



Ministry
of Justice

Official Statistics

HMP Doncaster

Payment by Results pilot

Final re-conviction results for cohort 2

Ministry of Justice
STATISTICS BULLETIN

30 July 2015

Executive Summary

This statistics bulletin presents the final outcomes for cohort 2 of the Payment by Results (PbR) pilot at HMP Doncaster.

HMP Doncaster PbR pilot: Result for cohort 2

The cohort 2 re-conviction rate for offenders released from HMP Doncaster was **3.3 percentage points lower** than the 2009 baseline year (from 58.0% in the 2009 baseline year to 54.6% in cohort 2¹). This is not a successful outcome for the provider, Serco, because the 5.0 percentage point threshold has not been achieved, and they therefore reimburse 10% of the core contract value for this pilot year.

Payment by Results (PbR) pilot at HMP Doncaster

In October 2011 a Payment by Results (PbR) pilot scheme was launched at Doncaster Prison to test the impact of using a PbR model to reduce re-convictions. The pilot is being delivered by Serco (who manage the prison under a core contract) and was originally intended to run for four years², with each cohort year running from October to September. The pilot involves the provision of 'through the gate' support to offenders released from Doncaster Prison. Through the gate support is the provision of support to offenders following their release into the community.

The HMP Doncaster pilot targeted, for cohort 1, adult male offenders that were released between 1st October 2011 and 30th September 2012 and, for cohort 2, those released between 1st October 2012 and 30th September 2013. Cohort 2 is the last of the Doncaster PbR prison pilot cohorts.

The re-offending measure used was the proportion of re-convicted offenders. This measure will be tested against a historic re-conviction rate, and a threshold of success has been set which will trigger payment. January to December 2009 was chosen as the baseline year as it was the most recent complete dataset available at the time of the pilot's launch. If the re-conviction rate in each pilot year is not at least five percentage points lower than the baseline of 58.0% for January to December 2009, the MoJ will reclaim 10% of the core contract value from Serco. If the re-conviction rate is reduced by five percentage points Serco will retain the full core contract value. If re-conviction rates are reduced six percentage points or more against the baseline, Serco will be entitled to additional outcome payments (up to an agreed level and up to a maximum of a ten percentage point reduction). The five percentage point reduction target was agreed after analysis of historic re-conviction rates and establishing that this would illustrate a demonstrable difference which could be attributed to the new system and not just natural variation.

¹ Due to a rounding effect $58.0\% = 3.3\% + 54.6\%$.

² As a result of the wider reforms to probation it has been decided that no new participants would enter the payment by results (PbR) pilot scheme at Doncaster prison after the end of 2014.

Background

The Ministry of Justice (MoJ) published “*Breaking the Cycle: Effective Punishment, Rehabilitation and Sentencing of Offenders*” in December 2010. This Green Paper included a commitment for the MoJ to commission a series of initial ‘payment by results’ (PbR) pilot projects to test the principle that PbR can result in service improvements by delivering better outcomes for the public at the same or less cost.

The Doncaster pilot began on 1 October 2011, and the results for cohort 1 were published in August 2014³.

This bulletin includes the final outcome for cohort 2 of the Doncaster PbR pilot.

Methodology

The results for the pilot are based on a 12 month re-conviction measure that tracks offences committed in the 12 months following release from prison, and result in conviction at court either in those 12 months or in a further 6 month period (allowing time for cases to progress through the courts).

Offenders enter the PbR pilot after their first eligible release from the prison within the cohort period. Cohort 1 included all eligible offenders released from prison between 1 October 2011 and 30 September 2012, and those between 1 October 2012 and 30 September 2013 for cohort 2. The Doncaster pilot includes all offenders released from custody regardless of sentence length.

The outcome measure is the proportion of offenders who commit one or more offences in the 12 months following release from prison and are convicted at court in those 12 months or in a further 6 months. This is often referred to as a binary re-conviction measure. Success is determined by comparison with the re-conviction rate at Doncaster prison in the baseline year of 2009.

The 12 month re-conviction measure differs from the National Statistics Proven Re-offending measure. The key difference is that re-convictions only count offences for which the offender was convicted at court, whereas the National Statistics Proven Re-offending measure also includes out of court disposals (police cautions). The time periods used for all measures are the same, however – offences committed within 12 months of release from prison and convicted at court (or cautioned for the Proven Re-offending measure) either in those 12 months, or in a further 6 month period (allowing time for cases to progress through the courts).

There are, in addition, a number of other differences between the pilot and the National Statistics Proven Re-offending measure in terms of which offenders are counted within the cohort. These differences are outlined in Table B1 in Annex B.

