Helpdesk Research Report

Evidence on outcomes of an inclusive societies approach

Evie Browne, Becky Carter, William Avis and Dana Blackburn

08.07.2015

Question

What is the evidence on outcomes from applying an inclusive societies approach?

Contents

1. Overview

Background

This paper is a rapid literature review of evidence about inclusive outcomes. This review contains 80 studies which have some evidence of inclusive outcomes. These range across sectors, such as the political sphere, health, and education; across groups, such as people with disabilities, women and ethnic minorities; and across indicators, such as increased growth, school enrolment, and policy changes. Because of this wide spread of outcomes, there is a broad evidence base from which to draw. Due to the large number of papers included in this review, these are presented in an annotated bibliography format,

with summaries focusing on the aspects of inclusive societies covered in the study. The studies are grouped by type of intervention.

Interventions to create inclusive societies

Intervention	Consistency of evidence included in this review	Likely impact(s) found in the literature included in this review
Macro level literature	Mixed	Legislation can result in social cohesion; human development; inclusive growth
Service delivery	Consistent	Increased community participation; local ownership; state legitimacy
Inclusive education	Consistent	Improved outcomes for children with disabilities, and other marginalised groups
Citizenship, participation & social movements	Mixed	Increased democracy; societal ownership of issues
Community-driven development	Mixed	Community ownership of development projects; social cohesion
Inclusion in statebuilding / peacebuilding	Mixed	Increased stability; reduction of outbreaks of conflict; groundwork for longer-term inclusion
Women's inclusion in politics	Mixed	More democratic representation; possibly more gender-equal policy and legislation
Social protection	Consistent	Increased school enrolment and completion; increased use of healthcare services

Key findings

From the literature included in this rapid review:

- The **macro level literature** highlights some relevant global reports and wide-ranging conceptual papers. These indicate that a wide variety of interventions have had some impact on social inclusion.

- The **inclusive service delivery** literature, mainly impact evaluations and one systematic review, shows that programmes have been effective in increasing access to services for marginalised groups. Outcomes are measured in terms of social inclusion, rather than inclusive society per se.

- The word 'inclusion' in the literature in this report is overwhelmingly used to refer to **people with disabilities[1]**. This literature search therefore encountered a strong bias towards programmes and evidence on disability, specifically on making schools more inclusive for children with disabilities. The literature, mainly programme evaluations, emphasises that **inclusive education** is well-tested and known to support better outcomes for children with disabilities, as opposed to special or segregated schooling. Other interventions supporting inclusion in schools have benefited children without disabilities.

- Many of the studies highlight the need for **enfranchisement, community, and voice** as prerequisites for successful inclusion outcomes. Citizenship, participation and social

---

[1] In the literature on inclusion more widely, 'inclusion' has a much broader focus than just disability. This report filtered results based on whether they included clear evidence, so it is possible that it is only the evidence-based literature which has a bias towards disability rather than other forms of exclusion.

movements provide examples of where democratic processes have helped citizens claim inclusion in political, social and economic processes.

- Evidence on **community-driven development** interventions is mixed. Some programmes have increased social inclusion, while others have not. Generally, these interventions can increase participation in development projects, but do not change the underlying social dynamics of inclusion. This literature is mainly programme evaluations, largely driven by the World Bank.

- There is strong negative evidence to support the idea that **exclusionary political settlements are likely to lead to violence.** It is difficult to provide positive evidence for this link, as the chain of causality would be that an inclusive settlement prevents outbreaks of violence, and this absence is impossible to measure. The evidence on this suggests that inclusive political settlements are important as a starting point for inclusive societies. This literature is more case study based or historical.

- There is some evidence to suggest that **political inclusion** has positive effects. The outcomes measured are usually numbers of marginalised groups participating in various political processes, with much less evidence on what difference this participation makes. These process indicators are useful for measuring participation, but do not offer information on the wider impacts of such participation.

- There is a significant stream of work on **women's participation in political processes**. The main messages from this are: there is strong theoretical and practitioner support, but limited evidence about what impact or outcomes women's participation has. The emphasis should be on quality not quantity, i.e. what women do when in power, not how many of them are there. This literature is more case study based or historical.

- There is strong evidence on the effectiveness of **social protection** programmes on increasing human development for marginalised children. These studies do not draw explicit links with contributions to more inclusive societies.

- The most rigorous evidence comes from three systematic reviews, which focus on health and education outcomes. Two of these studies find that social protection schemes increase enrolment in schools for marginalised children, and the other study finds that community accountability mechanisms have little impact on inclusive service delivery.

- In general, the literature is **missing the conceptual link** between interventions which improve short-order outcomes such as educational achievement or political participation, and how these outcomes might contribute to an inclusive society.

- The phrase 'inclusive society' is rarely used in the literature.

- Several types of **intervention** stand out as being effective for social inclusion: inclusive education for children with disabilities; community-driven development; including women (and others) in political processes; and social protection.

Defining inclusive societies

An 'inclusive societies approach' is defined by DFID as an approach that leaves no one behind by ensuring opportunities for all: "a world where no-one is left behind, and where all women and men, girls and boys have equal opportunity to realise their rights, achieve their potential and live in dignity, free from extreme poverty, stigma, discrimination and violence" (DFID 2015 internal scoping paper)

This includes supporting inclusive economic, political and social institutions, tackling the structural barriers that keep some people from opportunity and tracking progress across different population groups. Success will be getting to zero on poverty and achieving development outcomes across all economic and social population groups (Carter, 2015).

In the literature reviewed for this report, 'inclusion' is most often used to refer specifically to the inclusion of people with disabilities. The term 'inclusive society' is not yet in common usage in the wider international development literature.

Scope of the review

This review identified studies which are evidence-based and provide lessons on what works.

This means that the studies had to give some detail on whether intervention outcomes actually had an impact on inclusivity, not just that they aimed to be inclusive. These studies provide empirical evidence on what has worked, and exclude studies which only provide recommendations, policy guidance, normative work or descriptive / exploratory research. The focus of the search process was therefore on programme evaluations, impact studies, and evidence reviews. The review excludes papers on high-income contexts, although there may be some transferable lessons. Full details on the review's methodology are in Annex A.

Since this review focuses on rigorous evidence, the key findings are quite **biased towards easily measureable or commonly implemented programmes**. Social protection, gender equality interventions and improved schooling are all commons forms of intervention which have some impact on inclusive societies. However, there is also a body of emerging literature which looks at the more indefinite aspects of inclusion, such as inclusive political settlements, or theories of change for creating social cohesion. The literature presented here is a reflection of what the search terms found, not the relative importance or significance of different issues. This mapping of the evidence base also provides information on where further research may be useful, to establish theories of change and whether approaches have important effects that are not yet measured.

Additionally, since this review took a rigorous approach, many papers were excluded on the basis that they did not report their methodology in sufficient detail. There is a significant body of useful literature which has been excluded from this report, which provides case studies, literature overviews, and guidance or best practice. The wider reading on inclusive societies indicates that large swathes of development strategies and interventions aim to increase social inclusion in some way, while these may not all report on their outcomes in a rigorous fashion.

Arguably, all gender equality progress contributes to inclusive societies. This review does not cover the broader body of literature on **gender equality**, as the search process did not specifically look for studies on women's inclusion (or that of any other specific groups). Nor does it cover microfinance and women's economic empowerment, except when there are rigorous findings which specifically detail the contribution this has made to inclusive societal outcomes. The areas of gender equality research that are most explicitly about inclusive societies are women's political participation; women's participation in peace negotiations and peacebuilding; and girls' schooling.

There are many studies which look at how to increase **school enrolment and completion**. In principle, these outcomes should contribute to an inclusive society if more marginalised children are attending and completing school. However, as noted above, this outcome is mostly implicit in these studies and not

drawn out with an explicit theory of change on inclusive societies. There is a large body of literature on increasing school attendance in low and middle-income contexts, which is not covered comprehensively here, except when there is evidence presented through an inclusivity lens.

This review did not specifically search for inclusion in **political processes**, either in formal, national-level politics, local government, or 'small-p' politics. Women's inclusion in politics emerged as a distinct sub-category through the general search on inclusion, and thus is presented here as a separate section. There is a body of literature which looks specifically at political issues and the inclusion of marginalised groups.

As noted above, this report did not search for specific identity categories, such as LGBTQI; ethnic minorities; religious minorities; or disability.

Limitations of this review

This rapid review is not based on an exhaustive search of the evidence base; its scope was limited by time and resource constraints. The search strategy was targeted to prioritise studies which provide primary or secondary evidence.

The topic of 'inclusive society' is broad and can encompass a range of issues and outcomes. Further research could map the state of the evidence on a number of different areas within this broad topic.

Other areas

This report identified several other search criteria and areas of interest which may contain further useful lessons on inclusive societies. These were not included as search terms in this report. These are:

- Social cohesion; trust; participation; social movements; community development; social integration; social capital; inclusive citizenship.
- Affirmative action; stigma; discrimination; minorities; identity.
- Transitional justice; statebuilding; state legitimacy; democracy; disarmament, demobilisation, reintegration.
- Inclusive development; inclusive growth.

2. Macro level literature

World Development Report 2013: Jobs

World Bank. (2012). Washington, DC: World Bank. http://dx.doi.org/10.1596/978-0-8213-9575-2

Crosscountry analysis of values surveys finds that job loss or lack of access to jobs is associated with lower levels of trust and civic engagement. Unemployment can cause depression, increase mistrust in others, and lead people to drop out of community life. Migrants without social ties may be excluded from job opportunities that would allow them to succeed in their new environments. In extreme cases, if people, particularly youth, lack jobs and hope for the future, they may turn to violent or criminal activity. Similarly, jobs offering limited opportunities for future growth or lacking access to voice can lead to alienation and frustration. Some jobs are positively correlated with social cohesion. Jobs that are empowering, build agency, and provide access to voice can increase trust and people's willingness to

participate in civil society. Jobs can create economic and social ties and have the potential to build incentives to work across boundaries and resolve conflict. And people's trust in government and their confidence in institutions may increase if they believe that job opportunities are available to them either now or in the future. Jobs can influence social cohesion through their effects on social identity, networks, and fairness.

Excluded and Invisible: The State of the World's Children 2006
UNICEF (2006). New York: UNICEF

http://www.unicef.org/sowc06/pdfs/sowc06_fullreport.pdf

This UNICEF report discusses the root causes of the exclusion and invisibility of some children, and how the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) can be met so that they are included and protected. The report draws on data collected from within the UN system and without to highlight examples of exclusion. The report notes that exclusion acts against children in all countries, societies and communities and that several factors increase the risk of children becoming 'invisible', including: lack or loss of formal identification; inadequate state protection for children without parental care; the exploitation of children through trafficking or forced labour; the premature entry of children into adult roles such as marriage, hazardous labour and combat.

The report comments that a stronger focus is required to reach out to those children currently excluded, highlighting the following as key:

- Access to essential services must be increased, meaning both short-term, 'quick impact initiatives' and longer term, sustainable projects. Participation from all stakeholders is required, and national capacity must be increased to maintain these initiatives through legislation, budgets, research, and programmes.

- Key elements of a protective environment include: strengthening the capacity of families and communities to care for children; ensuring access to basic social services; government commitment to child protection by making budgetary provision, social welfare policies, and legislation and prosecution concerning children's rights and protection. Children can also contribute to their own protection if they know their rights and are equipped with vital life skills.

- To ensure attainment of the Millennium agenda for children, firm and decisive action is required for the next ten years. Efforts must be redoubled to meet the MDGs – confronting unpalatable truths about the disparities and abuse suffered by many children, and striving to eliminate these by working together. No individual government, agency or organisation can meet these goals alone.

The report concludes that creating a world fit for children requires the following commitments;

- Governments bear the primary responsibility for reaching out to excluded and invisible children, and need to increase their efforts in research, legislation (in particular abolishing discrimination), financing and capacity-building, and programmes (service delivery reform to remove entry barriers for excluded children is urgently required).

- Donors and international organisations must create an enabling environment through bold and well-conceived policies on aid, trade and debt relief.

- The private sector must adopt ethical corporate practices that ensure children are not exploited.

- The media can become a vehicle for empowerment by providing people with accurate information and, together with civil society, can facilitate an open discussion on attitudes, beliefs, prejudices and practices which lead to abuses.

Disability Inclusion: Translating Policy into Practice in Humanitarian Action

Women's Refugee Commission (2014). Women's Refugee Commission.

http://reliefweb.int/report/world/disability-inclusion-translating-policy-practice-humanitarian-action

WRC consulted with over 770 displaced persons, including persons with disabilities, across refugee and displacement contexts in eight countries – India (New Delhi), Uganda, Thailand, Bangladesh, Nepal, Ethiopia, Philippines (Mindanao) and Lebanon – gathering their perspectives on access and inclusion in humanitarian programmes and their suggestions for change. More than 390 humanitarian actors and stakeholders attended workshops to define context-specific action plans on disability inclusion. Follow-up assessments and consultations were also conducted in a number of countries to identify positive practices and barriers to the implementation of UNHCR Guidance on Disability. Positive lessons include:

- A twin-track approach to promote access and inclusion for persons with disabilities in gender-based violence (GBV) prevention and response activities in Nepal, through mainstreaming disability in procedures and strategies, as well as targeted actions to build sign language capacity in the camps and establish selfhelp groups of women with disabilities.

- Ensuring physical security by strengthening case management through tailored training to staff on identifying and responding to the needs of persons with disabilities in the Syrian refugee response in Lebanon.

- Promoting equal access to information by having screen-reader software on computers and piloting a disability rights database in Kampala, Uganda.

- Making durable solutions inclusive through targeted outreach and information dissemination on resettlement options, using local staff with disabilities in Nepal.

Report on Disability: Summary

World Health Organisation and the World Bank (2011). World WHO, Geneva.
http://whqlibdoc.who.int/hq/2011/WHO_NMH_VIP_11.01_eng.pdf

This report synthesises the best available scientific evidence on how to overcome the barriers which people with disabilities face in health, rehabilitation, support and assistance, environments, education, and employment.

- *Addressing barriers to health care*: Making all levels of existing health care systems more inclusive and making public health care programmes accessible to people with disabilities will reduce health disparities and unmet need.

- *Addressing barriers to rehabilitation*: Policy responses should emphasise early intervention, the benefits of rehabilitation to promote functioning in people with a broad range of health conditions, and the provision of services as close as possible to where people live.

