer-led innovation support funds.

The hypothesis that had a gender focus was that *Farmers’ livelihoods, and in particular those of the poor and women, start to change as a result of the improved agricultural practices enabled by these inputs and services.* The studies show positive impact on key elements of the farmer livelihoods, except when prices fall in response to an increase in production in a context of limited markets outside the production area. The content of a ‘one size fits all’ technology package supplied through a voucher system could constrain



agricultural innovation, while offering a menu of options to choose from would enhance innovation. The authors concluded that there is *moderate support* for this hypothesis in the studies reviewed.

Robustness of evidence

The methodology consisted of a search for in-depth studies on agricultural innovation including small holder agricultural producers or agricultural service providers. The review team used a systematic search in electronic data-bases to capture studies from different disciplines and geographical areas, published until January 2012. The synthesis was based on 20 impact studies and makes reference to another 42 largely qualitative studies.

Reference

Ton G, de Grip K, Klerkx L, Rau M-L, Douma M, Friis-Hansen E, Triomphe B, Waters-Bayer A, Wongtschowski M (2013) Effectiveness of innovation grants to smallholder agricultural producers: an explorative systematic review. EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London.

Keywords: innovation in agriculture; grants

(ii) Empowering Rural Women through ICT - GenARDIS Grant

GenARDIS was a collaborative project on Gender, ICTs and Agriculture, to change rural women's lives. CTA (Technical Centre for Agricultural and Rural Cooperation ACP-EU) was the main channel for these grants. GenARDIS made 34 grants of €7000 in 21 different countries.⁸

What the evaluations highlight

According to evaluation reports, the GenARDIS project both catalyzed change on the ground and build capacities around gender and implementation of rural ICT projects through grants of €7000.

The report highlights 15 ways to change rural women's lives and illustrates how institutions who received the €7,000 grant actually made a difference. For example better fish conservation techniques lead to more business in Benin. Thirty leaders from women farmers organisations in the province of Sissili in Burkina Faso interacted with computers for the first time and acquired skills that will allow them to better manage their revenue-generating activities (mostly small-scale farming) and learned to use tools that will help them to train other women (e.g. using presentations; digital photography). After the training they were also in a stronger position to promote their interests and concerns in mixed (male and female) farmers federations, where women were traditionally seen as "weak". They were able to present information on their farming activities in a more effective way. In Cameroon, mobile phones allowed rural women to access official information and thus buy subsidized potato seeds. The rural women saw a 3% increase in their revenue over the previous year. In the DRC's border region of Uvira, women's cassava root crops were being destroyed by pests, but women used the internet to find out more about the pests. Women were provided with mobile phones in order for them to contact potential buyers.

⁸ CTA along with IDRC, HIVOS, IICD and APC (Association for Progressive Communication). CTA promotes the integrated use of communication channels, old and new, to improve the flow of information (e.g., e-communities, web portals, seminars, and study visits) and builds ACP capacity in information and communication management (ICM), ICT for Development (ICT4D) mainly through training and partnerships with ACP bodies and other international organisations.



Robustness of evidence

Good - evidence body from CTA and independent evaluations. Moderately confident about quality.

References

GenARDIS (2010) *2002-2010: Small grants that made big changes for women in agriculture*. Published by APC. <http://genardis.apcwomen.org/en/node/149>
http://genardis.apcwomen.org/uploads/Genardis_EN_web.pdf-1.pdf

Keywords: ICT; innovation in agriculture; grants; women focus

EnGENDER IMPACT website, World Bank

The World Bank launched a new website in September 2013 enGENDER IMPACT. This website brings together information about WB-related *Gender Impact Evaluations*.

What the website highlights

The Gateway informs on evidence-based approaches to policy and programme design with rigorous evaluations. There are over 160 impact evaluations, supported by the World Bank Group identified, which contribute to better understanding of what works to advance gender equality and women's empowerment. The initiative was started with the intent of making lessons from these evaluations more easily accessible to staff, clients, partners, and other stakeholders.

Evaluations in enGENDER IMPACT are organized around five key outcome areas:

- Reducing health disparities
- Shrinking education and skills gaps
- Increasing economic opportunities
- Boosting voice and agency
- Addressing gender-based violence

Each outcome area can be searched for a rural development and gender focus. An additional page with "*Issue Briefs and Resources*" will also be added. This resource page should provide short, user-friendly summaries of key policy or methodological lessons. The website was just launching at the time this report was being written.

Reference

The gateway is at www.worldbank.org/engenderimpact

Keywords: impact evaluation gender

DFID evaluations which had their final reports in 2012/13

DFID conducted a gender review of their evaluations, which had their final reports in 2012/13. This report is forthcoming and should be interesting for DFID e-learning. About 70 evaluations identified for the review of evaluations related to the economic empowerment of women and girls. It would be necessary to draw out those evaluations that have a rural empowerment focus.

