



Helpdesk Research Report

Urban governance in Tanzania

Emilie Combaz

25.06.2015

Question

Please identify key literature on urban governance in Tanzania.

Contents

1. Overview
2. State of knowledge
3. Political economy in diverse urban contexts
4. Land use, urban farming, and land property
5. Provision of public goods and services
6. About this report

1. Overview

Urbanisation has been increasing quickly in Tanzania. The share of the population who lives in cities had reached nearly 30 per cent by 2012 - an average annual increase of 6 per cent since 1967 and twice the rate of population growth (Wenban-Smith, 2014: 4). Up to 80 per cent of these urban residents live in informal settlements, with few basic services (UNICEF, 2012: 1). The opportunities and challenges urbanisation generates for development have been well documented. In this context, many authors emphasise that making urbanisation work for development is not just about technical issues such as physically building infrastructure. It is inherently about formal and informal political decision-making over the collective functioning and organisation of city life: it is about urban governance. What recent knowledge is available to shed light on urban governance in Tanzania?

Available literature is limited, but it is methodologically strong and covers a wide range of dimensions (see section 2 for details). Key points include the following.

- Taking into account the **political economy of diverse urban contexts** is essential to understand how urban governance functions and to identify possibilities for improvement.
 - For **urban planning**, political economy analyses offer crucial insights on the conflicting interests at play. Policies and processes for urban planning have generally remained top-down and captured by powerful actors. This has marginalised groups such as the poor and urban farmers, who have often resisted dynamics that disadvantaged them. In turn, this has put pressure on local and national Tanzanian authorities. In addition, municipal processes for urban planning are often complicated, with low technical and financial capacities, and some limitations to decentralisation. Local authorities are also not committed to deeper citizen participation. Authors' recommendations include: ensuring that genuine two-way engagement takes place; treating access to urban services and spaces as rights; empowering municipalities through capacity-building and funding; and ensuring that local government is accountable to the public.
 - **Several groups are disadvantaged** in urban governance, although they have also displayed capacities for resistance and empowerment. They include: persons living in poverty, especially in informal settlements (particularly renters); women; children; and refugees. Social movements and political mobilisations have had mixed success in advancing disadvantaged groups' rights and interests. Several authors argue that ensuring these groups' participation requires legitimising and guaranteeing their place in urban planning.
 - **Rural-urban linkages, and small- and medium-sized cities**, are often overlooked, and yet they are important dimensions of urbanisation and urban governance.
- **Land use, urban farming, and land property** are major issues in urban governance.
 - **Customary land rights** and formal land allocations have tended to conflict and coalesce into land disputes. Several authors recommend making urban planning inclusive, clear and fair, so that it brings together all stakeholders and both formal and informal land allocation systems. Fair compensation for forced evictions is widely demanded in the literature.
 - **Urban farming** has a number of benefits for farmers, landholders, governments and local communities. However, allocation of land for urban farming has been neglected, and farmers have often been marginalised. Various authors' recommendations include: paying attention not only to tenure, but also to access; better supporting urban agriculture in national government; and, at local level, incorporating farming into urban planning, and providing clear regulations and incentives.
 - **Formal land titling** in cities is difficult to access for the poor, due to complicated procedures and costs of application. Formalisation has also tended to be top-down and to further marginalise the poor, such as urban farmers.
- The **provision of sufficient and good-quality public goods and services** is confirmed as a major stake in urban governance.
 - Some overarching themes emerge from references about **informal and community-based provision** of public goods and services, and references about specific **sectors** (mobility and transportation; water and sanitation and health; security and policing; education). In particular, public frameworks for consultation and compensation determine whether local residents will collaborate with, or oppose, public projects, and how much their voices shape service delivery. Social networks among residents also play an important role in having a voice and delivering services. Achieving inclusive and equal participation is difficult - for

marginalised groups to genuinely contribute, projects need to engage with *all* residents, and not only about implementation, but also about planning.

- **Disaster risk management and climate change adaptation** are important challenges for urban governance: they require action but that are difficult to do well and to coordinate.

2. State of knowledge

This rapid review of academic and grey literature published in the past five years found a small **body of knowledge** about urban governance in Tanzania, in contrast to a large number of references that document urbanisation in the country. Contributing experts confirmed that evidence specifically on the report topic is limited and eclectic (expert comments). Most key references on the topic were published over five years ago – this report focuses on recent publications, but the additional readings it lists do include the earlier publications mentioned by experts who provided suggestions for this report.

Major findings on urban governance in Tanzania can be deemed **conclusive**, not just indicative, thanks to a combination of methodological rigour, methodological diversity, and general consistency. References found for this report were typically rigorous. The knowledge base as a whole was generated through a variety of qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods. Most of the literature is academic, with few references from practitioner and policy sources. Major findings on the most researched dimensions are generally consistent. Nonetheless, authors do have some differences in perspectives and, most of all, in their prescriptions. For instance, some authors explicitly support policies promoted by the World Bank on how to reform local government (e.g. Venugopal & Yilmaz, 2010), while other authors explicitly criticise World Bank policies on urban education (Dilger, 2013) or urban transportation (Rizzo, 2015). Another strength of the literature is its wide thematic coverage, which encompasses many cross-cutting aspects of urban governance, such as urban political economy, as well as various sectoral issues.

However, available knowledge has **some weaknesses and gaps** in coverage. Thematically, some aspects have been researched by a number of authors (e.g. the governance of urban farming), while others are discussed in one or two references only (e.g. the provision of health services). Geographically, the literature is largely focused on Dar es Salaam. A handful of studies also consider a few other prominent urban settlements, such as Dodoma, Moshi and Zanzibar City. However there is a dearth of research on small towns, emerging urban settlements (e.g. around mining areas) and mid-sized cities.

