

Helpdesk Research Report

Democratic governance initiatives: civic education and media

Becky Carter

30.09.2013

Question

Links between democratic governance initiatives and poverty reduction: Please identify some examples of successful democratic governance interventions with a specific focus on supporting civic education and free and independent media, and how do these interventions impact on poverty reduction? Please do a short literature review with an emphasis on lessons learnt. Please also identify and summarise evaluations of implemented development programs.

Contents

1. Overview
2. Civic education
3. Free and independent media
4. Other references

1. Overview

This rapid review synthesises the **findings of successful democratic governance interventions** supporting civic education (seven cases) and a free and independent media (six cases)¹. The choice of cases to include has been limited. Not many evaluations of civic education and media initiatives are publicly available: many evaluations undertaken by or for funding donors are produced for donors' internal use and are not published. Some of the reports available provide only brief case studies and do not always

¹ The cases have been selected to provide a spread of country contexts (including fragile and post-conflict countries), a range of donors, and different types of interventions in terms of their objectives, scope (national/regional/community), methods, implementing arrangements and delivery techniques.

specify in detail the research methodology used. Others, especially more recent evaluations using experimental methods, do provide in-depth analysis and discussion of their methods².

It has been challenging to find evaluations that **explore the link between these initiatives and poverty reduction**. Most focus on the link between civic education/media and governance outcomes, but they do not tend to then go on to show the link between good governance and poverty reduction (expert comment)³. In some cases there are ambitious claims of transformational change without much explanation of the drivers involved and how the change is attributed to an individual intervention in the absence of a credible counterfactual. Other evaluations do not investigate governance outcomes, focusing instead on programme outputs and implementation lessons.

Looking in particular at **gender effects**, some of the cases do not report on this, but others do, with mixed findings. Two cases (one a civic education programme, the other a media intervention) reported a positive impact on women's political engagement, and another media intervention reported a better balance of women in the media and their access to justice. The same civic education programme also found impacts on greater educational opportunities for girls and less gender-based violence. Another civic education case did not, however, find any change in gender attitudes despite it being a focus of the educational programme.

A number of the cases included in this report identify **lessons learnt** which are relevant for interventions that seek to address poverty reduction, even while this link is not made explicitly in the evaluations themselves. Here is a synthesis of these key lessons:

Lessons learnt from successful civic education initiatives⁴

Objectives and scope:

- Studies recommend realistic objectives, given that changing entrenched attitudes will depend on changing incentives. Changing incentives is very difficult, and will take a long time.
- There is a need for careful targeting, considering the often scarce resources. One study found using a 'train-the-trainer' approach allowed the programme to extend its reach effectively, in particular to more remote rural communities.

Risks:

- Studies warn that peace education and dialogue can risk stirring up latent conflicts.

Delivery:

- It is important to get right the training of promoters and trainers. Programmes need to deal with issues of insufficient competence and motivation.
- Importance of making the messages and their delivery relevant, including through creative use of the arts (images, theatre, music, poetry) and the use of participatory teaching methods.

² Finkel (2013) finds that the use of experimental methods in evaluation is an increasing trend in the civic education sector.

³ The links between good governance and poverty reduction is discussed in a large separate body of literature. There is also another body of literature exploring the links between democratic initiatives and good governance (e.g. on media – Myers, 2012).

⁴ For a complementary synthesis of findings from evaluations of civic education approaches, see Browne (2013).

- Use opportunities provided by different contexts outside of schools (e.g. post-peace-agreement transitions, constitutional reforms and new elections) to make civic education relevant and meaningful.
- Move away from one-off events to multiple, continuous exposure, exploiting post-activity discussions among the wider community, and bolster with an intensive media campaign.

Monitoring and evaluation:

- Impact evaluations using rigorous evaluation methodologies can add to the knowledge base of what has and has not worked with civic education initiatives.

Lessons learnt from successful initiatives to support free and independent media:

Objectives and scope:

- Objectives and time horizons should be realistic, with clear, specific results in the short term.

Risks:

- In politically sensitive contexts the supporting organisation and/or media platform initiated needs to be, and be seen to be, impartial.
- Political discussion programmes should be lively but well-moderated to avoid inflaming tense situations.
- External factors can be supportive or challenging, including the political and legal framework, international community support, the level of poverty and education, level of infrastructure and the general standards of journalism.