³ www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/341682/pbr-pilots-cohort-1-results.pdf

Detailed Final Results

HMP Doncaster PbR pilot – Cohort 2 further analysis

The final result for the PbR pilot at HMP Doncaster is based on 12 month re-conviction figures for offenders released from Doncaster in the 12 months of the cohort 2 period. For comparison, we have provided below the 2009 baseline figure as well as equivalent figures for the seven years prior to the pilot and equivalent national figures for the same period. The national result is based on other local⁴ prisons, which exclude Peterborough⁵ and Doncaster.

Table 1 shows a 12 month re-conviction rate of **54.6%** for offenders released from Doncaster during the cohort 2 period (between October 2012 and September 2013). This compares to 58.0% for offenders released in the baseline year (calendar year 2009). The target of a 5.0 percentage point reduction has not been met because the re-conviction rate for cohort 2 is 3.3⁶ percentage points lower than in the 2009 baseline.

Table 1: HMP Doncaster (and national equivalent) 12-month re-conviction rate for offenders released in the cohort 2 period

Release Period	Doncaster		National ^(*)	
	Number of offenders	Re-conviction rate	Offenders	Re-conviction rate
Oct06-Sep07	1,353	58.2%	23,497	54.8%
Oct07-Sep08	1,178	61.3%	26,224	56.0%
Oct08-Sep09	1,254	57.8%	26,805	54.0%
Jan09-Dec09	1,282	58.0%	26,987	53.3%
Oct09-Sep10	1,245	55.8%	25,804	53.8%
Oct10-Sep11	1,275	53.4%	25,873	53.7%
Oct11-Sep12	1,281	52.2%	25,894	52.8%
Oct12-Sep13	1,111	54.6%	25,143	52.8%

^(*) Local prisons only

Nationally, the equivalent figures show a re-conviction rate of 52.8% for offenders released between October 2012 and September 2013. This represents a fall of 0.4⁷ percentage points compared with offenders released in the baseline period between January 2009 and December 2009 (53.3%).

For the final result of Doncaster's cohort 2 we have included in this bulletin an additional breakdown below, which shows the re-conviction outcome by sentence length (i.e. broken down by under 12 month and 12 month or more custodial sentences). This is of public interest here because one of the key aspects of the Offender Rehabilitation Act 2014 is giving statutory supervision and rehabilitation in the community to every offender released from custody, including around 45,000 of the most prolific group of offenders (those sentenced to less than 12 months in custody).

⁴ Since HMP Doncaster is a local prison, the underlying characteristics of the prison and its offenders will be more similar to those of local prisons.

⁵ Since a PbR pilot was also ongoing in HMP Peterborough during the cohort period

⁶ Due to a rounding effect 58.0% = 3.3% + 54.6%.

⁷ Due to a rounding effect 53.3% = 0.4% + 52.8%.

Table 2 shows that the re-conviction rate for offenders released from Doncaster after being sentenced to less than 12 months fell by 6.3 percentage points (from 64.1% to 57.8%) when comparing those released between October 2012 and September 2013 with those released during the baseline period of January 2009 and December 2009. Nationally, over the same period, the equivalent rate increased by 1.0 percentage point (from 58.7% to 59.7%).

Table 3 shows the re-conviction rate for offenders released from Doncaster with sentences of 12 months or more increased by 3.7 percentage points over the same period (from 40.6% to 44.3%). Note that care needs to be taken when looking at the latter as the sample size is significantly smaller. Nationally, over the same period, the equivalent rate fell by 0.4 percentage points (from 40.7% to 40.3%).

Table 2: HMP Doncaster (and national equivalent) 12-month re-conviction rate for offenders with a sentence of less than 12 month that were released in the cohort 1 period

Release Period	Doncaster		National ^(*)	
	Number of offenders	Re-conviction rate	Offenders	Re-conviction rate
Oct06-Sep07	1,075	61.6%	16,826	60.9%
Oct07-Sep08	951	65.8%	19,103	61.5%
Oct08-Sep09	949	63.6%	18,977	59.3%
Jan09-Dec09	947	64.1%	18,865	58.7%
Oct09-Sep10	898	60.7%	17,498	59.0%
Oct10-Sep11	906	57.3%	16,899	60.1%
Oct11-Sep12	944	55.7%	16,994	58.8%
Oct12-Sep13	849	57.8%	16,209	59.7%

^(*) Local prisons only

Table 3: HMP Doncaster (and national equivalent) 12-month re-conviction rate for offenders with a 12 month or more sentence that were released in the cohort 1 period

