

# Chapter A5: Appeals – PIP and UC only

## Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	A5001
Changes and further claims during the period before a hearing.....	A5010
The rules of natural justice .....	A5020
Overriding objective.....	A5023
The Human Right Act 1998.....	A5025
Further evidence received.....	A5030
Failure to comply with rules.....	A5035
<b>Which decisions can be appealed to the First-tier Tribunal</b> .....	A5040
Decisions which cannot be appealed.....	A5041
Decisions not revised .....	A5043
Notice of decision against which appeal lies.....	A5045
<b>Who can appeal to the First-tier Tribunal</b> .....	A5050
<b>Making an appeal to the First-tier Tribunal</b> .....	A5060
Time limit for appealing to the First-tier Tribunal.....	A5065
Appeals following decisions whether or not to revise .....	A5067
Late appeals.....	A5070
<b>Action when an appeal is made</b> .....	A5100
Identifying the decision appealed against .....	A5102
<b>Appeal not duly made</b> .....	A5110
<b>Appeals outside First-tier Tribunal jurisdiction</b> .....	A5150
<b>Lapsing an appeal</b> .....	A5159
Decision not to the claimant's advantage.....	A5165
<b>Appeal awaiting outcome of other proceedings</b>	
Employment or other tribunal pending .....	A5180

Criminal proceedings contemplated or pending.....	A5181
Appeal on the same subject as a case before the Court .....	A5183
<b>Withdrawing an appeal</b> .....	A5194
Reinstatement of withdrawn appeal .....	A5220
<b>When is an appeal struck out</b>	
The appellant.....	A5230
The respondent .....	A5235
Reinstatement of appeal .....	A5240
<b>Hearings</b> .....	A5270
<b>Evidence</b> .....	A5286
Non disclosure of documents and information.....	A5287
Extracts from documents .....	A5294
Copyright .....	A5304
Presentation of statements .....	A5305
Overpayments	
Warning and instructions issued to claimants.....	A5306
Disclosure not made to administering office .....	A5307
Rehabilitated offenders .....	A5308
Exchange of medical reports.....	A5311
<b>Witnesses</b> .....	A5320
No power to compel attendance .....	A5322
Attendance of employers .....	A5325
<b>Writing the response to the First-tier Tribunal</b> .....	A5330
Recommendation to the First-tier Tribunal.....	A5335
Outcome decision required .....	A5336
Outcome decision not required .....	A5337
Completion of appeal response .....	A5338
Personal details.....	A5339
The decision .....	A5340

Summary of facts .....	A5342
Law and case law.....	A5345
Use of unreported Upper Tribunal decisions .....	A5346
Northern Ireland Commissioners' decisions and Court of Appeal judgments.....	A5348
Relevant evidence.....	A5350
<b>First-tier Tribunal procedures</b> .....	A5360
Composition of the First-tier Tribunal.....	A5365
Other members .....	A5366
Membership for certain types of appeal.....	A5369
Tribunal member unavailable.....	A5372
Hearings and notice given.....	A5386
Right to be heard.....	A5395
Use of experts .....	A5405
Reference for medical examination and report.....	A5406
Medical examination by the First-tier Tribunal .....	A5410
Directions .....	A5412
<b>The hearing</b>	
Attendance of presenting officer at oral hearing .....	A5417
Function of the First-tier Tribunal .....	A5420
Options open to the First-tier Tribunal .....	A5422
First-tier Tribunal's power to substitute decisions.....	A5425
First-tier Tribunal's power to correct decisions .....	A5426
Responsibility of the appellant .....	A5428
Presenting officer's role.....	
Before the hearing.....	A5429
At the hearing.....	A5430
Conduct of the presenting officer .....	A5431
Order of proceedings.....	A5432
Presenting the appeal .....	A5433
What standard of proof of evidence is required .....	A5434
What evidence is admissible.....	A5435

Questioning witnesses .....	A5436
Recall of witnesses.....	A5440
Introduction of new material	
By the presenting officer .....	A5441
By the appellant .....	A5442
Unreported decision produced at the hearing.....	A5446
Summing up .....	A5447
Adjournments - presenting officer at the hearing.....	A5448
Action following adjournment .....	A5451
Resumed hearings .....	A5460
Appeal outstanding at appellant's death .....	A5470
Report of any exceptional incidents .....	A5480
<b>The First-tier Tribunal's decision</b>	
Decision notice .....	A5500
Statement of reasons .....	A5503
Late application for statement of reasons.....	A5504
Record of proceedings .....	A5508
<b>Consideration of the First-tier Tribunal decision</b>	
Decision incomplete .....	A5515
Case remitted to DM .....	A5516
Liberty to apply .....	A5518
Where a party thinks the decision is wrong.....	A5520
Accidental error .....	A5521
Setting aside First-tier Tribunal decisions on procedural grounds.....	A5530
Decisions that cannot be implemented .....	A5550
Potential appeals to the Upper Tribunal.....	A5557
Late applications .....	A5558
First-tier Tribunal consideration of application for permission to appeal.....	A5564
Suspension of payment of benefit.....	A5570

Appeals remitted by the Upper Tribunal.....	A5585
Supersession of the First-tier Tribunal decision.....	A5592
<b>Appeals to the Upper Tribunal and the Courts</b> .....	<b>A5600</b>
<b>Who can appeal to the Upper Tribunal</b> .....	<b>A5620</b>
<b>Application for permission to appeal to the Upper Tribunal</b>	
Application to the Upper Tribunal.....	A5640
Late applications .....	A5643
Decision on permission to appeal .....	A5645
Notice of appeal .....	A5647
Composition of Upper Tribunal .....	A5660
Withdrawal of applications and appeals.....	A5661
Reinstatement of withdrawn applications and appeals.....	A5663
Consideration of decision under appeal.....	A5664
Death of appellant .....	A5670
Striking out of proceedings.....	A5680
Power to extend time limits .....	A5683
<b>The Upper Tribunal's decision</b> .....	<b>A5685</b>
Parties to an appeal .....	A5689
Correction and setting aside .....	A5690
<b>Appeals to Court of Appeal or Court of Session</b> .....	<b>A5700</b>
Who may apply for leave.....	A5701
Leave to appeal.....	A5702
Time limits .....	A5706
Suspension of benefit.....	A5707
Judicial review .....	A5900
Judicial review of an Upper Tribunal decision.....	A5903
Action on receipt of a claim for judicial review .....	A5904
Examples of the type of case suitable to request strike out of appeal on basis of no reasonable prospect of success.....	<b>Appendix 1</b>
Aide memoire for DMs seeking a Secretary of State's application for permission to appeal to the Upper Tribunal .....	<b>Appendix 2</b>

# Chapter A5: Appeals - PIP and UC only

## Introduction

A5001 The following chapter contains guidance for dealing with appeals covering

1. PIP from 8.4.13 **and**
2. UC from 29.4.13.

**Note:** DMs should note that guidance on dealing with appeals for all other benefits can be found in DMG Chapter 06.

A5002 Claimants can **only** appeal to a FtT where the DM has first considered an application for revision of the original decision<sup>1</sup> (see ADM Chapter A3: Revision). Where a claimant makes an appeal before mandatory reconsideration has been requested then the appeal should be treated as a request for a mandatory reconsideration.

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(3A); UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 7*

A5003 If, following the mandatory reconsideration, the claimant wishes to pursue an appeal then they must send their notice of appeal directly to HMCTS<sup>1</sup>. HMCTS will then send the notice of appeal to DWP along with the mandatory reconsideration notice and any supporting documents to request that a response is prepared.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 22(2)(aa)*

A5004 The Secretary of State must

1. provide the person with the right of appeal (see A5050) a written notice of the decision including their appeal rights<sup>1</sup> **and**
2. tell the person with the right of appeal that where the notice in **1.** above does not include a statement of reasons, they may, within one month of the date of the notification of the decision, request that a statement of reasons is provided<sup>2</sup>. The statement must be provided within 14 days of the request or as soon as practicable thereafter<sup>3</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 51(2)(a); 2 reg 51(2)(b); 3 reg 51(3)*

A5005 When making their appeal to HMCTS, the claimant must include with their notice of appeal, a copy of the notice of the result of the mandatory reconsideration issued by DWP<sup>1</sup>. Where the mandatory reconsideration notice has not been included, HMCTS will return the notice of appeal to the appellant and advise that the appellant either

1. provide the mandatory reconsideration notice **or**

2. contact DWP to request a mandatory reconsideration if one has not already been carried out<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 22(4)(a)(i)*

A5006 Once the DM receives the request for an appeal response from HMCTS, this is the point at which the DM should

1. identify cases that are out of the FtT's jurisdiction (see A5150) or that have no reasonable prospect of success (see A5233) and apply to the FtT for strike out **or**
2. revise the decision to the claimant's advantage<sup>1</sup> if further evidence enables them to do so and so lapse the appeal (see A5160).

*1 SS Act 98, s 9(6); UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 52(1)*

A5007 The DM **must** notify HMCTS and the appellant if any decision under appeal is changed by revision or supersession. The DM must tell the FtT in the appeal response what the effect of the revision or supersession will have on their jurisdiction, for example

1. appeal lapsed
2. appeal now against unfavourable revised decision
3. jurisdiction limited to period/issues not covered by the supersession.

A5008 An appeal to the FtT is a rehearing of the whole outcome decision. The FtT does not have to consider any issue which is not raised by the appeal. However, as the FtT exercises an inquisitorial role, it is open to them to look at the whole decision entirely afresh<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(8)(a)*

A5009 Where an issue is raised after the appeal is made, the parties to the appeal should have notice of it and a reasonable opportunity to deal with it.

## **Changes and further claims during the period before a hearing**

A5010 DMs should note that the FtT may take account of evidence produced after the decision under appeal, where it provides information relevant to that decision<sup>1</sup>. For example, where the claimant produces a medical report showing a change of diagnosis, the FtT can consider the report.

*1 R(DLA) 2/01 & 3/01*

A5011 Any circumstances which change after the date of the appealed decision cannot be taken into account by the FtT<sup>1</sup>. Any changes should be referred to the DM to consider whether supersession is appropriate.

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(8)(b)*

A5012 The DM may supersede the decision under appeal before the appeal is heard. However, the appeal does not lapse. See ADM Chapter A4: Supersession.

A5013 Where a further claim is made and has been determined, the FtT cannot consider any period after the effective date of the decision on that claim. The FtT should always be informed in a further response where a further claim is decided before the hearing.

A5014 Once the appeal is heard and the FtT has made a decision, the DM may need to revise any

1. decision on a further claim **or**
2. superseded decision

to take account of the FtT's decision<sup>1</sup>. See ADM Chapter A3: Revision.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 11*

A5015 - A5019

## The rules of natural justice

A5020 There is a common law requirement that tribunals should observe the rules of natural justice<sup>1</sup>. Natural justice is the manner in which justice is expected to be achieved. It can be described as fair play in action<sup>2</sup>.

*1 R(S) 4/82(T); 2 R(IS) 5/93*

A5021 Natural justice relates solely to procedural unfairness. The requirements for the rules of natural justice are

1. an absence of personal bias on the part of the FtT **and**
2. an obligation to base their decision on evidence **and**
3. whether or not there is an oral hearing, to consider fairly the contentions of all people entitled to be represented<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(S) 4/82(T)*

A5022 The duty to ensure a fair hearing includes giving the claimant the opportunity to comment on their observations made during an oral hearing where they intend to rely on them as evidence for the decision. The FtT must not take account of observations unless they are

1. relevant to the issues under appeal or the time of the decision under appeal **or**
2. reliable as evidence of the claimant's condition<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(DLA) 8/06*

## Overriding objective

A5023 The FtT rules have what is known as an overriding objective rule<sup>1</sup>. This contains requirements for the FtT to deal fairly and justly with a case. This means

1. dealing with the case in proportion to
  - 1.1 its importance
  - 1.2 the complexity of the issues
  - 1.3 the anticipated costs
  - 1.4 the resources of the parties
2. avoiding formality and seeking flexibility in proceedings
3. ensuring all parties are able to participate fully
4. using any special expertise of the FtT effectively
5. avoiding unnecessary delay.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 2*

A5024 All parties to the appeal must help the FtT to further the overriding objective and must co-operate with the FtT in general<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 2(4)*

## The Human Rights Act 1998

A5025 The HR Act requires that so far as it is possible primary and subordinate legislation must be interpreted in a way which is compatible with the Convention rights<sup>1</sup>. The High Court, Court of Appeal, Supreme Court and the House of Lords can make declarations of incompatibility under s 4 of the Act, but FtTs and the UT do not have such power. Where the FtT finds that it is impossible to interpret **primary** legislation as compatible it must apply that legislation as enacted. This is because incompatibility does not affect the validity or continuing effect of incompatible legislation<sup>2</sup>. Unlike EC law there is no doctrine of supremacy so as to give Convention law precedence over domestic law.