Delivery:

- Involving local stakeholders and in particular the local implementing organisations in the design and ongoing development of initiatives, and providing core multi-year predictable support at a sufficient level, can facilitate organic and gradual growth, ownership and sustainability.
- Successful programmes have avoided development jargon and strive to be 'authentic', through understanding local communities' perceptions of their own information needs.
- Committed, skilled staff and leadership are important, as is sustained support by the government, international community, and other local media professionals.

Monitoring and evaluation:

- Develop early baselines where possible and conduct ongoing audience research.

2. Civic education⁵

Case 1: UNDP Trust Fund for Civic Education in Angola

Background: Launched in 2006 this UNDP project aims to: 1) empower civic stakeholders by expanding democratic participation through civic education; and 2) improve the financial, technical and managerial capacity of civil society organisations (CSOs) (UNDP, 2008, p.5). The project disburses grants for civic education projects to Angolan CSOs, closely monitoring the implementation process to build CSO capacity through an ‘on-the-project’ learning process (UNDP, 2008, p.5). The project is funded by NORAD, Sida, UNDP and USAID (M’Cormack, 2011).

Results: The mid-term review (Orre and Larsson, 2008, pp. 4-5) commends the outstanding performance of the project support unit which quickly set up and implemented monitoring and evaluation processes and carried out ‘an impressive schedule’ of training and follow up for the organisations involved.

Impact on poverty reduction: UNDP (2008) and Orre and Larsson (2008) do not mention the programme’s impact on poverty reduction.

Lessons learned: General lessons identified in the mid-term review (Orre and Larsson, 2008, p. 5) include:

- Addressing the challenges provided by the highly variable organisational capacities of the various CSOs and training needs of their staff.
- Considering careful targeting as the project covered only 1 per cent of the registered electorate.
- Working out how best to train and motivate promoters, considering that many were perceived to be insufficiently competence and/or motivated.
- Using innovation to enhance the relevance of the messages conveyed and their delivery for.

The review also made specific recommendation for running the grants scheme, suggesting for example that CSOs are asked for brief concept notes rather than fully-fledged proposals, and those CSOs with successful concept notes are then given technical assistance to develop full proposals (p.14).

Sources:

- M’Cormack, F. (2011). *Approaches to civic education in Africa* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. Retrieved from: <http://www.gsdr.org/docs/open/HDQ772.pdf>
- Orre, A. and Larssen, C. (2008). *How can the elections help us quell hunger? Final Report. A mid-term review of Norwegian support to UNDP’s trust fund for civic education*. Retrieved from: <http://mirror.undp.org/angola/LinkRtf/CE-ER2008.pdf>
- UNDP Angola (2008). *Support to civic education (UNDP project no. 00052948). Annual report 2007*. Retrieved from: <http://mirror.undp.org/angola/LinkRtf/Civic-Education-AR2007.pdf>

⁵ Some of the examples are taken from two previous GSDRC helpdesk reports: M’cormack (2011) and Browne (2013). The civic education cases have been selected to provide examples of general civic education, rather than a more narrow focus on elections and voter education.

Case 2: Community Empowerment Program (CEP) – Peace Education in Rural Liberia

Background: The CEP was a community education campaign on civic education, human rights, and community collective action. The overall aim was to ‘impart knowledge and skills to foster dialogue and non-violent conflict resolution’ (Blattman et al, 2011, p.2). UNHCR and a Liberian non-profit organization, the Justice and Peace commission (JPC), implemented the program in 67 conflict-prone communities reaching over 9,000 people.

Results: Innovations for Poverty Action’s (IPA) two-year impact evaluation of the programme, using a randomized controlled trial, reports that ‘the education campaign stimulated dialogue and provided some skills and knowledge for non-retributive dispute resolution’ ((Blattman et al, 2011, p.3).

Impact on poverty reduction: The report does not mention poverty or poverty reduction.

Lessons learned: Blattman et al (2011) identify several success factors including the intensity and reach of the programme, its emphasis on safe and non-violent discourse, and concurrent programmes also promoting alternative dispute resolution (p.3). They also identify a set of key lessons (p.4):

- ‘Without any fundamental change in incentives or institutions’, campaigns relying on ‘information and education alone’ may have ‘marginal’ effects on changing ‘entrenched attitudes’.
- Peace education and dialogue can be risky as it can be ‘strikingly easy [...] to stimulate contentious dialogue and activate latent conflicts’.
- The first step is ‘admitting that attitudes are hard to change, and that traditional systems and human rights are sometimes directly in conflict’.
- Given that achieving results on a large scale is expensive because of the risks and the difficulty of change, policymakers need to decide what is the best use of (often scarce) security and justice resources.

