Department of Energy & Climate Change

Minutes of the Aviation Management Board Meeting

RenewableUK, Greencoat House, London, SW1P 1DH

Date: Thursday, 5th November 2015

<u>Present</u>

| AM AW BS | Anne Mackenzie Andy Wells Ben Springhall | Scottish Power (AIFCL Deputy Chair) CAA DECC |
|----------------|--|--|
| CS | Wg Cdr. Colin Scott | MOD |
| DBes | t David Best | DfT |
| DB | David Boyd | MOD |
| DGC | Dujon Goncalves-Collins | RUK |
| EM | Emma Mildred | DECC (Secretariat) |
| JE | Jenny McMillan | Scottish Government |
| KP | Kieran Power | DECC – Chair |
| MD | Mark Deakin | CAA |
| MC | Matt Clear | The Crown Estate |
| SH | Simon Heyes | Infinis (AIFCL Chair) |
| ZK | Zoe Keeton | RWE (RUK Board member for aviation) |

Apologies

| AH | Allen Hughes | Scottish Government |
|----|----------------|---------------------|
| MB | Mark Balsdon | NATS |
| PG | Paul Gallagher | MOD |
| RM | Rachel Murphy | MOD |
| SC | Simon Cootes | Scottish Government |

Introduction, Minutes & Actions

- 1. KP opened the meeting by welcoming everyone. Apologies were noted and the agenda agreed.
- 2. The draft minutes from the 17th of July AMB were noted and comments were requested ahead of publication. KP ran through the outstanding actions: 75 ongoing (pending response); 76 ongoing; 77 closed.

FMB Update

3. On MoD Air Traffic Control (ATC), SH advised he is aware that four offshore wind projects are moving forward with the MoD contractual process (at Phase 1) and that three onshore wind developers are due to enter Phase 1 contracts shortly. The current issue with the MOD 'Annex D' work package (future MOD ATC mitigation engagement process) concerns the AIFCL contracting route. SH planned to speak with MoD at the end of November. The CAA packages of work are also now complete. AIFCL had reviewed the latest CAA business case for the next phase of their Turbulence Studies and had provisionally agreed to fund £20K towards the next phase of studies.

RUK Update

- 4. DGC reported that his duties have broadened following a restructure at RUK although he remains the aviation lead.
- 5. The Aviation Strategy Group (ASG) remains very active with both the legacy radar and onshore wind work and the offshore aviation work. RUK are currently trying to help their members understand the aviation safeguarding and mitigation processes they might face. Looking ahead, RUK have also been working on lighting, primarily for turbines above 150 metres, but there has also been some work in the area of smaller turbines. Development of the offshore wind aviation guidelines is going well and RUK are supporting turbulence next steps.

MoD ATC and Air Defence update

MoD ATC

- 6. DB informed the Board that good progress has been made since the previous meeting and there is a lot of work ongoing. MoD are engaged with 14 developers comprised of four offshore and ten onshore consented windfarms. Out of the ten onshore windfarms, three are on-board the accession process and seven will be on-track shortly. At present there are six radars involved. The potential for additional consented onshore windfarms to join the accession process is currently under review and MoD are engaging with potential candidates.
- 7. There have been multiple successes this period. The SSR Fast Track work and flight check at Lossiemouth (LOS) was completed on the 15th May and Phase 1 (identification of a mitigation solution) has been underway with four offshore wind developers since August. The Potential Mitigation Solution Providers Industry day, held in September, was a success and very informative. The PQQ exercise started in October and requests for detailed submissions were issued in November. Phase 1 is expected to report late January for the four offshore wind developers and end March for the three onshore wind developers. DGC asked if there would be just one Phase 2; DB confirmed that

the answer would be informed by the Phase 1 study reports, but that the MOD are looking at solutions that would be applicable to both onshore wind and offshore wind.

- 8. The MoD Safety Assessment for the LOS transponder mandatory zone (TMZ) is complete and was passed to the CAA for consideration in October. Post meeting note: Approval for the Airspace Change Proposal was confirmed in the CAA Decision Letter dated 26 Jan 2016.
- 9. The current focus of MoD's efforts is on drafting commercial agreements for the various phases of the ATC mitigation work.