Lastly, few references offer findings that are systematically disaggregated by social group and inequality structure. When disaggregation is provided, typical categories are socio-economic status, education, working occupation, or housing status – and, more occasionally, religion or migration (internal or international). The literature thus largely fails to disaggregate findings on urban governance through the lens of gender, sexuality, age (especially youth and the elderly), ethnicity, and disability. Consideration of how these various social structures interplay (e.g. for women tenants who are poor) and how this affects urban governance is also scant and not systematic.

3. Political economy in diverse urban contexts

Urban political economy

Urban Sustainability at the Limits: Development Rhetorics and Realities in Tanzania

Bissell, W. C. (2011). *Development*, 54(3), 317–324.

<http://doi.org/10.1057/dev.2011.63>

Would the urban master plans that Tanzanian officials proposed in 2011 for Zanzibar City and Dar es Salaam improve living conditions for urban dwellers? This critical analysis draws on secondary literature about the history, politics, economics and sociology of urban planning in Tanzania and beyond. It finds that urban policies and plans have remained top-down. This has marginalised the poor and pathologised their survival strategies. The author argues that further growth will not solve the urban problems that free-market policies have created. He concludes that urban sustainability can only be achieved by transforming the political culture, engaging citizens, and treating access to urban services and spaces as basic rights.

The Political Economy of an Urban Megaproject: The Bus Rapid Transit Project in Tanzania

Rizzo, M. (2015). *African Affairs*, 114(455), 249–270.

<http://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/adu084>

Political economy analyses show that some approaches to urban governance do not generate the promised benefits. For example, projects for Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) have been growing rapidly, as actors with vested interests have promoted them as a win-win solution. However, the author's in-depth qualitative fieldwork on the BRT in Dar es Salaam since 2002 found political and economic conflicts. Proponents included the World Bank, an industry-related international NGO, and private operators seeking to enter the market. In contrast, some Tanzanian actors resisted the scheme: public workers, at risk of job cuts; pre-existing private operators, at risk of exclusion; the city council, which faced a loss of revenue; tenants and businesses at risk of expropriation and poor compensation; and users, who faced higher fares. Some of these local actors have considerable electoral power. In response, the Tanzanian government has struck a balance by making a tepid commitment to the BRT and implementing it slowly.

Dynamics of Land for Urban Housing in Tanzania

Massoi, L., & Norman, A. S. (2010). *Journal of Public Administration and Policy Research*, 2(5), 74–87.

http://www.academicjournals.org/article/article1379502526_Massoi%20and%20Norman.pdf

Population movements towards cities have heightened the need for allocating urban land to housing. This mixed-method research on Songea municipality (south-east Tanzania) identifies problems that local authorities face in this area. Urban planning and services are weak, with overlapping authorities, unclear roles, and the unnecessary involvement of numerous actors. The preparation and approval of detailed plans, prepared by land experts, involves cumbersome procedures, making the process very long. Lines of accountability are also deficient. In addition, the municipality lacks technical capacity and has limited financial resources. The authors recommend empowering municipalities through technical capacity-building and increased funding, to make their services more effective and efficient.

Further readings:

Calas, B. (2010 [2006 for original edition in French]). *From Dar es Salaam to Bongoland: Urban Mutations in Tanzania*. African Books Collective.

Cunningham, V., Morisset, J., & Haji, M. (2014). *Who Wants a Job? The Magnetic Power of Cities* (Tanzania Economic update No. 88932). World Bank, see esp. pp. 29–52.
<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2014/06/19705053/tanzania-economic-update-wants-job-magnetic-power-cities>

Lugalla, J. L. P. (2010). Why planning does not work? Land use planning and residents' rights in Tanzania. *Review of African Political Economy*, 37(125), 381–386.
<http://doi.org/10.1080/03056244.2010.511786>

Mukandala, R. S. (2010). *Grassroots Institutions of Governance*. In Mukandala, R. S., & Gasarasi, C. (Eds). *Governance and Development at the Grassroots in Tanzania*, REDET Book Series, Dar es Salaam University Press, Dar es Salaam (pp. 6-43).

Tripp, A. M. (1997). *Changing the Rules: The Politics of Liberalization and the Urban Informal Economy in Tanzania*. University of California Press.

Formal local government

Is Decentralization Still Recentralization? The Local Government Reform Programme in Tanzania

Kessy, A. T., & McCourt, W. (2010). *International Journal of Public Administration*, 33(12-13), 689–697.

<http://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2010.514454>

Has formal decentralisation in Tanzania since 2000 led to a real devolution of authority from the centre to the local level, and to citizens' participation? This 2006 mixed-method research looked at two local councils, one urban (Mwanza, on the southern shore of Lake Victoria) and one rural (Moshi Rural). It found significant devolution of authority and resources. However, deficits in local capacities persisted, while financial dependence on the central government increased. Constraints on local autonomy also remained. Institutionally, the deconcentrated structures persisted (i.e. local-level structures from the central government), due to problems of coordination and to staff's vested interests. Politically, authorities were not committed to deeper citizen participation. The authors recommend addressing the enduring constraints of capacity, implementation and accountability to achieve effective decentralisation.

Further readings:

Kiduanga, J. (2014). Managing Land for Developing Dodoma, the Capital City of Tanzania. Critical Analysis of the Role of Dodoma Municipal Council and Capital Development Authority. *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 7(5), 140–149. <http://doi.org/10.5539/jsd.v7n5p140>

Pallangyo, W., & Rees, C. J. (2010). Local Government Reform Programs and Human Resource Capacity Building in Africa: Evidence from Local Government Authorities (LGAs) in Tanzania. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 33(12-13), 728–739. <http://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2010.514714>

Lerise, F., & Ngware, S. (1996). *Managing Urban Development in Tanzania: Issues, Initiatives and Priorities*. In Ngware, S. S. A., & Kironde, J. M. L. (2000). *Urbanising Tanzania: Issues, Initiatives, and Priorities*. DUP Limited, University of Dar es Salaam.

