



**Minutes of the Aviation Management Board Meeting**

**RenewableUK, Greencoat House, London, SW1P 1DH**

**Date:** Tuesday 17 July 2015

**Present**

AM	Anne Mackenzie	Scottish Power (AIFCL Deputy Chair)
CS	Wg Cdr. Colin Scott	MOD
DB	David Boyd	MOD
DGC	Dujon Goncalves-Collins	RUK
EM	Emma Mildred	DECC (Secretariat)
KP	Kieran Power	DECC – Chair
MD	Mark Deakin	CAA
PG	Paul Gallagher	MOD
SC	Stuart Curry	The Crown Estate (deputising for MC)
SH	Simon Heyes	Infinis (AIFCL Chair)
ZK	Zoe Keaton	RWE

**Apologies**

AH	Allen Hughes	Scottish Government
AW	Andy Wells	CAA
BS	Ben Springhall	DECC
DB	David Best	DfT
MB	Mark Balsdon	NATS
MC	Matt Clear	The Crown Estate
MP	Matt Partridge	RUK
RM	Rachel Murphy	MOD
SC	Simon Coote	Scottish Government

**Introduction, Minutes & Actions**

1. KP opened the meeting by welcoming everyone and especially new members. Apologies were noted and the agenda agreed.
2. The draft minutes from the 24<sup>th</sup> of March AMB were noted and comments were requested ahead of publication. KP ran through the outstanding actions: 70 – closed; 71 – closed, comments received; 72 – closed, updated during the meeting. 73 – KP read out update provided by MB; 74 – action ongoing, KP invited views before the next meeting.

## **Fund Management Board (FMB) Update**

3. SH updated the Board on two issues:

- AIFCL understand that the CAA's request for EU funding for the next turbulence study was unsuccessful and that the CAA are seeking funds from a variety of sources. The next study will consider the effects of larger machines which are contemporary with those being deployed now. AIFCL is prepared to contribute £20k towards the study. We also understand that there is another non-AIFCL developer, for whom this is an issue, and are likely to seek evidence that this developer is also making a contribution.
- Three AIFCL member developers remain in the onshore group for the MoD proposed ATC radar phase 1 work. AIFCL are not being asked to contribute towards this work at this stage. However, they are aware of the potential relevance of the MoD's work to other developments which are not yet consented. There is awareness of the proposed Annex D (enduring engagement with MoD and Aquila), which will address the mechanism by which such schemes can benefit from mitigation, and AIFCL awaits detail on the timing and cost of this in order to consider whether or not it may be able to contribute funding. PG agreed to ask the supplier to prepare a cost proposal/rough order of magnitude for the next meeting of the AMB.

**Action 75: PG to ask the supplier to prepare a cost proposal/rough order of magnitude for the next meeting.**

## **MOD Update**

4. Air Traffic Control (ATC) - PG updated the Board on developer and industry engagement. Four offshore windfarm developers are still in the process. Following recent discussions with onshore developers, eight projects remain engaged and this may rise to 10. The procurement strategy has been revised to allow direct contracting between supplier and developer for phase one, although the three phase approach remains. PG informed the Board that the SSR Fast Track work and flight check were successfully completed in May. Immediate activities include finalising commercial agreements with developers, working on developer and supplier contracts or letters of intent, obtaining MOD staff funding and the ongoing TMZ safety case. PG reported that securing ongoing funding for the MOD windfarm team remains a significant challenge.
5. On air defence (AD), PG informed the Board that the upgrades of air defence radars at RAF Buchan and RAF Benbecula were underway. Installation and acceptance testing has been completed at both stations. Commissioning of flight checks was in progress at Buchan and in-service acceptance of radar performance was expected by autumn 2015. Flight trials at Benbecula were waiting to be commissioned. PG anticipates the need for further trials to quantify the operational and cumulative impact of single turbines on AD radars, following an initial trial in 2014. (Closes Action 68). PG further reported that MOD are undertaking a comprehensive review of the AD accession process and would be briefing the Aviation Strategy Group (ASG) in August. An ASG-

MoD sub-working group is to be set up and will have its first meeting in September.

### **Results of the RUK 2015 Developer Survey**

6. DGC summarised the preliminary results of RUK's 2015 developer survey on the number of onshore wind sites affected by aviation objections. The response rate was below what was hoped for. However, first impressions of the data received indicated that of projects in planning by the end of 2014, an estimated 2.6GW had aviation objections, of which 2.2GW were in Scotland. Of projects which entered planning since 2014, nearly 1GW had aviation objections of which nearly 80% were in Scotland.
7. DGC invited comments from Board members by mid-August and indicated that he would particularly welcome comparisons with data held by others on live objections.