- *Addressing barriers to support and assistance services*: Transitioning to community living, providing a range of support and assistance services, and supporting informal caregivers will promote independence and enable people with disabilities and their family members to participate in economic and social activities.

- *Creating enabling environments*: Requirements for addressing accessibility and reducing negative attitudes are access standards; cooperation between the public and private sector; a lead agency responsible for coordinating implementation; training in accessibility; universal design for planners, architects, and designers; user participation; and public education.

- *Addressing barriers to education*: The inclusion of children with disabilities in mainstream schools promotes universal primary completion, is cost-effective and contributes to the elimination of discrimination.

- *Addressing barriers to employment*: This is likely to require antidiscrimination laws, and tax and other financial incentives for employers. In addition to mainstream vocational training, peer training, mentoring, and early intervention show promise in improving disabled people's skills.

Girls' Education and Gender Equality

Unterhalter E., North, A., Arnot, M., Lloyd, C., Moletsane, L., Murphy-Graham, E., Parkes, J. & Saito, M. (2014). Education Rigorous Literature Review. London: Department for International Development.
http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/HumanDev_evidence/Girls_Education_Literature_Review_2014_Unterhalter.pdf

This literature review investigates the kind of interventions that can help expand and improve girls' education and gender equality. All relevant literature published since 1991 was identified and systematically reviewed by a team of experts.

Key findings:

- Interventions concerned with shifting gender norms and enhancing inclusion, by, for example, increasing participation in decision-making by the marginalised, are under-researched and under-resourced. Further research is suggested on promising interventions in this area associated with girls' clubs, faith communities, work with boys on gender equality, and strategies to include marginalised girls and women in decision making, reflection and action, notably with regard to gender-based violence.

- The relationship between changes in girls' education and developments in the enabling environment of legislation, regulation and opinion formation is under-researched. There is an accompanying lack of studies of the links between girls' education and empowerment outcomes.

- A significant number of studies suggest that successful interventions associated with institutional change and policy within the education sector may also impact on gender equality outcomes more broadly.

Public Policy Responses to Exclusion

Piron, L.H. & Curran, Z. (2005) *Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London*
http://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/2303.pdf

How have governments in Brazil, South Africa and India sought to address exclusion in those three societies? What lessons can be learnt from their experiences? This paper reviews research on policymakers' responses to exclusion to evaluate the success of various strategies aimed at addressing inequality. It argues that, while affirmative action and inclusive politico-legal frameworks contribute to anti-exclusion efforts, coordinated public policy and an equitable political economy are also necessary to ensure successful policy implementation. The following key issues emerge as 'preconditions' for policy adoption:

- Recognising that exclusion exists and is not acceptable as part of the 'social contract'.

- The importance of social movements has emerged from all three case studies (e.g. women's movement in South Africa, black consciousness in Brazil, trade unions in both countries) to raise awareness and inform the development of policies.

- The availability and use of data is key to both publicly recognising the problem and informing appropriate responses, in particular disaggregated data which can allow an identification of inequalities across and within groups.

- International pressure can play a positive role.

- Crises can drive change such as economic decline in apartheid South Africa, fiscal pressure in the early period of democratisation in Brazil and in response to the use of violence.

Looking at technical responses, a number of options are available:

- Legal safeguards must underpin anti-exclusionary policies and the judiciary and police must be willing to enforce these standards.

- Affirmative action is central to strategies aimed at reversing inequalities, but it can provoke a violent backlash from other groups.

- Governments should consider the side-effects of mainstream policies: economic growth plans and public sector reform may disadvantage excluded groups.

- A co-ordinated anti-exclusionary strategy is the best approach: various policies should be directed towards the same goal, possibly across a range of government departments.

- Governments must address low-level discriminatory attitudes by raising awareness among public servants to enable inclusive measures to be implemented.

The Global Partnership for Inclusive Growth

Huang, Y. and Quibia, M. (2013). Helsinki: UNUWIDER
http://www.wider.unu.edu/publications/working-papers/2013/en_GB/wp2013-059/

This paper investigates the determinants of inclusive growth with a focus on foreign aid. Based on the Solow Growth Model, a theoretical model has been developed which shows that foreign aid can stimulate inclusive growth if it is effectively used for augmenting either physical or human productive capacity. Based on the United Nations Development Programme's (2011) human development index, this

research calculates the inequality-adjusted human development index, and uses its growth rate to measure inclusive growth. The empirical section of this paper finds evidence for a significantly positive effect of foreign aid on inclusive growth in the sample countries. It further suggests that foreign aid fosters inclusive growth effectively, particularly when aid is directed to health and education. This research has important implications for an enhanced global partnership in areas such as foreign aid to achieve an inclusive society.

A rapid desk-based review: A study of evidence in mainstreaming social inclusion into programmes promoting agricultural productivity and access to markets among the rural poor

Turrall, S. (2013). Evidence on Demand, UK

http://dx.doi.org/10.12774/eod_hd.october2013.turrall

This study is a rapid assessment of the evidence regarding effective approaches to promoting agricultural productivity and improving access to markets, across different social groups of the rural poor, with a particular focus on those at risk of exclusion. The review was desk-based, drawing upon an Internet search of both grey and academic literature from the last ten years. Key findings include:

- Promising approaches include supporting legal literacy of women, so that there is greater awareness of tenure rights and the ability to exercise those rights.

- Access to finance is a critical issue in Zimbabwe, particularly for women. The support of financial services to find innovative ways of meeting heterogeneous clients should be explored, for example: loan periods accommodating of the agricultural cycle; mobile banking; systems tailored towards illiterate customers such as biometric cards.

- Approaches to reduce the burden on HIV/AIDs households include promoting income-generating activities that are low in inputs and labour use. Home or kitchen gardens were interesting examples of programmes to support people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA). Supporting PLWHA in agricultural programmes can help to reduce stigmatisation. Extension services and agricultural programmes including training, while credit and seed selection need to have an 'HIV lens' so that PLWHA are able to access and take advantage of the services.

- The limited literature on older people interlinked with agricultural productivity focuses upon their wealth of knowledge and the need to learn from and capture their knowledge (such as weather patterns); and also calls for agricultural input schemes and financial services to be age inclusive. There is reference to women's vulnerability as widows given the loss in social and legal status; and the risk of asset loss. There is more literature regarding grandmother's changing roles in the context of HIV/AIDS, how caring for the children reduces their labour input and agricultural productivity and some experience of safety net schemes to support them.

- Market based development approaches generally tend to target those who are 'market ready' and do not focus upon or include the socially excluded. The programmes found were specifically focused upon women's access to market with two different broad approaches: i) reducing the barriers to participation in markets; and ii) finding innovative ways to connect smallholders to markets.

- The role of collective action was highlighted in order to improve productivity, social capital and increase bargaining power in the market. The results are inconclusive and context

specific as to whether it is more beneficial to have women-only or mixed sex groups. Women-only groups may have more positive results regarding empowerment, building confidence and leadership skills'; but mixed-sex groups allow women to tap into men' networks, resources and information. A flexible approach as to what is most suitable in different contexts is advocated.

3. Service delivery

What is the evidence that the establishment or use of community accountability mechanisms and processes improves inclusive service delivery by governments, donors and NGOs to communities?

Lynch U., McGrellis S., Dutschke M., Anderson M., Arnsberger P., Macdonald G. (2013). London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London. http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/Default.aspx?tabid=3425

This systematic review answers the questions: What is the evidence that interventions aimed at improving community accountability mechanisms and processes influence inclusive service delivery? What factors impact on these accountability mechanisms? The included studies are located in Kenya, Nigeria, Tanzania, Sierra Leone, South Africa and Uganda. They are focused largely on women, young people and people living in rural areas. This review highlights the absence of empirical studies examining the impact of these interventions. Of the seven studies included in the synthesis, GoBifo (Casey et al., 2011) is the only one which focused explicitly on creating organisational change. Drawing on a range of innovative methods, GoBifo produced very positive outcomes in terms of creating a supportive economic environment for citizens. The intervention, however, had no impact on securing the inclusion of women and young men in decision making structures. The other studies included in the synthesis all provided powerful evidence of interventions which strengthened capacity for people to participate in society. The findings demonstrate the central role of empowerment and capacity development in enhancing community accountability, promoting inclusive service delivery and giving voice to all people.

The Politics of What Works in Service Delivery: An evidence-based review
Mcloughlin, C. and Batley, R. (2012) Birmingham: University of Birmingham
http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/FutureState/dfid_Politics_BOOKMARK_SINGLESNEW.pdf

This paper examines the evidence on the forms of politics likely to generate positive incentives for inclusive social provisioning and enable, as opposed to constrain, improvements in service outcomes. It focuses on the forms of politics that have underpinned eight relatively successful cases of delivery in a range of country contexts and sectors (roads, agriculture, health, education) where independent evaluations demonstrate evidence of improved outcomes. The paper traces the main characteristics of the political environment in which these cases evolved, from the national political context to the politics of sector policymaking and to the micro politics of implementation.

A number of common factors underpinning successful cases of delivery emerge strongly but need to be tested through further research. In particular, the studies of what works support the prominence given to

the role of the nature of the political regime, the political conjuncture, and the origins of elite incentives as key determinants of inclusive social provisioning. They illustrate the state may have strong incentives for inclusive provision where a particular service or good has historically been a key source of state legitimacy and an expression of the social contract. Calculations of political returns on the part of political actors, linked in some cases to the pursuit of political entrepreneurship, have also been critical in some cases where remarkable improvements in service provision have been achieved. The characteristics of a particular service – or the extent to which it is targetable, 'visible', measurable and easily credited - affect its political salience and in turn the likelihood of state responsiveness.

Models for Service Delivery in Conflict-affected Environments: Drawing Lessons from the experience of the Ushirika/GBV Partnership Programmes in the eastern Democratic Republic of the Congo

Dijkzeul, D. (2005). London: IRC

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/Disability/PolicyProject_cambodia.pdf

The Ushirika/GBV partnership programmes build capacities of local organisations to deliver services and sustain themselves. The study involved three stages, a visit to the eastern Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) , a writing period and another visit that included a workshop on the evaluation report in Bukavu. The research noted that whilst the Ushirika and GBV programmes offer no simple "one size fits all solution", they constitute an innovative approach to service delivery, because they combine intensive managerial and financial control with capacity building, which can lead to results in a relatively short period of time (accountability and capacity-building are tightly linked). The programmes have improved access and inclusion of extremely vulnerable groups and built more sustainable service delivery by local organisations. The report did however note that although both programmes are likely to have improved the lives of the local population, it is difficult to prove the actual change beyond output indicators and qualitative description. The report concluded that the Ushirika and GBV programmes constitute an innovative and effective approach, because they combine intensive hands-on management control with strong capacity building. Dijkzeul noted that the approach marks a rethinking of humanitarian assistance, linking it to rehabilitation and development.

Are service-delivery NGOs building state capacity in the global South? Experiences from HIV/AIDS programmes in rural Uganda.

Bukenya, B. (2013). Manchester: Effective States and Inclusive Development Research Centre (ESID). http://www.effective-states.org/wp-content/uploads/working_papers/final-pdfs/esid_wp_22_bukenya.pdf

This primary research into the 'Mini-TASO Project', a programme by Ugandan NGO TASO to support government health workers and hospitals in improving HIV/AIDS service delivery, finds that "NGOs can have a constructive impact on four aspects of state capacity – bureaucratic capacity, embeddedness, territorial reach, and legitimacy". The paper finds that "within its project areas TASO strengthened the bureaucratic ability of government hospitals to deliver HIV/AIDS services, made people living with HIV (PLHIV) visible to the state, increased the state's embeddedness within society through co-production, and enhanced state legitimacy in the eyes of beneficiaries, due to increased accessibility to life-saving services and improved patient–provider relationships. However, the impact of the programme on the infrastructural reach of the state in rural Uganda was not sustained beyond its implementation. The

overall conclusion of this paper is that service delivery by NGOs is not merely a technical activity: it can actually be an avenue for building more effective states."

Sharing reflections on inclusive sanitation

Banana, E., Chikoti, P., Harawa, C., McGranahan, G., Mitlin, D., Stephen, S., Schermbrucker, N., Shumba, F. and Walnycki, A. (2015) International Institute for Environment and Development. http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/Output/200778/

This paper reports on an action research project currently under way in four African cities in Malawi, Zimbabwe, Tanzania and Zambia in response to the failures of conventional approaches to urban sanitation. It considers the routes to both spatial and social inclusion (including the role of loan finance in the four cities) and its political underpinnings. A key conclusion is that inclusion is a multi-faceted concept that needs to be unpacked if it is to be achieved. Through this project, local authority staff and politicians at multiple levels have been drawn in to play an active part, particularly in three of the cities, where engagements have strengthened during the course of this project. Moreover new solutions to sanitation have helped to improve provision, particularly for households far from existing sewers. Challenges include affordability (evident at the household level with difficulties in repaying loans, and exacerbated by the lack of public finance to support the extension of sanitation systems at the scale required) and limited investigation of designs for people with limited mobility. Moreover there are concerns about equity within all four cities, with discussions about dissuading landlords from increasing the rents as a result of taking on sanitation loans, and in concerns about tenants whose landlords refuse to improve the sanitation.

4. Inclusive education

Outside the Circle: A research initiative by Plan International into the rights of children with disabilities to education and protection in West Africa.
Coe, S (2013). Dakar: Plan West Africa.

http://plan-international.org/files/global/publications/education/outside-the-circle-english

This research comprised of three components: targeted in-depth research in four countries – Guinea, Niger, Sierra Leone and Togo, a West Africa region-wide literature review and an investigation into good practices that exist in the region to include children with disabilities in education and protection work. Where disability awareness-raising has taken place, the situation and acceptance of children with disabilities has improved. Community-based rehabilitation work (CBR) has been used in some countries to positive effect. Good practices which have increased inclusion of children with disabilities are: inclusion in Early Childhood Care and Education; CBR; policies and training for teachers; child to child methods; rapid education services; non-formal education; awareness-raising in the community; access to information and rights; home support.

Situational Analysis and Assessment of Education for Children with Disabilities in Bangladesh, South Asia, East Asia and South Africa.

Choudhuri, M. A., Alam, J., Hasan, R., & Rashida, S. A. (2005). Centre for services and information on disability (CSID) Bangladesh.

http://www.hpod.org/pdf/Kar-thematic_edu.pdf

This research asseses and analyses the major shortfalls in the existing design and implementation process of education programmes for disabled children in Bangladesh, Nepal, Vietnam and the Republic of South Africa. It also provides some results on the effectiveness and impact of Inclusive Education programmes in terms of enrolment, repetition, dropout and attitude; and assessing the impact of Special versus Integrated and Inclusive Education. Major findings are:

- In Bangladesh, most children with disabilities (CWD) are enrolled in free, non-formal NGO schools as opposed to mainstream schools. These provide better facilities and programmes for CWD.

