Social media and governance

Evie Browne

28.01.2015

Question

What is the recent evidence on the impact of social media on governance of social, political, and economic bodies? How is social media regulated and governed in low-income and fragile contexts?

Contents

1. Overview  
2. Political participation  
3. Transparency and accountability  
4. Peacebuilding  
5. Private sector  
6. Internal governance  
7. About this report

1. Overview

This report presents an annotated bibliography of papers reviewing social media and governance. It includes development contexts, humanitarian contexts, conflict and post-conflict contexts and fragile states.

‘Social media’ refers to “web-based tools and services that allow users to create, share, rate and search for content and information without having to log in to any specific portal site or portal destination. These tools become ‘social’ in the sense that they are created in ways that enable users to share and communicate with one another.” (Bohler-Muller & Van der Merwe, 2011: 3). This includes social networking sites, blogs, microblogs, video blogs, discussion forums and others.

It is commonly noted in the literature that new ICTs favour those already in power, and elites. Internet access is still somewhat restricted to middle- and high-income populations. Across most of the countries studied, Facebook is the most highly accessed social media site.
The literature suggests that social media has a lot of potential to be used for governance purposes, but that this is not capitalised on in most contexts. Many governments are using e-government strategies and disseminating information through online channels, but not soliciting citizen feedback. Where there are two-way channels, it is very unclear whether citizen feedback is acted upon. There is promising evidence on social media improving transparency of organisations and government ministries, but less evidence on whether this improves accountability. There are a few discrete examples of e-government working successfully in specific programmes, but the overall evidence base suggests social media is not widely used as a direct route of communication with government. There is even less literature on social media used to monitor or report on corporate activities or other organisations’ governance. In general, there is a strong assumption in the literature that internet access and social media will improve transparency, accountability, and good governance, but little evidence on how this is achieved.

There is a reasonable amount of literature looking at the technologies needed to facilitate social media. There is a large amount of literature on ICTs for development, particularly mobile phones, and on e-governance. Mobile phones are increasingly used as a means to access the internet, which has increased usage of social media sites, which no longer need access to a personal computer.

A large part of the literature focuses on how social media is used as a route to political activism or democracy. In particular, there are many reports on the Arab Spring. This report does not directly review social media and activism and/or social movements, except where the literature draws links with governance. Nor does this report directly review social media’s contribution to political democracy. Papers looking at post-conflict, conflict management, truth and reconciliation commissions can be found in Rohwerder (2015). Transparency International’s Anti-Corruption Resource Centre has produced a report on ICTs used to reduce corruption, which contains some examples of social media (Wickberg, 2013). This paper agrees that there is little evidence but positive signs of ICTs’ impact on corruption.

Social media has impacted on governance in the following ways:

- **Political participation**: governments have provided formal online channels for citizens to report crime, comment on policy, or petition for change. Largely this is restricted to a small elite of internet users, and government websites are not popular. Citizens often use social media to organise between themselves for activism and protest.

- **Transparency and accountability**: citizens have used social media to communicate, report and map issues in society, which has increased pressure on governments to respond.

- **Peacebuilding**: social media have been used to monitor violence, which can support peacebuilding, although media can also be used to incite violence.

- **Private sector**: social media used by businesses can increase transparency and customer communication, as well as create new forms of leadership.

- **Internal governance**: new legislation and regulation of social media is controversial. Some online hate speech constitutes a crime, and some governments have shut down internet services in an attempt to control social media.

---

1 The literature search included the following terms, which found no or very few papers of relevance to the query: “social media AND tax”; “social media AND tax evasion”; “social media AND fraud”; “social media AND natural resource”; “social media AND economic governance”; “social media AND social exclusion”; “social media AND police”; “social media AND justice”; “social media AND rule of law”.
2. Political participation

*Liberation technology.*
http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/journal_of_democracy/v021/21.3.diamond.html

This brief opinion piece describes how the Internet, mobile phones, and other forms of “liberation technology” enable citizens to express opinions, mobilise protests, monitor elections, scrutinise government, and deepen participation. Autocratic governments are also learning to master these technologies, however. A case study from Malaysia shows how internet access has facilitated alternative and independent journalism. In contrast, China’s government maintains control of the internet, but sees ongoing resistance to censorship. Applications such as YouTube, FrontlineSMS and Ushahidi have been used to monitor government violence, elections and other accountability issues.