Keywords: economic empowerment



Programmes that benefited rural women workers - ILO

The ILO indicated that a forthcoming review / report will be completed by mid 2014 to outline evidence of how ILO Technical Cooperation has benefited rural workers, including rural women workers. The ILO Evaluation Unit provided nine evaluation reports that had a focus on gender/rural women/empowerment.⁹

The ILO also provided examples of support to cooperatives that benefited rural women, such as the Coop Africa programme.¹⁰ The lessons learned from these programmes should be examined in more detail to understand how support can be provided to rural women workers.

Keywords: rural women workers; rural infrastructure; rural employment

⁹ Titles of ILO Evaluations:

- (i) Promoting freedom of association and collective bargaining rights in the rural & export processing sectors: 08/2009-12/2011 Final Evaluation.
- (ii) Nias Islands Rural Access & Capacity Building Project Final evaluation Indonesia. 12/2012
- (iii) Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE) Project. Pakistan & Philippines. Mid-term Evaluation. 01/2005
- (iv) Support to sustainable rural infrastructure development services for poverty reduction in the Asia Pacific Region. Final Evaluation.
- (iv) Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women (EEO) Viet Nam. Final Evaluation 12/2006 Report of Independent.
- (v) Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women Cambodia and Vietnam (EEO) Final Evaluation 07/2008.
- (vi) Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women (EEO) Cambodia Chapter Final Evaluation 03/2007.
- (vii) Investment Budget Execution Support for Rural Infrastructure Development and Employment Generation Midterm Evaluation Timor Leste 01/2009.
- (viii) Recuperación del empleo a través de apoyo a la creación y consolidación de micro y medianas empresas en el marco de estrategias de desarrollo económico local Uruguay. 12/08 Final evaluation.

¹⁰ See for instance:
www.ilo.org/coopafrica
http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/ent/coop/africa/download/woman_eastafrica.pdf
http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/ent/coop/africa/download/women_day_coop.pdf
http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/ent/coop/africa/download/woman_voice_march.pdf



SECTION 3

Evaluation reports – useful for short case studies

Many evaluation reports were sent by individuals in bilateral agencies, and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) as examples of providing evidence of impact. This Section contains some example of such evaluation reports. These evaluation reports may be useful for developing short case examples in e-learning materials, bearing in mind that the body of evidence to support the statements in these evaluation reports can be variable. This is not to say these evaluation reports do not provide a body of evidence within the context of an 'end of programme' evaluation.

DFID evaluations

DFID sent six evaluation reports (not in 2012/13 review) that may be worth considering and that could feed into future work. These are:

1. **Care Adaptation Learning Programme (Africa)**
2. **Burma Livelihoods & Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT)**
3. Darfur Community Stability Fund
4. Uganda World Food Programme's Livelihoods Programme, Karamoja
5. Sustainable Agriculture Research for International Development (SARID)
6. Bangladesh CHARS Livelihood Programme

What the evaluations highlight

Gender is a particular focus in the **CARE Adaptation Learning Programme** in Africa (ALP) (no. 1 in the list above). There was evidence reported on progress towards gender equity at community level, but more clear and scaled-up evidence needs to be documented by ALP to inform and support advocacy for integrating gender issues in climate change policy. ALP needs a stronger framework, gender skills, planning, review and analysis tools, and resource persons to strengthen activities (must increase focus on gender dynamics within collecting targeted evidence, in building up its models, and reporting).

Some interesting findings emerged in terms of female participation in **Burma LIFT** activities (no. 2 in the list above) and the impact on livelihoods /intra-household relations. Female involvement was mostly adequate, although there were occasional complaints of only one member per household being invited (resulting in lower female participation). Many of the activities for vulnerable households were specifically targeted at women, therefore they were the primary recipients of the benefits. This was case for home gardening, revolving funds, self-help groups and many income-generating training & input provisions (e.g. tailoring, beauty salon, grocery store, etc.). When discussing specific effects of activities on women, a key finding reported was a sense of 'independence' and 'influence' over their husbands because of the support received.

Robustness of evidence

Medium to limited, as body of evidence based on evaluation reports only, but may be worthy of further investigation.



References

Nottawasaga Institute (2012) Adaptation Learning Programme (ALP) CARE International Mid-term Review Final Report November 2012

Barcm, V. Nils Riemenschneider, N. with Shaw, K. Nu Hlaing, H., Htwe, E., Htet, L. and Htun, M. (2012? No date on report). Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – Delta 1 Evaluation Final Report. DFID, UK.

Keywords: participatory approaches; targeted interventions; livelihoods; food security

FAO livestock evaluation

FAO recently carried an internal gender stocktaking exercise - consolidated information on FAO's performance in mainstreaming gender equality in their work during 2011-2012. The evaluation below on women and livestock in Afghanistan may hold potential for further study.

What the Afghan poultry project highlighted

A Poultry Project was one of the components of World Bank funded integrated Horticulture and Livestock Project (HLP) in Afghanistan. An evaluation of the Poultry Sub-component of HLP demonstrates some important issues around a focus on vulnerable rural women in Afghanistan. The objective of the project was to enhance productivity, stimulate production, and to develop and strengthen the national poultry production strategy as an effective tool for providing economic opportunities and empowerment of women. The project established 25,000 small-scale layer units for 25,000 rural vulnerable women in Afghanistan in 10 provinces.