- In Bangladesh the percentage of repetition and dropout is only 2 per cent and 1.20 per cent respectively. In Vietnam, the Inclusive School, which only caters for visually impaired children, reported they do not have any repetition or drop out, because they will add extra marks to results to prevent this.

- The impacts of Special (segregated) Education as identified by the research team are: Special Education systems isolate disabled children from society; existing Special Education systems are confined to the primary and, to some extent, secondary level; emphasis is given to vocational training rather than academic teaching in special education settings; due to inadequate special education centres and high costs, very few children have the opportunity to participate in the special education system in all four countries.

- Impact of integrated education systems, according to stakeholders from all the countries: an Integrated Education system facilitates socialisation from the school level; CWD can participate in a mainstream curriculum, which can be helpful in participating in higher mainstream education; it is less costly than Special Education.

- Impact of Inclusive Education: Inclusive education is not practiced widely. It is too early to predict to what degree and to what extent inclusive education will turn out as the most pragmatic approach.

Special and inclusive education in the Eastern Caribbean: policy practice and provision.

Armstrong, A. C., Armstrong, D., Lynch, C., & Severin, S. (2005). *International journal of inclusive education*, 9(1), 71-87. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1360311042000302905

What impact has the OECS regional strategy had on inclusive education? There is a lack of funding, although fairly significant political will exists. There are small but important examples of inclusive education happening in the region as a result of the policy. The case study provided from St Lucia shows that inclusive approaches are successful.

Education Exclusion and Inclusion: Policy and Implementation in South Africa and India. Researching the Issues 72

Samuel, M. et al. (2007). London: DFID

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/impAccess/ResearchingtheIssuesNo72.pdf

This synthesis report of research carried out in India and South Africa builds on two separate country reports that present the findings of studies which examined the policy environment, the structures and mechanisms in place to promote inclusion, and detailed empirical investigation of the practice of inclusion at the school community level. The report acknowledges that both countries have 'activist identities'. The state is configured in each country as a rights-minded state which addresses not only the protection of rights of vulnerable groups but also their active promotion. The significance of the state is thus enhanced by playing a stronger role in relation to weaker groups in society. The report notes that the alignment of policy with practice remains a challenge. While the rhetoric value of policy in both countries is high, the potential for implementation remains precarious. In particular, the report highlighted that both countries are struggling with the key issues of race and caste. The report concludes that while it is evident that the state in both countries has an explicit policy framework for enabling inclusion, there is very little evidence that schools have generated policies to effect inclusion. While school policy statements by themselves do not ensure inclusion, they are key to schools indicating clearly a vision of, and commitment to, promoting inclusion. They also inform communities of the values that are deemed to be important.

Making Education for All inclusive: Where next?

Ainscow, M. and Miles, S. (2008). New York: UNESCO

http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs11125-008-9055-0

The authors draw on research evidence relating to teaching and learning, school development, leadership and the development of education systems and case study material gathered by the Enabling Education Network (EENET), which supports practitioners in documenting their experience of working towards more inclusive education, primarily in the countries of the South. They note that making education for all inclusive does not require the introduction of new techniques; rather it involves collaboration within and between schools, closer links between schools and communities, networking across contexts, and the collection and use of contextually relevant evidence. Whilst they note an increasing interest in inclusive education they comment that the field remains confused about the actions that need to be taken to move policy and practice forward. They also note that education involves complex social processes; education systems are not developed in isolation. Rather, such development has to be understood in relation to particular geographical, political and economic factors, as well as culturally and contextually specific values and beliefs. They conclude that one must assume that schools and their communities know more than they used to and that the logical starting point for development is a detailed analysis of existing arrangements. This allows good practices to be identified and shared, whilst at the same time drawing attention to ways of working that may be creating barriers to the participation and learning of some children and young people. However, they stress, the focus must not only be on practice. It must also address and sometimes challenge the thinking behind existing ways of working.

Making Inclusive Education Happen: the Impact of Initial Teacher Education in Remote Aboriginal Communities
Maher, M. (2013). London: Routledge

http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/sites/default/files/docs/making-schools-inclusive_1.pdf

This paper discusses the Growing Our Own initial teacher education (ITE) pilot programme which allowed Indigenous assistant teachers in their own communities to study to become a teacher with the support of a non-Indigenous teacher. Maher outlines several advantages of inclusive education are noted by those schools in which inclusion has been implemented effectively. Students accessing ITE report that they respond positively to the way the wealth of knowledge, competence, and skill that they bring to their schools and communities is valued and that this knowledge is used as the basis for contemporary curriculum and pedagogy. The two-way focus means that both Indigenous ATs and non-Indigenous teacher mentors develop strong foundations in both the culture of the community and the school. She comments that this supports them to:

- infuse cultural identities and knowledge with professionalism as a teacher;
- promote children's learning and spiritual well-being in authentic ways;
- actively engage families, community, and elders;
- connect their personal knowledge with contemporary teaching and learning theory and practice;
- support the development of home languages while nurturing the parallel development of Standard Australian English.

Maher also commented that schools were also reporting improved attendance in the classes where these Indigenous preservice teachers are working. Attendance at school is strongly correlated with achievement (Northern Territory Government 2008).

Making Schools Inclusive: How Change Can Happen
Pinnock, H. et al. (2008). London: Save the Children

http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/sites/default/files/docs/making-schools-inclusive_1.pdf

This book uses the experience of Save the Children UK and its partners to identify what changes are needed for school systems to become inclusive of all children, and how these can be leveraged. The experience of national education teams working for Save the Children provides insight into the approaches that have worked best, using cases from 14 developing and transition countries. The book considers experience from participatory school development tools; working with teachers; public campaigning and coalition building; and building the capacity of education officials.

Even when funding levels are low, strategic work on a policy level has been effective when accompanied by demonstrations of practical, grassroots reform possibilities. Findings include the following:

- Targeted provisions are needed to facilitate education for some groups of children. These should always be adopted in parallel with moves towards more flexible and welcoming schools for all children.
- A child rights approach provides a ready and politically neutral framework, and links inclusiveness reforms to international commitments which many governments have already made.

- Involving parents and community members, especially children, in education planning and management is key to developing schools which respond to the needs of all children.

- With the right support, parents' groups and networks have become long-term forces for educational change, particularly where disabled children are excluded from good-quality schooling. Rapid evidence of success, however small, is often important in motivating parents.

- Small grants for school development can jump-start efforts to get excluded children engaged in education, boosting community motivation. Yet governments must ultimately provide ongoing resources to deliver longer term change.

- Flexible and devolved models of school financing can contribute to inclusiveness and quality of education. More evidence and investigation is needed in this area.

The Influence of an In-service Teacher Training (INSET) Programme on Attitudes towards Inclusion by Regular Classroom Teachers Who Teach Deaf Students in Primary Schools in Turkey

Diop, F. et al. (2006). London: Wiley

http://www.maneyonline.com/doi/pdfplus/10.1179/146431507790559996

The study aims to examine the impact of an INSET programme on classroom teachers' attitudes towards deaf students educated in primary schools. The research project adopts a quantitative research approach involving randomised allocation of subjects to groups, and a pre-test – post-test design. The sample for each group consisted of a random allocation of 61 teachers to an experimental group and 61 teachers to a control group. The authors found that the teachers in the experimental group increased their knowledge about deafness and that their attitudes were significantly more positive. In particular, the teachers' attitudes changed in relation to classroom management and knowledge about the education of deaf students in inclusive settings.

Widening participation in higher education in Ghana and Tanzania: Developing an equity scorecard.

Morley, L., Leach, F., Lugg, R., Lihamba, A., Opare, J., Bhalalusesa, E., ... & Mwaipopo, R. (2007). University of Sussex, Brighton.

https://www.sussex.ac.uk/webteam/gateway/file.php?name=full-report---final.pdf&site=43

This comprehensive research project looks at how to make higher education more socially inclusive in Ghana and Tanzania. It is a mixed methods study of one public and one private case study university in each country, combining 200 student life history interviews, 200 key staff and policymakers interviews, and 100 Equity Scorecards compiled largely from raw data on admission/access, retention, completion and achievement. The study findings on inclusivity are:

- In some programmes, the percentage of women applicants accepted was significantly lower than men's, even when a high proportion of women reached the minimum standards to enter university

- Loans and bursaries were successful in helping students from low socio-economic backgrounds attend university.

- Affirmative action programmes such as the scheme to promote women's entry to the B.Sc. in Engineering in the Tanzania public university had been successful in increasing the number of women in the programme. However, when gender was intersected with age and socio-economic background, participation rates of low socioeconomic status and older women were shown to be extremely low. Affirmative action was perceived as a form of reverse discrimination and favouritism by many male students, particularly in Ghana, where it was not as formally executed as in Tanzania.

- Different modes of delivery e.g. part-time, evening and weekend programmes, particularly in the private universities, facilitated participation of mature students. However, many experienced the strain of learning while earning.

The State of Inclusive Pedagogy in South Africa: A Literature Review

Makoelle, T. M. (2012). *Journal of Sociology and Social Anthropology,* 3(2), 93-102. http://www.krepublishers.com/02-Journals/JSSA/JSSA-03-0-000-12-Web/JSSA-03-2-000-12-Abst-PDF/JSSA-03-2-093-12-051-Makoelle-T-M/JSSA-03-2-093-12-051-Makoelle-T-M-Tt.pdf

This article presents the background of inclusive education developments, both within historical and policy contexts. This paper finds that the way inclusion is conceptualised within South Africa still bears the hallmarks of the special needs education of the past education dispensation. South Africa has a strong history of inclusive policies from the 1990s onwards, but these have not had much impact on the way education is delivered. The influence of special educational needs which was based on the medical-deficit model is still prevalent in schools. While policies clearly articulate that learners have to be taught in accordance with their needs, teachers' beliefs and practices have not changed significantly.

A Disability Rights in Education Model for evaluating inclusive education

Peters, S., Johnstone, C., & Ferguson, P. (2005) *International Journal of Inclusive Education, 9:2,* 139-160, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1360311042000320464

This paper presents a Disability Rights in Education (DRE) Model to understand and evaluate effective Inclusive Education across widely disparate local and international contexts. An inclusive education project in Lesotho is described and analysed to explain the DRE Model's dynamic processes, and to demonstrate its potential utility for evaluation and future planning. A few of its findings include:

- Concessions such as removing school fees have increased access and therefore potential for increasing social capital of students with disabilities. However, most of the state's system has remained unchanged since the 1800s.

- Policy statements claim inclusive education for all, for enforcement is difficult due to Lesotho's lack of anti-discrimination legislation and other unique cultural factors.

- A broad-based approach to disability, which encompasses disability issues throughout the life cycle, may be a way of shifting disability issues out of the home and school into the national movement for development.

- The DRE model highlights areas of strengths and weaknesses within multiple levels and contexts that can be addressed systematically and holistically as next steps.

An ecosystemic approach for understanding inclusive education: An Indian case study

Singal, N. (2006). *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, *21*(3), 239-252. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF03173413

This paper presents findings of a multi-level study, which explored the various meanings and efforts towards inclusive education in an Indian context. Using an ecosystemic framework, it explores the many complex ways in which efforts have been influenced by international developments and socio-cultural factors within the national context. At the school level, the research was based primarily on participants' perceptions and experiences, with several case studies being performed at schools in Delhi. At the government level, several documents were analysed and many policy makers were interviewed. It emphasises the impact that narrowly constructed notions of "ability" and "disability" have on efforts undertaken at the government and school level. This affects the actual inclusion of children with disabilities, who are not regarded as integral to the classroom, and remain socially segregated.

Engaging with teachers' knowledge: promoting inclusion in Zambian schools

Miles, S. (2009) *Disability & Society*, 24:5, 611-624
http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09687590903010990

This paper explores a study carried out by the Enabling Education Network in schools in Northern Zambia, in which reflective writing played a role in generating locally relevant teachers' knowledge. Although there was only minimal evidence of the benefits of the digital revolution, the Zambian teachers successfully developed a problem-based approach to including disabled children in education as part of their commitment to child rights. Reflective writing can help teachers to become more self-critical while, at the same time, producing accounts of practice which engage with, rather than overlook, teachers' knowledge.

Giving children a better start: Preschool attendance and school-age profiles

Berlinski, S., Galiani, S., & Manacorda, M. (2008). *Journal of public Economics*, *92*(5), 1416-1440. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2007.10.007

This study examines the effect of pre-primary education on children's subsequent school outcomes in Uruguay. The research uses a unique feature of the Uruguayan household survey that collects retrospective information on preschool attendance in the context of a rapid expansion in the supply of pre-primary places. Using a within household estimator, it finds small gains from preschool attendance at early ages that get magnified as children grow up. By age 15, treated children have accumulated 0.8 extra years of education and are 27 per cent more likely to be in school compared to their untreated siblings. Pre-primary education appears as a successful and cost-effective policy to prevent early grade failure and its long lasting consequences in low-income countries.

5. Citizenship, participation and social movements

So What Difference Does it Make? Mapping the Outcomes of Citizen Engagement

Gaventa, J. and Barrett, G., (2010). Working Paper 347, Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Brighton http://www.ids.ac.uk/files/dmfile/Wp347.pdf

Citizen participation increases societal inclusivity. This paper presents results from a meta-analysis of 100 research studies of citizen engagement in 20 countries. By mapping over 800 observable effects of citizen participation, the authors created a typology of four democratic and developmental outcomes – the construction of citizenship; the strengthening of practices of participation; the strengthening of responsive and accountable states; and the development of inclusive and cohesive societies. Citizen participation produced positive effects across these outcome types in 75 per cent of the outcomes studied, although in each category there were also examples of negative outcomes. Inclusive and cohesive societies was the least frequent outcome overall. Citizen engagement is shown to provide a greater sense of inclusion of previously marginalised groups; and a greater sense of social cohesion across groups.