*How Are Parliaments Using New Media to Engage with Citizens?*

This article uses survey data from the Global Centre for ICT 2009 to provide a baseline on the current state of new media use by parliaments, and influencing factors. Respondents to the survey came from 109 countries and 134 chambers. 97 per cent of parliaments have a website, but only about half of these are used to publish legislation and/or seek input from citizens. Use of social media by parliaments is more tentative. 72 per cent of parliaments webcast meetings and proceedings, but less than half of parliaments use e-petitions, e-consultations or online discussion groups. 12 per cent use Twitter and 13 per cent other social networking sites. Blogs are the most widely used at 22 per cent. All these newer forms of communication are more prevalent in higher-income countries. This may reflect the lack of internet penetration in low-income countries, where radio is more likely to reach citizens.

*The Innovative use of Social Media to Advance Citizens’ Participation in Government.*

This paper reviews the autonomous use of social media and ICTs by civil society organisations in South Africa for purposes of protest or advocacy. It first provides an overview of the upsurge in use of social media worldwide for protest and political activism, including advantages and risks. Facebook is the most visited website across all of Africa’s internet users, who make up 10 per cent of Africa’s population. This implies that social media usage is restricted to elites. South Africa had 2.5 million Facebook users in 2010, a small percentage of the population but the second highest in Africa (Egypt has the highest number of users). This comprises about half the internet-enabled population of South Africa, while in Nigeria only 9 per cent of internet users access Facebook.
Many activist groups have their own websites and social media channels in South Africa. These are used to disseminate news and information, and/or criticise government, and appear to be moderately mature and well-developed. Resistance to the Protection of Information Bill largely happened through social media. Limited internet access means these channels are currently out of reach of the poorest and most marginalised.

The potential of social media to influence socio-political change on the African Continent.


This policy brief examines the use of social media and mobile phones in Africa. It argues that the use of social media tools has high potential for bringing about political and social change, through enhancing opportunities for political participation and opening new spaces for active citizenship. Egypt and South Africa have the highest number of Facebook users in African countries, and Facebook is the most visited website for internet users in Africa. However, the internet penetration rate remains low at 10 per cent of the population. The authors present short case studies of the revolution in Tunisia and journalism in South Africa, concluding that social media represents a new channel for participative democracy.

The use of blogs for political campaigning in a developing country context: the case of South Africa.


This exploratory research investigates the impacts and implications of blogging in the 2009 election campaign in South Africa. Qualitative content analysis of 31 blog posts relevant to the election campaigns shows that blogging for political campaigning is low in South Africa. There were no blogs from citizens, only journalists and political parties. This indicates that even the media were not engaging in political debate through blogs. The content of the blogs reflected electoral issues such as crime, corruption, and education. The authors conclude that social media has not yet enabled the electorate to set the political agenda.

Social media, e-governance and developing countries: insights from India.


This paper uses case studies to explore how municipal Facebook accounts are used by the public. It examines the Facebook pages of the Municipal Corporation of Delhi, the Delhi Traffic Police, and the Planning Commission. Only 7 per cent of India’s population have internet access, which excludes most of the poorest, and those who do not speak English. The paper finds that the Facebook accounts are not widely used, but that local government is more widely used than national government sites.
Understanding risks, benefits, and strategic alternatives of social media applications in the public sector.


What are public servants’ perceptions of social media? This paper presents opinions from 250 public servants in Central Mexico. The conclusions of the analysis are 1) that governments' participation in social media may result in improved communication and citizen participation, more transparency, and transfer best practices among government agencies; 2) that a good implementation strategy is necessary to realise these benefits and to avoid risks; and 3) that the implementation of social media highlights the importance of updating laws and regulations, and of promoting changes in government culture and organisational practices.

Social media in Egyptian government websites: Presence, usage, and effectiveness.