Blattman et al (2011) conclude by recommending ‘close monitoring and evaluation of success, and of different approaches, [...] with continued experimentation with intensity, reach, curriculum, out-of-classroom facilitation, economic components, and other program aspects’ (p.4).

Sources:

- Blattman, C., Hartman, A. & Blair, R. (2011). *Can we teach peace and conflict resolution? Results from a randomized evaluation of the Community Empowerment Program (CEP) in Liberia: A program to build peace, human rights and civic participation*. Policy Report 2011.2. Innovations for Policy Action and Yale University. Retrieved from: https://www.poverty-action.org/sites/default/files/blattman_hartman_blair_can_we_teach_peace_ipa_liberia_0.pdf

Case 3: Promoting youth participation in Indonesia

Background: The Center for Civic Education, California and the Center for Civic Education, Indonesia collaborated with the US Department of State from 2007-09 to build a network of Indonesian educational institutions and religious organizations, NGOs, and regional education offices with the capacity to adapt and implement two educational programmes (called Project Citizen and Foundations of Democracy) (Center for Civic Education, 2009, pp. 4-5).

Results: An evaluation of the programme finds that it was effective (Center for Civic Education, 2009, p.5). Both of the educational courses led to changes in students' attitudes, with students on the Foundation of Democracy course expressing their opinions and using critical thinking (p.8). The evaluation of the Project Citizen course found that participants 'were significantly more likely to become politically engaged than their peers in the control classes' (p.25), with a significant increase in students' belief in their own ability to effect change in government and community institutions (p.53).

Impact on poverty reduction: The impact on poverty reduction is not directly explored, but the evaluation reports an array of transformational changes, including 'strengthening local representative government; fostering the knowledge, attitudes, and political skills necessary for engaged citizenship; promoting gender equality and increased respect for human rights and the rule of law' (Center for Civic Education, 2009, p.5).

Lessons learned: Two success factors are identified by the evaluation of the Foundations of Democracy programme: 1) that the curriculum was compatible with primary civic education standards and competencies, increasing the programme's 'use and the likelihood of institutionalization', and 2) that it filled a gap in informal Indonesian education, as most extracurricular programmes tend to offer social activities only (p.22).

Sources:

- Center for Civic Education (2009). *Evaluation Report. Promoting Youth Participation in Local Government in Indonesia: An Evaluation of the Kami Bangsa Indonesia and Dasar Dasar Demokrasi Programs*. Center for Civic Education. [Not available on the web. Copy shared.]

Case 4: United States Institute of Peace (USIP) – civic education programme, South Sudan

Background: Levine & Bishai (2010) provide a brief case study of the United States Institute of Peace's (USIP) civic education programme in South Sudan. Launched following the 2006 peace agreement, the programme delivered a series of voter education and citizenship skills workshops aimed at mixed audiences (p.10). The aim was to spread understanding of civic rights and duties 'quickly and broadly through key sectors of Sudanese society' (p.10). Methods included putting on a play about voter education (which was funny and reflected local dialogue and customs); providing a programme of interactive electoral violence prevention workshops; other training on democratic values and conflict management skills; and a conference on changing the civic education national curriculum (pp.10-13).

Results: Levine & Bishai (2010) conclude that 'civic education concepts and techniques have proven welcome and needed in Sudan' (p.14). They list a number of detailed results, including:

- The 'train-the-trainer' approach extended the EVP content's reach into the countryside and created a skilled group of trainers, many of whom went on to facilitate pre-election local community forums and continue to be a resource for USIP's local partners (p.13).
- Invitations for high-ranking members of the police to speak at the workshops on their view of the role of police in ensuring peaceful elections led to an EVP program at the police academy training centre in Khartoum, providing 'a much-needed opportunity for Sudanese citizens to question a police representative in neutral and safe surroundings' (p.13)

- The conference, however, was not able to secure commitment from key stakeholders; the recommendations remained ‘aspirational’ and plans for a follow-up conference were indefinitely postponed (p.12).