Afghanistan's poultry sector consists of family/household small-scale poultry production as well as a re-emergence of a larger scale poultry production sector. This project has worked on establishing business linkages between these two sectors and links between the veterinary field services vested in the village units and the poultry farmers. It has made some progress in this field, but more and more targeted attention is required to firmly establish these linkages. The organisational model of Village Poultry Production Group (VPPGs) and Village Group Leader (VGLs), which has been used now for the last 11 years, has shown mixed results, whereby in some cases the VGL when assisted by her husband seems to have developed her private business out of the service provision to group members. In other cases after the project lifetime and the support from poultry trainers finishes, women resort back to purchasing their inputs. Careful planning for a focus on women is thus required in a programme of this nature, along with very targeted support. It is important to build on existing groups and opportunities for women economic empowerment. For example adult literacy and microfinance development projects could make use of the same groups.

Robustness of evidence

Limited based observations and three-person evaluation team.

Source of FAO evaluations

FAO (2012) *Consultancy Services for Poultry Subcomponent of Horticulture & Livestock Project – UTF /AFG/051/AFG*. FAO Office or Evaluation.
http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/UTFAFG051AFG_2012_MR.pdf

Keywords: targeted invention; poultry; women



USAID evaluations

USAID collected many relevant evaluation reports from agency gender advisors and USAID staff and has gathered USAID research publications and/or evaluations that could be relevant to this enquiry. Some of these should be examined in more detail. Three examples are included below.

(i) USAID Family Farming Program Tajikistan

In 2013, USAID provided a revised scope of work for the Family Farming Program that focused on four activity areas:

- Improving water provision for agricultural production;
- Researching, testing, and disseminating food production and utilization practices;
- Improving household economics and water access points; and
- Supporting research and advocacy for policy reforms that enhance food security.

What the evaluation highlights

Both women and men are key decision makers regarding what crops to plant. It is important to target both women and men in agricultural extension and nutritional education programs, as well as focus on the nutritional benefits of diverse crops and livestock production for healthy child development. Women were not aware of or convinced of the economic and nutritional benefits of improved agricultural practices. Given low educational levels among female members of the household, any extension materials should be developed in easy-to-understand formats. Interventions should encourage and work with women to participate more in community forums.

The report noted the following recommendations applicable to donors working to improve food security:

- Low levels of understanding among female survey respondents about their rights underscores the need to offer training separately for female beneficiaries on economic rights for women, land succession rights, and finance/credit access.
- Women who bring children to the field during work hours would benefit greatly from childcare and nutrition training.
- Survey results showed that many of the small businesses opened by families were unsustainable and closed quickly. This suggests that an Enterprise Group approach could facilitate knowledge-sharing among women on products, experiences, and technology that could help connect them with new market outlets.

Robustness of evidence

The survey (12 southwestern districts of Khatlon Oblast, Tajikistan) was designed to take a “snapshot in time” of females within the target population. The sample population consisted of 300 households within 30 *jamoats* across the 12 FFP targeted districts in Khatlon. The assessment used a purposive and snowball sampling design. Ten households per *jamoat* were identified based on one of three criteria: (1) households with female heads of household; (2) households with females actively engaged in or leading village activities, or (3) households with particularly low economic status. Because this sampling method is not randomized, the findings are not representative of the larger population. The survey instrument was adapted from an early version of the *Women’s Empowerment in Agriculture Index* (WEAI). Questions from WEAI were used to interview individuals and semi-structured focus groups. All respondents were female. The survey included all six modules of the WEAI in their entirety. These six modules focus on: household demographics; public engagement of female household members; women’s rights in the family and community; and women’s empowerment related to land, livestock, and business activities. Enumerators then asked 11 open-ended questions on female education and entrepreneurship to provide context to the



WEAI-survey responses. The assessment was funded by USAID and implemented by DAI.

Reference

Yaminova, M. (2013) Winrock International. USAID Family Farming Program Tajikistan: Assessing the role of women in rural areas of Tajikistan. August 2013. DAI, USAID

Keywords: household level; voice; WEAI

(ii) USAID Accelerating Sustainable Agriculture Program (ASAP)

In Afghanistan, involving women in projects can be difficult. The Accelerating Sustainable Agriculture Program (ASAP) included over 80,000 women in training programs, supported 11 women's groups and involving women in newly established businesses. ASAP probably may have had less success in the extension of technologies than anticipated. A number of women's organisations (5) were supported through the programme, who continue to support their members and achieve increasing benefits for their family households. Women were involved in many of the ASAP supported training programs, ranging from horticulture to cashmere to poultry rearing and weaving, including 83,000 women out of 516,000 participants. ASAP supported a number of other activities to improve the knowledge base of women, provided technical skills, encourage their involvement in various businesses, and assist them with management and marketing skills. The evaluation report contains a summary of ASAO women's activities from the annual reports (2008-2011).