MoD Air Defence

- 10. DB advised that overall progress is good. Project EOLUS Full Operational Capability of RRH Trimingham was declared in September against the Sheringham Shoal windfarm development. Project SALMONEUS – in-service acceptance of the radar performance (not wind mitigation) at RRH Buchan is progressing well and expected to be achieved in autumn 2015. Commissioning flight checks of RRH Benbecula radar are imminent.
- 11. NAIZ upgrades have been completed on five AD radars.
- 12. On the accession process, MoD are continuing the review of the Air Defence Process with a view to making it more streamlined and simple. They are currently in consultation with stakeholders. The MoD and RUK ASG Air Defence Wind Farm Mitigation Working Group has been formed to provide an informal forum for MoD, RUK and developers to discuss concerns and improve joint understanding. The next meeting is anticipated to be in February 2016.

ACTION - MoD to share with RUK information on the AD accession process for safeguarding guidelines.

Civil Aviation Updates

13. AW reported that following a review of the work programme for the remainder of financial year 2015/16 of the CAA Spectrum Release Programme, DfT has announced a review of the strategic fit of the emerging technology aspect of the Programme in wider UK and international objectives. It has placed the majority of work for the emerging technologies aspect on hold. As a result, a number of planned activities have been ceased. In addition, work on the Future Airspace Surveillance Strategy has been suspended while the CAA assesses the direction of intent in respect of the European Commission's review of the Surveillance Performance and Interoperability Implementing Rule. The European Aviation Safety Agency has been tasked to conduct the review and has committed to commence work by April 2016.

- 14. AW confirmed that the Turbulent Wake Effects milestones are currently on time and cost. Work carried out by University of Liverpool has been incorporated into the development of turbulence guidance as part of CAP 764 revision, which is expected to be issued in early 2016. The guidance covers turbines up to 30 metres in rotor diameter and further work is planned to consider larger turbines (~100M rotor diameter). The next stage of this project will be later than planned due the academic team's move from Liverpool University to Glasgow University. CAA, Glasgow University and RUK are expected to finalise the business case later this month ready to approach relevant organisations for funding for this stage of the project.
- 15. On the voice communications work stream, AW advised that QinetiQ has completed the testing of a representative sample of V/UHF radio sets and subjected them to synthesized wind turbine interference signals obtained from Goonhilly. Based on the results of this work planning rules are currently being devised to allow the assessment of applications for wind turbine developments. The expected date for initial publication of these rules is early Q1 2016, which is expected to be written into Civil Aviation Publication 670, ATS Safety Requirements.
- 16. DGC mentioned that airports are now putting mitigation measures in place under a NATS contract.
- 17. MC reported that the development of the Offshore Aviation Guidance document is progressing well. The goal is to publish the final guidance in early 2016 and to provide seminars on its content. MC agreed to send KP a copy of the Offshore Renewable Energy Forum's (ORAF) terms of reference and details of the next meeting.

ACTION – AW to provide an update on the safety case for the NATS NERL mitigation contract at the next AMB.

ACTION - MC to send KP a copy of ORAF's ToR and details of next meeting.

Possible future focus of the AMB

18. KP facilitated a short initial discussion on the possible future focus of the AMB. Work on delivering the Aviation Plan milestones was progressing well. It was therefore appropriate to begin thinking about the longer term role and focus of the Board. Members expressed a variety of views and agreed that it would be useful for the Secretariat to prepare a short discussion paper for the next AMB that captures members' views and facilitates further consideration of the AMB's future. The Secretariat would contact members ahead of the next meeting to gather their views. **ACTION** – DECC would prepare a discussion paper outlining members' thoughts on the future of the AMB to facilitate further discussion at the next Board meeting.

AOB

- 19. DBest Informed the Board that there was a Cabinet Office-led red tape challenge on renewables.
- 20. KP gave a quick update on the provisions in the Energy Bill on early closure of the Renewables Obligation (RO) to onshore wind and proposed grace period arrangements. KP advised that under Government proposals submitted to the House of Lords, projects would need to have had planning approval, an agreed grid connection date and land rights by 18 June 2015 in order to be eligible to accredit under the RO by the original closure date of 31 March 2017. The pre-existing grace periods for grid and radar delays would continue to apply, allowing eligible projects a further year to accredit. Projects which satisfy the 18 June 2015 grace period criteria but experience difficulty securing funding because of uncertainty created by the Parliamentary process will have an additional period after the 31 March 2017, under what is known as the "investment freezing condition", in which to accredit. The additional period is expected to be equivalent to the length of delay experienced.
- 21. To apply a consistent approach, Government has proposed that projects that qualify for the "investment freezing condition" and also experience a delay in grid connection or implementation of a radar mitigation solution will, in addition, be eligible for a grid or radar delay grace period allowing them a further year in which to accredit, i.e. provisionally until the end of December 2018. The effect of the 18 June grace period, "investment freezing condition" and grid/radar delay grace period for investment-delayed projects is cumulative.
- 22. KP reported that the Government's proposals had not succeeded in being adopted as part of the Energy Bill during the House of Lords stage. However, the Government intended to resubmit its' proposals once the Bill reached the House Commons.