Impact on poverty reduction: The impact on poverty reduction is not mentioned.

Lessons learned: Levine and Bishai (2010, p. 14) identify some issues for consideration:

- Creative use of the arts (theatre, music, poetry) can be effective in reaching different sectors and making the message memorable, but its effectiveness is reduced considerably when recorded.
- ‘Addressing civic education in a national curriculum is a long-term project and requires patience and determination’.
- Civic education can build bridges by bringing together groups, such as the police and civil society leaders, especially when they share an interest in understanding civic issues such as elections.
- Civic education can be taught effectively in many different contexts: post-peace-agreement transitions, constitutional reform, and new elections all provide opportunities to make civic education relevant and meaningful.

Sources:

- Levine, D.H. & Bishai, L.S. (2010). *Civic education and peacebuilding: Examples from Iraq and Sudan*. United States Institute of Peace Special Report 254. United States Institute of Peace. Retrieved from:
<http://dspace.cigilibrary.org/jspui/bitstream/123456789/29751/1/Civic%20Education%20and%20Peacebuilding.pdf?1>

Case 5: Kenya’s National Civic Education Programme II (Uraia)

Background: The first national civic education programme (NCEP), called ‘Uraia’ (‘citizenship’ in Swahili) started in 1999 and was replaced by the second programme from 2006-7 which in turn ended to make way for focused voter education in the run-up to the national elections (Finkel, 2009, p.1). For NCEP II, 43 Kenyan CSOs grouped into four consortia delivered approximately 79,000 workshops, poetry/drama events and other public events, as well as an extensive media campaign on democracy, governance, and rights-related topics. Approximately 10 million people were involved in some form of face-to-face civic education activities while many more were reached via the new and innovative mass media component (Finkel, 2009, p.2).

Results: An impact evaluation of NCEP II undertook a post-treatment cross-sectional survey of 3,600 total respondents (with participants and ‘matched’ non-participants) one year after the programme and the intervening political violence (Finkel, 2013, p.4). The study finds that:

- Participants in the programme were ‘significantly more knowledgeable about politics, [and] more participatory at the local level’ (Finkel, 2009, p.6).
- There were, however, limited effects on strengthening attitudes to rule of law, and on issues such as HIV/AIDS, gender and the environment that had figured prominently in the programme’s curriculum (p.6).
- There was extensive exposure to messages in the mass media (in particular through the radio programming) but no significant impacts were found from this (p.7).

- The size of the programme expanded many CSOs' reach and enhanced their capacity, but the evaluation concluded, however, that 'the program's impact on Kenyan civil society was not [...] transformational' (p.8).

Impact on poverty reduction: The evaluation does not mention poverty or poverty reduction.

Lessons learned: The evaluation identifies a number of recommendations to maximize the impact of future civic education programmes, including (pp.11-14):

- Focus the content on topics that 'resonate with the Kenyan public' (p.10).
- Improve the training of facilitators, use participatory teaching methods, and stimulate multiple and continuous exposures to civic education activities.
- Facilitate post-activity discussions by programme participants with people within and outside of their immediate social networks.
- 'Develop a more targeted, frequent, and intensive media campaign' (p.12).
- 'Make more aggressive use of the new information technologies, and in particular the internet and mobile communications' (p.12).
- Recognize that there may be multiple programme goals and 'integrate these goals into programme organisation, planning, and implementation', while 'recognising trade-offs and potential tensions between multiple goals' (p.12).
- 'Reconsider the relationship between civic education goals and the advocacy activities' of programme CSOs (p.13).
- Devote 'more effort to impact assessment using appropriately rigorous evaluation methodologies' (p.14).

Sources:

- Finkel, S. (2009). The Second Kenya National Civic Education Programme II (URAIA): Goals, findings and recommendations from participant and civil society impact assessments. Washington, DC: USAID. Retrieved from: http://marsgroupkenya.org/pdfs/2011/01/AID_EFFECTIVENESS/Documents/CSO_and_Aid_Effectiveness/NCEP_II_Summary_Impact_Evaluation_Report_May_20_2009.pdf

Case 6: 'Boîtes à Images' sessions, the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC)

Background:

The Voter Opinion and Involvement through Civic Education Program (VOICE) was implemented by the US International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES) to improve the capacity of the Congolese people to participate in the ongoing decentralisation of the DRC (Finkel, 2012, p.1). The civic education-related activity of the programme delivered 'Boîtes à Images' sessions in four provinces in 2010-2011, using simple drawings to communicate messages and facilitate two-hour long discussions with groups of 100 people.