Sikika Ltd. (2012). *Budget Transparency and Participation at Local Government Level in Tanzania*. Sikika, Health Governance and Finance Department. <http://sikika.or.tz/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Transparent-Report-Final.pdf>

Venugopal, V., & Yilmaz, S. (2010). Decentralization in Tanzania: An Assessment of Local Government Discretion and Accountability. *Public Administration and Development*, 30(3), 215–231. <http://doi.org/10.1002/pad.556>

Disadvantaged persons and groups: marginalisation and empowerment

Social Construction of Peri-Urban Places and Alternative Planning in Zanzibar

Myers, G. A. (2010). *African Affairs*, 109(437), 575–595.

<http://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/adq044>

The urban poor, who are the majority of city dwellers, are typically concentrated in informal settlements and shape these places through informal everyday practices. Planning processes have attempted to work with such place-making. However, the author's in-depth qualitative fieldwork in Zanzibar's peri-urban West District (Mwere and Weleso) draws attention to difficulties with such approaches. Informal place-making remains a survival strategy of people who are abjectly poor, and often cannot be taken beyond that. In addition, each informal neighbourhood remains particular, due to its historical-geographical roots and its residents' relationships with the state. These factors determine the capacity of individuals and neighbourhoods to create new or replicable alternatives with their urban places. Place-making and social positioning are also heterogeneous within neighbourhoods. Champions of alternative planning risk romanticising the potential for social movements and civil society in informal areas. They often fail to address the lack of stability and trusting relationships in some of these neighbourhoods, and how state institutions and officials can make land use contested, occupancy vulnerable, and planning complex. All this makes alternative planning with informal neighbourhoods challenging.

Moving Beyond "Community" Participation: Perceptions of Renting and the Dynamics of Participation around Urban Development in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Hooper, M., & Cadstedt, J. (2014). *International Planning Studies*, 19(1), 25–44

<http://doi.org/10.1080/13563475.2013.799630>

Participatory urban planning has frequently treated communities as homogeneous, and overlooked barriers to the participation of marginalised groups such as renters. This qualitative research examined participation in two urban development projects in Dar es Salaam (including one supported by the World Bank). It found that renters were unwilling and often unable to participate. This is because renters themselves, and others involved in planning – such as owners and key development actors – perceived renters as transient and inconsequential. This led to a cycle of nonparticipation: policy-makers gave little attention to renters' needs, and renters were disinclined to mobilise. The authors recommend actively including and legitimising renters in urban plans.

A Home in the City: Women's Struggle to Secure Adequate Housing in Urban Tanzania

Hughes, K., & Wickeri, E. (2011). *Fordham International Law Journal*, 34(4), 788-929.

http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1842392

Women have particular difficulties securing and retaining urban housing, a problem made acute by the housing crisis. This qualitative study takes a rights-based approach to examine women's experiences of housing in informal settlements, drawing on secondary literature and fieldwork in Arusha, Dar es Salaam, Dodoma, Moshi and Morogoro.

It identifies **multiple barriers** for women. Laws and practices are discriminatory (e.g. on inheritance, ownership, mortgage, divorce). Patriarchal attitudes are entrenched, including on titling, land, and renting or selling to single women. Government policy, bureaucracy and inaction also create roadblocks. So do public failures to regulate the landlords-tenant relationships, to address government-sponsored forced evictions, and to guarantee women's access to justice. Violence against women and discrimination against women with HIV/AIDS are pervasive. Women's poverty is a major barrier as well, through lack of regular income and problematic access to credit.

Inadequate housing affects women disproportionately, because they spend significantly more time in informal settlements. They suffer from the poor quality of housing and unavailability of building materials. In addition, they experience more acutely the lack of basic services, and are more exposed to gender-based violence and health risks.

Most **initiatives** by the Tanzanian government and international organisations have overlooked gender inequalities. Most programmes have been underfunded and fragmented, and have failed to ensure that women benefit directly.

To **realise women's right to adequate housing** in Tanzanian cities, the authors recommend that the Tanzanian government make cross-cutting improvements to urban housing policies and practices at local and national levels, for example by better including civil society organisations that work in informal settlements into urban planning. Laws and public services should also advance gender equality and serve women (e.g. through equal titling, services for victims of domestic violence, education to gender equality, legal empowerment). In particular, the State should be responsive to women's voices on urban development and services such as water, health and security. International organisations should also increase their staff and resources for community development, and genuinely listen to women's voices throughout their plans.

Cities and Children: The Challenge of Urbanisation in Tanzania

UNICEF (2012). UNICEF.

http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/files/Cities_and_Children_-_FINAL.pdf

In Tanzania, one in four children lives in a city. Decision-makers often assume there is an 'urban advantage' compared to rural areas, but his UNICEF report, which brings together quantitative and qualitative data from secondary sources, calls for a more nuanced analysis. For now, most children have been exposed to the **problems of city life** - especially children who are poor and live in informal settlements. In fact, the 'urban advantage' has been eroding: in many dimensions of child well-being, rural areas are catching up to, or at times outperforming, cities.

This is because **availability of services does not equate with access** to them, and the urban advantage is unequally shared. High-quality facilities and services are concentrated in affluent areas. Conversely, under-resourced facilities are typically located in unplanned settlements where residents cannot afford

the costs of access. In addition, the vast majority of urban children suffer from social, physical and environmental problems specific to cities, including: overcrowded and sub-standard shelters in areas exposed to hazards; pollution; and a lack of safe places to gather and play.

However, national approaches have continued to focus on rural poverty. Official statistics depict rural and urban *averages*, which obscure disparities in cities. Standard measures also overlook the high costs of daily necessities (food, housing, transport, health, etc.) and poor people's lack of irregular and well-paid jobs. **Poor children are thus hidden from official estimates**, marginalised to urban fringes, and, as a result, invisible in development policies. UNICEF argues that gathering and analysing sub-municipal data must be a priority, to reveal poor children's actual living conditions and inequalities within cities. As urbanisation keeps increasing, investments in facilities and services will become costlier financially and socially. Climate change is also likely to increase urban children's vulnerabilities.