Robustness of evidence

Variable, depends on methodology in each evaluation

References

Cecchi and Company Consulting, Inc. (2012) *Accelerating Sustainable Agriculture Program (ASAP) Final Performance Evaluation* April 2012. USAID

Keywords: targeting women; targeted interventions

(iii) USAID Nepal Flood Recovery Program Evaluation Report December 11, 2012

Women's economic empowerment was reported to be enabled through access to production surplus and increased cash incomes. This was one of 12 key findings in the evaluation report. Overall the report stated that there was extensive engagement of women in the program activities (training, production and sales), which has 'empowered' them and have positively influenced family nutritional intake.

Robustness of evidence

Variable, depends on methodology in each evaluation

References

Adhikari R. Kantham, S., Chaudhary, B. & Tumbahangfe, A. (2012) *Nepal Flood Recovery Program (NFRP) Evaluation Report*. December 11, 2012
http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PDACU698.pdf

Keywords: targeting women; nutrition



ADB evaluations

The Asian Development Bank provided a range of evaluations for this report. Unfortunately these evaluations were received very late. Nevertheless they following should be reviewed in more detail. Three are included below.

What the evaluations highlight

The evaluation reports sent were believed to have generated impact because they adopted an innovative approach to rural women; or applied a gender lens as an entry point; or tailored interventions during implementation; or supported rural women to diversify their livelihoods. These ADB projects had gender strategies.

(i) ADB Sustainable Livelihoods in Barani Areas Project, Punjab

This Project (2004 - 2013) aimed to focus on improving the economic livelihood of the population of dryland areas in rural Punjab province by improving access to inputs and markets; enhancing water storage, conservation, and conveyance; and diversifying the sources of income, while at the same time overcoming fundamental barriers to economic development such as illiteracy. The project had a focused gender strategy. During project implementation, female staff was contracted for 20% of the total person months. In addition, women's employability was improved through off-farm income generating skill training and access to microcredit. The Government of Punjab's evaluation report noted a significant decline in the unemployment rate of the sample women beneficiaries from 77% to 43% as 84% of the women trained in stitching and/or embroidery and 74% of women with beautician and parlour management skills were employed. Female beneficiaries interviewed attest they now have better control over their incomes and thus, have a stronger voice in household decision making.


(ii) ADB The Gender Equality and Empowerment of Women Project, Nepal

This Gender Equality and Empowerment focused Project (2004-2013) in Nepal aimed to reduce poverty by empowering poor rural women and members of other disadvantaged groups, such as ethnic and low-caste women. A total 101,376 households have benefited from the project activities. The project provided training to 12,187 women from the project districts. Of the total trainees, 6,300 have utilized their training knowledge into their business practice. The average percent of microenterprise (ME) households is 86 percent. Savings and credit cooperative societies received seed grants and were found using loans for genuinely new enterprises or for growing existing ones. Income of households in general, and women in particular, has increased by two to three times after project implementation. Income level of men- and women- headed households has increased by 87.5% and 41.4% respectively.

Legal awareness campaigns took place also, with 82 village development committees with approximately 15, 000 men and women participating; curricula on gender and inclusive justice have been developed and 25 students have enrolled in Tribhuvan University; (3) 27 judges, 28 prosecutors, and 30 female police personnel (100% of the target) have been trained in women's legal rights issues. At least 3,677 women have registered their citizenship and 1,735 women have registered their marriage as a result of the legal awareness raising training. Nearly 76 percent female above 16 years have citizenship certificates; the number of marriage certificate holders almost doubled to 60 percent.

(iii) ADPB The Crop Diversification Project in Bangladesh

This project in Bangladesh (2000-2010) aimed to increase farm incomes through the production and marketing of high value crops, and the establishment of a partnership between the government agencies and NGOs. The project covered 16 districts and 60 administrative sub-districts of the Rajshahi Division. The project gender action plan (GAP)



which required 60% female participation in many activities. Out of the 326,020 beneficiaries who received training, 51% were females.

Women beneficiaries saw improvement not only in their personal earnings, savings and assets (ownership of cash grew by 19%) but also in their family status. About 16% of the female farmers group reported that involvement of women in decision making regarding the productions, post-harvest handling, sorting, cleaning and selling of high value crops increased considerably while 80% reported partial participation after joining project groups. About 35% reported a reduction in domestic violence while about 36% reported no violence after joining such groups.

Robustness of evidence

Variable – based on individual evaluation methodologies.

References

Punjab <http://www.adb.org/projects/34331-013/documents>

Nepal Gender Equality Project <http://www.adb.org/projects/34306-013/details>

Bangladesh Northwest Crop Diversification Project <http://www.adb.org/projects/32193-013/documents>

Also recommended

Nepal Rural Infrastructure Improvement Project: <http://www.adb.org/projects/31304-013/documents>

Keywords: gender project plans; gender focused project strategies; targeting women; legal, economic empowerment; poverty focus; enterprises

Gender equality and rural development- AusAID's approach

AusAid undertook a review of their work on rural development from a gender perspective, which was published in 2012. Their stocktaking found a lack of outcome data in their rural development programmes. The report states that many approaches are too process based. Nevertheless the report highlights the strength in allocating funds to benefit women directly and a strong belief that women's leadership within programmes is important.

