Piper PA-28R-201, G-HERB, 31 August 1996

AAIB Bulletin No: 11/96 Ref: EW/G96/08/28 Category: 1.3

Aircraft Type and Registration: Piper PA-28R-201, G-HERB

No & Type of Engines: 1 Lycoming IO-360-C1C6 piston engine

Year of Manufacture: 1978

Date & Time (UTC): 31 August 1996 at 1440 hrs

Location: Eshott, Northumbria

Type of Flight: Private

Persons on Board: Crew - 1 - Passengers - None

Injuries: Crew - None - Passengers - N/A

Nature of Damage:

Propeller, nose landing gear and lower engine

cowling damaged

Commander's Licence: Private Pilot's Licence

Commander's Age: 59 years

Commander's Flying Experience: 1,284 hours (of which 450 were on type)

Last 90 days - 26 hours

Last 28 days - 8 hours

Information Source: Aircraft Accident Report Form submitted by the

pilot and metallurgical examination by AAIB

After take off for a short local pleasure flight, the pilot selectedthe landing gear up and during the retraction cycle heard a metallicnoise from the front of the aircraft. The cockpit landing gearindicator lights showed that the main landing gear had retracted correctly, but that the nose landing gear had not. The pilot selected the landing gear down and obtained main landing gear 'down-and-locked'indications but no corresponding indication from the nose landinggear. Flying the aircraft at a safe altitude, the pilot recycled the landing gear but was unable to obtain a nose landing geardown-and-locked indication. After making radio contact with the airfield the pilot flew the aircraft, with the landing gear selected down, past the clubhouse and was informed by those on the groundthat all three landing gears looked normal. An approach and engine-offlanding was made on the grass. The nose landing gear collapsed after approximately 40 metres of the landing roll and the aircraft continued for about another 65 metres before coming to rest.

Examination of the nose landing gear showed that part of the casting of the gear leg had failed at the point where the drag link assemblyattached (Figure 1). It was noted upon initial examination by a locally based engineer and an insurance assessor that the surface of the lower half of the failure was dirty compared to the surface of the upper half. AAIB metallurgical examination concluded that the fracture of the drag brace attachment lug on the nose legcasting had resulted from the combined effect of a reduction in the material strength caused by an adjacent weld repair, one or two heavy landings, and the presence of intergranular corrosion in the bore of the attachment lug. The relative effects of these three factors could not be estimated, nor could it be determined when the lower half of the lug had cracked before the accident flight, although final separation has occurred as a result of the development of the intergranular corrosion.

Examination of the aircraft log book and enquiries with one of the previous owners found no evidence of any heavy landings having occurred, or any repair work having been carried out on the noselanding gear since the aircraft was imported into the UK in 1986. It was noted that the aircraft had been parked in the open andunused for approximately three years during the early 1990's.