Cities are ideal levels of action for **supporting children holistically** and overcoming the typical fragmentation of interventions. To make cities friendly to children's needs and rights, local governance needs to be competent, accountable and equitable. This would enable the urban poor to access adequate land tenure, housing, water, sanitation, education, health care, nutrition and transport. The key actors will be local authorities, and active communities and children. Municipalities, which are close to their constituents, could ally with civil society groups, media, private sector, and community organisations.

Municipalities and communities are also useful settings for **genuine participation by children**. Children's views can inform local decision-making and provide nuanced understandings of the diverse social, cultural and economic realities of childhood. For now, most children are rarely consulted, at home, at school or in their communities, although some children participate in children's municipal councils and other grassroots institutions.

This UNICEF report is a shorter version of the following report:

Riggio, E. (2012). *Children in an Urban Tanzania*. UNICEF.
http://digitallibrary.ihl.or.tz/532/1/Children_in_an_Urban_Tanzania_-_Eliana_Riggio_06.06.2012%281%29.pdf

Implementing a Revised Refugee Policy for Urban Refugees in Tanzania

Pangilinan, C. (2012). *Oxford Monitor of Forced Migration*, 2(2), 5-9.

<http://oxmofm.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/Pangilinan-FINAL.pdf>

Tanzania is identified as a host country for refugees in rural camps, but it also hosts a large population of urban refugees. This short brief draws on secondary literature and the author's expertise to identify key issues in this area and to offer rights-based recommendations. At the time this article was written, urban refugees had no legal status, and received no humanitarian aid or resettlement assistance. Even though Tanzania seemed to consider recognising urban refugees, the author warned that it was likely to continue using refugee camps and imposing restrictions on refugees wishing to legally reside outside of camps. The hosting of refugees had been a political issue in national, regional and local government, and at times among host populations.

Further readings:

Cadstedt, J. (2015). Tenants' and Owners' Participation in Rotating Savings Groups and Help Groups: A Study of Housing Tenure Forms and Social Inclusion in Mwanza City, Tanzania. *International Development Planning Review*. <http://doi.org/10.3828/idpr.2012.4>

Couzens, M. and Mtengeti, K., (2012). *Creating Space for Child Participation in Local Governance in Tanzania: Save the Children and Children's Councils* (REPOA Brief No. 27). Research on Poverty Alleviation. http://www.repoa.or.tz/documents/REPOA_BRIEF_27.pdf

McLees, L. (2013). A Postcolonial Approach to Urban Studies: Interviews, Mental Maps, and Photo Voices on the Urban Farms of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. *The Professional Geographer*, 65(2), 283–295. <http://doi.org/10.1080/00330124.2012.679449>

Sommers, M. (2001). *Fear in Bongoland: Burundi Refugees in Urban Tanzania*. Berghahn Books.

Social movements and political mobilisations

Confronting Urban Displacement Social Movement Participation and Post-Eviction Resettlement Success in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Hooper, M., & Ortolano, L. (2012a). *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 32(3), 278–288.

<http://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X12439066>

Some residents of informal settlements subjected to eviction have participated in social movements for housing. Have they had greater success at resettlement than other residents? This study investigates these effects through interviews with 64 extremely poor residents from an informal settlement in Dar es Salaam, some of whom were members of the Tanzania Federation of the Urban Poor (TFUP). Most interviewees had better housing after the eviction, but worse employment.

Within evicted households, women were more vulnerable: unlike most men, nearly all women's individual income fell after eviction. This is because women's pre-eviction work was more often located in the eviction zone, and their source of income (petty or street trade) was especially dependent on tight social networks, which the eviction disrupted.

As for membership in TFUP, it was associated with negative outcomes in employment, particularly for property owners. Members had expected TFUP to secure housing for them and had delayed finding accommodation. They ended up resettling farther from their former homes, which hampered their employment.

Overall, grassroots mobilisation alone seems insufficient to help marginalised groups. The authors conclude that the study results raise considerable challenges to urban planners, policy-makers, and movement organisers. They recommend strongly integrating marginalised groups' needs into formal planning, and supporting these groups through major disruptions such as evictions. Resettlement must also carefully consider distinctions between post-eviction owners and renters, and men and women.

Further readings:

Dilger, H. (2012). *Targeting the Empowered Individual: Transnational Policy-Making, the Global Economy of Aid and the Limitation of "Biopower" in the Neoliberal Era*. In Dilger, H., Langwick, S., & Kane, A. *Medicine, Mobility, and Power in Global Africa*. Transnational Health and Healing. Indiana University Press, pp. 60–91. <http://dx.doi.org/10.13140/2.1.4578.1444>

Hooper, M., & Ortolano, L. (2012b). Motivations for Slum Dweller Social Movement Participation in Urban Africa: A Study of Mobilization in Kurasini, Dar es Salaam. *Environment and Urbanization*, 24(1), 99–114. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0956247811435889>

Sanga, I. (2013). Musical Figuring of Postcolonial Urban Segmentarity and Marginality in Selected “Bongo Flewa” Songs in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*, 44(2), 385–405. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23594805>

Importance of rural-urban linkages and smaller-sized cities

Researchers and practitioners seem to have under-researched in small- and medium-sized cities. This gap is noted in a few references, such as Bryceson (2011).

Similarly, there is little literature on rural-urban linkages in urban governance, whether in the form of cooperation or conflict. Exceptions include one synthesis on rural-urban linkages (Wenban-Smith, 2014), one study on credit facilities in emerging urban centres in rural areas (Larsen & Birch-Thomsen, 2015), and one study on water transfers from rural agriculture to city uses in the Pangani River Basin (Komakech, Van der Zaag & Van Koppen, 2012).

