Call for evidence: Shortage occupation list review 2018

9 November 2018
1. Introduction

1.1 In June 2018, the Government commissioned the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) to carry out a full review of the composition of the Shortage Occupation List (SOL)\(^1\). The SOL comprises occupations and job titles held to be in shortage either across the UK, or in Scotland only, where it would be sensible to fill through non-EEA migration. Job titles on the SOL are not required to undertake the Resident Labour Market Test or meet the five-year salary threshold for settlement.

1.2 To be eligible for the SOL occupations and job titles must:

- show demonstrable national shortages that cannot be filled from within the domestic labour market;
- be skilled to the required level set by the Home Office; and
- demonstrate that it is sensible to seek to fill vacancies with migrant labour from outside of the EEA.

Evidence gathering

1.3 In order to assess which occupations and job titles should be added to the SOL the MAC uses both national data and evidence submitted by stakeholders. The MAC considers both sets of evidence in combination.

1.4 The MAC is adopting a new approach to its call for evidence and engagement with stakeholders. The MAC will focus on specific job titles rather than broader occupations and requires evidence that supports this approach. The evidence produced by stakeholders is very important in helping to assess which job titles are in shortage. The MAC ask that all respondents to this call for evidence complete an online form that will comprise their evidence to this review of the SOL.

Stakeholder engagement

1.5 The MAC will be hosting a series of regional events around the UK, including Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales. These will be published on the MAC website in due course. Stakeholders wishing to attend these events will be invited to inform the MAC by email when the dates and locations are announced.

1.6 Once the MAC have had time to consider the responses to the call for evidence they will take a view on whether it is necessary to meet with industry

\(^1\) The commissioning letter from the Home Secretary and the MAC’s response can be found here: https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/commissioning-letter-to-the-mac-on-the-shortage-occupation-list
professionals to discuss the occupations and job titles in more detail, including the underlying causes of the shortages being put forward and what remedial action is being taken to address these.

Skills level

1.7 In previous reviews of the SOL the MAC has used the current minimum skill level for Tier 2 of the points-based system as set by the Home Office as the minimum skill level to be considered for the SOL. This is currently set at Regulated Qualifications Framework (RQF) level 6. However, in the recent MAC report on EEA migration in the UK we made the recommendation to open the Tier 2 work route to roles skilled to RQF 3 and above. The Home Office has indicated that it is considering our recommendations. In addition, with the Brexit negotiations currently on-going the context in which we will be delivering our report remains uncertain.

1.8 The MAC considers it worthwhile to get a better understanding of the scale of potential shortages across the whole of the UK labour market and at all skill levels. The MAC is therefore inviting evidence from all occupations and job titles at RQF 1 and above to ascertain what national shortages there are within the UK at present. It is possible that we will only end up making recommendations about the current shortage list which comprises of jobs skilled at RQF level 6 and above.

1.9 It should be noted that the MAC are asked to identify a national skill shortage. This means shortage across the UK, or just Scotland in the case of the separate Scotland-only SOL. While it may be the case that an employer in one locality experiences difficulties in recruiting staff there might be other employers in other localities who do not experience the same difficulty; this would not necessarily qualify as a national shortage.

2. Call for evidence

2.1 This call for evidence seeks views and evidence from anyone with relevant knowledge, expertise or experience to help inform the MAC response. We strongly welcome views from a wide range of interested parties from all parts of the UK including: businesses, employers, recruiters, trade unions, academics, think tanks, representative bodies, government departments, etc.

2.2 The questions in the online form show the information that the MAC would find most useful to receive, but respondents may provide the MAC with other relevant information. The easiest method to provide additional information is through the online form. Responses should be evidence-based and where possible should provide data and/or examples to support your answers.
The questions within the form are attached to this call for evidence at Annex A and B to allow respondents the opportunity to compile their evidence before filling out the form.

Please ensure that you have gathered evidence for the set of questions that apply to you. The questions in Annex A are for; business/organisations including voluntary organisations and other public sector employees such as NHS trusts that wish to provide evidence of current shortages in their organisations. The questions in Annex B are for; sector representative bodies, recruitment agencies, government departments including local authorities, think tanks and academic institutions that wish to provide evidence of wider shortages.