Results: An experimental-methods evaluation (comparing participating and control communities) was undertaken for the sessions that took place in 2011 in Bandundu province. The study finds strong effects on political knowledge and awareness (Finkel, 2013, p.9), with 'substantial gains in knowledge about the decentralization process at the village level' (Finkel, 2012, p.2), and more general political knowledge, but

little impact on political attitudes, and no-spill over effects onto non-participants (p.4). The most significant effects were found when there was higher perceived quality of the session and facilitators (Finkel, 2012, p.5). Finding that participants' acquired knowledge appeared to decrease over time, the study questions whether single 'Boîtes à Images' sessions can have a transformational impact (p.6).

Impact on poverty reduction: Not mentioned.

Lessons learned: The study makes the following recommendations for civic education design, implementation and evaluation (pp.7-8):

- Images and visuals can be 'effective means for the transmission of basic civics information related to decentralization and democratic political processes in rural populations characterized by relatively low levels of adult literacy'.
- Multiple exposures to civic education treatments are necessary for enduring effects, and in particular for 'altering orientations, attitudes and political engagement'.
- 'Greater emphasis should be given to the training of facilitators and to improving the general organization of civic education treatments'.
- 'Future programs should emphasize post-treatment discussions of participants to maximize the possibilities of spill over effects'.
- Future evaluations should use experimental designs 'to make more credible causal inferences about program effects, while recognizing potential limitations in certain settings'.

Sources:

- Finkel (2012). Impact Evaluation of the VOICE program in the Democratic Republic of the Congo. Washington, D.C.: IFES. Retrieved from: http://www.ifes.org/Content/Publications/News-in-Brief/2012/Sept/~//media/Files/Publications/Reports/2012/VOICE_2012_Impact_Evaluation.pdf
- Finkel, S. (2013). *The impact of adult civic education programmes in developing democracies*. WIDER Working Paper No. 2013/064. UNU-WIDER 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.wider.unu.edu/publications/working-papers/2013/en_GB/wp2013-064/

3. Free and independent media

Case 1: Nepal – Common Questions programme

Background: BBC Media Action reports that the DFID-funded 'Sajha Sawal' (Common Questions) was launched in 2007 and has an audience of 5.8 million adults – nearly one in three adults in Nepal (Vallance, 2012). Broadcast on TV and radio, the 45-minute weekly programme brings different political leaders and government officials before a live audience to answer questions.

Results: The BBC Media Action research summary finds that the programme, which has a strong reach, has been 'successful at increasing levels of civic knowledge and political engagement and action amongst its audience' and 'holding Nepal's government to account' (Vallance, 2012, p.1). It reports that 'the main strengths of Sajha Sawal are its inclusiveness and unbiased nature' (p.1). Audiences, however, want it to do more to follow up with politicians over time to enhance accountability (p.2).

Impact on poverty reduction: The research summary does not detail the impact on poverty reduction.

Lessons learned: The research summary lists lessons learned including:

- 'Future media development initiatives should use TV and radio and avoid use of newspapers.
- Radio should be used to increase reach within rural areas and minority communities, as radio shows higher penetration amongst these communities.
- Cross-marketing of the programme on TV and radio could help improve its impact.
- The inclusiveness (covering all relevant issues) and unbiased nature (giving equal importance to audience and panellists) of Sajha Sawal content is liked by its audience and should be maintained in the subsequent shows.
- Most respondents felt the programme should initiate a follow-up programme where the panellists can be re-invited to explain their actions on commitments.
- Partner organisations require further training in business development skills in order to be more effective in seeking and securing sponsors and ensuring that the programmes continue running successfully.'
- Journalists found learning through practice (rather than only through classroom training) was the most effective part of the training

(Vallance, 2012, p.2)

Sources:

- Vallance, P. (2012). *Research Summary. Encouraging peace and good governance through the media in Nepal*. BBC Media Action. Retrieved from:
http://downloads.bbc.co.uk/mediaaction/pdf/research_summaries/BBCMA_RS_Nepal_august_2012.pdf

Case 2: Dialogue on Bangladesh programme

Background: Bangladesh Sanglap ('Dialogue on Bangladesh') was launched in 2005 by the BBC World Service Trust in partnership with the BBC Bengali Service and the satellite television station Channel I, to increase access to, and participation in, current affairs debates. The weekly programmes allow citizens to question Bangladeshi politicians and other senior figures on air. Recent programmes take place in rural locations, enabling isolated and impoverished communities to challenge politicians and debate issues affecting them (DFID, 2008, p.5).