Release Period	Doncaster		National ^(*)	
	Number of offenders	Re-conviction rate	Offenders	Re-conviction rate
Oct06-Sep07	278	45.0%	6,671	39.4%
Oct07-Sep08	227	42.3%	7,121	41.3%
Oct08-Sep09	305	39.7%	7,828	41.0%
Jan09-Dec09	335	40.6%	8,122	40.7%
Oct09-Sep10	347	43.2%	8,671	42.8%
Oct10-Sep11	369	43.9%	8,974	41.8%
Oct11-Sep12	337	42.4%	8,900	41.5%
Oct12-Sep13	262	44.3%	8,934	40.3%

^(*) Local prisons only

Proven Re-offending Rate

Table 4 shows the Proven Re-offending rate for the Doncaster cohort was 55.1%, compared to 59.1% in the baseline period⁸ (6.8% lower, or 4.0 percentage points lower). For local prisons nationally, the Proven Re-offending rate was 53.5% for the cohort period, compared to 54.3% in the baseline period (1.5% lower, or 0.8 percentage points lower).

Table 4 also shows the Proven Frequency of Re-offending for the Doncaster cohort was 2.59, compared to 2.33 in the baseline period (up 10.8%⁹). These compare to the national equivalent of 2.61 during the cohort period, up from 2.42 in the baseline period (up 7.6%¹⁰, local prisons only).

Table 4: Proven Re-offending rate and Proven Frequency of Re-offending for HMP Doncaster cohort 1 and local prisons

Release Period	Doncaster		National ^(*)	
	Proven Re-offending rate	Proven Frequency of Re-offending	Proven Re-offending rate	Proven Frequency of Re-offending
Oct06-Sep07	59.9%	2.73	56.1%	2.63
Oct07-Sep08	62.6%	2.96	57.2%	2.69
Oct08-Sep09	58.9%	2.43	55.1%	2.46
Jan09-Dec09	59.1%	2.33	54.3%	2.42
Oct09-Sep10	56.5%	2.26	54.8%	2.44
Oct10-Sep11	54.7%	2.22	54.5%	2.50
Oct11-Sep12	53.1%	2.39	53.7%	2.51
Oct12-Sep13	55.1%	2.59	53.5%	2.61

(*) Local prisons only

Table 5 shows the Proven Re-offending measures for the Doncaster cohort split by sentence length (by under 12 month and 12 month or more custodial sentences). This shows that the increase in the Proven Re-offending rate at Doncaster between the baseline period and cohort 2 is wholly due to the sub-cohort of prisoners sentenced to 12 months and over.

Table 5: Proven Re-offending rate and Proven Frequency of Re-offending for HMP Doncaster cohort 1, by sentence length

Release Period	Under 12 month cohort		12 month and over cohort	
	Proven Re-offending rate	Proven Frequency of Re-offending	Proven Re-offending rate	Proven Frequency of Re-offending
Jan09-Dec09	65.3%	2.74	41.8%	1.19
Oct12-Sep13	58.3%	2.93	44.7%	1.47

⁸ January to December 2009

⁹ Due to a rounding effect, $2.59 \div 2.33 = 10.8\%$ rise

¹⁰ Due to a rounding effect, $2.61 \div 2.42 = 7.6\%$ rise

Offender Group Reconviction Scale (OGRS) Score data

Re-offending is related to the characteristics of offenders, for example offenders with a large number of previous convictions are more likely to re-offend than those with fewer previous convictions, and changes in re-conviction rates over time can be related to changes in the mix of offenders being worked with rather than a real change in the level of their re-offending.

The Offender Group Reconviction Scale (OGRS)¹¹ is a predictor of re-offending based on age, gender and criminal history, which are risk factors known to be associated with the likelihood of re-offending. OGRS scores range from 0 to 1, with a lower score representing a lower likelihood of re-offending. The scores can be used to compare the relative likelihood of re-offending either over time or between different groups of offenders, with a higher/lower rate meaning a group of offenders who are more/less likely to re-offend. For example if Offender Group A have an average OGRS score of 0.44, and Offender Group B have an average OGRS score of 0.58, this means that Offender Group A are less likely to re-offend.