3. Submitting evidence to the MAC

3.1 Please use the online form to submit your evidence. This will allow the MAC to assess and analyse the information in a structured and methodological way, assessing all information using the same criteria. This is the most effective way for the MAC to consider evidence from stakeholders.

3.2 The work of the MAC is evidence based and we intend to engage with a wide range of experts and interested parties within the short time available to extend and clarify our knowledge. By responding to this online form you will contribute to the range of evidence that we will consider. Our work will be helped by receiving the best quality evidence from the widest range of people and organisations.

The link to the online form is attached here:

https://www.homeofficesurveys.homeoffice.gov.uk/s/SOL2018/

Please submit your evidence online by 14\textsuperscript{th} January 2019.

For clarification questions and further info the MAC can be contacted at:

Email: MAC@homeoffice.gov.uk

Migration Advisory Committee
2\textsuperscript{nd} Floor
Peel Building
2 Marsham Street
London
SW1P 4DF
Please note details of those jobs you identify as in shortage – may be published as part of our final report. All identifying and personal information will remain confidential. The MAC is, however, subject to the Freedom of Information (FOI) Act and we would assess confidentiality accordingly to the FOI rules on exemptions.
Annex A: Form for businesses/organisations

MAC Review of the Shortage Occupation List

This form is for businesses/organisations including voluntary organisations, and other public sector employers such as NHS trusts with current recruitment shortages. Please use this form to gather evidence for completion of the online form.

7. We are interested in hearing from organisations/businesses of all sizes, please tell us the number of individuals your organisation/business currently employ?

☐ 1-9 employees
☐ 10-49 employees
☐ 50-249 employees
☐ 250+ employees

8. Please tell us the name and Standard Industrial Classification (SIC) code that most closely describes the industry of your organisation/business. If multiple SIC codes apply, please select the one that best describes the largest component of business/organisation (by employment/turnover). An interactive list of all SIC codes can be found below:
http://resources.companieshouse.gov.uk/sic/
Job shortages

9. Please list the job titles that your organisation has currently experienced difficulties in recruiting suitable workers for. (Maximum of 10 job titles).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs, please use the space below to state what these job titles are.
Help us to standardise job titles

10. Using the Office for National Statistics (ONS) Occupation Tool linked below, please help us by matching the job titles you have provided with the closest standardised ONS job title and associated 4-digit occupation (SOC) code. [https://onsdigital.github.io/dp-classification-tools/standard-occupational-classification/ONS_SOC_occupation_coding_tool.html](https://onsdigital.github.io/dp-classification-tools/standard-occupational-classification/ONS_SOC_occupation_coding_tool.html)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title 1</th>
<th>Closest ONS job title</th>
<th>Closest ONS occupation code (4-digit)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please use this space to provide the closest ONS job title and the 4-digit SOC code as above.
More information about those jobs in shortage

11. For each job title provided please state the pay per period (annual, monthly, fortnightly, weekly or hourly). If you, for any job title, provide a pay per hour figure please also provide the hours per week you would expect to advertise for a vacancy with this job title.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title</th>
<th>Annual salary</th>
<th>Monthly pay</th>
<th>Fortnightly pay</th>
<th>Weekly pay</th>
<th>Hourly pay</th>
<th>Hours per week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please state what the job titles are as per question 10 and what the advertised pay would be.
12. What prior relevant work experience is required for each job in shortage?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title</th>
<th>Entry level-no prior experience</th>
<th>0-6 months experience</th>
<th>6-12 months experience</th>
<th>1 to 3 years</th>
<th>3 years and over</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job title 1</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 2</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 3</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 4</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 5</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 6</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 7</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 8</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 9</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 10</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please use the space below to state what these jobs are, and the experience required for each job.
13. What is the minimum qualification requirement for someone applying for the job title(s) you have identified as in shortage?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title 1</th>
<th>Degree level qualification, or higher</th>
<th>Higher qualification below degree level</th>
<th>A-level vocational</th>
<th>AS-level vocational</th>
<th>GCSE/Vocational</th>
<th>Other work-related or professional qualification</th>
<th>None</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job title 10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please use this space to state what the job titles are and what minimum qualifications are required. If another work-related qualification is required, please state what this is along with the job title.
14. What do you think are the main reasons for the recruitment difficulties? (Please select all that apply).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Job title 1</th>
<th>Job title 2</th>
<th>Job title 3</th>
<th>Job title 4</th>
<th>Job title 5</th>
<th>Job title 6</th>
<th>Job title 7</th>
<th>Job title 8</th>
<th>Job title 9</th>
<th>Job title 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Too much competition from other employers.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of applicants with the required skills.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of applicants generally.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of applicants with the required motivation, personality and or attitude.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of applicants with qualifications that are required for the job.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job entails shift work and or unsociable hours.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal work.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remote location/transport issues.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't know.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please state what these jobs are and what the reasons are for recruitment difficulties. If there are other reasons, please use this space to explain.
15. If known, for a previously advertised job (in shortage), how long did it take to fill that job? (Not to exceed 500 words).