Results: The BBC World Service reports that the programmes reach a weekly audience of more than 7 million people in the country. In-house research finds that '86 per cent of the audience felt that the programme improved political dialogue in Bangladesh, 89 per cent felt it explained issues in ways that people could understand, 91 per cent believed provided an opportunity to raise the voice of the people, and 86 per cent felt the programme established a good standard for political discussion on radio and TV' (DFID, 2008, p.5).

Impact on poverty reduction: Not mentioned.

Lessons learned: Devries (2011) reports that ‘key personnel involved with creating the Bangladesh Sanglap model identify the following five key elements for replication’:

- Given the sensitive political context, ensuring the platform is, and is seen to be, neutral – implemented by an organisation with a reputation for impartiality and with a balanced panel and audience.
- Ensuring that debate is constructive as well as lively; attention needs to be paid to avoid inflaming tense public order situations. The programme moderator plays a key role.
- Using ‘authentic language’ understood by project beneficiaries, and avoiding development ‘jargon’.
- Investing in audience recruitment to ensure a politically- and gender-balanced audience.
- Undertaking audience research to ‘inform the choice of debate topics and the future development of the programme’.

Sources:

- BBC World Service Trust (no date). *Bangladesh Sanlap*. London: BBC World Service Trust. Retrieved from: http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/MediaBroad/bangladesh_sanglap.pdf
- DFID (2008). *Media and good governance: a DFID Practice Paper*. London: Department for International Development. Retrieved from: <http://www.gsdrc.org/docs/open/innovations-in-accountability/IA5.pdf>
- Devries, K. (2011). *Bangladesh Sanglap*. The Communication Initiative Network. Retrieved from: <http://www.cominit.com/content/bangladesh-sanglap>

Case 3: USAID support to FM radio stations in South Sudan and the Three Areas

Background: With USAID support and managed by Internews, five small FM radio stations were established at the time of the 2005 Comprehensive Peace Agreement, covering what is now South Sudan and the regions known as the Three Areas.

Results: An evaluation of the initiative (de Masi, 2011) concludes that ‘the Internews stations have been effective in providing an open forum for dialogue and debate at the local level’ (p.5).

Impact on poverty reduction: An overwhelming majority of 750 survey respondents ‘believed that several desirable outcomes could be attributed to their local FM radio stations, including increased voter participation, greater educational opportunities for girls, less gender-based violence, and reduced social conflict generally’ (p.5). Moreover, de Masi (2011) reports that ‘the stations gave voice to women (including one who ran for and won elective office), to marginalized minorities and the poor, and promoted social trust and solidarity’ (p.6).

Lessons learned: The evaluation’s main recommendation is for media assistance organizations to make audience research ‘integral to their work’ (p.6). De Masi (2011) finds that ‘Information is most likely to promote positive change when media assistance providers... understand what local populations themselves perceive to be their information needs’ (p.6). Recommendations include developing early baseline measures and conducting ongoing audience research. De Masi finds that the challenge is learning how to do that in a development context such as South Sudan where the logistical obstacles can

be daunting, and more generally, how to undertake effective monitoring and evaluation given resource constraints (p.6).

Source:

- De Masi, S. (2011). *When does information change lives? An evaluation of community radio development in South Sudan and the Three Areas*. Internews. Retrieved from: http://www.internews.org/sites/default/files/resources/InternewsWP10Sudan.web_.pdf

Case 4: Independent Television in Kosovo

Background: In 1999, after the withdrawal of Serbian forces, USAID and a US NGO IREX working in close partnership with the Open Society Institute (OSI), began a programme to establish two independent television stations (RTV21 and KTV) to provide Kosovo's citizens with news and information (Kalathil, 2011).