*1 Human Rights Act 98, s 3; 2 s 4(6)(a)*

A5026 Regulations which are not protected by primary legislation, because their incompatibility does not arise from the primary legislation that they are made under, may be found to be incompatible by the FtT. These provisions would be outside the power conferred by the primary legislation under which they are made and therefore *ultra vires*. By making such regulations the relevant Minister would have acted unlawfully<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Human Rights Act 98, s 6*

A5027 DMs should ensure that, where the claimant raises a substantial human rights issue in his appeal, HMCTS is made aware of this issue at the outset. If such an issue is

raised for the first time at an oral hearing presenting officers should request an adjournment for consideration of a further response.

A5028 As with other grounds of appeal it is not sufficient for a claimant to make a general statement that the decision in question breaches the Convention on the Human Rights Act. The claimant should identify

1. the asserted breach of the convention
2. the Article which is said to be breached
3. the remedy sought in respect of the breach
4. the legal principles and authorities relied upon **and**
5. any error in law on the part of the DM in consequence of the breach.

For further guidance on Convention Rights, see ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence and Annex G.

A5029 Where a human rights issue is raised on a case and the DM requires advice on the matter, they should contact DMA Leeds without delay.

## Further evidence received

A5030 Where further evidence is received at **any** time before the FtT gives its decision, e.g. following an adjournment, a further reconsideration of the decision under appeal **must** be carried out. This is **despite** there having already been earlier reconsiderations. See also A5006. HMCTS will refer any such further evidence to the DM for their consideration.

A5031 - A5034

## Failure to comply with rules

A5035 The FtT has several options where a party to an appeal has failed to comply with the rules. The FtT can

1. waive the requirement to comply<sup>1</sup>
2. require the failure to be remedied<sup>2</sup>
3. strike out the party's case<sup>3</sup>
4. refer the matter to the UT to decide where a failure by a person to comply with a requirement imposed by the FtT<sup>4</sup>
  - 4.1 to attend at any place to give evidence
  - 4.2 otherwise to make themselves available to give evidence
  - 4.3 to swear an oath in connection with giving evidence

**4.4** to give evidence as a witness

**4.5** to produce a document

**4.6** to facilitate inspection of a document or any other thing (including premises).

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 7(2)(a); 2 rule 7(2)(b); 3 rule 7(2)(c); 4 rule 7(2)(d) & 7(3); TCE Act 07, s 25*

A5036 The UT has the same powers as the High Court in England and Wales and the Court of Session in Scotland. They can therefore summons a person to give evidence etc. Non-compliance with such a summons could result in serious penalties.

A5037 - A5039

## Which decisions can be appealed to the First-tier Tribunal

A5040 Decisions which can be appealed are listed in ADM Annex D. They include decisions on claims and supersession whether as originally made or as revised<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98 s 12(1) & Sch 3; UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 50(1) & Sch 2*

## Decisions which cannot be appealed

A5041 Claimants might make an appeal against decisions which do not carry the right of appeal<sup>1</sup> (see ADM Annex E). These are

1. administrative decisions<sup>1</sup>
2. determinations necessary to an outcome decision<sup>2</sup>.

Where the FtT has no jurisdiction to hear the appeal, it will be struck out (see A5150 - A5151 and A5230 - A5243).

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 50(2); Sch 3; 2 SS Act 98, Sch 2; 2 s 12(2)*

A5042

## Decisions not revised

A5043 A notification that the DM has not

1. revised **or**
2. accepted a late application for revision of

a decision is not a decision with the right of appeal. Where an appeal is made against these decisions HMCTS will consider it as out of jurisdiction (see A5150 - A5151). For guidance on when a decision should not be revised, see ADM Chapter A3: Revision.

A5044 Where a decision is not revised, it may still be possible to appeal the original decision to the FtT. See A5065 et seq for further guidance

## Notice of a decision against which an appeal lies

A5045 A person with the right of appeal must be

1. given written notice of the decision and their right to appeal the decision **and**
2. told that, where that notice does not include a statement of reasons, they can request one and they must do so within a month of the notification of that decision<sup>1</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 7(3)(b)*

A5046 Where requested in A5045 2., that statement of reasons must be provided by the Secretary of State within 14 days of the request or as soon as practicable afterwards<sup>1</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 7(4)*

A5047 - A5049

## Who can appeal to the First-tier Tribunal

A5050 In addition to the claimant<sup>1</sup>, other people have a right of appeal to the FtT. An appeal is accepted where it is made by

1. a person appointed by the Secretary of State<sup>2</sup> to proceed with a claim of a person who has claimed benefit and subsequently died<sup>3</sup> **or**
2. a person appointed by the Secretary of State<sup>4</sup> to act on behalf of another<sup>5</sup> **or**
3. a person who claims PIP on behalf of a terminally ill claimant<sup>6</sup> **or**
4. any person from whom any amount payable by way of a relevant benefit is recoverable, but only if their rights, duties or obligations are affected by a decision<sup>7</sup> (see ADM Chapter D1: Overpayments for UC and DMG Chapter 09 for PIP).

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(2); 2 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (C&P) Regs, reg 57; 3 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA, (D&A) Regs, reg 49(a); 4 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (C&P) Regs, reg 56; 5 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 49(b); 6 reg 49(c); 7 reg 49(d); SS A Act 92, s 71ZB, 71ZG & 71ZH*

A5051 The DM **does not** have the right of appeal to the FtT. Where there is any doubt about a decision, the DM should consider whether it would be appropriate to revise or supersede the decision instead.

A5052 Where a person who does not have the right of appeal makes an appeal against a decision, see A5110 et seq.

A5053 - A5059

## Making an appeal to the First-tier Tribunal

A5060 The notice of appeal must include<sup>1</sup>

1. the name and address of the appellant and any representative
2. the address where documents for the appellant should be sent
3. the name and address of any respondent other than the DM
4. details as to why the appellant thinks the decision may be wrong
5. whether the appellant will require an interpreter at any hearing and for which language or dialect
6. whether the appellant intends to attend or be represented at any hearing.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC), Rules, rule 22(3)*

A5061 Along with the notice of appeal, the appellant must also provide

1. a copy of the mandatory reconsideration notice
2. any statement of reasons that the appellant may have
3. any documents the appellant has to support their case that have not already been sent to the Department<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 22(4)*

A5062 Where the appeal form or letter does not give all the details required, see A5110 - A5116 below.

A5063 – A5064

### Time limit for appealing to the First-tier Tribunal

A5065 The time limit within which the claimant must make an appeal<sup>1</sup> to the FtT is one month after the date the appellant was sent the DM's mandatory reconsideration notice<sup>1</sup>.

**Note:** The decision is notified when it is posted or handed to the claimant or, where the claim is for UC, when it is notified via the claimant's online UC account. For guidance on rights to request a written statement and time limits, see ADM Chapter A3: Revision.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 22(2)(aa)*

A5066 Where the decision is handed to the claimant, the Department should ensure that the date of notification is recorded in the claimant's case papers. The response to the FtT should include the date notification was handed to the appellant.

## Appeals following decisions whether or not to revise

A5067 Where the DM revises a decision, the right of appeal is against the original decision as revised<sup>1</sup>. The original decision is treated as made on the date it is revised solely for the purposes of calculating appeal time limits<sup>2</sup>.

*1 R(IS) 15/04; 2 SS Act 98, s 9(5)*

A5068- A5069

## Late appeals

A5070 Where an appeal is made to the FtT outside normal time limits, the appellant must include a request for an extension of time and the reason why it is late<sup>1</sup>. If the appellant does not then HMCTS will request reasons. A late appeal will normally be treated by the FtT as having been made in time if neither the DM nor any other respondent objects<sup>2</sup>. In this situation the FtT will extend the time for appealing<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 22(6); 2 rule 22(8); 3 rule 5(3)(a)*

A5071 - A5079

A5080 The time limits in A5065 begin when the decision is notified. It is therefore important to ensure, especially in cases where it is alleged that the decision notice has not been received, that the decision has been notified correctly. For guidance on how a decision is notified see ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence.

A5081 The following are examples of special circumstances when it might be appropriate for the DM to not object to HMCTS accepting an appeal as made in time

1. difficulty in getting an appointment with a representative (especially in rural areas)
2. problems in writing the appeal for a blind person living alone
3. difficulty in obtaining an appeal form
4. allegation that the decision notice was not received
5. inability to read, write or understand English where the appellant lives alone
6. change of address during one month period
7. allegation that an earlier appeal was made
8. inability to understand the decision notice where the person has a mental disability or learning difficulties and lives alone.

A5082 The list at A5081 is intended only as a guide. For example, a person might not be living alone, but the other people in the house may not be willing to help. Alternatively, a person living alone may have family or friends who visit regularly to check post. Each case should be considered on its merits.

A5083 - A5099

## **Action when an appeal is made**

A5100 When an appeal is made, or further evidence is obtained after an appeal is made, the DM should consider whether the original decision should be revised and the appeal lapsed once they are passed the papers by HMCTS. This applies even though a mandatory reconsideration will have already been done.

A5101

## **Identifying the decision appealed against**

A5102 In most cases an appeal is made against the last decision made on a claim or application. However, claimants may make an appeal against an earlier decision which has been revised or superseded. Where the appealed decision has been

1. revised, the claimant should be advised that this decision has been amended by the later decision. See A5160 et seq for further action **or**
2. superseded, the claimant has the right of appeal against the previous decision as the superseded decision does not entirely replace it. For example, there may be a limitation on payability of arrears.

A5103 - A5109

## **Appeal not duly made**

A5110 It will be for HMCTS/FtT to decide whether the appeal has been duly made taking into account the information required (see A5060). If it has not been duly made then HMCTS will write to the person making the appeal to provide that information. There may however, be information that HMCTS is not aware of that means the appeal would not be accepted as duly made. For example where the person making the appeal does not have written authority to do so from the claimant. In that case, DWP would have to return the papers to HMCTS to investigate.

A5111 - A5149

## **Appeals outside First-tier Tribunal jurisdiction**

A5150 The FtT has the authority to decide whether an appeal is within the tribunal's jurisdiction. HMCTS will only send the appeal to DWP once they have accepted it. However, this does not prevent the DM from referring a case back to the FtT if the DM considers the matter outside the FtT's jurisdiction because of information they

hold that HMCTS may not be aware of. Decisions or determinations that are non-appealable are listed at ADM Annex E<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, Sch 2; UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, Sch 3*

A5151 The mandatory reconsideration notice issued by the DM will state what decision the claimant can appeal to the FtT. Without this notice, HMCTS may not progress the appeal.

A5152 - A5158

## Lapsing an appeal

A5159 Where the appeal is accepted by HMCTS, the DM can still consider revising the decision under appeal, the outcome determines whether the appeal lapses. An appeal should be lapsed where the revised decision is to the claimant's advantage<sup>1</sup>.

**Note:** An appeal cannot be lapsed where the decision is superseded.

*1 SS Act 98, s 9(6)*

A5160 The purpose of lapsing an appeal is to prevent unnecessary appeals going ahead. The power to revise is discretionary rather than mandatory, and should not be used in order to prevent an appeal being heard. DMs are therefore advised to consider whether a decision under appeal should be revised where

1. the revision does not address the issue which is the subject of the appeal **and**
2. it is likely that a further appeal will be made.

**Note:** Once the DM actually makes that revised decision then the appeal must lapse so it is important that the DM considers whether revision is the appropriate course of action to take.

A5161 So where a revision would not give the claimant all they are asking for in the appeal, the DM will contact the claimant before revising to ask them if they would still want to appeal if the revised decision were made. If the claimant says they would

1. still appeal, then the decision would not be revised and the appeal goes ahead with our response including details of the revised decision and that we cannot revise the decision as this would mean the appeal would have to lapse **or**
2. be happy with the revised decision, the DM would make that revised decision and lapse the appeal. The claimant would be informed of their appeal rights against the revised decision.

**Note:** If the claimant cannot be contacted then the appeal should not be lapsed.

### Example 1

The DM decides that a claim for UC should be disallowed from and including 17 January on the grounds that the claimant's income exceeds the maximum amount of the award. The mandatory reconsideration confirms the earlier decision. On receiving the appeal from HMCTS, the issue in the appeal is whether the claimant has income, the DM notices that the date of disallowance is incorrect, and should have been 19 January. The DM does not revise the decision, and the appeal goes ahead.

### **Example 2**

The DM decides that an overpayment of PIP of £10,855 is recoverable. The mandatory reconsideration confirms the earlier decision. The decision is reconsidered on appeal, the issue being whether the overpayment is recoverable. (PIP is subject to guidance in DMG Chapter 09 and so recoverability is an appealable decision). The DM notices that the amount of the overpayment has been incorrectly calculated, and should be £10,835. The DM does not revise, and the appeal goes ahead.

### **Example 3**

The DM decides that there has been an overpayment of UC of £10,855. The mandatory reconsideration confirms the earlier decision. The decision is reconsidered on appeal, the issue being whether the amount of the overpayment is correct. The DM notices that the amount of the overpayment has been incorrectly calculated, and should be £6,255. The DM contacts the claimant who says they are happy with this and do not want to continue with the appeal. The DM revises the decision and the appeal is lapsed.

A5162 Where the decision is not revised, but the DM considers it to be incorrect, the response should

1. advise the tribunal why the decision is not revised **and**
2. request that the correct decision is substituted for that of the DM.