The first phase of this study examined the presence of social media applications on Egyptian government websites. The second phase analysed the use of Facebook by governmental entities in Egypt. Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube were the top social media applications in Egyptian government websites. Social media were mainly used to post information, with very little two-way interaction between citizens and government. Only 5.6 per cent of the websites were ‘talked about’ on social media. The authors conclude that while social media has potential for transformative change, it may be more effective as a catalyst for change. At present, citizens are not using social media to communicate directly with government.

Microblogs in China: Bringing the state back in


Through a discourse analysis of the current Chinese debate on the role of microblogs in China, this paper argues that China’s political elites have revised their social management strategy. They now tend to base their political decision-making on strategic calculations that reflect online public opinion in order to increase the political system’s efficiency and to generate a new kind of performance-based legitimacy. The opening of new input channels on the internet in China suggests a more responsive approach to social steering and the balancing of state–society relations, but there is little evidence of what impact these communications have on policy. Government microblogs do not mark any major shift in the party-state’s Internet strategy. These government–citizen e-communication platforms may serve a venting function, which is thought to prevent large-scale public dissent.
Social Media and Civic Participation: Literature Review and Empirical Evidence from Bangladesh and Palestinian Territories.


With data from the BBC Media Action Global Grant surveys in the Palestinian Territories and Bangladesh on the relationship between social media use and civic participation, this report assesses the role of social media in governance. It finds that social media is positively associated with offline civic participation and political efficacy.

‘Social Media and the Environment Online’.


This chapter reviews the new use of social media for global environmental activism and communications. Social media is used to share information and news, connect with NGOs and other organisations, document and report on issues, publically criticise, hold organisations accountable, and mobilise supporters. The chapter goes on to describe how social media has been effectively used for political advocacy for a green agenda.

3. Transparency and accountability

The role of crowdsourcing for better governance in fragile state contexts.


This chapter offers an overview of crowdsourcing as a resource for development, crisis response and post-conflict recovery. Crowdsourcing is a collaborative exercise that enables a community to form and to produce something together: “the act of taking a job traditionally performed by a designated agent (usually an employee) and outsourcing it to an undefined, generally large group of people” (p.1). The paper reviews the factors necessary for crowdsourcing success (vision, trust, human capital, among others) and the challenges. Crowdsourcing can be used to inform and consult citizens, thereby increasing government accountability to citizens. Crowdsourced mapping can create pressure for governments to respond, for example providing emergency services after disasters. There are case studies from Haiti, Libya, and Sudan. In Guinea, a crowdsourcing system was used to enable citizen oversight of elections.
**Crowd Capital in the Governance Context.**


The authors have collated a database of worldwide initiatives to use crowds for governance. It contains 209 applications. The principal actors are social enterprises and non-profits, while the most prevalent topic areas are community improvement and public safety. These initiatives are largely aimed at national or municipal governments. The authors suggest that there is a new wave of IT-mediated governance occurring.

**Social media and postelection crisis in Kenya.**


This article analyses the role of the media during the two months of postelection crisis in 2008 in Kenya. After presidential election results were announced and disputed, the government banned live news broadcasts for five days. Citizens used social media tools to communicate, share news of violence outbreaks, and promote peace. As in many countries, social media is mainly accessible to elites, and thus may represent elite views. Many social media sites are run by expatriate Kenyans, or foreigners in Kenya. Many Kenyans used social media as citizen journalists. This trend generated an alternative public sphere which widened participation and discussion. These channels presented critical alternative viewpoints to the traditional media. Some video bloggers documented protestors’ confrontations with police, while the Ushahidi tool mapped the outbreaks of violence. Social media was also used to incite violence and provoke ethnic tensions. The authors argue that during the crisis, social media offered a forum for a diversity of voices, which increased democracy.

**Power of Social Media in Developing Nations: New Tools for Closing the Global Digital Divide and Beyond**


How can social media help address the global digital divide? The author suggests that social media is empowering individuals to overcome the digital divide, and empowering individuals to express themselves, which improves their human rights situation. The paper also examines the gaps in ICT access and usage across nations. It provides a case study on Egyptian citizens’ use of social media to call for Hosni Mubarak to step down in 2011. Social media in Egypt became a source of free media and tools for revealing human rights abuses and corruption, as well as organising protests. The government was unable to significantly censor or prevent this activity. Social media is seen as a democratising set of tools.
Reflections on Social Accountability. Catalyzing democratic governance to accelerate progress towards the Millennium Development Goals.