16. Thinking about question 15 in the last 12 months has the length of time to fill that job changed? (Please select one option).

- Increased a lot
- Increased a little
- Stayed the same
- Decreased a little
- Decreased a lot
- Don't know

17. What is being done to reduce recruitment difficulties? (Please select all that apply.)

- Increase wages to attract candidates.
- Increase spending/investment on recruitment.
- Increase spending/investment on training of existing staff.
- Using different methods/channels for advertising vacancies.
- Improve conditions such as the inclusion of holiday allowances and bonuses.
- The use of different labour pools such as temporary/contract workers, job sharing.
- Other: please specify.
18. Thinking about the measures you have taken to reduce recruitment difficulties, can you provide any further information about how these measures have been used? (Not to exceed 500 words).

How long have the above measures been applied? (Not to exceed 500 words).

19. Have the above measures worked in reducing some of the difficulties in recruiting, if not why? (Not to exceed 500 words).

20. What impacts are these job shortages having on your business/organisation? (Not to exceed 500 words).

21. Are the jobs that you have said are in shortage, open to eligible workers from the Tier 2 points-based visa system?

☐ Yes

☐ No

22. If you have answered yes to question 21, has your business/organisation used the Tier 2 points-based visa system to recruit workers from outside of the UK? If so, please state how many employees have been recruited in the past 12 months along with the job titles. (Not to exceed 500 words).

23. If you have evidence for other occupations in shortage but have not had enough space to provide in this form, please use this space to explain (not to exceed 1,000 words).
Annex B: Evidence on behalf of members, or from academic institutions and think tanks

MAC Review of the Shortage Occupation List

This form is for anyone providing evidence of current sector/wider recruitment shortages, evidence provided on behalf of members, or from academic institutions, and think tanks. Please use this form to gather evidence for completion of the online form.

Your evidence

24. Please indicate from which of these industries are you providing evidence? (Please select all that apply).

- All sectors
- Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing
- Mining and Quarrying Activities
- Manufacturing
- Energy
- Water supply, sewerage, waste management
- Construction
- Wholesale and Retail Trade
- Transport
- Warehousing
- Accommodation and Hospitality
- Media and Communications
25. If you wish, you can provide details of individual jobs titles you/your members have found hard to fill in the boxes below (maximum of 10). Please help us by matching the job titles you have provided with the closest standardised ONS job title and associated 4-digit occupation (SOC) code using the Office for National Statistics (ONS) Occupation Tool – https://onsdigital.github.io/dp-classification-tools/standard-occupational-classification/ONS_SOC_occupation_coding_tool.html. There is also space to list the sector(s) where shortages of candidates to fill these job titles has been most acute. If providing this information, please refer to the list in question 24.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job title</th>
<th>Closest ONS job title</th>
<th>Closest ONS occupation code (4 digit)</th>
<th>Sector(s) most affected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
If there are more than 10 jobs in shortage, please use this space to provide the job titles, closest ONS job title, ONS occupation code and sector most affected as above.

26. What do you think are the main reasons for job shortages (answered in the question above), and or wider shortages in the sector(s)? (Not to exceed 500 words).