Further readings:

Bryceson, D. F. (2011). Birth of a Market Town in Tanzania: Towards Narrative Studies of Urban Africa. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 5(2), 274–293. <http://doi.org/10.1080/17531055.2011.571389>

Komakech, H. C., Van der Zaag, P., & Van Koppen, B. (2012). The Last Will Be First: Water Transfers from Agriculture to Cities in the Pangani River Basin, Tanzania. *Water Alternatives*, 5(3), 700–720. <http://search.proquest.com/openview/270dade158c9f04085790eb07f227d64/1?pq-origsite=gscholar>

Larsen, M. N., & Birch-Thomsen, T. (2015). The Role of Credit Facilities and Investment Practices in Rural Tanzania: A Comparative Study of Igowole and Ilula Emerging Urban Centres. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 9(1), 55–73. <http://doi.org/10.1080/17531055.2014.985808>

Wenban-Smith, H. (2014). *Rural-Urban Linkages: Tanzania Case Study* (Working Paper Series No. 127). Rimisp, Working Group: Development with Territorial Cohesion, Territorial Cohesion for Development Program, October. http://rimisp.org/wp-content/files_mf/1422298599R_ULinkages_Tanzania_countrycasestudy_Final_edited.pdf

4. Land use, urban farming, and land property

Cross-cutting issues of land use

The Dynamics of Land Use Change and Tenure Systems in Sub-Saharan Africa Cities; Learning from Himo Community Protest, Conflict and Interest in Urban Planning Practice in Tanzania

Magigi, W., & Drescher, A. W. (2010). *Habitat International*, 34(2), 154–164. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2009.08.004>

How have local communities engaged with land use planning, particularly to regulate changes in land use and to address challenges to customary tenure? This qualitative case study examines the rapidly expanding urban settlement of Himo (Kilimanjaro region). Planning authorities there presume that customary land rights do not exist anymore, and have not instituted any legal procedures to formally consider customary land rights before reallocating land. Conflict between customary land rights and statutory tenure have led to disputes and protests around, for instance, indigenous tenure arrangements,

cadastral surveys, irrigation canals, and access footpaths. Most land disputes have their roots in poor urban planning, and in landholders' social and economic uncertainty with the integration of their farms into an urban environment (e.g. free grazing for subsistence is forbidden under urban rules). Forging functional linkages between council authorities, lower-level administration and informal local authorities has been a major challenge. The current administrative arrangements and legislation do not enable meaningful decentralization. Nor do they empower local community leaders to deal with land subdivision and to register property rights and transfers. The authors recommend: paying fair and appropriate compensation; consolidating local participation in planning; establishing land use planning committees at ward level; clarifying legislation, with inputs from the ministries of land and agriculture; and setting up *ad hoc* institutions to articulate formal and customary land use at local levels.

Further reading:

Briggs, J., & Mwamfupe, D. (2000). Peri-urban Development in an Era of Structural Adjustment in Africa:

The City of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. *Urban Studies*, 37(4), 797–809.

<http://doi.org/10.1080/00420980050004026>

Kombe, W. (2010). *Land Conflicts in Tanzania: Who Gains? Who Loses?* (Crisis States Working Series No. 2). DFID, October.

<http://www.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/download/wp/wpSeries2/WP822.pdf>

Kombe, W. J. M., & Kreibich, V. (1997). *Urban land management and the transition to a market economy in Tanzania. Proceedings of a Workshop Organized by the University College of Lands and Architectural Studies (ULAS), University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, in Collaboration with the Faculty of Spatial Planning, University of Dortmund, Germany at the Goethe Institut Dar es Salaam on August 28, 1996.* SPRING-Center, University of Dortmund.

Urban farming and food chains

Planning the Unplanned: Incorporating Agriculture as an Urban Land Use into the Dar es Salaam Master Plan and beyond

Halloran, A., & Magid, J. (2013a). *Environment and Urbanization*, 25(2), 541–558.

<http://doi.org/10.1177/0956247813500903>

Central and local governments have given little political support to urban agriculture in Dar es Salaam because of its informal status. Very little has changed politically over the past 30 years, although various foreign organisations have tried to legitimise and institutionalise urban agriculture in the city. Many urban farmers thus find themselves without secure land access and ownership. As a result, they cannot invest in improving their land, buying inputs, and creating infrastructure. This case study, drawing particularly on participatory action research and interviews, examines the incorporation of urban agriculture into the Dar es Salaam master plan for 2012-2032. It finds that the sustainability of urban agriculture largely depends on political commitment from local and central government. Policy, rules and regulations can legitimise urban agriculture. In turn, legitimacy can further the institutionalisation of urban agriculture, especially in land use planning. However, formalisation also risks marginalising urban farmers who cultivate open spaces in the city. Nonetheless, the authors conclude, urban agriculture is persistent, adaptable and innovative regardless of formal legitimacy in urban planning.

Access to Land for Urban Farming in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania: Histories, Benefits and Insecure Tenure

McLees, L. (2011). *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 49(04), 601–624.

<http://doi.org/10.1017/S0022278X11000498>

The literature on land tenure in sub-Saharan Africa focuses on access to land for housing and sidelines the distinct issues around access to land for urban farming. This in-depth qualitative study examines how farmers in four open-space farms in Dar es Salaam negotiate their access to land. Farmers use diverse informal mechanisms to gain access to land - at least temporarily. Many of these mechanisms are peaceful and collaborative with the landowners and public authorities. In turn, the landowners derive economic benefits from farmers' land use, and the government can derive electoral benefits from the situation. While governments and development agencies tend to push for legal land tenure, informal land delivery has generally proven to be faster, more efficient, and more accepted locally. Thinking about access rather than tenure can provide a framework for integrating urban agriculture into city zoning plans. This approach reveals the variety of benefits from urban farming that stakeholders gain (farmers, rights holders of the land, government). For instance, urban farming generates enhanced economic value and prevents theft and litter. The lens of access also identifies power, in positive collaborations and in negative dynamics such as continued insecurity of tenure and constraints on farming activities and crops.