States of mobilisation? A comparison of modes of interaction between states and social actors in India, Brazil & South Africa

Mohanty, R., Thompson, L., Schattan Coelho,V. (2010). African Centre for Citizenship and Democracy, University of the Western Cape

http://www.drc-citizenship.org/system/assets/1052734707/original/1052734707-mohanty_etal.2010-states.pdf

This set of three papers explores the interaction between citizen mobilisation and the state in India, Brazil and South Africa. It finds that the gains won through mobilisation are often selective and partial, and sometimes non-existent. Mobilisation that adopts a critique or protest approach seems less likely to elicit a positive state response than collaborative engagement. State actors prefer to interact with citizens within their own policy frameworks and spaces, and within their own ideologies. State engagement with mobilised citizens in the countries studied has had both progressive and regressive outcomes: it has increased space for participation in policymaking, and increased state resistance to critique. Mobilisation in these countries is often around marginalised identity groups.

- States have shown more willingness to engage with social actors pursuing collaborative engagement with them than with those who adopt a protest approach.

- When the ideology and means of social mobilisation correspond to the goals of the state, it is perceived as legitimate by the state, which responds with facilitation.

- When the ideology and means of mobilisation are different from those of the state, it responds with repression or indifference.

Strengthening social justice to address intersecting inequalities

Paz Arauco, V. et al. (2014). London: ODI. http://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/9213.pdf

This report addresses the significance of deep identity based forms of exclusion, which constrain the life chances of affected social groups. The experiences and relative successes of seven countries reviewed in this report (Bolivia, Brazil, Ecuador, Ethiopia, India, Nepal, and Pakistan) suggest that there are a small number of 'key ingredients' required to address intersecting inequalities. These include: social mobilisation, political change, constitutional reforms, increased political participation in pluri-national states, a combination of universal and targeted or affirmative action especially in the policy field, and further mobilisation around the implementation of rights and guarantees. Political inclusion is critical, and the report picks out two main types of political settlements which have significantly addressed intersecting inequalities: i) governments with a strong inclusive and redistributive agenda combined with class-based social mobilisation; and ii) multi-ethnic countries in which movement-based governments result from identity-group mobilisation.

Mid-Term Review: Social Inclusion Research Fund (NPL-2946) Nepal

Ingdal, N., Shah, S. G. and Storholt, K. H. (2007) Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation, Oslo

http://www.niaslinc.dk/gateway_to_asia/nordic_webpublications/x506033286.pdf

The Social Inclusion Research Fund (SIRF) was established to promote research on social exclusion in Nepal. SIRF has three grant streams: research fellows, apprenticeships and Norwegian institutional cooperation. This MTR finds that SIRF has generally been effective at achieving its social inclusion goals. SIRF has succeeded in promoting excluded groups in academic research. 'Dalits' ('untouchable' people), 'Janajatis' (indigenous nationalities) and 'Madheshis' (of Tarai lowland origin) have secured research fellowships and apprenticeships. Only 23 per cent of research fellows, 40 per cent of apprentices and 25 per cent of the Interim Steering Committee (ISC) are women. Research themes regarding discrimination against women also need to be increased. Success criteria have included the ability of the steering committee to reach consensus, involvement of an extended group of stakeholders, obtaining early support from the government, generous availability of funds, and efficient staff and clearly defined job descriptions.

Citizens' Perceptions of Government Responsiveness in Africa: Do Electoral Systems and Ethnic Diversity Matter?

Cho, W. (2010). *Comparative Political Studies* December 2010 vol. 43 no. 12 1650-1674. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0010414010374019

Analysing evidence from 15 sub-Saharan African countries, Cho finds that the type of electoral system used affects people's perceptions of government responsiveness, but this relationship depends on the country's degree of ethnic diversity. Lower levels of ethnic diversity, majoritarian electoral systems are better at boosting positive perceptions of government responsiveness. At higher levels of ethnic diversity, proportional representation (PR) systems are more likely to have this effect. These findings have implications for constitutional design and democratic consolidation. He concludes that further research is required to determine whether these findings affect the occurrence of ethnicity-based violent conflict.

Citizen Mobilisation in Nepal: Building on Nepal's Tradition of Social Mobilisation to Make Local Governance more Inclusive and Accountable.

Jha, C., Prasai, S., Hobley, M. & Bennett, L. (2009). World Bank, DFID and Swiss Development Cooperation. http://www.gsdrc.org/docs/open/VA1.pdf

This report from the Local Governance and Community Development Programme (LGCDP) analyses social mobilisation in Nepal. The LGCDP is a national programme, which aims – among other things – to promote citizen engagement through social mobilisation. The study analysed the range of different forms of mobilisation practised in Nepal to identify those approaches that LCGDP should learn from in order to meet its Outcome 1 – empowering citizens and communities to actively engage with local government bodies and to hold them accountable. The study's key findings are:

- Transformational approaches to citizen mobilisation are more sustainable than transactional processes and help to build individual and collective capabilities.

- The extreme poor are left out or self-excluded from most group-based processes.

- Most programmes do not link citizens/groups with local body processes. Group processes are generally isolated and parallel to local structures, and fail to strengthen state-citizen relationships.

Citizen Led Accountability and Inclusivity in Pakistan

Kirk, T. (2014). London: LSE.

http://www.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/JSRP/downloads/JSRP-Paper-20.pdf

A recent citizen-led accountability programme across both conflict-affected and peaceful constituencies in Pakistan has reported significant success in mobilising volunteer groups to demand the resolution of local issues. This paper examines the strategies that contributed to their successes, based on three months of research and fieldwork in Pakistan.

It focuses on the tensions between the programme's drive for 'inclusive' citizens groups that raise demands, and the need for such groups to work in ways that acknowledge the power and politics of their local contexts. While in some cases this led to innovative solutions to local problems, in others it may have strengthened the divisions and networks that support unaccountable governance.

Key findings include:

- In the studied conflict-affected constituencies it was not possible to include marginalised groups that stood in opposition to the constituency relation groups' (CRGs) dominant members.

- In conflict-affected areas where two clearly defined groups are violently competing over economic and political opportunities it may be difficult to include them within the same citizens' association.

- It was found across the CRGs that the majority of advocacy activities were undertaken by a core group of educated and comparatively wealthy members, many of whom had significant experience of activism.

- CRGs' preferred routes to accountability were heavily dependent on where power lay within their constituencies. Thus, regardless of the programme's guidelines, the CRGs often sought to achieve their aims by working with the grain of local politics.

- It can be argued that by interacting with local authorities, such as maliks, the CRGs introduced new ideas and practices into the public discourse, and laid the foundations for longer-term change.

- When opportunities arise CRGs should be encouraged to involve themselves in the design or reform of local governance institutions.

Beyond elite bargains: building democracy from below in Uganda

King, S. and Hickey, S. (2015). Manchester: Effective States and Inclusive Development Research Centre (ESID).

http://www.effective-states.org/wp-content/uploads/working_papers/final-pdfs/esid_wp_45_king_hickey.pdf

This paper is based on 12 months of research undertaken in the Rwenzori sub-region of western Uganda between 2009 and 2011. Looking at the experiences of nongovernmental and cooperative organisations in rural Uganda, the findings suggest that "although the structural limitations to achieving democratic development in such contexts remain powerful, certain civil society forms and strategies can help promote processes of democratic development at local levels, particularly when these are led by local producer groups". Two case study organisations demonstrate that "both elite and popular civil society forms have been able to catalyse economic and political empowerment and shifts in elite attitudes and behaviour". The authors conclude that "economic empowerment – particularly in remote areas with strong drives for selfhelp, and where locally embedded support structures are in place – has enabled subordinate actors to gain greater political agency".

Strengthening the Voice of the Poor: Faith-based Organizations' Engagement in Policy Consultation Processes in Nigeria and Tanzania

Taylor, M. (2011). Birmingham: University of Birmingham

http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/1598/1/Taylor_Voiceofpoor.pdf

This paper is part of a research programme (the Religious and Development Research Programme Consortium) that explored the relationship between several major world religions, development in low-income countries and poverty reduction. Through a series of semi-structured interviews with key informants, Taylor's research noted that despite organisational strength, legitimacy and grassroots membership, religious organisations in Tanzania and Nigeria have been little involved in policy consultation processes, such as those that occur during the preparation and review of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs).

Pilot projects carried out by the programme with networks of religious organisations demonstrated that obstacles can be overcome:

- Faith based organisations can cooperate across religious and denominational lines to collect and present data on poverty to governments.

- Local management arrangements worked reasonably well, data on selected issues were assembled and analysed and reports submitted to government. However, existing capacity was limited and the pilots were insufficient to overcome all of the constraints.

- Taylor concludes that pilot programmes have demonstrated a way of working that can increase the capacity of religious organisations to contribute to policy making but that this may flounder in countries where there is a lack of resources.

Mainstreaming Disability in Development: India Country Report

Thomas, P. (2005). London: DFID

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTSARREGTOPLABSOCPRO/1211714-1144074285477/20873614/IndiaReportDFID.pdf

The Disability Knowledge and Research (KaR) programme report on mainstreaming disability in India comprised a desk review of literature and a 24-day field visit to India. The fieldwork segment of the research included semi-structured key informant interviews, focus-group discussions with disabled people, project field visits etc. The country report noted that there appeared to be some confusion in India over the understanding of the terms 'mainstreaming' and 'inclusion'. The confusion is considered largely semantic, resting on whether mainstreaming is the goal and inclusion the strategy, or vice versa. Three key actors play critical roles in achieving this objective; the state, service providers, and disabled people's organisations (DPOs). Whilst the state and services are relatively strong, DPOs are weaker. Indian DPOs require capacity building and the state, services and DPOs urgently need to better engage with each other, and work in mutually supportive ways to enhance the inclusion and improve the outcomes of disabled people. The report concluded that there are no easy answers or quick fixes when it comes to the inclusion of disabled people. Thomas noted that in theory, all the key components are in place for success in India, and resources (both human and financial) do not present a significant barrier. However, despite all these positives, in reality, the situation for the average disabled Indian is bleak. The major obstacles appear to be more attitudinal rather than structural.

Poverty Reduction and Development in Cambodia: Enabling Disabled People to Play a Role

Thomas, P. (2004). London: DFID

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/Disability/PolicyProject_cambodia.pdf

The research comprised a desk review of literature and an 18-day field visit to Cambodia. The primary research method was key informant semi-structured interviews and visits to three disability organisations. It also involved a focus group discussion with disabled people and follow-up interviews with four disabled individuals. The country report noted that the inclusion of disabled people via the provision of state report was extremely limited, confined to providing office space for the Disability Action Council (a forum to bring together stakeholders in the sector), a small contribution of 1000 Riels (US$0.25) per day to patients in some rehabilitation centres, and the veterans and civil servants' pension scheme. This pension scheme represents the only state social protection system of cash transfers. However, the system is in some disarray and subject to significant corruption. The report noted that the physical visibility of disabled people in Cambodia, along with the international focus on landmines, has resulted in a conflation of visibility with inclusion. Thomas commented that there is a misplaced perception by those working outside the disability sector that disability receives a lot of funding and that

it is well supported and 'moving forward.' In fact, the reality is rather different. Research for this study revealed that most disabled people in Cambodia are among the very poorest in the country. Whilst the disability sector was considered to be well coordinated, there was seen to be an overemphasis on service provision, driven by international agendas and funding sources and an insufficient focus on empowering disabled people. Thomas concluded that the government relied on civil society to address disability issues and that disability had become largely divorced and isolated from mainstream development, undermining the sustainability of existing services.

Developing participatory rural appraisal approaches with disabled people: A pilot project by Disability Development Services Pursat (DDSP) in Pursat province, Cambodia

Harknett, S., Heurn, C., Bunny, K., Pha, L., Sokha, M., Khy, R., & Veasna, T. (2005). Disability Knowledge and Research programme.
http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/Disability/PolicyProject_pra_ex.pdf

This study examines rural disabled people's role in all stages of a participatory rural appraisal (PRA) exercise in Cambodia. The research project appointed a 'PRA team' to plan, coordinate and facilitate the PRA exercises. The majority of the team-members were inexperienced, uneducated rural people with severe disabilities such as paraplegia, double leg amputation and learning difficulties (it was possibly the first research project in Cambodia to include a person with learning difficulties in the implementing team). The team planned and implemented a complete PRA process, including training in PRA, planning and design of the PRA, fieldwork, monitoring and evaluation, presentation of the results, and visiting other NGOs to learn about their PRA practice.

The project succeeded in increasing the participation of disabled people in PRA activities. The PRA team was made aware of accessibility issues in the training and in general they showed sensitivity to disability issues and made great efforts to ensure that all disabled people could join in the PRA activities. Modifications and adaptations to increase disabled people's participation included use of drawings and minimal use of written documents, assisting with transport, speaking clearly and slowly and repeating key points. Attendance at PRA meetings was generally good in all three villages, which suggests that the villagers found the meetings informative and useful.

Mainstreaming disability in development: country-level research. Rwanda country report.

Thomas, P. (2005). Disability Knowledge and Research (KAR) programme.
http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/Disability/PolicyProject_rwanda.pdf

The research was comprised of a desk review followed by an 18-day field visit to Rwanda, which included semi-structured interviews, focus groups and home-based interviews with disabled people, field visits to projects and centres and a one-day participatory stakeholder workshop in Kigali. All the key components are in place in Rwanda to enable disabled people to access their rights and participate fully in society. In addition to the considerable government interest in the issue, there is a nascent but nonetheless burgeoning disability movement and a well-established and committed range of CSOs providing services. However, disabled citizens generally remain marginalised and discriminated against.

Disability in Conflict and Emergency Situations: Focus on Tsunami-affected Areas

Kett, M., Stubbs, S., & Yeo, R. (2005). Disability in conflict and emergency situations: Focus on Tsunami-affected areas. *International Disability and Development Consortium Research Report*. http://www.pacificdisaster.net/pdnadmin/data/original/IDCC_2005_Disability_conflict.pdf

The study promotes the inclusion of disability in emergency, conflict and refugee programmes. The particular objectives were to assess a) the extent of inclusion, b) the impact of networking and c) the role of resources in post-tsunami contexts. The geographical focus was mainly Sri Lanka, with contributions from India and Indonesia. The study found that:

- Inclusion of disabled persons was limited primarily to surveys and receiving relief, aids and equipment; inclusion was not usually involved in planning, decision-making or management. Though many organisations had training manuals or inclusive guidelines, they were rarely used. One notable exception was the INGO Action Aid and a local NGO they fund in India, Sanghamam. Their projects involved disabled persons at all levels and as implementers in relief operations. This resulted in an increase in status and confidence among local disabled persons.

- There is a gap between central level policy and local staff knowledge and understanding. No matter what international written policies are, in practice inclusion still typically means delegation to a specialist agency. Networking took place upwards towards those with influence, money and power, with little evidence of horizontal networking; the poor communities including disabled people were the least involved and consulted.