27. Please explain what measures have been taken to reduce shortages in the sector as informed by your members and or research. (Not to exceed 500 words).

28. Have these measures worked, if not why? (Not to exceed 500 words).

29. Are the jobs that you have said are in shortage, open to eligible workers from the Tier 2 points-based visa system?

☐ Yes

☐ No
30. If known, how many workers from outside of the UK have been recruited using the Tier 2 points-based visa system in the past 12 months, stating the job titles. (Not to exceed 500 words).

31. If you have supporting evidence such as survey results from members please attach here. Please remember to omit sensitive details before attaching.

32. If you have any other information that might be useful for our call for evidence please use the space below to explain (Not to exceed 500 words).
Annex C: Processing of personal data

Review of the Shortage Occupation List Call for Evidence online form-processing of personal data.

This notice sets out how the Migration Advisory Committee (the processors and controllers) will use your personal data for the purposes of the review of the Shortage Occupation List and explains your rights under the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018 (DPA).

Your data (data subject categories).

The personal information relates to businesses, sector bodies/representatives, government departments including devolved administrations and local authorities, think tanks, academic/higher education establishments and others that may wish to provide evidence of current recruitment shortages.

The data that that will be collected (data categories).

The information may include organisation name, location, email address, as well as opinions on recruitment shortages. It is possible that respondents may volunteer additional identifying information about themselves or third parties.

Legal basis of processing

The processing is necessary for the performance of a task carried out in the public interest. This requires evidence and opinion data to develop good effective proposals and recommendations to the government of what the current shortages are in the UK labour market. The Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) may use the contact details (email address) provided to contact respondents to add their details onto the MAC stakeholder database, for future research and to provide updates on work of the MAC, but this is optional.

Special category data

Although not being requested, it is possible that this information will be processed if volunteered by the respondent. If such a submission of special category of personal data, including that of third parties, we will take all necessary steps to delete, anonymise or pseudonymise that data before any publication takes place.

Purpose

Any personal information will be processed for the purpose of obtaining evidence from businesses, and representations from organisations and companies, about; evidence
of labour market shortages, including opinion data to enable the MAC to review its current Shortage Occupation List (SOL) list to inform the government.

**Who we may share your responses with**

Information provided to us in response to the online form and consultations may be published or disclosed in accordance with the access to information regimes. These are primarily the Freedom of Information Act 2000 (FOIA) and the Data Protection Act 2018 (DPA). It would be helpful if you could explain why you regard the information as confidential. If we receive a request for disclosure of the information we will take account of your explanation but cannot give an assurance that confidentiality can be maintained in all circumstances.

The MAC are an independent, non-departmental public body that advises the government on migration issues. A final report of the recommendations will be made to the Home Secretary in Spring 2019. If a submission of special category of personal data including that of third parties, we will take all necessary steps to delete, anonymise or pseudonymise that data before any publication takes place.

**How long we will hold your data (retention).**

Personal information will not be published but will be retained up until the period of reviewing the SOL has concluded. If there is ongoing interest in the commission and topic, we will need to retain the data in case of further analysis.

**Your rights**

You have the right to request information about how your personal data are processed and to request a copy of that personal data.

You have the right to request that any inaccuracies in your personal data are rectified.

You have the right to request that your personal data are erased if there is no longer a justification for them to be processed.

You have the right, in certain circumstances (for example, where accuracy is contested), to request that the processing of your personal data is restricted.

**How to submit a Data Subject Access Request (DSAR)**

To request access to personal data, email the Data Protection Office at:

[dsro@homeoffice.gov.uk](mailto:dsro@homeoffice.gov.uk)

Telephone: 020 7035 6999
Or write to:
Office of the DPO
Home Office
Peel Building
2 Marsham Street
London
SW1P 4DF

**Complaints**

If you have any concerns about the use of your personal data, please contact the MAC by emailing:

MAC@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk

The contact address for the MAC is:

Migration Advisory Committee
2nd Floor
Peel Building
Home Office
2 Marsham Street
London
SW1P 4DF
United Kingdom

If we are unable to address your concerns to your satisfaction, you can make a complaint to the Information Commissioner, the UK’s independent regulator for data protection. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF

Telephone: 0303 123 1113