Next Meeting

23. The Secretariat would aim to arrange the next meeting for March 2016, ideally before the Easter break.

END.

Annex A – List of Actions and status as at 05/11/2015

| | Owner | Action | Expected Date | Status |
|----|------------------|--|-------------------|----------|
| 3 | RenewableUK | To refresh the Evidence regularly for updates to the Aviation Plan | Annual updates | On-going |
| 44 | CAA | KL to draft text for inclusion in the guidance. | 23 Jan 2014 | Closed |
| 51 | DECC | JH to progress work on dashboard template. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 52 | DECC/TCE/MO D | DECC, TCE and MOD to meet to discuss air defence mitigation issues. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 53 | NATS | NATS to circulate the Project RM Information Pack to AMB members. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 54 | CAA | KL to circulate an update on the aircraft communications research. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 55 | NATS | NATS to provide details of the projects or MWs affected by aircraft communications objections. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 56 | AMB | AMB to report to DECC on the recommendations in Paper 2014/1. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 57 | CAA | CAA and RUK to engage with AOA on future AMB membership [REVISED]. | 24 July 2014 | Closed |
| 58 | MOD | MOD to develop ATC milestones for the dashboard. | 12 November 2014 | Closed |
| 59 | RUK | RUK to investigate/identify possible sites for inclusion in the single turbine study | 12 November 2014 | Closed |
| 60 | MOD and RUK | MOD and RUK to consider comms on MOD workstreams – specifically on the single turbine study. | 12 November 2014 | Closed |
| 61 | MOD and CAA | MOD and CAA to meet to discuss overlap of workstreams and discuss how best to work together. | 12 November 2014 | Closed |
| 62 | NATS & MOD | NATS and MOD to discuss the Project RM funding model. | 12 November 2014 | Closed |
| 63 | NATS | MB to circulate timeframe for Project RM | 12 November | Closed |
| 64 | DECC | DECC to circulate a draft of the Aviation Plan to AMB members within 8 weeks. | 18 September 2014 | Closed |
| 65 | RUK | RUK to contact Board members regarding data requirements for the RUK survey | 24 March 2015 | Closed |

| 66 | ALL | Board members to provide final comments on the Aviation Plan to DECC by 20 November | 24 March 2015 | Closed |
|----|-------|--|-----------------|---------|
| 67 | MOD | MOD to make air defence mitigation guidance document available | 24 March 2015 | Closed |
| 68 | MOD | MOD to update FMB on progress with the single turbine study. | 24 March 2015 | Closed |
| 69 | MOD | MOD to forward revised lighting guidance to RUK for web publication. | 24 March 2015 | Closed |
| 70 | RUK | RUK to circulate the 2013 survey results for the next meeting. | 17 July 2015 | Closed |
| 71 | ALL | Comment on the Generic MOD Air Defence Accession Process – comments to PG by end April '15. | End April | Closed |
| 72 | ALL | KP asked for an indicative ATC timeline for the next meeting. | 17 July 2015 | Closed |
| 73 | NATS | MB to update project milestones for Project RM | 17 July 2015 | Closed |
| 74 | ALL | KP asked for views on a metric of what the board has achieved with regards to releasing capacity. DGC said technical glitch has prevented obtaining data as part of survey. For the next meeting 5 th November 2015 | 17 July 2015 | Ongoing |
| 75 | PG | PG to ask the supplier to prepare a cost proposal/rough order of magnitude for the next AMB meeting. | 5 November 2015 | Ongoing |
| 76 | DGC | DGC to send to ASG and set out methodology for future studies | August 2015 | Closed |
| 77 | ALL | Board members were invited to send any comments on the developer survey, including comparison with their own data, to DGC by mid-August. | Mid-August 2015 | Closed |
| 78 | PG/DB | MoD to share with RUK information on the AD accession process for safeguarding guidelines. | None specified | Ongoing |
| 79 | AW | To provide an update on the safety case for the NATS NERL | None specified | Open |

| | | mitigation contract at the next AMB. | | |
|----|-----|--|----------------|--------|
| 80 | MC | To send KP a copy of ORAF's ToR and details of next meeting. | None specified | Closed |
| 81 | All | DECC would prepare a discussion paper outlining members' thoughts on the future of the AMB to facilitate further discussion at the next Board meeting. | None specified | Closed |