Table 6: HMP Doncaster 12-month re-conviction rate and OGRS score for prisoners that were released in the cohort 2 period

Discharge Period	Doncaster			
	Offenders	Number of re-convict	Re-conviction rate	OGRS
Oct06-Sep07	1,353	787	58.2%	0.56
Oct07-Sep08	1,178	722	61.3%	0.58
Oct08-Sep09	1,254	725	57.8%	0.57
Jan09-Dec09	1,282	743	58.0%	0.56
Oct09-Sep10	1,245	695	55.8%	0.55
Oct10-Sep11	1,275	681	53.4%	0.55
Oct11-Sep12	1,281	669	52.2%	0.53
Oct12-Sep13	1,111	607	54.6%	0.54

Table 6 shows that while the 12-month re-conviction rate for offenders released from Doncaster decreased by 3.3 percentage points between January to December 2009 and October 2012 to September 2013, the associated OGRS score for offenders released between the same period also fell (from 0.56 to 0.54).

¹¹ For more details on OGRS see Ministry of Justice Research Summary 7/09 OGRS 3: the revised Offender Group Reconviction Scale at: webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20110201125714/http://www.justice.gov.uk/publications/offender-assessment-system.htm

Annex A

Relationship between final results and published interim figures

Given the high level of public interest in relation to the reforms set out in the MoJ publication “Transforming Rehabilitation – a strategy for reform”, the MoJ began publishing interim re-conviction figures for cohort 1 of this pilot from July 2014. These interim figures were published within MoJ’s quarterly Proven Re-offending Statistics Bulletin, and the last interim figures for cohort 2 of these pilots were published in April 2015¹².

The last interim figures for cohort 2 were 12 month re-conviction figures for offenders released from Doncaster in the first 9 months of the cohort 2 period (the full cohort on which the final result was measured comprised 12 months). For comparison, we provided equivalent figures for the five years prior to the pilot and equivalent national figures for the same periods. The national figures were based on other local prisons which excluded Peterborough¹³ and Doncaster.

The last interim figures showed a 12 month re-conviction rate of 55.3% for offenders released from Doncaster between October 2012 and June 2013 (the first 9 months of cohort 2). This compared to 59.1% for offenders released between October 2008 and June 2009 (a fall of 3.9¹⁴ percentage points), and to 57.1% for those released between October 2009 and June 2010 (a fall of 1.9¹⁵ percentage points). We compared to these figures as they are the closest comparable periods to the baseline period of calendar year 2009.

Nationally the equivalent figures showed a re-conviction rate of 53.7% for offenders released between October 2012 and June 2013. This represents a fall of 1.3 percentage points compared with offenders released between October 2008 and June 2009 (55.0%) and a fall of 0.7 percentage points compared with those released from October 2009 to June 2010 (54.4%).

¹² www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/424823/annex-a-payment-by-results-apr15.pdf

¹³ Since a PbR pilot was also ongoing in HMP Peterborough during the cohort period

¹⁴ Due to a rounding effect 59.1% = 3.9% + 55.3%

¹⁵ Due to a rounding effect 57.1% = 1.9% + 55.3%

Annex B

Table B1: Comparison of Doncaster PbR re-conviction and National Statistics Proven Re-offending measures

	National Statistics measure of Proven Re-offending (for any prison)	Doncaster PbR prison pilot re-conviction measures
The cohort	All offenders who were discharged from custody, over a 12 month period, regardless of sentence length. Excludes those in prison for breach	Male offenders aged 18 or over discharged from Doncaster prison between 1 October 2011 and 30 September 2012 (cohort 1). Differences from National Statistics: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Excludes those who serve the whole of their custodial sentence on remand • Excludes foreign national offenders recorded as having been deported on release from prison
The period to measure re-convictions/re-offending	12 months for offences to occur and a further 6 months for offences to be proven (through conviction at court or a caution)	12 months for offences to occur and a further 6 months for offences to be re-convicted Note: excludes cautions
The headline measure	Proportion of offenders who commit one or more proven re-offences	Proportion of offenders re-convicted of one or more offences
What counts	Offences committed in the 12 months following release from prison, and proven by conviction at court or a caution either in those 12 months or in a further 6 months	Offences committed in the 12 months following release from prison, and resulting in conviction at court either in those 12 months or in a further 6 months Note: excludes cautions

Contact points

Press enquiries should be directed to the Ministry of Justice press office:

Tel: 020 3334 3536

Email: newsdesk@justice.gsi.gov.uk

Other enquiries about these statistics should be directed to:

Steve Ellerd-Elliott

Ministry of Justice
Justice Statistics Analytical Services
7th Floor
102 Petty France
London
SW1H 9AJ

General enquiries about the statistical work of the Ministry of Justice can be e-mailed to: statistics.enquiries@justice.gsi.gov.uk

General information about the official statistics system of the United Kingdom is available from www.statistics.gov.uk.

© Crown copyright Produced by the Ministry of Justice. Alternative formats are available on request from statistics.enquiries@justice.gsi.gov.uk