What the report highlights

The report highlighted examples of direct economic benefits to women such as: The **Cambodia Smallholder Agriculture and Social Protection Program**, which offered stipends to 3000 poor pregnant women. The **BRAC Extreme Poverty Program in Bangladesh** has benefited more than 40 000 'ultra poor' rural women through intensive two-year support to establish micro enterprises. The BRAC programme provides stipends while businesses are being set up; provides weekly education and empowerment sessions with women; a focus on cattle and small livestock transfer as the basis for the business; and building household infrastructure such as toilets, wells and stables. Longitudinal research shows the program has a 98 per cent success rate in lifting women out of poverty and keeping them out of poverty.

Robustness of evidence

Limited as stocktaking exercise. If the report is to be used, the original AusAID reports would have to be located from each of the above projects.




Reference

Ferguson, S., Wiseman, B. (2012) *Gender equality and rural development —a stocktake of AusAID's approach and progress* September 2012. AUSAID
<http://www.usaid.gov/aidissues/foodsecurity/Documents/rural-dev-gender-stocktake.pdf>

Keywords: targeted interventions; funds for women; stipends

References

- Adhikari R. Kantham, S., Chaudhary, B. & Tumbahangfe, A. (2012) Nepal Flood Recovery Program (NFRP) Evaluation Report. December 11, 2012
http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PDACU698.pdf
- Ali, D. A., Deininger, K. & Goldstein, M. (2011). Environmental and gender impacts of land tenure regularization in Africa: pilot evidence from Rwanda. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series*, 5765. <http://elibrary.worldbank.org/doi/pdf/10.1596/1813-9450-5765>
- Arimond, M., Hawkes, C. Ruel, M.T., Sifri, Z., Berti, P.R., Leroy, J.L., Low, J.W., Brown L.R. and Frongillo E.A. (2010) Agricultural Interventions and Nutrition: Lessons from the Past and New Evidence. In: Thompson, B. & Amoroso, L. (2011). *Combating micronutrient deficiencies: food-based approaches*, CABI.
- Barcm, V. Nils Riemenschneider, N. with Shaw, K. Nu Hlaing, H., Htwe, E., Htet, L. and Htun, M. (2012? No date on report). Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – Delta 1 Evaluation Final Report. DFID, UK.
- Bernstein, J.T.W. (2013) Feed the Future Learning Agenda Annotated Bibliography: Improved Gender Integration and Women’s Empowerment. Feed the Future Feedback project. USAID. August 2, 2013.
http://agrilinks.org/sites/default/files/resource/files/FTF%20Learning%20Agenda%20Gender%20Annotated%20Bibliography_July%202013.pdf
- Brudfors U. (2008) Independent Evaluation of Support to Sustainable Rural Infrastructure Development Services for Poverty Reduction in the Asia Pacific Region (ASIST AP) RAS/04/12/SID Evaluation Office ILO. Available at:
<http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---edmas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms108633.pdf>
- Buvinić, M, Furst-Nichols, F & Courey Pryor, E, (2013), A Roadmap for Promoting Women’s Economic Empowerment, United Nations Foundation, ExxonMobil.
http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/sites/default/files/WEE_Roadmap_Report_Final.pdf
- Campos, F., Goldstein, M., McGorman, L., Nuno Boudet, A. & Pimhidzai, O. (2013) Breaking the metal ceiling: Female entrepreneurs who succeed in male-dominated sectors in Uganda. World Bank 2013
- Carpano, F, (2011) Strengthening Women’s Access to Land in IFAD Projects: The Rwanda Experience.
http://www.ifad.org/english/land/women_land/WomenAndLand_Rwanda_Report_Eng.pdf
- Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc. (2012) Accelerating Sustainable Agriculture Program (ASAP) Final Performance Evaluation April 2012. USAID
- CIP (2013) International Potato Centre News. http://cipotato.org/resources/publications/cip-newsletter/CIPNewsletter_July_2013.pdf
- Cissé, F. & Diatta, B. (2012) Story on economic rights in Senegal Women open the debate on access to land: the case of the rural community of Enampore in Ziguinchor, Senegal. Pg 111-119 in: Iman, A. & Kamminga, E. (2012) Women in search of citizenship: Experiences



from West Africa. KIT Publishers, The Netherlands.

http://www.kitpublishers.nl/net/KIT_Publicaties_output/ShowFile2.aspx?e=2042

Davis, K., Nkonya, E., Kato, E., Mekonnen, D. A., Odendo, M., Miiro, R. & Nkuba, J. (2010). Impact of farmer field schools on agricultural productivity and poverty in East Africa. *World Development*, 40, 402-413.