This review of social accountability contains a chapter on ICT interventions, including social media. It suggests that it is important to acknowledge the limitations of ICT. In transparency initiatives using ICT, there are few documented examples of the innovation alone being transformative. More frequent are incremental changes, in which ICT facilitates communication and coordination within accountability systems. This chapter reviews the available literature on how recent ICT interventions have contributed within a framework of social accountability and offers examples. It then analyses certain successes and failures and suggests lessons.

Open Government and Social Media: A Focus on Transparency


This article explores the adoption and use of Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube by Thailand’s public sector and social media’s contribution to transparency. It collected data from 172 public agencies at the central, provincial, and local administration levels, and analysed their usage. Only Facebook was used actively at all administrative levels. Overall, the use of these channels was low, and content analysis showed that posted messages were mostly news updates which did not increase the agencies’ transparency. The messages were also less popular than other Thai organisations’.

Ignorance is Bliss! Internet Usage and Perceptions of Corruption in a Panel of Developing Countries.


Examining a panel of developing countries from 1996 to 2009, this study shows that perceptions of corruption increased alongside a rise in access to the internet. The authors conclude that a rise in Internet access causes increased perceptions of corruption. This can lead to public protest and destabilisation as citizens push for improved conditions.

Free, social, and inclusive: Appropriation and resistance of new media technologies in Brazil.


This review analyses the ways new media are being appropriated within Brazilian society, with particular attention to changes around the processes of production, distribution, and consumption. O Globo, a newspaper in Brazil, developed a place where residents could anonymously report crimes, which led to the
development of a crime map which identified problem areas. Citizen journalists are also incorporated in O Globo’s Eu-Reporter site. In contrast, Twitter is mainly used as an informational tool in Brazil.

**Citizen sensors or extreme publics? Transparency and accountability interventions on the mobile geoweb.**


This paper reviews the literature on transparency policies and describes their drivers, characteristics and supply–demand dynamics. It provides an empirical assessment of whether citizen sensors creating and using volunteered geographic information (VGI) can increase the transparency of the state, or whether changes brought about by transparency and accountability (T&A) interventions are more likely to be incremental. Case studies are from East Africa. The authors conclude that the effect of T&A interventions is more likely to be incremental and mediated by existing organisations and professional users, rather than citizens. T&A interventions are more likely to increase transparency if they amplify the efforts of traditional and new intermediaries, and not by-pass or undermine them.

**Safety valve or pressure cooker? Blogs in Chinese political life.**


This paper argues that blogs serve as a “safety valve” to voice complaints when the mainstream media has already set the agenda, and as a “pressure cooker” on issues where bloggers get ahead of journalists, which might increase social tensions. The author uses quantitative large-scale content analysis and specific case studies to show that Chinese blogs allow people both to non-violently express discontent, and to lead to increased pressure on specific issues. It compares the issues discussed to those discussed in newspapers.

**Investigating the Potential of Mobile Phones for E-Governance in Indonesia.**


This paper reviews e-governance and citizen engagement in Indonesia. It contains some information on social media usage. Facebook was commonly visited before visiting the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources and the Ministry of Agriculture portals, the two most visited government websites. Over 70 per cent of Facebook users in Indonesia access the site through their mobile phones. There are some social divisions between web users: males who have children visited government websites most frequently. The authors suggest that social media and mobile phone usage should be capitalised on by the government as a means to communicate with citizens.
4. Peacebuilding

*The technology of nonviolence: Social media and violence prevention.*

The book describes and documents technology-enhanced efforts to stop violence before it happens in Africa, Asia, and the United States. Peacekeeping was once the remit of international observers, but today citizens take violence prevention into their own hands. These local approaches often involve technology, including digital mapping, crowdsourcing, and mathematical pattern recognition to identify likely locations of violence. However, technological advances are of little value unless they are used by a trained cadre of community organizers. After covering general concepts in violence prevention and describing technological approaches to tracking conflict and cooperation, the book offers five case studies that range from "low-tech" interventions to prevent ethnic and religious violence in Ahmedabad, India, to an anti-gang initiative in Chicago that uses Second Life to train its "violence interrupters." There is solid evidence of success but there is much to be discovered, developed, and, most importantly, implemented.