A5163 A decision is to the claimant's advantage<sup>1</sup> when the outcome is that

1. any benefit paid to the appellant is greater or for a longer period as a result of a revision
2. it would have resulted in a greater amount of benefit being payable but for the effect of any restriction or suspension of payment of, or disqualifying a claimant from receiving some or all of the benefit **or**
3. as a result of the decision, a denial or disqualification for the receiving of any benefit if lifted wholly or in part **or**
4. it reverses a decision to pay benefit to a third party **or**

5. the amount of a recoverable overpayment is reduced or is no longer recoverable **or**
6. a financial gain has or will accrue to the claimant as a result of the decision.

This list is not exhaustive and each case should be considered on its facts.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 52(5)*

A5164 Where an appeal is lapsed because the decision is revised, the new outcome decision carries a new dispute period and appeal rights. The claimant and HMCTS should be notified that the appeal has lapsed.

## Decision not to the claimant's advantage

A5165 Where the revised decision is not to the claimant's advantage, the appeal should be treated as made against the decision as revised<sup>1</sup>. The claimant must also be invited to make further representations within one month of notification of the revised decision<sup>2</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 52(2); 2 reg 52(3)*

A5166 If the decision is not revised following reconsideration, the reconsideration is **not** a decision. The appeal continues and the DM prepares the appeal response to be sent to HMCTS.

A5167 After the end of that period, or within that period if the claimant consents in writing, the appeal to the FtT must proceed, except where

1. the DM further revises the decision in light of further representations from the claimant **and**
2. that decision is more advantageous to the claimant than the decision before it was revised<sup>1</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 52(4)*

A5168 The appeal lapses where

1. the claimant provides further information **and**
2. the revised decision can be revised again **and**
3. the effect of the new decision is that the conditions in A5160 are satisfied for the original decision<sup>1</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 52(4)*

## Example

The DM awards UC of £40. Mandatory reconsideration confirms this award. The claimant appeals, and the DM revises the decision to award £35. The claimant provides more information, as a result of which the DM is able to revise again and award £40.50. The appeal lapses.

A5169 Where the result of the further revision is not to the claimant's advantage, the appeal proceeds to HMCTS with a response in the normal manner.

A5170 - A5179

## **Appeal awaiting outcome of other proceedings**

### **Employment or other tribunal pending**

A5180 Where a claimant has already appealed to another tribunal or authority (including the FtT) on a matter connected to the present appeal, HMCTS should be asked to delay or postpone the present appeal hearing to await the outcome of the other proceedings.

### **Criminal proceedings contemplated or pending**

A5181 If an appeal is connected to matters that may result in criminal proceedings against the claimant, no mention of this should be made in the written or oral response. However, it should be brought to the attention of HMCTS.

A5182 The response should not be delayed where criminal proceedings are being brought by the Department against the claimant. The matter should be brought to the attention of HMCTS with details of how far those proceedings have progressed. The FtT decides whether the tribunal hearing should be delayed or postponed.

## **Appeal on the same subject as a case before the Court**

A5183 An appeal to the FtT may be affected by the outcome of an appeal to the Court on the same subject. The DM can require the FtT to

1. not determine the appeal, but refer the case to the DM<sup>1</sup> **or**
2. stay the appeal until the appeal to the Court is decided<sup>2</sup> **or**
3. decide the appeal as if the appeal to the Court had been decided unfavourably for the claimant where the FtT considers this to be in the interests of the appellant<sup>3</sup>.

Appeals where this might apply will be identified by DMA Leeds.

For further guidance on staying appeals see ADM Chapter A4: Supersession, suspension and termination.

*1 SS Act 98, s 26(2); 2 s 26(4)(a); 3 s 26(4)(b)*

A5184 - A5193

## Withdrawing an appeal

A5194 Once an appeal has been lodged with HMCTS, it may be withdrawn by the claimant or representative

1. in writing to the FtT<sup>1</sup> **or**
2. at an oral hearing but only where the FtT agree to the withdrawal<sup>2</sup> **or**
3. by telephone to HMCTS<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 17(1); 2 rule 17(2) & (3); 3 Practice Statement on Delegation of Functions to Staff*

A5195 The withdrawal of an appeal to the FtT made

1. before a hearing begins **or**
2. during an adjournment of proceedings

takes effect automatically, unless the FtT has previously directed that any withdrawal requires its consent. So even where the proceeding are adjourned part heard for some months for example, the appeal could still be withdrawn during the adjournment period without consent of the FtT being required.

A5196 However, the content of the decision under appeal is not “part” of the party’s case; it is what the case is about. So where a decision contains several determinations, for example in PIP cases where a decision consists of a determination on the PIP assessment and a determination on the required period, it is still one decision. So if an appeal is withdrawn then all the determinations that make up that decision are withdrawn<sup>1</sup>.

*1 AE v SSWP (ESA) [2014] UKUT 5; AACR 23*

A5197 HMCTS will inform all parties to an appeal when an appeal lodged with HMCTS has been withdrawn.

A5198 - A5219

## Reinstatement of withdrawn appeal

A5220 A party to an appeal who has withdrawn their case may also apply to the FtT for it to be reinstated<sup>1</sup>. Such a request must be made in writing and be received within a month after

1. the date the FtT received the written request to withdraw the case **or**
2. the date of the hearing if the withdrawal was made verbally<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 17(4); 2 rule 17(5)*

A5221 - A5229

# When is an appeal struck out

## The appellant

A5230 The FtT will automatically strike out appeal proceedings if the appellant has failed to comply with a direction where the direction stated that failure to comply would result in strike out<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 8(1)*

A5231 Where the FtT have no jurisdiction to hear the appeal then they must strike out the whole or part of the proceedings unless they transfer the case to another court or tribunal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 8(2)(a)*

A5232 The FtT have the option to strike out proceedings if the

1. appellant fails to comply with a direction by the FtT where the direction stated that failure to comply may result in strike out
2. appellant failed to co-operate with the FtT to the extent that the proceedings cannot be dealt with fairly and justly
3. FtT considers there is no reasonable prospect of appellant being successful<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 8(3)*

A5233 While it is only the FtT who have the authority to strike out proceedings, the DM is able to apply to the FtT for cases to be struck out. So where the DM identifies a case that they think

1. is outside of the FtT's jurisdiction, they should take action as per A5150 **or**
2. has no reasonable prospect of success, they should send the case to HMCTS **before** writing the appeal response including details of the appeal and why they think there is no reasonable prospect of success.

**Note:** Appendix 1 to this Chapter gives examples of the types of case that may be suitable for applying for strike out on grounds of no reasonable prospect of success.

A5234 The FtT may not strike out proceedings under A5231 or A5232 **2.** and **3.** above before allowing the appellant the opportunity to make representations to the FtT about the matter<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 8(4)*

## The respondent

A5235 The strike out provisions described in A5230 - A5233 above also apply to the respondent (i.e. DWP) except that for the respondent this means that rather than the proceedings being struck out, the respondent would be barred from taking any further part in the proceedings<sup>1</sup>. The respondent must be given the opportunity to make representations to the FtT on the proposed bar before it is imposed.

A5236 The DM **must** respond to a direction from the FtT as the direction can be accompanied by a warning that DWP may be barred from the proceedings if they fail to comply. When a direction is received it will include a time limit within which the DM must respond. The DM can request an extension to this time limit if they have to seek information or advice before responding. A direction should never be ignored and the DM can always refer the case to DMA Leeds for advice if they do not feel able to respond to the direction without assistance.

A5237 If failure to comply with the direction does result in DWP being barred from proceedings, the FtT is then able to continue with the hearing without taking any account of the appeal response submitted by DWP. It can then determine any or all issues under appeal against DWP<sup>1</sup>. So it is extremely important that the direction is complied with.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 8(8)*

A5238 The DM does have the right to challenge a direction<sup>1</sup>, for example if they feel it is unreasonable for DWP to provide the information requested or DWP does not have the relevant authority to obtain the information.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 6(5)*

A5239

## **Reinstatement of appeal**

A5240 If proceedings have been struck out under A5230 or A5232 **1.**, the appellant can apply in writing to the FtT for proceedings to be reinstated<sup>1</sup>. Where the respondent has been barred from taking further part in the proceedings as in A5234, then they can apply to the FtT for the bar to be lifted<sup>2</sup>. An application for reinstatement or lifting of the bar has to be made within a month of the striking out or barring being notified<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) Rules, rule 8(5); 2 rule 8(7)(b); 3 rule 8(6)*

A5241 - A5269

## **Hearings**

A5270 The FtT must hold a hearing, which means an oral hearing<sup>1</sup>, before making a decision on the appeal unless

**1.** each party to the appeal has

**1.1** consented to **or**

**1.2** not objected to

the matter being decided without a hearing **and**

2. the FtT considers it can decide the appeal without a hearing<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 1(3); 2 rule 27(1)*

A5271 Each party to the proceedings is entitled to attend a hearing<sup>1</sup>. At least 14 days notice of the hearing should be given. Exceptionally this can be less with the consent of all parties or where there are urgent reasons for shorter notification<sup>2</sup>. Hearings should be in public unless the FtT decide otherwise<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 28; 2 rule 29; 3 rule 30(1)*

A5272 The FtT can direct that a person be excluded from all or part of the hearing where they consider that that person's

1. conduct is likely to disrupt the hearing **or**
2. presence is likely to prevent someone from giving evidence or talking freely **or**
3. presence would counteract the effect of withholding information likely to cause harm **or**
4. attendance would defeat the purpose of the hearing<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 30(5)*

A5273 The FtT can also exclude a witness from the hearing until they give their evidence<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 30(6)*

A5274 - A5285

## Evidence

A5286 All evidence

1. relevant to the appeal **and**
2. available to the DM

should be available to the tribunal and disclosed to the appellant or representative<sup>1</sup>. (see ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence).

**Note:** Advice on the law, such as guidance on an individual case, is not evidence and should not be disclosed to the appellant, representative or tribunal. See ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence for further details.

*1 R(S) 1/58*

## Non disclosure of documents and information

A5287 The FtT may give an order prohibiting the disclosure or publication of

1. documents or information relating to the appeal **or**

2. any matter which would enable the public to identify any person whom the FtT considers should not be identified<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 14(1)*

A5288 The FtT may give a direction prohibiting disclosure of documents and information to a person if

1. the FtT is satisfied that disclosure would cause that person, or someone else, serious harm **and**
2. the FtT is satisfied that it is in the interests of justice and proportionate to do so<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 14(2)*

A5289 Any party to the proceedings can request that the FtT give such a direction. If they do then they must

1. exclude the relevant document or information from the rest of the papers provided to the person they wish the non disclosure to effect **and**
2. provide the FtT with the excluded document or information and the reason for its exclusions<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 14(3)*

A5290 The FtT will then decide whether to give a non disclosure direction, bearing in mind the criteria in A5288<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 14(4)*

A5291 If the person to whom the directive has been made has a representative, the FtT can direct that the representative can see the relevant document or information provided the FtT is satisfied that

1. disclosure to the representative would be in the interests of the person they represent **and**
2. the representative will not disclose the document or information to the person they represent unless they have the consent of the FtT<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) Rules, rule 14(5) & (6)*

A5292 The appellant is asked to produce any relevant documents, for example, business accounts, to HMCTS when they return the pre-hearing enquiry form.

A5293

## **Extracts from documents**

A5294 The Department may submit extracts from lengthy documents, for example, a set of accounts. The response writer should

1. indicate which part of the document is to be copied by the Department and ensure that the typed extract is clearly headed "Extract from..." giving the necessary identifying details
2. ensure that the complete document or a copy of it is available at the hearing
3. provide a transcript and ensure the original tape is available at the hearing where an interview has been tape recorded.

**Note:** Extracts should never be taken from interviews under caution. The whole document should be provided<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(I) 10/58*

A5295 - A5303

## Copyright

- A5304 Permission is not needed to reproduce printed material covered by copyright for an appeal to the FtT or the UT<sup>1</sup>. If an extract of printed material is needed for a response, the document can be photocopied and its source noted on the copy.

*1 Copyright Act 56, s 6(4)*

## Presentation of statements

- A5305 The Department should ensure that
1. written statements are signed with an explanation of why they were made and signed unless the reason is self-evident<sup>1</sup>
  2. all evidence that is hard to read, especially records of interviews or phone calls, is typed and signed
  3. the original documents are available at the hearing where practicable
  4. the advice in ADM Chapter A1 about evidence given in confidence is followed where the evidence refers to imprisonment
  5. anonymous letters are not included
  6. anonymous witness statements are not routinely included. Generally a witness should not be anonymous unless there are special circumstances requiring anonymity and that would be a matter for the tribunal chairman to decide
  7. if redacted documents are included the papers, an unredacted copy in a sealed envelope should be made available to the chairman of the FtT.

*1 R(G) 1/63*

## Overpayments

## Warning and instructions issued to claimants

A5306 If an appeal is made against a recoverable overpayment, the evidence should include

1. the warnings and instructions in a printed form
2. a copy of any leaflet sent to the claimant if the advice in that leaflet is relevant.

If the particular print of a form or leaflet is no longer available, the nearest equivalent should be included. If there have been any changes to the warnings and instructions to the claimant then the DM should include an explanation as to the effect, if any, those changes have on the case.