<http://www.ifpri.org/sites/default/files/publications/ifpridp00992.pdf>

Wu, D. (2013) Measuring Change in Women Entrepreneur's Economic Empowerment: A Literature Review. *The Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED)*

<http://www.enterprise-development.org/download.ashx?id=2259>

Dimova, R. & Gang, I.N. (2013) Good and Efficient? Women's Voice in Agriculture Institute of Development Policy and Management, University of Manchester and IZA, Bonn. Dimova, R. & Gang, I. (2013) The Productivity and welfare Implications of Female Empowerment through High Value Agriculture: What Role Can Interventions Play UN Foundation) *University of Manchester and Rutgers University* Authors find that female headship and land ownership are associated with females cultivating profitable cash crops.

Doss, C., Bockius-Suwyn, Z. & D'Souza, S. (2012) Women's Economic Empowerment in Agriculture: Supporting Women Farmers. UN Foundation. http://api.ning.com/files/y4dy-j9rq*gCepwdf7TaaELGzGL6nmYoBdpXceiw7nlWtbUr9J3t29G-oNqekwH6teyrY8LS7d1cL7XU4FLsK0du84WxFm**/WomensEconomicEmpowermentinAgriculture.pdf

Doss, C., Deere, C. D., Oduro, A. D. & Swaminathan, H. (2012) Women Who Save: A Comparative Analysis of Ecuador, Ghana and Karnataka, India. UN Foundation

FAO (2012) Consultancy Services for Poultry Subcomponent of Horticulture & Livestock Project – UTF /AFG/051/AFG. FAO Office or Evaluation.

http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/UTFAFG051AFG_2012_MR.pdf

FAO (2012). Office of Evaluation Programme Spécial de Sécurité Alimentaire (PESA) Soutien des politiques publiques et le renforcement des capacités pour améliorer la sécurité alimentaire en Angola sous le Plan d'Action National pour la Sécurité Alimentaire et la Nutrition. GCP/ANG/033/SPA April 2012

http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/GCPANG033SPA_2012_ER.pdf

Farnworth, C. (2010) Gender Aware Approaches in Agricultural Programmes. A Study of Sida-supported Agricultural Programmes. Sida Evaluation. Sweden

www.Sida.se/publications <http://www.oecd.org/countries/burkinafaso/46145893.pdf>


Farnworth, C. & Munachonga, M. (2010) Gender Approaches in Agricultural Programmes – Zambia Country Report A special study of the Agricultural Support Programme (ASP) UTV Working Paper 2010:8 Sida, Sweden

<http://www.sida.se/Global/Gender%20in%20Agriculture%20working%20paper%202010-8%20Zambia.pdf>

Ferguson, S. & Wiseman, B. (2012) Gender equality and rural development —a stocktake of AusAID's approach and progress September 2012. AUSAID

<http://www.ausaid.gov.au/aidissues/foodsecurity/Documents/rural-dev-gender-stocktake.pdf>

Friis-Hansen, E., Duveskog, D. & Taylor, E. (2012) Less noise in the household: the impact of Farmer Field Schools on Gender Relations. *Journal of Research in Peace, Gender and Development* (ISSN: 2251-0036) Vol. 2(2) pp. 044-055, February 2012



GenARDIS (2010) 2002-2010: Small grants that made big changes for women in agriculture. Published by APC <http://genardis.apcwomen.org/en/node/149>
http://genardis.apcwomen.org/uploads/Genardis_EN_web.pdf-1.pdf

Gilligan, D. C. McNiven, S. Musoke, C. Hotz, C. & Kiguli, G. (forthcoming) A bio fortification Program To Reduce Vitamin A Deficiency In Uganda *3ie Funded Evaluation*

Gillingham, P. (forthcoming) Rwanda Land Tenure Regularisation Case Study. *Evidence on Demand. DFID*

Hillenbrand, E. (2010) Transforming gender in homestead food production. *Gender and Development* Vol. 18, No. 3, November 2010 ISSN 1355-2074 print/1364-9221 online/10/030411_/15 – Oxfam GB 2010

IFPRI (2012) Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index. Feed the Future. The US Government's Global Hunger and Food Security Initiative. USAID, IFPRI, OPHI http://www.ifpri.org/sites/default/files/publications/weai_brochure.pdf

Kerr, R. B., Berti, P. R. & Shumba, L. (2011). Effects of a participatory agriculture and nutrition education project on child growth in northern Malawi. *Public health nutrition*, 14, 1466-1472.
http://journals.cambridge.org/download.php?file=%2FPHN%2FPHN14_08%2FS1368980010002545a.pdf&code=9f373423fcdf8de5d1724b76fbc7feb

Knowles, J. C. (2013) Increasing the Productivity and Earnings of Rural Women: What Works? UN Foundation Trust.