Getting the Policy Right: Urban Agriculture in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Schmidt, S. (2012). *International Development Planning Review*, 34(2), 129–145.

<http://doi.org/10.3828/idpr.2012.9>

Which policies would facilitate agriculture in Dar es Salaam? Drawing on quantitative and qualitative secondary literature, this article offers a critical review of the context for urban agriculture in the city. Obstacles include: ambiguous regulations; adverse institutional priorities (disadvantaging farming compared to housing, focusing on rural farming, devaluing farming); perceptions of health hazards from farming; the pressures of urbanisation; and insecure land tenure. The author calls for better national policies to support urban agriculture, such as prioritising investments in this sector. The government should also educate public officials on the benefits of urban agriculture for income generation and urban households' food security and nutrition. It should also reform institutions, in particular to clarify the roles of the Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security, and the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries. At the local level, government needs to incorporate urban agriculture into planning as a major urban and peri-urban activity. Local government also needs to provide incentives for urban farming, and clear regulations.

Further readings:

Halloran, A., & Magid, J. (2013b). The Role of Local Government in Promoting Sustainable Urban

Agriculture in Dar es Salaam and Copenhagen. *Geografisk Tidsskrift-Danish Journal of Geography*, 113(2), 121–132. <http://doi.org/10.1080/00167223.2013.848612>

Namwata, B. M., Kikula, I. S., & Kopoka, P. A. (2015). Access of Urban Farmers to Land, Water and Inputs for Urban Agriculture in Dodoma Municipality, Tanzania. *Journal of African Studies and Development*, 7(1), 31-40. http://www.academicjournals.org/article/article1419425070_Namwata%20et%20al.pdf

Schmidt, S., Magigi, W., & Godfrey, B. (2015). The Organization of Urban Agriculture: Farmer Associations and Urbanization in Tanzania. *Cities*, 42, Part B, 153–159. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2014.05.013>

Wegerif, M. C. A. (2014). Exploring Sustainable Urban Food Provisioning: The Case of Eggs in Dar es Salaam. *Sustainability*, 6(6), 3747–3779. <http://doi.org/10.3390/su6063747>

Property and formalisation of land titles

Is Land Titling Feasible in Tanzania's Low-Income Urban Areas?

Ali, D. A., Collin, M., Deininger, K., Dercon, S., Sandefur, J., & Zeitlin, A. (2012). (Policy Brief). International Growth Centre.

<http://www.theigc.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Ayelew-et-al-2012-Policy-Brief.pdf>

How to give poor people formal property rights in a cost-effective, equitable manner? This study used a randomised experiment to lower the price barriers that poor households face to obtain land titling in Dar es Salaam. It found that extensive hurdles (lengthy and complicated procedures, application costs) are indeed impeding the formalisation of tenure. Programmes that bypass these constraints can induce residents “to obtain formal property rights for their land, although substantial subsidies may be required” (p. 1). 60 per cent of residents covered by the programme purchased a title, compared to one per cent before the intervention, though rates drop off without a large subsidy. In addition, even very small subsidies are enough to induce households to include women as formal landowners. This extra requirement of gender inclusiveness does not deter households from purchasing a land title.

Farmers at the Edge: Property Formalisation and Urban Agriculture in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Bersaglio, B., & Kepe, T. (2013). *Urban Forum*, 25(3), 389–405.

<http://doi.org/10.1007/s12132-013-9214-0>

How does the formalising of property rights work out for poor urban farmers? This qualitative research examines how a Western NGO conducted a consultation on formalising property rights for urban agriculture in Dar es Salaam between 2010 and 2012. It finds that formalisation was not conducted democratically, but rather was largely top-down and did not support the poor. The consultation excluded the vast majority of urban farmers. Poor urban farmers expected to benefit from clarified, secured and redistributive land rights. But more powerful actors imposed their vision – in particular, local government used formalisation to solidify its control over open spaces. Formalisation has thus reinforced urban farmers’ physical and ideological relegation to the edge of society, “to precarious open spaces where their crops are prone to damage or loss” (p. 403).

Further readings:

Ali, D. A., Collin, M., Deininger, K., Dercon, S., Sandefur, J., & Zeitlin, A. (2014). *The Price of Empowerment: Experimental Evidence on Land Titling in Tanzania* (Working Paper No. 369). Center for Global Development, May. <http://www.cgdev.org/sites/default/files/price-empowerment-land-titling-tanzania.pdf>

Briggs, J. (2011). The Land Formalisation Process and the Peri-Urban Zone of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. *Planning Theory and Practice*, 12(1), 131–137. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14649357.2011.545626>

Parsa, A., Nakendo, F., McCluskey, W. J., & Page, M. W. (2011). Impact of Formalisation of Property Rights in Informal Settlements: Evidence from Dar es Salaam City. *Land Use Policy*, 28(4), 695–705. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2010.12.005>

5. Provision of public goods and services

Informal and community-based provision of public goods and services

Public-Public Partnerships in Urban Water Provision: The Case of Dar es Salaam

Dill, B. (2010). *Journal of International Development*, 22(5), 611–624

<http://doi.org/10.1002/jid.1601>

In Dar es Salaam, urban residents have been playing a greater role in the provision of basic services, through a variety of partnerships between government and community - a 'public-public partnership' (PuP). Drawing on in-depth qualitative research and secondary data, this study examines water provision through community-based organisations (CBOs) that acted either as intermediaries creating and managing second theory pipes, or as direct producers extracting water locally through wells. Overall, CBOs increased service delivery, particularly in informal settlements. CBOs benefitted directly from the projects, leading them to achieve swift and positive results. They typically sought external support from donors, which in turn often catalysed government action. However, the authors note several issues. Local authorities need to assist CBOs into becoming genuine service providers that are sustainable, through consistent revenue, and equitable. The role of direct producers, while positive in the short term, poses ecological issues for groundwater. Another concern is that local residents have a limited involvement unless local authorities encourage it and support scaling up. The authors argue that local authorities would need to invest in infrastructure and to exercise consistent oversight of CBOs' spending and equitable reach. CBOs alone will not produce the public goods neglected by state and market: CBOs' strengths – independence from the state and roots in the community – are insufficient to deliver the magnitude of services required: successful PuPs call for partnerships with considerable time, oversight and resources.