*The Role of Social Media and User-Generated Content in Post-Conflict Peace-Building.*

ICT has an untapped potential to enhance post-conflict reconstruction processes. There is a very small literature on the use of social media and user-generated content in post-conflict peacebuilding. The paper describes a few uses of social media in the Arab Spring, and highlights that social media can be used for inciting violence as well as peacebuilding. The use of information and communication technologies for peace is thus not very clear cut.

5. Private sector

*Leadership in the Age of Social Media: The “Social Media Uprisings” and Implications for Global Business Leadership.*

This chapter enquires into the nexus between social media and business leadership by analysing the roles and influence of social media in shaping leadership processes, using the case study of the 2011 Egyptian revolution. It finds that formal leadership structures become redundant, but that multiple leaders emerge autonomously and leaders change over time. Leadership was still important, but appears to have a ‘one-off’ aspect. For business leadership, this implies a trade-off between less control (over social media) and greater innovation and creativity.
**Impact of Social Media on Organizational Culture: Evidence from Pakistan.**


This paper determines to what extent social media affects organisational culture in SMEs in Pakistan. A self-administered survey was used to collect responses from 175 employees working at various companies through e-mail and social media tools. Social media enhances employee communication, work environment, shares knowledge, builds trust, makes employees aware of their business, enables early detection of organisational wrongdoing, finds new human resources and facilitates change by knowing customers’ opinions as well as development of positive changes in the work environment.

6. Internal governance

**When does Abuse of Social Media constitute a Crime?—A South African Legal Perspective within a Global Context.**


How should social media usage be governed and what role should criminal law take? The paper argues that communication constitutes an abuse when the limits of free speech are exceeded. South Africa has no reported case law that deals specifically with criminal conduct on social media. Examples of criminal prosecutions mainly come from the UK and USA. Cases can concern hate speech, defamation of character, protection of human rights, and protection of the safety of citizens. Currently only a few cases have been prosecuted globally and there are not clear precedents.

**A Value Focused Thinking (VFT) Analysis to Understanding Users’ Privacy and Security Dynamics in Social Networking Services.**


This study examines how to maximize users’ general security and privacy threats in the social networking domain. 10 students in Jamaica were surveyed. The results show that students were concerned about individual privacy, confidentiality of personal information, integrity of social networks, security measures, awareness campaigns, individual and corporate social responsibilities (CSR). In addressing these concerns there is a likely chance that security and privacy risks and threats will be reduced or better managed. The finding on CSR is novel, and suggests that service providers, organisations, and legislators have a responsibility to ensure the integrity of their service, provide effective awareness campaigns to and for their users, and implement suitable actions and legislations to promote social responsibility.
When do states disconnect their digital networks? Regime responses to the political uses of social media.


The authors build an event history database of 566 incidents from 1995-2011 in which a regime shut down social media. Comparative analysis indicates that both democratic and authoritarian regimes disable social media networks, citing concerns about national security, protecting authority figures, and preserving cultural and religious morals. Whereas democracies disable social media with the goal of protecting children, authoritarian regimes also attempt to eliminate what they perceive as propaganda.

New media in Kenya: Time for regulation?


This opinion piece summarises the principal national and international laws that regulate and restrict freedom of expression in Kenya. Kenya has 17 million internet users, with active social media communities. There are some movements towards government regulation of online space, in particular monitoring for hate speech.

7. About this report

Other references


Suggested citation


This report is based on four days of desk-based research. It was prepared for the UK Government’s Department for International Development, © DFID Crown Copyright 2015. This report is licensed under the Open Government Licence (www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence). The views expressed in this report are those of the author, and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of GSDRC, its partner agencies or DFID.

The GSDRC Research Helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of key literature and of expert thinking in response to specific questions on governance, social development, humanitarian and conflict issues. Its concise reports draw on a selection of the best recent literature available and on input from international experts.
Each GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report is peer-reviewed by a member of the GSDRC team. Search over 400 reports at www.gsdrc.org/go/research-helpdesk. Contact: helpdesk@gsdrc.org.