## Disclosure not made to administering office

A5307 Where

1. the appeal is against a recoverable overpayment decision **and**
2. the ground of appeal is that disclosure was made to another office or part of another office of the Department

the DM should include evidence of Departmental procedures for links between sections, whether by computer or otherwise, and whether they broke down during the period of the overpayment.

## Rehabilitated offenders

A5308 It is a criminal offence for anyone whose official duties involve access to official records to disclose information about spent convictions of rehabilitated offenders outside the course of those duties. In this connection the response writer should note that

1. evidence referring to a spent conviction should only be included where justice can **only** be done by doing so
2. if it is essential to refer to a period when the claimant has been in prison but has not been convicted of an offence, for example on remand, this should be made clear in the response.

A5309 - A5310

## Exchange of medical reports

A5311 When a claimant disputes or appeals a decision and argues that a medical report produced for another benefit is more favourable to them, the DM should, if possible, obtain a copy of the other report and take it into account when reconsidering the decision. The decision may need to be revised or superseded in the light of the

other report. See ADM Chapters A3: Revision and Chapter A4: Supersession, for further guidance.

- A5312 The DM may also use a report produced for another benefit as evidence, for example where it is sent by another part of the Department.
- A5313 If an appeal proceeds, include a copy of the other report in the appeal documents and refer to it in the appeal response.
- A5314 The DM should also ensure that the tribunal is made aware of any decision making and appeals process which may have followed the production of the report.

A5315 - A5319

## Witnesses

- A5320 Any person with a right to be heard (see A5395) at an oral hearing has the right to call witnesses and put questions to another person called as a witness.
- A5321 The FtT may issue a summons (or citation in Scotland) to any person in GB requiring them to attend a tribunal hearing as a witness or order them to answer questions or produce evidence<sup>1</sup>. The summons must
1. give 14 days notice of the hearing (or shorter period if the FtT direct) **and**
  2. make provision for the person summonsed to be paid necessary expenses and say who will pay them, where they are not a party to the appeal<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 16(1); 2 rule 16(2)*

## No power to compel attendance

- A5322 No person can be compelled to give evidence or produce any document that they could not be required to do in a court of law in the part of the UK where the proceedings are to be heard<sup>1</sup>. Where a summons or order has been made it must state
1. that the person subject to the summons or order can apply to the FtT to vary or set it aside if they have not had the opportunity to object to it **and**
  2. the consequences of failure to comply with the summons or order<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 16(3); 2 rule 16(4)*

- A5323 The following general points apply to the attendance of witnesses
1. a claimant does not have the right to demand the presence of an officer whose evidence is unfavourable to him or her<sup>1</sup>
  2. if a claimant wants to question a witness to resolve a conflict in evidence, the presenting officer should agree to an adjournment if necessary<sup>2</sup>.

*1 R(SB) 1/81; 2 R(SB) 10/86*

A5324 If it is likely that the evidence obtained by a visiting officer, special investigator or other officer will be challenged, the Department should arrange for that officer to attend. Witnesses can give direct evidence and give the appellant (or representative) an opportunity to question that evidence<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(SB) 10/86*

## **Attendance of employers**

A5325 The Department should not normally ask an employer to attend as a witness or send a representative except

1. where there is a material conflict between the employer's written evidence and that of the appellant **or**
2. where the employer could otherwise make a material contribution to the tribunal's consideration of the case.

A5326 Where a witness is required, the witness should have first-hand knowledge of the relevant facts. For example if the evidence of overtime disclosed on wages records is to be questioned, the witness should be the person who made up the wage records, not the office manager who was not personally involved.

A5327 - A5329

## **Writing the response to the First-tier Tribunal**

A5330 The main purpose of the written appeal response is to provide the FtT and the claimant with a comprehensive explanation of the reasons for the DM's decision. DWP will provide a response within 28 calendar days after the receipt of the appeal papers from HMCTS<sup>1</sup>. The response must always contain<sup>2</sup>

1. the name and address of the DM who made the decision against which the claimant is appealing
2. the name and address of the presenting officer, if one is going to attend the hearing
3. the name and address of the relevant DWP office where documents can be sent

4. the names and addresses of any other respondents and their representatives, if known
5. whether the Secretary of State opposes the appeal and if so the grounds for that opposition if this is not already set out in any documents the FtT has
6. any further information that the FtT issues a direction for.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 24(1)(c); 2 rule 24(2)*

A5331 The response should

1. focus on the circumstances that existed at the time that the appealed decision was made **and**
2. deal solely with the issues raised by the appeal.

A5332 The response writer should adopt the role of friend of the court<sup>1</sup>. This means that the response should

1. give proper emphasis to points in the claimant's favour **and**
2. deal with any unresolved points put forward by the appellant. Account should be taken of these even if they are, in the response writer's opinion, only vaguely relevant to the question at issue.

*1 R(I) 4/65, Appendix*

A5333 [\[See memo ADM 22/17\]](#) Along with the appeal response, the DM must also provide

1. a copy of any written record of the decision and subsequent mandatory reconsideration and any statement of reasons for those decisions **and**
2. copies of all other relevant documents that the Secretary of State holds<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 24(4)(a) & (b)*

A5334 Unless the FtT has made an order prohibiting the disclosure of certain documents<sup>1</sup> (see A5287 et seq), the DM must provide a copy of the appeal response and any other papers to each other party to the appeal. If the party has a representative then they must be provided with a copy of any papers and therefore there is no need to provide them to the party<sup>2</sup>. If they wish, the appellant can then make a written submission or supply other documents in reply to the DM's appeal response<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 14; 2 rule 11(6); 3 rule 24(5)-(7)*

## **Recommendation to the First-tier Tribunal**

A5335 In order to assist the FtT to take the most appropriate course of action, the response to the FtT should indicate whether, if the appeal succeeds on the issue raised, there are other issues which require determination. If so, the response should also state whether the Secretary of State considers that the FtT should deal with them, or whether they should decide the issue under appeal and refer the case to the DM for a final outcome decision to be made.

## **Outcome decision required**

A5336 The following example is where the response writer may wish to request that the FtT give an outcome decision.

**Note:** If the FtT does not accept the recommendation, the DM must comply with the FtT's directions.

### **Example**

The DM decides that a claim for UC is disallowed because the claimant is not in GB. The claim form has given sufficient information to decide all other conditions of entitlement. The response requests the FtT to give an outcome decision on entitlement if the appeal on the issue of being in GB is allowed.

## **Outcome decision not required**

A5337 The following examples are where the response writer may wish to request that the FtT refers the case for the DM to give an outcome decision.

### **Example 1**

The DM disallows a claim for PIP as the claimant has not been able to show they satisfied the residence and presence conditions. The DM's response requests the FtT to remit the claim to the DM to deal with the daily living and mobility component activities should the FtT decide the residence and presence conditions are satisfied.

### **Example 2**

The DM disallows a claim for UC on the basis that the claimant has capital in excess of the £16,000 limit. In the response to the FtT, the DM asks that if they should find that the capital is less than £16,000, the FtT remit the case to the DM so that enquiries can be made about the claimant's earnings.

## **Completion of appeal responses**

A5338 Appeal responses are made in a standard format depending on the focus of the response. For general advice on the contents of responses see A5330 et seq. Detailed guidance on the completion of appeal response templates can be found in Departmental operational guidance.

## **Personal details**

A5339 The response should contain

1. the claimant's name and NI number
2. the date the decision appealed was made
3. the date the decision was notified to the claimant (see A5065 - A5066)

4. the date the mandatory reconsideration was undertaken
5. the date the mandatory reconsideration notice was sent to the claimant.

## **The decision**

A5340 The exact wording of the decision as notified to the claimant should be included. The response writer should not paraphrase or make corrections to the decision. DMs should ensure that the outcome is recorded, and not the determination which is the issue under appeal.

A5341

## **Summary of facts**

A5342 The summary should

1. be a plain statement of facts in a simple narrative form
2. contain only those facts relevant to the case
3. exclude opinions or assumptions not supported by the evidence.

A5343 The facts of the case should also include an explanation of the reasons for the decision and the mandatory reconsideration process. The explanation of the decision should cover the outcome and how the issues under appeal were decided. The reconsideration process should include details of information supplied by the claimant and its consideration.

A5344 Where the facts refer to a particular document, an appropriate cross-reference to the page number should be made.

## **Law and case law**

A5345 The response should list

1. the sections of Acts
2. the numbers of regulations
3. any European legislation, for example Regulations and Directives
4. relevant case law

used to make the decision about the issues under appeal.

## **Use of unreported Upper Tribunal decisions**

A5346 The response writer should note the following points on unreported UT decisions

1. response writers should not normally rely on unreported UT's decisions as authority or refer to them in responses

2. the response writer should take account of an unreported decision if a claimant refers to it
3. in exceptional cases copies of unreported decisions and advice on their application are available from DMA Leeds
4. if the facts are clearly distinguishable so as to make the legal principles in the unreported case inapplicable, the response writer should say so in the response
5. reported decisions which clearly cover the point at issue should be included because they take precedence over unreported decisions.

A5347 Where

1. the claimant cites an unreported decision after the response is sent to HMCTS **and**
2. there is insufficient time to prepare a supplementary response

the presenting officer should cover the matter in the oral presentation to the FtT, or request an adjournment.

**NB:** See Annex K (Neutral citation) for details of how reported and unreported decisions are now numbered.

### **Northern Ireland Commissioners' decisions and Court of Appeal judgments**

A5348 Response writers should contact the Office of the Social Security Commissioners, Child Support Commissioners & Pensions Appeal Commissioners (NI) when a Northern Ireland decision is involved and there is no reported decision in GB dealing with the point at issue.

A5349 Commissioners' decisions and judgments of the Court of Appeal in Northern Ireland may be persuasive but are not binding on the decision making authorities in GB<sup>1</sup>. However, where the relevant statutory provisions are identical, the same interpretation should be applied by the judicial authorities throughout the UK<sup>2</sup>. For example, where a view of the law is fully argued before the Court of Appeal in Northern Ireland, and the law is the same in GB, the FtT should follow it<sup>3</sup>.

*1 R(S) 5/85; 2 R(SB) 1/90; 3 R(IB) 4/04*

### **Relevant evidence**

A5350 The response should contain the relevant evidence that was available to the DM when the decision was made unless for other reasons it should be excluded (see A5287 et seq). All the relevant evidence before the DM should be presented to the FtT. See ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence.

A5351 The relevant evidence should be listed in a schedule, with the documents themselves numbered by page for cross-references.

A5352 - A5359

## First-tier Tribunal procedures

A5360 The FtT's procedure is decided by the presiding member of the FtT within a framework laid down in rules<sup>1</sup> and in Practice Statements issued by the Senior President of Tribunals. The presenting officer should be aware of procedures. Decisions of Commissioners and UT Judges on tribunal procedures are summarized in RDD<sup>2</sup>. Failure to observe proper procedures or established rights may leave the FtT's decision open to challenge on grounds of natural justice (see A5020 – A5022).

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules; 2 Reported Decisions Digest*

A5361 - A5364

## Composition of the First-tier Tribunal

A5365 The FtT will consist of between one and three members depending on the type of appeal and as decided by the Senior President of Tribunals<sup>1</sup>. Where the FtT is made up of just one member than that person must be a FtT judge<sup>2</sup>. Where the FtT is made up of two or more members then the Senior President of Tribunals will decide how many are to be FtT judges and how many are to be other members and will select one to be the presiding member who will chair the FtT. The presiding member has the casting vote if votes are otherwise equally divided<sup>3</sup>.

*1 FtT & UT (Composition of Tribunal) Order, arts 2 & 3; 2 art 4; 3 arts 5-8*

## Other members

A5366 A person who is not a judge can qualify to be a member of a Social Security FtT<sup>1</sup> by being

1. a registered medical practitioner<sup>2</sup> or
2. an accountant<sup>3</sup>.

*1 Practise Statement on the Composition of Tribunals, para 7;*

*2 Qualifications for Appointment of Members to the FtT & UT Order, art 2(2)(a); 3 art 2(2)(i)*

A5367 As well as people with specific qualifications as in A5366, certain other people with relevant experience with regard to social security matters can also become members of the FtT. These people are those who are not a registered medical practitioner but who have experience dealing with the physical or mental needs of disabled people because they

1. work with disabled people in a professional or voluntary capacity **or**
2. are themselves disabled<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Qualifications for Appointment of Members to the FtT & UT Order, art 2(3)*

A5368

## **Membership for certain types of appeal**

A5369 Where the appeal relates to

1. LCW
2. LCWRA
3. limited or severely limited ability
4. recovery of benefits

the FtT must consist of a FtT judge and a member who is registered medical practitioner<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on the Composition of Tribunals, para. 5*

A5370 Where an appeal would normally be heard by a FtT judge sitting alone<sup>1</sup> or by a FtT constituted as per A5369, the Chamber President can decide that specific types or extra members must be included where

1. financial matters are an issue in the appeal then the tribunal member is an accountant **or**
2. the appeal involves complex medical issues then an additional member is included who is a registered medical practitioner **or**
3. for the purposes of
  - 3.1 providing further experience for a FtT judge or member **or**
  - 3.2 monitoring decision making standardsan additional FtT judge or member is included<sup>2</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on the Composition of Tribunals, para. 6; 2 para. 7*

A5371 Where an appeal which would normally be heard by the FtT constituted as in A5368 or A5369 but which only raises questions of law, the Chamber President can direct that a FtT Judge may hear the case or a judge and a member who has the relevant experience and qualifications for the issued raised<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on the Composition of Tribunals, para. 8*

## Tribunal member unavailable

A5372 There may be occasions where although a FtT would normally consist of more than one member (see A5369 and A5370), this is not possible. So for example, because of adverse weather conditions one or more members are unable to attend the hearing. Where the hearing is otherwise able to go ahead as all other parties who are intending to be present are at the venue, it would be sensible to be able to continue with the hearing. Primary legislation does allow for an appeal to be heard in the absence of one or more but not all of the members, providing all the parties agree<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, Sch 4, para 15(6)*

A5373 DWP has come to an agreement with HMCTS that in circumstances where

1. a member is, at short notice, unable to attend the venue **and**
2. the DWP has already told HMCTS that a PO will not be attending the hearing, or the DWP PO agrees **and**
3. the appellant and/or any representative agrees

the FtT will hear the appeal in the absence of one or more of the members.