- The research highlighted many different and conflicting agendas, and raised the question of 'inclusion into whose agenda?'

- The focus of the disabled community on accessibility in some ways led to further isolation from other marginalised groups.

- Despite the current widespread implementation of psychosocial programmes, mental health issues are still stigmatised.

Too Close for Comfort? Immigrant Exclusion in Africa

Adida, C. L. (2011). *Comparative Political Studies, vol. 44,* no. 10, pp. 1370-1396. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0010414011407467

This study explores why some minority groups involved in South-South migration integrate into their host societies, whereas others face exclusion and hostility. It draws on surveys of Nigerian Hausa and Yoruba immigrants and host populations in urban Ghana, Benin and Niger. Its findings suggest that cultural similarities may worsen, not improve, immigrant-host relations in sub-Saharan Africa: cultural similarities seem to motivate immigrant community leaders to preserve their group identities by highlighting group boundaries. In addition, host societies seem to reject groups that can easily blend in because those groups can access indigenous benefits in the competition for scarce resources.

While immigrants are generally insecure in Sub-Saharan Africa, immigrant-host relations vary widely across groups and localities:

- Interviews with immigrant leaders in Accra show how they seek to strengthen members' attachment to the immigrant community. Leaders showed keen awareness of the opportunities of 'high-overlap' immigrants to pass as indigenous. They struck deals with local police to create an institutional mechanism to encourage immigrant attachment to the immigrant community. In addition, leaders punish immigrant defectors.

- Host society members seem to reject immigrants who can assimilate and enjoy indigenous benefits through shared cultural repertoires. For example, in Niamey, where Islam and Hausa are indigenous identities, the host population exhibits a greater propensity to exclude immigrants who are both Muslim and Hausa.

- Conversely, if immigrant groups share few or no cultural traits with their host society, their leaders face a lower threat of group identity loss. They lack incentives to highlight boundaries that they perceive as already existing. In addition, hosts feel less threatened by easily identifiable 'foreigners' and are therefore less likely to reject them.

These findings relate to a larger debate on the determinants of political identity in ethnically diverse societies. They highlight the significance of ethnic and religious divisions and institutions for social integration:

- In Accra and Niamey both host populations and immigrants tended to equate national identity with ethnic identity.

- Institutions can overwhelm cultural factors in determining political identity and group relations.

- As religious affiliations cut across ethnic categories, religious institutions could play an important role in building trust and cooperation between members of different ethnic groups. However, these opportunities are missed when religious leaders use ethnicity as a rallying point for organisation and recruitment, 'ethnicising' religious institutions.

6. Community-driven development

Interventions to Promote Social Cohesion in Sub-Saharan Africa
King, E. et al. (2010). London: Routledge

http://cyrussamii.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/king_etal2010_jdefffinal.pdf

This article presents a synthetic review of impact evaluations examining the effectiveness of community-driven development (CDD) and curriculum interventions in improving social cohesion in sub-Saharan Africa. The review found weakly positive impacts of CDD and curriculum interventions on social cohesion outcomes. Causal chain analysis of data on implementation and contextual factors relating to the CDD interventions found that broad and substantive participation was often lacking, suggesting the interventions have often not been carried out in accordance with the theory of CDD. The authors highlighted inconsistencies between programme theory and implementation. The authors conclude that the evidence from the statistical meta-analysis of pro-social effects is weak. Only for 'the possibility of one community member assisting another who is in need' did they find evidence across more than one study of a positive social cohesion effect that clearly reflects more than programmatic aspects of the intervention. At the same time, the most compelling result of their meta-analysis – although more evidence would be helpful here too – is the negative estimated effect on inter-group relations.

The authors highlight that the meta-analysis raises some issues about the manner in which social cohesion effects should be measured. They note that social cohesion is a complex concept. Behavioural manifestations are highly context specific, and attitudinal manifestations rely on abstract concepts that, when translated into terms that are meaningful to subjects, are also highly context specific. The ability to reduce these diverse measures to a few dimensions comparable across contexts requires that such measures can be anchored to valid, context-free constructs.

A Critical Review of Community-Driven Development Programmes in Conflict-Affected Contexts

King, E. (2013). International Rescue Committee and DFID.

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/misc_gov/61046-
A_Critical_Review_of_CDD_in_Conflict_Affected_Contexts.pdf

This study finds that the record of Community-Driven Development / Reconstruction (CDD/R) in conflict-affected contexts is mixed and, overall, disappointing in terms of reaching the ambitious goals set out. The study draws on: a review of five rigorous evaluations of CDD/R programmes in Afghanistan, DRC, Indonesia (Aceh), Liberia, and Sierra Leone; a broader literature review; and fifteen interviews with individuals with expertise on CDD/R in conflict-affected states. As currently designed, implemented, and evaluated, CDD/R programmes – that empower local communities to directly participate in development activities and to control resources to do so – are found to be better at generating the more tangible economic outcomes than at generating social changes related to governance and social cohesion. Even the economic effects are found, however, in just a few studies. Moreover, CDD/R programming is better at producing outcomes directly associated with the project rather than broader changes in routine life. This study finds that CDD/R has been plagued by a panacea-type approach to goals and a generalised – and "unrealistic" (according to interviewees) theory of change. The author recommends an open and honest conversation about CDD/R, and more realistic goals, to guide the way forward.

Examining Inclusion: Disability and Community Driven Development

World Bank (2014). Washington DC: World Bank

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/impAccess/ResearchingtheIssuesNo72.pdf

This note discusses the varied strategies adopted by Community Driven Development (CDD) programmes to ensure the inclusion of disabled people. It is based on five case studies, which represent a wide spectrum of approaches. The note argues for an approach which integrates micro and macro interventions, and balances participatory processes with social protection mechanisms that are designed to include the needs of vulnerable groups. The importance of improved targeting, and building an appropriate enabling environment is also highlighted.

Key findings: The case studies analysed represent a wide spectrum of approaches, ranging from micro interventions such as CBR, education, vocational training and provision of other social and welfare services at community level, to macro interventions such as policy reform and advocacy within a disability rights framework. For CDD to be truly effective as an approach towards promoting the inclusion of disabled people, micro and macro approaches need to be integrated. Some emerging lessons on ways to include disabled people in CDD programmes are:

- ▪ Supporting a twin track approach of targeting people with disabilities and integrating their voices and needs within the broader project cycle. While specific sub-projects with an

emphasis on addressing disability concerns are valuable, communities should be encouraged to address the voices and needs of vulnerable groups.

- A strong enabling environment, wherein disability concerns are mainstreamed into institutional frameworks and are supported by progressive legislation. To ensure sustainability, it is also important that multiple stakeholders such as local government, civil society organisations, and the private sector, as well as disabled people are involved.

- Project staff should be equipped with capacities and resources to integrate disability in CDD programmes. People with disabilities should be employed as facilitators and project managers to ensure self-representation and better outreach.

- Inclusion of disabled people can be accomplished only if a "vulnerability perspective" is integrated in all aspects of CDD operations. Disability, much like gender, is a cross-cutting issue and should be incorporated in all stages of the project cycle – design and appraisal, implementation, review and monitoring and evaluation.

- Finally, it is important to balance the participatory and demand-driven approach of CDD programmes with social protection mechanisms that include the special needs of vulnerable groups as part of a rights-based paradigm. It is important to complement participatory processes with the provision of safety nets to not only ensure that the needs of people with disabilities are included in CDD programmes, but also that disabled people themselves are engaged as active participants.

Fast-Track Institution Building in Conflict-Affected Countries? Insights from Recent Field Experiments

King, E. and Samii, C. (2014). *World Development Volume 64,* December 2014, Pages 740–754. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2014.06.030

This article synthesises evidence from four recent 'community-driven development' field experiments in countries affected by violent conflict. Conflict-affected settings are presumed to combine extraordinary need and opportunity for building institutions. The substantive and methodological consistency of the field experiments (Afghanistan, DRC, Liberia, and Sierra Leone) enables general conclusions about attempts at local institution building in conflict-affected contexts. The study assesses prospects for externally driven "fast-track" institution building, meaning the strengthening of local capacities for inclusive problem solving and collective action over a few years. The study finds that the CDD programmes generally established successful community-level organisations, broadening the base of participation in local development and providing an opportunity for community members to meaningfully work together to achieve community goals. But the programmes largely failed to increase the capacity for collective action in a way that is durable and transferable beyond the CDD interventions. The authors suggest that the motivating assumptions that conflict-affected areas exhibit a special need and opportunity for building social institutions problematic. Further, programme design issues may undermine performance.

Randomized Impact Evaluation of Phase-II of Afghanistan's National Solidarity Programme (NSP): Estimates of Interim Program Impact from First Follow-Up Survey

Beath, A., Christia, F. & Ruben, E. (2013).

http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Full_Report_2090.pdf

The National Solidarity Programme (NSP) is the largest development programme in Afghanistan. It seeks to improve the access of rural villagers to basic services and to create a foundation of village governance based on democratic processes and female participation. This impact evaluation is a multi-year randomized control trial designed to measure the effects of implementation of the second phase of NSP on village governance; political attitudes and social cohesion; access to infrastructure, services, and utilities; and economic activity. The sample consists of 500 villages, out of which half received NSP. Its outcomes on inclusive societies are:

- An improvement in male villagers' perceptions of government and nongovernment officials and increased connections between villages and government and nongovernment institutions.

- Increased acceptance of elections as a means to select village headmen and of involving women in the process.

- Male, but not female, villagers are more supportive of female involvement in local governance because of NSP, although it has no effect on stated opinions of villagers on female employment, education, or medical treatment.

- The programme produces a sharp increase in the ability of male and female villagers to identify well-respected women in the village and improves access to support groups for village women. It also increases inter-village connections among women, although it does not affect the pattern of intra-village socialization.

- There is weak or no evidence that NSP affects levels of trust between villagers, the prevalence of village disputes or tribal feuds, or the probability of a village suffering an attack, but the programme appears to stem out-migration of households from villages.

The GoBifo Project Evaluation Report Assessing the Impacts of Community Driven Development in Sierra Leone

Casey, K. et al. (2013). New Delhi: International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie)

http://www.povertyactionlab.org/publication/gobifo-project-evaluation-report-assessing-impacts-community-driven-development-sierra-l

The impact evaluation conducted by 3ie seeks to rigorously test whether social inclusion goals have been achieved in Sierra Leone. 3ie conclude that the programme achieved what it intended: it established village-level structures and tools to plan and manage development projects; it provided communities with financing and guidance to implement small-scale projects; and it created links between these processes and local government institutions. Moreover, the contributions to and benefits from the sponsored projects were distributed broadly and equitably, and the leakage of project resources appears to be minimal. The extreme poverty, recent recovery from civil war and endemic struggles against corruption in Sierra Leone were seen to make these achievements even more impressive.

Reshaping Institutions: Evidence on Aid Impacts Using a Pre-Analysis Plan.

Casey, K., Glennerster, R., Miguel, E., (2011). NBER Working Paper No. 17012, National Bureau of Economic Research, Cambridge, US. http://www.nber.org/papers/w17012.pdf

This study evaluates the Go-Bifo CDD project in Sierra Leone that combined block grants for local public goods with intensive training and requirements for minority inclusion designed to catalyse collective action and empowerment. The study finds positive short-term effects on local public goods provision and economic outcomes, but no sustained impacts on collective action, decision-making processes, or the involvement of marginalised groups in local affairs.

- Exposure to democratic project processes did not make traditional elites more willing to seek out the views of others in making community decisions.

- Participation requirements did not foster learning-by-doing or demonstration effects large enough to change attitudes, norms or behaviours towards marginalised groups taking on leadership roles. Women and youth were no more likely to voice opinions about how the community should manage new public assets at the end of the project than at the beginning.

Understanding and Tackling Social Exclusion

Popay, J. et al. (2008). Final Report to the WHO Commission on Social Determinants of Health from the Social Exclusion Knowledge Network

http://www.who.int/social_determinants/knowledge_networks/final_reports/sekn_final%20report_042008.pdf

This final report on a large research programme on social exclusion identifies policies and actions which contribute to inclusion. These are:

- Universal systems of social protection and essential services

- Three types of community action are relevant to address exclusionary processes: (i) large scale social movements typically aiming for political change and social transformation; (ii) policies and actions, which may be sponsored by the state, NGOs or others, that seek to promote community involvement in decision making and/or community empowerment, and (iii) action by formal non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to address exclusionary processes such as delivering services.

- Private sector can help extend access to basic services, but has usually provided powerful exclusionary processes generated by market mechanisms at a global level.

Exploring the Impact of Community Solidarity Building Approach in Addressing Social Discrimination. Shiree Working Paper No. 13

Mizanur Rahman, M. et al. (2012). London: DFID

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/EEP/Shiree-WP13.pdf

This paper explores how the Social and Economic Transformation of the Ultra-poor (SETU) project, implemented by CARE-Bangladesh, builds community solidarity and how this solidarity addresses social discrimination at the community level. The SETU project suggests that changes in the poverty situation

are not a standalone matter; rather they require a combination of social inclusion, economic empowerment, pro-poor governance, and learning and influencing that works to graduate extreme poor households out of poverty. The research used a qualitative approach including a review of relevant literature, focus group discussion and interviews. The research noted that though the project impacted on discriminatory practices which started changing, hierarchical power structures persisted which impacted upon the ability of marginalised groups to assert their opinions. The establishment of community groups that facilitated the engagement of both poor and non-poor groups had some impact upon the lives of stakeholders. The report highlighted how some Union Parishads have started engaging in open budgeting and incorporating community feedback into planning processes. Communities traditionally marginalised have developed a greater awareness of their rights and responsibilities and are consequently raising their voice increasingly participating effectively. Additionally, the Union Parishads have become open enough to accept the views of the people and incorporate these accordingly.

7. Inclusion in statebuilding/peacebuilding/political settlements

The Politics of Poverty: Elites, Citizens and States Findings from ten years of DFID-funded research on Governance and Fragile States 2001–2010(a synthesis paper)
DFID Research and Evidence Division. (2011) London: DFID

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/PDF/Outputs/FutureState/dfid_Politics_BOOKMARK_SINGLESNEW.pdf

The paper synthesises findings from ten years of DFID-funded research on Governance and Fragile States 2001–2010 conducted by four research centres. The key message from all four research programmes is that to understand development we must understand the politics that shape it. The research shows that:

- Political settlement is central to all development; and one that does not exclude powerful players is more likely to prevent conflict,

- Settlements also need to work at the grassroots level, representing the interests of social groups,

- Security is a precondition for development; this is a matter of survival and must be prioritised in countries recovering from conflict.