Results: In a brief case study reported by Kalathil (2011) by 2008, RTV-21 and KTV 'had reached financial viability... and were considered leaders in news and public affairs programming' (p.62).

Impact on poverty reduction: Not mentioned.

Lessons learned: The success is thought to be driven by the following factors:

- Close coordination of IREX, USAID, and OSI, through developing joint work plans and sharing funding.
- Provision of multiyear operational and equipment support to the stations, on the basis of a self-developed long-term strategic plans.
- A 'whole station' approach that included long-term management training and mentoring, development of financial management and accounting systems, regular audience research and training in the use of research and long-term journalism training (pp.62-3).
- Involving the stations in developing training and consultancy plans 'to ensure full buy-in and agreement from management and ownership' (p.63).
- Dynamic and committed leadership in the stations.

Source:

- Kalathil, S. (2011). *Developing independent media as an institution of accountable governance. A how-to guide*. Washington D.C.: World Bank. Retrieved from: <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTGOVACC/Resources/Mediatoolkit.pdf>

Case 5: UNDP/UNESCO Media Development Project (MDP) in Mozambique

Background: This programme supported the development of an independent media in Mozambique from 1998-2006. Executed by UNESCO with UNDP support, six donors provided USD 14 million funding (Disch, A. & Taela, K., 2010). The programme took on a wide range of issues, with a focus on capacity building. (p.25) Over time it concentrated much of its resources on community resources, seen as 'useful to expand the reach of media outside of large urban areas, as well as 'strengthening the use of vernacular languages and getting more community involvement in defining the contents and producing it' (p.26).

Results: A working document for the general evaluation of Norwegian support concludes that the project was 'a success' as it strengthened the strategic capacity of key media actors and 'through this has contributed to improved access to information and freedom of expression' (Disch, & Taela, 2010, p.33). The study cautions, however, that 'attributable results are difficult to document' and 'net benefits may be considerably less than the more enthusiastic supporters would like to believe' (p.33).

Impact on poverty reduction: There is no specific mention in the study of the impact of poverty reduction, but there are relevant findings of 'positive spill-over effects' of the programme, including a positive impact on: 'women in the media, but also in access to justice; strengthening civil society; promoting human rights; supporting democratic elections; and contributing to public oversight' (p.33).

Lessons learned: The evaluation identifies the following key factors behind the success of the programme (pp.31-2):

- Key stakeholder participation in the design of the programme led 'to political acceptance by all and firm donor financial commitments for an exceptionally prolonged project period' (p.31).
- The project team was highly qualified, hard-working, and remained in post throughout the project period.
- The key stakeholders – UN, donors, government, RM, local media and media professionals – were on the whole committed and provided sustained support.
- The level of funding gave local actors confidence in the project, critical to its longer-term impact
- The project was adjusted to the changing environment and therefore remained relevant.
- There were a number of positive external factors, including favourable political and legal framework conditions; considerable financial and technical resources provided by a interested international community.

There were, however, some issues (pp.31-2):

- 'The time horizon and resource levels, the expectations on sustainability and impact were unrealistic, and documentation of results was weak' (p.31).
- In addition the local UNESCO office could have been 'more pro-active and supportive' (p.31).
- The evaluation also identifies external challenges, including: the overall poverty including low level of education; poor infrastructure which drove up production and distribution costs and restricted the coverage of print media and radio; and the generally poor quality of journalism.

Sources:

- Disch, A. & Taela, K. (2010). *Democracy support through the United Nations. Report 10/2010 – Evaluation Mozambique Case Report*. Retrieved from: <http://www.oecd.org/derec/norway/48086830.pdf>

Case 6: IPDC support for community radio, Nepal

Background:

UNESCO's International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC) has supported community radio in Nepal since 1993, playing a key role in the establishment of the country's first independent broadcaster and other radio stations (IPDC, 2008a, p.3).

Results: With community radio expanding from one station in 1997 to nearly 90 at the end of 2007, IPDC reports that its support has catalysed the growth of the sector ‘by promoting replicable models, establishing precedents and benchmarks, and building the capacity of key organizational players’ (IPDC, 2008a, p.3).

Impact on poverty reduction: The impact on poverty reduction is not investigated.