A5374 The FtT must however, always include a tribunal judge. So where a three person tribunal is reduced to two people, one must be a judge<sup>1</sup>, or where reduced to one person, that person must be a judge<sup>2</sup>. Where a judge is not available then the hearing cannot go ahead.

*1 The FtT & UT (Composition of Tribunal) Order 2008, art 6; 2 art 4(1)*

A5375 - A5385

## Hearings and notice given

A5386 Each party to the appeal is entitled to attend the hearing. Reasonable notice of a hearing of at least 14 clear days, giving the time and place of the hearing, must be given to each party to the proceedings. The FtT may give shorter notice with consent of the parties or in urgent or exceptional circumstances<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 29(2)*

A5387 If a party to the appeal fails to attend a hearing, the FtT may decide to hear the appeal in their absence if the FtT

1. is satisfied the party was notified or that reasonable steps were taken to notify the party **and**
2. considers that it is in the interests of justice to proceed<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 31*

A5388 A hearing means an oral hearing<sup>1</sup> and should be held in public unless the FtT decide otherwise<sup>2</sup>. It also includes a hearing conducted in whole or part by video link, telephone or other instantaneous two-way electronic communication.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 1(3); 2 rule 30(1)*

A5389 Where the FtT decide the hearing or part of it is to be held in private, they may also decide who can be permitted to attend the hearing, or part of it<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 30(4)*

A5390 - A5394

## Right to be heard

A5395 The following are entitled to be present and be heard at tribunal hearings<sup>1</sup>

1. the claimant
2. the DM

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 28*

A5396 Any person entitled to be heard at a tribunal may be accompanied or represented by another person<sup>1</sup>. This applies whether or not the representative has professional qualifications. The representative can do anything that the party could do, except sign a witness statement<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 11(1); 2 rule 11(5)*

A5397 - A5404

## Use of experts

A5405 Where the FtT considers it requires special expertise not otherwise available to it, it may seek assistance from a person with the relevant knowledge or experience<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 28(1)*

## Reference for medical examination and report

A5406 Where an appeal is against a decision on a claim for or entitlement to a relevant benefit in A5407 the FtT may refer a claimant to a health professional for examination and report where it is considered necessary to determine the appeal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 2; TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 25(3) & Sch 2*

A5407	Relevant benefit	Prescribed circumstance
	PIP	Whether the claimant has limited or severely limited ability <sup>1</sup>

UC

Whether the claimant has LCW or LCWRA<sup>1</sup>

A5408 Where there is an oral hearing, the tribunal may not carry out a physical examination of the appellant<sup>1</sup>

A5409 - A5411

## Directions

A5412 The FtT may at any time give a direction that relates to the conduct or disposal of proceedings<sup>1</sup>. Such a direction can include amending, suspending or setting aside an earlier decision. The types of direction the FtT can give are as follows

1. extend or shorten the time for complying with any rule practice directives or direction
2. consolidate or hear together two or more sets of proceedings or part of proceedings which raise common issues or treat a case as a lead case
3. permit or require a party to amend a document
4. permit or require a party or another person to provide documents, information, evidence or submissions to the FtT or a party
5. deal with an issue in the proceedings as a preliminary issue
6. hold a hearing to consider any matter
7. decide the form of any hearing
8. adjourn or postpone a hearing
9. require a party to produce a bundle for a hearing
10. stay proceedings (in Scotland sist proceedings)
11. transfer proceedings to another court or tribunal if that court or tribunal has jurisdiction over the matter **and**
  - 11.1 the FtT no longer has jurisdiction due to a change of circumstances since the proceedings started **or**
  - 11.2 the FtT considers the other court or tribunal is a more appropriate place for the determination of the case **or**
12. suspend its own decision until the FtT or UT has decided on

**12.1** an application for permission to appeal against the decision **or**

**12.2** any appeal or review of the decision.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 5*

A5413 - A5416

## The hearing

### Attendance of presenting officer at oral hearing

A5417 Where there is a hearing any person, including the DM, may be represented by another person at the FtT. The DM who made the decision under appeal can attend the hearing and present the case personally. However, the DM is usually represented by the presenting officer. The presenting officer as the DM's representative has all the same rights and powers as the DM who gave the decision.

A5418 Decisions on attendance of the presenting officer at oral hearings are made by the relevant business unit. However, the FtT do have powers to direct a person to attend a hearing and all parties have a duty to co-operate with the FtT<sup>1</sup>. This can include directing that a presenting officer attend. If a FtT Judge issues such a direction then DWP is under a duty to obey that direction. If attendance is not possible, for example the presenting officer may be ill on the day of the hearing and there is nobody else who could attend in their place, then the DM should apply to the FtT as soon as possible to amend, suspend or set aside its direction as appropriate<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 2(4)(b); 2 rule 6(5)*

A5419 Failure to comply with such a direction could result in the FtT taking action it thinks appropriate which could include striking out the party's case<sup>1</sup>. This means that DWP would be barred from taking further part in the proceedings and the FtT would not need to take any account of the DWP appeal response<sup>2</sup>. See A5035 re FtT powers on failure to comply.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 7; 2 rule 8(7)(a) & (8)*

### Function of the First-tier Tribunal

A5420 The FtT's function is inquisitorial not adversarial<sup>1</sup>. It is not a matter of the DM versus the appellant. The FtT should make a full investigation into the matter under appeal and not just rely on evidence presented to them by the parties<sup>2</sup>.

*1 R(SB) 2/83(T); 2 R(SB) 12/85*

A5421 The FtT's jurisdiction on appeal is to make any decision the DM could have made, whether on a claim or an application for revision or supersession. However, a FtT is not required to substitute an outcome decision for that which is under appeal. The

power enabling them to deal only with the issues raised by the appeal<sup>1</sup> does not have the effect that they have to make a decision on every issue if there is a more appropriate way of dealing with those issues.

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(8)(a); R(IS) 2/08*

## Options open to the First-tier Tribunal

A5422 The FtT has the power to

1. dismiss the appeal **or**
2. allow the appeal on the issue **and**
  - 2.1 substitute an outcome decision **or**
  - 2.2 substitute an outcome decision subject to matters of calculation referred to the DM **or**
  - 2.3 refer the case back to the DM to make an outcome decision **or**
3. adjourn to enable further information to be obtained before making a decision as in 1. or 2. above **or**
4. make a consent order at the request of the parties and making appropriate provisions as agreed by the parties<sup>1</sup>.

**Note:** While consent orders under A5422 4. above are an option for the FtT, presenting officers should not agree to any suggestion of a consent order.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 32(1)*

A5423 When deciding which option in A5422 2. or 3. above applies, the FtT will take into account

1. the difficulty of outstanding issues
2. the likelihood of a further appeal
3. whether the Secretary of State is better placed
  - 3.1 to decide the issue
  - 3.2 to get further information
4. the wishes of the parties.

A5424 The FtT should bear in mind that an appeal against a FtT decision cannot be made on a question of fact.

## First-tier Tribunal's power to substitute decisions

A5425 The FtT has the power to substitute a decision for that of the DM, in order to correct defects or change the grounds for revision or supersession where appropriate. It can also substitute a revision for a supersession, and vice versa, within limited circumstances. (See A5422 2.1 and 2.2). This is where a ground is required for

revision, which overlaps with a ground required for supersession, i.e. in cases of ignorance of or mistake as to some material fact, and error of law or official error<sup>1</sup>. See A5510 where a tribunal decision is incomplete.

*1 R(IB) 2/04*

### **Example**

The DM revised a decision awarding UC for ignorance of a material fact, determining that the claimant knew the fact and could reasonably be expected to know that it was relevant to the decision. Entitlement was removed from the date of claim. The FtT finds that the claimant did not and could not reasonably be expected to know the fact. The FtT substitutes a supersession decision for the revised decision.

## **First-tier Tribunal's power to correct decisions**

A5426 Where the FtT upholds the outcome of a decision which is otherwise defective, they only need correct it if

1. it is wrong in some way, e.g. relying on an incorrect ground for supersession  
**or**
2. there is likely to be some practical benefit to the claimant or the decision making process in the future<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(IB) 2/04*

A5427 Exceptionally, the FtT may decide that the decision is so fundamentally flawed that it cannot be corrected. In such cases the decision is invalid, and the appeal should be dismissed on the grounds that no proper decision has been made. The DM should make the decision again ensuring that the flaws are not repeated<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(IS) 13/05*

### **Example**

A single claimant is in receipt of UC. Following an investigation, the DM makes a determination that she is LTAHAW with her partner. No findings are made about whether they are entitled to UC as joint claimants, nor when they began to live together. The award of benefit is ended. On appeal, the FtT decide that they have no jurisdiction to hear the appeal as no valid decision has been made, nor is it clear whether the awarding decision should have been revised or superseded.

## **Responsibility of the appellant**

A5428 The primary responsibility to make a case to the FtT rests with the appellant. However as appellants, in general, are not familiar with the law, the FtT should

consider the appeal without insisting that the appellant points to the precise legal provision under which the claim or application is made.

## **Presenting officer's role at the hearing**

### **Before the hearing**

A5429 In advance of the hearing, the presenting officer should review the case and satisfy themselves that the right decision has been reached on the evidence available. If they do not think the right decision has been made then they should reconsider the original decision, lapse the appeal where appropriate and notify the FtT.

### **At the hearing**

A5430 The role of the presenting officer is to present the Secretary of State's case and support the FtT to make the right decision based on the conditions set out in legislation. The presenting officer should not

1. put questions to any appellant or witness in a hostile manner
2. think in terms of "winning" the case. The objective should be to assist the FtT to assess the facts, relevant law and case law relating to the case. This is done by highlighting the questions to be decided and by clarity in the presentation, evidence, argument and advice to the FtT.

## **Conduct of the presenting officer**

A5431 The presenting officer should not

1. discuss the case with the FtT when a party to the appeal is absent unless directed to do so because the appeal is to proceed in the appellant's absence
2. address the FtT about the case before the arrival of the appellant<sup>1</sup>
3. enter the FtT room before or leave after the appellant<sup>2</sup>
4. discuss the merits of individual cases with appellants and their representatives either before or after the hearing.

Failure to observe these simple rules may result in an application being made to set aside the decision of the FtT on the grounds of a breach of the rules of natural justice.

## Order of proceedings

A5432 The FtT do not have the strict rules and atmosphere of formal legal proceedings. The presiding member decides whether the appellant or the presenting officer is invited to speak first and how the presentation should be made.

## Presenting the appeal

A5433 The presenting officer should not read out the response word for word unless asked to do so, but should

1. state, as fully as possible, the grounds for the appellant's appeal
2. describe the appellant's circumstances at the date of the decision, and try to ensure that all the relevant facts are made known, particularly where the appellant does not attend the hearing
3. explain the legal basis for the decision
4. assist the FtT to focus their attention on the issues raised by the appeal.

## What standard of proof of evidence is required

A5434 The FtT should not require the same high standard of proof as is required in criminal cases<sup>1</sup>. The burden of proof usually rests on the appellant but the standard of proof required is that of a balance of probabilities. The appellant's evidence should be accepted unless it is self-contradictory or inherently improbable<sup>2</sup>.

**Note:** Where the revision or supersession was requested by DWP, the burden of proof is with the DM.

*1 R(I) 32/61; 2 R(I) 2/51*

## What evidence is admissible

A5435 The FtT may consider any evidence, direct or circumstantial, first-hand or second-hand (hearsay), directly or indirectly relevant to the question for determination. But note that

1. a bald assertion of fact, unsupported by personal knowledge is not evidence. This includes an assertion by a presenting officer
2. presenting officers can only give evidence if they have some personal knowledge of the facts which they obtained when acting for the Secretary of State, for example by interviewing the appellant. The presenting officers would then assume the role of a witness<sup>1</sup> and would be open to questioning
3. an assertion of fact by an appellant's representative is not evidence unless backed up by a witness with personal knowledge. Often that witness is the appellant in which case the presenting officer should get confirmation of the assertion. The appellant then becomes a witness and is open to questioning<sup>2</sup>.