**Action 76: DGC to share the preliminary results with the ASG and set out methodology for future surveys.**

**Action 77: Board members were invited to send any comments, including comparison with their own data, to DGC by mid-August.**

### **Civil aviation update**

8. KP updated the Board on behalf of MB who was unable to attend.
9. Project RM is currently going through final checks and trials, and is on track for delivering the upgrade at Great Dun Fell radar station by the end of August. The upgrade at Lowther Hill radar station is expected to follow on 6 months later although there is a risk with respect to the 2015 winter weather window for accessing Lowther radar.
10. Fewer onshore wind sites in England seem to be interested in participating in scoping the mitigation at Claxby due to the Government's recent announcement on early closure of the Renewables Obligation and the uncertainty about the future availability of CFDs for onshore wind.
11. With respect to the technical limitations on the upgrade, NATS have spoken to RUK about other funding options and are currently working in parallel with a developer about enabling this part of the project.
12. Both Claxby and the reviews of technical limitations have a finite period for being triggered - estimated to be around 6 months. After this the options from NERL and Raytheon are reset, mainly due to project economies of scale.
13. MD gave a short update on CAA work streams. The work being undertaken by QinetiQ on Voice Communications was progressing well and civil radio work almost complete. On the Spectrum Release work stream, CAA could not provide

update until after the Spectrum Release Programme Board, which was sitting shortly after the AMB meeting.

14. AM reported that Prestwick are evaluating tenders for their radar upgrade and aim to contract by September.

#### **Update of Government policy towards onshore wind subsidies**

15. KP summarised the key points of the announcement by the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change on 18 June concerning early closure of the Renewables Obligation on 1 April 2016 to new onshore wind capacity. DECC was engaging with industry, investors, the Devolved Administrations and other stakeholders to get their views to inform the Government's final policy. The changes would be taken forward through the Energy Bill. No decision had been taken as yet on the future of CfDs for onshore wind.

16. Several members expressed disappointment at these developments. It was mentioned that some small developers were looking at laying off staff in the next few weeks and that many developers would not be investing, or would have difficulty securing investment, until there is legislative clarity. Some members said that a hiatus in projects was inevitable and that there was a significant risk that projects on which good progress had been made would be lost. The uncertainty on future support now meant that it was difficult to look to the long term.

#### **Any Other Business**

17. None.

#### **Next Meeting/Dates of Future Meeting**

18. The last AMB meeting of 2015 will be held on 5 November.

**END**

**Annex A – List of Actions and status as at 17/7/2015**

	<b>Owner</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Expected Date</b>	<b>Status</b>
3	RenewableUK	To refresh the Evidence regularly for updates to the Aviation Plan	Annual updates	On-going
44	CAA	KL to draft text for inclusion in the guidance.	23 Jan 2014	Closed
51	DECC	JH to progress work on dashboard template.	24 July 2014	Closed
52	DECC/TCE/MOD	DECC, TCE and MOD to meet to discuss air defence mitigation issues.	24 July 2014	Closed
53	NATS	NATS to circulate the Project RM Information Pack to AMB members.	24 July 2014	Closed
54	CAA	KL to circulate an update on the aircraft communications research.	24 July 2014	Closed
55	NATS	NATS to provide details of the projects or MWs affected by aircraft communications objections.	24 July 2014	Closed
56	AMB	AMB to report to DECC on the recommendations in Paper 2014/1.	24 July 2014	Closed
57	CAA	CAA and RUK to engage with AOA on future AMB membership [REVISED].	24 July 2014	Closed
58	MOD	MOD to develop ATC milestones for the dashboard.	12 November 2014	Closed
59	RUK	RUK to investigate/identify possible sites for inclusion in the single turbine study	12 November 2014	Closed
60	MOD and RUK	MOD and RUK to consider comms on MOD workstreams – specifically on the single turbine study.	12 November 2014	Closed
61	MOD and CAA	MOD and CAA to meet to discuss overlap of workstreams and discuss how best to work together.	12 November 2014	Closed
62	NATS & MOD	NATS and MOD to discuss the Project RM funding model.	12 November 2014	Closed
63	NATS	MB to circulate timeframe for Project RM	12 November	Closed
64	DECC	DECC to circulate a draft of the Aviation Plan to AMB members within 8 weeks.	18 September 2014	Closed
65	RUK	RUK to contact Board members regarding data requirements for the RUK survey	24 March 2015	Closed

66	ALL	Board members to provide final comments on the Aviation Plan to DECC by 20 November	24 March 2015	Closed
67	MOD	MOD to make air defence mitigation guidance document available	24 March 2015	Closed
68	MOD	MOD to update FMB on progress with the single turbine study.	24 March 2015	Closed
69	MOD	MOD to forward revised lighting guidance to RUK for web publication.	24 March 2015	Closed
70	RUK	RUK to circulate the 2013 survey results for the next meeting.	17 July 2015	Closed
71	ALL	Comment on the Generic MOD Air Defence Accession Process – comments to PG by end April '15.	End April	Closed
72	ALL	KP asked for an indicative ATC timeline for the next meeting.	17 July 2015	Closed
73	NATS	MB to update project milestones for Project RM	17 July 2015	Closed
74	ALL	KP asked for views on a metric of what the board has achieved with regards to releasing capacity. DGC said technical glitch has prevented obtaining data as part of survey. For the next meeting 5 <sup>th</sup> November 2015	17 July 2015	Open
75	PG	PG to ask the supplier to prepare a cost proposal/rough order of magnitude for the next AMB meeting.	5 November 2015	Open
76	DGC	DGC to send to ASG and set out methodology for future studies	August 2015	Open
77	ALL	Board members were invited to send any comments on the developer survey, including comparison with their own data, to DGC by mid-August.	Mid-August 2015	Open