Lessons learned: Findings from an external evaluation of the IPDC’s contribution to community radio in Nepal – summarised by the IPDC – include (IPDC, 2008a, p.7):

- IPDC played an important role in realizing a strong sense of local ownership over its community radio, building global capacity, and ensuring that the sector’s growth has been ‘gradual, organic and, perhaps most importantly, sustained’.
- Local organisations generally implement IPDC projects within their existing organizational and human resource frameworks, which mean the projects do not require unsustainable additional staff or infrastructure, and they do not introduce external structures or international salaries.
- IPDC projects benefited from having ‘specific objectives and tangible outputs’ which ‘emphasize concrete results that clearly contribute to media development in the short term’.
- IPDC is respected for being non-partisan while UNESCO is ‘as an unbiased source concerning best practices of community radio from the South Asia region and internationally’.

Sources:

- Pringle, I. and Subba, B. (2007). *Ten years on: the state of community radio in Nepal. A Report prepared for UNESCO*. Retrieved from: http://portal.unesco.org/geography/en/files/7991/11966615215State_of_Community_Radio_in_Nepal_abridged.pdf/State%2Bof%2BCommunity%2BRadio%2Bin%2BNepal_abridged.pdf
- IPDC (2008a). *Pioneering community radio. Impacts of IPDC assistance in Nepal*. Retrieved from: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0015/001585/158500e.pdf>

Additional references:

- Evaluation summaries of this and other UNESCO IPDC programmes from Palestine, Guatemala are found in IPDC (2008b). *Evaluation reports on the projects selected by the IPDC Bureau. Intergovernmental Council of the IPDC Twenty-sixth session, 26-28 March 2008*. Paris: UNESCO.

Case 7: Sweden’s support to the media in Vietnam

Background: Since 2000 Sweden has supported the Vietnamese media through two projects, one for local radio and the other providing training for journalists. The local radio project, implemented by the government-managed Voice of Vietnam with the support of Swedish Radio, provided training to over half of the 60 provincial radio stations. The training project, managed by the Ministry of Culture and Information with technical assistance from the Swedish Institute for Further Education of Journalists, provided training to more than 1,200 of the 11,000 accredited journalists in the country. (McGillivray et al, 2012, pp.96-97)

Results: The brief case study in McGillivray et al (2012) states that ‘Sweden’s support to the media during this period, and subsequently, has been a success’ (p.99). Radio stations’ live broadcasts increased, resulting in dramatically increased calls and audience participation (pp.99-100), and improved capacity of

the local radio stations (p.100). Moreover, Sweden's support for the training of journalists 'is widely seen as having made a significant contribution', resulting in more development news (p.100).

Impact on poverty reduction: The impact on poverty reduction is not mentioned.

Lessons learned: The case study does not focus on lessons learned. It does, however, highlight that there were 'concerns over the sustainability of many stations given the costs of the equipment and the ongoing shortages of resources' (p.100) and challenges related to the political sensitivities involved (p.101).

Sources:

- McGillivray, M., Carpenter, D. and Norup, S. (2012). *Evaluation study of long-term development co-operation between Vietnam and Sweden*. Sida.

4. Other references

Browne, E. (2013). *Civic education: approaches and efficacy*. (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 947). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.

<http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=947>

Finkel, S. (2013). *The impact of adult civic education programmes in developing democracies*. WIDER Working Paper No. 2013/064. UNU-WIDER 2013. Retrieved from:

http://www.wider.unu.edu/publications/working-papers/2013/en_GB/wp2013-064/

Myers, M. (2012). *Is there a link between media and good governance? What the academics say*.

Washington, D.C.: Center for International Media Assistance. Retrieved from:

<http://cima.ned.org/publications/there-link-between-media-and-good-governance-what-academics-say>

Expert contributors

Caroline Sugg, BBC Media Action

Suggested citation

Carter, B. (2013). *Democratic governance initiatives: Part 1 – civic education and media* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1004). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.

About this report

This report is based on two days of desk-based research. It was prepared for the Australian Government, © Australian Government. The views expressed in this report are those of the author, and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of GSDRC, its partner agencies or the Australian Government.

The GSDRC Research Helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of key literature and of expert thinking in response to specific questions on governance, social development, humanitarian and conflict issues. Its concise reports draw on a selection of the best recent literature available and on input from international experts. Each GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report is peer-reviewed by a member of the GSDRC team. Search over 300 reports at www.gsdrc.org/go/research-helpdesk. Contact: helpdesk@gsdrc.org.