## Questioning witnesses

- A5436 A presenting officer should not question any witness in a hostile or disbelieving manner. The presenting officer should be calm, polite and unruffled. Courtesy is proper before the FtT; any other approach is unlikely to be effective in obtaining helpful answers from the witness.
- A5437 The presenting officer should never accuse a witness of giving untruthful evidence but should suggest that
1. the witness is mistaken
  2. the FtT might find it difficult to reconcile the witness's statement with the other known facts or statements.
- A5438 Where
1. the FtT does not give the presenting officer the chance to question the appellant **or**
  2. the presenting officer does not accept the oral evidence
- the presenting officer should ask the FtT for permission to put questions. If the evidence obtained differs substantially, the FtT may pursue the matter themselves. If they do not, the presenting officer may need to question the witness more closely to resolve discrepancies and test the truth of the evidence.
- A5439 If, despite a request to question an appellant or witness, the presenting officer is not allowed to exercise that right, the presenting officer should not pursue it further at the hearing but should ask the FtT to include in the record of proceedings a note of the request and of the refusal.

## Recall of witnesses

- A5440 A witness may be recalled to give further evidence by
1. the presenting officer or any other party
  2. the FtT even after the parties have retired and the FtT has begun its deliberations.

Where the FtT has recalled a witness, all parties should return to the FtT before the further evidence is heard.

## Introduction of new material

### By the presenting officer

A5441 The presenting officer should avoid raising completely new points or introducing new evidence not included in a written response. If the presenting officer is forced to do so at the hearing, they should

1. explain the reason and suggest an adjournment for the appellant to have an opportunity to consider the matter
2. seek an adjournment if the appellant does not attend. This will allow a further written response to be made and give the appellant an opportunity to respond to the fresh points.

### **By the appellant**

A5442 The presenting officer should not object to new evidence or points being introduced by the appellant. However, it should be pointed out that such submissions and further evidence should normally be provided to the FtT within a month after the date on which the DM sent their response<sup>1</sup>. Documents submitted as evidence by an appellant, employer or other witnesses, for the first time at a hearing should be included in the FtT record or copied. The presenting officer should ask the FtT, if the appellant does not attend, to record the contents of the document and if possible have it copied before returning it to the person who produced it.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 24(6) & (7)*

A5443 If the new evidence raises issues of fact or law not reasonably foreseeable at the time the response was prepared, the presenting officer should establish details of the new material and its precise legal effect. The presenting officer should then

1. decide whether a response can be made at the hearing on the basis of the new material or legal position arising **or**
2. seek an adjournment to give the presenting officer the opportunity to deal with the fresh material<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(F) 1/72*

A5444 If the material produced concerns a matter that is outside the jurisdiction of the FtT, for example where the evidence does not relate to the condition of the claimant at the time the decision appealed against was made, the presenting officer should submit that the FtT should disregard it<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 12(8)(b)*

A5445

### **Unreported decision produced at the hearing**

A5446 If an unreported decision is produced without warning at the hearing, the presenting officer and the FtT should read and consider it. See A5346 - A5347 for guidance on

the use of unreported decisions. If the appellant or the FtT member merely quoted an unreported decision not available to the FtT, an adjournment should be sought so that a copy can be obtained and made available to all parties.

## **Summing up**

A5447 In the summing up the presenting officer should

1. remind the FtT of the questions for determination
2. readily suggest a change in the ground of the original decision if further evidence or argument has been put forward justifying that approach
3. submit the appellant's appeal should succeed if the new evidence or argument justifies this.

## **Adjournments - presenting officer at the hearing**

A5448 The FtT decides whether to adjourn a hearing. The presenting officer, or the appellant, can request an adjournment.

A5449 Since a presenting officer is expected to prepare in advance the ground for an effective hearing, the FtT is usually slow to grant an adjournment. There are a number of facts it normally takes into account

1. there has to be a new relevant issue arising in the course of the hearing (or exceptionally just before it) which could not reasonably have been foreseen and needs further enquiries or consideration
2. whether the adjournment would cause any of the other parties to the proceedings hardship or prejudice their case.

A5450 A presenting officer might ask initially for a very short adjournment, for example to read an unreported UT's decision produced by the appellant for the first time at the hearing. This may lead to a request for further adjournment to another date. If the presenting officer's request for an adjournment is refused the FtT should be asked to note the request on the record of proceedings.

## **Action following adjournment**

A5451 Following an adjournment, the FtT judge/presiding member must direct on the record of the adjournment notice the enquiries to be made. The notice should clearly set out all the FtT's requests and directions including who should obtain the relevant information.

A5452 - A5459

## **Resumed hearings**

A5460 A resumed hearing before a single FtT judge can usually be heard by the same person. When a two or three member FtT has adjourned, it is rarely possible to arrange for the appeal to continue before the same members. If at the subsequent hearing the FtT is differently constituted, the proceedings are a complete rehearing of the case.

A5461 The following general points apply to resumed hearings

1. all evidence should usually be heard again and recorded by the FtT judge/presiding member
2. oral evidence need not be given again at the rehearing. Although the matter is considered again the FtT can accept the recorded evidence of a witness from the original hearing, provided the rules of natural justice are not infringed<sup>1</sup>
3. the FtT judge/presiding member may ask questions based on the notes of evidence given at the previous hearing, but it is not sufficient to simply read over the record of the decision and ask the appellant to confirm that it is correct<sup>2</sup>
4. all members of the new FtT should have the opportunity to ask questions about the evidence presented.

*1 R(U) 3/88; 2 R(S) 1/87*

A5462 A further response should be made to the FtT if

1. the presenting officer or DM wishes to comment on further evidence received
2. there are other aspects that the presenting officer or DM wishes the FtT to consider.

A5463 - A5469

## **Appeal outstanding at appellant's death**

A5470 On the death of a person who has made a claim for benefit, the Secretary of State may appoint someone to act in the place of the appellant in relation to any appeal relating to the claim<sup>1</sup>.

*1 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (C&P) Regs, reg 56(1)*

A5471 If the Secretary of State does not appoint a person to proceed with the appeal and any executors or personal representatives do not wish to proceed, the FtT judge/presiding member should decide how the appeal should be dealt with. The presenting officer should suggest the following

1. where there are executors to the deceased's estate, the appeal should be determined even though the executors have refused to proceed with it<sup>1</sup>
2. where there are no executors the appeal should be abated<sup>2</sup>. The appeal is then suspended but can be revived<sup>3</sup>.

A5472 The FtT also has power make a direction to substitute a party where circumstances have changed since the start of the proceedings<sup>1</sup>.

1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 9

A5473 - A5479

## Report of any exceptional incidents

A5480 When the hearing is completed, the presenting officer should make a note of any exceptional incidents, for example where the FtT does not allow the presenting officer to question a witness. The presenting officer should draw the attention of the DM who prepared the response to any difficulties met at the hearing. This may help the DM to decide whether an appeal to the UT is appropriate when the FtT decision is received.

A5481 - A5499

## The First-tier Tribunal's decision

### Decision notice

A5500 The FtT may give a verbal decision at the hearing. Whether they do this or not, they must also provide all parties with a written decision notice which should include notification of

1. the right to apply for a written statement of reasons **and**
2. any appeal rights and time limits<sup>1</sup>.

1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 33

A5501 The FtT's decision notice should explicitly record what it has decided and make it clear whether

1. an outcome decision has been made (including those subject to calculation by the DM) **or**
2. the final decision on entitlement has been remitted to the DM<sup>1</sup>.

1 R(IS) 6/07

A5502 The decision notice may be sent by electronic mail. When calculating time limits for

1. requesting a statement of reasons
2. requesting the record of proceedings

a decision notice is sent when it is properly addressed and sent by electronic mail<sup>1</sup>.

1 TP (FtT) (SEC), Rules, rule 13

### Statement of reasons

A5503 The FtT may give reasons for a decision which disposes of the proceedings

1. verbally at the hearing **or**
2. in a written statement of reasons<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC), Rules, rule 34(2)*

### **Late application for statement of reasons**

A5504 Within a month of the written decision notice being issued, any party to the appeal can make a written application for a written statement of reasons if one has not already been provided as in A5500. This can be requested even if the reasons were given verbally at the hearing. The FtT must then issue the written statement of reasons within a month of receipt of the application or as soon after as is reasonably practicable<sup>1</sup>. There is no specific provision for a late application for a written statement of reasons, however the FtT does have a wide ranging power to extend the time for complying with any provisions in the rules<sup>2</sup>.

**Note:** The DM should not request a statement unless the case is being considered as a potential appeal to the UT.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 34(3)-(5); 2 rule 5(3)*

A5505 - A5507

### **Record of proceedings**

A5508 The FtT judge or presiding member is required to make a record of the hearing sufficient to indicate the evidence taken. It can be in whatever form the FtT member may direct<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on Record of Proceedings, para 2 & 3*

A5509 The FtT must keep a copy of

1. the record of proceedings
2. the decision notice
3. any written reasons for the FtT's decision

for a period as in A5510<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on Record of Proceedings para. 4*

A5510 The period is<sup>1</sup>

1. six months from the date of
  - 1.1 the FtT's decision
  - 1.2 any written reasons for the FtT's decision
  - 1.3 any correction of the decision notice<sup>2</sup>
  - 1.4 a refusal to set aside the decision for procedural reasons<sup>3</sup>

- 1.5** a determination of an application for permission to appeal to the UT **or**
- 2.** until the date when the documents in A5509 are sent to the UT in connection with an appeal or an application for permission to appeal if that is within the six months in **1.**.

*1 Practice Statement on Record of Proceedings, para. 5; 2 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 36; 3 rule 37*

A5511 Any party to the proceedings may apply in writing for a copy of the record of proceedings within the time limit in A5510, and a copy must be sent to the party<sup>1</sup>.

*1 Practice Statement on Record of Proceedings, para. 6*

A5512 - A5514

## Consideration of the First-tier Tribunal decision

### Decision incomplete

A5515 Where the FtT decision is incomplete the DM should refer the case back to the FtT immediately for a decision to be made. The DM should explain that all matters raised by the appeal have not been decided<sup>1</sup>. However the DM should be aware that FtT does have the power to just decide on certain issues (see A5422 **1.**, **2.1** and **2.2**).

*1 R(S) 9/81*

### Case remitted to DM

A5516 If the case is remitted to the DM, a new outcome decision should be made incorporating the FtT's decision. The FtT's decision is binding on the DM, subject to supersession or appeal. (See ADM Chapter A1: Principles of decision making and evidence for guidance on finality of decisions and ADM Chapter A4: Supersession.)

A5517 The DM's new decision will itself have a right of appeal. However, the claimant cannot use this appeal to re-open the issue decided by the FtT, unless there are grounds to supersede.

### Example

A claim for UC is disallowed on the grounds that the claimant has capital in excess of £16,000. On appeal, the FtT decides that the capital is £9,500, and remits the claim to the DM. The DM makes a further decision on the claim taking into account the amount of capital as decided by the FtT, which results in a further disallowance as income exceeds the maximum amount payable. On a further appeal, the

claimant cannot raise the issue of the amount of capital as decided by the FtT, unless they can show that the FtT was ignorant of material facts.

## **Liberty to apply**

A5518 Where the FtT allows the appeal, but remits calculation to the DM, any dispute about further calculation by the DM should be referred back to the same FtT. This is known as “liberty to apply”<sup>1</sup>. There is no further right of appeal against the DM's calculation, but the FtT's decision about the calculation can be appealed to the UT.

*1 R(IS) 2/08*

A5519

## **Where a party thinks the decision is wrong**

A5520 There are a number of options available to the appellant and DM if they think the FtT's decision is wrong. The decision notice issued by the FtT includes information to the appellant to encourage him to choose the correct option. The different options open to appellants and the DM are set out below.

## **Accidental error**

A5521 The FtT may, at any time, correct accidental errors or omissions in a decision, direction or any document produced by it. If corrected, all parties must be sent a copy of the corrected decision notice, direction or document<sup>1</sup>. The time limit for then applying for a written statement of reasons would only be extended if an entirely new decision notice is issued. If the original decision notice is just corrected then the time limit runs from the date the original decision notice was issued.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 36*

A5522 - A5529

## **Setting aside First-tier Tribunal decisions on procedural grounds**

A5530 Any party to the appeal can apply for the FtT decision to be set aside where

1. a document relating to the appeal was not
  - 1.1 sent to or received at an appropriate time by
    - 1.1.a a party to the proceedings **or**
    - 1.1.b the party's representative **or**
  - 1.2 sent to the FtT at an appropriate time **or**
2. a party to the proceedings or a party's representative was not present during the hearing **or**

3. there has been some other procedural irregularity in the proceedings<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 37*

A5531 The FtT may set aside a decision, or part of a decision and re-make the decision, or relevant part of it if

1. the FtT considers that it is in the interests of justice to do so **and**
2. one or more of the conditions in A5530 1. to 3. applies<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 37(1)*

A5532 Where an application for set aside is made it must be in the form of a written application received by the FtT no later than a month after the date on which the FtT sent notice of the decision to the party<sup>1</sup>. The FtT has the power to extend this time limit as appropriate<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 37(3); 2 rule 5*

A5533 - A5549

## **Decisions that cannot be implemented**

A5550 There may be instances where it is impossible to implement the decision of the FtT. In these cases, the DM should consider whether the decision can be corrected or set aside by the FtT.