Evidence presented in the synthesis paper shows that in countries where cultural or ethnic groups feel there is economic, political and social inequality, wars are more likely. The future face of insecurity is not restricted to civil wars – more and more people are dying in social violence, particularly in cities.

Leveraging Local Knowledge for Peacebuilding and Statebuilding in Africa.
Ó Súilleabháin, A. (2015). New York: International Peace Institute.

http://www.ipinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/IPI-Rpt-Leveraging-Local-Knowledge-rev.pdf

This report highlights examples of innovative peacebuilding and statebuilding at the community and local level across Africa. Five case studies explore the work of local actors, their relationship to and interaction with national actors and policies, and their influence on international programmes and planning.

In Egypt, women carried out community evaluations of public services, which offered constructive channels to communicate with local officials, and increased public respect for the women-led groups.

Women also participated in the constitution-making process, which succeeded in garnering a commitment to protect women against violence. In Zimbabwe, the introduction of the 'Alternatives to Violence' programme successfully steered youth militia away from post-election violence. This provides experiential learning and training to deal with conflict. The experimental results show that the treatment group shifted away from use of force, changed attitudes about violence, and have been rehabilitated into communities. The issue concludes that inclusivity must be promoted through integrating local approaches and knowledge.

Restoring Confidence: Moving Away from the Brink.

World Bank, (2011). *World Development Report 2011: Conflict, Security and Development, World Bank, Washington DC, ch. 4*.

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTWDRS/Resources/WDR2011_Chapter4.pdf

There are a number of pathways back from the brink of violent conflict, but there are two common elements in successful cases. The first is building 'inclusive-enough' coalitions, and identifying the signals and commitment mechanisms that can galvanise support for change. Pacts to end violence need not be all-inclusive, and can promote peace if they are minimally inclusive at the beginning. The second element is delivering results on the ground to build confidence in citizen security, justice and economic prospects. Country studies reveal different approaches for building coalitions at national, subnational and local levels, and several guiding principles emerge on what is 'inclusive enough':

- Groups may legitimately be excluded where there is a widespread belief that they have sacrificed their right to participate due to past abuses. Inclusion strategies can change over time.

- Including business and civil society groups that bring legitimacy and resources, and that will press for deeper institutional transformation is valuable. However, at the beginning it may be necessary for such parties to defer to political leadership on some decisions.

- There can be trade-offs between wide inclusiveness and efficiency of state decision-making, as including many groups may mean creating a government with many ministries.

- In the early stages of transition, building confidence requires policies that signal a break from the past and instil trust that new directions will not be reversed. This can be achieved through commitment mechanisms, such as robustly independent electoral commissions supplemented by regional or international technical and monitoring capacity.

- Signals used in successful transitions involved combined actions across the security-economic or political-economic domains. These include actions on security sector reform, social cohesion, wealth-sharing, transparency, human rights violations and political reform.

Indigenous and Tribal Peoples: An Ethnic Audit of Selected Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers

Tomei, M. (2005). London: Routledge http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---normes/documents/publication/wcms_100602.pdf

This paper from the International Labour Office surveys 14 Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) from countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America to evaluate the extent to which they address the varieties of economic, social and political exclusion faced by these communities. It argues that improved targeting,

data-collection and Indigenous and Tribal People's (ITPs) participation in PRSPs are required if they are to tackle poverty more successfully.

While significant differences exist in individual PRSPs' responses to ITP poverty both within and between the three continents, various over-riding themes emerge:

- PRSPs vary in their rationale for targeting ITP poverty. Reasons given include: to strengthen democracy and good governance (Bolivia), to counter insurgency (Nepal), or to recognise land and cultural rights in countries where legal frameworks protect indigenous rights.

- Disaggregated data-collection and poverty indicators which disregard indigenous populations' own perceptions of exclusion hamper poverty analysis in all PRSPs, except Vietnam's.

- Some PRSPs view political under-representation among ITPs as central to their economic exclusion. Bolivia's governance system promotes indigenous representation, while decentralisation in Asian countries could enhance ITP representation, but is insufficiently accommodating to the specific needs of ITPs.

- ITPs have not largely been consulted during the formulation of PRSPs. Logistical, linguistic and political barriers have excluded indigenous groups, except in Bolivia and Guyana where consultation mechanisms encouraged their participation.

- Although Bolivia and Vietnam advocate ethnic mainstreaming, most PRSPs envisage a targeted response to poverty, aimed either at poor areas inhabited by ITPs or directly at the ITPs themselves. These interventions are directed at improving services, productiveness and land tenure among indigenous groups.

Re-thinking Gender in Peacebuilding

Myrttinen, H. et al. (2014). London: International Alert
http://www.international-alert.org/sites/default/files/Gender_RethinkingGenderPeacebuilding_EN_2014.pdf

This report is based on a three-year research project on gender in peacebuilding, which involved field research in four countries (Burundi, Colombia, Nepal and Uganda). The research found that peacebuilding can be more effective if built on an understanding of how gendered identities are constructed through the societal power relations between and among women, men, girls, boys and members of sexual and gender minorities. The researchers noted that this 'gender-relational' approach is broader, in the sense that it moves away from equating gender with women (and girls) and deeper, in that it examines the interplay between gender and other identity markers, such as age, social class, sexuality, disability, ethnic or religious background, marital status or urban/rural setting.

Key findings included:

- Different forms of violence are often interlinked, with men, women, boys, and girls, and sexual and gender minorities facing different challenges and vulnerabilities. Although these links exist, they are often not linear or directly causal.

- Patterns of seeking to 'resolve' conflict through violent means – or being accepting of violence – are often linked to gender role expectations, which are reproduced by men, women and sexual and gender minorities in both the private and public spheres.

- Gendered perception of danger, often linked to social class and age, such as of 'the young, male ex-combatant' or 'the old, female witch', can often increase the vulnerability of the person perceived as being dangerous.

- Reducing societal violence requires taking a gender-relational approach to engaging with different stakeholders in society – for example, working with both men and women to help them understand and begin to change the different ways they each perpetuate violent attitudes and behaviour in response to certain circumstances. These efforts need to examine and take into account gendered power dynamics lest they cement existing disparities.

Inclusive Elite Bargains and the Dilemma of Unproductive Peace: a Zambian case study

Lindemann, S. (2014). London: Routledge

http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/01436597.2011.610585

This article contributes to recent debates on the link between political settlements and state building. It proposes a theoretical framework that centres on the alternative concept of 'elite bargain' and suggests that inclusive elite bargains can be expected to facilitate both peace and economic development. Yet a detailed case study of elite bargains in Zambia shows that all good things do not always go together. While inclusive elite bargains have indeed helped to avoid civil war, they have often constrained economic development—a dilemma of unproductive peace. The author concludes that large-N research finds that ethnic inclusion increases long-term economic growth rates, which seems to indicate that the Zambian case is little more than an 'outlier'. Nonetheless, Lindemann asserts that there is evidence that the Zambian dilemma of unproductive peace also affects other countries in sub-Saharan Africa and beyond, using the example of Tanzania, which exhibits trade-offs between peace and economic development that are strikingly similar to those observed in Zambia.

Development Assistance, Institution-Building and Social Cohesion after Civil War: Evidence from a Field Experiment in Liberia

Fearon, J., Humphreys, M., & Weinstein, J.M. (2009). Washington DC: Center for Global Development. http://www.columbia.edu/~mh2245/papers1/CGD_WP.pdf

The Center for Global Development undertook a randomised field experiment to assess the effects of a community-driven reconstruction (CDR) project carried out by the International Rescue Committee (IRC) in northern Liberia. This project attempted to build democratic, community-level institutions for making decisions about local public goods. The findings provide strong evidence that the CDR programme altered patterns of social cooperation and reinforced support for democratic practices, even six months after the programme's conclusion. However there was little evidence of positive improvement in material well-being: while access to education improved significantly, evidence for gains in livelihoods and asset holdings was weak. This is the first time a CDR evaluation has attempted to assess changes in actual behaviour in relation to community governance and cooperation, as opposed to changes in survey responses. Evidence of positive impact, and absence of negative impact, is therefore stronger than previous CDR evaluations.

What Difference Has Peacebuilding Made? A Study of the Effectiveness of Peacebuilding in Preventing Violence: Lessons Learned from the March 2004 Riots in Kosovo

CARE International and CDA-Collaborative Learning Projects (2006). CARE International and CDA-Collaborative Learning Projects, Pristina

http://www.cdacollaborative.org/media/82431/Has-Peacebuilding-Made-a-Difference-in-Kosovo-English.pdf

This paper reports on a study conducted in the aftermath of the riots to determine any peacebuilding programme gaps that inadvertently contributed to the recurrence of violence. 200 people were interviewed. While the riots should not be the only benchmark for assessing peacebuilding in Kosovo, peacebuilding programmes need to re-consider their heavy focus on multi-ethnicity as the core of their strategy.

- Contrary to expectation, places with greater inter-ethnic contact – whether in the form of business/economic ties or personal relationships – did not experience less violence.

- Intra-ethnic social networks (or 'bonding social capital') were more important than inter-ethnic engagement in preventing violence.

- Peacebuilding programming did not contribute significantly to prevention of interethnic violence.

- The focus on multi-ethnicity and returns as the core of peacebuilding increased divisions rather than improving relations.

The Involvement of Persons with Disabilities in Conflict Resolution and Peacebuilding Efforts: Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities (PWD) as Part of the Solution in the Post-Conflict Arena.
World Institute on Disability (2014).

http://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/WID-Disability-Inclusive-Peacebuilding-Process.pdf

This paper examines how and why people with disabilities (PWD) should be included in the conflict resolution and peace processes. There has only been one case study examining the experiences of persons disabled by war in the peace process. The paper uses this case study, which took place in Sierra Leone. It also draws from literature research, discussions with experts in the international disability community and interviews with practitioners who work in post-conflict countries.

Key Findings:

- When disability leaders/NGOs are included in civil society's conflict resolution and peacebuilding efforts, field practitioners foster the inclusion of all affected populations, which contributes to the successful implementation of peacebuilding initiatives.

- Including disability leaders/NGOs in the civil society peacebuilding process increases the effectiveness and innovation of peacebuilding initiatives because disability leaders/NGOs bring key experiences and specific skills that are directly applicable to implementing effective peacebuilding initiatives.

- The fundamental commonality of the experience of disability in all societies is a powerful and successful unifying theme for peacebuilding initiatives across conflict divides.

- A disability-focused, civil society peacebuilding initiative across conflict divides can be successful when initiatives by other civil society actors are not politically tolerated.

Demobilization and Reintegration

Humphreys, M. and Weinstein, J. M. (2007). *Journal of Conflict Resolution,* 51(4), pp.531-567, Yale University, New Haven. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0022002707302790

This article uses data on ex-combatants in Sierra Leone to analyse individual-level determinants of demobilisation and reintegration. Evidence from Sierra Leone does not support the hypothesis that participation in DDR programmes increases the degree to which their communities accept combatants. The data also shows no relationship between participation in DDR programmes and democratic attitudes, or the likelihood of breaking ties with factions or returning home. Theory suggests that DDR programmes should be more effective for combatants who distrust other groups or are dissatisfied with the results of the peace process. The evidence from Sierra Leone suggests that DDR programmes have no greater effect on these groups than on others. Failure to find evidence that DDR programmes have facilitated reintegration should be treated with caution, however, due to possible spill over and selection effects and sampling bias.

Measurement of different dimensions of reintegration produced distinct results, indicating that different processes underlie each dimension of reintegration. Analysis of the determinants of successful reintegration in Sierra Leone reveals that:

- individuals who distrust other factions are less likely to trust the democratic process or to have broken ties with their own factions;

- neither female nor younger ex-combatants face a significantly more difficult task in gaining acceptance, finding employment, breaking ties to factions or trusting democratic processes;

- less well educated and poorer individuals have more success in reintegrating, while more educated ex-combatants were less likely to be employed;

- higher ranking officers in the various military factions display a strong rejection of the democratic system;

- the abusiveness of the military faction in which a combatant participated is associated strongly and negatively with a combatant's ease in achieving reintegration; and

- individuals settling in wealthier locations face greater difficulty reintegrating, while those settling in communities which experienced greater suffering are less likely to gain community acceptance.

8. Women's inclusion in politics

Introduction: Quotas - Add Women and Stir?
Tadros, M., (2010). *IDS Bulletin,* vol. 41, no. 5., pp.1-10

http://www.dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1759-5436.2010.00160.x

Is women's empowerment directly related to the proportion of women in parliament? Have various forms of quota been successful in transforming gender relations? This article examines different pathways to women's empowerment and the assumptions about gender, power, and politics that underlie quotas. Quotas have been successful in increasing women's participation in politics, so are inclusive at a simple level. However, simply having more women in power has not in many cases resulted in deeper and wider transformation of gender relations. Closer examination reveals that:

- In many cases the adoption of quotas is not an expression of feminist agency but a coalition of different actors who have vested interests in forwarding other agendas, such as regime legitimacy.

- The kind of quota system adopted in a country and whether it actually transforms a society's wider gender relations depends on complex and context-specific political factors.

- Women political representatives are most effective where a strong and engaged local feminist movement supports them, and where they have a strong sense of representing a constituency.

- There is an assumption that women in parliament promote progressive political agendas, but this is not necessarily the case where conservative women connected to political and economic elites come to power.

Gendered Politics of Securing Inclusive Development
Nazneen, S. and Mahmud, S. (2012). London: DFID

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/EEP/Shiree-WP13.pdf

This paper interrogates the nature of gendered political settlements through analysing selected country case studies. It identifies the different contextual and structural factors that promote gender inclusive development policies and outcomes.

The paper argues that a political settlement framework stands to gain from using a gender lens as it allows for exploration of the role played by (gendered) ideas, (gender) ideology, informal relations, policy coalitions and bottom-up strategies in how settlements are reached and sustained. Key findings include:

- The factors that play important roles in determining how gender equity concerns are represented and decided upon in politics and policy making processes are: the interests and incentives of the political and social elites in promoting/obstructing gender equity concerns; the relationship and negotiations that take place between the feminist constituency and these actors on gender equity; the political opportunity structures that create or limit space for making claims around gender equity and the discourses around gender which influence the gender ideologies of these different actors.