Urban Trust in Kenya and Tanzania: Cooperation in the Provision of Public Goods

Burbidge, D. (2013). *Canadian Journal of African Studies/La Revue Canadienne Des Études Africaines*, 47(3), 465–482

<http://doi.org/10.1080/00083968.2013.876921>

This qualitative study challenges the common view that public goods will be poorly and unevenly supplied in communities that are ethnically diverse, as opposed to homogeneous. The authors compared the provision of security and cleaning by market-sellers in Mwanza (Tanzania), who were ethnically heterogeneous, and market-sellers in Kisumu (Kenya), who were ethnically homogeneous. Levels of trust and cooperation in the provision of public goods differ starkly. In Tanzania, the sense of solidarity among sellers facilitates greater trust. In Kenya, sellers respond to the lack of state provision feebly and individualistically. The authors conclude that, for the provision of public goods, ethnic distribution matters less than commitments amongst citizens themselves, and between citizens and local authorities.

Further readings:

Liviga, A. J. (2011). *Local Governance and Service Delivery in Tanzania*. REDET (ed.). Democratic Transition in East Africa. Governance and Development at the Grassroots. REDET, Department of Political Science and Public Administration, UDSM (pp. 370-386)

Ngwanza Kamata and Hadija K. Mwendah (2011). *The Role of Civil Society Organisations and Business Community in Governance at the Grassroots: The Case of Tanzania*. REDET (ed.). Democratic Transition in East Africa. Governance and Development at the Grassroots. REDET, Department of Political Science and Public Administration, UDSM (pp. 172-194)

Sectors

Mobility and transportation

Paradoxes of Establishing Mass Rapid Transit Systems in African Cities - A Case of Dar es Salaam Rapid Transit (DART) System, Tanzania.

Ka'bange, A., Mfinanga, D., & Hema, E. (2014). *Research in Transportation Economics*, 48, 176–183.

<http://doi.org/10.1016/j.retrec.2014.09.040>

In Dar es Salaam, some city residents have opposed the Mass Rapid Transit (MRT) system, despite the widely agreed need for better transportation. This mixed-method study identifies the causes of this opposition: authorities failed to have a current plan for land use, to exert effective control over land use, and to adhere to legal provisions for property compensation and resettlement. The result has been inequities, forced evictions, and threats to affected people's livelihoods. Government (local and national) has not come to an agreement with residents and activists, which has deterred the implementation of MRT. The authors call for a well-organised and inclusive framework engaging all stakeholders, for structured dissemination of information, and for compensation at market price to affected people.

Further readings:

Lizárraga, C., Lopez-Castellano, F., & Manzanera-Ruiz, R. (2014). Advancing Towards Sustainable Urban Mobility in Dar es Salaam (Tanzania): A SWOT Analysis. *Africanology*, 1(1).

<http://as-journal.dctthink.org/index.php/as-journal/article/view/12>

Mfinanga, D. A. (2014). Ineffective Human Control of Signalised Intersections in Developing Countries; Case of Dar es Salaam City. *Transportation Research Part F: Traffic Psychology and Behaviour*, 27(PA), 174–181. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.trf.2014.10.003>

Water, sanitation and health

Urban Water Governance Failure and Local Strategies for Overcoming Water Shortages in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Rugemalila, R., & Gibbs, L. (2015). *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy*, 33(2), 412–427.

<http://doi.org/10.1068/c1324>

Water supply does not meet the population's needs in Dar es Salaam. This mixed-method study on Temeke, one of the municipalities in the city, examines why that is, and how residents secure water daily. Failing infrastructure and rapid urbanisation have placed additional pressure on water supply. However, the primary cause of water shortage is the failure of water governance. Privatisation has not lead to positive outcomes. Community participation in water projects is often focused on implementation, not planning. The author argues that effective participation would help meet local needs and would lead people to have ownership and responsibility for maintaining projects. For now, many residents collect water from tenuous and inconvenient sources. This entrenches poor people's marginalisation, because they are exposed to associated health risks and lose education and employment opportunities to gather water – especially women, girls and boys. In view of the problems with infrastructure for piped water, the author suggests the use of simpler technologies, such as rainwater harvesting.

Further readings:

Dilger, H. (2014). Claiming Territory: Medical Mission, Interreligious Revivalism, and the Spatialization of Health Interventions in Urban Tanzania. *Medical Anthropology*, 33(1), 52–67.
<http://doi.org/10.1080/01459740.2013.821987>

Kelly, A. H., & Lezaun, J. (2014). Urban Mosquitoes, Situational Publics, and the Pursuit of Interspecies Separation in Dar es Salaam. *American Ethnologist*, 41(2), 368–383.
<http://doi.org/10.1111/amet.12081>

Kessy, F. L. (2014). Improving Health Services through Community Participation in Health Governance Structures in Tanzania. *Journal of Rural and Community Development*, 9(2), 14-31.
<http://www.jrcd.ca/include/getdoc.php?id=2024&article=942&mode=pdf>

Lugalla, J. L. (1997). Economic reforms and health conditions of the urban poor in Tanzania. *African Studies Quarterly*, 1(2), 17. <http://asq.africa.ufl.edu/files/ASQ-Vol-1-Issue-2-Lugalla.pdf>

Mattes, D. (2011). “We Are Just Supposed to Be Quiet”: The Production of Adherence to Antiretroviral Treatment in Urban Tanzania. *Medical Anthropology*, 30(2), 158–182.
<http://doi.org/10.1080/01459740.2011.552454>

Obrist, B. (2006). *Struggling for Health in the City: An Anthropological Inquiry of Health, Vulnerability and Resilience in Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania*. Peter Lang.