A5551 If

1. the decision cannot be corrected or set aside **or**
2. there has been no factual mistake which gives grounds for supersession

the only course open to the DM is an appeal, with permission, to the UT. See A5560 - A5564 for guidance on potential appeals and time limits.

A5552 In some cases the FtT refer cases back to the DM, for example to recalculate a recoverable overpayment. If there is then a dispute between the DM and the appellant, the DM should put the case before the FtT again so that they can finally determine the appeal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(SB) 11/86*

A5553 - A5556

## **Potential appeals to the Upper Tribunal**

A5557 An appeal to the UT can be made only on a point of law<sup>1</sup>, with the permission of the FtT, or the UT. The time limits for applying for leave to appeal are

1. to the FtT - within one month of the latest of the dates that the FtT sends the applicant
  - 1.1 the relevant decision notice
  - 1.2 written statement of reasons, if the decision disposes of

- 1.2.a all issues in the proceedings **or**
  - 1.2.b a preliminary issue that was the result of a direction **or**
  - 1.3 notification of amended reasons for or correction of the decision following a review **or**
  - 1.4 notification that an application for the decision to be set aside is unsuccessful<sup>2</sup> **or**
2. to the UT - within one month of the date that the FtT's decision refusing permission or rejecting the application was sent to the applicant<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 11(1); 2 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 38(3); 3 TP (UT) Rules, rule 21(3)*

## Late applications

A5558 If the application made to the FtT as in A5557 1. is sent after the one month limit or after any extension of that limit<sup>1</sup> then the application must include a request to extend the time limit and why the application was not provided in time<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 5(3)(a); 2 rule 38(5)(a)*

A5559 Where the FtT does not extend the time limit as in DMG 06561 then they must not allow the application<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 38(5)(b)*

A5560 Where the DM thinks that the FtT's decision is wrong on a point of law, the case should be identified as a potential appeal to the UT and sent to DMA Leeds as soon as possible. Before sending the case, the DM should obtain the statement of reasons from HMCTS. The request must be made in writing on the appropriate form within one month of the decision notice being given or sent. See A5501 - A5504 for further guidance.

**Note:** Where suspension is appropriate, see A5570 et seq.

A5561 Applications for permission to appeal on behalf of the DM are made by DMA Leeds. DMs, appeals officers and presenting officers should note that only officers of the Department employed at DMA Leeds are authorized to make applications on behalf of the Secretary of State. For further guidance see A5600 et seq.

A5562 An application for leave to appeal against the FtT decision that would be supported by the DM before the UT cannot be made, even though the DM may wish to obtain authority in an area of the law that is open to dispute<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(I) 68/53(T)*

A5563 Where the FtT decision is not in the appellant's favour, but the DM believes that the decision is in error of law, the DM should consider sending the case to DMA Leeds, who will then decide whether to make an application for permission to appeal in order that

1. the appellant's interests are protected **or**
2. the law on a particular point is established.

**Note:** This only applies where the error of law is significant. DMs should ensure that the claimant does not intend to make an application for permission to appeal.

## **First-tier Tribunal consideration of application for permission to appeal**

A5564 The first thing that the FtT should do on receiving an application for permission to appeal is to consider whether to review the decision<sup>1</sup>. If the FtT decides not to review or reviews but decides to take no action on all or part of the decision, the FtT must still decide whether to give permission to appeal for all or part of the decision<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 39(1) & 40; 2 rule 39(2)*

A5565 The FtT must send a record of its decision on the application to all parties as soon as possible. If the FtT refused permission to appeal then with the record of decision it must also send

1. a statement of reasons for refusal
2. notification of the right to make an application to the UT and the relevant time limits for doing that<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 39(4)*

A5566 Where the FtT has given permission to appeal on limited grounds it must still provide the information as in A5565 for those aspects for which permission was refused<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 39(5)*

A5567 - A5569

## **Suspension of payment of benefit**

A5570 The DM can suspend payment of benefit awarded by the FtT whilst an appeal to the UT is considered<sup>1</sup>. The suspension can be imposed whilst awaiting for or on receipt of, the FtT's decision notice. The DM must, as soon as reasonably practicable, inform the appellant in writing that they intend to request a statement of reasons<sup>2</sup>. If the DM does not apply for the statement of reasons within one month of the date the FtT sent the decision then the suspension must be lifted<sup>3</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 21; UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, regs 44(2)(b); 2 reg 44(5); 3 reg 46(c)*

A5571 The suspension is maintained if, within one month of the FtT sending the statement of reasons, the DM informs the appellant that an application for permission to appeal to the UT has been made<sup>1</sup>. The written notice must be

1. issued after the application for permission has been sent to the chairman of the FtT **and**
2. posted to the appellant within the time limit.

*1 TP (FtT) (SEC) Rules, rule 38(3)*

A5572 Where such an application is made, the suspension may continue until the application and any consequent appeal are decided<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 21; UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 44(2)(b)*

A5573 For further guidance, see ADM Chapter A4: Suspension.

A5574 - A5584

## **Appeals remitted by the Upper Tribunal**

A5585 Where the UT decide that the FtT's decision is erroneous in point of law<sup>1</sup>, the UT may (but not must) set it aside<sup>2</sup> and if it does must either

1. remit the case to another FtT with different members to the first with directions for its reconsideration<sup>3</sup> **or**
2. re-make the decision by making any decision which the FtT could make if it were re-making the decision and make any appropriate findings of fact<sup>4</sup>.

**Note:** The UT need not set aside a decision, even where there is an error of law, if the error makes no difference to the outcome

*1 TCE Act 07, s 12(1); 2 s 12(2)(a); 3 s 12(2)(b)(i) & (3); 4 s 12(2)(b)(ii) & 4*

A5586 When the UT sets aside the FtT's decision, but does not replace it, the effect is to remove the FtT decision. The only decision remaining is the disputed decision by the DM.

A5587 The UT's decision and a copy of all the documents available to the UT is sent to the DM via DMA Leeds. The decision may contain directions from the UT to the new FtT to help them decide the appeal.

A5588 A new response is only required if the Agency is directed to produce one by a FtT or the UT, or on the advice of DMA Leeds.

A5589 Whether or not a new response has been requested, the DM should inform the FtT of any events such as a decision on a claim or supersession made since the decision went under appeal.

A5590 The proceedings should be by way of a complete rehearing and all the evidence should be taken again (see A5460 - A5462)<sup>1</sup>.

A5591 Where the DM receives an application to reconsider the disputed decision before the rehearing, the application should be considered as in A5452.

## **Supersession of the First-tier Tribunal decision**

A5592 The DM can supersede the decision of the FtT in the same way as a decision of another DM, with one important exception<sup>1</sup>. This is where the DM considers the FtT's decision was erroneous in law. In such cases, the DM should consider whether an application for leave to appeal to the UT is appropriate (see A5600 et seq). For further guidance see ADM Chapter A4: Supersession.

*1 SS Act 98, s 10(1)(b)*

A5593 - A5599

## **Appeals to the Upper Tribunal and the Courts**

A5600 DMs should note that all action on these appeals is taken or directed by DMA Leeds. No other officer of the Department is authorised to represent the Secretary of State by making or commenting on applications for leave at any stage.

**Note:** See Appendix 2 re process for seeking permission to appeal to the UT.

A5601 An application for permission to appeal to the UT can only be made on the ground that the decision of the FtT is erroneous in point of law<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 11(1)*

A5602 The FtT considers whether to review the decision (see DMG 06564 et seq). If the FtT does not review the decision, the FtT decides whether or not to give permission to appeal.

A5603 Where

1. the claimant **and**
2. DMA Leeds on behalf of the Secretary of State

apply for permission to appeal, or otherwise expresses the view that the decision was erroneous in point of law, the FtT shall set aside the decision for rehearing without considering whether it is erroneous in law<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 13(3)*

A5604 The FtT sends a copy of the decision to each party to the appeal.

A5605 - A5619

## **Who can appeal to the Upper Tribunal**

A5620 An appeal may be made with leave from the decision of the FtT by

1. a DM<sup>1</sup> (but see A5564)
2. a claimant claiming relevant SS benefits<sup>2</sup>
3. any trade union or association that has the right of appeal<sup>3</sup> (see A5621)
4. the person from whom an amount is recoverable where a recoverable overpayment is involved<sup>4</sup>
5. a person whose right to II benefit is, or may be, affected by the decision appealed against<sup>5</sup>
6. those listed in A5050<sup>6</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 14(3)(a); 2 s 14(3)(b); 3 s 14(3)(c); 4 s 14(3)(d); 5 s 14(4);  
6 UC, PIP, JSA & ESA (D&A) Regs, reg 49*

A5621 A trade union or association has the right of appeal where

1. the claimant is a member at the time of the appeal and was a member immediately before the question arose<sup>1</sup>
2. the question relates to a deceased person who was a member of the union at the time of death<sup>2</sup>
3. in II cases the claimant, or for IDB, the deceased, was a member of the union at the time of the relevant accident<sup>3</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 14(5)(a); 2 s 14(5)(b); 3 s 14(5)(c)*

A5622 Any association which exists to promote the interests and welfare of its members has the same right of appeal as a trade union<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 14(6)*

A5623 - A5639

## **Application for permission to appeal to the Upper Tribunal**

### **Application to the Upper Tribunal**

A5640 If the FtT refuse permission to appeal or do not admit it, an application can be made direct to the UT (see A5565). Such an application should be in writing and should be received by the UT no later than a month after the date the FtT sent to the appellant its refusal of permission to appeal or refusal to admit the application for permission to appeal<sup>1</sup>. Where the UT receive an application for a decision to be corrected, set aside or reviewed, or for permission to appeal against a decision, they may treat it as an application for any one of those things<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 21(3); 2 rule 48*

A5641 The application must include<sup>1</sup>

1. the name and address of the appellant

2. the name and address of any representative of the appellant
3. an address where the documents for the appellant should be sent
4. details of the decision being challenged
5. grounds on which the appellant is relying
6. whether the appellant wants a hearing.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 21(4)*

A5642 The appellant must also provide with the application<sup>1</sup> a copy of

1. any written record of the decision being challenged
2. any separate written statement of reasons for the decision **and**
3. if the application is for permission to appeal against the decision of another FtT
  - 3.1 the notice of refusal of permission to appeal **or**
  - 3.2 the notice of refusal to admit the application for permission to appeal.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 21(5)*

## Late applications

A5643 If the application to the UT is made later than the time in A5640 or any extension of time allowed by the UT<sup>1</sup> then the application must include a request for extension of time and reasons why it was not on time<sup>2</sup>. The UT can only admit the application if they have extended the time limit<sup>3</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 5(3)(a); 2 rule 21(6)(a); 3 rule 21(6)(b)*

A5644 If the application to the UT is for permission to appeal against the decision of another FtT which was refused due to not being made on time, then the application to the UT must include reasons why the application was late. The UT may then only admit the application if it considers it to be in the interests of justice<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 21(7)*

## Decision on permission to appeal

A5645 If the UT refuses permission it must send a written notice of the reason for refusal to the appellant<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 22(1)*

A5646 If the UT gives permission

1. it must send written notice of permission to all parties
2. a copy of the application should be sent to all parties (this becomes the notice of appeal)
3. it may determine the appeal without any further response if the appellant and each respondent consent<sup>1</sup>.

## **Notice of appeal**

A5647 The appellant must still provide a notice of appeal to the UT within a month of the notice of permission from the FtT being sent to the appellant where

1. another FtT gave permission for a party to appeal to the UT **or**
2. the UT give permission and in doing so directed that the application was not to stand as a notice of appeal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 23(1) & (2)*

A5648 The notice of appeal should contain the information as per A5641 **1. to 5.** and where the UT has given permission to appeal, the UT case reference should also be provided<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 23(3)*

A5649 If another FtT granted permission to appeal, the appellant must provide with the notice of appeal a copy of:

1. any written record of the decision being challenged
2. any separate written statement of reasons for that decision
3. the notice of permission to appeal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 23(4)*

A5650 If the notice of appeal is provided to the UT later than the time limit in A5647 or any extension granted by the UT<sup>1</sup> the notice should include a request for an extension and the reason why the notice was not provided on time. The UT may only admit the notice of appeal if it has extended the time<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 5(3)(a); 2 rule 23(5)*

A5651 The UT must send a copy of the notice and any other documents to each respondent<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 23(6)*

A5552 - A5559

## **Composition of Upper Tribunal**

A5660 The UT must consist of at least one UT Judge, however, the Senior President of Tribunals can decide that an UT can consist of up to three members<sup>1</sup>. Where there are two or three members of the UT then the Senior President of Tribunals must select one of the Judges to be the presiding member and chair the UT. The presiding member has the casting vote if votes are equally divided<sup>2</sup>.