- The political settlement perspective allows one to focus both on agency of different actors and structures; and also the interactions between these elements. This focus on structure,

> agency and their interaction, makes political settlement a useful perspective for understanding how women as actors are included and women's needs and gender equity concerns are negotiated in politics and policymaking processes and the subsequent outcomes.

- A major challenge in using a political settlement framework to unpack gendered politics of securing inclusive development is that its focus on incentives and interests is based on a rational choice analysis that leaves out the role played by ideologies. Gender ideologies play a key role in motivating behaviour of the actors, both of political and social elites, excluded elites, oppositional non-elites and women who may want to contest these ideologies.

Women's Voice and Leadership in Decision-Making: Assessing the evidence

Domingo, P. et al. (2015). London: ODI

http://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/9627.pdf

This report reviews the global evidence on the processes of change that enable women to have substantive voice and leadership in decision-making. It seeks to answer two main questions; 1) What are the enabling factors for women and girls' voice, leadership and access to decision-making? 2) What do we know about whether and how women and girls' voice, leadership and/or presence in decision making roles result in greater gender equality? Key findings include; Women's individual and collective action, whether in formal politics, civic society or the economy, provide opportunities for women to voice their needs and demands. Women often organise around their practical interests, particularly in the case of social and economic mobilisation. But women, usually from the elite, also come together to lobby for gender equality and to advance their strategic interests. However, Domingo et al. note that the variation in modes and levels of voice and influence means that it is not possible to track clear trajectories of change between women's voice and leadership and wider gender equality gains. The report concludes that there is no automatic link between women's presence and voice in public life and transformative change. Instead, the unity of women's collective voice, the degree to which the issues they raise are perceived as legitimate or representative and how women's interests intersect with men's, mediates this relationship. Findings across the literature emphasise that women may not be heard when they voice their demands and articulate feminist interests. The viability and sustainability of collective feminist voice depends on both mobilisation capabilities and resources for strategic action and coalition building. It also depends on there being institutional structures and political opportunities, including the political space for associational life, that enable voice to translate into influence. The report also provides a series of policy recommendations for international actors noting the centrality of context analysis.

Strengthening Women's Participation in Local Governance: Lessons and Strategies

Hicks, J. (2011). Oxford: Oxford University Press

http://cdj.oxfordjournals.org/content/46/suppl_1/i36.abstract

This article finds a disconnect between women's experience and knowledge and state policy and programmatic responses. It proposes two, formally linked, strategies to address this problem: 1) the creation of women-only forums, supported by training, to enable women to develop recommendations; and 2) the input of those recommendations into formal participation structures and processes.

Regarding women's participation, in 2007, the South African Department of Provincial and Local Government launched a Gender Policy Framework for Local Government, outlining comprehensive institutional arrangements to address gender and a detailed Gender Management System. Initial research suggests, however, that despite this elaborate gender-focused machinery and the provision of guidelines on gender mainstreaming, gender remains a 'side issue' in local government:

- In local development processes, participation by women is variable. Even where women dominate in numbers, they have limited influence due to power relations within institutions.

- The current system of ward committees, the primary driver of public participation at the municipal level, does not in itself enable meaningful citizen deliberation of development and planning issues, let alone women's full participation. The Municipal Structures Act stipulates that ward committees must include 'equitable representation of women and of a diversity of interests in the ward'. In practice, municipalities have tended to understand this as, after ensuring geographical representation, including 'one member from each sector representing women, youth, business, religion and the disabled'.

Given that new participatory spaces tend to reproduce existing power relations, mechanisms for participation must be designed and implemented differently if they are to enable women to influence state policy and programmes. The water committee model indicates the potential for participatory structures to be designed that, supported by training, enable women to articulate their needs and preferences in technical local governance processes. However, the inclusion of men in water committees resulted in women being marginalised. Women-only forums are therefore likely to be needed to protect women from inequitable power relations, enabling them to develop agendas that can be voiced in formal decision-making processes.

The African Union's Mechanisms to Foster Gender Mainstreaming and Ensure Women's Political Participation and Representation

Martin, O. (2013). Stockholm: International IDEA

http://www.idea.int/resources/analysis/loader.cfm?csModule=security/getfile&pageid=58486

This paper analyses the African Union's (AU) mechanisms to foster gender mainstreaming and women's political participation and representation in supranational/regional decision-making and reflects on areas of cooperation on these issues between the AU, EU and UN. It does so primarily by examining AU constitutional and policy documents. It further shows how the AU's creation has benefited from the UN and European experiences on the development of gender issues. The paper concludes with a brief overview of the challenges and some recommendations, intended as a resource for policymakers seeking to promote gender equality in political participation and representation.

Key findings:

- To date, 70 per cent of member states have gender policies and yet few of them have been implemented. They all share inadequate tracking and monitoring and evaluation systems, both within the AU and its member states.

- The AU's commitment to gender equality and women's empowerment is difficult to translate into concrete policies, programmes and actions due to the scarce capacities and resources of gender mechanisms, the slow process of change at legislative and policy levels,

- the lack of real political backing, unclear mandates, the confusion of overlapping memberships and the weak binding power of declarations, protocols and policies over member states.

- Leadership by national machineries and adequate data are important elements in gender mainstreaming strategies. Gaps in these areas hinder progress in the implementation of global commitments on gender equality.

Women's Political Participation and Economic Empowerment in Post-conflict Countries: Lessons from the Great Lakes region in Africa

Sow, N. (2012) London: International Alert / Eastern Africa Sub-Regional Support Initiative for the Advancement of Women. http://www.international-alert.org/sites/default/files/publications/201209WomenEmpowermentEN_0.pdf

Does women's increased representation in national and local decision-making translate into the adoption of gender equality policies and greater socio-economic status for women? This report highlights findings and recommendations from research on women's political participation and economic empowerment in Burundi, Rwanda, DRC and Uganda.

- In Burundi and DRC, women's level of representation in the official peace processes was low. Nevertheless, Burundian and Congolese women managed to have provisions for women's rights and gender equality included in the 2000 Arusha peace accord and the 2002 Global and All-inclusive Agreement for DRC.

- Burundi's 30 per cent women's representation quota has increased the number of women in decision-making bodies at all levels, but this did not necessarily lead to substantial and effective representation of women or to significant reduction in inequalities between men and women.

- The quota policy implemented by the Rwandan government led to greater representation of women in the decentralisation process. However, gender equality has not been properly integrated into the process and decentralisation has not enabled women to influence the policies defined at the local governance level.

- In DRC, women were actively involved in the 2006 general elections, and made up the majority of voters. However, very few of them managed to get elected: 8 per cent at the National Assembly and 8.6 per cent in the Senate.

Demonstrating Legislative Leadership: The Introduction of Rwanda's Gender-Based Violence Bill.

Pearson, E. (2008), Initiative for Inclusive Security, Hunt Alternatives Fund, Washington, DC

http://www.inclusivesecurity.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/1078_rwanda_demonstrating_legislative_leadership_updated_6_20_08.pdf

What can be learnt from the work of Rwanda's female parliamentarians? This report reviews the literature concerning women's participation in politics, and specifically considers the issue of gender-

based violence in Rwanda and the role of women in Rwanda's government. Even in the brief period since their election in 2003, women have improved the dialogue between the grassroots and national levels, enhanced collaboration between civil society and the government, demonstrated legislative leadership, and advocated for human rights, creating a more inclusive society for women in Rwanda. Factors behind the successful development of the gender-based violence (GBV) law included soliciting input from constituents, close relationships with civil society, the way they conceptualised their roles as representatives of women, and the strategies they employed for including male colleagues in the fight against gender-based violence.

Empowering the 'Socially Excluded' in Rural Local Governments: An Exploratory Study from a State In India

Bonu, S., Rani, M., Peters, D. H., & Baker, T. D. (2011). *Journal of International Development*, *23*(1), 42-62. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jid.1566

The study investigates the effects of mandatory political representation of women and non-forward castes in India (73rd Constitutional Amendment) on development preferences and social equity. It uses systematic content analysis of proceedings from meetings of 155 rural village assemblies. The study reveals overemphasis on physical infrastructure, relative neglect of health and education, influence of state government directives and marginalisation of gender issues. However, there was higher likelihood of articulation of non-forward caste-related issues by non-forward caste chairpersons.

The 73rd Constitutional Amendment of India has been hailed as a watershed in social legislation, attempting to correct age-old social inequities in rural India. It ushered in a new hope for rural development by restoring faith in the PRIs. However, evidence from studies since the implementation of 73rd Constitutional Amendment has not shown large changes in social equity related to mandatory representation for women and non-forward castes.

9. Social protection

A systematic review of the evidence of the impact of eliminating school user fees in low-income developing countries

Morgan, C., Petrosino, A., & Fronius, T. (2013). London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London.
http://www.wested.org/wp-content/files_mf/1370973644SchoolFees2012MorganReport1.pdf

Morgan et al. conducted a systematic review of studies of interventions in low-income developing countries that evaluated the elimination of school user fees paid by households. They identified five rigorous experimental and quasi-experimental evaluations that met their selection criteria. This included three evaluations of free uniform provision to primary school children in Kenya, one on the impact of free universal primary education in Uganda and one on a secondary school fees elimination programme in Malawi. Outcomes reported across the evaluations included impacts on duration of enrolment, drop-out, grade advancement, re-enrolment, absenteeism, age at school entry and marriage and childbearing. All of the studies reported positive outcomes in one or more of these areas for the children involved. The findings highlight the need for more rigorous empirical research to investigate the effects of various types

of school fees elimination policies in low-income countries – particularly on the effectiveness of targeting the most vulnerable groups, tradeoffs in education quality, and the extent to which fees abolition policies can be sustained over time without undue donor dependency.

A Systematic Review of the Evidence of the Impact of School Voucher Programmes in Developing Countries

Morgan, C., Petrosino, A., & Fronius, T. (2013). London: EPPICentre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London.

http://r4d.dfid.gov.uk/pdf/outputs/systematicreviews/VoucherProgrammes2013Morgan.pdf

Morgan et al. conducted a systematic review of evaluations of education voucher programmes in developing countries. They identified two studies that met their inclusion criteria – one examining the Colombia PACES programme and the other evaluating the Quetta, Pakistan Urban Fellowship programme. Their key findings are:

- Both programmes increased private school enrolment amongst the countries' poorest income groups, thus probably improving equity.

- The Pakistan programme resulted in girls being educated for less than it would have cost for the government to create public school spaces, while the Colombia programme cost more, but will most likely prove cost-effective in terms of long-term economic gains.

The authors conclude that "more rigorous research in developing country contexts is necessary to determine whether the gains from these two programmes can be replicated and enhanced and to elucidate the many issues surrounding vouchers".

Can social inclusion policies reduce health inequalities in sub-Saharan Africa?—a rapid policy appraisal

Rispel, L. C., de Sousa, C. A. P., & Molomo, B. G. (2009). *Journal of health, population, and nutrition*, *27*(4), 492. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2928096/

This paper reviews three categories of social inclusion policies in the health sector: cash-transfers; free social services; and specific institutional arrangements for programme integration in six selected countries—Botswana, Mozambique, South Africa, Ethiopia, Nigeria and Zimbabwe. The policies were appraised as part of the Social Exclusion Knowledge Network (SEKN) set up under the auspices of the World Health Organization's Commission on Social Determinants of Health.

Crosscutting benefits include: poverty alleviation, notably among vulnerable children and youths; improved economic opportunities for disadvantaged households; reduction in access barriers to social services; and improved nutrition intake. The impact of these benefits, and hence the policies, on health status can only be inferred. The authors conclude that while the policies may be strong on inclusion, their design and implementation is weak.

How do Social Protection and Labour Programmes Contribute to Social Inclusion? Evidence from Afghanistan, Bangladesh, India and Nepal

Babajanian, B. et al. (2014). London: ODI

http://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/8922.pdf

This paper draws on the findings from four country case studies that examined the role of social protection and labour programmes in promoting social inclusion: life skills education and livelihoods training (Adolescent Reading Centres (ARCs) for young women in Afghanistan); asset transfers (the Chars Livelihoods Programme (CLP)) in the Chars and a food transfer programme (Vulnerable Group Development (VGD)) in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) in Bangladesh; the Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY) health insurance programme in India; and the Child Grant cash transfer in Karnali region in Nepal. The research used a social exclusion framework to guide design and analysis.

The findings show that these interventions have contributed to wellbeing outcomes. The interventions have had some, albeit small, impact on the drivers of social exclusion. All programmes target either geographically excluded areas or excluded groups (ethnic minorities, women). The paper notes that all interventions have – to some extent – contributed to strengthening social relations, including social participation and social networks. Furthermore, the RSBY scheme in India has institutionalised inclusive health care provision through public health insurance to poor households, where marginalised groups, such as poor lower castes and Muslims, were previously excluded. In Bangladesh, an integrated economic and social approach through CLP has opened up productive opportunities for women and allowed them to diversify their livelihood activities. The authors conclude that, on many occasions, the interventions did not deliver transformative changes in the lives and livelihoods of excluded households and individuals.

The Impact of Mutual Health Organizations on Social Inclusion, Access to Health Care, and Household Income Protection: Evidence from Ghana, Senegal, and Mali

Diop, F. et al. (2006). Maryland: ABT Associates Inc.

http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/Pnadh424.pdf

This study uses regression analysis of household survey data from Ghana, Mali, and Senegal to investigate the effects of household and individual characteristics on enrolment in Mutual Health Organisations (MHOs) (social inclusion), the impact of MHO membership on use of priority health care services, and the impact of MHO membership on out-of-pocket health care expenditures (household income protection). Findings on social inclusion indicate a positive association between MHO membership and education as well as employment of the head of household. Findings included:

- Households headed by women are more likely to enrol in MHOs than households headed by men.

- The evidence on the association between household economic status and MHO enrolment is inconclusive, and suggests that enrolment in a MHO may depend upon other dimensions of social inclusion, such as type of MHO ownership.

- Adverse selection appears to be operating primarily at the individual level: there is some evidence that those with a disability or chronic illness and the elderly may be more likely to enrol in MHOs than individuals with healthier profiles.

- MHO coverage has some positive effect on the use of modern health care. In Ghana and Mali, MHO coverage increases curative care seeking from a modern health care provider, and women who are beneficiaries of MHOs are more likely to have had at least four prenatal care visits compared to women who are not beneficiaries of MHOs. However, this result is not confirmed in Senegal.

- In Ghana, women who were beneficiaries of a MHO were more likely to deliver in a hospital. There is no conclusive evidence from Mali or Senegal on the association between delivery with a modern provider and MHO coverage.