Security and policing

Community Policing and the Politics of Local Development in Tanzania

Cross, C. (2014). *Journal of Modern African Studies*, 52(4), 517–540.
<http://doi.org/10.1017/S0022278X14000433>

Has community policing fulfilled its promise of effective, democratic and accountable practices? This in-depth mixed-method research in the city of Mwanza found that community policing has very successfully reduced crime and improved neighbourhood safety. However, police understand community policing as extending services while reducing their workload, rather than reorienting practices according to community priorities. Indeed, community policing is not owned by communities. Rather, it relies on the local government’s coercive capacity to make citizens participate in line with government directives. This legacy of the one-party era has shaped local understandings of citizens’ contribution to collective services. Lastly, community policing does not receive regular government funding. With the rise of multi-party politics, this makes it susceptible to political patronage, instrumentalisation and partisan use.

A longer version of this research is: Cross, C. (2013). *Community Policing Through Local Collective Action in Tanzania: Sungusungu to Ulinzi Shirikishi*. University of Sussex, D.Phil. dissertation.
http://sro.sussex.ac.uk/47166/1/Cross._Charlotte.pdf

Education

Religion and the Formation of an Urban Educational Market: Transnational Reform Processes and Social Inequalities in Christian and Muslim Schooling in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

Dilger, H. (2013). *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 43(4), 451–479.

<http://doi.org/10.1163/15700666-12341265>

Religious schools have had a growing presence in Tanzanian urban settings over the last decade, shaping parents' and students' search for good education. This article explores three dynamics around new Christian and Muslim schools in Dar es Salaam, by drawing on in-depth qualitative fieldwork and secondary material. Firstly, the positioning and appeal of these schools are intertwined with the continued weakening of state education since the mid-1990s, which was generated by privatisation and World Bank policies. Secondly, education is increasingly stratified and commodified. In part, this stems from the histories of inequality and religious difference in colonial and post-colonial Tanzania. The other driver has been diverse ties with education actors in North America, Europe, Kuwait and Saudi Arabia. Thirdly, the urban education market has contributed to re-inscribing religion in public spaces. This results from macro-economic and historical forces that have shaped schooling and Christian-Muslim encounters, at national and transnational levels.

Further readings:

Mgina, S., & Lwehabura, M. J. F. (2011). Status of Secondary School Libraries under the Secondary Education Development Plan: A Case Study of Dodoma Municipality, Tanzania. *African Journal of Library Archives and Information Science*, 21(2), 167–177.

<http://www.ajol.info/index.php/ajlais/article/view/106598>

Disaster risk management and climate change adaptation

Implementing Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation Interventions at the Local Government Levels in Tanzania: Where Do We Start?

Shemdoe, R., Kassenga, G., & Mbuligwe, S. (2015). Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability, 13, 32–41.

<http://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2015.01.002>

The authors of this article conducted a training needs assessment with local officials in Dar es Salaam who are tasked with climate change adaptation and mitigation (CCAM). Their assessment used questionnaire-based interviews. They report that local authorities have little knowledge and skills to address climate change and vulnerabilities through policies and plans. As entry points in local plans and budgets for CCAM, the authors recommend building up technical cadres' capacities through short courses and workshops, and through training on the job and in postgraduate programmes.

Further readings:

Hambati, H. (2013). Weathering the Storm: Disaster Risk and Vulnerability Assessment of Informal Settlements in Mwanza city, Tanzania. *International Journal of Environmental Studies*, 70(6), 919–939.

<http://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2013.850796>

Kiunsi, R. (2013). The Constraints on Climate Change Adaptation in a City with a Large Development Deficit: The Case of Dar es Salaam. *Environment and Urbanization*, 25(2), 321–337. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0956247813489617>

Mguni, P., Herslund, L., & Jensen, M. B. (2015). Green Infrastructure for Flood-Risk Management in Dar es Salaam and Copenhagen: Exploring the Potential for Transitions towards Sustainable Urban Water Management. *Water Policy*, 17(1), 126–142. <http://doi.org/10.2166/wp.2014.047>

6. About this report

Key websites

- International Growth Centre - Tanzania: <http://www.theigc.org/country/tanzania/>
- Research on Poverty Alleviation: <http://www.repoa.or.tz/>
- Tanzanian Studies Association - Bibliographies: <https://sites.google.com/site/tanzanianstudies/bibliographies>
- Twaweza: <http://www.twaweza.org/>

Expert contributors

Meda Couzens, School of Law, University of Kwazulu-Natal, South Africa

Hansjörg Dilger, Institute of Social and Cultural Anthropology, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany

Brian Dill, Department of Sociology, University of Illinois, USA

Deborah Fahy Bryceson, The Policy Practice, UK

Maia Green, Social Anthropology, University of Manchester

Ambrose T. Kessy, Department of Political Science and Public Administration, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Juma Kiduanga, Institute of Development Studies, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Suggested citation

Combaz, E. (2015). *Urban governance in Tanzania* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report 1231). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.

This report is based on five days of desk-based research. It was prepared for the UK Government's Department for International Development, © DFID Crown Copyright 2015. This report is licensed under the Open Government Licence (www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence). The views expressed in this report are those of the author, and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of GSDRC, its partner agencies or DFID.

The GSDRC Research Helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of key literature and of expert thinking in response to specific questions on governance, social development, humanitarian and conflict issues. Its concise reports draw on a selection of the best recent literature available and on input from international experts. Each GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report is peer-reviewed by a member of the GSDRC team. Search over 400 reports at www.gsdrc.org/go/research-helpdesk. Contact: helpdesk@gsdrc.org.