Laven, A. and Pyburn, R. (2012) Challenging chains to change: Gender equity in agricultural value chain development. KIT Publisher.
<http://www.kitpublishers.nl/net/KITPublicatiesoutput/ShowFile2.aspx?e=2008>

Lesser Blumberg, R., Dewhurst, K. & Sen, S. G. (2013). Gender-inclusive Nutrition Activities in South Asia: Volume 2. Lessons from Global Experiences. The World Bank. http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2013/08/20/000442464_20130820101220/Rendered/PDF/710890v20REVIS0balExperiences0FINAL.pdf

Majoor, H. & Ton, P. FAO (June 2012) Mid-term evaluation report Addressing HIV and Gender Inequities through a Food Security and Nutrition Response in Eastern and Central Africa - OSRO/RAF/010/SWE FAO Office of Evaluation (June 2012)
http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/oed/docs/OSRORAF010SWE_2012_ER.pdf.

Man-Kwun, C. and Barrientos, S. (2010) Improving opportunities for women in smallholder-based supply chains: business case and practical guidance for international food companies: case studies. Report prepared for the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation.
<https://docs.gatesfoundation.org/Documents/gender-value-chain-guide.pdf>

Manyire, H. & Apekey, A. D. (2013) Mainstreaming gender equality in African agricultural research and development: A study of constraints and opportunities. Forum for Agricultural Research in Africa
http://www.fao.org/docs/eims/upload/313434/Gender_equality_report_Ver05_lowres%20%282%29.pdf



Mayoux, L. (2012). Gender mainstreaming in value chain development: Experience with Gender Action Learning System in Uganda. *Enterprise Development and Microfinance*, 23(4). 319–37

Mehra, R. Patel, P. Shetty, A. & Golla A, (2012) Financial Services for Low-Income Women: Opportunities for Economic Empowerment? Revised Final Report December 19, 2012 International Center for Research on Women (ICRW) Washington.

Meinzen-Dick, R., Behrman, J., Menon, P., & Quisumbing, A. (2012). Gender: A key dimension linking agricultural programs to improved nutrition and health. In S. Fan and R. Pandya-Lorch (Eds.), *Reshaping agriculture for nutrition and health: An IFPRI 2020 book* (135-144). Washington, DC: IFPRI.

Meinzen-Dick, R., Behrman, J. Menon, P., & Quizumbing, A. (2011) Gender: A key dimension linking agricultural programs to improved nutrition and health, in *Leveraging Agriculture for Improving Nutrition and Health*. 2011, IFPRI: New Delhi, India.
<http://www.ifpri.org/sites/default/files/publications/2020anhconfbr09.pdf>

Menon, N. van der Meulen Rodgers, Y. & Huong N. (2014) Women's Land Rights and Children's Human Capital in Vietnam. *World Development*, 54, 18-31.

MRFCJ (2012) A New Dialogue: Putting People at the Heart of Global Development. Hunger, Nutrition, Climate Justice Conference Papers 15-16 April 2013 - Dublin, Ireland.
<http://www.mrfcj.org/pdf/hncj/conference-papers.pdf>

Mwetwa, C. (2012) Settings things right towards Gender Equality and Equity Final Evaluation Gender Equality & Women's Empowerment Namibia August 2012 MDG Achievement Fund. <http://www.mdgfund.org/sites/default/files/Namibia%20-%20Gender%20-%20Final%20Evaluation%20Report.pdf>

Nottawasaga Institute (2012) Adaptation Learning Programme (ALP) CARE International Mid-term Review Final Report November 2012, DFID UK.


Nyekanyeka, T., Kapalasa, E., Chipungu, F., Botha, BI and Abidin, P. (2013). Improving Food Security, Nutrition and Gender Empowerment. CIP, Malawi, Department of agricultural Research Services (DARS) and Irish Aid Malawi.

Padian, N. Gautam, M. & Msolla, M. (forthcoming) Enhancing Food Production and Food Security through Improved Inputs: An Evaluation of Tanzania's National Agricultural Input Voucher Scheme with a Focus on Gender Impacts Ongoing 3ie Funded Studies.
<http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/impact-evaluations/details/230/>

Quisumbing, A. Rubin, D., Manfre, C., Waithanji, E., van den Bold, M. Olney, D. and Meinzen-Dick, R. (2013). Closing the Gender Asset Gap: Learning from value chain development in Africa and Asia. Paper developed for the UN Foundation and ExxonMobil Foundation research collaboration on "Building a Roadmap for Women's Economic Empowerment". Unpublished manuscript, International Food Policy Research Institute.