- While MHO membership has no effect on out of pocket expenditures for curative outpatient care, it has a strong protective effect against the potentially catastrophic expenditures related to hospitalisation.

The authors conclude that enrolment in a MHO can increase access to health care and provide protection against the financial risks associated with illness. However, these outcomes vary according to the structure of the benefits package, co-payment policies and the schedule of contributions.

Protecting Education for the Poor in Times of Crisis: An Evaluation of a Scholarship Programme in Indonesia

Sparrow, R. (2007). *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics, 69(*1), 99-122. http://www.dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0084.2006.00438.x

This paper analyses the impact of the Indonesian Social Safety Net scholarship programme, which was implemented in 1998 to preserve access to education for the poor during the economic crisis. Targeting was pro-poor for primary and junior secondary school, but there was also a lot of leakage to wealthier groups. For senior secondary school the scholarships were not allocated pro-poor at all, but instead distributed quite evenly across the per capita consumption quintiles. Without the JPS programme enrolment would have dropped substantially, especially in primary school. Amongst programme participants aged between 10 and 12 years, 10% would have dropped out of school if they had not received a scholarship. For the age group 13–15 years the programme increased the enrolment rate by 0.8 percentage point, although these estimates are not precise. For children aged 16–18 years no significant effect was found. These results suggest that secondary school scholarships did little to affect enrolment. The scholarships were especially effective for children whose education attainment was most vulnerable to the effects of the crisis. The strongest effects of the scholarships were found amongst children at primary school in rural areas, from households that live below the poverty line. Scholarship recipients were more likely to go to school and less likely to work, but only for students of secondary school age. The effects on child labour are largest for the poor.

Can a public scholarship program successfully reduce school drop-outs in a time of economic crisis? Evidence from Indonesia

Cameron, L. (2009). *Economics of Education Review*, *28*(3), 308-317. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2007.09.013

This study analyses the impact of the Indonesian Jaring Pengamanan Social (JPS) cash grants programme on school dropouts among students at primary schools, lower secondary schools and upper secondary schools. It was set up to alleviate the effects on education of the economic crisis that hit Indonesia in

1997. Scholarships were allocated by enrolling students belonging to the lowest socioeconomic status level. This study collected data from 12,000 households in 100 villages located in 8 of Indonesia's 27 provinces. The study used the probit model, controlling for village fixed effects and for as large a number of covariates as possible.

The JPS programme had no impact on dropouts at the primary school level. It had a strong, negative impact on dropouts at the lower secondary level. Students living in households that had been granted a scholarship had a 2.3 per cent lower likelihood of leaving school. In other words, the scholarship programme lowered the dropout rate by 38 per cent. The author did not estimate the impact of the JPS programme for the upper secondary level because the sample size was small with village fixed effects in the regression.

Two policy implications emerge from this study. First, cash transfers may be an effective way to reduce school dropouts during economic crises if they are targeted at poor households. Second, these transfers should be made at the school level at which the dropout rate is high.

Access, Sorting, and Achievement: The Short-Run Effects of Free Primary Education in Kenya.

Lucas, A. and Mbiti, I.M. (2012). *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics 2012,* 4(4): 226–253. http://dx.doi.org/10.1257/app.4.4.226

The authors "examine the impact of the Kenyan Free Primary Education programme on student participation, sorting, and achievement on the primary school exit examination". Exploiting variation in pre-programme dropout rates between districts, they "find that the programme increased the number of students who completed primary school, spurred private school entry, and increased access for students from disadvantaged backgrounds". They "argue that the programme was welfare enhancing as it promoted educational access without substantially reducing the test scores of students who would have been in school in the absence of the programme".

10.   Other categories

Institutional Change and its Impact on the Poor and Excluded

Narayana, D. (2005). Paris: OECD. http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/institutional-change-and-its-impact-on-the-poor-and-excluded_855711082322

This study from the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development examines newly created local governance institutions (the Panchayat) in three states in India. It finds significant variation in the outcomes of decentralisation on participation across states and between different marginalised groups. Women were under-represented in all three states. The success of institutional reforms in increasing participation is influenced by how well their designs fit the local context, the extent to institutions, and the degree of local political mobilisation. For example, Kerala's greater degree of political representation among the poor and disadvantaged may be explained by its better developed political parties, denser civil society network, and higher levels of education and literacy. Given that the outcomes of institutional reforms are largely influenced by local factors such as the vibrancy of political society, social capital, and

the structure of governance, these reforms should be implemented in conjunction with other policies as part of a larger plan to empower excluded groups in society.

Can Land Registration Serve Poor and Marginalised Groups? Summary Report

Kanji, N., Cotula, L., Hilhorst, T., Toulmin, C., & Witten, W. (2005). *International Institute for Environment and Development, London*. http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/12518IIED.pdf

This research examines the current processes of land rights registration in Ethiopia, Ghana and Mozambique and assesses their outcomes for vulnerable groups. It shows that land registration is not inherently anti-poor. The distributional consequences of land registration depend on the design of the registration process and of the institutions responsible for its management. In Ethiopia, land registration systems are being designed and pilot programmes carried out in several states. In Ghana, an ambitious Land Administration Programme has begun, which has chosen to do much of its work through Customary Land Secretariats. In Mozambique, the 1997 Land Law is being implemented – a law which has been recognised internationally as demonstrating a strong pro-poor approach.

The diversity of land registration systems and processes in the three country case studies illustrates the importance of avoiding a 'one size fits all' solution.

- Systematic land registration in Tigray and in the 'traditional' system in Amhara is decentralised, uses local languages, is cheap (partly because boundaries are not recorded) and records are stored at a local level.

- Collective rights registration, as in Mozambique, provides access for large 'communities' to register their land rights and can increase security for smallholder farmers when negotiating with outsiders.

- In the process of land registration, secondary rights may not be registered and women often lose out. Where they have equal rights to land, and land registration records these rights, they may gain greater tenure security.

Building the capacity of local land institutions over time is a key challenge. However, there is considerable experience from which to learn:

- Land registration systems can be set up to address the risk of bias against marginalised groups by considering issues of language, cost and accessibility and by recording secondary rights.

- Land registration systems need to be phased and tailored to local circumstances. They should be as simple and locally based as possible, and should evolve on the basis of experience.

- Whether land titles improve the tenure security of local users depends on the existence of strong local institutions that are able to uphold and defend the rights embodied in those documents.

- Effective accountability mechanisms are needed for land registration and oversight and dispute settlement institutions.

Can mobile internet help alleviate social exclusion in developing countries?

Chigona, W., Beukes, D., Vally, J., & Tanner, M. (2009). Can mobile internet help alleviate social exclusion in developing countries? *The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in Developing Countries*, *36*.
https://www.ejisdc.org/ojs2.../index.php/ejisdc/article/view/535/270

This study explores whether mobile internet may be a viable option for addressing social exclusion in South Africa. Data for the study was gathered using semi-structured interviews with socially excluded individuals and then examined using thematic analysis. The findings of the study show that usage of mobile internet amongst the socially excluded is low mainly because internet-capable cell phones are still beyond the reach of the socially excluded and because of limited awareness of what mobile internet is and what it can achieve. The study also shows that while mobile internet has significant impact in addressing exclusion from social participation, usually increasing social ties through text messaging, its impact on economic as well as political dimensions of exclusions is still limited.

11.   About this report

Key websites

- Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity (CRISE):
  http://www.qeh.ox.ac.uk/research/research-networks/crise-network

- Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC): http://www.chronicpoverty.org/

- Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability (Citizenship DRC): http://www.drc-citizenship.org/

- Social Exclusion Knowledge Network (SEKN):
  http://www.who.int/social_determinants/themes/socialexclusion/en/

- World Bank – Community Driven Development:
  http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/communitydrivendevelopment

Related reports

Carter, B. (2015). *Benefits to society of an inclusive societies approach* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1232). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/publications/benefits-to-society-of-an-inclusive-societies-approach/

Alexander, K. (2015). *Inclusive growth: Topic guide.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/inclusive-growth/

Broadbent, E. (2010). *Helpdesk Research Report: Land and Property Rights Interventions.* Birmingham, UK: Governance and Social Development Resource Centre, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=612

Browne, E. (2013). *Ethnic minority public sector employment* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 989). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=989

Browne, E. (2014). *Community-driven development and indigenous, ethnic minority, and disability issues.* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1132). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1132

Browne, E. (2014). *Elected women's effectiveness at representing women's interests* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1111). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1111

Browne, E. (2014). *Gender in community-driven development*. (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1079). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1079

Browne, E. (2014). *Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex rights in national human rights institutions.* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1098). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1098

Browne, E. (2015). *Evidence on programmes' effectiveness on horizontal political inclusion* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1233). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/publications/evidence-on-programmes-effectiveness-on-horizontal-political-inclusion/

Carter, B. (2013). *Interventions to increase levels of trust in society.* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 941). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=941

Carter, B. (2014). *Inclusive Institutions: Topic Guide.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/inclusive-institutions

Combaz, E. (2013). *Poor people's rights and successful legal actions* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report), Birmingham, UK: Governance and Social Development Resource Centre, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=891

Combaz, E. (2013). *Social inclusion in productive safety net programmes* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1005). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1005

Combaz, E. and Mcloughlin, C., (2014). *Voice, empowerment and accountability: Topic guide.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/voice/-empowerment/-and-accountability

Fraser, E. (2012). *Helpdesk Research Report: Gender Inclusive Urban Planning.* Birmingham: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=804

Haider, H. (2008). *Helpdesk Research Report: Participation of Excluded Groups in Local Governance.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=468

Haider, H. (2010). *Helpdesk Research Report: Civil Society and Excluded Groups.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=587

Haider, H. (2010). *Helpdesk Research Report: Literature Review on Inclusive Growth.* Birmingham: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=588

Haider, H. (2011). *Helpdesk Research Report: Effects of Political Quotas for Women.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=757.

Haider, H. (2011). *Helpdesk Research Report: Youth statebuilding and peacebuilding interventions.* Birmingham, UK: Governance and Social Development Resource Centre, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=771

Haider, H. (2011). *State-Society Relations and Citizenship in Situations of Conflict and Fragility.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/state-society-relations-and-citizenship

Haider, H. (2014). *Statebuilding and peacebuilding in situations of conflict and fragility.* Revised edition with A. Strachan. Birmingham: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/statebuilding-and-peacebuilding

Kangas, A., Haider, H., and Fraser, E. (2014). *Gender: Topic Guide.* Revised edition with E. Browne. Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/gender

Khan, S. (2008). *Helpdesk Research Report: Community Participation in Disaster Rehabilitation and Recovery.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=440

Khan, S. (2012). *Topic Guide on Social Exclusion.* Revised edition with E. McAslan Fraser. Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/topic-guides/social-exclusion

McAslan Fraser, E. (2011). *Helpdesk Research Report: Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender (LGBT) and Aid.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=769

Mcloughlin, C. (2009). *Helpdesk Research Report: Donor Activities Supporting Women in Elected Political Spaces.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=549

Mcloughlin, C. (2012). *Helpdesk Research Report: Successful Gender Ministries.* Birmingham, UK: Governance and Social Development Resource Centre, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=828

Oddsdottir, F. (2014). *Social protection programmes for people with disabilities* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1137). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1137

Rohwerder, B. (2014). *Disability inclusion in social protection* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1069). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=1069

Scott, Z. (2008). *Helpdesk Research Report: Constitutions and minorities.* Birmingham: GSDRC, University of Birmingham. http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=437

Walton, O. (2012). *Helpdesk Research Report: Economic Benefits of Disability-Inclusive Development.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=831

Walton, O. (2012). *Helpdesk Research Report: Evidence for the Development Impact of Inclusive Service Delivery.* Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Helpdesk&id=851

Suggested citation

About this report

12.   Annex A: Methodology

Identifying literature

The following search terms were applied to a range of electronic databases and websites to identify relevant literature:

- Inclusive society + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation

- Social exclusion + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation

- Social inclusion + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation

- Inclusion

- Exclusion

The searches were conducted between 25 and 30 June 2015 and yielded the following results:

Source	Number of studies screened
R4D	
Social exclusion	248
Social inclusion	302
Inclusive society	84
Campbell Library	0
3ie Systematic Review Database	164
3ie Impact Evaluation Repository	77
GSDRC	
Social exclusion	311
Social inclusion	509
Inclusive society	377
Google Scholar	Screened first 100 results
Social exclusion + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation	67,100 results
Social inclusion + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation	44,700 results
Inclusive society + evidence OR outcome OR impact OR evaluation	12,000 results

Studies were included if they met the following criteria:

- Published within the last 10 years
- English language only
- Geographical focus is low- or middle-income countries
- Relevance – our primary focus was to identify evidence about inclusive outcomes, although studies that provided contextual evidence were also included.

Primary evidence on impacts, outcomes and results of interventions was prioritised, along with systematic and rigorous literature reviews. Theoretical, conceptual and policy papers were excluded.

A total of 266 studies were identified as potentially relevant based on the study's abstract. This number was reduced to 80 following a full review of the papers.

Quality assessment

Each study was assessed against a simplified framework derived from DFID's How to Note: *Assessing the Strength of Evidence*[2] in order to make an overall judgement of quality.

Because of the emphasis on finding primary evidence, most primary evidence papers were included in the final subset without conducting a rigorous quality assessment. Some primary evidence papers were excluded if they did not provide significant discussion of methods and thus could not be described as high-quality.

Secondary evidence was assessed against the following criteria:

Quality indicator		Score
Does the author outline how studies were selected for inclusion?	Yes = 1 No = 0	
Does the author state where they searched for the studies?	Yes = 1 No = 0	
Does the author attempt any quality assessment of studies they found?	Yes = 1 No = 0	
To what extent are the study's conclusions demonstrably based on the studies it reviewed?	Not at all = 0 Somewhat = 1 Fully = 2	
High quality = 5 Moderate quality = 3-4 Low quality = 0-2	TOTAL:	

Given the time constraints and resources, individual researchers' assessments and scoring of papers were not cross-checked against each other. While the approach was consistent, there remains a degree of subjectivity in interpreting the extent to which a study demonstrates that it has met those criteria to a high standard. This may lead to discrepancies in the application of the inclusion criteria. In addition judgements were based on the information provided in each paper; a lack of detail relating to particular criteria may therefore have affected the overall quality assessment.

---

[2]   https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/291982/HTN-strength-evidence-march2014.pdf