*1 FtT & UT (Composition of Tribunal) Order, art 3; 2 arts 7 & 8*

## **Withdrawal of applications and appeals**

A5661 A party may withdraw its case or any part of it by sending the UT a written notice of withdrawal or orally at a hearing<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 17(1)*

A5662 An appeal to the UT can only be withdrawn with the approval of the UT. Withdrawal of an application for permission to appeal does not require such approval<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 17(2)*

## **Reinstatement of withdrawn applications and appeals**

A5663 A party that has withdrawn its case can apply to the UT for it to be reinstated<sup>1</sup>. This must be received by the UT within one month after the date

1. the UT received the withdrawal request **or**
2. the date of the hearing if the withdrawal was made orally.

(See A5683 for applications outside the time limit.)

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 17(4)*

## **Consideration of decision under appeal**

A5664 If the DM considers the FtT's decision should be superseded<sup>1</sup>, DMA Leeds should be contacted urgently.

*1 SS Act 98, s 10(1)(b)*

A5665 - A5669

## **Death of appellant**

A5670 The death of an appellant does not automatically stop an appeal to the UT. A personal representative or an appointee can pursue an appeal. A personal representative is

1. an executor, where there is a will
2. an administrator, appointed by the Court.

If there is no personal representative or the Secretary of State is unable to appoint a person to proceed with the appeal, the UT decides whether the appeal should be decided or abated. An appeal which is abated may be revived if the Secretary of State subsequently appoints someone to act, otherwise the matter is regarded as closed<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R(I) 2/83; R(SB) 25/84*

A5671 - A5679

## **Striking out of proceedings**

A5680 Proceedings

1. will automatically be struck out if the appellant has failed to comply with a direction of a UT which said that failure to comply would result in proceedings being struck out<sup>1</sup>
2. must be struck out<sup>2</sup> if the UT
  - 2.1 does not have jurisdiction **and**
  - 2.2 does not transfer the proceedings to another court or tribunal
3. may be struck out<sup>3</sup> if
  - 3.1 the appellant failed to comply with a directive of a UT which said failure to comply with lead to the proceedings being struck out **or**
  - 3.2 the appellant has failed to co-operate with the UT so that the UT cannot deal with the proceedings fairly or justly **or**
  - 3.3 the proceedings are not an appeal from another FtT or judicial review proceedings and the UT considers there is no reasonable prospect of the appellant's case succeeding.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 8(1); 2 rule 8(2); 3 rule 8(3)*

A5681 The appellant must be given an opportunity to make representations before the UT can strike out the proceedings<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 8(4)*

A5682 Once struck out, the appellant may apply for the proceedings to be reinstated<sup>1</sup>. Such an application must be in writing and received by the UT within one month after the date that the UT sent notification of the striking out to the appellant<sup>1</sup>. (See A5683).

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 8(5) & (6)*

## Power to extend time limits

A5683 The UT has general powers to extend time limits for complying with the rules<sup>1</sup> so a person outside the normal time limits would need to apply for an extension of time.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 5(3)(a)*

A5684

## The Upper Tribunal's decision

A5685 UT Judges may form their own views on the issues arising from appeals and are not restricted to what is said by the appellant, representatives of the appellant, or the DM where they are not the appellant<sup>1</sup>.

*1 R v Deputy II Commissioner ex parte Moore [1965] IQB 456; R(I) 4/65 Appendix*

A5686 The UT who holds that the decision of the FtT was wrong in law may, but does not have to, set aside the FtT's decision. If it does then the UT must either

1. remit the case to the FtT, giving directives for its reconsideration **or**
2. re-make the decision<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 12(2)*

A5687 If the UT remit the case to the FtT then it may

1. direct that the FtT which reconsiders the case is not made up of the same members as those on the FtT whose decision has been set aside
2. give procedural directives to the FtT who reconsider the case<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 12(3)*

A5688 If the UT decide to re-make the decision then it may make

1. any decision which the FtT could make **and**
2. findings of fact that it considers appropriate<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 12(4)*

## **Parties to an appeal**

A5689 The principal parties to an appeal are

1. the DM
2. the claimant in cases involving social security benefits, labour market questions and contributions questions
3. the person from whom an amount is recoverable where a recoverable overpayment is involved
4. a person whose right to II benefit is affected by the decision appealed against<sup>1</sup>.

*1 SS Act 98, s 13(4)*

## **Correction and setting aside**

A5690 A UT Judge may correct or set aside his own decision at any time. A decision may be corrected if it contains an accidental error<sup>1</sup> and may be set aside if the UT considers that it is in the interest of justice to do so and that one or more of the following conditions are satisfied

1. a document relating to the proceedings was not sent to or received at the appropriate time by a party or a party's representative **or**
2. a document relating to the proceedings was not sent to the UT at an appropriate time **or**
3. a party or representative was not present at an oral hearing **or**
4. there has been a procedural irregularity.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 43(1) & (2)*

A5691 Any application to set aside a decision given by the UT must be

1. in writing **and**
2. received no later than one month after the date on which the UT gave notice of the decision<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 43(3)*

A5692 - A5699

## Appeals to Court of Appeal or Court of Session

A5700 An appeal against a decision of the UT on a question of law should be made to the Court of Appeal or, in Scotland, the Court of Session<sup>1</sup>. All action on appeals to the Courts will be taken by DMA Leeds.

*1 SS Act 98, s 15*

### Who may apply for leave

A5701 An application for leave to appeal from a decision of the UT may be made by

1. any person who was entitled to appeal against the FtT's decision
2. any other person who was a party to the FtT proceedings.

*1 SS Act 98, s 15(3)*

### Leave to appeal

A5702 Appeals to the Court of Appeal or Court of Session can be made only

1. with the permission of the UT<sup>1</sup> **or**
2. with permission of the appropriate court<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 13(4)(a); 2 s 13(4)(b)*

A5703 It is for the UT to specify the appropriate court to which appeal should be made<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TCE Act 07, s 13(11)*

A5704 If the UT refuses leave to appeal the application can be renewed before the Court of Appeal or the Court of Session<sup>1</sup>. There is no right of appeal against a refusal of a UT to accept an application made out of time, and it cannot be renewed before the Court<sup>2</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 45(4)(b); 2 R(SB) 12/83; R(S) 8/85*

A5705

### Time limits

A5706 The applicant has three months from the date of notification of the written UT's decision to apply for leave to appeal<sup>1</sup>.

*1 TP (UT) Rules, rule 44(3)*

## Suspension of benefit

A5707 As with FtT decisions, the DM can suspend payment of benefit resulting from a UT decision. For further guidance, see Chapter 04.

A5708 - A5899

## Judicial review

A5900 The decision making authorities are subject to judicial review, that is the controlling jurisdiction of the High Court (Court of Session in Scotland), because the High Court has legal authority to decide questions affecting peoples' rights<sup>1</sup>.

*1 [1924] 1KB, 171, 205*

A5901 The result of judicial review differs from that of an appeal. An appeal

1. examines the decision under appeal, and decides whether it is one which could be made on the basis of the facts found and the relevant law **and**
2. if the decision is found to be erroneous, either refers it back to be made again, or substitutes a fresh decision.

A5902 A judicial review considers a case to find out if there is a fault in the decision making process. If a fault is found the Court usually

1. quashes the decision, **and**
2. makes an order for the decision making authority to consider the question again.

In exceptional cases, the Court may make its own decision.

## Judicial review of an Upper Tribunal decision

A5903 The Court exercises its jurisdiction to quash an UT decision by way of judicial review only if there are compelling reasons in the interest of justice<sup>1</sup>. In approaching such cases the Court takes account of

1. the existence of the right of appeal on a question of law to the Court of Appeal
2. the fact that Parliament has set limits to this right.

*1 RA 5/83, Appendix; R(SB) 12/83, Appendix; [1892] 1QB609*

## Action on receipt of a claim for judicial review

A5904 All action on claims for judicial review is taken by the DWP Legal Advisors, Government Legal Department, Caxton House, 3-12 Tothill Street, London SW1H 9NA. Where a claim for judicial review, including a proposal to bring a claim for

judicial review, is received, it should be forwarded to the above address immediately.

A5905 - A5999

## Appendix 1

### **Examples of the types of case suitable to request strike out of appeal on the basis of no reasonable prospect of success - A5233**

This list is not exhaustive but is a selection of situations that have been identified as the type of case that may be suitable for the DM to request strike out. It covers as many benefits as possible but where a benefit is not listed, this would not necessarily mean that DM requested strike out was not possible. It would be up to the DM to decide whether any other type of case was suitable using the principles set out in this memo.

### **Employment and Support Allowance (Cont)**

#### **Work Capability Assessment**

Evidence indicates a physical medical condition where the claimant cannot score 15 points under the physical descriptors. Suitable referrals would mainly focus on those claimants that have been deemed by the DM only to satisfy one or two physical descriptors due to their physical medical condition. The available evidence should support the view that the claimant cannot score 15 points. No case where the claimant has indicated that there are mental health issues should be put forward for consideration.

#### **Contribution condition**

Contribution conditions are laid out in law and must be met for a payment to be made. This would only be suitable where HMRC have made a decision confirming that the NI record is correct.

#### **Age limitation**

Decision not to pay ESA cases where the appellant has attained State Pension age and therefore the benefit cannot be paid beyond that date.

## **Jobseekers Allowance (Cont)**

### **Good cause**

Decision not to consider good cause where the claimant appeals against the specified time limit (5 days) in which they must provide an explanation for failure to attend a mandatory interview (usually fortnightly job review) and they are not disputing that they did not respond within 5 days but the only reason they provide is that they forgot their appointment.

### **Universal credit**

Decision to disallow entitlement on basis of capital exceeding £16,000. Claimant appeals although they do not dispute they have the capital but disagrees with the capital limit being set at £16,000.

### **Personal independence payment**

Appeal against disallowance of PIP for a person under the age of 16. PIP is for working age people only, 16 to 64.

Any appeal to PIP from a person over pension age, where benefit has not been claimed before.

## Appendix 2

### **Aide memoire for DMs seeking a Secretary of State's application for permission to appeal to the Upper Tribunal (ADM A5600)**

#### **Introduction**

- 1 All applications for permission to appeal to the UT on behalf of the S of S are made only by DMA Leeds. If it is considered that an appeal might be appropriate, take the following action to notify DMA Leeds immediately.
- 2 It is very important that anyone considering requesting that DMA Leeds apply for permission to appeal to the UT, does so within the timescales described below. Many potential Secretary of State appeals have to be returned because they are late. Administrative delays are **almost never accepted** by the FtT or the UT as a reason for a late application. Cases must be sent to DMA Leeds **within one month of the date the FtT send the written statement of reasons (WSoR)**. As DMA Leeds have to work within the same timescales sufficient time must be allowed for DMA Leeds to work through the necessary processes **within the same one month deadline**.
- 3 In most instances, the FtT's decision should not be implemented if the case is referred to DMA Leeds. As soon as an application for permission to appeal to the UT is being considered
  1. suspend benefit **and**
  2. send the claimant a DL/Susterm 6 (found in the Suspension and Termination Guide on the DMA Leeds part of the intranet). This tells the claimant that the FtT's decision is not being implemented as an application for permission to appeal the FtT's decision to the UT is being considered).

#### **Action to take**

- 4 Once a case is identified as one where permission to appeal the FtT's decision may be appropriate, the following action should be taken
  1. request a written statement of reasons (WSoR) from the FtT within one calendar month of the date that the decision notice was issued to all parties.
  2. when the WSoR is received, consider if an application to the UT is still appropriate. It must be remembered that an appeal can only be made where we consider that the FtT's decision is erroneous in law, e.g. consider whether

- 2.1 the provisions of the act or regulations/rules have been misinterpreted or misapplied
- 2.2 the decision is not supported by evidence
- 2.3 the decision is such that no person acting judicially and properly instructed about the relevant law could have reached it
- 2.4 there has been a breach of natural justice
- 2.5 there are other errors of law, e.g.
  - 2.5.a taking irrelevant evidence into account **or**
  - 2.5.b giving reasons for decisions which imply faulty reasoning **or**
  - 2.5.c ignoring relevant evidence

**Note:** This list is not exhaustive.

- 5 If an application is considered appropriate
  - 1. refer the case to **DMA Leeds**, having first checked payments systems (such as JSAPS) and confirm that full payment has **not** been made for the period which the appeal covers
  - 2. all documents referred **must be clearly marked with office/business unit address and contain**
    - 2.1 an AT64 proforma stating clearly the grounds for appeal and where appropriate an estimate of the amount of benefit involved
    - 2.2 the DM's written response to the FtT and numbered enclosures **and**
    - 2.3 any other written response made, received from, or handed in, by any party to the appeal on the day of the FtT hearing **and**
    - 2.4 the FtT's decision **and**
    - 2.5 the WSoR for the decision **and**
    - 2.6 papers relating to any action taken after the FtT's decision has been made; for example, if an application is made to set aside the FtT's decision
    - 2.7 set a three monthly reminder to await the outcome **and**
    - 2.8 set further three monthly reminders if the case is still outstanding when the BF matures.
- 6 When DMA Leeds has decided whether or not to seek an application to appeal, they will inform the DM by e mail. The DM must then send DL/SUSTERM 7 to the claimant to inform them of what further action will be taken.

**The content of the examples in this document (including use of imagery) is for illustrative purposes only**