Richards, E., Theobald, S., George, A., Kim, J. C., Rudert, C., Jehan, K. & Tolhurst, R. (2012) Going beyond the surface: Gendered Intra-household bargaining as a social determinant of child health and nutrition in low and middle income Countries. *Social Science & Medicine*.
<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22809796>

Rodgers, Y. & Menon, N. (2012) A Meta Analysis of Land Rights and Women's Economic Well Being. August 2012. Corresponding author: Yana van der Meulen Rodgers, Women's



and Gender Studies Department, Rutgers University, NJ 08901 Nidhiya Menon, Department of Economics & IBS Brandeis University, MA 02454

Sindi, K., Kiria, C., Low, J.W., Sopo, O., Abidin, P.E. (2013). Rooting out hunger in Malawi with nutritious orange-fleshed sweetpotato: A baseline survey report. Blantyre, Malawi. International Potato Center (CIP) <http://cipotato.org/publications/pdf/006116.pdf>

Stewart, R. Korth, M., Zaranyika, H., Rebelo Da Silva, N. Langer, L., Randall, N. van Rooyen, C. & de Wet, T. (2014 forthcoming). What is the effectiveness of agriculture interventions on agricultural investment, yields, and income for smallholder farmers in Africa? 3ie systematic review. <http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/systematic-reviews/details/244/>

Talukder, A., Haselow, N., Osei, A., Villate, E., Reario, D., Kroeun, H., Sokoing, L., Uddin, A., Dhunge, S. & Quinn, V. (2000). Homestead food production model contributes to improved household food security and nutrition status of young children and women in poor populations. Lessons learned from scaling-up programs in Asia (Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal and Philippines). *Field Actions Science Reports. The journal of field actions.*

Talukder, A., Sapkota, G., Shrestha, S., De Pee, S. & Bloem, M. W. Year (2004). Homestead Food Production Program in Central and Far-western Nepal Increases Food and Nutrition Security: An Overview of Program Achievements. *In: Home Gardens in Nepal: Proceeding of a workshop on "Enhancing the contribution of home garden to on-farm management of plant genetic resources and to improve the livelihoods of Nepalese farmers: Lessons learned and policy implications"*, 6-7 August 2004, Pokhara, Nepal. LI-BIRD, Bioversity International and SDC. Local Initiatives for Biodiversity, 2006. 27.

Tengnäs, B. Myles, A., Alffram, H. & Lundberg, M. (2010) Mapping and Review of SIDA's Assistance to Land Policy Reform, Land Administration and Land Governance. Naturbruk AB For Sida. http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/sites/default/files/file/16/02/2011_-_1252/Mapping_and_Review_of_SIDAs_assistance_to_land_policy_reform.pdf

Ton G, de Grip K, Klerkx L, Rau M-L, Douma M, Friis-Hansen E, Triomphe B, Waters-Bayer A, Wongtschowski M (2013) Effectiveness of innovation grants to smallholder agricultural producers: an explorative systematic review. EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London

Yaminova, M. (2013) Winrock International. USAID Family Farming Program Tajikistan: Assessing the role of women in rural areas of Tajikistan. August 2013. DAI, USAID

Yoong, J., Rabinovich L. & Diepeveen, S. (2012) The impact of economic resource transfers to women versus men. A systematic review. Technical Report. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London. <http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=q7MJCBgRUsQ%3d&tabid=3306&mid=6204>



Useful Websites

UN Women [Knowledge Gateway for Women's Economic Empowerment](http://www.empowerwomen.org/),
<http://www.empowerwomen.org/>

Country specific information available on MDG Achievement Funds for Gender Equality and women's Empowerment available at:
<http://www.mdgfund.org/content/genderequalityandwomensempowerment>

Helen Keller Homestead Food Production: <http://www.hki.org/reducing-malnutrition/homestead-food-production/>

Roadmap for Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment:
http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/sites/default/files/WEE_Roadmap_Report_Final.pdf

Databases of reports used in the Roadmap for Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment report (Buvinić et. al 2013)
http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/sites/default/files/Roadmap%20for%20Action_Evaluation%20Database.xlsx

Background papers for Roadmap for Promoting Women's Economic Empowerment (Buvinić et. al 2013) <http://www.womeneconroadmap.org/>

Gender and Value Chains

<http://genderinvaluechains.ning.com/page/publications-1>

<http://genderinvaluechains.ning.com/>

Promoting Gender equitable opportunities in Value Chains: <https://compartnetwork-genderinvaluechains.pbworks.com/f/Final%20GATE%20gender%20value%20chain%20handbook%20low%20res.pdf>

<http://wiego.org/resources/review-value-chain-analyses-commodities-and-horticulture-sectors>.

Evaluation websites

USAID evaluation can be located at the following website:
<https://dec.usaid.gov/dec/home/Default.aspx>

enGENDER IMPACT – A Gateway to Gender-Related Impact Evaluations.
<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTGENDER/0,,contentMDK:23457844~pagePK:210058~piPK:210062~theSitePK:336868,00.html>

Knowledge gateway for women's economic empowerment <http://www.empowerwomen.org/>

Poverty Action Lab:
http://www.povertyactionlab.org/search/apachesolr_search?filters=type:evaluation

The International Initiative for Impact Evaluation 3ie <http://www.3ieimpact.org/>
<http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/>



Harvard University's Women and Public Policy Program will launch the [Gender Action Portal](http://www.hks.harvard.edu/centers/wappp/for-scholars/gender-action-portal) to gender-related impact evaluations in 2014 <http://www.hks.harvard.edu/centers/wappp/for-scholars/gender-action-portal>